## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE :

PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO

ANIMALS, et al., : FILED UNDER SEAL

Plaintiffs, :

•

v. : Case No. 03-2006 (EGS/JMF)

•

FELD ENTERTAINMENT, INC.,

•

Defendant.

REPLY IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO COMPEL THE DEPOSITION TESTIMONY OF TOM EUGENE RIDER, THE ANIMAL PROTECTION INSTITUTE AND THE WILDLIFE ADVOCACY PROJECT AND FOR COSTS AND FEES

## **EXHIBIT 12**

## **Paul** Hastings

Paul, Hastings, Janofsky & Walker LLP 875 15th Streel, N.W. Washington, DC 20005 telephone 202-551-1700 • facsimile 202-551-1705 • www.paulhastings.com

Atlanta Beljing Brussels Chicago Hong Kong London Los Angeles Milan New York Orange Country Palo Alto San Diego San Francisco Shanghai Tokyo Washington, DC (202) 551-1771 matthewstowe@paulhastings.com

December 17, 2007

VIA E-MAIL AND FIRST CLASS MAIL

George Andrew Gasper Fulbright & Jaworski L.L.P. Market Square 801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20004-2623

Re: Humane Society

Dear George:

The use of the phrase "custody or control" in my letter of December 13, 2007, was not intended to limit HSUS's production to something other than that order by the Court. With respect to points 1-4 appearing on page two of that same letter, HSUS further confirms that it does not have in its possession, custody or control any documents falling within those categories. In other words, HSUS has produced all documents responsive to the order to compel issued by the Court on December 3, 2007.

With respect to your specific concern regarding e-mails and other documents relating to payments made by HSUS to the WAP, I have doubled checked with the client today, and there are none responsive to the Court's order. The reason is that, with the exception of the early payments relating to the manatees, these were check requests issued by the FFA that were simply processed through the HSUS accounting department following the 2004 corporate combination of the two entities. It is not surprising, then, that there was no e-mail traffic generated at HSUS by these requests.

Please call me at 202-551-1771 if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

for Paul, Hastings, Janofsky & Walker LLP