UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

Civ. No. 03-2006 (EGS) (D.D.C.)

vs.

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

CERTIFIED

Defendants.

VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF ROBERT RIDLEY

Friday, August 25, 2006

9:25 a.m.

CLARION HOTEL
1355 N. Fourth Street
San Jose, California 95112

Danielle Reading, CSR #10826

#06-350DR





Landi Court Reporters

1292 Líncoln Ave. • San Jose, CA 95125 Tel: 408.279.8590 • Fax: 408.279.0577 lourdes@landireporters.com • www.landireporters.com

1 APPEARANCES 2 3 For the Plaintiffs: MEYER, GLITZENSTEIN & CRYSTAL BY: KIMBERLY D. OCKENE, ESQ. 1601 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. 4 Suite 700 5 Washington, D.C. 20009 (202) 588-5206 б 7 For the Defendants: FULBRIGHT & JAWORSKI, L.L.P. BY: MICHELLE C. PARDO, ESQ. 8 LISA ZEILER JOINER, ESQ. 801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. 9 Washington, D.C. 20004 (202) 662-450110 11 LANDI COURT REPORTERS 12 Video Operator: BY: ILYSE ZIMMERMAN, CLVS 13 1292 Lincoln Avenue San Jose, CA 95125 14 (408) 279-859015 16 17 --000--18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25

1				
2		INDEX OF EXHIBITS		
3	Plaint	lffs':	<u>Page</u>	
4	1	Subpoena	6	
5	2	Affidavit	108	
6	3	E-mail from Dr. Ramiro Isaza, with two black & white photocopies of	131	
7		pictures		
8	4	Videotape	134	
9				
10				
L1		000		
L2				
L3				
L4				
L5				
L 6				
L7				
L 8				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				

the time? 1 2 I think there was 16. Do you recall whether they were all Asian 3 elephants? Yes, they were all Asian. 09:37:02 5 They were. 6 0 7 Are any of the elephants that were with Ringling Bros. then still there today? 8 Still. . . 9 09:37:1710 Still on the show today. Just one. 11 A Which one? 12 Q 13 Α Jewel. Okay. And so you were hired by Ringling Bros. 14 09:37:3615 in 1966, and you are still there today, correct?) 16 Yes. And at any time since 1966, have you left to be 17 employed by anyone other than Ringling Bros.? 18 19 Α No. So you've been there consistently since 1966? 09:37:4520 Yes. 21 Okay. And when you arrived and started working 22 as a barnman in 1966, were you provided with any 23 training concerning the handling or care of the 24 09:38:1025 elephants?

With the elephants or other animals. 1 0 I was just with the elephants. So you continued --3 4 Α Yes. -- to provide emergency care to the elephants? 10:44:42 5 A Yes. Yes. 6 And what type of emergency care did they need, 7 if you can give some examples? 8 Occasionally there would be a foot infection. 10:45:0410 would notify Debbie. Do you treat the infection? 11 Yes. Yes. 12 A How do you treat a foot infection? 13 With ointments or creams. 14 Ζ Do you treat any other injuries on elephants? 10:45:21 15 Occasionally a puncture wound. 16 And how do you treat a puncture wound on an 17 elephant? 18 With an antiseptic. 19 Do you ever use a product called Wonder Dust? 10:45:4820 Probably 12 or 15 years ago. There's much newer 21 medications on the market now. 22 So you never -- today you never use a product 23 referred to as Wonder Dust? 24 Not with the elephants, no. 10:46:1325 Α

With other animals? I don't know. So what product replaced Wonder Dust? 3 There was various creams that was used for the elephants. 10:46:34 5 So can you tell me the names of any of the 6 products you would use to treat a puncture wound on an 7 elephant today? No. Whatever the veterinary technician told me. Okay.) What would typically cause a puncture 10:46:5110 wound on an elephant? 11 12 The browse or what's commonly referred to as a bullhook. 13 As a bullhook? 14 Yes. I prefer a stick or a guide. 10:47:2215 Okay. But when you say -- when you use the term 16 "stick" or "guide," you are referring to what's also 17 known as a bullhook, correct? 18 19 Yes. Okay. How often do you see puncture wounds 10:47:3920 caused by bullhooks? 21 Probably three to four times a month. That's with the whole herd of elephants.) 23 And where do you typically see those puncture 24 wounds? 10:48:0625

```
Under the chin. Occasionally on the back of the
      1
          leq.
      2
                Anywhere else?
      3
          Α
                No.
               Behind the ear?
10:48:24 5
                No.
      6
          A
                You never see a puncture wound behind the ear
      7
          caused by a bullhook? Is that your testimony?
      8
                In years past I have.
10:48:4310
                But in recent years --
               No.
     11
          A
                -- the answer is "no"?
     12
     13
          Α
                No.
                Okay. So just so I understand your testimony:
     14
          You said you would typically see the puncture wounds
10:48:5515
          under the chin or on the back of the leg.
     16
     17
          A
                Yes.
                Anywhere else on the elephant's body?
     18
     19
          A
                No.
               On the head at all?
10:49:0620
               No.
     21
          Α
                       So since 2001, I guess, when
                Okay.
     22
          Ms. Fahrenbruck came, you said your duties with regard
     2.3
          to veterinary care reduced somewhat?
     24
10:49:2925
          Α
                Yes.
```

```
And did you pick up any additional duties at
       1
       2
          that time?
                No.
       3
          A
                So you continued presenting?
                I presented until -- well, yes. Until today.
10:49:49 5
                Has there ever been a time since -- I can't
       6
          remember -- you started presenting, I think, in 1969,
      7
          correct?
      8
               '68.
                '68. Has there ever been a time that you
10:50:1110
          haven't been a presenter other than the time -- the
     11
          two years you said you were in winter quarters?
     12
          Α
               No.
     13
                Have your duties changed at all with respect to
     14
10:50:3415
          training the elephants?
               I'm not a trainer.
     16
          А
          Q You are not a trainer. Have you ever trained
     17
          any elephants?
     18
     19
                No.
                All right. Who are the elephants currently
10:50:4320
          traveling on the blue unit?
     21
                Minyak, Jewel, Nicole, Karen, Juliet, Bonnie,
     22
          KellyAnn and Sara.
     23
                Okay. Is that in order of age? Do you know?
          Or, no?
10:51:3225
```

```
Α
                No.
       1
                Okay. Who is the oldest?
       2
                Jewel.
       3
                Oh, Jewel. Right. You said she was there when
          you first started?)
10:51:42 5
                Yes. Yes.
       6
                And has she been on the blue unit the entire
       7
          time you've been on the blue unit?
                She was at the conservation center for -- []
          believe it was a year, year and a half.
10:51:5510
                When you say "the conservation center," are you
      11
          referring to the Center for Elephant Conservation?
     12
                Yes. Yes.
      13
                Do you know when she was there?
      14
                I believe it was last year she was there.
10:52:05 15
                Do you know why she was sent to the Center for
      16
          Elephant Conservation?
      17
                Just rest, I guess.
                Who made the decision to take her off the blue
      19
          unit and send her to the -- I'll call it the CEC. Is
10:52:3020
     21
          that okay?
               CEC.
     22
          A
     23
               The Center for Elephant Conservation.
              CEC.
     24
          Α
               Who made the decision to send her to the CEC?
10:52:3725
                                                                  58
```

```
Do you know?
       1
                Troy Metzner.
       2
                Can you spell Troy's last name? Is it Metzler?
       3
                Maybe it is Metzler.
       4
          Α
                I think it's M-e-t-z-l-e-r. Does that sound
10:52:49 5
          correct?
      7
                Yes.
          Α
               Okay.
          Q
      8
               And Dr. Lindsay.
                And do you know why it was determined that she
10:52:5710
          needed rest?
     11
                She was old -- well, and she needed -- she had a
      12
          stiff lea.
      13
                Do you know what caused her stiff leg?
      14
                There was another elephant that knocked her
10:53:2215
     16
          down.
                Do you know which elephant?
     17
                Zina.
     18
                This was last year, you said, or about a year
     19
          and a half ago?
10:53:3420
                     No. This was probably five or six years
      21
          ago.
     22
                Oh, when Zina knocked her down?
     23
                      Yes.
     24
                Yes.
                  see. So she's had a stiff leg since then?
10:53:4325
```

```
Yes.
      1
               But just so I understand what you are saying:
      2
          She was (--) she remained on the blue unit until last)
      3
          year?
               Yes.
10:53:52 5
               At which point, Mr. Metzler and Mr. Lindsay
      6
          decided to send her --
               It was Dr. Lindsay.
          A
      8
               Dr. Lindsay decided to send her to the CEC?
10:54:0510
               Yes.
               And how long did she stay at the CEC? Do you
     11
     12
          know?
          A
               It was about a year, year and a half -- well,
     13
          she came back on the road the beginning of this year.
               And does she still have a stiff leg?
10:54:1715
               Yes.
     16
          A
          Q Are you aware why the decision was made to
     1.7
         return her to the blue unit if she still has a stiff
          leg?
     19
         A
               No.
10:54:3820
          Q Do you know whether any effort was made to breed
     21
          her at the CEC?
     22
     23
          A No.
                    THE WITNESS: Could I take a break?
     24
                    MS. OCKENE: Yes.
10:54:5725
```

```
I believe she's with the gold unit.
           А
       1
                The gold unit is the third --
       2
           0
                A third unit.
       3
           Α
                -- unit?
                     How many elephants do they have?
11:01:59 5
                Two.
       6
          Α
                Angelica, and who is the other?
       7
          Д
                Mysore.
       8
                Okay. Was an elephant named Shirley ever on the
11:02:2110
          blue unit?
      11
          A
                Yes.
                Do you know when that was?
      12
                I think it was 1996 and part of 1997.
      13
          Α
                Was she there longer than that? Do you know?
                I don't think so. I don't remember.
11:02:5515
                Do you know why she left the blue unit?
      16
      17
          Д
                No.
                So were you consulted at all regarding Shirley's
      18
          departure from the blue unit?
      19
11:03:1920
          Ά
              No.
                Do you know where she is now?
      21
                I believe she's at the CEC.
      22
      23
                Okay.) Now, Nicole, you said, is currently with
          the blue unit, right?)
      24
11:03:3725
                Yes.
```

```
Was she at one point -- has she been with the
       1
          blue unit -- let me ask it this way.
       2
                     How long has she been with the blue unit?
       3
                I think 1980.
       4
                And has she been there the entire time, or do
11:03:59 5
          you know whether at any point Nicole was taken off and
      6
          later returned to the blue unit?)
      7
                She was taken off and then returned.
          A
      8
                Do you know when she was taken off?
                I think it was 1994, the end of 1994.
11:04:1610
                Would it sound accurate to you if I said she was
     11
     12
          taken off the blue unit in 1999?
               She's been taken off twice, then.
          A
     13
     14
               Oh, okay.
          A
               Twice.
11:04:5115
     16
               So 1994 first?
               First.
          A
     17
               And then later?
     18
     19
          A
               Later.
               1999. Does that sound right?
11:04:5620
          Q
         A
               Somewhere around there, yes.
     21
               Okay.) Can you tell me why she left in 1994?
          0
     22
               She became just very stiff-legged.
     23
          A
               Do you know what caused her stiffness?
     24
          Q 
          A
               No.
11:05:1825
```

At the time, you were the veterinary -- the 1 acting veterinary technician, correct? Yes Yes А 3 So what, if anything, were you doing to treat her stiff legs? 11:05:32 5 When it happened, she was sent back to the -- to 7 the CEC because the legs were swollen. It was difficult for her to walk. 8 Was that something that happened all of a sudden 11:06:0010 or was it something that happened gradually? It was probably within three or four days. 11 And again, do you have any recollection what 12 13 caused the swelling in her legs? No. 14 Okay. And where was she sent when she was taken 11:06:1915 off of the blue unit in 1994?) At that time, she would have been sent to the 17 retirement farm in Williston, Florida. 18 19 Okay. And when was she returned to the blue unit after she left in 1994? 11:06:5620 I think it was 1996. 21 Okay. And was her -- were her legs healed when 22 she returned? 23 They were back to normal. 24 11:07:2625 And then you said she left again in -- you think

```
around 1999?
       1
               Yes. The same problem.
       2
               Same problem?
      3
              Yes.
          Α
               Swollen legs?
11:07:46 5
          0
               Swollen legs.
      6
          A
            And at that time you were also still the
      7
          acting --
      8
          Α
            Yes.
               -- veterinary technician?
11:07:5910
               Yes. Yes. Yes.
     11
          А
     12
            And did you do anything to treat her legs at
          that time?
     13
               The veterinarian said that it would be best just
     14
         to give her rest at that time.
11:08:14 15
            And who was the veterinarian at that time, 1999?
     16
               '99? It was either Dr. West or Dr. Isaza. I'm
     17
     18
         not sure.
     19
               Isaza?
11:08:3720
          Α
               Isaza.
               And who -- just to back up, who was the
     21
          veterinarian in 1994? Do you recall?
     22
            Dr. Houck.
     23
              Houck. When did Dr. Lindsay come on board?
     2.4
            I think 2000. Either 1999 or 2000.
11:08:5825
         Α
```

Q Okay. So in -- somewhere around 1999, you say 1 Nicole had the same problem with swollen legs --Yes A 3 -- that led to her being taken off the show 11:09:26 5 again. Do you know, at that time, was it a sudden 6 onset condition or was it a gradual -- gradually onset condition? 8 It was a gradual at that time. 9 11:09:4010 Were you the first person to notice it? Yes. 11 A Q Okay. And do you know what caused it at that 12 time? 13 No. 14 Α Q And how long did she -- first of all -- I'm 11:09:5215 sorry. When she was taken off the second time, where 16 did she go? Do you know? 17 To the CEC. 18 19 Went to the CEC. 11:10:2820 Do you know whether there was any effort to breed her at the CEC? 21 22 I don't know. 23 And how long did she stay at the CEC for? She came back -- I believe it was 2001. 24 11:10:5325 Q And were her legs healed when she returned to

the blue unit? 1 They were back to normal. And has she been on the blue unit since 2001? 3 Yes. Α And has there been any recurrence of her 11:11:12 5 leg-swelling condition since 2001? 6 No. 7 Д Do you have a relationship with any elephant or 8 elephants in particular? 9 Karen. 11:11:3810 Can you tell me about Karen. For example, her 11 history, to the extent you know it, when she came to 12 the blue unit, where she came from. 13 She came through an animal dealer in 1969, 14 December. She was between four and six months old. 11:12:0115 She was wild-caught? Do you know? Taken from 16 the wild? 1.7 The understanding I had -- or the information I 18 19 could get, she was -- she came from a zoo in Bangkok. I don't know if she was wild-caught or captive-bred. 11:12:2820 Okay. So you've known her basically her whole 21 life? 22 23 Yes. And who trained Karen to perform tricks? 24 Hugo Schmitt started. And he retired and Axel 11:12:4025 Д

```
Are there places on the elephant that you would
       1
          never place the hooked end of the bullhook?
       2
                In the eyes, in the mouth, the backside.
       3
                So you've never used the hooked end of a
       4
11:55:24 5
          bullhook in an elephant's mouth?
                No.
       6
       7
                Have you ever seen anyone use the hook in an
          elephant's mouth?
       8
                No.
       9
                Would it ever be appropriate to use the hook) --
11:55:3110
                No. Absolutely not.
      11
                (--) (in an elephant's mouth?)
      12
                    No, it would not be?
      13
          A
                No.
      14
                Are elephants very sensitive with their mouths?
11:55:4215
          Q
                Same as a person would be.
      16
                Are the elephants cued with the bullhook to
      17
          perform their tricks during the performance?
      18
      19
          A
                Yes.
11:56:0220
                In what way?
                It's like the hook can be two and three feet
      21
          from the elephant, and it would be "Come here," you
      22
          know, "tub." Or move them around the tub; it would be
      23
          "Come here" (indicating).
      24
                Okay. So do you typically use the bullhook to
11:56:2525
          0
```

```
cue an elephant to perform a trick as opposed to a
       1
          voice command?
       2
               Not always, no.
       3
               Under what circumstances would you --
               It's sort of a 50-50.
11:56:41 5
                So 50 percent of the time you would use a voice
       6
          command and --
       7
          A
               Yes.
       8
               -- and 50 percent of the time you would use the
          hook?
11:56:53 10
      11
          A Well, the hook would be away from the elephant,
          but -- the elephant would see the handler and the hook
      12
          and follow.
      13
      14
                So you are saying -- just to be clear, you are
          saying that you wouldn't necessarily apply the hook to
11:57:1015
          the elephant?
      16
            No. No.
     17
          А
               Under what circumstances would you actually hit
     18
          or apply the hook to the elephant?
     19
11:57:2520
               Just pressure, to get it moving.
          Α
                So if they weren't responding?
     21
     2.2
          Α
               Yes.
                       (How many -- do you own your own)
     23
                Okay.
          bullhooks?
     24
                They are bought by Feld Entertainment from a
11:57:4225
```

Charlie Gray in Canada. So the ones that you use are not your personal possessions? A Well, they are Feld equipment. But when they are presented to us, they say, Okay. Here is your bullhook. Okay. How many do you have in your possession? I have three right now, from Charlie Gray. And do you use all of those equally? No. I have a small one that I use in the show and a larger one I use for the animal walks. Why would you use a larger one for the animal walks? Just as a safety precaution. What do you mean when you say "a safety precaution"? A Because there's always that chance that the public might get a little too close to the animal. And you have a little more handling power, you might say. Or a dog might run under them or something of that sort and startle them. So are you saying that the larger bullhooks are

more useful in controlling an elephant?

No. It's just more -- to me, it's just more of

1

3

7

8

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

a safety.

11:58:10 5

11:58:3110

11:58:4715

11:59:0920

11:59:3225

Are you worried that an elephant is going to become dangerous? No. They can be startled by occasional small children or dogs. And what would you do with the bullhook if an elephant became startled? I would hold it under the chin, and say, "Steady." And try to calm them. Have you ever seen anyone at Ringling Bros. strike an elephant with force with a bullhook? What do you mean by "force"? Force is something A like -- like using a baseball bat. Or just applying weight or force while using the hooked end of the bullhook. In other words, not just touching. A Nothing intentional, no. Does that mean you have seen it? I've seen, you know, tapping (indicating). Tapping on the legs, the trunk. Have you ever seen anyone yank an elephant with the hooked end of a bullhook, like apply the hook to the skin and then pull with some force? I'm thinking. Yes. Under what circumstances? (And can you tell me) who you saw do that?)

1

2

3

4

6

7

8

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

11:59:50 5

12:00:2910

12:00:5115

12:01:0920

12:01:5025

```
The elephants were starting to, like, move out
       1
          of line.) And just going in and)(indicating) pulling)
       2
          them back in line.
       3
                Is it something that you have done?
       4
                Yes, I have done.
12:02:07 5
                And who else have you seen --
       6
                Troy Metzler.
          A
                -- do that?
      8
                Mike Haywood, Hisham.
                So would you say that it is a common occurrence
12:02:1810
          to apply the hooked end to an elephant and pull or
     11
          yank with some force to get the elephant to do what
     12
          you want the elephant to do?
     13
               Each person has their own technique of pulling
     14
          or quiding an elephant.)
12:02:4815
               Would you say that it's common for the handlers
     16
          on the blue show, including yourself, to apply
     17
     18
          pressure or some force when using the hooked end of
          the bullhook in the elephants?
     19
          A
               Yes.
12:03:0720
               Have you ever seen anyone, including yourself,
     21
          draw blood through use of a bullhook on an elephant?
     22
               Accidentally, yes.
     23
               How often would you say the hook -- the use of a
     24
          bullhook draws blood on an elephant?
12:03:3725
```

1	A) I would say, within the whole herd, probably	
2	three to four times a month.	
3	Q And you say "accidentally." How does it happen	
4	accidentally?	
12:03:56 5	A Sometimes, when we're maneuvering them in the	
6	show, it will just accidentally, a quick movement.	
7	Q Have you ever been asked to treat these the	
8	bleeding that is caused by the bullhooks?	
9	A Yes.	
12:04:2510	Q How often do you treat these I guess would	
11	you call them injuries or wounds?	
12	MS. PARDO: Objection.	
13	Q BY MS. OCKENE: Would you say that they are	
14	injuries?	
12:04:3915	A No. No.	
16	Q What would you just so we have a term for it,	
17	what would you call it when there's blood drawn from	
18	the use of a bullhook?	
19	A It's very slight. It's like pricking your	
12:04:5620	finger with a needle or a paper cut.	
21	Q Is it the same thing you said earlier you see	
22	puncture wounds, on average, three to four times a	
23	month from the use of a bullhook. Is that the same,	
24	or would you equate the puncture wounds to the	
12:05:1225	bleeding that you are describing now?	
1		

- A Yes. Yes. Yes.
- Q Have you ever been asked to treat the puncture wounds that are caused by the bullhooks?
 - A In years past I have.
- 12:05:20 5 Q And today you no longer are?
 - 6 A No.

12:05:2910

12:05:5515

12:06:1420

12:06:3025

1.1

12

13

14

16

17

19

21

23

- 7 Q Who treats those wounds -- those puncture wounds today?
 - A Normally, Mike Haywood.
 - O And what does he treat them with?
 - A An antiseptic, ointment.
 - Q Okay. But these instances in which you say somebody would accidentally cause a puncture wound from a bullhook, are these instances in which someone would be reprimanded for improper use of a bullhook?
 - MS. PARDO: Objection. Speculation.
 - MS. OCKENE: You can answer.
- 18 THE WITNESS: Yes.
 - Q BY MS. OCKENE: And have you ever seen anyone be reprimanded for causing these -- what you've referred to as puncture wounds from a bullhook?
- 22 A Yes.
 - Q And are these different from the instances you were describing earlier? When we were talking about several years ago, you recalled someone or several

```
which you are aware that someone has been disciplined
       1
          or reprimanded for use of the bullhook?
       2
          Α
                No.
       3
               Okay.
       4
               Not in recent times.
12:10:58 5
               Okay. Has Troy ever been reprimanded, to your
       6
          knowledge, by anyone superior to him for use of the
       7
          bullhook?
       8
                No.
               No, you don't know?
12:11:0810
               No, I don't know.
      11
               Okay.
      12
                     THE WITNESS: Can I take a break?
      13
                     MS. OCKENE: Yes.
      14
                     VIDEO OPERATOR: Going off the record.
12:11:20 15
          time is 12:11.
      16
      17
                     (Recess taken.)
                     VIDEO OPERATOR: Back on the record.
      18
          time is 12:15.
      19
12:15:3020
                BY MS. OCKENE: Okay. Mr. Ridley, are you
          familiar with the term "hook boil"?)
      21
                That's an old circus term.
                What does it mean to you?
      23
                It's a puncture to the skin that becomes
      24
12:15:4925
          infected.
```

```
And is it called a hook boil because it's caused
      1
          by a bullhook?
               It was back then.
      3
                Could it be caused by anything else?
               Possibly the hook, the browse the elephants eat.
12:16:15 5
                So it's -- just to make sure I understand what
      6
          you are saying, it's a puncture -- like a puncture
      7
          wound to the skin that then becomes infected?
                Yes, if it's not treated.
                Okay. You say that term is no longer used
12:16:40 10
     11
          today?
                I prefer a puncture.
     12
                Just puncture or puncture wound?
     13
                Yes. Yes. Puncture or puncture wound.
     14
               Okay. So you would use those terms
12:16:5715
          interchangeably, "hook boil" and "puncture wound"?
     16
               Hook boil, like I said, was an older circus
     17
          terminology for puncture.
               And do you observe -- ever observe hook boils on
     19
          the blue unit elephants?
12:17:2520
               Maybe three to four times a month, the
     21
          punctures.
     2.2
               So this is, again, the same that we were
     23
          speaking about earlier --
12:17:3825
                Yes.
```

-- the puncture wounds? Okay. 1 So I'm talking here just about hook boils or 2 puncture wounds that would be caused by a bullhook (as) 3 opposed to something else, and you said you would see that about three to four times a month? 12:17:53 5 Yes, with the whole herd. б Okay. And again, I guess this would be the same as what you were saying about the puncture wounds, but is there some way in which you would treat a hook boil different from how you would treat a puncture wound? 12:18:0910 No. 11 A So you would use, you were saying, antiseptic? 12 Antiseptic, antibacterial ointment. 13 Α Okay. And again, you say you no longer use a 14 product called Wonder Dust. 12:18:24 15 No, not with the elephants. 16 And when was the last time you would say you 17 used a product called Wonder Dust? 18 Probably 1997, '98. There's a lot newer 19 medications now. 12:18:4420 21 Okay. And I think you said you no longer treat the hook boils -- also what you would call puncture 22

Q And you said also Mike Hayward treats --

If I see one, I will treat it.

wounds -- on elephants?

23

24

12:18:5925

```
Yes, Mike. Mike does.
       1
               Anyone else?
               No. Mainly Mike and myself.
       3
                Do you see puncture wounds or hook boils more
          frequently on certain elephants?)
12:19:20 5
                No.
       6
                So you see them with equal frequency on all of
      7
          the elephants?
                On all of the elephants.
                And you may have already answered this. I
12:19:3110
          apologize. But you say a hook boil or a puncture
     11
          wound does not get recorded anywhere in writing?)
     12
          Would you record it anywhere in writing if you saw a
     13
          puncture wound on an elephant?
     14
               No, not now.
12:19:54 15
     16
            And you would not --
              No.
     17
          A
               You would not be likely to call a veterinarian?
     18
          Is that what you said?
     19
12:20:0720
          A
               No. No. Like I said, it was like a paper cut
          or something of that sort.
                    MS. OCKENE: Okay. I just want to have this
     22
          document marked as Exhibit 2.
     23
                    (Whereupon, Plaintiffs' Exhibit 2 was marked
     24
12:20:2125
         for identification.)
```

```
that ever asked you, in connection with this lawsuit,
to search for or turn over records?
A
     No.
     Okay. How often are the elephants provided with
water while they are on the road?
     At least twice a day. Sometimes three and four
times a day. It depends on the weather conditions.
     Do they have continual access to water?
Α
     No.
     Are the elephants on the blue unit chained
throughout the night?
     Yes. It's mainly a safety measure. Because if
the wrong elephants get together, they'll start
fighting.
Q
     And are they chained by a front leg and a back
leq?
A
     Yes.
     Okay. And are the elephants chained whenever
they are on the train?
     Yes. As a safety measure, again. Because of
the movement of the train.
     So at any point when they are on the train, the
elephants are chained?
A
     Yes. Yes.
  Yes. Okay. And is water continuously available
```

2

8

11

1.2

13

14

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

13:34:10 5

13:34:3510

13:35:04 15

13:35:1920

13:35:3125

```
in sort of a veterinary technician --
       1
                Oh, after she arrived?
                Yes.
       3
          0
          А
               Yes
13:42:52 5
                Okay. Who is John Griggs?
                He's -- he was the operations manager with the
          blue unit. He's with the gold unit now as, I think,
       7
          manager.
       8
                Okay. How long was he with the blue unit?
       9
13:43:24 10
          you know?
      11
                Probably two or three years.
              And when did he leave?
      12
                I think the end of last year, he left.
      13
          A
      14
                    MS. OCKENE: Okay. I want to have a
          videotape marked as an exhibit now. So this is a
13:43:43 15
          video that Plaintiffs produced to Defendants in
      16
      17
          discovery, with Bates Number PL 8980. I quess it will
      18
          be marked Exhibit 4.
                    MS. PARDO: Does that video have a title?
     19
                    MS. OCKENE: It's "Ringling -- Angelica and
13:44:1220
          Sara Chained and Swaying, Oakland."
     21
     22
                     (Whereupon, Plaintiffs' Exhibit 4 was marked
          for identification.)
     23
                    MS. OCKENE: I can't really wear this down
     24
          there. Are you going to be able to see from there?
13:45:5925
```

```
asked him any questions about where this came from,
       1
           who, what, where. If we've seen it before.
       2
                    MS. OCKENE: Oh, we produced it to you in
       3
          discovery. I read the Bates number, so you have it.
       4
                     MS. PARDO: Okay. My objection is on the
13:52:16 5
           record.
       6
                    MS. OCKENE: Okay.
       7
                     (Whereupon, video was played.)
       8
                    MS. OCKENE: I'm just going to stop it and
       9
          say that I started it at a point on the video where,
13:52:3210
          in the lower right-hand corner, it's labeled
      11
          "August 18th, 2004," and 9:30:, approximately
      12
      13
          10 seconds.
                     (Whereupon, video was played.)
      14
                    MS. OCKENE: Okay. I'm just going to pause
13:53:1015
      16
          it and ask a few questions now.
      17
                BY MS. OCKENE: Does this look like a Ringling
          Bros. setup? Is this a Ringling Bros. elephant?
     18
     19
               Yes.
                    MS. PARDO: Objection to the form.
13:53:2120
                BY MS. OCKENE: Is this is a Ringling Bros.
     21
          elephant that you are watching on the video?
     22
               Yes.
     23
               And is that elephant named Sara?
     24
               The video is too fuzzy to.
13:53:3125
          A
```

```
Okay. I'll play it for a little while longer.
       1
          And see if you -- because earlier you testified you)
       2
          would recognize them by sight.
       3
                Yes.
       4
                    MS. OCKENE:) [I'll play] it a little more.
13:53:43 5
                     (Whereupon, video was played.)
       6
                BY MS. OCKENE: Can you now tell whether that is
       7
          an elephant named Sara?
       8
                Yes, that's Sara.
          A
                That's Sara. Okay. Let me forward a little bit
13:54:3510
          more. There's another elephant that comes into the
      11
     12
          picture.
                     (Whereupon, video was fast-forwarded.)
     13
                    MS. OCKENE: Sorry. I just wanted to state
     14
          for the record that (I) restarted it again at a point on)
13:55:2715
          the video -- in the lower right-hand corner it says
     16
          9:35, I think it was, and 15 seconds.
     17
     18
                    (Whereupon, video was played.)
                    MS. OCKENE: I'll stop it.
     19
               BY MS. OCKENE: The other elephant that was in
13:56:1020
          the picture, across from Sara, did you recognize that
     21
          elephant?
     22
          A
               It looks like either Juliet or Angelica.
     23
     24
               Okay.
               I don't know. I can't get the size.
          A
13:56:2225
```

```
Let me forward it a little bit more and see if
       1
          she comes into the picture again.
       2
                Okay. Okay.
       3
                     (Whereupon, video was fast-forwarded.)
       4
                    MS. OCKENE: Okay. We're at 9:37:35 on the
13:57:01 5
          monitor.
       6
                BY MS. OCKENE: Can you tell which elephant that
          0
       7
          is?
                That's Angelica.
               Angelica.
13:57:3310
                    MS. OCKENE: Okay. I'm going to forward a
     11
     12
          significant amount more. Okay.)
                    (Whereupon, video was fast-forwarded.)
     13
     14
                    MS. OCKENE: There's a point I'm trying to
13:59:4815
          get to.
                    (Whereupon, video was fast-forwarded.)
     16
     17
                    MS. OCKENE: Actually, I'm now at a point on
     18
          the video -- it's in the lower right-hand corner. It
          says "8:33:28."
     19
          Q BY MS. OCKENE: Can you identify the gentleman
14:00:3720
     21
          pictured in the image?
               That's David Whaland.
     22
     23
              Dave Whaland or Whaley? Is that the same one
     24
          you thought maybe was Whaley?
14:00:5025
         A Whaley,
```

```
Q
               Okay.
      1
                     (Whereupon, video was fast-forwarded.)
      2
                    MS. OCKENE: Okay. I stopped it at a point
      3
          on the videotape. In the lower right-hand corner, it
      4
          says "9:28:57."
14:02:42 5
              BY MS. OCKENE: Do you know whether this man in
          the image now, whether his name is Brian Clark?
      7
          Α
                Yes.
      8
               That's Brian Clark?
14:02:5310
          Α
               Yes.
                    (Whereupon, video was played.)
     11
     12
                    MS. OCKENE: We need to change the tape.
                    VIDEO OPERATOR: Here ends Videotape
     13
          Number 2 in the deposition of Robert Ridley. We're
     14
          going off the record. The time is 2:03.
14:03:1915
                    (Recess taken.)
     16
                    VIDEO OPERATOR: Here begins Videotape
     17
          Number 3. We're back on the record. The time is
     18
     19
          2:07.
               BY MS. OCKENE: Okay. While we were watching
14:07:1320
          the video, I asked you to identify two elephants. You
     21
          identified one as Sara.)
     22
     23
          A
               Yes.
               (And the other as Angelica?)
     24
               Yes.
14:07:2425
```

```
Do you know whether Ringling Bros. has more than
       1
          one elephant named Sara?
       2
                No.
       3
                Just one?
       4
                Just one.
14:07:31 5
                And was she born at the CEC?
       6
                Yes.
       7
                And do you know if (Ringling (Bros.) owns (more than
       8
          one elephant named Angelica?
14:07:4010
                Only one.
                Only one. (And was she born at the CEC?)
                Yes.
          A
      12
      13
               Have you been asked to testify at trial -- at a
          trial in this lawsuit by your employer?
                To testify? No.
14:07:5115
          A
                Would you do so if your employer asked you to?
      16
               Yes.
     17
          A
                     MS. OCKENE: Okay. I think I'm just about
      18
          done, but I'd like a few minutes just to look over my
      19
          notes. Talk a little break.
14:08:1120
                    MS. JOINER: Do you need a break?
      21
                    MS. OCKENE: Yes.
     22
                    THE WITNESS: Good. Good.
     23
                    VIDEO OPERATOR: Going off the record. The
     24
          time is 2:08.
14:08:1525
```