# Deposition Testimony for FEI Rule 30(b)(6) Witness Gary Jacobson (Jan. 18, 2008) - Re Proposed Stipulation To Admit At Trial

8:10 - 10:01
17:09 - 17:21 19:06 - 19:21 20:09 - 20:17 22:05 - 23:06 23:07 - 23:11 23:15 - 24:07 24:12 - 24:18 25:12- 25:14 26:01 - 26:11

42:12 - 42:21 44:10 - 44:12

45:01 - 45:06

45:13 - 45:15

55:10 - 55:13

59:11 - 59:13

60:01 - 60:12

61:04 - 61:20

63:19 - 65:04

66:11 - 66:15

66:19 - 67:10 67:21 - 68:01

68:05 - 69:13

77:05 - 78:20

79:16 - 80:04

81:12 - 81:15

82:14 - 83:09

84:13 - 85:07 86:14 - 86:19

93:01 - 93:14

94:11 - 95:01

108:16 - 110:10



#### 115:03 - 116:02

116:22-117:17

118:14- 119:21

120:03 - 120:15

121:02 - 122:07

122:13 - 123:15

124:14 - 125:01

125:06 - 126:06

126:07 - 127:09

128:08 - 128:15

129:14 - 129:22

130:17 - 131:15

136:04 - 136:22

154:16 - 17

155:06 - 156:13

157:12- 158:04

162:21 - 22

163:1 - 8

165:13 - 18

168:13 - 169:03

175:20 - 175:22

179:16 - 179:22

Gary Jacobson 30(b)(6) January 18, 2008
Washington, DC

Page 1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION : OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al., Plaintiffs, : Civ. No. V. : 03-02006 RINGLING BROTHERS AND BARNUM & BAILEY: (EGS) CIRCUS, et al., Defendants. Washington, D.C. Friday, January 18, 2008 Videotaped deposition of GARY JACOBSON, called for examination by counsel for the Plaintiffs in the above-entitled matter, pursuant

Videotaped deposition of GARY JACOBSON, called for examination by counsel for the Plaintiffs in the above-entitled matter, pursuant to notice, the witness being duly sworn by OKEEMAH S. HENDERSON, a Notary Public in and for the District of Columbia, taken at the offices of Meyer, Glitzenstein & Crystal at 1601 Connecticut Avenue, Northwest, Suite 700, Washington, D.C. 20009-1056, at 9:49 a.m., Friday, January 18, 2008, and the proceedings being taken down by Stenotype by OKEEMAH S. HENDERSON and transcribed under her direction.

Gary Jacobson 30(b)(6) January 18, 2008 Washington, DC

	Page 2
1	APPEARANCES:
2	On behalf of the Plaintiffs:
3	KATHERINE A. MEYER, ESQ.
	DELCIANNA J. WINDERS ESQ.
4	Meyer, Glitzenstein & Crystal
	1601 Connecticut Avenue, Northwest
5	Suite 700
	Washington, D.C. 20009-1056
6	(202) 588-5206
	E-Mail: delciwinders@meyerglitz.com
7	
	On behalf of the Defendants:
8	LISA ZEILER JOINER, ESQ.
9	JOHN M. SIMPSON, ESQ.
	Fulbright & Jaworski, L.L.P.
10	801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
	Washington, D.C. 20004-2623 (202) 662-0200
11	E-Mail: jsimpson@fulbright.com
12	I marr. Jornepourerary regime.
13	ALSO PRESENT:
14	RICK SANBORN, Videographer
	JULIE ALEXA STRAUSS, ESQ.
15	MICHELLE SINNOTT, Paralegal
16	,
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
L	

Gary Jacobson 30(b)(6) January 18, 2008 Washington, DC

			Page 3
1		C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S	
2	WITNE	SS EXAMINATION BY COUNS	SEL FOR
3	GARY	JACOBSON PLAINTIFFS	
4	By Ms	. Meyer 5	
5			
6		E-X-H-I-B-I-T-S	
7	NO.	IDE	ENT.
8	1	Notice of deposition	7
9	2	Letter dated 12/28/07	7
10	3	E-mail dated 1/17/05	8
11	4	Cites sheet issued 2/28/97	31
12	5	Cites sheet issued 6/14/99	34
13	6	Cites sheet issued 10/30/02	37
14	7	Asian elephant studbook update	46
15	8	Affidavit of Jerome Sowalsky	50
16	9	Veterinarian health certificate	52
17	10	Cites sheet issued 7/29/86	71
18	11	Cites sheet issued 6/14/99	74
19	12	6/2/04 blue unit transportation order	202
20	13	6/6/04 blue unit transportation order	218
21	14	6/6/04 blue unit transportation order	221
22	15	6/3/04 blue unit transportation order	223

Gary Jacobson 30(b)(6) January 18, 2008 Washington, DC

		Page 4
1	E X H I B I T S Continued	
2		
3	16 Video footage CD dated 12/10/01	239
4	17 Video footage CD dated 12/15/03	242
5	18 Video footage CD	259
6	19 Video footage CD	262
7	20 Video footage CD dated 2/1/06	262
8	21 Video footage CD	264
9		
10	(Original Exhibits 1-17, 20-21 atta	ched.)
11	(Original Exhibits 18 & 19 retained by M	s. Meyer.)
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		

Page 5 1 P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S 2 THE VIDEO OPERATOR: This is tape 1 in 3 the video deposition of Gary Jacobson in the 4 matter of the American Society for the Prevention 5 of Cruelty Animals, et al versus Ringling Brothers 6 and Barnum & Bailey Circus, et all, filed in the 7 United States District Court for the District of 8 Columbia. 9 Today's date i January 18th, 2008. The time 10 is 9:49 a.m. We are located at the offices of 11 Meyer Glitzenstein & Crystal at 1601 Connecticut 12 Avenue, Northwest, Washington, D.C. 20009. 13 counsel identify themselves beginning with the 14 attorney giving notice. 15 MS. MEYER: Kathy Meyer for the 16 Plaintiff. 17 MS. WINDERS: Delci Winders for the 18 plaintiff. 19 MS. JOINER: Lisa Joiner on behalf of 20 the witness, Field Entertainment, Inc. 21 MR, SIMPSON: John Simpson on behalf of 22 the same entities as identified by Ms. Joiner.

Page 6 1 MS. STRAUSS: Julie Strauss, in-house 2 counsel, Feld Entertainment. 3 THE VIDEO OPERATOR: Also present are 4 the Court Reporter, Okeemah Henderson representing 5 Alderson Court Reporting and the videographer 6 Terry Powell representing Alderson Court 7 Reporting. 8 Will the Court Reporter, please, swear in 9 the witness. 10 Whereupon, 11 GARY JACOBSON, 12 called as a witness, having been first duly sworn 13 to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing 14 but the truth, was examined and testified as 15 follows: 16 DIRECT EXAMINATION 17 BY MS. MEYER: 18 Good morning, Mr. Jacobson? Q. 19 Α. Hello again. 20 Nice to see you again. Before I 21 start, I want to introduce a couple of, make a 22 couple of documents exhibits in this case and the

Page 7 1 first is a letter dated November 8, 2007 from me 2 to Lisa Joiner and Michelle Pardo, and attached to 3 that is a notice of deposition of defendant, Feld Entertainment pursuant to federal rule of civil 5 procedure 30(B)(6), which is the notice pursuant 6 to which Mr. Jacobson is here today, and I'd like 7 to have that marked as Exhibit 1, please. 8 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 1 was marked for 9 identification.) 10 MS. MEYER: I'd like to have marked as 11 Exhibit 2 the letter dated December 28th, 2007 12 from me to Ms. Joiner explaining that now the 13 Judge Frachola has ruled that the parties may take 14 up to 15 fact depositions, that I'm following up 15 with regard to the rule 30(B)(6) notice that was 16 September earlier and that we would like to 17 schedule the taking of that deposition. I'd like 18 to have that marked as Exhibit 2. 19 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 2 was marked for 20 identification.) 21 MS. MEYER: And I'd like to have marked 22 as Exhibit 3 an E-mail that I received last night

Page 8 1 in Michelle Pardo dated January 17, 2008, time 2 stamped 5:33 p.m. and attached to that E-mail is 3 something called objection to notice of deposition by the defendant, and it is dated January 17, 5 I'd like to have both those documents 6 marked as Exhibit 3. 7 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 3 was marked for 8 identification.) 9 BY MS. MEYER: 10 Could you, please, state your full Q. 11 name, for the record? 12 Α. Gary Lynn Jacobson. 13 And you work for Feld Entertainment; Q. 14 is that correct, Mr. Jacobson? 15 Α. Yes. 16 And what's your position there? Q. 17 Α. I'm the general manager at the Center 18 for Elephant Conservation located in Polk City, 19 Florida. 20 How long have you held that position? Q. 21 As a general manager since 2000. Α. 22 Q. And how long have you been at the CEC?

Page 9

- 1 A. Since June 26, 1995.
- Q. When I say the CEC, I'm referring to
- the Center for Elephant Conservation. You
- 4 understand that, right?
- <sup>5</sup> A. Yes.
- Q. And just briefly, what are your duties
- <sup>7</sup> at the CEC?
- 8 A. I manage the breeding operation and
- 9 care and management of the elephants.
- 10 Q. Have you held other positions at Feld
- 11 Entertainment over the years?
- A. Yes.
- Q. What have they been?
- 14 A. I was a handler in the early '70s,
- presenter in the mid '70s, handler and presenter
- in the late '70s, and I came on board as a trainer
- 17 in 1995.
- Q. Did you also do some handling of
- elephants on the road in the late '90s?
- A. Some. Yes.
- 21 Q. You traveled with the blue unit at one
- point in the late '90s, didn't you?

Page 10

- A. Once or twice. Yes.
- Q. Are you familiar with how the
- elephants that travel on the blue unit are
- 4 maintained on the blue unit?
- 5 A. Currently you mean?
- Q. Yes.
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- Q. Are you familiar with how they're
- $^{9}$  maintained in the 1990s when you traveled with the
- 10 blue unit?
- 11 A. To a certain extent, I was mainly
- concerned with the young elephants.
- Q. Are you familiar with the blue unit
- schedules in terms of the cities that the blue
- unit travels to throughout the year?
- 16 A. Yes.
- Q. And are you familiar with the general
- way the circus sets up when it gets to a venue?
- A. Basically. Yes.
- Q. And are you generally familiar with
- how rehearsal is handled by the blue unit?
- 22 A. Yes.

Page 11 1 And how performance is handled? Q. 2 Α. Yes. 3 And are you also familiar with how the Q. 4 circus is taken down when it's time to leave a 5 venue and go to a new venue? 6 The elephant part of it. Α. Yes. 7 And are you also familiar with how the Q. 8 elephants travel on the train from one venue to 9 another? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Are you familiar with who the handlers 12 are on the blue unit who handle the elephants on 13 the blue unit? 14 Α. Mostly. Yes. 15 And you recognize them by name? Q. 16 Α. Yes. 17 And you would recognize them if you Q. 18 saw them? 19 Α. Yes. 20 And are you familiar with the handlers 0. 21 who run the blue unit in the late 1990s as well? 22 Α. Pretty much. Yes.

Page 12 1 And you would know them by name as Q. 2 well? 3 Α. Yes. 4 And you would recognize them if you 0. 5 saw them? 6 Certainly. Α. 7 And obviously you have a great deal of Q. 8 experience with the CEC, correct? 9 Α. Yes. 10 And you're familiar with the schedules Q. 11 of the CEC? How the CEC is run from day to day; 12 is that correct? 13 Α. Yes. 14 And you're familiar with the handlers 0. 15 who work at the CEC, correct? 16 Α. Yes. 17 And know them by name, correct? Q. 18 Α. Yes. 19 And you'd recognize them if you saw 0. 20 them, correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Mr. Jacobson, what have you done to Q.

Page 13 1 prepare for this deposition? 2 I have been to the blue show, and I 3 looked at a number of papers and depositions or declarations, I should say. 5 Anything else? Q. 6 There may have been something else but Α. 7 all this legal stuff is kind of beyond me. Sorry. 8 Have you actually read some of the 9 deposition testimony that's been given in this 10 case? 11 My own. Α. 12 And have you met with anybody other 13 than your attorneys to prepare for this 14 deposition? 15 Α. I talked to David Polke. 16 And who is that? Q.

19 Q. How long has he held that position?

He's the elephant superintendent of

A. Just this year.

Α.

the blue unit.

17

18

Q. Have you talked to anybody else?

A. Not personally, no.

Page 14 1 And Mr. Polke has held other positions Q. 2 at Feld Entertainment over the years; is that 3 correct? Α. Yes. 5 What other positions has he held? Q. 6 He was the animal superintendent Α. 7 before he was the elephant superintendent. 8 And how long did he hold that 0. 9 position? 10 Α. I'm not really sure. 11 Q. Do you have any idea? 12 Α. I'm not really sure. 13 Q. And that was on the blue unit as well? 14 Α. Right. 15 Was it more than a couple of years? Q. 16 Α. I'm not sure. Could have been two or 17 more. 18 What other positions has he held with Q. 19 the company? 20 In the '90s, he worked a ring of 21 elephants and in the '70s, he was on the red show. 22 He worked at Williston.

Page 15 1 When did he work at Williston? Q. 2 Α. Before he went to the blue show, and 3 I'm not exactly sure when the dates were. 4 When you say in the '90s he worked a 5 ring of elephants, was that with the blue unit as 6 well? 7 Α. Yes. 8 And when you said that you've been to 9 the blue show as part of your preparation for this 10 deposition, can you tell me what that means? 11 Α. I went over and just took a look at 12 the elephants and actually went to see the show. 13 Q. Just once? 14 Α. Yes. Just once to see the show. 15 Which venue did you visit the blue Q. 16 unit in? 17 Orlando. Α. 18 I'm sorry? Q. 19 Α. Orlando. 20 0. So that was recently that you visited 21 the blue unit? 22 Α. Yes.

Page 16 1 Q. Did you travel on the train with the 2 blue unit? 3 Α. No. 4 How many days were you at the blue 5 unit facility when you were in Orlando? 6 I was there two different days. Α. Three 7 hours on one day, four on the other. 8 Can you tell me which days you were 0. 9 there? 10 Last Friday a week ago today and on Α. 11 Saturday, I saw the show. 12 So last Friday you were there for 13 three hours? 14 Α. About three hours. 15 And then last Saturday you were there Q. 16 for about four hours? 17 Α. Right. Part of that was seeing the 18 evening performance. 19 Was that the last night of the show, 0. 20 do you know? 21 I think they closed Sunday. Α. 22 Q. Have you been to see a blue unit show

Page 17 1 other than that one in recent years? 2 Α. Yes. I see it every year. 3 Q. Oh, you do. Okay. Have you been to winter quarters before? 5 Α. Yes. 6 Do you go to winter quarters every Q. 7 year? 8 Α. Normally. 9 Just so the record is clear, what is Ο. 10 winter quarters for the blue unit? 11 Α. It's the Tampa, the state fairgrounds 12 part of the state fairgrounds where the show is 13 put together. 14 How long does winter quarters last? Q. 15 Α. Roughly five weeks. 16 And when is winter quarters held? Q. 17 Α. It's part of November and most of 18 December. 19 And that's true every year; is that 0. 20 correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 When you said you looked at papers to Q.

Page 18

- prepare for this deposition, can you be more
- specific about which papers you looked at?
- A. I think I looked at a couple of
- declarations and I looked at this (indicating)
- <sup>5</sup> piece of work here.
- O. That's something your lawyer prepared?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- MS. MEYER: I'd like to have a copy of
- 9 that. That's a joke.
- MS. JOINER: He's referencing the
- exhibits to the summary judgment motion, but I'll
- get you a copy, another one if you'd like.
- MS. MEYER: I have one of those. Okay.
- BY MS. MEYER:
- Q. Anything else that you looked at that
- you can think of paperwise?
- 17 A. I think the declarations.
- Q. Do you know which declarations that
- you looked at?
- A. I think they were mine.
- Q. What I'd like to do now is talk to you
- about the seven elephants that we're talking about

Page 19

- 1 today. Do you know which seven elephants are at
- issue for this deposition?
- A. Yes.
- Q. I'd like to ask you questions about
- each of them, if I could. Starting with Karen.
- 6 Are you familiar with the elephant Karen?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- 8 Q. She's on the blue unit right now; is
- 9 that correct?
- A. Correct.
- 11 Q. And Karen was born in 1969; is that
- 12 correct?
- A. Probably.
- Q. When you say probably, what do you
- 15 mean?
- A. She came into this country in 1969 and
- $^{17}$  was quite small.
- Okay. How old was she when she got to
- this country?
- A. Judging from the pictures I have seen,
- 21 probably six or eight months.
- Q. I think Robert Ridley testified

Page 20 1 between four and six months; is that about right? 2 Α. He would have been there. I was not 3 there. 4 And Karen was born in the wild; is 0. 5 that correct? 6 I do not know. Α. 7 Do you know which country she's from? Q. 8 Α. I have seen it on paper as Thailand. 9 Q. And as you said, she came into 10 Ringling Brothers' possession in 1969, correct? 11 Α. Right. 12 Q. And how long has she been on the blue 13 unit? 14 Α. Since she came into this country, 15 1969. 16 Do you know who trained Karen? Q. 17 Α. Axel Gautier. 18 How do you spell that last name? Q. 19 G-A-U-T-I-E-R, I believe. Α. 20 Do you know if Hugo Schmidt had any 0. 21 responsibility for training Karen before she got 22 here?

		Page 21
1	Α.	Before she got here?
2	Q.	Or after she got here or at all?
3	Α.	I believe if my memory serves me
4	right, Hugo	retired in 1969.
5	Q.	Okay. Who did Hugo Schmidt work for?
6	Α.	What do you mean?
7	Q.	Well, you said he retired in 1969?
8	Α.	He retired from Feld Entertainment.
9	Q.	That's what I wanted to know. He
10	worked for	Feld Entertainment?
11	Α.	Yes.
12	Q.	He was a trainer of elephants for Felt
13	Entertainme	ent?
14	Α.	Yes.
15	Q.	Did he have some responsibility for
16	training Ka	aren when she arrived?
17	Α.	I am not sure.
18	Q.	If Mr. Ridley said that Hugo Smith
19	began the t	raining of Karen, would that be
20	probably co	orrect?
21	Α.	Yes. Since he was there.
22	Q.	And Mr. Ridley said that Alex Gautier

Page 22

- 1 completed her training. Would that be consistent
- with what you believe is true?
- 3 A. Yes.
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- <sup>5</sup> Q. Who is Axel Gautier?
- A. He's an Austrian. He came from a
- <sup>7</sup> circus family and worked for Feld Entertainment.
- § Q. He was a trainer of elephants for Feld
- 9 Entertainment?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. When was he a trainer of elephants for
- 12 Feld Entertainment?
- 13 A. In the, some of the '60s '70s, '80,
- until the time of his death which I think was in
- 15 '90 or '91, something like that.
- Q. He died in -- I'm sorry. What year
- did you say he died?
- A. I'm not sure. I thought it was in '90
- or '91 but I'm not sure.
- Q. Do you know what he died from?
- A. Yes.
- Q. What did he die from?

Page 23 1 Α. He was killed by an elephant. 2 Q. An elephant owned by Feld 3 Entertainment? Α. Yes. 5 Which elephant was that? Q. 6 Α. Reba. 7 Now, when did Hugo Schmidt start Q. 8 working for Feld Entertainment? 9 I believe in 1948 which at that time Α. 10 was not Feld Entertainment, it was Ringling 11 Brothers Barnum & Bailey. 12 Thank you for that correction. 13 know if Hugo Schmidt trained any of the other six 14 elephants that are at issue in this deposition? 15 Let me be specific. Do you know whether or not 16 Hugo Schmidt trained Jewell? 17 He did some training. He did not do Α. 18 the initial training. 19 Do you know who did the initial 0. 20 training of Jewell? 21 Α. Louie Reed and Robert Smokey Jones. 22 How about Lutzi? Q.

Page 24

- 1 A. The same.
- Q. When you say the same, I guess I'm
- trying to figure out if Mr. Schmidt had any
- 4 responsibility for training Lutzi?
- 5 A. The initial training was done by Louis
- Reed and Robert Smokey Jones, then Hugo took over
- <sup>7</sup> later.
- Q. Do you know how old Jewell was when
- 9 she was trained by Smokey Jones, and I'm sorry
- $^{10}$  what is --
- A. Louis Reed.
- 12 Q. Thank you. Do you know how old she
- was, Jewell, when she was trained by Louis Reed
- and Smokey Jones?
- 15 A. I have seen it on the paperwork, but
- normally at that time they brought the elephants
- over by ship. So they were normally at least
- three or four years old.
- 19 Q. And do you know how old Jewell was
- when Hugo Schmidt took over the training of her?
- A. I'm not sure what year that was. Hugo
- had left the show for a while to go to another

Page 25

- show and then he came back, and I'm not sure what
- <sup>2</sup> year that was.
- Q. And do you know how old Lutzi would
- 4 have been when she was trained by Louis Reed and
- 5 Smokey Jones?
- A. Pretty much it would be the same
- <sup>7</sup> answer.
- 8 Q. And do you know how old she was when
- 9 she was trained by Hugo Schmidt?
- 10 A. No. I'm not sure when Hugo came back
- 11 to the show.
- 12 Q. How about Mysore. Did she receive any
- training from Mr. Reed and Mr. Jones?
- $^{14}$  A. Yes.
- Q. Who else trained Mysore?
- A. Pretty much it would have been just
- 17 those two.
- 18 Q. Do you know how old Mysore was when
- she received the training from Mr. Reed and Mr.
- Jones?
- 21 A. She probably would have been about the
- same age. She came in in 1947.

Page 26 1 And what about Susan. Did she receive Q. 2 any training from Mr. Reed and Mr. Jones? 3 Α. Yes. 4 0. Did she receive training from anyone 5 else? 6 Α. From Hugo later when he came back to 7 the company. 8 Do you know how old Susan was when she 9 received her training from Mr. Reed and Mr. Jones? 10 Would have been roughly the same as Α. 11 Jewell and Lutzi. 12 Q. What about Zina, did she also receive 13 training from Mr. Reed and Mr. Jones? 14 Α. No. 15 Do you know who trained Zina? Q. 16 I'm not sure who trained Zina. Α. 17 Do you have any idea who it might have Q. 18 been? 19 Α. I'm not sure. She was in Europe. 20 0. So Mr. Reed worked for Ringling 21 Brothers; is that correct? 22 Α. Yes.

		Page 27
1	Q.	When did he work for Ringling
2	Brothers?	
3	Α.	I'm not sure exactly how long it was.
4	Q.	Do you know when he stopped working
5	for Ringli	ng Brothers?
6	Α.	No.
7	Q.	Was Mr. Jones a protégé of Mr. Reeds?
8	Α.	Yes.
9	Q.	Do you know anything about the
10	background	of Mr. Reed?
11	Α.	Not a lot. He was way before my time
12	but he was	a famous trainer.
13	Q.	And I take it he was an American
14	trainer; i	s that correct?
15	Α.	Yes.
16	Q.	Is he still alive, do you know?
17	Α.	No.
18	Q.	You don't know or
19	Α.	No. He's not alive. He's deceased.
20	Q.	Do you know when he died?
21	Α.	No, I do not.
22	Q.	So Mr. Reed trained Smokey Jones to

Page 28 1 train elephants; is that correct? 2 Α. Yes. 3 And did Karen receive any training at Q. all from Mr. Reed or Mr. Jones? 5 Α. No. 6 Did Nicole receive any training at all Q. 7 from Mr. Reed or Mr. Jones? 8 Α. No. 9 Who trained Nicole? Ο. 10 Α. That's a three-part question. She 11 would have been partially trained in Asia, so I do 12 not have an idea who that would be. Then she went 13 to Germany and I do not know who trained her 14 there. Then when they came to this country, Axel 15 Gautier would have trained them. 16 Okay. Are you familiar with a 17 document called the Asian Elephant North American 18 Regional Studbook? 19 Α. Yes. 20 Can you tell me what the studbook is? 0.

Alderson Reporting Company 1-800-FOR-DEPO

together by the AZA and it pretty much keeps track

It's a book that I believe is put

21

22

Α.

Page 29

- of all of the Asian elephants in the United States
- <sup>2</sup> and Canada, I believe.
- 3 Q. And these would be the captive
- 4 elephants, correct, when you say keeps track of
- 5 all the elephants?
- A. What do you mean captive, they're
- 7 captive in this country.
- Q. Well, that's what I meant. I was just
- 9 clarifying?
- 10 A. Yes.
- Q. When you say the AZA, what do you mean
- by that?
- 13 A. I believe it's the American Zoological
- 14 Association.
- 15 Q. Have you ever had occasion to consult
- the studbook about information about an elephant?
- A. From time to time.
- 18 Q. So you're familiar with entries made
- in the studbook; is that correct, in a general
- sense?
- A. Some form.
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.

Page 30 1 MS. MEYER: I just want to show you and 2 unfortunately, I only have one and I don't want to 3 make it an exhibit, I just want to show this to 4 But what I'm showing you is the North 5 American Regional Studbook Update, it's dated May 6 1st 2005 through July 16, 2007. 7 It's actually an exhibit and has been 8 produced in this case as PL 16303 and what I 9 wanted to show you and just ask you a question 10 about is the entry for Karen on page 39. 11 If you could just take a look at that, 12 please. I've got it highlighted so you could look 13 at it. 14 Α. (The witness complies.) 15 Have you looked at it? Q. 16 Α. Yes. 17 And see in that studbook entry that I Q. 18 just showed you that it says Karen was born in 19 Thailand? 20 Uh-huh. Α. 21 And you see that it also says that she Q. 22 was captured. Do you see that?

Page 31 1 Α. Right. And if you ask Mike Keele 2 about that, if they don't know, they put down wild 3 capture. 4 All right. Thank you. MS. MEYER: And 5 I want to now show you what I'd like to have 6 marked as Exhibit 4. 7 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 4 was marked for 8 identification.) 9 MS. MEYER: I ask you just to take a 10 look at that document, please. 11 MS. JOINER: I object to the exhibit. 12 It's incomplete. 13 BY MS. MEYER: 14 0. Have you had a chance to look at that 15 document? 16 Exactly what am I looking at? Α. 17 I'll get to that in a minute. I just Q. 18 want, for the record, this is a document that was 19 produced by defendant and has Bates label Feld 20 0005209. And what I wanted you to, first, I 21 wanted to ask you if you're familiar with this 22 kind of a document?

Page 32 1 Α. Yes. 2 Q. And what is this document? 3 Α. It's a Cites permit. What is a Cites permit? 0. 5 It allows you to move elephants, in Α. 6 this case, in and out of the United States. 7 And you see that the issuing date for Q. 8 this Cites permit in the middle, sort of the 9 middle of the page is February 28, 1997? 10 Α. Yes. 11 And what I wanted to ask you about, 12 you see at the bottom the list of elephants 13 there's listed, the last elephant listed actually 14 is listed with the name Karen. Do you see that? 15 Α. Yes. 16 And that would be the same Karen that 17 we've been talking about, correct? 18 Α. Yes. 19 And there's no other Karen that was 0. 20 owned by Feld Entertainment in 1997, is there? 21 Α. Correct. 22 And you see right next to that in Q.

Page 33 1 block No. 12 it says country of origin? 2 Α. Mm-hmm. 3 Q. And there it says unknown. Do you see 4 that? 5 Α. Mm-hmm. 6 Q. And this was a document that was 7 prepared by Ringling Brothers; is that correct? 8 I believe so. Α. 9 So I was wondering why that particular Q. 10 entry says unknown if, in fact, the studbook says 11 she's from Thailand? 12 Could be that there was a mistake made 13 when this was put together. 14 Okay. But in 1997, it would have been 0. 15 easy to check the studbook and see that she was 16 from Thailand, wouldn't it? 17 MS. JOINER: Objection. Argumentative. 18 Α. I don't know. 19 BY MS. MEYER: 20 So you think that would be the only 0. 21 explanation, it was a mistake? 22 Α. Yes. It was a mistake.

```
Page 34
 1
                MS. MEYER: Now, I'd like to show you
 2
     another document and have that marked as an
 3
     exhibit.
        (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 5 was marked for
 5
                       identification.)
 6
                MS. MEYER: It's been marked as Exhibit
 7
     5, and for the record, it's a document produced by
     the defendant in this case and it's Bates labeled
 9
     Feld 0005203. And I ask you to take a look at
10
     that document as well?
11
           Α.
                  (The witness complies.)
12
                BY MS. MEYER:
13
                 Have you looked at it?
           Q.
14
           Α.
                 Yes.
15
                 And this is also a Cites document; is
           Q.
16
     that correct?
17
           Α.
                  It appears to be.
18
           Ο.
                  And you see that the date of issue for
19
     this Cites document sort of toward the bottom of
20
     the page on the right-hand side is 1999?
21
           Α.
                  Yes.
22
           Q.
                  It's says June 14, 1999, correct?
```

Page 35 1 Α. Yes. 2 Form. MS. JOINER: Objection. 3 BY MS. MEYER: 4 And if you go to page 2 of this 0. 5 document, you see that there's a list of animals 6 who are the subject of this document listed on the 7 left-hand side of the second page. Do you see 8 that? 9 Yes. Α. 10 Q. And see Karen listed there? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. And that would be the same Karen that 13 we're talking about also, would it not? 14 Α. Yes. 15 And do you see also it says date of 16 birth and then origin. You see that column in the 17 middle of the page? 18 Α. Yes. 19 And it says date of birth, 1969 and 0. 20 then for origin, again, it says unknown. Do you 21 see that? 22 Α. Yes.

Page 36 1 Do you know why it would say unknown Q. 2 on this document when, in fact, the studbook shows 3 she was born in Thailand? 4 I will assume that it's an error 5 probably made from the previous permit. 6 Do you know who would have been Q. 7 responsible for preparing this document that we're 8 looking at on behalf of Ringling Brothers? 9 Α. No. 10 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 11 BY MS. MEYER: 12 Q. Do you know who would have been 13 responsible for carrying the Cites permit that we 14 marked as Exhibit 4? 15 Α. I don't see a name on it. 16 Do you know who, for example, in 1997 17 would have had the authority within the company 18 for preparing Cites documents? 19 Α. Probably legal. 20 Do you know who that would have been 0. 21 in 1997? 22 Α. No.

Page 37 1 MS. MEYER: I'd like to have another 2 document marked as an exhibit. 3 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 6 was marked for identification.) 5 MS. MEYER: I ask you to take a look at 6 that and for the record, this exhibit is also one 7 that was produced by defendant in this case and it 8 has the Bates label of Feld 0005199? 9 (The witness complies.) Α. 10 BY MS. MEYER: 11 Q. Have you had a chance to look at that 12 document? 13 Α. Yes. 14 And this is also a Cites permit; is 15 that correct? 16 Α. Yes. 17 Q. And do you see that the issuing day 18 was 10/30/2002? 19 Α. Yes. 20 And you see in block No. 12 it says 21 country of origin and it says unknown. Do you see 22 that. It's on the left-hand side of the page?

Page 38 1 Α. Yes. 2 Q. It says unknown and do you see that? 3 Α. Yes. 4 And again, this is a document that 0. 5 refers to Karen as well, which is indicated in 6 block number 9 in the middle of the page. Do you 7 see that? 8 Α. Yes. 9 So do you have an explanation for why Q. 10 it would say her country of origin was unknown on 11 this Cites permit dated 2002? 12 I would assume it just came from a 13 previous permit. 14 0. But that information about her country 15 of origin as unknown is incorrect; isn't that 16 right? 17 Would you repeat that, please? 18 0. The statement that her country of 19 origin is unknown on this document is incorrect, 20 right? 21 Yes and or no. At that time, they 22 came out of Thailand. They could have came from

Page 39 1 any of the Asian countries. 2 But earlier in the deposition when I Q. 3 asked you where she was from you said Thailand? 4 I thought she was from Thailand. Α. 5 And again, the studbook says she's Q. 6 from Thailand as well, correct? 7 That's what it says. Yes. Α. 8 I'd like to ask you some questions 9 about Nicole, if I could. Now, Nicole was born in 10 1976; is that correct? 11 Α. I believe that's what the papers say. 12 Yes. 13 And she was also wild; is that 0. 14 correct? 15 Α. I do not know. 16 Do you know what country she was from? Q. 17 Α. I believe Burma. 18 And she was purchased by Ringling Q. 19 Brothers in 1980; is that correct? 20 Α. Yes. 21 And who was she purchased from? Q. 22 Α. I'm not sure who she was purchased

Page 40 1 from but the gentleman handling the transaction 2 was an animal dealer in Germany by the name of 3 Ruhe. 4 Okay. And I'm sorry. What is his 0. 5 name? 6 Ruhe, R-U-H-E, I believe it is. Α. 7 Q. Do you know his first name? 8 Α. No. 9 Is it Herman? Ο. 10 Α. I'm not sure. 11 Q. Does that ring a bell with you? 12 Α. I'm not sure. 13 Q. And who is Mr. Ruhe? 14 Α. I believe he was an animal dealer or 15 importer. 16 And Ringling Brothers obtained Nicole Q. 17 through Mr. Ruhe; is that what you said? 18 Α. Yes. 19 Was he a German individual? 0. 20 I believe he's German. Yes. Α. 21 Was she obtained along with some other Q. 22 elephants through Mr. Ruhe by Ringling Brothers?

		Page 41
1	Α.	Yes.
2	Q.	How many other elephants, do you know?
3	Α.	Five.
4	Q.	So there was six in all?
5	Α.	Yes.
6	Q.	And were they all obtained in 1980 by
7	Ringling Brothers?	
8	Α.	Yes.
9	Q.	Who were the other five elephants?
10	Α.	Icki, Alana, Banko.
11	Q.	I'm sorry?
12	Α.	Banko. Siam.
13	Q.	Siam with an S, right?
14	Α.	Yes. How many is that?
15	Q.	Four?
16	Α.	Nicole is five and another elephant
17	named Babe,	that's 6.
18	Q.	And these elephants when they came to
19	Ringling Br	others had different names; is that
20 correct?		
21	Α.	Yes.
22	Q.	They had do you know any of those

Page 42 1 names? 2 Α. No. 3 If I gave you the names, would you 0. 4 recognize which one was Nicole's? 5 Α. I don't think so. No. 6 Do you have any idea which one would Q. 7 have been Nicole's? 8 I never knew what their names were. Α. 9 And Nicole is on the blue unit as Ο. 10 well; is that correct? 11 Α. Yes. 12 0. And how long has Nicole been on the 13 blue unit? 14 Since 1980. Α. 15 Ο. So she's been on the blue unit the 16 entire time she's been in the possession of 17 Ringling Brothers; is that correct? 18 Α. No. 19 Were there times when she was taken 0. 20 off the blue unit? 21 Α. She was at the CEC. 22 Q. When was she at the CEC?

Page 43 1 Α. I cannot remember. 2 Q. Was she taken to the CEC in order to, 3 for breeding purposes? 4 Α. No. 5 Q. She was never considered a breeding 6 candidate for the CEC? 7 Α. She was not. 8 Do you remember why she was taken to 0. 9 the CEC? 10 She didn't seem to feel well. Α. 11 Q. According to my records, she went to 12 the CEC between February of '96 and June of '97. 13 Does that comport with your memory? 14 I'm not sure. Α. 15 Do you think it was in the mid '90s, Q. 16 that she was at the CEC? 17 Α. I cannot remember exactly when she was 18 there. 19 When did you start at the CEC? Q. 20 **'**95. Α. 21 Was she at the CEC when you started Q. 22 there?

Page 44 1 I would have to check the list to see. Α. 2 0. You don't remember her being there? 3 Α. No. 4 But she was at the CEC for some period 0. 5 of time after you were at the CEC, correct? 6 Yes, she was. Α. 7 And was that, has she been at the CEC 0. before than once? 8 9 I believe so. Α. 10 So she's been taken off the road a Q. 11 couple of times and taken to the CEC, correct? 12 I believe twice. 13 Q. Do you know how long she's been back 14 at the blue unit? 15 Α. I cannot remember when. 16 According to my records, she's been 17 back on the blue unit since 2001. Does that 18 comport with your memory? 19 I'm not sure when. Α. 20 But she hasn't been at the CEC for a 21 while; is that correct? 22 Α. No. Has not.

Page 45 1 And she's been at the blue unit for Q. 2 the last several years, as far as you know? 3 Α. Yes. 4 So Nicole is about 31 or 32 years old; 5 is that correct? 6 Probably. Yes. Α. 7 But you say she's not an elephant that Q. 8 would be considered for the breeding program? 9 No. Α. 10 Why is that? Q. 11 Α. I cannot remember the exact reason but 12 it was ovarian cyst or something. 13 And Karen is about 38 or 39; is that Q. 14 correct? 15 Α. Yes. 16 Has she ever been part of the breeding Q. 17 program at the CEC? 18 No. Α. 19 Is she considered a possible candidate 0. 20 for the breeding program in the future? 21 No. Too old. Α. 22 She's too old. MS. MEYER: Now, I

Page 46 1 wanted to show you an entry in the Asian Elephant 2 Studbook that we spoke about earlier. It's the 3 same document that I referenced earlier. It's the 4 update dated May 1, 2005 to July 16, 2007, and I 5 wanted to just show you the page which is page 39. 6 It's the same page actually, I didn't 7 realize that, that Karen is on. You can actually 8 look that the exhibit and I don't even have to 9 mark it as an exhibit. Did we mark that as an 10 exhibit or I just show it to you? 11 MS. JOINER: You didn't mark it. 12 MS. MEYER: Let's mark it as an exhibit 13 because I do have copies of it. It would be 14 easier to do it that way. It's Bates labeled PL 15 16303. 16 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 7 was marked for 17 identification.) 18 MS. JOINER: And just for the record, 19 my copy doesn't have Bates labels on it. 20 MS. MEYER: Okay. Sorry about that. MS. JOINER: That's okay. 21 2.2 BY MS. MEYER:

Page 47 1 If you look at just page 2 of the Q. 2 exhibits which is page 39 of the studbook? 3 Α. Yes. 4 And the entry for Nicole at the bottom 5 of the page. Do you see that? 6 Α. Yes. 7 And it says under the column Sire Dam, Q. it says wild, wild. Do you see that? 8 9 Yes. Α. 10 Q. Do you know what that means? 11 Α. One of two things, they're either wild 12 or he didn't know what they were so he put down 13 wild. 14 How do you know they put down wild if 0. 15 they dont know what it is? 16 That's what they do. Α. 17 How do you know that? Q. 18 Mr. Keele said so. Α. 19 Mr. Keele's told that you before? Q. 20 Α. Yes. 21 Mr. Keele's told you if they don't Q. 22 know whether or not the parents of a particular

Page 48

- elephant were born in the wild, they put down wild
- in the studbook any way?
- A. Right. In fact, I believe we have
- 4 records stating that they were born in captivity.
- <sup>5</sup> Q. Who was born this captivity?
- A. Nicole.
- Okay. Do you know where she was born
- 8 in captivity?
- 9 A. I believe Burma.
- Q. So you're saying the studbook is wrong
- when it says wild, wild?
- 12 A. Yes or no, it could be or it might not
- be. I don't know.
- Q. And you see that it also says for
- Nicole in the column that's titled event, it says,
- capture. Do you see that?
- A. Is that what that means?
- 18 Q. I'm just asking you if you see the
- word capture?
- A. Yes. I see the word capture.
- 21 O. Which would seem to indicate that she
- was captured from the wild, correct?

Page 49 1 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 2 Α. I quess. I don't know. 3 BY MS. MEYER: 4 I thought you said you were familiar 0. 5 with the studbook and the entries in the studbook? 6 MS. JOINER: Objection. 7 I'm some familiar. Α. 8 BY MS. MEYER: 9 I thought you said earlier that you 0. 10 were familiar with the studbook? 11 I am somewhat familiar with it. Α. Ι 12 never read it completely. 13 I just want to know what these entries 0. 14 mean based on your knowledge of the studbook, and 15 so I was just asking you what the entry capture 16 would mean? 17 Α. I believe I have seen paperwork that 18 says she was captive. I would be more likely to 19 believe that than something in the studbook. 20 Whose paperwork have you seen? Q. I believe it's in this book here. 21 Α. 22 Q. So you have paperwork that shows that

Page 50 Nicole was born in captivity; is that correct? 1 2 I believe. Α. 3 Do you have reason as to why the Q. 4 studbook would have gotten that wrong? 5 Α. I don't know why. 6 MS. MEYER: So I'd like to have another 7 document marked as an exhibit. 8 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 8 was marked for 9 identification.) 10 BY MS. MEYER: 11 Q. I ask you to take a look at that? 12 Α. (The witness complies.) 13 0. Have you had a chance to look at that 14 document? 15 Α. Yes. 16 MS. MEYER: And for the record, this 17 was a document that was produced by the defendant, 18 and it has the Bates labeled Feld 0005354 and it 19 is an affidavit executed by Jerome F. Sowalsky, 20 spelled, S-O-W-A-L-S-K-Y. 21 And for the record, this is also a document 22 that was produced as an exhibit in support of

Page 51 1 defendant's motion for summary judgment in this 2 case. 3 BY MS. MEYER: 4 Who is Mr. Sowalsky? 0. 5 Α. I believe he's an executive vice 6 president and an attorney for Feld. 7 For Feld Entertainment? Q. 8 Α. Yes. 9 And has he worked for Feld 0. 10 Entertainment for many years? 11 Α. As far as I know. Yes. 12 And you see in this affidavit that was 13 executed by Mr. Sowalsky that he states in 14 paragraph one that, "In July, 1980, Ringling 15 Brothers and Barnum & Bailey entered into an 16 agreement to purchase six female captive-borne 17 Asian elephants from Herman Ruhe." Do you see 18 that? 19 Α. Yes. 20 Was Nicole one of those six elephants? Q. 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. And is this the document you think you

Page 52 1 were referring to when you said you saw paperwork 2 saying she was captive born? 3 Α. I believe I was looking at export 4 permits. 5 And in paragraph 2 it says, "The Asian Q. 6 elephant known as Nicole, currently on Ringling 7 Brothers' blue unit, born in 1976 is one of the 8 six Asian elephants that was imported into the 9 U.S. as part of this transaction." Do you see 10 that? 11 Α. Yes. 12 And according to your testimony, the 13 other five elephants that would have been referred 14 to in paragraph 2, actually both paragraph 1 and 15 paragraph 2 of Mr. Sowalsky's affidavit would have 16 been as I understand it Icki, Alana, Banko, Siam 17 and Babe; is that correct? 18 Α. Yes. 19 MS. MEYER: I'd like to have another 20 exhibit marked. (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 9 was marked for 21 2.2 identification.)

Page 53

- MS. MEYER: For the record, I have
- handed you an exhibit marked Exhibit 9, which is
- also a document that was produced by defendant in
- this case. It has a Bates label of Feld 0005378.
- 5 I'll have you take a look at that?
- 6 A. (The witness complies.) Yes.
- BY MS. MEYER:
- 8 Q. And this is the American Association
- of Zoo Veterinarian, Standard House Certificate.
- Do you see that?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And in the left-hand corner part of it
- is chopped off but it appears it says owner L.
- Ruhe. Do you see that?
- 15 A. Yes.
- Q. And then it says consignee, Ringling
- Brothers and Barnum & Bailey Circus. Do you see
- 18 that?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. And it's dated November 9, 1980. Do
- you see that?
- 22 A. Yes.

Page 54

- Q. So this appears to be a document that
- is, was executed in connection with the
- transaction that was spoken of in Mr. Sowalsky's
- affidavit, which was marked as Exhibit 8; is that
- 5 correct?
- A. Yes.
- <sup>7</sup> Q. And on the very left side of the
- 8 document there is a column that looks to have the
- 9 names of the six elephants who were imported or
- were purchased by Ringling Brothers through
- Mr. Ruhe; is that correct?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And they have the names Jenue, Jebju,
- Wimsalin, Soluma, Winmiasada and Solladaun. Do
- you see that?
- 16 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you know which one of those would
- have been Nicole?
- 19 A. I wouldn't have tried to pronounce
- them for the all money in China. No.
- Q. But these would appear to be the six
- elephants that Mr. Ruhe arranged to get to

Page 55

- Ringling Brothers; is that correct, in 1980?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And then so one of these elephants
- 4 would be Nicole then, correct?
- 5 A. Yes.
- O. Then you see in the middle the third
- 7 column in it says physical description and it has
- 8 the ages of the elephants?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And I think you said Nicole would have
- been about four years old. I think you said she
- was born in 1976, right?
- A. Yes.
- Q. So I see there are several, four of
- the elephants look like they were about four years
- old. Do you see that?
- 17 A. Yes.
- Q. So she's probably either Wimsalin,
- Sokuma, Winmiasada or Solladaun, correct?
- A. I'm not sure.
- Q. And you see at the bottom of that
- column it says all elephants have star-shaped

Page 56 1 brands bilaterally on dorsal buttocks. Do you see 2 that? 3 Α. Yes. 4 So that indicates that all six of 5 these elephants would have a star-shaped brand on 6 their buttock; is that correct? 7 That's what it indicates. Α. 8 0. Does Nicole have a star-shaped brand 9 on her buttock? 10 Α. No. 11 Q. Do you know was it removed by Ringling 12 Brothers? 13 Α. No. 14 0. So if Nicole doesn't have a 15 star-shaped brand on her buttock, it means she's

MS. JOINER: Objection to form.

A. She is one of the six. She just does

probably not one of these six elephants then,

 $^{20}$  not have a star.

correct?

16

17

BY MS. MEYER:

22 Q. So was there an additional elephants

Page 57 1 then, that's not accounted for in this document? 2 Α. No. 3 Do you see the bottom of the document Q. 4 there's a signature and a name? 5 Α. Yes. 6 Q. And it appears to be a veterinarian 7 Daniel C. Laughlin? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. Do you have any idea who that person 10 is? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. Who is that? 13 Α. At that time, he was a Ringling 14 Brothers veterinarian. 15 Q. He signed this document, correct? 16 That appears to be his signature. Ι 17 couldn't swear to it. 18 Do you have any idea why the Q. 19 veterinarian would sign a document saying all of 20 the elephants have a star-shaped brand on their buttock if, in fact, one of them did not? 21 22 Α. I do not know.

Page 58 1 Are there other elephants owned by Q. 2 Feld Entertainment that have star-shaped brands on 3 their buttocks? What do you mean other elephant? 5 Are there elephants owned by Feld Q. 6 Entertainment that have star-shaped brands on 7 their buttocks? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. Who are they? 10 Α. Banko, Siam and Icki II. 11 Q. Were there any other elephants ever 12 owned by Feld Entertainment that had star-shaped 13 brands on their buttocks? 14 Α. Babe. 15 Q. What about Alana? 16 Α. No. 17 Anyone else? Q. 18 Α. No. 19 So if Alana was also one of the six 0. 20 elephants listed on Exhibit 9, it would also be 21 incorrect to say that she had a star-shaped brand 22 on her buttocks; is that correct?

Page 59 1 She doesn't have one. Α. 2 Q. So just to be clear, so this document, 3 Exhibit 9, is incorrect when it says that all six 4 of the elephants who Ringling Brothers obtained 5 through Mr. Ruhe had a star-shaped brand on their 6 buttocks; is that correct? 7 Α. Obviously. 8 Okay. I want to talk about the 0. 9 elephant Jewell. Are you familiar with Jewell? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. And Jewell was born in 1951; is that 12 correct? 13 Α. Give or take a year. 14 0. And she was born in India; is that 15 also correct? 16 That's what the import papers say. Α. 17 And she was born in the wild; is that Q. 18 correct? 19 Α. Probably. But there's no way of 20 knowing. 21 Do you know what country she's from? Q. 22 India. Α.

Page 60

- Q. And do you know when Ringling Brothers
- <sup>2</sup> obtained her?
- <sup>3</sup> A. 1954.
- Q. So she was about three years old when
- <sup>5</sup> Ringling Brothers got her; is that correct?
- A. Probably.
- <sup>7</sup> Q. And Jewell is currently at the CEC; is
- 8 that correct?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And how long has she been at the CEC?
- 11 A. I don't know. She's like Nicole.
- She's been there twice.
- 13 Q. How long has she been there since she
- qot there this time?
- A. I'm not sure.
- Q. According to my records, she got there
- in about September of '06. Does that comport with
- your knowledge?
- 19 A. That might be about right.
- 20 O. And the other time that I have
- according to my records that she was at the CEC
- was between January 15, 2003 and December of 2005.

Page 61

- Does that comport with your knowledge?
- A. I'm not sure the exact dates but it
- was similar years.
- Q. And other than that, she was on the
- blue unit; is that correct?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. So how long was she actually on the
- 8 blue unit?
- 9 A. Well, technically she was on the blue
- unit from 1969 on.
- 11 Q. Until the first time she went to the
- 12 CEC, which according to my records was 2003; is
- that about right?
- $^{14}$  A. Yes.
- 0. So she was on the blue unit from 1969
- until some time in 2003, correct?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 O. Then when she when back on the road
- she went back to the blue unit; is that correct?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. So she was on the blue unit, according
- to my records and tell me if I'm wrong, between

Page 62 1 December of '05 and September of '06, does that 2 comport with your knowledge? 3 Α. I would have to look it up. 4 But is that around the time frame that 0. 5 you think she would have been on the blue unit? 6 Α. Probably. 7 At some point in time, was there some Q. 8 consideration of Jewell going to the Gulf Breeze 9 Zoo? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Can you tell me about that? 12 Α. There was a zoo benefactor up there 13 that their son really liked elephants and this 14 wealthy gentleman was going to build a facility 15 and we were going to supply them with several 16 retired elephants. 17 Where is the Gulf Breeze Zoo? Q. 18 In Gulf Breeze. Α. 19 Is that in Florida? 0. 20 Yes. Florida. Α. 21 What part of Florida is it? Q. 22 The Pan Handle. Α.

```
Page 63
 1
            Q.
                  And what was the name of this
 2
     benefactor?
 3
                  I do not know.
            Α.
 4
                  Did this actually come to pass that
 5
     Ringling Brothers supplied this entity with some
 6
     elephants?
 7
            Α.
                  No.
 8
            Q.
                  Why not?
 9
                  They did not build the exhibit.
            Α.
10
            Q.
                  Do you remember which other elephants
11
     Ringling Brothers was considering providing to the
12
     Gulf Breeze Zoo?
13
            Α.
                  Zina.
14
            Q.
                  Any others?
15
            Α.
                  No.
16
                  And are you familiar with the elephant
            Q.
17
     named Lutzi?
18
                  Yes.
            Α.
19
                  And Lutzi was born in 1950; is that
            Q.
20
     correct?
21
            Α.
                  Probably.
22
                  And she was also born in India; is
            Q.
```

Page 64 1 that correct? 2 Α. Yes. 3 And she was also born in the wild; is Q. that correct? 5 As far as we know. Α. 6 When did she go to Ringling Brothers? Q. 7 Α. 1954. 8 So she was about four years old when 9 she went to Ringling Brothers; is that correct? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. And she's currently at the Center for 12 Elephant Conservation, correct? 13 Α. Yes. 14 And how long has she been there? 15 Α. I don't know, a couple of years. I'm 16 not sure exactly when. 17 According to my records, she arrived Q. 18 at the CEC in January of 2005. Does that comport 19 with your knowledge? 20 A couple of years. Yes. 21 And prior to that time, was she on the Q. 22 blue unit?

Page 65 1 From '69 on. Α. 2 So from 1969 until about January of 0. 3 2005, she was on the blue unit; is that correct? 4 Α. Yes. 5 Did she ever spend any time at Q. 6 Williston as far as you know? 7 Yes. She was at Williston for a Α. 8 period of time before the CEC was built but I 9 don't remember the exact dates. 10 Q. Did you spend time at Williston before 11 you went to the CEC? 12 Α. Yes. 13 Q. What was your position at Williston? 14 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 15 Α. I worked a coupe of winters as a 16 handler and then when the CEC was to be built, I 17 went in there and waited to come down to the 18 Center. 19 BY MS. MEYER: 20 How long did you work at Williston? Q. 21 Α. About a year and a half. 22 Q. What year are we talking about or what

Page 66 1 time frame? 2 MS. JOINER: Objection to the form. 3 Α. I came in in February, the last of 4 February of the year of the train wreck, whatever 5 year that was. I can't remember. '94 or '93. 6 94. 7 BY MS. MEYER: 8 And Lutzi was at Williston when you 0. 9 were there; is that what you said? 10 Α. She was there was for a while. Yes. 11 Q. What is Williston, just for the 12 record? 13 Α. It's a retirement facility. 14 0. Owned by Feld Entertainment? 15 Α. Yes. 16 Are you familiar with the elephant, Q. 17 Mysore? 18 Α. Yes. 19 And Mysore was born in 1946; is that 0. 20 correct? 21 Α. Probably earlier. She came in by ship 22 in 1947, so they normally were larger than a year

Page 67 1 old. 2 When you said she came in by ship, Q. 3 came where? 4 Α. India. 5 And when did Ringling Brothers acquire Q. 6 her? 7 Α. I think I stated that in a previous 8 deposition and now I can't remember. 9 Was it about 1986? Q. 10 Α. That sounds about right. 11 Q. Who did Ringling Brothers get her 12 from? 13 Α. A guy named Tony Diano. 14 0. Who is that? 15 Α. He was a construction worker that owns 16 some elephants, a construction company that owns 17 some elephants in Ohio. 18 Was the name of his company Diamond Q. 19 Ranch? 20 I believe it was called that. 21 And did Ringling Brothers purchase Q. 22 Mysore from Tony Diano?

Page 68 1 As far as I know. Yes. Α. 2 Q. Do you know how much Ringling Brothers 3 paid for Mysore? 4 I'm not sure. Α. 5 Do you know how long Mysore has been Q. 6 at the CEC? 7 Α. Probably about a year or a little 8 more. 9 According to my records, she arrived Q. 10 at the CEC in late August of '06. Does that 11 comport with your knowledge? 12 Was it August? That would be about 13 right, I guess. 14 So she's been at the CEC since then; 0. 15 is that right? 16 Α. Yes. 17 Prior to being at the CEC, did Mysore Q. 18 spend time on the blue unit? 19 Α. Yes. 20 How long was she on the blue unit? Q. 21 Α. I'm not sure how long she was on it. 22 Q. Do you have any idea how long she was

Page 69 1 on the blue unit? 2 I'm not sure. Α. 3 Q. According to inventory records that 4 were supplied by the defendant in this case, she 5 was on the blue unit from January of 1994 until 6 March 9th of 2006. Does that comport with your 7 knowledge? 8 I know she was there quite a while. 9 Q. And Mysore also spent some time on the 10 gold unit; is that correct? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. When was that? 13 Α. Before he came back into the CEC. 14 0. Just prior to coming to the CEC? 15 Α. Correct. 16 Do you know how long she was on the Q. 17 gold unit? 18 I cannot remember. Α. 19 Do you know who handles her on the 0. 20 gold unit? 21 Α. Billy Morris. 22 Q. Is Billy Morris a Feld Entertainment

Page 70 1 employee? 2 Α. He was. 3 When did he leave Feld Entertainment? Q. 4 Α. I think several months after Mysore 5 came back. I'm not sure when. 6 Q. Several months after Mysore came back 7 in where? 8 Α. To the CEC. 9 Did any other person handle Mysore Q. 10 when she was on the gold unit? 11 Α. His wife, Libby. 12 Mr. Morris' wife --Q. 13 Α. Yes. 14 0. -- Libby. Is it Libby Morris? 15 Α. You know, I'm not sure if they're 16 married or not. 17 Anybody else handle Mysore when she Q. 18 was on the gold unit? 19 I'm not sure. Α. 20 MS. MEYER: I'd like you to take a look 21 at another document. I'll have it marked as an 22 exhibit.

Page 71 1 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 10 was marked for 2 identification.) 3 MS. MEYER: You've been handed a 4 document that's been marked Exhibit 10, Mr. 5 Jacobson. And for the record, it's a document 6 that was produced by defendant in this case and it 7 has a Bates label Feld 0005350. Have you had a 8 chance to look at that document? 9 Α. Yes. 10 Q. And this is also a Cites permit, is it 11 not? 12 Α. Yes. 13 Q. And you see the issuing date is 14 7/29/1986 at the top? 15 Α. Yes. 16 At the top right part of the document? Q. 17 Α. Yes. 18 Okay. And if you look down in the Q. 19 middle column where the elephants are described, 20 there's an entry for Mysore, it's the second one 21 from the bottom of that column. Do you see that? 22 Α. Right.

Page 72

- Q. And it indicates in the that column
- that Mysore was born in 1946; is that correct?
- A. Probably not and the reason I say that
- is they were imported in 1947 and they came by
- ship, so they had to be able to sustain themselves
- on hay, so they were probably three or four years
- 7 old.
- 9 Q. You totally lost me on that answer.
- 9 Could you explain that to me again?
- 10 A. In later years, they flew young
- elephants over by airplane. In years past when
- they came by ship, the elephants had to be older
- to be able that to make such a voyage.
- Q. Because it was a long voyage?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. I see. So what does that have to do
- with the date that's down here?
- A. Well, see, it says that she was born
- in '46. It was probably several years earlier
- $^{20}$  than that when the elephant was born.
- Q. Oh, so you think Mysore was born prior
- to 1946; is that correct?

Page 73

- 1 A. That would be more than likely true.
- Q. This is a document that was prepared
- by Ringling Brothers; is that correct?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- 5 A. Yes. But most of the dates of the
- 6 preact elephants were just kind of hearsay.
- Accurate records were not necessarily kept as
- 8 where they are now.
- 9 So if our company was told that the elephant
- was born in '46, we would have no reason to
- dispute that. I just see they're no different,
- that's all
- MS. MEYER. Okay. I appreciate that.
- 14 I'm just trying to make sense of these documents,
- that's all, that's why I'm asking the questions.
- And I have one more which I'd like to have marked
- as an exhibit. Let's take a break and then I can
- 18 figure this out.
- THE VIDEO OPERATOR: This marks the end
- of videotape 1 of the deposition of Gary Jacobson.
- Going off the record. The time is 11:08 a.m.
- This marks the beginning of videotape No. 2

Page 74 1 of the deposition of Gary Jacobson representing 2 Feld Entertainment. Going back on the record. 3 The time is 11:15 a.m. 4 MS. MEYER: I want to have another 5 document marked as an exhibit. 6 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 11 was marked for 7 identification.) 8 MS. MEYER: 9 And for the record, this is also a Q. 10 document that was produced by the defendants in 11 this case and it has a Bates label of Feld 0005335 12 through 0005337. And I ask you to take a look at 13 that? 14 Α. (The witness complies.) 15 BY MS. MEYER: 16 Have you had a chance to look at it? Q. 17 Α. Yes. 18 And this is also a Cites permit; is 0. 19 that correct? 20 Α. Yes. 21 And on the first page of the document Q. 22 you see that the issuing date is 6/14/1999 it's in

1 the middle of the page? 2 Α. Yes. 3 And this is a permit that was issued Q. 4 to Feld Entertainment; is that correct? 5 Α. Yes. 6 And can you tell from the document Q. 7 what this permit was issued for? 8 A trip to Canada. Α. 9 It was issued by the Fish and Wildlife Ο. 10 Service to allow Feld Entertainment to take some 11 elephants into Canada; is that correct?

12 A. Yes.

Q. And if you go to the very last page of

the document where there's a list of elephants.

Do you see that?

16 A. Yes.

Q. And Mysore is in the middle of the

page. In the first column, it says Mysore. Do

you see that?

20 A. Yes.

Q. And under the column date of birth it

says 1950. Do you see that?

Alderson Reporting Company 1-800-FOR-DEPO

Page 75

Page 76 1 Α. Yes. 2 0. And what would be the explanation for 3 that, having a birth date of 1950 for Mysore on 4 this document? 5 My opinion is it's just an error, Α. 6 that's all. 7 But this is based on information 0. 8 that's provided to the Fish and Wildlife Service by Feld Entertainment; is that correct? 10 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 11 Α. Could you repeat that, please. 12 BY MS. MEYER: 13 0. This document is based on information 14 that is obtained by Feld Entertainment, it's 15 provided by Feld Entertainment to the Fish and 16 Wildlife Service; is that correct? 17 Α. Yes. 18 So if there's an error with respect to 19 the date that's given for the date of birth for 20 Mysore, it's an error that was made by Feld 21 Entertainment; is that correct? 22 I would assume so. Α. Yes.

```
Page 77
 1
                  Okay. Thank you. I want to talk
           Q.
 2
     about the elephant named Susan. Are you familiar
 3
     with Susan?
           Α.
                  Yes.
 5
                  And Susan was born in 1951; is that
           Q.
 6
     correct?
 7
                  Probably.
           Α.
 8
           Q.
                  And she -- what country is she from?
 9
           Α.
                  India.
10
                  And she was also from the wild; is
           Q.
11
     that correct?
12
           Α.
                  Probably.
13
           0.
                  And when did Ringling Brothers obtain
14
     Susan?
15
                  1954.
           Α.
16
                  So she was about three years old when
17
     Ringling Brothers obtained her?
18
           Α.
                  Yes.
19
                  And she has been used on the blue
           0.
20
     unit; is that correct?
21
                  From '69 on. Yes.
           Α.
22
           Q.
                  From '69 until when was she on the
```

Page 78 1 blue unit, do you know? 2 I cannot remember when she came off. Α. 3 She's currently at the CEC though; is Q. that correct? 5 Α. Yes. 6 Q. Do you know when she got to the CEC? 7 No, I do not. Α. 8 Has she been to the CEC before in 0. 9 prior yours? 10 Α. I believe we brought her there once 11 before. 12 And she did a stint at the CEC and 13 then she went become out on the blue unit; is that 14 correct? 15 Α. Yes. 16 So she was on the blue unit from 17 1954 -- I'm sorry. Give me the years she was on 18 the blue unit? 19 She came in in 1954 and there was only 20 one unit until '69. 21 I'm sorry. 1969. So from 1969 she Q. 22 was on the blue unit. According to my records,

Page 79 1 she was on the blue unit until July of '01. Does 2 that comport with your knowledge? 3 Α. She's been there that long. I'm not 4 sure. 5 Do you remember when she first was Q. 6 transferred to the CEC? 7 Α. No. 8 Do you remember how long she stayed at 9 the CEC the first time she was transferred there? 10 No, I do not. Α. 11 Q. According to my records, she was 12 transferred to the CEC on July 21st of 2001 and 13 stayed at the CEC until November 28, 2003. Does 14 that comport with your knowledge? 15 Α. I'm not sure. 16 Do you remember her being at the CEC 17 around that time, though? 18 I remember her coming in and going Α. 19 back. Yes. 20 Around that time frame, 2001 to 2003? Q. 21 Α. That sounds about right. 22 Q. And then she went back to the blue

Page 80

- unit around November of 2003 until December of
- 2 2005, was that correct?
- A. I know she was in, then back out, then
- 4 back in.
- <sup>5</sup> Q. I'm trying to get and sense of time
- 6 periods.
- A. I'm not sure exactly when. I have to
- 8 look it up.
- 9 Q. How would you look that up? How would
- you look it up?
- 11 A. Animal census medical records.
- 12 Q. So you didn't look at any of those in
- connection with this deposition?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. If I told you that I looked at the
- animal census that Ringling Brothers provided and
- it said that Susan was back on the blue unit
- between 11/18/03 and 12/18/05, does that seem to
- be correct information to you?
- A. If that's what it says, it should be
- correct.
- Q. All right. And the last elephant I

Page 81 1 want to talk about is Zina. Are you familiar with 2 Zina? 3 Α. Yes. 4 0. And Zina was born in 1961; is that 5 correct? 6 I do not know. Α. 7 Do you have any idea when she was Q. 8 born? 9 Α. She's probably a bit older than that. 10 Q. Do you know how old she is? 11 I do not know for sure. No. Α. 12 Q. Now, when did Ringling Brothers obtain 13 Zina? It was '71 or -- 1971 or 1972. I'm 14 Α. 15 not sure exactly which. 16 And who did Ringling Brothers obtain Q. 17 Zina from? 18 Some people called the Α. 19 Chipperfields -- no the Smarts. I'm sorry. 20 Smart Circus. 21 And where is Billy Smart Circus? Q. 22 Α. It was in England.

Page 82 1 Was Zina performing with that circus? Q. 2 Α. Yes. 3 So do you know how old Zina was when Q. 4 she was obtained by Ringling Brothers from Billy 5 Smart Circus? 6 I think I believe the records say Α. 7 10, but I think she was older than that. I first saw her in 1973 and she was certainly older than 9 11 or 12 years old. 10 How old do you think she was? Q. 11 Α. Probably 17 or 18. 12 Q. What do you base that on? 13 Α. Size and the group that she was with. 14 0. Has Zina spent time on the blue unit? 15 Α. Yes. 16 From when? Q. 17 Α. I'm not sure. 18 Q. Do you have any idea? 19 Α. I would have to look it up. 20 All right. Do you know if she would 0. 21 have been put on the blue unit in 1973 when 22 Ringling Brothers first obtained her?

Page 83 1 When she first traveled on the Α. No. 2 blue unit, it was the fall of 1977. 3 Okay. How do you know that? Q. 4 Α. I was there. 5 And how long was she on the blue unit Q. 6 after the fall of 1977? 7 She was there '78 and '79 and then --Α. 8 And then after that, where did she go? 0. 9 The Circus World Theme Park. Α. 10 The Circus World Theme Park. Q. And 11 where is that? 12 It was right on the corner of Maple 13 and Main. It was on the corner of highway 27 and 14 the US, and interstate 4. 15 Q. In Florida? 16 Right. In Florida. Α. 17 How did she go from Ringling Brothers Q. 18 to Circus World Theme Park? 19 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 20 Α. They swapped groups of elephants. 21 BY MS. MEYER: 22 Q. Who swapped groups of elephants?

Page 84 1 Α. Feld Entertainment. 2 Q. Feld Entertainment swapped elephants 3 with whom? Α. Themselves. 5 Can you explain that to me? Q. 6 Α. They had two traveling shows and three 7 groups of elephants, so they made a change for two 8 years and they changed it back. 9 Do you know who Zina was swapped for? 0. 10 There was 20 elephants that went into Α. 11 the park and the 18 or so that were in there came 12 out to the show. 13 I see. And what was the Circus World 0. 14 Theme Park? 15 A theme park with a circus motif. Α. 16 Can you describe it more to me? 0. 17 me more of a description than that? 18 MS. JOINER: Objection to form.

elephants and lions and/or tigers and.

it has a circus-style show and a group of

BY MS. MEYER:

19

20

Alderson Reporting Company 1-800-FOR-DEPO

It was built by Feld Entertainment and

Page 85 1 How is it different than the Ringling Q. 2 Brothers -- the other Ringling Brothers show at 3 that time? Α. It was stationary. 5 So it was not a traveling? Q. I see. 6 Α. No. No. No. It was a park, a theme 7 park. 8 0. And how long was Zina at the Circus 9 World Theme Park? 10 Α. I do not know. 11 Q. Any of the other seven elephants, 12 other six elephants we've been talking about today 13 go to the Circus World Theme Park during that 14 time? 15 Α. Lutzi, Susan and Jewell and Karen. 16 Do you know how long those elephants 17 were at the Circus World Theme Park? 18 Α. Two years. 19 So Lutzi, Susan, Jewell, Karen and 0. 20 Zina were all at the Circus World Theme Park 21 between 1978 and 1979? No. 22 Α. No. When Zina was on the road on the

Page 86

- blue show in 1978 and '79, the other elephants
- were off the blue show and into the park.
- <sup>3</sup> Correct.
- <sup>4</sup> Q. I see. Okay.
- 5 A. So they were there two years.
- Q. All right. So Lutzi, Susan, Jewell
- and Karen were at the Circus World Theme Park
- 8 during which years?
- <sup>9</sup> A. '78 and '79.
- 10 Q. Then when Zina went to the Circus
- World Theme Park, did Lutzi, Susan and Jewell and
- 12 Karen go back to the blue unit?
- A. Back to the blue unit. Yes.
- 0. Who were the handlers at the Circus
- World Theme Park, the elephant handlers?
- A. When it started in 1974, the gentleman
- in charge was Bill Woodcock.
- 18 O. Is that Buckles Woodcock?
- A. Yes. And Scott Riddle was there?
- O. Scot Riddle?
- A. Yes. Ben Williams and myself and a
- couple of other guys that we had kind of joined

```
Page 87
 1
     out in the process.
 2
            Q.
                  That you kind of what?
 3
            Α.
                  Had hired in the process.
 4
                  Do you remember any of their names?
            0.
 5
            Α.
                  Bill Bouthillier.
 6
            Q.
                  Bill?
 7
                  Bouthillier.
            Α.
 8
                  How do you spell that?
            Q.
 9
                  B-O-U-T-H-I-L-L-I-E-R.
            Α.
10
            Q.
                  Okay.
11
                  Tom Hafner.
            Α.
12
            Q.
                  Is that H-A-F-F-N-E-R?
13
            Α.
                  I think one F. And later there was Ted
14
     Svertesky?
15
            Q.
                  How do you spell Ted Svertesky's last
16
     name?
17
            Α.
                  S-V-E-R-T-E-S-K-Y.
18
            Q.
                  Is this the same Ted Svertesky that
19
     you identified when I interviewed you, when I
20
     deposed you earlier who was in one of the tapes of
21
     a birth of an elephant?
22
            Α.
                  Yes.
```

```
Page 88
 1
                  Okay. Is this also the same
            Q.
 2
     individual who was killed in the train wreck that
 3
     you referred to?
           Α.
                  Yes.
 5
                  Do you remember any other handlers at
            Q.
 6
     the Circus World Theme Park?
 7
                  Mike Aria.
           Α.
 8
                  Aria?
            Q.
 9
           Α.
                  Aria.
10
           Q.
                  Okay. Who else?
11
           Α.
                  Wayne Dedham. Chris Shacht.
12
                  Shacht?
           Q.
13
                  Shacht, S-H-A-C-H-T.
           Α.
14
            Q.
                  Okay.
15
           Α.
                  Axel Gautier, Suni Ridley, Darryl
16
     Atkinson, a guy named Ziggy.
17
            Q.
                  Ziggy?
18
                  Yes. I can't remember his last name.
19
     Frans Tish.
20
                  T-I-S-H?
            0.
21
                  Yes. And I think that's about all I
22
     can ridge out.
```

Page 89

- 1 Q. That's pretty good. How long was the
- <sup>2</sup> Circus World Theme Park in operation?
- <sup>3</sup> A. From '74 to '85 or '86.
- O. Some of the handlers who worked at the
- 5 Circus World Theme Park also worked on the blue
- 6 unit; is that correct?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- Q. Can you tell me which of the handlers
- you've named also worked on the blue unit? Did
- Buckles Woodcock work on the blue unit?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 O. When did he work on the blue unit?
- 13 A. '78 and '79.
- 0. Would he have handled all of the
- elephants who were on the blue unit at that point
- in time?
- 17 A. Yes. But it was a group that he put
- together. It wasn't the blue unit elephants that
- we're talking about now.
- Q. Okay. It was a different group of
- elephants?
- 22 A. Yes.

Page 90

- 1 Q. It wasn't any of the seven that we're
- talking about today?
- A. Zina would be the only one.
- Q. All right. What about Axel Gautier,
- would he have handled any of the blue unit
- 6 elephants?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Would he have handled any -- let's do
- 9 it this way: Would he have handled any of the
- seven elephants that we're speaking of today, and
- by those elephants, I mean Karen, Nicole, Zina,
- Jewell, Susan, Mysore and Jewell?
- A. I don't think he handled Zina but all
- $^{14}$  the rest of them.
- MS. JOINER: Before you ask another
- question, do you want to open one of your notices
- $^{17}$  here with the list so he can look at the list when
- $^{18}$  you say the seven? I mean --
- MS. MEYER: I think he knows them.
- That's up to you. Would that help you. You know
- which seven I'm talking about.
- A. Sure.

Page 91 1 MS. MEYER: Would you like to see the 2 list, that would be great. That would be fine. 3 MS. JOINER: That's just the list but 4 that might help streamline things a bit. 5 MS. MEYER: That's fine. 6 BY MS. MEYER: 7 So we were talking about Axel Gautier Q. 8 handling, which of the blue unit elephants has 9 he's handled? 10 I believe all of them except Zina. Α. Ι 11 don't think he had anything to do with Zina. 12 Q. What about Suni Ridley, which of the 13 seven elephants has Suni Ridley handled? 14 Α. All of them but Zina. Well, he 15 handled Zina, too, but at a later date. 16 Did Axel Gautier handle Zina at a 0. 17 later date? 18 No. I do not think so. Let me Α. 19 rephrase that. 20 What about Scott Riddle, which of the 0. 21 seven elephants has Scott Riddle handled? 22 Α. I believe only Zina in that group.

Page 92 1 I think the record is getting a little Q. 2 unclear here. When I'm asking you about these 3 individuals, let's not confine the time period I'm 4 asking you about to the Circus World Theme Park or 5 for the 1970s. I want to talk about if you know 6 if any of these handlers have ever handled any of 7 these seven elephants. Do you understand that? 8 Yes. And that was not referring in 9 there was Zina because Scott and Zina were in a 10 different place. 11 Q. I'm sorry. You lost me on that one. 12 I was already doing what you asked. 13 0. Okay. Great. I just wanted to be 14 clear. So when I asked you if Scott Riddle has 15 handled any of the seven elephants, I'm sorry, 16 what is the answer? 17 I believe the only one would be Zina. Α. 18 When did he handle Zina? 0. 19 I believe it was for a Disney parade Α. 20 in 1985 or '86. 21 Was it just a one-shot deal? Q. 22 Α. Like 10 weeks, something like that.

Page 93 1 And when did Mr. Woodcock handle any Q. 2 of the seven elephants? 3 He would have handled Zina from Α. 4 December of '73 until November of '79, then, that 5 would have been Zina. Then he would have been 6 back around Karen, Nicole, Lutzi, Susan, Jewell, 7 Zina and Mysore, if the record shows that Mysore 8 was on the show in the same year that Ted 9 Svertesky got killed. When Ted got killed, Bill 10 Woodcock came over and took over the blue show 11 elephants. 12 Q. How long was Woodcock at the blue 13 show? 14 Α. About a season and a half. 15 Q. So that would be about a year and a 16 half? 17 Α. Roughly. 18 Q. Do you know when Ted got killed? 19 Α. I think it was January 13, 1994, I 20 think. 21 What about Ben Williams. Which of the Q. 22 seven elephants would he have handled and when?

Page 94 1 Ben would only have been around Zina. Α. 2 Q. During what period of time? 3 Α. 1974 until 1976 probably. 4 0. Okay. What about -- sorry? 5 Then again, back around Zina again in Α. 6 late in '77 through '79 then that would have been 7 it for him. 8 And that would have been? 9 That's it. He wouldn't have been Α. 10 around any of the rest of them. 11 Q. And what about Mr. Hafner, Tom Hafner, 12 when would he have handled any of these seven 13 elephants? 14 Α. He would have been around Zina in 1974 15 and then from '74, I believe, through 1979. 16 then --17 I'm sorry. We're still talking about Q. 18 Zina? 19 Just Zina. And then he would have Α. 20 worked for Axel at some time, I'm not sure, 21 probably in the '70s or early '80s, and he would 22 have been around Karen, Nicole, Lutzi, Susan and

Page 95

- Jewell. I don't think Mysore was there. No. I
- didn't know Mysore then and Zina was not on the
- 3 show then.
- Q. Okay.
- 5 A. Then he vanished and Ted Svertesky
- 6 brought him back in the fall of 1993 to go back
- with him on the blue show. So he would have been
- on the blue show late in '93, all of '94 and about
- <sup>9</sup> half of '95.
- 10 Q. So whichever of the elephants were on
- the blue show during that period of time, would
- have been handled by Mr. Hafner; is that correct?
- A. Karen, Nicole, Lutzi, Mysore, Zina and
- Jewell because Mysore wouldn't have been there
- 15 then.
- Q. What about, I'm not sure we completely
- covered Ted Svertesky. Which of the seven
- elephants would he have handled and when?
- 19 A. He would have been around Zina with
- the Circus World group and probably from 197 -- he
- $^{21}$  was there about six months in the early, mid '70s,
- then he left, I don't know when the dates were and

Page 96

- then he came back in 1976, I believe and he stayed
- through '77 and '78 then he left.
- But then -- and at that time he was not
- <sup>4</sup> around Jewell, Susan, Mysore, Lutzi, Nicole or
- 5 Karen he was not around them. He was around Zina.
- Then he ended up with the remains, the left over
- <sup>7</sup> elephants from the third herd. Ted ended up with
- 8 them and Zina would have been part of that group.
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 A. Then he built the facility at
- Williston and moved the group there.
- 12 Q. And that's when Zina went to
- Williston?
- 14 A. That's when Zina went to Williston and
- then later she went back on the show?
- Q. Do you know when that was that he took
- <sup>17</sup> Zina to Williston?
- A. I think that was 1986, I believe. '85
- <sup>19</sup> or '86.
- Q. All right.
- A. And then when he went to the blue show
- in the fall of '94, he would have been back around

Page 97 1 all of his elephants again, including Zina. Ι 2 think '94. Actually, late in '93. 3 Q. Okay. What about Ben Williams, which 4 elephants would have he have handled and when? 5 Α. Zina. 6 Q. Is that it? 7 He worked for me for a short time at Α. 8 the CEC, but I don't think he ever did anything 9 with Susan or Mysore or any of those elephants. 10 He was just hired in to deal with the young ones. 11 Q. And when was that? 12 Α. Three years ago. 13 Q. Can you be more precise on the dates? 14 Α. He wasn't there very long. He was 15 only there three or four months. 16 Okay. So we're talking 2005? Q. 17 Α. The year of all the hurricanes. 2005. 18 Why was he only there three or four Q. 19 months? 20 He left. Α. 21 Where did he go? Q. 22 Α. Back to his truck driving job.

Page 98

- 1 Q. You've obviously worked with all of
- these elephants, correct?
- A. Yes. To a certain extent.
- Q. Can you tell me the years that you
- worked with these elephants and where you worked
- 6 with them?
- A. I was around Zina from late '73 until
- late in '76, then back around her late in '77, all
- of '78, three months of '79 and I guess after Ted
- built the place in Williston, I would have been in
- there. I probably would have been around Mysore,
- Susan, and I think maybe Nicole was there at one
- 13 time.
- 14 O. This would have been in --
- A. Well, the early '90s. I was in there
- working for the company in the wintertime is all.
- Q. What were you doing?
- A. Just taking care of the elephants,
- 19 pretty much.
- Q. And before we get to the next time
- period, the time you were working with Zina in the
- '70s that you've outlined, was when she was

Page 99

- traveling in the show; is that correct?
- A. At the theme park and traveling with
- $^3$  the show.
- Q. Okay. And when else would you have
- worked with any of these seven elephants?
- A. Off and on since I came back to work
- <sup>7</sup> for the company.
- Q. I think we spoke earlier that you were
- on the blue unit in the late 1990s; is that
- 10 correct?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. So whichever of these elephants were
- on the blue unit in the late 1990s, you would have
- had some responsibility for handling them,
- 15 correct?
- A. I wouldn't necessarily say
- responsibility, but I may have been around them
- $^{18}$  and handled one of them for any reason.
- 19 Q. And you obviously handled the
- elephants who are currently at the CEC, correct?
- A. Yes.
- Q. What about Mike Aria, which of the

Page 100

- 1 elephants has he handled?
- A. Zina would be the only one.
- Q. When would that you have been?
- <sup>4</sup> A. It would have been probably '74
- 5 through '77.
- Q. And what about Wayne Dedham?
- A. He would have been around Zina in the
- 8 mid '70s probably '75, '76, '77.
- 9 Q. What about Bill Bouthillier?
- A. He was around Zina at the theme park.
- Q. What year was that?
- 12 A. '74, '75 and then he left some time in
- $^{13}$  the mid '70s and came back in the fall of 1977 and
- stayed until the summer of 1978.
- Q. Came back where?
- A. To the theme park, Circus World Theme
- 17 Park.
- Q. Did he work with any of the other
- 19 elephants?
- A. He worked for us in -- he was never on
- the road with the blue show. He worked for us in
- 22 at the CEC but it was before the year 2000. I'm

Page 101 1 not sure if any of those elephants were there or 2 not before the year 2000. 3 Okay. What about Chris Shacht? Q. 4 He was at Circus World. I'm not sure 5 In the mid '70s. how long. 6 So which elephants would he have been 7 around? 8 Α. Zina would have been the only one. 9 Did he have some responsibility for Q. 10 handling Zina at some point? 11 He was a handler, so it's possible, I Α. 12 quess. 13 Did he handle her at any other period Q. 14 of time? 15 Α. Not that I'm aware of. 16 He didn't handle any of the other Q. 17 elephants? 18 Not on that list. No. Α. 19 What about Suni Ridley? 0. 20 Suni would have handled all of them. Α. 21 When would he have handled all of Q. 22 Just for the record, Suni Ridley is Robert

Page 102

- 1 Ridley; is that correct?
- A. Yes. Whenever he came on the show
- which would have been a year or two before Karen
- 4 probably?
- 5 Q. So --
- A. He would have been there, I think,
- when Karen got there, when Nicole got there.
- Q. I think you said Karen started on the
- <sup>9</sup> show in 1969?
- 10 A. Right. I think Suni was already
- there.
- Q. Mr. Ridley was already there in 1969?
- A. I think so.
- Q. So Mr. Ridley has been on the blue
- unit since 1969, correct?
- A. Except for the two years he was at the
- theme park. Yes.
- Q. And when was he at the theme park?
- <sup>19</sup> A. '78 and '79.
- Q. So Mr. Ridley handled all of the seven
- elephants during the time they were on the blue
- unit; is that correct?

Page 103

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. And during any time they were at the
- theme park; is that correct?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to the form.
- A. Zina would not have been at the theme
- 6 park, that would have came later when she migrated
- become to the blue show.
- MS. MEYER: Okay. All right.
- 9 BY MS. MEYER:
- 10 Q. I'm not sure we covered Axel, so I
- want to go over him, Axel Gautier. Which of the
- seven elephants would he have handled and when?
- 13 A. I do not think he was around Zina, I
- think he was around all of the others.
- O. When was that?
- 16 A. I believe he came to the company in
- the early '60s, I believe, and I'm not sure if he
- ever was around Zina or not but I don't believe
- 19 so.
- Q. So which of the elephants would he
- 21 have handled?
- A. All of them but Zina as far as I know.

Page 104 1 And from the early '60s until when Q. 2 would he have, what periods of time would he have 3 handled these other elephants? 4 Until the early '90s. Α. 5 Q. Do you know who Axel Gautier received 6 his elephant training from? 7 Hugo Schmidt. Α. 8 0. Is Axel Gautier related to Mark 9 Gautier? 10 I don't know Mark Gautier. Α. 11 Q. And somebody named Atkinson, I didn't 12 get the first name? 13 Α. Darryl. 14 0. Darryl Atkinson. When did he work 15 with any of the seven elephants? 16 He would have been around Karen, 17 Nicole, Lutzi, Susan and Jewell. 18 When would that have been? 0. 19 I'm not sure. I believe it would have Α. 20 been in the 1980s but I'm not exactly sure. 21 When the elephants were on the show? Q. 22 Α. Yes.

		Page 105
1	Q.	Until when?
2	Α.	I don't know.
3	Q.	Do you know who Scott Riddle received
4	his elephant training from?	
5	Α.	Probably Woodcock, Robert Smokey
<sup>6</sup> Jones.		
7	Q.	William Woodcock is Buckles Woodcock?
8	Α.	Yes.
9	Q.	What's your basis for saying that?
10	Α.	Pardon?
11	Q.	How do you know that that's who he got
12	his training from?	
13	Α.	Scott's a good friend of mine.
14	Q.	Frans Tish?
15	Α.	Frans Tish.
16	Q.	Frans Tish. When did Frans Tish work
17	with any of	these seven elephants?
18	Α.	I believe the only one he would have
19	been around	would have been Zina.
20	Q.	And when would that have been?
21	Α.	That would have been in 1970 late
22	in '79 afte	r Woodcock left, Frans took over.

Page 106 1 What about the individual named Ziggy. Q. 2 When did Ziggy work with any of these elephants? 3 Α. He would have been around Karen, 4 No, not Nicole. Pardon me. Karen, Nicole. 5 Lutzi, Susan and Jewell. He was on the blue show 6 in the mid '70s and he was at the theme park at 7 least one year. I'm not sure about the second 8 year. 9 And do you know who Buckles Woodcock 0. 10 received his training from, his elephant training 11 from? 12 Α. William Woodcock, Sr. 13 Q. Is that the colonel? 14 Α. The colonel. 15 Do you know who Frans Tish received Q. 16 his training from? 17 I don't know. Α. 18 What about Darryl, do you know who Q. 19 trained him? 20 Axel Gautier. Α.

Alderson Reporting Company 1-800-FOR-DEPO

How about Ziggy, do you know who

21

22

trained him --

Page 107 1 Axel Gautier. Α. 2 Q. How about Suni, who trained him to be 3 an elephant handler? Α. Hugo and Axel Gautier. 5 Hugo Schmidt? Q. 6 Α. Hugo Schmidt. Yes. 7 What about Chris Shacht, who trained 0. 8 him to be an elephant handler? 9 Α. He spent some time around Bill Woodcock and I'm not sure who else. His parents 10 11 own an elephant. 12 When you say Bill Woodcock, there's 13 two Bill Woodcocks, right? 14 Α. Well, Buckles. 15 Do you know if Buckles Woodcock gave Q. 16 Mr. Shacht any training on how to handle an 17 elephant? 18 Yes. Α. 19 He did? 0. 20 He would have. Yes. Α. 21 And what about Wayne Durham do you Q. 22 know who -- is that his name?

Page 108 1 Α. Wayne Dedham. Yes. He was in the 2 Circus World. 3 Do you know who trained him to be an Q. 4 elephant handler? 5 Α. Would have been Buckles Woodcock. 6 Q. And what about Mike Aria. Do you know 7 who would have trained him to be an elephant 8 trainer? 9 Buckles Woodcock. Α. 10 Q. And who would have trained Bill 11 Bouthillier? 12 Buckles Woodcock. Α. 13 Q. What about Tom Hafner, who would have 14 trained him? 15 Α. Buckles Woodcock. 16 What about Ben Williams, who would 17 have trained him? 18 Buckles Woodcock. And I forgot Α. 19 actually I have two sons that were also at the 20 theme park, Michael and Kevin. 21 Michael and Kevin? Q. 2.2 Α. Gauthier.

		Page 109
1	Q.	Who would have trained Michael
2	Gauthier?	
3	Α.	Their father, Axel Gautier.
4	Q.	And what was the other son's name?
5	Α.	Kevin.
6	Q.	How long did Michael Gautier work at
7	this theme	park?
8	Α.	Two years.
9	Q.	Did he ever work on the blue unit?
10	Α.	Yes.
11	Q.	When did he work on the blue unit?
12	A.	From the time he was born until his
13	father got	killed. I don't know how old he is but
14	he was on t	the blue show for 20 years.
15	Q.	Until about 1990, would you say
16	A.	I think that's
17	Q.	I'm sorry.
18	A.	I think that's '91 but I'm not exactly
19	sure.	
20	Q.	What about Kevin Gautier, when did he
21	work for Fe	eld Entertainment or Ringling Brothers?
22	Α.	His entire life also.

Page 110 1 Q. And was he on the blue unit as well? 2 Α. Yes. 3 Q. When was he on the blue unit? 4 Α. From the time he was born until his 5 dad got killed. 6 So also until about 1991? Q. 7 Α. Yes. 8 And you said both of them would have 9 been trained by Axel Gautier, correct? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Did we cover Darryl Atkinson? Who 12 trained Darryl Atkinson? 13 Α. Axel Gautier. 14 MS. MEYER: I need to take a break. So 15 can we take a 10-minute break? 16 THE VIDEO OPERATOR: We are going off 17 the record. The time is 12 p.m. 18 We're going on the record. The time is 19 12:08 p.m. 20 BY MS MEYER: 21 Mr. Jacobson, you mentioned a Q. 22 Mr. Keele in your testimony. Who were you

Page 111

- <sup>1</sup> referring to?
- A. John Keele -- Michael Keele. I'm
- 3 sorry. There is also a John Keele.
- 4 O. Who is Michael Keele?
- 5 A. I believe he is in charge of the
- 6 agents that are working for us.
- Q. What's your basis for saying that?
- A. I think his name is on the cover of
- 9 the book.
- Q. And when I was talking to you about
- Jewell, at one point you said she was technically
- on the blue unit in 1969. Do you remember that
- 13 testimony?
- A. Right.
- Q. What did you mean by that?
- 16 A. In 1954 when she came over, there was
- one circus. In 1969 Feld Entertainment bought
- another show from Europe and brought it over, so
- now there were two shows, a different group of
- elephants.
- So the elephants that were on Ringling
- 22 Brothers and Barnum & Bailey are the ones that

Page 112 1 ended up on the blue unit, the blue show. The 2 ones that came in were in the red show. 3 Q. And I just wanted to clarify, David 4 Polke's position on the blue unit, his current 5 position on blue unit? 6 He's the elephant superintendent. Α. 7 How long has he held that position? 0. 8 Since the show closed in the fall. Α. 9 The fall of 2007? 0. 10 Α. In November. Yes. He was the animal 11 superintendent and then he became the elephant 12 superintendent. 13 0. How long was he the animal 14 superintendent of the blue unit? 15 Α. I can't remember. 16 So he was the animal superintendent 0. 17 until the fall of 2007; is that correct? 18 Α. Yes. 19 So he's got a new title; is that 0. 20 right? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. So right now he's the elephant

Page 113 1 superintendent. 2 Α. Yes. 3 And what's the difference between 0. 4 those two positions? 5 The overall animal superintendent is Α. 6 kind of in charge of setting it all up and making 7 sure everything goes in the right places, and 8 theoretically, the tiger trainer, the horse 9 trainer, the elephant superintendent would all 10 report to the animal superintendent. 11 Q. And who was the elephant 12 superintendent on the blue unit until Mr. Polke 13 became the elephant superintendent? 14 Α. Mike. 15 Q. Mike Hayward? 16 Α. Mike Hayward. 17 And how long was Mike Hayward the Q. 18 elephant superintendent? 19 Probably six months. Α. 20 What is Mike Hayward's current 0. 21 position on the blue unit? 22 Α. He's resigned.

		Page 114
1	Q.	He resigned. When did he resign?
2	Α.	When the show closed in November.
3	Q.	Do you know why he resigned?
4	Α.	He got married and became a farrier.
5	Q.	A farrier? What do you mean by that?
6	Α.	Shoes horses.
7	Q.	Where does he do that?
8	Α.	Northern California.
9	Q.	Where in Northern California?
10	Α.	I believe it's San Jose.
11	Q.	Did he stay as the elephant
12	superintend	ent of the blue unit until the show
13	closed in November of 2007?	
14	Α.	Yes.
15	Q.	And how long was Mike Hayward with the
16	blue unit?	
17	Α.	I believe seven years or six.
18	Q.	I'm sorry?
19	Α.	Six or seven years.
20	Q.	Now, what I want to do is ask you
21	about some	Ringling Brothers employees and ask you
22	if you know	them and ask you if you know when they

Page 115

- 1 may have worked with any of the seven elephants.
- Okay. And the first one I have on my list is Gram
- 3 Chipperfield? Do you know who Gram Chipperfield
- 4 is?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Who is he?
- A. He was a British tiger
- 8 trainer/elephant presenter.
- 9 Q. And did he work for Feld Entertainment
- at one point?
- A. Yes.
- 12 Q. When did he work for Feld
- 13 Entertainment?
- A. I'm not sure.
- Q. Was he working for Feld Entertainment
- <sup>16</sup> in 1997?
- 17 A. I believe he would have been. Yes.
- Q. Was he working on the blue unit?
- 19 A. I'm not sure. He was on the red and
- the blue.
- Q. Do you know whether he worked with any
- of the seven elephants?

Page 116

- A. He was on the blue. I would assume he
- would have had something to do with all of them.
- 3 Q. So all of the elephants who were on
- 4 the blue unit at the time that Mr. Chipperfield
- worked on the blue unit, he would have had some
- 6 responsibility for handling those elephants; is
- <sup>7</sup> that correct?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Can you give me any better dates for
- when Mr. Chipperfield would have been working on
- the blue unit?
- 12 A. I'm not sure exactly when he left. He
- came over one year on the red show, the lion act
- and then he moved over to the blue show.
- 0. Was this in the late 1990s?
- A. Yes, I believe.
- 17 Q. You think he was at the blue unit from
- 1997, some time in 1997 until some time in 1999?
- Does that comport with your knowledge?
- A. I don't know. I would have to ask
- somebody. I thought he was there later than '99.
- Q. Did he have any responsibility for

Page 117

- 1 presenting elephants on the blue unit?
- A. Yes, he did.
- 3 Q. So would he have been responsible for
- 4 presenting the elephants who were on the blue unit
- during the time that he worked there?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And did he also have responsibility
- for training any of those elephants? We're
- <sup>9</sup> talking about the seven elephants that are the
- subject of this deposition?
- 11 A. Depends on what you call training. He
- would have been involved in routining them. Yes.
- Q. When you say routining, what do you
- 14 mean?
- 15 A. Changing the act from one year to the
- next or choreographing the elephant part of the
- show from one year to the next.
- Q. And if that involved teaching an
- elephant a new trick, he would be the person who
- would have done that during that time period?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- A. It's possible but most of these older

Page 118

- elephants kind of by then did everything they were
- going to do and it would have been just changing
- the routine, moving two of them over here or two
- over here and just swapping things around, not so
- 5 much training.
- BY MS. MEYER:
- <sup>7</sup> Q. So he was principally a presenter of
- 8 elephants during the time that he worked on the
- 9 blue unit; is that correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And he also handled the elephants when
- he worked on the blue unit?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 0. What about an individual named Jeff
- Pettigrew. Do you know who he is?
- 16 A. Yes.
- Q. Who is he?
- A. He was on the blue show.
- O. When was he on the blue show?
- A. I don't know. He was there two or
- three times I think but I'm not sure what the
- dates are.

Page 119

- Q. Would he have had responsibility for
- handling any of the seven elephants that we're
- 3 talking about?
- A. I would think so. Yes.
- Q. Which ones?
- A. Probably all of them. The exception
- yould be I don't know if he was there when Mysore
- 8 was there or not.
- 9 Q. But if he was on the blue unit when
- Mysore was on the blue unit, he would have had
- some responsibility for handling Mysore; is that
- 12 correct?
- 13 A. Yes.
- Q. What about Mr. Ridley. We spoke about
- 15 him earlier?
- A. Suni.
- Q. Suni. He would have had
- responsibility for handling all of those seven
- elephants when they were on the blue unit; is that
- 20 correct?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Did Jeff Pettigrew ever work at the

Page 120 1 CEC? 2 Α. No. 3 What about Alex Vargas, who is he? Q. 4 Α. He's the animal superintendent on the 5 red show. 6 But he worked on the blue unit at one Q. 7 period of time; is that correct? 8 Α. Yes. 9 When was that? 0. 10 Α. I'm not sure. 11 Q. Do you have any idea? 12 Α. He was, he left the blue to go to the 13 red, I think two years ago he left the blue. 14 he was on the show for some years and then left 15 and then came back. 16 When you say he was on the show, was 0. 17 he on the blue unit? 18 He was on the blue unit. Α. 19 And that's what I'm trying to figure 0. 20 When was he on the blue unit? 21 I'm not sure. Α. 22 Q. Was it also the late 1990s?

Page 121 1 It would have been. Α. Yes. 2 0. So would he have had responsibility 3 for handling the elephants who were on the blue 4 show in the late 1990s? 5 He was a presenter some time in there. Α. 6 Yes. 7 Q. So he would have had responsibilities 8 for handling the elephants in the blue show in the 9 late 1990s? 10 Α. Yes. 11 That would include all of the seven Q. 12 elephants at issue here? 13 Α. If they were there, he would have. 14 Yes. 15 What about Randy Peterson. Do you Q. 16 know who he is? 17 Α. Yes. 18 Who is he? Ο. 19 He was brought over to help Gram 20 Chipperfield with the elephants and then he became 21 the elephant superintendent. 22 Q. When was that?

Page 122 1 Α. I'm not sure what year it was. 2 Q. And was that an elephant 3 superintendent for the blue unit? 4 Α. Yes. 5 Q. Was he with the blue unit in the late 6 1990s? 7 I believe so. Yes. Α. 8 And how long was he with the blue 0. 9 unit? 10 It was two or four years. Α. 11 Q. Is he British? 12 Α. No. 13 Q. And did he have responsibility for 14 handling any of the seven elephants when he worked 15 on blue unit? 16 If they were there, he would have had 17 responsibility. 18 So as far as you know, he had Q. 19 responsibility for handling all of the seven 20 elephants at one point in time; is that correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 What about Andy Weller, who is he? Q.

	Page 123
1	A. I vaguely remember the guy.
2	Q. What do you remember about him?
3	A. He was a handler.
4	Q. Was he a handler for the blue unit?
5	A. Yes.
6	Q. Do you know when he was a handler for
7	the blue unit?
8	A. Probably some time in that time frame.
9	Q. The late 1990s?
10	A. Yes. I think he worked for Randy.
11	I'm not sure.
12	Q. If he worked for Randy on the blue
13	unit, would he have had responsibility for
14	handling the seven elephants at issue here?
15	A. I don't think he went around Karen.
16	Q. Why do you say that?
17	A. I don't remember the guy very well and
18	if I don't remember him very well, that means he
19	probably wasn't there very long so that means he
20	probably wasn't around Karen.
21	Q. What makes you say how do you
22	deduce that he wasn't around Karen?

Page 124 1 Α. Because she's a little grumpy. 2 Q. So why wouldn't he be around her? 3 Α. Because he was sort of goofy. 4 Like the seven dwarfs. Can you be 0. 5 more specific? 6 I don't remember the guy very well. Α. 7 So if I don't remember him, then I don't think he 8 was there very long. 9 Is the fact that he wasn't there very 0. 10 long the reason you said he probably wasn't around 11 Karen? 12 Α. He probably was inexperienced, I 13 believe. 14 0. I see. So because he was 15 inexperienced he wouldn't have been around Karen; 16 is that what you're saying? 17 That would be my assumption anyway. Α. 18 Q. And why is that? 19 Α. Because she's a little testy sometimes 20 with strange people and he was strange. 21 And so inexperienced handlers would Q. 22 not work with Karen; is that correct?

Page 125 1 Α. Probably not. No. 2 Is she the only elephant that Q. 3 inexperienced elephants would not have worked with of the seven that we're talking about? 5 Α. Yes. 6 What about Adam Hill. Do you know who Q. 7 he is? 8 Yes. Α. 9 Who is he? Q. 10 Α. He was a presenter. 11 Q. Was he a presenter for the blue unit? 12 Α. Yes. 13 Q. When was that? 14 Α. Probably right in about the same time 15 frame. 16 Late 1990s? Q. 17 Α. Yes. 18 '97 to '99? Ο. 19 I don't know but it would be in there Α. 20 somewhere. 21 And was he both the presenter and a Q. 22 handler of elephants?

Page 126

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. And would he have had responsibility
- <sup>3</sup> for presenting and handling the seven elephants at
- 4 issue here?
- 5 A. I don't know if he presented all of
- them but he would have handled all of them.
- <sup>7</sup> Q. Okay. And did Randy Peterson also
- 8 work at the CEC?
- 9 A. Yes.
- Q. When was that?
- 11 A. I think 2000 and 2001. I would have
- to look it up. He was there about two years, I
- 13 think.
- 0. What did he do at the CEC?
- 15 A. He was operations manager.
- Q. What does that mean?
- A. He kind of took care of the day-to-day
- procedures for me.
- Q. And were any of the seven elephants at
- issue here at the CEC when Mr. Peterson worked at
- $^{21}$  the CEC?
- A. I'm sure some of them were. I would

Page 127

- 1 have to look it up.
- Q. I'm sorry. When was he at the CEC?
- A. I thought it was about the year 2000
- or 2001 but I'm not completely sure.
- 5 Q. So if, in fact, some of the seven
- 6 elephants were at the CEC at the time period that
- Mr. Peterson was at the CEC, would he have had
- 8 some responsibility of handling them at the CEC?
- 9 A. Yes, he would.
- Q. And how long was Adam Hill employed by
- 11 Feld Entertainment?
- A. I'm not sure.
- Q. Do you know when he left the circus?
- A. I cannot remember.
- Do you know if Adam Hill had anything
- to do with making bull hooks for handlers on the
- 17 blue unit?
- 18 A. I do not know if he made them for
- handlers. I knew he made hooks, but I'm not aware
- of them being put in the hands of handlers.
- O. Who did he make them for?
- A. Himself.

Page 128 1 How do you know he made them? Q. 2 I think I saw him make them. He makes Α. 3 all kinds of things out of metal. 4 But you don't know whether or not he 5 provided some of his bull hooks to some of the 6 other crew on the blue unit during that time? 7 No, I do not know. Α. 8 What about Pat Harned. Who is he? 0. Do 9 you know Pat Harned? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Who is he? Q. 12 Α. He works for me at the CEC. 13 Q. Prior to him working at the CEC, he 14 worked the blue unit for some period of time; is 15 that correct? 16 Α. Yes. 17 And he worked at the blue unit -- when Q. 18 did he work at the blue unit? 19 It's got to be in my previous Α. 20 deposition somewhere. 21 Was he there during the late 1990s? Q. 22 Α. Yes.

Page 129 1 Was he there between 1997 and 1999? Q. 2 Α. I believe so. 3 Q. I think you testified he left when 4 Benjamin died and that was July 25 of 1999, does 5 that --6 Α. He left in December or January. 7 Of 1999 or 2000? Q. 8 Yes. Either late in '99 or 2000. Α. 9 That's when he left the blue unit? Ο. 10 Α. Well -- yes. Yes. 11 Q. And that's when he left the circus for 12 a while? 13 Α. Correct. 14 0. And when he was on the blue unit, 15 during the period he was on the blue unit, he 16 would have had responsibility, would he have had 17 responsibility for handling any of the seven 18 elephants at issue here? 19 He primarily was with the young 20 elephants but also it would have, he probably 21 would have been involved with some at one time or 22 another.

Page 130 1 Do you know which elephants he would Q. 2 have handled? 3 Α. No. 0. Would he have handled Karen? 5 Α. He could have. Yes. 6 Q. And what about Nicole? 7 He could have handled any of them. Α. 8 Okay. You think it's likely that he 0. 9 did during the time he was on the blue unit? 10 Α. I'm not sure, but I believe he made 11 animal walks and things like that. 12 And if he was on the animal walks, he 13 would have been, he would have had some 14 responsibilities for handling the elephants; is 15 that correct? 16 If he was there. Yes. Α. 17 And how long has Mr. Harned been at Q. 18 the CEC? 19 Α. I cannot remember exactly when he came 20 back. 21 I think you testified it was 2001. Q. 22 Does that comport with your knowledge?

Page 131 1 Α. That sounds about right. Yes. 2 Q. And he's the operations manager at the 3 CEC; is that correct? 4 Α. Yes. 5 And he has responsibilities for Q. 6 handling the five elephants who were at the CEC, 7 the five of the seven? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Ο. And that would be Nicole -- I'm sorry. 10 Jewell, Lutzi, Mysore, Susan and Zina; is that 11 correct? 12 Α. Yes. 13 0. And he handles all five of them; is 14 that correct? 15 Α. From time to time. Yes. 16 And what about an individual named Q. 17 Tony Rodriguez. Do you know who he is? 18 Α. Yes. 19 Who is he? Q. 20 He worked for us there for a while. Α. 21 Worked where for a while? Q. 22 Α. At the CEC.

		Page 132
1	Q.	Did he ever work on the blue unit?
2	Α.	Yes.
3	Q.	When did he work on the blue unit?
4	Α.	I do not know.
5	Q.	Could it have been in the late 1990s?
6	Α.	I would be guessing. I'm not sure
7	when he was	there.
8	Q.	But you know he worked on the blue
9	unit at one	period of time?
10	Α.	Yes.
11	Q.	Do you know how long he worked on the
12	blue unit?	
13	Α.	I do not know.
14	Q.	Was he one of the employees who had a
15	long tenure	at the blue unit or?
16	Α.	I think not.
17	Q <b>.</b>	So he did a shorter stint at the blue
18	unit?	
19	Α.	I believe so.
20	Q.	And you're not sure when that was,?
21	А.	No, I'm not.
22	Q.	Was it before he came to the CEC?

		Page 133
1	Α.	Yes.
2	Q.	When did he come to the CEC?
3	Α.	I would have to look it up.
4	Q.	What's your best recollection?
5	Α.	I would have to look it up.
6	Q.	Is he still at the CEC?
7	Α.	No.
8	Q.	When did he leave the CEC?
9	Α.	Three or four years ago.
10	Q.	How long was he at the CEC?
11	Α.	I think about a year.
12	Q.	What was his job at the CEC?
13	Α.	He cleaned up and cut grass and things
14	like that.	
15	Q.	Would he have had any responsibilities
16	for handlin	g elephants at the CEC?
17	Α.	No.
18	Q.	What about Robbie Castillo. Does that
19	name mean s	omething to you? Do you know who that
20	is? No?	
21	Α.	Robbie Castillo? No.
22	Q.	What about Jeff Steele. Do you know

Page 134 1 who Jeff Steele is? 2 Α. Like the general manager, Jeff Steele? 3 Yes. 4 Did he ever have any responsibility 0. 5 for handling elephants? 6 Α. No. 7 He was the general manager for the Q. 8 blue unit? 9 Α. Yes. 10 Q. When was that? 11 Α. I'm not sure. 12 Do you have any idea? Q. 13 Α. I don't know exactly when he was 14 there. 15 Is he still working for Feld Q. 16 Entertainment? 17 Α. No. 18 Q. Do you know when he stopped working 19 for Feld Entertainment? 20 Three, four years ago. 21 Did he ever -- strike that. Q. 22 the general manager at the blue unit in the late

Page 135

- <sup>1</sup> 1990s?
- A. I believe so. Yes.
- Q. And you worked on the blue unit in the
- <sup>4</sup> late 1990s, too, correct?
- 5 A. I was there putting Benjamin and
- 6 Shirley on the show and things like that, but I
- didn't work there, per se.
- 9 Q. You were with the show in the late
- <sup>9</sup> 1990s?
- A. Correct. Yes.
- 11 Q. What time period were you with the
- 12 blue show?
- 13 A. I would have to look it up in my past
- deposition.
- Do you remember how long a period of
- time you spent with the blue show in the late
- <sup>17</sup> 1990s?
- A. When I put the elephants, the two
- little guys on the show, I was there probably a
- couple of months and then two or three weeks later
- that year. And then in the fall, we took the five
- out which I went over in my other deposition. I

Page 136 1 believe that was 1999. 2 1999? Q. 3 I believe it was. Yes. 4 And do you know who Dave Whaley 0. 5 (phonetic) is? 6 Α. Yes. 7 Who is Dave Whaley? Q. 8 He works for us at the Center. Α. 9 What's his position at the Center? 0. 10 He's a handler. Α. 11 Does he handle all of the five Q. 12 elephants who were at the Center who were among 13 the seven that are at issue hear? 14 Actually, he does not. Α. 15 Q. Okay. Who does he handle? 16 Α. Out of that five? 17 Q. Yes. 18 Normally none. Α. 19 0. None. When you say normally none, 20 does he sometime handle some of them? 21 If we were short handed or something, Α. 22 it's possible he could deal with them.

Page 137 1 Q. Have you ever seen him handle any of 2 those five elephants. Let me take it one at a 3 time. Have you ever seen him handle Jewell? 4 I guess he would clean up around them, 5 something like that, but he hasn't taken them out 6 and water them, things like that. 7 Does he carry a bull hook around 0. Jewell when he's around her? 8 9 Yes. Α. 10 Q. What about Lutzi. Has he been, had 11 any responsibility for handling Lutzi at all? 12 Α. Not normally. 13 Q. Would he clean up around Lutzi the way 14 he would clean up around Jewell? 15 Α. Yes. 16 And would he carry a bull hook with Q. 17 him? 18 Α. Yes. 19 What about Mysore? Does he have any 0. 20 responsibility for handling Mysore? 21 It would be the same. Α. 22 Q. What about Susan?

		Page 138
1	Α.	The same.
2	Q.	What about Zina?
3	Α.	The same.
4	Q.	All right. How long has Dave Whaley
5	been at the	CEC?
6	Α.	I would have to look it up.
7	Q.	He's there now?
8	Α.	Yes.
9	Q.	Do you know how long he's been there?
10	Α.	No.
11	Q.	Has it been more than a year that he's
12	been there?	
13	Α.	Yes.
14	Q.	Has it been more than two years?
15	Α.	Yes.
16	Q.	Has it been more than three?
17	Α.	Probably about three.
18	Q.	And prior to coming to the CEC, was he
19	on the blue	unit?
20	Α.	Yes.
21	Q.	And had he been on the blue unit for a
22	while?	

Page 139 1 Α. Believe me, it's all starting to run 2 together. He was on the blue unit when we took 3 the five out. Which I think you said was in 1999 0. 5 correct? 6 Α. Correct. But that was short lived. 7 Well, he was out with Troy for a year, I think. 8 Q. Out with Troy, what does that mean? 9 Out on the blue unit with Troy. Α. 10 Q. Troy Metzler? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. When was that? 13 Α. I think the year 2000. 14 Ο. All right. 15 Α. I think. 16 Okay. But he was on the blue unit Q. 17 prior to that time as well; is that correct? 18 For a short time. Α. 19 Do you remember any time periods when 0. 20 Dave Whaley was on the blue unit? 21 Α. He was on the blue unit with Troy and 22

> Alderson Reporting Company 1-800-FOR-DEPO

I cannot remember how long it was.

Page 140

- Q. Was he on the blue unit before Troy
- was on the blue unit as well?
- $^3$  A. Yes.
- Q. So he was on the blue unit -- do you
- 5 have a better sense of when he was on the blue
- 6 unit?
- A. When we took the five elephants out,
- 8 the five young elephants, he was alone on this.
- 9 O. So he was on the blue unit at that
- point in time?
- A. Right.
- Q. And that was in the fall of 1999; is
- that correct?
- $^{14}$  A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And had he been on the blue unit for a
- while at that point in time?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 O. Had he been on the blue unit for the
- 19 previous year?
- A. When we took the five elephants out of
- the CEC, he came out with us.
- Q. But I'm trying to find out how long he

Page 141 1 was on the blue unit before he went to the CEC 2 with you? 3 I cannot remember. I would have to Α. 4 look it up. 5 But you think it was for a couple of Q. 6 years? 7 I believe so. Yes. Α. 8 So he would have had responsibility 9 for handling the elephants who were on the blue 10 unit during the time he was working on the blue 11 unit; is that correct? 12 He could have. Yes. 13 0. What about Brian Christiani. Do you 14 know who he is? 15 Α. Yes. 16 Who is he? Q. 17 He came over to the blue show in 2000 Α. 18 maybe. 19 Came over from where? 0. 20 From whatever he was doing. I don't Α. 21 know. 22 Does he have another name? Q.

Page 142 1 Α. Brian French. 2 Q. And do you know how long he was on the 3 blue unit? 4 Α. Several years. 5 Q. You said 2000. So from 2000 to 2003, 6 maybe? 7 Α. Yes. It was two or three years. 8 He was on the blue unit? 0. 9 Α. Yes. 10 Was he an elephant hander? Q. 11 Α. He was the superintendent. 12 Q. Did he handle elephants, though, when he worked in the blue unit? 13 14 Α. Yes. 15 He was the superintendent of Q. 16 elephants? 17 Α. Yes. 18 Would he have handled all of the blue Q. 19 unit elephants who were on the blue unit during 20 the time he was working on the blue unit? 21 Of these on the list. Yes. Α. 22 Q. So he would have handled all of the

Page 143 1 elephants -- all of the seven elephants, correct? 2 Α. If they were there when he was there. 3 Yes. 4 And do you know when Brian Christiani 0. 5 AKA Brian French left the blue unit? 6 Probably three or four years ago. Α. 7 Do you know where he went? Q. 8 Α. He ended up in the zoo in Tampa. 9 And what about Sara Houcke. Did she 0. 10 work on the blue unit? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. Who is she? 13 Α. She was a presenter. 14 Q. Presenter of elephants? 15 Α. Elephants, tigers, horses. 16 Q. But she presented elephants on the 17 blue unit? 18 Α. Yes. 19 She's the daughter of Sasha Houcke, 0. 20 correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. When did she present elephants on the

Page 144 1 blue unit? 2 Some time after 2000. Α. 3 Would it have been in -- was she there Q. 4 in 2001 as a presenter of elephants? 5 Α. I'm not sure. I would have to look it 6 up. 7 Do you know how long she was a Q. 8 presenter of elephants on the blue unit? 9 Α. I think she was just there two years, 10 I believe. 11 Q. And which two years would that have 12 been? 13 Α. I'm not sure. I would have to look it 14 up. 15 Q. And when she was a presenter on the 16 blue unit, would she have had responsibility for 17 handling all of the elephants who were on the blue 18 unit during the time she was on the blue unit? 19 All of those on this list. Yes. Α. 20 they were there. 21 Is she still employed by Feld 22 Entertainment?

		Page 145
1	Α.	No.
2	Q.	When did she leave?
3	Α.	I believe she was on the show two
4	years and t	hen left.
5	Q.	Do you know where she is now?
6	Α.	In Europe.
7	Q.	Do you know what she's doing?
8	Α.	No.
9	Q.	What about Troy Metzler. Who is he?
10	Who is Troy	Metzler?
11	Α.	He was the elephant superintendent on
12	the blue sh	OW.
13	Q.	How long was he the elephant
14	superintend	ent on the blue show?
15	Α.	After Brian Christiani AKA French
16	left.	
17	Q.	Do you know when that would have been?
18	Α.	I think he was superintendent the last
19	three years	or so.
20	Q.	The last three years, what does that
21	mean?	
22	Α.	When Brian left, he took over but I

Page 146 1 would have to look up the dates. I'm not sure 2 exactly. 3 I think Mr. Metzler testified that he Q. 4 became superintendent of elephants in 2003. 5 that comport with your knowledge? 6 That probably sounds about right. Α. 7 But he was on the blue unit prior to 0. 8 that time in a different capacity; is that 9 correct? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. And do you know how long he was on the 12 blue unit? 13 From either late '99 or early 2000. Α. 14 0. Do you know when he left the blue 15 unit? 16 Some time last summer. Α. 17 Summer of 2007? Q. 18 Α. Yes. 19 So and was Mr. Metzler a handler of 0. 20 elephants on the blue unit? 21 Α. Handler, presenter. 22 And would he have had responsibility Q.

Page 147 1 for handling all of the elephants who were on the 2 blue unit during the time he was on the blue unit? 3 Α. Yes. 4 And that would include all of the 5 seven elephants, would it not? 6 Α. Yes. 7 And he's at the CEC now; is that Q. 8 correct? 9 Α. No. 10 Q. He's not at the CEC. Okay. When he left the blue unit in the summer of 2007, did he 11 12 go to the CEC? 13 Α. Yes. 14 What was he doing at the CEC? Q. 15 was his job? 16 He was working with some young 17 elephants. 18 Did he have any responsibility for Q. 19 working with any of the five elephants who are at 20 the CEC that are the subject of this deposition? 21 Α. No. 22 Q. When did he leave the CEC?

Page 148 1 This week. Α. 2 He just left. Do you know where he's Q. 3 going? 4 Α. The blue unit. 5 Q. Oh, he's back on the blue unit? 6 So he went with the new tour on the blue unit? 7 Α. Yes. 8 So he has responsibility as an 9 elephant handler on the blue unit? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Is he going to be presenting on the 12 blue unit as well? 13 Α. No. 14 Ο. Just a handler? 15 Yes. Α. 16 He used to be a presenter, though; is Q. 17 that correct? 18 Α. Yes. 19 And will he have responsibility for 0. 20 handling Karen and Nicole on the blue unit? 21 Α. No. 22 Q. Why not?

Page 149 1 Α. He's with two young elephants. 2 Q. I see. Which elephants is he with? 3 Α. Rudy and Asha. 4 Did Rudy and Asha just join the blue 0. 5 unit? 6 Yes. Α. 7 So Mr. Metzler is in charge of Rudy Q. 8 and Asha on the blue unit; is that correct? 9 Α. Yes. 10 Was he involved in training Rudy and Q. 11 Asha at the CEC before he went out on the blue 12 unit? 13 Α. Yes. 14 MS. MEYER: We have to change the tape. 15 THE VIDEO OPERATOR: This marks the end 16 of videotape No. 2 of the deposition of Gary 17 Jacobson representing Feld Entertainment, 18 Incorporated. Going off the record. The time is 19 12:43 p.m. 20 This marks the beginning of videotape No. 3 21 of the deposition of Gary Jacobson representing 22 Feld Entertainment, Incorporated. Going back on

Page 150 1 the record. The time is 12:46 p.m. 2 BY MS. MEYER: 3 Q. You mentioned that Mike Hayward recently left Feld Entertainment; is that correct? 5 Α. Yes. 6 Q. He was a presenter on the blue unit 7 for some period of time, correct? 8 Yes. Α. 9 Q. When was that? 10 Α. I believe for the last six years. 11 Q. So from about 2002 through 2007? 12 Α. Yes. 13 0. And did he work on the blue unit 14 before that as well? 15 Α. No. 16 So did he work under Troy Metzler at 17 all on the blue unit? 18 Α. Yes. 19 When was that? 0. 20 When he started over there until Troy 21 left last summer. 22 Q. And was he -- so he would have had,

Page 151

- 1 Mr. Hayward would have had responsibility for
- handling the elephants on the blue unit, correct?
- $^3$  A. Yes.
- 4 O. And that would include whatever
- 5 elephants were on the blue unit during the time
- 6 Mr. Hayward was there?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- Q. David Brown? Who is he? Was he the
- 9 general manager of the blue unit for some period
- of time?
- 11 A. I think he might have been an
- 12 assistant manager.
- Q. Do you know when?
- A. I think some time after 2000, but I'm
- <sup>15</sup> not sure.
- Q. Could it have been in the late 1990s?
- A. It could have been. He wasn't there
- very long. I don't think.
- 19 Q. What about an individual named Icham.
- Do you know who that is?
- A. He's a handler on the blue show.
- Q. Is his last name Sacko?

Page 152 1 Α. I believe so. Yes. 2 Q. How long has he been a handler on the 3 blue unit? 4 Α. Six or seven years. 5 And he's currently a handler on the Q. 6 blue unit as well? 7 Α. Yes. 8 So he's had responsibility for 9 handling some of these elephants, correct? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Which ones? Q. 12 Α. All of them. 13 Q. And do you know where Icham Sacko 14 received his training in elephant handling from? 15 Α. Most of it from Troy Metzler. 16 And what about an individual named 17 Hicham. Hicham or Hicham? Does that ring a bell 18 with you at all? H-I-C-H-A-M? 19 I would be quessing but I think that's 20 probably Icham's father. 21 That's Icham's father? Q. 22 Α. Yes.

Page 153 1 Q. Okay. Is he also a handler on the 2 blue unit? 3 Α. Yes. 4 And how long has he been on the blue 0. 5 unit? 6 I am not sure. Α. 7 Is he still on the blue unit? 0. 8 Α. Yes. 9 Has it been several years that he's 0. 10 been on the blue unit? 11 Α. If it's the guy that I'm thinking of, 12 more than that. He came over with a troop of 13 people and Icham is his son. 14 And when did Icham come over with a 0. 15 group of people? 16 I don't know when the group actually 17 came over, but I believe Icham, the younger one, 18 has been there for six or seven years, I believe. 19 All right. So if you think if Hicham 0. 20 is his father, he's been with the blue unit for 21 six or seven years as well? 22 Α. Yes.

Page 154 1 And he's been a handler of the Q. 2 elephants on the blue unit? 3 Handler and also works with the other Α. 4 animals on the show. 5 And would Hicham have responsibility Q. 6 for working with any of the seven elephants at 7 issue here? 8 Sort of. I mean, he can kind of walk Α. 9 you along with one or something and help them out 10 or things like that. 11 Q. And he would carry a bull hook when he was around the elephants; is that correct? 12 13 Α. Sometimes. Yes. 14 0. Most of the time? 15 Α. Perhaps so. Yes. 16 And who is Jeff Lease? Q. 17 He works at the CEC. Α. 18 Q. And how long has he been at the CEC? 19 Α. I would have to look it up. 20 0. Has he been there for some period of 21 time? 22 Α. Yes.

		Page 155
1	Q.	More than two years?
2	Α.	Yes.
3	Q.	More than five years?
4	Α.	No.
5	Q.	More than three years?
6	Α.	He was in the blue show for, I think,
7	three years	then he came to the CEC.
8	Q.	When was he on the blue show?
9	Α.	Somewhere around the turn of the
10	century.	
11	Q.	So that would have been around the
12	year 2000?	
13	Α.	I believe so. Yes.
14	Q.	When did he come to the CEC?
15	Α.	Three or four years ago.
16	Q.	When he was on the blue show, was he
17	an elephant	handler?
18	Α.	Yes.
19	Q.	Would he have handled all of the
20	elephants w	ho were on the blue show at that point
21	in time?	
22	Α.	I'm not sure he handled Karen. The

Page 156 1 rest of them. Yes. 2 Would he not have handled Karen for Q. 3 the same reason that Andy Weller would not have 4 handled Karen? 5 Α. It would be the same reason, if my 6 memory serves me right. 7 Q. And what is that again? 8 Α. He was new around elephants. 9 0. And would he have handled any of the 10 other six elephants that we've been discussing? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. Which ones would he have handled? Any or all of them. 13 Α. 14 And what does he do at the CEC? 0. 15 Α. He works under animal programs. 16 doesn't work for me anymore. 17 Did he work for you at one point? Q. 18 Α. Yes. 19 When did he work for you? Q. 20 For two or three years. Α. 21 Until when? Q. 22 Until six or eight months ago. Α.

Page 157 1 When he was working for you, what were Q. 2 his job responsibilities? 3 He was a handler. Α. He was handling the elephants? 0. 5 Α. Yes. 6 Did he handle any of the seven Q. 7 elephants that are on our list when he was at the 8 CEC? 9 Α. Yes. 10 Q. Which ones? 11 Any or all of them. Α. 12 Q. Do you remember which ones he would 13 have handled at CEC? 14 Α. Well, it's kind of like Dave Whaley. 15 He specifically took care of other elephants but 16 they could handle these. 17 So he would have handled Jewell? Q. 18 He could have. Yes. Α. 19 And Lutzi? Q. 20 Α. Yes. 21 Q. And Mysore? 22 Α. Yes.

		Page 158
1	Q.	And Susan?
2	А.	Yes.
3	Q.	And Zina?
4	Α.	Yes.
5	Q.	And you're saying six to eight months
6	ago he tool	a different job at that CEC?
7	Α.	Yes.
8	Q.	So he's not handling any elephants
9	anymore?	
10	Α.	Yes.
11	Q.	Yes, he's not handling them?
12	Α.	No.
13	Q.	Is he handling the elephants anymore?
14	Α.	Sometimes.
15	Q.	And is he still handling some of the
16	five elepha	ants that I just named?
17	Α.	Yes.
18	Q.	What is his title now at the CEC?
19	А.	I don't know exactly what it is.
20	Q.	I may have asked you this already, if
21	I did, I ap	pologize. Did never mind. I did ask
22	you that or	ne. How about an individual named

Page 159 1 Ahmed. Do you know who he is? 2 I believe he worked on the blue show. Α. 3 Q. And his name is spelled A-H-M-E-D? 4 Α. I'm not sure. 5 Do you know when he worked on the blue Q. 6 show? 7 Α. No. 8 Do you have any idea when he worked on 9 the blue show? 10 Α. I could not tell you. 11 Do you know who Jeff Lease received Q. 12 his training from to handle elephants? 13 Α. I guess some from Randy Peterson and 14 Pat. 15 Q. Pat Harned? 16 Myself. Α. Yes. 17 Who taught Sarah Houcke how to handle Q. 18 elephants? 19 Α. Nobody. That would be just a guess, 20 it would be her dad probably. 21 What's your basis for saying that? Q. 22 Α. She grew up on a circus family, so.

Page 160 1 And do you know who taught Brian Q. 2 Christiani AKA Brian French how to handle 3 elephants? His family owned elephants, so 5 probably his father and mother. 6 What was his father's name? Q. 7 Larry French. Α. 8 Q. Is Larry French still in the circus 9 industry? 10 Α. He's deceased. 11 Q. Do you know when he died? 12 Α. Pardon? 13 0. Do you know when he died? 14 Α. I can't remember. 15 Q. Did he have elephants? 16 Α. Yes. 17 Do you know anything about Larry Q. 18 French's training, who taught him how to handle 19 elephants? 20 Probably Brian's mother. 21 Okay. Was her name Christiani by any Q. 22 chance?

		Page 161
1	А.	Yes.
2	Q.	What was her first name, do you know?
3	А.	Karen.
4	Q.	Okay. And was she an elephant
5	handler?	
6	Α.	Yes.
7	Q.	Did you know her?
8	А.	Enough to say hello.
9	Q.	Do you know who taught Karen
10	Christiani h	now to handle elephants?
11	А.	Her parents.
12	Q.	Who were her parents?
13	А.	I'm drawing a blank. They were
14	Christiani's and they had four elephants.	
15	Q.	Their last name is Christiani also
16	too, right?	
17	А.	Yes.
18	Q.	Do you know who taught Pat Harned how
19	to handle elephants?	
20	А.	He worked for Benny White of Busch
21	Gardens.	
22	Q.	I'm sorry. Who is that?

		Page 162
1	Α.	Benny White from Busch Gardens.
2	Q. 1	Who is Benny White?
3	Α.	He was the elephant superintendent at
4	Busch Garden	s, Busch Gardens Theme Park.
5	Q.	So do you think Mr. White is the one
6	who taught Pa	at Harned how to handle elephants?
7	Α.	Some.
8	Q. 1	Who else?
9	Α.	Gary Johnson.
10	Q. 1	Who is Gary Johnson?
11	Α.	He owns Have Trunk Will Travel.
12	Q. 1	What's your basis for saying that Pat
13	Harned train	ing from Gary Johnson in how to handle
14	elephants?	
15	Α.	Pat worked for him.
16	Q.	How long did Pat work for him?
17	Α.	Eight or ten months.
18	Q. 1	When was that?
19	Α.	He came to work for us in '95, I
20	believe. So	it would have been before that.
21	Q.	Did Pat Harned receive training from
22	anyone else	in how to handle elephants?

```
Page 163
 1
           Α.
                  Myself.
 2
           Q.
                  Anyone else?
 3
           Α.
                  No.
 4
                  How about Randy Peterson? Who taught
           0.
 5
     Randy Peterson how to handle elephants?
 6
                  Myself. Buckles Woodcock.
           Α.
 7
           Q.
                  Anyone else?
 8
           Α.
                  Joe Frisco.
 9
           Q.
                  Joe Frisco, Sr.?
10
           Α.
                  Junior.
11
           Q.
                  Joe Frisco, Jr. Okay.
12
           Α.
                  Well, there's three of them, the
13
     middle one.
14
           0.
                  The middle one. Well, Joe Frisco, Jr.
15
     is the oldest son. Tim Frisco is the middle son
16
     and Terry Frisco is the younger son, the youngest
17
           So would it have been Tim Frisco then?
18
           Α.
                  No. Joe.
19
                  Joe Frisco, Jr.?
           Q.
20
           Α.
                  Joe, Jr.
21
                  Is the one who caught Randy Peterson
           Q.
22
     how to handle elephants?
```

Page 164 1 Α. Yes. 2 Q. Anyone else teach Randy Peterson how 3 to handle elephants? 4 Not that I know of. 5 What about Suni Ridley? Who taught Q. 6 him how to handle elephants? 7 Hugo Schmidt and Axel Gautier. Α. 8 How about Jeff Pettigrew. Do you know 0. 9 who taught him how to handle elephants? 10 I actually don't know who Jeff worked Α. 11 for originally. 12 How about Dave Whaley? Do you know 13 who taught him how to handle elephants? 14 Α. He also worked at Busch Gardens and 15 worked for Benny White. 16 And it's Benny White? Q. 17 Benny. Α. 18 And who taught Benny White how to Q. 19 handle elephants. 20 Hi name is Rex Williams? Α. 21 Who is Rex Williams? Q. 22 Α. He was an old-time trainer.

Page 165 1 What's your basis for saying Rex Q. 2 Williams is the one who taught Benny White how to 3 handle elephants? 4 Rex Williams was the elephant 5 superintendent on a Clyde Beatty & Cole Brothers 6 and Benny was his assistant. 7 Do you know who taught Adam Hill how Q. 8 to handle elephants? 9 I think a good share would come from Α. 10 his dad. His father owned elephants. 11 What was his dad's name? Q. 12 Α. Murray Hill. 13 0. Murray Hill. And Adam Hill goes by a 14 different name as well, doesn't he? 15 Α. Do you know? 16 Siden? Q. 17 Yes. Actually, his last name is Α. 18 Siden. 19 Adam Hill's last name is Siden? 0. 20 It's actually Siden. Murray Hill is 21 where his father was from in New York City. 22 Q. You really lost me on that one. Adam

Page 166 1 Hill's --2 There's a Murray Hill District in New Α. 3 York City and that's where Siden, the elder Siden 4 is from originally. So he took that as his name 5 because his other name sounded a little too 6 Jewish. 7 So Adam Hill's father, what is his 0. 8 real name? 9 Siden. Α. 10 And is it, do you know the first name? Q. 11 I think it's Arlon, but I'm not sure. Α. 12 Q. And Adam him also sometimes goes by Adam Siden? 13 14 Α. Yes. 15 You know him by both names? Q. 16 Α. Yes. 17 And you said that his father taught Q. 18 Adam Hill how to handle elephants; is that 19 correct? 20 I believe so. He owned a number of Α. 21 them. 22 And do you know who taught his father Q.

Page 167 1 how to handle elephants? 2 Α. I'm not sure. Smokey Jones trained 3 them for him so. Smokey Jones trained? 0. 5 Α. Trained three of his elephants. 6 Q. Trained three of? 7 Α. Siden's elephants. 8 0. And when we say Siden, it's Adam 9 Hill's father we're talking about, correct? 10 Yes. So perhaps Smokey showed him how Α. 11 to do it. 12 MS. MEYER: I just want to ask him 13 about some of the CEC employees, then we can break 14 for lunch, if it's all right? 15 MS. JOINER: Is it okay with you? 16 THE WITNESS: Yes. 17 MS. MEYER: Okay. I appreciate it. 18 BY MS. MEYER: 19 So turning to the employees at the CEC Q. 20 Jim Williams works at the CEC; is that correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Does he have any responsibility for Q.

Page 168 1 handling elephants at the CEC? 2 Α. Yes. 3 Does he have responsibility for 4 handling any of the five elephants that were at 5 the CEC who were the subject of this deposition? 6 Α. Yes. 7 Does he handle all of them, all five 0. 8 of them? 9 Yes. Α. 10 That would be Zina, Mysore, Susan, Q. 11 Jewell and Lutzi, correct? 12 Α. Yes. 13 0. And we talked about Pat Harned, he is 14 your operations manager, correct? 15 Α. Yes. 16 And did he have a brace on his leg 17 recently or something? 18 Α. Yes. 19 And because I think I saw him at the 0. 20 CEC and I just wanted to know if that's who it 21 Is that who it was? 22 Α. Yes.

		Page 169
1	Q.	And he has responsibility for handling
2	Zina, Mysor	re, Susan, Jewell and Lutzi, correct?
3	Α.	Yes.
4	Q.	And there is an individual named Sean
5	Quinn?	
6	Α.	Yes.
7	Q.	And what does he do with the CEC?
8	Α.	He's also a handler.
9	Q.	And does he handle Zina, Mysore, Susan
10	Jewell or I	utzi?
11	Α.	Yes.
12	Q.	Who taught him how to handle
13	elephants?	
14	Α.	William Woodcock and Fred C. Logan.
15	Q.	Is that Buckles Woodcock?
16	Α.	Yes.
17	Q.	And who is the other person?
18	Α.	Fred C. Logan.
19	Q.	Who's Fred C. Logan?
20	Α.	He was a trainer of some renown.
21	Q.	In this country?
22	Α.	Yes.

Page 170 1 During what period of time? Q. 2 I guess from the early '40s until Α. 3 three or four years ago when he retired. 4 Did he work in a circus? 0. 5 Α. Yes. 6 Q. Which circus did he work in? 7 Α. Carson & Barnes. 8 When did he work at Carson & Barnes? 0. 9 Α. Actually, I guess when he worked there 10 it was Kelly Miller, then it became Carson & 11 Barnes. 12 0. I'm sorry. What did the circus used 13 to be called? 14 Α. Kelly Miller. Al G., Kelly, Miller 15 and Brothers. 16 When did it become Carson & Barnes? Q. 17 Α. I think about 1970. 18 And Mr. Logan worked at first Kelly Q. 19 Miller, then Carson & Barnes as an elephant 20 trainer? 21 Α. Trainer. Yes. From the probably from 22 about 1950 until 1969. Then in 1969, he went to

Page 171 1 the Clyde Beatty & Cole Brothers Circus. 2 0. And how do you know Sean Quinn 3 received training from Fred C. Logan? 4 Α. Because he worked for him for 10 or 12 5 years. 6 Where did he work for him? Q. 7 Clyde Beatty & Cole Brothers Circus. Α. 8 During what period of time? 0. 9 He would have left Ringling Brothers Α. 10 probably about 1981 or '82, so then he worked for 11 the Beatty show for a long time. 12 Now, I'm confused. Did Mr. Logan work 13 for Ringling Brothers? 14 Α. No. Mr. Ouinn. 15 Mr. Quinn previously worked for Q. 16 Ringling Brothers? 17 Α. Yes. 18 And which show did he work on? 0. 19 He started out with Bill Woodcock on Α. 20 the blue show. 21 When was that? Q. 22 Α. 1977.

Q. How long was he on the blue show?

A. He was on for the two years that it was out and then when it came back with the heme park, Sean went to work in the Theme Park for a couple of years.

Q. So would Sean Quinn have

- 7 responsibility for handling some of the s
- responsibility for handling some of the seven
- 8 elephants?

1

2

3

4

5

6

- 9 A. Zina at that time and all the rest of
- them now.
- 11 Q. All the rest of them now at the CEC,
- but what about Karen and Nicole?
- 13 A. Nicole may have been there when Sean
- was there, I can't remember. I have to look it
- $^{15}$  up.
- Q. May have been on the blue unit?
- A. No. When Nicole was at the CEC, Sean
- may have been there.
- 19 Q. I see. Okay. And do you know who
- Fred C. Logan received his training from?
- A. William Woodcock, Sr.
- Q. And that's the colonel, correct?

Alderson Reporting Company 1-800-FOR-DEPO

Page 172

		Page 173
1	Α.	Yes.
2	Q.	Who is David Garcia?
3	Α.	He's been at the CEC for about 10
4	years.	
5	Q.	What does he do at the CEC?
6	Α.	He's a handler.
7	Q.	Does he have responsibility for
8	handling al	of the elephants who are at the CEC?
9	Α.	Yes.
10	Q.	Who did he receive his training from?
11	Α.	Rex Williams.
12	Q.	Anyone else?
13	Α.	Not really, no.
14	Q.	How do you know that?
15	Α.	That's where he got his start around
16	elephants i	s working for Rex Williams on Circus
17	Vargas.	
18	Q.	When was that?
19	Α.	Probably 25 years ago.
20	Q.	How long was he with Circus Vargas?
21	Α.	I'm not sure.
22	Q.	How long has David Green you said

Page 174 1 10 years he's been at the CEC? 2 Α. Roughly 10 years. Yes. 3 And what about Trudy Williams. Q. Does 4 she have any responsibility for handling 5 elephants? 6 Α. Yes. 7 Does she have responsibility for 8 handling any of the five elephants who are 9 currently at the CEC --10 Α. She has. Yes. 11 Q. -- and the subject of our deposition? 12 Α. Yes. 13 0. And who trained her? 14 Α. Jim Williams. Her uncle is Gary 15 Johnson of Have Trunk Will Travel, her father. 16 Q. Her, you lost me. Her uncle is Gary 17 Johnson? 18 Α. No. Yes. Her uncle is Gary Johnson. 19 What did you say about -- oh, her 0. 20 father also trained her? 21 Her father also. Α. 22 Q. Who is her father?

		Page 175
1	Α.	Last name is Johnson. I can't
2	remember h	is first name. Eugene.
3	Q.	Eugene Johnson?
4	Α.	Yes.
5	Q.	Is he an elephant trainer?
6	Α.	Handler.
7	Q.	Where does he work?
8	Α.	Normally for his brother Gary.
9	Q.	With Have Trunk Will Travel?
10	Α.	Yes.
11	Q.	So they're brothers?
12	Α.	Yes.
13	Q.	Do you know who taught Eugene Johnson
14	how to handle elephants?	
15	Α.	His father owned elephants.
16	Q.	What was his fathers name?
17	Α.	I forget.
18	Q.	Something Johnson?
19	A.	Something Johnson.
20	Q.	Do you know who taught Gary Johnson
21	how to hand	dle elephants?
22	Α.	Smokey Jones.

		Page 176
1	Q.	And who's Laura Keefe?
2	Α.	She's a handler.
3	Q.	And does she have responsibilities for
4	handling t	he five elephants who are at the CEC?
5	Α.	Yes.
6	Q.	And who did she receive her training
7	from?	
8	Α.	Some from her husband, some from me.
9	Q.	Who's her husband?
10	Α.	Kirk Keefe.
11	Q.	Kirk?
12	Α.	Kirk.
13	Q.	Who is he?
14	Α.	He's an elephant handler.
15	Q.	Where does he work?
16	Α.	Cheyenne Mountains in Colorado.
17	Q.	Are they still married?
18	Α.	Yes.
19	Q.	How long has she been at the CEC?
20	Α.	I think a year. Probably a year.
21	Q.	Do you know who Kirk Keefe received
22	his traini	ng in handling elephants from?

Page 177

- A. Some at the zoo where he's at and then
- 2 he also works for me.
- Q. And we talked about Randy Peterson.
- 4 He worked at the CEC for a while, correct?
- A. A couple of years. Yes.
- Q. And he was the operations manager,
- 7 correct?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And that was 1999 to 2001?
- 10 A. Something like that. I would have to
- look it up to be correct.
- 12 Q. And so he had responsibility for
- handling the elephants who were at the CEC during
- that time period; is that correct?
- $^{15}$  A. Yes.
- Q. And according to my notes, Karen was
- actually at the CEC for some of that time period;
- is that correct?
- A. She came in once or twice. She had a
- stiff leg or something so we pulled her off for
- $^{21}$  the rest of it.
- Q. Would Mr. Peterson have had some

Page 178 1 responsibility for handling Karen when she was at 2 the CEC? 3 Α. Yes. 4 And Nicole was also at the CEC for 5 some period of time when Mr. Peterson was at the 6 CEC; is that correct? 7 That would be correct. Yes. Α. 8 0. Would he have had responsibility for 9 handling Nicole as well? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. Did Mr. Peterson have some 12 responsibility for handling Susan when she was at 13 the CEC? 14 Α. Yes. 15 And he's had responsibility also for 16 handling some of the other elephants; is that 17 correct? 18 Α. Yes. 19 Which ones? 0. 20 Α. Probably all of them. 21 Q. Who did Mr. Peterson get his training 22 from?

Page 179

- 1 A. Buckles Woodcock, Joe Frisco, he was
- <sup>2</sup> around me some, Joe Williams.
- Q. And Joe Frisco, Jr. also worked at the
- 4 CEC for some period of time, correct?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. That was December of 2005 to November
- <sup>7</sup> of 2006?
- 8 A. About a year. Yes.
- 9 Q. He had responsibility for handling the
- elephants there during that time period, correct?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 O. And that would have included
- responsibility for handling Jewell, Lutzi, Mysore,
- Susan and Zina, correct?
- $^{15}$  A. Yes.
- Q. Who did Mr. Frisco, we went over this.
- Who did he receive his training from, maybe we
- didn't?
- 19 A. I think we did in the last deposition.
- Quite a bit from his father and self taught.
- Q. And his father is Joe Frisco, Sr.,
- correct.

Page 180 1 Α. Yes. Yes. 2 Is there anybody else that's currently Q. 3 at the CEC who handles elephants that I haven't mentioned? 5 Α. Jim Varn V-A-R-N. 6 Q. Okay. And who is Jim Varn? 7 Α. He was the last elephant 8 superintendent at Busch Gardens. 9 Until when? Q. 10 Α. Two or three years ago. 11 And what does he do at the CEC? Q. 12 He's a handler. Α. 13 Q. Okay. So he has responsibilities for 14 handling Jewell, Lutzi, Mysore, Susan and Zina? 15 Α. Yes. 16 And who did Jim Varn receive his Q. 17 elephant-handler training from? 18 Benny White. Α. 19 And we already discussed Benny White 0. 20 earlier, it's the same Benny White, correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 MS. MEYER: This is a good place to

Page 181

- break for lunch.
- THE VIDEO OPERATOR: We're going off
- $^{3}$  the record. The time is 1:14 p.m.
- We're going back on the record. The time is
- 5 2:03 p.m.
- BY MS. MEYER:
- <sup>7</sup> Q. Mr. Jacobson before we broke for
- lunch, I was asking you about whether there were
- <sup>9</sup> any other CEC employees that we haven't covered.
- The last one you mentioned was Jim Varn. Is there
- anybody else that we haven't talked about?
- A. Kathy Jacobson.
- Q. And what are Ms. Jacobson's
- 14 responsibilities?
- A. Nothing to do with those elephants at
- $^{16}$  all.
- Q. Right. Anybody else that has
- responsibility for handling any of the five
- elephants who were at the CEC; Lutzi, Mysore,
- Susan, Zina and Jewell?
- A. Not that I can remember.
- Q. Are you familiar with a handler on the

Page 182 1 blue unit whose name is Peshta? 2 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 3 Α. No. BY MS. MEYER: 5 Peshta. Anything like that? Q. 6 Α. No. 7 He worked on the blue unit with Troy Q. 8 Metzler and Alex Vargas in 2004, 2005? 9 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 10 BY MS. MEYER: 11 Q. Do you know that name? 12 Α. I know the name but he's on the red 13 show. 14 Oh, he's on the red show? 0. 15 Α. I've never anyone him to be on the 16 blue show, unless I missed it. 17 Who is he? 0. 18 He's a handler on the red show. 19 As far as you know, he's never worked 0. 20 on the blue show? 21 I don't think so. No. Α. 22 Q. Do you know who trained Peshta to

Page 183

- handle elephants?
- A. No. He's east European.
- Q. Lutzi was never on the red show, was
- 4 she?
- 5 A. No.
- Q. At the CEC when the elephants are in
- <sup>7</sup> the barn and when I say the elephants, I mean the
- five that we're talking about; Jewell, Lutzi,
- 9 Mysore, Susan and Zina. When they're in the main
- barn, are they on chains when they're in the main
- 11 barn?
- A. Yes.
- On the blue unit, when elephants are
- out in pens at a particular venue, they can also
- be on chains; is that correct?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- 17 A. The pens normally run from inside the
- housing to outside, but normally they are not tied
- up. Particularly the two in question.
- BY MS. MEYER:
- Q. When you say not tied up, you mean not
- on chains?

Page 184 1 Not on chains, right. If they're, Α. 2 from morning to night, they're normally loose the 3 entire time. 4 When you say night, in that context, 5 do you mean when they're done with the last show? 6 Yes. Α. 7 That's not always in the nighttime, is Q. 8 it? 9 Α. Well, no. On the tear-down day of the 10 last show it will be early, and then they'll go to 11 the train. 12 Okay. What's a turn out show? 0. What 13 does that mean? 14 Α. Turn out? 15 Isn't that what you just said? Q. 16 sorry. What did you just say? Can you read that 17 back, that answer? 18 The closing show. Α. 19 I thought you said turn out. Q. 20 Well, if I did, I misspoke. Α. 21 Okay. Tear down. Q. 22 Α. Yes. Tear down.

Page 185

- Q. On a tear-down show, what does that
- 2 mean?
- A. It's the last show in the venue and
- 4 then they go to the next venue.
- On a day when there's a tear-down
- show, how long does it take from the end of the
- <sup>7</sup> show to the time the elephants are loaded on the
- 8 train, in time?
- 9 MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- 10 A. That would vary.
- MS. MEYER: What's the objection? I'm
- sorry.
- MS. JOINER: Vague.
- 14 A. That would vary depending on a number
- of things; one, how far they have to walk; No. 2,
- how long it takes to clear out the parking lot.
- Sometimes a parking lot takes an hour to get the
- cars out before you can go, but normally, they're
- taken out as soon as possible, as soon as you get
- a police escort and then they go for the road
- $^{21}$  cars.
- Q. So after the last show on a tear-down

Page 186

- day, the elephants are taken to the train as soon
- as possible; is that what you're saying?
- $^3$  A. Yes.
- Q. The elephants on the blue unit are
- transported from venue to venue via train cars,
- 6 right?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- Q. And on a tear-down day, I'd like you
- 9 to explain as much as you can, describe to me the
- process of, the process engaged in by the Circus
- from the time the last show ends until the
- elephants are loaded onto the train, what happens?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- 14 A. That varies depending on if the
- weather is warm, the tent is taken down normally
- during the last show or in between the last shows,
- $^{17}$  if the weather is nice. And the pens are left up
- $^{18}$  and after the show, the elephants go back in those
- and are watered and then depending on the things
- that I have described to you already they'll
- either wait awhile in the pens or go straight to
- the train. They will be watered first. Once

Page 187

- they're on the train, they're tied up and fed.
- Q. When you say once they're on the train
- they're tied up, their legs are chained, is that
- 4 correct?
- 5 A. They're put on the chains. Yes.
- Q. And where in the process are the
- elephants loaded as opposed to other species of
- 8 animals?
- 9 A. What do you mean?
- 10 Q. Well, there's other animals that are
- used in the circus, correct?
- 12 A. Right. All the animal cars are
- together in a group.
- O. But are all the animals loaded onto
- the train at the same time?
- A. Pretty much. Yes. They all walk at
- the same time to the train.
- Q. Oh they are. All right. And while
- the elephants are waiting to be loaded onto the
- train, are they on chains or off chains?
- A. Off chains.
- Q. So if the last show, I know there's

Page 188

- some variables but I'm just trying to figure this
- out. If the last show ends at 5 o'clock p.m.,
- when typically would the elephants be loaded onto
- 4 the train?
- 5 A. Then it would depend on how far the
- 6 walk is. Normally two or three hours. Sometimes
- <sup>7</sup> less. Sometimes you go two blocks and jump them
- on the train, it takes 30 minutes.
- 9 O. And then what if the last show is at
- 1:30 p.m. How long does it take to get the
- elephants on the train?
- 12 A. It would be the same, just depends on
- distance and what kind of traffic you have and
- whether the escorts arrive on time.
- O. Who would the escorts be?
- A. The police.
- Q. So the police have to arrive before
- the elephants can be escorted to the train?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. Are there any other requirements that
- have to be met before the elephants can be loaded
- onto the train?

Page 189 1 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 2 Not that I know of. Α. 3 BY MS. MEYER: 4 And once the elephants are loaded onto 0. 5 the train, there sometimes is a wait before the 6 train actually leaves the venue; is that correct? 7 Yes. Α. 8 And on the other end when the train 9 gets to a new venue, there is a wait before the 10 elephants get off the train; is that correct? 11 Α. Sometimes. It varies tremendously. 12 Is there a process at the other end 13 when the train arrives at a new venue that has to 14 be followed before the elephants can be loaded off 15 the train? 16 Α. Right. 17 What is that process? Q. 18 The facilities they'll be housed in Α. 19 have a building that is put up. 20 Who does that, the crew? Q. 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. So you have to wait for the facility

Page 190 1 to be put up by the crew. What else? 2 Α. Although sometimes it's put up, 3 sometimes it goes by truck and it's put up when the cars get in. 5 Okay. How often does that happen? Q. 6 Α. I'm not sure. 7 What's the usual practice? Q. 8 Α. I'm not sure. 9 Ο. Who would know what the usual practice 10 is? 11 Α. The animal superintendent. 12 Ο. That will be David Polke? 13 Α. Yes. Actually, no. He's the elephant 14 superintendent. 15 Q. Who would it be now? 16 It could be David Polke. 17 Who is the animal superintendent of Q. 18 the blue unit? 19 They have a new one. His name is also 20 Alex. I can't remember his last name. 21 They would know what the usual Q. 22 practice is for when the train arrives at a new

Page 191 1 venue in terms of unloading the train? 2 Α. Right. 3 But you don't know what it is? Q. 4 Α. No. 5 Did ask you anybody before you came to Q. 6 this deposition? 7 I did not. Α. 8 When the train arrives at a new venue, 9 some of the crew arrives by another means; is that 10 correct? 11 Α. Yes. 12 And before the elephants can be 13 unloaded, the crew has to arrive, correct? 14 Α. Correct. 15 So you have to wait for the crew to 16 arrive before the elephants can be unloaded, 17 right? 18 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 19 Right. You have to wait until Α. 20 everybody's assembled. 21 BY MS. MEYER: 22 And isn't there some security fence Q.

Page 192

- that's put up around the area where the elephants
- <sup>2</sup> are unloaded?
- A. Not while they're unloaded but at the
- 4 building.
- <sup>5</sup> Q. At the building?
- A. Right. There's fence put up around
- <sup>7</sup> where the animals are kept.
- Q. Well, I went to an inspection in
- 9 Auburn Hills and they put up a little area that we
- had to stand behind before the elephants came off
- the train. I'm wondering if that's the normal
- 12 procedure?
- 13 A. Normally there wouldn't be anybody
- there that close.
- Q. So that's not a normal procedure to
- put any kind of security area up when the
- elephants are being unloaded from the train?
- A. Normally they're unloaded and they're
- <sup>19</sup> walking.
- Q. When the train arrives in a new venue,
- do the police have to arrive before the elephants
- can be unloaded from the train?

Page 193

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. And are there any other requirements
- 3 that have to be met before the elephants can be
- 4 unloaded from the train?
- 5 A. No.
- O. It sometimes takes a while for the
- police to get there, doesn't it?
- A. All of that is set up in advance, way
- 9 in advance.
- 10 Q. Does that mean it never takes a while
- 11 for the police to get there?
- A. Well, anything can happen. We were
- late coming here today.
- O. Because I remember when I was in
- Auburn Hills we had to wait for the police to
- come. So that seemed to be the procedure and I'm
- just asking you if that's the normal procedure?
- A. Normally, that's the way it's done.
- 19 It's required to have the police escorts.
- Q. Required by whom?
- A. I imagine the company and also the
- different municipalities.

Page 194 When the elephants are on the train, 1 Q. 2 they're sometimes provided water on the train; is 3 that correct? Α. Yes. 5 Q. How is that done? 6 Α. There's a tank on the train. A water 7 tank with an electric motor. 8 How are the elephants actually 9 provided water? 10 By hose into watering tubs. Α. 11 Is that done while the train is Q. 12 moving? 13 Α. It can be. Yes. 14 0. Is there a schedule for providing the 15 animals with, the elephants with water when 16 they're on the train?

17 A. Yes.

Q. And who's responsible for providing

them water when they're on the train?

20 A. Normally the people that stay with the

elephants on the train.

Q. Who would those people be? What would

Page 195

- 1 their position be?
- A. They would be handlers.
- Q. Could it be any handlers that are
- 4 working for the blue unit at the time or does
- someone actually get assigned that job?
- A. They get assigned that job.
- 7 Q. How does the animal crew find out when
- 8 the train is going to be leaving a particular
- <sup>9</sup> venue?
- 10 A. They're told what time the train will
- 11 probably be leaving.
- Q. How are they told?
- A. By the company communicator.
- 0. What does that mean?
- A. Well, when the show is over, it takes
- 16 X number of hours to load it up. So the show is
- over at 9 o'clock, then they load the train and
- it's pretty much the same every time.
- 19 Q. But the loading of the train occurs at
- different times at different venues, right?
- A. Right.
- Q. And the watering of the elephants

Page 196

- occurs at different times during the trip from a
- venue to a venue, correct, from one venue to
- another venue, correct?
- A. It can.
- 5 Q. So how does the animal crew find out
- 6 what the schedule is for all that?
- 7 A. They stop the train three times when
- 8 they're out a day. Theoretically, it's every
- 9 eight hours and then they make crew changes with
- the animal people.
- 11 O. And how does the crew know what's
- going on, is what I'm asking you?
- A. By radio.
- Q. How do they know ahead of time what
- the schedule is?
- A. It's printed out.
- Q. Where? And it's printed out and
- disseminated to the crew?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. Does every member of the crew get the
- same schedule?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.

	Page 197
1	A. I'm not sure.
2	BY MS. MEYER:
3	Q. Who prints it out?
4	A. The company.
5	Q. Who at the company?
6	A. There's a board at the back door of
7	the building that explains what's going on with
8	the runs, where to find a doctor, where to find a
9	dentist. It's an information board.
10	Q. It's like a bulletin board?
11	A. Yes.
12	Q. And where is the bulletin board
13	located?
14	A. Normally at the back door.
15	Q. Back door of what?
16	A. Of the building.
17	Q. What building?
18	A. Wherever they're playing. It's in an
19	easily accessible areas for emergency.
20	Q. And who prepares this document we're
21	talking about?
22	A. Management.

Page 198 1 Who at management? Q. 2 I don't know who at management. Α. 3 What kind of information is on the Q. 4 document we're talking about? 5 Α. It tells about the estimated time of 6 trip, what railroad it's on, where the stocks will 7 be set, where the coaches will be set. 8 0. Sorry. Estimated time of trip? 9 Α. Right. 10 Which rail? Q. 11 Α. Which railroad will be pulling it. 12 Which engines. 13 0. What else? 14 Α. What time it arrives. What time the 15 unloading would be for the animals. Just general 16 information. 17 And would it also have the water Q. 18 schedule on it for watering the animals? 19 Α. If it's water stops. Yes. 20 And is that done for every venue? Q. 21 Α. Yes. 2.2 Q. So there's a new printout of the

Page 199 1 schedule for every venue? 2 Α. Yes. 3 And this is true for the blue unit? Q. 4 Α. Yes. 5 Q. And has this been true for the last 10 6 years? 7 Α. As long as I can remember. 8 Has it been true since 1994? 0. 9 Α. Yes. 10 And how many different venues are Q. 11 there a year pretty much? 12 40 something normally. 13 0. And so that document has basically the 14 schedule that the crew would follow in going from 15 one venue to another venue; is that correct? 16 Α. Pretty much. Yes. 17 Is that document prepared on a Q. 18 computer? 19 Α. Pardon? 20 Is it prepared on a computer? Is it a 21 computerized document? 22 Α. I would image.

Page 200 1 Well, you've seen them, haven't you? Q. 2 Α. Yes. 3 Can you tell whether or not they're Q. 4 prepared on a computer? 5 I would imagine everything is prepared Α. 6 on a computer as far as I know. 7 So Ringling Brothers has to get Q. 8 permission from a rail company to travel on the 9 tracks from one venue to another, correct? 10 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 11 MS. MEYER: What's the objection? 12 MS. JOINER: Permission. 13 Α. They buy it. 14 BY MS. MEYER: 15 Q. They buy it? They have to make 16 arrangements with the rail company to travel on 17 the tracks, correct? 18 Yes. Α. 19 0. How is that done? 20 Α. I do not know. We have a large 21 transportation department that takes care of that. 22 Q. Who is the head of the transportation

Page 201

- department?
- 2 A. The person that does that normally is
- <sup>3</sup> a guy named Joe DeMike.
- 4 O. Joe DeMike?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. How do you spell the last name?
- 7 A. D-E-M-I-K-E.
- Q. And if the train is going to stop
- 9 somewhere along the way from one venue to another,
- does the rail company have to be notified of that?
- 11 A. Yes. That's the only way you're going
- to stop is if the engineer stops it. Yes.
- 13 Q. Is that something that would be
- denoted on this schedule that we talked about that
- $^{15}$  the crew gets?
- 16 A. Yes.
- Q. Does the rail company have to be
- notified of when the train arrives at a new venue?
- 19 A. The railroad yard would. Yes.
- Because you have to store the trains in different
- places.
- MS. MEYER: I'd like to have this

Page 202 1 marked as an exhibit. 2 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 12 marked for 3 identification.) 4 MS. MEYER: So I have had an exhibit 5 handed to you that's been marked Exhibit No. 12, 6 and for the record, it's a document that was 7 produced by the defendant in this case with the 8 Bates label Feld 0004065. I'm going to ask you to 9 take a look at that? 10 (The witness complies.) Α. 11 BY MS. MEYER: 12 Q. Have you taken a look at it? 13 Α. Yes. 14 0. Is this an example of one of the 15 documents you were talking about that's posted on 16 the back door? 17 Α. I'm not sure. They also have another 18 document but this would be one of them. Yes. 19 0. So you're familiar with this kind of 20 document; is that correct? 21 Yes. Sort of. Α. 22 Because I'm hoping you can help me Q.

Page 203

- decipher what's on here. So I'd like to kind of
- walk through it with you and see if you can answer
- my questions about it and for the record, this
- 4 exhibit is titled blue unit
- 5 schedule-transportation order. This one is dated
- 6 06/02/04 and up in the right-hand corner it has
- <sup>7</sup> the name J. William Misiura. Do you see that?
- 8 A. Bill Misiura. Yes.
- 9 O. And he's identified as the director of
- transportation. Would that be for the Circus?
- 11 A. Yes.
- Q. But he's no longer the director of
- transportation?
- 14 A. No. He still is. Joe DeMike works
- 15 for him.
- Q. I see. Okay.
- 17 A. This is a few years old, right?
- 18 Q. This is dated 2004. This has a lot of
- information on it. It says departure Monday,
- June 14, 2004 from station Wilkesborough,
- Pennsylvania and then it has a route with a bunch
- of names and it looks like rail companies on it

Page 204

- and then it says to station Wichita Falls, Texas.
- 2 Do you see that?
- A. Uh-huh.
- Q. And then over on the right-hand column
- right opposite of where it says Wichita Falls,
- Texas it says 1,961 miles. Do you see that?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- 8 Q. So that 1,961 miles would connote the
- 9 mileage from Wilkesborough, Pennsylvania to
- Wichita Falls, Texas; is that correct?
- A. I believe so.
- 12 Q. Where it says route and then it has
- some names of it looks like companies, are those
- the rail companies? See where it says LNS,
- Wilkesborough; CP, Harrisburg; NS, Kansas City;
- DNSF, Wichita Falls; WKTJR, are those -- those are
- rail companies?
- <sup>18</sup> A. Yes.
- 19 Q. So were those the rail companies that
- Ringling Brothers has to get permission or has to
- pay in order to use the tracks?
- A. Yes. They employ them. We use their

Page 205 1 engines. 2 Q. So explain how that works to me? 3 Α. Different engines go in different 4 parts of the country on different tracks and we 5 rent the engines to pull the train. 6 Q. And those are the companies you rent 7 the engines from? 8 Some of them. Α. 9 Ο. Once you have the engines, then you 10 are you allowed to use the tracks for a certain 11 period of time? 12 Α. Yes. 13 It says transportation order at the 0. 14 What does that mean? top. 15 It's just explaining where they're 16 going to be at certain times if it's on the 17 schedule. 18 Was is an order from someone to Ο. 19 someone else? 20 MS. JOINER: Objection to form.

Alderson Reporting Company 1-800-FOR-DEPO

for everybody to look at to see where they're

Bill Misiura sets it up, and this is

21

22

Α.

Page 206 1 going to be at certain times. 2 So it's an order directed to the crew Q. 3 then? Α. Yes. More or less. 5 And it's a regular practice of Q. 6 Ringling Brothers to prepare these documents; is 7 that correct? 8 Yes. Α. 9 Are they kept in the course of Q. 10 Ringling Brothers regularly-conducted business? 11 Α. Pardon? 12 Are they maintained in the course of 13 the company's business? 14 Α. They would be. Yes. 15 Do you know what any of these rail Q. 16 company acronyms stand for? 17 Α. No, I do not. 18 Particularly looking at the left-hand 19 column of this document where it as LNS, then it 20 says CP, NS, do you see those? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. Abbreviations. Do you know what those

Page 207 1 stand for? 2 Α. No, I do not. 3 Q. It says at the top of the document just under Wichita Falls, Texas the circus train 5 master is Gene Pettis. Do you see that? 6 Yes. Α. 7 Is Gene Pettis still the train master? 0. 8 Α. I believe not. 9 Q. Do you know who the train master is 10 for the blue unit? 11 Α. No, I do not. 12 Q. Who would know that? 13 Α. Any number of people. 14 0. Would David Polke know that? 15 Α. Sure. 16 Who else would know that when you say Q. 17 any number of people? 18 Jim Andacht. Α. 19 All right. And it says, "Please 0. 20 monitor the progress of the circus train to assure 21 crews are available." Do you see that? 22 Α. Yes.

Page 208 1 Who is that directed to? Q. 2 Α. I'm not sure. 3 Q. All right. Now it says, just going 4 down this document a couple of lines under that 5 double line there at the top it says, "Train 6 loaded and ready for switching." Do you see that? 7 Α. Yes. 8 Do you know what that means? 9 That means they're ready to switch Α. 10 over onto the main tracks. 11 Switch over from where? Q. 12 From the siding that they're on where 13 they're unloading. 14 Does it mean the train is loaded with 0. 15 the animals on it? 16 Α. Yes. 17 Then it has the time there in the Q. 18 right-hand column and I assume that's military 19 time, correct? 20 Α. Yes. 21 So, for example, when it says train Q. 22 loaded and ready for switching, then it says 00:01

Page 209

- Monday, 06/14/04, that means the train was loaded
- and ready for switching at 12:01 a.m. on that
- 3 date?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- 5 A. I have to look at my watch.
- MS. MEYER: Did I get the military time
- 7 wrong; is that why you're objecting?
- MS. JOINER: No. You were asking him
- 9 if this was after, I thought, but I don't think I
- understood that correctly.
- BY MS. MEYER:
- 12 Q. I'm just asking you, if you read this
- column it says train load and ready for switching
- and then if you read across it says the time,
- 00:01, then it says Monday, 06/14/04. And I'm
- asking you what does that mean?
- A. I'm not sure.
- Q. Do you know military time?
- A. No, not unless I look at my watch.
- Q. You can look at your watch. That's
- $^{21}$  fine with me.
- A. My watch must not be military.

Page 210

- Q. Well, I believe 00:01 is 12:01 a.m.
- We can check that, that's not a problem. You
- agree this is military time on here, right?
- <sup>4</sup> A. Yes. Or Greek.
- <sup>5</sup> Q. So at that point in time, again, the
- 6 animals are loaded onto the train when it says
- <sup>7</sup> train load and ready for switching, correct?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Then when it says a few lines down
- depart Wilkesborough, Pennsylvania and it has the
- time over in that right-hand column it says
- 5 o'clock right there, Monday, 06/14/04, that
- would be the time that the train actually starts
- moving?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- A. I'm not sure.
- BY MS. MEYER:
- Q. What is meant by depart Wilkesborough,
- 19 Pennsylvania?
- 20 A. That sounds like when the train
- leaves.
- Q. Okay. When it leaves Wilkesborough,

Page 211 1 correct? 2 Α. Right. 3 Just below that it says arrive Q. 4 Harrisburg and then it says at the end of that 5 line, deliver to NS. Do you know what that means? 6 I would assume that's another engine Α. 7 or track. 8 Well, the train, correct me if I'm 0. 9 wrong, but the animals aren't getting off the 10 train and getting into new train cars, are they? 11 Α. No, they're not. 12 But they may be getting onto tracks 13 that are owned by different rail companies? 14 Α. It could be. 15 Then a couple of lines down from there Q. 16 it says, arrive Altoona, Pennsylvania, crew 17 change, water animals. Do you see that? 18 Α. Yes. 19 And does that mean the animals were 0. 20 given water at that point in time? 21 Α. It may. In the old days, they used to 22 stop the train twice a day to water. Now they

Page 212

- 1 have ample water in the cars but when they do
- stop, they do refill the tanks normally.
- Q. But that's at a point in time when the
- 4 animals would be given water, correct?
- 5 A. They may have already been watered
- 6 before then.
- <sup>7</sup> Q. Oh, I see okay. Then nine lines down
- from that, again, it says arrive New Haven, crew
- 9 change. It says water animals. Do you see that?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Then just below that it says, rest
- 12 animals?
- 13 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you see that? What does that mean?
- 15 A. They must have taken the elephants off
- $^{16}$  the cars.
- Q. And that's what is denoted by the word
- 18 rest animals?
- 19 A. That's what I believe it means?
- Q. That means the animals actually got
- off the train?
- A. Just the elephants.

Page 213 1 Just the elephants. How do you know Q. 2 that? 3 Α. I don't think they take the zebras and 4 other things off. I think it's just the 5 elephants. 6 Q. So when it says rest animals, that 7 means the elephants got off the train at that 8 point in time, correct? 9 I believe so. Yes. Α. 10 And these, right before the hours in Q. 11 the, that says when each of these events occurred 12 it says EDT, CDT, I assume those are time zones, 13 correct, like Eastern Daylight? 14 Α. Central Daylight. Yes. 15 Q. Right? Those are time zones? 16 They should be. Α. 17 And do you know given that they're Q. 18 crossing different time zones, do you know how 19 that affects the column where the time is listed, 20 would that be taken into account? 21 Α. I do not know. 22

> Alderson Reporting Company 1-800-FOR-DEPO

Q.

That's something the director of

Page 214

- transportation could answer, right?
- A. Certainly.
- Q. And you think Mr. Polke could answer
- 4 that question?
- 5 A. No.
- Q. If you go sort of way down to the
- bottom of the column it says at one point, arrive
- 8 Wichita Falls, Texas, deliver coaches to WTJR. Do
- 9 you see that? It's almost at the very end right
- before it says lock and blue flag storage?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 O. And that would be the arrival time of
- the train at the new venue in Wichita Falls,
- 14 correct?
- $^{15}$  A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And the arrival time on this document
- says 9:15, and that would be 9:15 a.m. on June
- 18 17th '04; is that correct?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. And then it says, all cars spotted.
- Do you see that?
- 22 A. Yes.

Page 215

- Q. What does that mean?
- 2 A. It could mean several different
- things. They spot cars in different places,
- 4 sometimes they spot the stock cars close so the
- walk is not as far, sometimes the coaches are
- 6 spotted 10 miles away, sometimes the flats are
- 7 spotted close and moved 10 miles.
- Q. I don't even know what spotted means.
- 9 What does spotted mean?
- 10 A. Put in a spot where they can unload
- things from them, normally or put in a spot where
- their going to stay for the duration of the venue.
- 13 Q. You used several different terms when
- you were answering my question. You said stock
- car and coach cars. What is a stock car?
- A. That's where the animals ride, in this
- case, elephants.
- Q. And how do you know it's just
- 19 elephants?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- A. I'm only talking about elephants,
- 22 right?

Page 216 1 BY MS. MEYER: 2 Well, is this schedule only pertaining Q. 3 to the elephants? 4 No. It's all of the animals, all the Α. 5 cars. 6 And you said coach cars, what does Q. 7 that mean? 8 That would be where people live, the Α. 9 pike car. 10 So that's the human beings basically? Q. 11 Α. Pretty much. 12 Q. So when it says all cars spotted, are 13 the elephants still on the train? 14 Α. I do not know. 15 Q. Who would know the answer to that 16 question? 17 I'm not sure. Α. 18 Well, the director of transportation Q. 19 would know the answer to that question? 20 I'm not certain of that. 21 Would Jim Andacht know the answer to Q. 22 that question?

Page 217 1 Α. Probably not. Joe DeMike would know. 2 Q. Is it possible that the elephants are 3 still on the train when it says all cars spotted? 4 Α. Yes. 5 And when they're on the train, they're Q. 6 in chains, correct? 7 They're tied up. Yes. Α. 8 And then once the train arrives and 9 all cars have been spotted, that's when this 10 procedure we talked about earlier kicks in that 11 occurs when a train arrives at a new venue; is 12 that correct? 13 Α. Yes. 14 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 15 BY MS. MEYER: 16 That's when the police have to arrive, Q. 17 correct? 18 Α. Correct. 19 And the crew has to get there, 0. 20 correct? 21 Α. Unless they have gone over land. 22 Q. And those things have to occur before

Page 218 1 the elephants can get off the train; is that 2 correct? 3 Α. Right. 4 I see Joe DeMike, he's listed down 5 here, I see that, transportation manager. That's 6 who you were talking about? 7 Α. Yes. 8 0. What is meant by lock and flag storage 9 tracks? 10 Α. I do not know. 11 Q. Who would know that? 12 Probably Joe DeMike. Α. 13 MS. MEYER: I've got another document 14 I'd like you to take a look at. 15 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 13 was marked for 16 identification.) 17 BY MS. MEYER: 18 So I have handed you a document that's Q. 19 been marked Exhibit 13. It is a document that was 20 produced by defendant in this case with the Bates 21 label Feld 0004056. And for the record, it is 22 another blue unit schedule transportation order.

Page 219

- 1 This one is dated June 6, 2004. Do you see that?
- <sup>2</sup> A. Yes.
- Q. And this concerns a trip that the
- 4 train -- that the circus took from Washington,
- D.C. to Charleston, West Virginia; is that
- 6 correct?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- Q. And this looks like a much shorter
- 9 trip. It says it's 453 miles, correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. That's a lot shorter than the last
- trip we were talking about, right?
- $^{13}$  A. Yes.
- Q. And again, it says train loaded and
- ready for switching at the top?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And it has a time over here which is
- military time for 8 o'clock p.m., Monday, April
- <sup>19</sup> 21, 2003, correct?
- A. Right.
- Q. Then I see down here a ways it says
- 22 arrive Elmore, West Virginia, crew change, water

Page 220 1 animals, head for cars. Do you see that? 2 Α. Yes. 3 And that happened at 17:15, which is Q. 4 5:15 p.m. on April 22nd, 2003; is that correct? 5 Α. Yes. 6 And then I don't see anything about a Q. 7 rest period here at all. Do you see anything 8 about a rest period? 9 No. There wouldn't be. Α. 10 Q. Why not? 11 It's a short distance. Α. 12 0. So if it's shorter distance, there 13 would not be a rest period, correct? 14 Α. Right. 15 If there had been a rest during this Q. 16 trip, it would be on here as a rest period, 17 correct? 18 Α. Yes. 19 Then I see arrive Charleston, West 0. 20 Virginia, 1:30 a.m. Wednesday, 4/23/03, correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. That would be the time the train

Page 221

- finally arrived in Charleston, West Virginia; is
- 2 that right?
- A. Right.
- 4 Q. And then the rest of these phrase is
- spot coaches, that's the same as the phrase you
- 6 explained to me earlier on the last document?
- A. Correct.
- Q. All cars spotted is the same as you
- 9 explained to me before, correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And at that point in time when all
- cars are spotted again, the elephants could still
- be on the train at that point; is that correct?
- $^{14}$  A. Yes.
- MS. MEYER: Okay. I've got another one
- 16 I'm going to ask you about. Can you mark that
- 17 Exhibit 14.
- 18 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 14 was marked for
- identification.)
- MS. MEYER: You've been handed what's
- been marked Exhibit 14, which is a document
- produced by the defendant with the Bates label

Page 222

- Feld 0004052, and it is another blue unit schedule
- $^{2}$  transportation order, this one is dated 6/06/04
- and it concerns a trip from Waco, Texas to Dallas
- <sup>4</sup> Texas. Do you see that?
- 5 A. Yes.
- Q. That's a very short trip, that's 120
- 7 miles. Do you see that?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And what I wanted to ask you about on
- this document is you see about five lines down in
- the schedule it says animals board train?
- $^{12}$  A. Yes.
- 0. Which I didn't see on the other
- documents. What does that mean?
- A. Well, I believe they stayed overnight
- and loaded in the morning.
- Okay. Because earlier it says train
- loaded and ready for switching, and I thought you
- explained to me that meant the animals were on the
- 20 train?
- MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
- A. That's what I thought it meant.

Page 223 1 MS. MEYER: Okay. 2 But it could be they hooked it all up Α. 3 and then they walked the elephants and loaded them 4 in the morning. 5 BY MS. MEYER: 6 That's why it says animals board Q. 7 train? 8 Α. That would be the various. 9 So in a situation where that had Ο. 10 occurred, it would say animals board train on the 11 schedule? 12 It does on this one. That's not a 13 normal procedure. Normally it's loaded the night 14 before. 15 MS. MEYER: All right. Okay. I've got 16 one more of these I want to ask you about. 17 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 15 was marked for 18 identification.) 19 BY MS. MEYER: 20 And Exhibit 15 is also a document 0. 21 produced by defendant marked Bates label Feld 22 0003551. It is also blue unit schedule

Page 224 1 transportation order, this one for June 3rd, 2004. 2 Do you see that? 3 Α. Yes. 4 And this is an even shorter trip it's 5 from East Rutherford, New York to Uniondale, 6 Garden City, New York. Do you see that? 7 Uh-huh. Α. 8 And what I wanted to ask you about 9 that is you see there's a second column of times 10 over on the right-hand side? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. What does that mean? 13 Α. I don't have a clue. 14 Q. Oh, okay? 15 MS. JOINER: I'm sorry. Where were you 16 at? 17 MS. MEYER: On the very far right. 18 MS. JOINER: Oh, on the times. 19 MS. MEYER: An additional column of 20 times. 21 BY MS. MEYER: 22 Q. You don't know what that means?

Page 225 1 Α. I don't. 2 Who would know what that means? 0. 3 Joe DeMike would know. Α. 4 MS. MEYER: All right. Let's take a 5 break. 6 MS. JOINER: I have something that I 7 want to point out to you about these documents. Ι don't know if you want to do that on or off the 9 record, the witness can leave the room but it's up 10 to you. 11 MS. MEYER: Boy, that sounds ominous. 12 MS. JOINER: It's not ominous. I just 13 want to clarify something with you. 14 MS. MEYER: Then let's have the witness 15 leave the room. 16 MS. JOINER: Okay. Then let's do that. 17 And it's fine with me if you want it to stay on 18 the record. I'm fine with that. It's your 19 preference. 20 THE VIDEO OPERATOR: This marks the end 21 of videotape No. 3 of the deposition of Gary 22 Jacobson representing Feld Entertainment

Page 226

- 1 Incorporated. Going off the record. The time is
- 2 2:51 p.m.
- This marks the beginning of videotape 4 of
- 4 the deposition of Gary Jacobson representing Feld
- 5 Entertainment, Incorporated. Going back on the
- 6 record. The time is 2:56 p.m.
- <sup>7</sup> BY MS. MEYER:
- 9 Q. Mr. Jacobson, if you will turn back to
- <sup>9</sup> Exhibit 12 which is the Wilkesborough,
- 10 Pennsylvania to Wichita Falls, Texas
- transportation order. I just want to make it
- clear, for the record, that this trip occurred,
- departure date was Monday, June 14, 2004 and the
- arrival date was June 17, 2004; is that correct?
- 15 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And if you would look at
- Exhibit 13 which is the transportation order for
- the trip from Washington, D.C. to Charleston, West
- Virginia, the departure date was Monday, April
- 21st, 2003 and the arrival date was April 23,
- 2003; is that correct?
- 22 A. Yes.

Page 227 which is

- Q. And if you look at Exhibit 14 which is
- the transportation order for Waco, the trip from
- Waco, Texas to Dallas, Texas, the departure date
- was July 30th, 2001 and the arrival date was
- <sup>5</sup> August 1st, 2001; is that correct? I'm sorry. No
- it isn't. Arrival, 7/31/01, correct?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Yes.
- 8 Q. And if you look at Exhibit 15 which is
- <sup>9</sup> the transportation order from the trip to East
- Rutherford to Uniondale, Garden City, New York,
- the departure date was March 6, 2000 and the
- arrival date was the same date, March 6, 2000,
- 13 correct?
- $^{14}$  A. Yes.
- 0. Mr. Jacobson, what is the role of
- Nicole among the elephants on the blue unit?
- A. What do you mean role?
- Q. Does she have any particular role
- among the elephants?
- A. She's a nice, stable, gentle
- 21 performing elephant. She paints. She can be
- taken by herself. She's just a nice elephant.

Page 228 1 Q. Do the other elephants enjoy 2 interacting with her? 3 Some of them. Α. 4 0. Which ones? 5 Α. She lives primarily with Karen. 6 Any of the other elephants that she Q. 7 interacts with? 8 Not a lot, no. Α. 9 Have she and Karen been together for a Q. 10 long time? 11 Quite a while. Α. 12 Q. Does Karen have any special role among 13 the elephants? 14 She's similar to the Nicole. She's a Α. 15 nice steady older elephant. 16 Is Nicole going to stay on the blue 17 unit for a while? 18 Yes. Α. 19 How long will she be on the blue unit? Q. 20 Α. Probably as long as there's a blue 21 unit. 22 Q. Really?

Page 229 1 Α. Yes. 2 0. And she's about 31 years old right 3 now; is that correct? 4 Α. Yes. 5 So you see her say staying on the blue Q. 6 unit for some period of time? 7 Α. Yes. 8 And what about Karen, is she going to stay on the blue unit for a while? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Q. And she's about 38, 39 years old; is 12 that correct? 13 Α. Yes. 14 So you see her staying on the blue 15 unit for the foreseeable future? 16 Α. Yes. 17 Now, what about is it possible that Q. 18 either Nicole or Karen may be transferred to the 19 gold unit at some point? 20 Α. No. 21 Q. Why not? 22 Α. Basically we need more, not less

Page 230 1 elephants on the blue show. 2 Q. Why do you say you need more? 3 It's nice to have more. Α. 4 And is there a possibility that Nicole 0. or Karen would be transferred to the red unit? 5 6 Α. No. 7 And is there any possibility that Zina Q. 8 may go back out on the road? 9 Α. No. 10 Q. What about Jewell? 11 Α. No. 12 Q. What about Susan? 13 Α. No. 14 Q. What about Mysore? 15 Α. No. 16 What about Lutzi? Q. 17 Α. No. 18 Is there any possibility that any of Q. 19 those five elephants may be sent somewhere else? 20 We have no plans at this time to send 21 them anywhere. 22 Q. Are you familiar with the routine

Page 231

- that's used to bathe the elephants on the blue
- 2 unit?
- $^3$  A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Are the elephants still chained when
- 5 they're bathed on the blue unit?
- A. Seldom.
- Q. Are they sometimes, though?
- 8 A. Not the ones that we're speaking
- 9 about. No.
- 10 Q. When we were going over the
- transportation records earlier, the transportation
- orders, I thought you said before we got to those
- that there's some other kind of document that has
- the schedule on it that is sometimes posted for
- the crew; is that correct?
- A. I thought it was different, maybe it's
- 17 this one.
- 18 Q. Is the documents that I showed you the
- kind of documents you were thinking of though?
- A. Sort of. The format is somewhat
- different.
- Q. How is the format different?

Page 232 1 I don't know. I'll have to look at it Α. 2 when I get home. I'm not much on papers. 3 Q. Are you familiar with the daily 4 performance records that were prepared for the 5 blue unit? Do you know what I'm talking about? 6 The show performance records? Α. 7 Is that what they're called? Q. 8 I think that's what they are. Α. 9 Ο. Can you tell me what those documents 10 are? 11 Α. I have seen one or two of them some 12 years ago. 13 So you don't know who prepares them? Q. 14 Α. No, I do not. 15 Q. You don't know who those records are 16 distributed to? 17 Α. No, I'm, not to me, I know that. 18 Who on the blue unit would know that Ο. 19 information? 20 Jim Andacht. Α. 21 Is Jim Andacht responsible for the Q. 22 blue unit?

Page 233 1 MS. JOINER: Objection to form. 2 Α. Right now, he's acting general 3 manager. 4 BY MS. MEYER: 5 How long has Jim Andacht been acting Q. 6 general manager of blue unit? 7 Five or six weeks. Α. 8 Did he take someone's place as the 9 general manager? 10 Α. Someone left. He's the vice president 11 that fills in. 12 Q. Is he filling in for Mike Hayward? 13 Α. No. 14 0. Who is he filling in for? I mean, who 15 left. Let me say it that way? 16 Α. A general manager. 17 Who is that? Q. 18 Α. I don't know his name. I never met 19 him. 20 You don't know who the general manager 0. 21 of the blue unit was prior to five or six weeks 22 ago?

Page 234 1 Α. He was only there a couple of weeks. 2 I never met him. 3 Who would know his name? Q. Α. Jim Andacht. 5 Would David Polke know his name? Q. 6 Α. Maybe. 7 Why was he only there for such a short Q. 8 period of time? 9 Α. He didn't get along. 10 Q. Who didn't he get along with? 11 Jim Andacht. Α. 12 Q. Was Jim Andacht on the show at the 13 time? 14 Α. Yes. 15 Is this something that occurred at 16 winter quarters? 17 Α. Yes. 18 So this was somebody who had been 19 recently hired to be the general manager who came 20 to winter quarters; is that correct? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. And did he stay through winter

Page 235 1 quarters? 2 Α. No. 3 Q. He did not. He didn't last through 4 winter quarters? 5 Α. No. 6 Do you know anything about this 0. 7 individual? 8 No, nothing. Α. 9 You didn't meet him? Ο. 10 Α. I've never met him. 11 And who was the general manager before Q. 12 this individual that we're speaking of? 13 Α. Jim Andacht. 14 0. For the blue unit? 15 Α. Yes. 16 How long had he been general manager Q. 17 for the blue unit? 18 Four or five months probably. Α. 19 So is the blue unit looking to hire a 0. 20 new general manager? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Q. Has it chosen a new general manager

Page 236 1 yet? 2 Α. Not that I know of. 3 Is anybody within the company right Q. 4 now being considered for that position? 5 Not that I know of, no. Α. 6 So that means Jim Andacht was Q. 7 traveling with the blue unit for some period of 8 time; is that correct? 9 Α. Yes. 10 Q. When was he traveling with the blue 11 unit? 12 Α. I'm not sure. 13 0. Would he have been traveling with the 14 blue unit the entire time he was the general 15 manager? 16 I think not, no. 17 Q. Does the general manager of the blue 18 unit usually travel with the rest of the blue 19 unit? 20 Α. Yes. 21 Can you tell me the total amount of Q. 22 time that the elephants on the blue unit, and I'm

Page 237 1 speaking of Karen and Nicole, are actually 2 performing when there's a show? 3 You mean, on the floor? In the arena? Α. Well, do they perform somewhere else? 0. 5 Α. No. 6 On the floor, in the arena? Q. Yes. 7 Maybe 10 minutes. Α. 8 Is that true for each show? 0. 9 Would be the same for each show. Α. Yes. 10 And is there a policy at the blue unit Q. 11 regarding written reprimands of employees for 12 misconduct? 13 Α. I believe they may do that there. 14 0. You're not familiar with the policy? 15 Α. No. 16 Would Mr. Andacht be familiar with the Q. 17 policy? 18 Α. Yes. 19 Would Mr. Polke be familiar with the Q. 20 policy. 21 Α. Probably. Yes. 22 Who at Feld Entertainment is Q.

Page 238

- 1 responsible for monitoring the health of the
- <sup>2</sup> elephants?
- A. The elephant superintendent, a general
- 4 manager such as myself, senior handlers, five
- 5 veterinarians, simple vet techs, quite a number of
- 6 people actually look at them.
- <sup>7</sup> Q. Who at the company is responsible for
- 8 ensuring that the elephants are well cared for?
- <sup>9</sup> A. All of the people that I just
- mentioned.
- Q. Anyone else?
- A. Not really?
- Q. Well, does Mr. Andacht has
- responsibility for ensuring the animals are well
- cared for, right?
- A. Yes. People would report to him.
- MS. MEYER: All right. I actually
- need to take a break, then I may have one last
- area of questioning I want to do, then I'll be
- done.
- MS. JOINER: Okay.
- THE VIDEO OPERATOR: We're going off

Page 239

- $^{1}$  the record. The time is 3:09 p.m.
- We're going back on the record. The time is
- 3:18 p.m.
- MS. MEYER: What I want to do,
- Mr. Jacobson, is I want to show you some video
- footage and the only reason I'm showing you this
- is so you can hopefully help me identify some of
- 8 the individuals that we see on the videotape,
- 9 that's the only reason I'm showing it to you.
- A. What do you mean by individuals?
- 11 Q. If there's a person on the video and
- you know who it is, I want you to tell me. That's
- all. So we're going to start with, the first one
- is footage that was produced by the defendants.
- $^{15}$  It has a Bates label of FEI 45204 it says No. 1
- and then it's dated 12/10/2001. Tape 1 of 10.
- Why don't we go ahead and have that marked as an
- exhibit.
- 19 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 16 was marked for
- identification.)
- MS. MEYER: So what I would like to do
- is I'm going to have my paralegal show you, we're

Page 240

- qoing to run through a little clip and then she's
- going to back it up and then I'm going to say, can
- you tell me who that person is, so we can figure
- out if we can identify some of these individuals.
- <sup>5</sup> Okay.
- A. Okay.
- BY MS. MEYER:
- Q. Okay. Go ahead (video plays). Do you
- 9 know who that is?
- 10 A. Sarah Houcke.
- MS. SINNOTT: On the tape the time
- stamp is 15 minutes and 11 seconds through 15
- minutes and 25 seconds.
- MS. MEYER: So I'd like the record to
- show that on this tape, Mr. Jacobson identified
- Sarah Houcke at that place on the tape that was
- just red into the record 15:11 to 15:25. Okay.
- $^{18}$  And the next.
- MS. JOINER: Is there audio to this?
- MS. SINNOTT: There is. I just turned
- 21 it up a little.
- MS. MEYER: So now we're going to go to

Page 241 1 the second clip. 2 MS. SINNOTT: We're not there yet. 3 Here we are (video plays). Okay. That was the 4 clip. 5 BY MS. MEYER: 6 Q. Was that also Sarah Houcke that you 7 saw? 8 Yes. Α. 9 MS. MEYER: So let the record show that 10 the witness identified Sarah Houcke at the second 11 clip which is at what place on the tape. 12 MS. SINNOTT: 16 minutes and 7 seconds 13 through 16 minutes and 20 seconds. 14 MS. JOINER: How are you getting the 15 time stamp off of there? 16 MS. SINNOTT: It will say and it's a 17 range, so in case. Are we ready for the next one. 18 MS. MEYER: Sure. Third clip. 19 MS. SINNOTT: Okay. Starting here 20 (video plays). And that was the clip. 21 BY MS. MEYER: 22 Q. Was that also Sarah Houcke?

Page 242 1 Α. Yes. 2 0. And what's the time stamp for that, 3 Michelle? 4 MS. SINNOTT: 18 minutes and 15 seconds 5 through 18 minutes and 30 seconds. And that's it 6 for this tape. 7 MS. MEYER: So the second footage is 8 one that was also produced by Feld Entertainment 9 it's labeled FEI 45196 and it's dated 12/15/03. 10 So if we could make that the next exhibit. 11 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 17 was marked for 12 identification.) 13 MS. MEYER: And again, I just want you 14 to identify these individuals. We're ready for 15 the next clip. 16 MS. SINNOTT: The clip starts now 17 (video plays). Okay. That's the end of that 18 clip. 19 BY MS. MEYER: 20 Do you recognize the lady in the hat? Q. 21 Α. That's a lady? 22 Q. Maybe it's not a lady. A person in

Page 243 1 the hat. 2 Α. Go back a little bit. What year is 3 this? 4 MS. MEYER: It's labeled 2003 (video 5 That's definitely not a -- that's a replays). 6 man. 7 BY MS. MEYER: 8 Do you know who it is? 0. 9 I can't tell. Α. 10 MS. MEYER: Can you back it up a little 11 bit and just play it one more time, Michelle 12 (video replays). 13 BY MS. MEYER: 14 0. You don't know who that is? 15 Α. I cannot tell who that is. I don't 16 know. 17 All right. We have a second clip on Q. 18 this footage. The second clip begins now (video 19 That's the end of it. Can you identify plays). 20 any of these individuals here? You want to back 21 up a little bit, Michelle, so he can see who we're 22 talking about?

	Page 244
1	A. You want all of them identified?
2	Q. Sure.
3	A. The first one is Alex Vargas.
4	Q. That's Alex Vargas in the front of the
5	line?
6	A. Yes.
7	Q. Okay. He's holding onto an elephant's
8	ear, right, on that shot, right?
9	A. Yes.
10	MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for
11	that, Michelle?
12	MS. SINNOTT: It's 12:10, this
13	particular time stamp.
14	Q. Okay. And the next person?
15	A. That's all I have. I can't tell who
16	that is.
17	Q. The next person?
18	A. The guy in the blue shirt is Pat.
19	Q. Pat Harned at the end on the right?
20	A. In the blue shirt.
21	Q. Right. In the blue shirt. Okay.
22	A. Then I can't see from here.

Page 245

- Q. Can you see the person in front of Pat
- 2 Harned who that is with the hat on?
- 3 A. No.
- MS. MEYER: Why don't you back it up
- and play it one more time, Michelle, see if that
- 6 helps. (The witness complies.)
- 7 A. The one guy scratching his head is
- 8 Jeff Pettigrew.
- 9 Q. Okay. Can you see the guy standing
- behind the guy with the hat on?
- A. I don't know.
- Q. Can you back it up?
- 13 A. I can't see that. The guy behind Alex
- is Icham.
- Oh, that's Icham the one behind Alex.
- 16 A. That's Jeff Pettigrew scratching his
- head.
- 18 Q. So Jeff Pettigrew is the guy with the
- baseball cap on?
- A. Yeah. And I can't tell who the other
- $^{21}$  guy is.
- Q. And Icham is the one behind Alex

Page 246 1 Vargas? 2 The guy that's looking at us. 3 MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for 4 this clip, Michelle. 5 MS. SINNOTT: 12:15. 6 BY MS. MEYER: 7 Anybody else you can identify in that Q. 8 clip? 9 Α. No. 10 MS. SINNOTT: That's the end of this 11 tape. 12 MS. JOINER: I suppose we should 13 clarify, the time stamp is not actually on the 14 screen itself, it's down below on the machine so 15 when people are reading the transcript. 16 MS. MEYER: We only have one copy of 17 this one, so you need to play it. Okay. So when 18 we're done playing it, we'll have it marked as an 19 exhibit and it will be Exhibit 18. 20 MS. JOINER: Is there a Bates number? 21 MS. MEYER: Yes. It's PL 07074. All 22 right. Let's see the first clip.

```
Page 247
 1
                 MS. SINNOTT: This is the first clip
 2
     (video plays). That's the end of the clip.
 3
                 BY MS. MEYER:
                  Who is that individual?
           0.
 5
           Α.
                  Troy.
 6
                  That's Troy Metzler?
           Q.
 7
                 Yes.
           Α.
 8
           Q.
                  And what's the stamp for that?
 9
                 MS. SINNOTT: The exact time is 37
10
     seconds.
11
                 MS. MEYER: I'm not sure what that
12
     means.
13
                 MS. SINNOTT: 00:37.
14
                 MS. MEYER: The entire clip is 20
15
     seconds through 36 seconds.
16
                BY MS. MEYER:
17
           Q.
                  So that's Troy Metzler in that clip?
18
           Α.
                 Yes.
19
           0.
                  All right.
20
                  I might also add I don't see Karen or
21
     Nicole there either.
22
                 MS. SINNOTT: This is the beginning of
```

```
Page 248
1
     this clip (video plays).
 2
                BY MS. MEYER:
 3
           Q.
                 Is that also Troy Metzler?
 4
           Α.
                 I believe so.
 5
                 And what's the time stamp for that
           Q.
 6
     clip?
 7
                MS. SINNOTT: 1 minute and 15 seconds
 8
     through 1 minute and 33 seconds?
 9
                MS. MEYER: Go to the next clip.
10
                MS. SINNOTT: This begins the next clip
11
     (video plays). That's the end of that clip.
12
                BY MS. MEYER:
13
                 Okay. And that's also Troy Metzler,
           Q.
14
     correct?
15
           Α.
                 Yes.
16
                 What's the time stamp for that one?
           Q.
17
                MS. SINNOTT: 1 minute and 39 seconds
18
     through 2 minutes. This is the next clip. (Video
19
     plays.)
              That's pretty much the end of that clip.
20
                BY MS. MEYER:
21
                 Keep playing it a little bit,
           Q.
22
     Michelle.
                And that was Troy Metzler as well,
```

```
Page 249
1
     correct?
 2
           Α.
                 Yes.
 3
                MS. MEYER: And what's the time stamp
 4
     for that one?
 5
                MS. SINNOTT: 2 minutes and 3 seconds
 6
     through 2 minutes and 20 seconds.
 7
                MS. MEYER: All right.
 8
                MS. SINNOTT: This is it (video plays).
 9
                BY MS. MEYER:
10
                 Is that also Troy Metzler?
           Q.
11
           Α.
                 Yes.
12
           Q.
                 And what's the time stamp for that
13
     clip, Michelle?
14
                MS. SINNOTT: 7 minutes and 55 seconds
15
     through 8 minutes and 4 seconds.
16
                MS. MEYER: And the next clip (video
17
     plays). And that's that clip. Is that also Troy
18
     Metzler, Mr. Jacobson?
19
           Α.
                 Yes.
20
                 What's the time stamp for that one,
           0.
21
     Michelle?
22
                MS. SINNOTT: 12 minutes 25 seconds
```

Page 250

- through 12 minutes and 50 seconds.
- MS. MEYER: And we're ready for the
- next clip (video plays). This is it. Is that
- 4 Dave Whaley?
- 5 A. Yes.
- Q. And what's the time stamp for that
- <sup>7</sup> one?
- MS. SINNOTT: 18 minutes through 18
- 9 minutes and 23 seconds. I'm just going to play
- through to the next clip but this is not the next
- 11 clip.
- BY MS. MEYER:
- 13 Q. That's Dave Whaley with the broom?
- $^{14}$  A. Yes.
- MS. SINNOTT: This is the next clip
- (video plays).
- BY MS. MEYER:
- Q. And that was Dave Whaley with the
- broom who just hit the elephant; is that correct?
- A. Yes. He swung at her.
- MS. MEYER: What's the clip time stamp
- for that one, Michelle?

```
Page 251
 1
                MS. SINNOTT: 18 minutes and 44 seconds
 2
     through 19 minutes and 1 second.
 3
                MS. MEYER: Okay. And the next clip.
 4
                MS. SINNOTT: I'm playing through to
 5
     the next clip but this isn't it.
 6
                MS. MEYER: All right.
 7
                MS. SINNOTT: This begins the next clip
 8
     (video plays). That's the end of the clip.
 9
                BY MS. MEYER:
10
                 Is that Troy Metzler?
           Q.
11
           Α.
                 I believe so. Yes.
12
                MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for
13
     that clip, Michelle?
14
                MS. SINNOTT: 19 minutes and 20 seconds
15
     through 19 minutes and 48 seconds.
16
                BY MS. MEYER:
17
                 That's Troy Metzler in the sparklie
           Q.
18
     top and the yellow pants, right?
19
           Α.
                 Yes.
20
                MS. MEYER: Next clip.
21
                MS. SINNOTT: This begins the next clip
22
     (video plays). That's the end of the clip.
```

Page 252 1 MS. MEYER: Is that Dave Whaley? 2 Α. Yes. 3 MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for 4 that one, Michelle? 5 MS. SINNOTT: 21 minutes and 15 seconds 6 through 21 minutes and 41 seconds. 7 MS. MEYER: All right. Ready for the 8 next one. 9 MS. SINNOTT: This begins the next 10 clip. (Video plays). That's the end of the clip. 11 BY MS. MEYER: 12 Q. Is that Dave Whaley? 13 Α. Yes, it is. 14 MS. MEYER: 15 Q. And what's the stamp for that one? 16 MS. SINNOTT: 23 minutes and 24 seconds 17 through 23 minutes and 40 seconds. 18 MS. MEYER: Are we almost there? 19 MS. SINNOTT: Yes. This is not it. 20 This is the next clip (video plays). That's the 21 end of the clip. 22 MS. MEYER: Can you rewind that? Do

Page 253 1 you know who that is? 2 That's Suni. Α. 3 Oh, that's Suni Ridley. And what's Q. 4 the time stamp for that? 5 MS. SINNOTT: 1 hour, 10 minutes and 21 6 seconds through 1 hour, 10 minutes and 45 seconds. 7 MS. MEYER: All right. The next one ? 8 MS. SINNOTT: This begins the next clip 9 (video plays). That's the end of the clip. 10 BY MS. MEYER: 11 Q. Do you know who that woman and who 12 that man is? 13 Α. The guy is Brian Christiani French. 14 The girl, I couldn't see who it was. 15 MS. MEYER: Can we play that one again? 16 MS. SINNOTT: Yes. (Video replayed.) 17 Α. No. I don't know who she is. 18 BY MS. MEYER: 19 But that was Brian Christiani French? Q. 20 Α. Yes. 21 MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for 22 that clip?

```
Page 254
 1
                MS. SINNOTT: 1 hour, 11 minutes
 2
     through 1 hour 11 minutes and 25 seconds.
 3
                MS. MEYER:
                            All right. The next one.
 4
                               This is the beginning of
                MS. SINNOTT:
 5
     the clip (video plays). That's the end of that
 6
     clip.
 7
                BY MS. MEYER:
 8
                 Do you know who that individual was?
           Q.
 9
           Α.
                 Jeff Pettigrew.
10
                MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for
11
     that one, Michelle?
12
                MS. SINNOTT: 1 hour, 17 minutes and 34
13
     seconds through 1 hour, 17 minutes and 47 seconds.
14
     This is the beginning of the clip (video plays).
15
     That's the end of the clip.
16
                BY MS. MEYER:
17
                 Is that also Jeff Pettigrew?
           Q.
18
           Α.
                 Yes.
19
                MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for
20
     that one?
                MS. SINNOTT: 1 hour, 23 minutes and 29
21
22
     seconds through 1 hour, 23 minutes and 50 seconds.
```

```
Page 255
 1
                MS. MEYER: Next one.
 2
                MS. SINNOTT:
                               This is the beginning of
 3
     the clip (video plays). This is the end of the
     clip.
 5
                BY MS. MEYER:
 6
                  Is that Troy Metzler in the white
           Q.
 7
     shirt?
 8
                On the far side?
           Α.
 9
                 Yes.
           Q.
10
           Α.
                 Yes.
11
           Q.
                 Do you know who the person in the
12
     yellow shirt was?
13
           Α.
                  Some clown. I don't know what his
14
     name is.
15
                 But that's Metzler in the white shirt?
           Q.
16
           Α.
                  Yes, it is.
17
                MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp?
18
                MS. SINNOTT: 1 hour, 24 minutes and 26
19
     seconds through 1 hour, 24 minutes and 55 seconds.
20
     (Video plays.) That was the clip that we just saw.
21
                BY MS. MEYER:
22
           Q.
                  Do you know who that was?
```

Page 256 1 Looks like Mike, but I'm not sure. Α. 2 Q. Mike Hayward? 3 Α. Let's watch it again, Michelle. 4 MS. SINNOTT: Okay. Start of the clip 5 (video plays). 6 BY MS. MEYER: 7 Q. That was Mike Hayward? 8 Α. Yes. 9 MS. MEYER: And what's the stamp for 10 that one, Michelle? 11 MS. SINNOTT: 1 hour and 27 minutes and 12 2 seconds through 1 hour, 27 minutes and 25 13 seconds. 14 MS. MEYER: Next one. Is this the 15 clip? 16 MS. SINNOTT: No. This is the 17 beginning of the clip (video plays). That's the 18 end of the clip. 19 BY MS. MEYER: 20 Who is that? 0. 21 That's, I don't know his real name. Α. 22 That's Papa Louie, that's the red show.

Page 257 1 Oh, it is? That's Papa Louie? You're Q. 2 sure that's who it is? 3 Α. Yes. 4 MS. MEYER: Okay. Next clip. 5 MS. SINNOTT: This is the clip (video 6 That's the end of clip. plays). 7 BY MS. MEYER: 8 Do you know who that is in the white 0. 9 pants? 10 Α. No. I couldn't tell you. 11 MS. MEYER: Can you go back and see if 12 we can see that person's face a little bit? 13 Α. I can't tell you if that's red or 14 blue. 15 You don't recognize the other person Q. 16 either? 17 No. I can't even tell you what 18 elephants they are. Could be the red show. 19 MS. MEYER: Don't stop it right away, 20 Michelle. Let's see it and see if we see anything 21 else on that that would help identify the 22 individual.

```
Page 258
 1
                MS. SINNOTT: Okay. (Video plays.)
 2
                BY MS. MEYER:
 3
           Q.
                 Did you recognize that person what
 4
     walked by there. Oh, it's a young person. Do you
 5
     recognize that person?
 6
                 No, I don't.
           Α.
 7
                 Did you recognize that other person
           Q.
 8
     who walked by?
 9
           Α.
                 Nope.
10
                MS. MEYER: All right. I think this is
11
     the last one on this tape, right?
12
                MS. SINNOTT: Yes. This is the clip
13
     (video plays). That's the end of clip.
14
                BY MS. MEYER:
15
                 Was that Suni Ridley?
           Q.
16
           Α.
               Yes.
17
           Q.
                 Was that Karen?
18
           Α.
                  I couldn't tell.
19
                MS. MEYER: Can you play it again,
20
     Michelle?
21
                MS. SINNOTT: Yes. (Video replays).
22
           Α.
                  I can't tell.
```

Page 259 1 BY MS. MEYER: 2 Q. But that is Suni Ridley in that clip? 3 That's Suni. Α. 4 MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for 5 that one? 6 MS. SINNOTT: 4 hours, 27 minutes and 7 40 seconds through 4 hours, 28 minutes and 7 8 That's the end of this tape. seconds. 9 MS. MEYER: Why don't you give me that 10 one we'll have that marked Exhibit 18. 11 (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 18 was marked for 12 identification.) 13 MS. JOINER: This is 7074. 14 MS. MEYER: The one we just played? 15 Yes. PO7074. 16 MS. JOINER: Objection to that as to 17 foundation and incomplete document. 18 MS. SINNOTT: We're ready with the next 19 tape. 20 MS. MEYER: Do you have a copy of it? 21 MS. SINNOTT: No. I'll have to give it 22 to you when we're done watching it.

Page 260 1 MS. MEYER: So the next tape is PL 2 08980 and we're going to once we play it, we'll 3 have it marked as Exhibit 19. 4 MS. SINNOTT: This is the start of the 5 clip (video plays) that's the end of the clip. 6 BY MS. MEYER: 7 Do you know who that individual was? Q. 8 Α. I don't have a clue. 9 MS. SINNOTT: We can play it again. 10 Α. I still wouldn't know hough who it is. 11 BY MS. MEYER: 12 Q. Do you know who the one in the 13 foreground is? 14 Α. No, I do not. 15 So you don't know who the guy with the Q. 16 glasses and the curly hair is? 17 Α. No. 18 MS. MEYER: What's the clip number on 19 this one, Michelle? 20 MS. SINNOTT: It was 11 minutes and 15 21 seconds through 11 minutes and 20 seconds. 22 MS. MEYER: The next one.

```
Page 261
 1
                 MS. SINNOTT:
                                This is the beginning of
 2
     the clip (video plays). That's the end of the
 3
     clip.
 4
                 BY MS. MEYER:
 5
                  Do you know who that was in the yellow
           Q.
 6
     shirt on the right side of the screen?
 7
                  I could not tell.
           Α.
 8
                  Did you know and handler named Brian
           0.
 9
     Clark?
10
           Α.
                  Yes.
11
                  Did he work on the blue unit?
           Q.
12
           Α.
                  Yes.
13
           Q.
                  When did he work on the blue unit?
14
           Α.
                  Four or five years ago.
15
                  Do you know what he looks like?
           Q.
16
           Α.
                  He's about that tall (indicating).
17
                  He's short?
           Q.
18
                  Yes.
           Α.
19
                 MS. MEYER: Let's play that clip again?
20
                 MS. SINNOTT: Okay (video replays).
21
                 BY MS. MEYER:
22
                  You don't know who that individual is?
           Q.
```

```
Page 262
 1
           Α.
                 The one with the elephant.
 2
                MS. MEYER: All right.
 3
                MS. SINNOTT: That's the end of this
 4
     tape.
 5
                MS. MEYER: Okay. I just have three
 6
     more clips to go. PL 08980 will be Exhibit 19.
 7
       (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 19 was marked for
 8
                       identification.)
 9
                MS. JOINER: Same objections.
10
                MS. MEYER: This one should be marked
11
     Exhibit 20 and it's Bates labeled PL 08982.
12
       (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 20 was marked for
13
                       identification.)
14
                MS. SINNOTT: This is the beginning of
15
     the clip (video plays). That's the end of the
16
     clip.
17
                BY MS. MEYER:
18
                 Was that Troy Metzler.
           Q.
19
           Α.
                 Yes.
20
                MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for
21
     that one, Michelle?
22
                MS. SINNOTT: 16 minutes and 55 seconds
```

Page 263 1 through 17 minutes and 3 seconds. 2 MS. MEYER: All right. 3 MS. SINNOTT: This is the beginning of 4 the clip (video plays). That's the end. 5 BY MS. MEYER: 6 Was that Mr. Metzler? Q. 7 Α. I couldn't tell you. 8 MS. MEYER: Can we play it again? 9 MS. SINNOTT: Yes (video replays). 10 I still couldn't tell you. Α. 11 BY MS. MEYER: 12 Don't know that that's Mr. Metzler? Q. 13 Α. No. 14 MS. MEYER: Michelle, if we play more 15 of that tape, would we see more of him? 16 MS. SINNOTT: I believe not. No. 17 MS. MEYER: All right. 18 MS. JOINER: Same objections for 19 Exhibit 20 as 18 and 19. 20 MS. MEYER: This will be No. 21 and it 21 has a bates label of PLO 7069. 22

```
Page 264
 1
       (FEI Deposition Exhibit No. 21 was marked for
 2
                       identification.)
 3
                MS. SINNOTT: This is the beginning of
 4
     the clip (video plays). That's the end.
 5
                BY MS. MEYER:
 6
                  Do you recognize that individual?
           Q.
 7
                  Just that it's one of Axel's boys.
           Α.
 8
                 Do you know which one it is?
           0.
 9
           Α.
                 No.
10
                 When you say Axel's boys, you mean one
           Q.
11
     of the sons of Axel Gautier?
12
           Α.
                 Right.
13
           0.
                  So it would be either Michael Gautier
14
     or Kevin Gautier; is that correct?
15
           Α.
                 Correct.
16
                MS. MEYER: What's the time stamp for
17
     that one?
18
                MS. SINNOTT: 19 minutes and 31 seconds
19
     through 19 minutes and 51 seconds.
20
                MS. MEYER: That's it for the video
21
            I have no further questions.
     clips.
22
                MS. JOINER: Same objection for
```

	Page 265
1	Exhibit 21. I have no questions.
2	THE VIDEO OPERATOR: This concludes the
3	videotape deposition of Gary Jacobson representing
4	Feld Entertainment, Incorporated. This is tape 4
5	of 4. Going off the record. The time is
6	4:17 p.m.
7	
8	(Deposition concluded at 4:17 p.m.)
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	Signature Date
14	
15	SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN to before me
16	this, 200
17	
18	·
19	NOTARY PUBLIC
20	
21	My Commission Expires:
22	

	Page 266
1	CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER/NOTARY PUBLIC
2	DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA, to wit:
3	I, OKEEMAH S. HENDERSON, a notary Public for
4	the District of Columbia, do hereby certify that
5	the within-named witness personally appeared
6	before me at the time and place herein set out,
7	and after having been duly sworn by me, according
8	to law, was examined by counsel.
9	I further certify that the examination was
10	recorded stenographically by me and this
11	transcript is a true record of the proceedings.
12	I further certify that I am not of counsel
13	to any parties, nor in any way interested in the
14	outcome of this action.
15	As witness my hand and notarial seal this
16	day of, 2008.
17	
18	
19	Okeemah S. Henderson
20	Notary Public
21	My Commission Expires: February 28, 2010
22	