## DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE

WASHINGTON



I, Thomas J. Vilsack, Secretary of the United States Department of Agriculture, do hereby certify that the annexed copy, or each of the specified number of annexed copies, is a true, correct and compared copy of a document in my official custody as hereinafter described:

The attached documents 1 through 51, as listed in the table immediately following, were created or obtained, and have been or were maintained, in the regularly conducted business activities of the Investigative Enforcement Service or Animal Care of the U.S. Department of Agriculture Animal and Plant Health Inspection Services; further, those documents created by USDA personnel were created at or near the time of the occurrence of the matters discussed therein by a person with knowledge of those matters or based upon information transmitted by a person having knowledge of those matters.

Doc	Document	Certified Bates Label	PDF File
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 7 8 8	10/12/01 Red Unit Inspection Report (PL 02146), as redacted 7/23/01 Memo from Diane Ward to Alan Christian re: CA00136-AC 1/26/05 Report of Investigation on FL4287, Riccardo  8/11/04 Letter from Kay Corker to John Kinsella re: a request for an investigation into the Riccardo death 1/16/99 Narrative written by Kristina Cox Documenting the 1/7/99 and 1/8/99 Inspection of Ringling Brothers Blue Unit 9/2/05 Report of Investigation for Case # VA05008-AC 9/1/99 Report of Investigation for Case # TX99237-AC (PL 3141-3150)	PL 012093  PL 012562  PL 11562-11567  PL 11568  PL 14244-14245  PL 12697-12702  PL 12733-12735	ASPCA136-1-04-702 (pg. 133) ASPCA203-1-04-702 (pg. 150) ASPCA FL04287 154 pages (pg. 1-6) ASPCA FL04287 154 pages (pg. 7) FL 99- 028_AW_Scan_072007 (pg. 150-151) ASPCA VA05008 36 pages (pg. 1-9) ASPCA216-01-02-569 (pg. 82-87)  ASPCA216-01-02-569
8	9/1/99 Report of investigation for Case 27 AC (PL 3141-3150)  7/16/99 Memo from Charles Currer to Dr. Robert Williams documenting a 7/15/99 inspection (PL 2081-2083), as redacted		

Doc No	Document	Certified Bates Label	PDF File
9	5/10/00 Email from Betty Goldentyer to Barbara	PL 11874	AGDGA105
	Kohn regarding Research Proposal	PL 118/4	ASPCA105p marked 04-
	romi regurding research rroposar		272
10	7/21/00 Memo from Diane Ward to Robert Gibbens,	PL 12609-12611	(pg. 19) ASPCA203-1-04-702
	as redacted	11.007-12011	(pg. 197-199)
	/.		(pg. 197-199)
11	10/29/01 Letter from Chester Gipson to Jeannie	PL 11982-11983	ASPCA136-1-04-702
	Perron and Julie Strauss (FELD 39517-39518)		(pg. 22-23)
12	4/13/00 Letter from Ted Friend to Ron DeHaven re:	PL 12135-12139	ASPCA145-1-04-727
	the proposal for his study		(pg. 39-43)
13	4/10/01 Prior agreement with USDA for study	PL 12144-12149	ASPCA145-1-04-727
			(pg. 48-53)
14	Proposal for USDA study	PL 12168-12174	ASPCA145-1-04-727
	:		(pg. 72-77)
15	2/18/00 Letter from Ted Friend to Dr. Tim Cordes	PL 12178	ASPCA145-1-04-727
			(pg. 82)
16	6/23/00 Letter & Grant Award from Frankie Comfort	PL 12150-12167	ASPCA145-1-04-727
1.77	to Diane Gilliland		(pg. 54-71)
17	9/1/99 Memo from David Green to Walter	PL 12864	ASPCA381-1-04-702
	Christensen forwarding the report received from		(pg. 33)
18	FELD after the Benjamin investigation was completed	DY 1000	
10	8/24/06 Letter from Dale Boyles to Julie Strauss re:	PL 13882	FL06932_AC_061907_SC
	Rudy and Angelica (FEI 49364)		AN(pg. 16-17)
19	3/10/06 Memo from Robert Brandes to G. Gaj	PL 13827-13828	07-487 Master AC
	regarding response to Feld's 3/7/06 appeal letter		(pg. 281-282)
	concerning Rudy & Angelica)		(FB: -01 -0 <b>-</b> )
20	3/13/06 Letter from Gaj to Albert regarding Feld's	PL 13799-13800	07-487 Master AC
	request for an appeal on the Rudy & Angelica incident		(pg. 253-254)
21	6/1/06 Asian Elephant Skin Evaluation on Angelica	PL 13710-13712	07-487 Master AC
22	(PL 11414-11416)		(pg. 164-166)
22	1/11/07 Letter from Cassie Armiger to Kenneth Vail	PL 13861-13863	FL06932_AC_061907_SC
			AN
23	1/18/06 Mama from Dohart Brandon to C. C.	DI 12070 12001	(pg. 1-3)
43	1/18/06 Memo from Robert Brandes to G. Gaj re: 1/6/06 inspection of Rudy & Angelica	PL 13879-13881	FL06932_AC_061907_SC
	170/00 hispection of Kudy & Angelica		AN
24	7/12/06 Email from Charles Currer to Robert Gibens	DI 12605	(pg. 19-21)
<b>∠</b> -T	re; inspection of the Red Unit	PL 13685	07-487 Master AC
	10, mapoonon of the Red Offit		(pg. 139)

26	regarding a 5/3/06 inspection of the CEC 5/24/06 Inspection Report from the Blue Unit (FEI 39550)	PL 13618-13619 PL 13603	07-487 Master AC (pg. 72-73) 07-487 Master AC (pg. 57)
26	regarding a 5/3/06 inspection of the CEC 5/24/06 Inspection Report from the Blue Unit (FEI 39550)	1 E 13010 12	(pg. 72-73) 07-487 Master AC
26	regarding a 5/3/06 inspection of the CEC 5/24/06 Inspection Report from the Blue Unit (FEI 39550)		07-487 Master AC
26	regarding a 5/3/06 inspection of the CEC 5/24/06 Inspection Report from the Blue Unit (FEI 39550)	PL 13603	07-487 Master AC
26	(FEI 39550)	TE 15005	(ng. 57)
27	(FEI 39550)	. *	(U#, J/)
27			48
	D 1 Tait	DI 10505	07-487 Master AC
	5/18/06 Inspection Report from the Red Unit	PL 13585	(pg. 39)
1	10000	10060	FL98026_AW_061907_SC
	(FEI 49026) 4/16/98 Complaint regarding the Kenny incident	PL 13959-13962	<b>1</b>
28	4/16/98 Complaint regularing and		AN
	(FELD 233-236)		(pg. 53-56)
	G Pingling Brothers Blue	PL 14240	FL 99-
29	10/7/98 Inspection Report of Ringling Brothers Blue		028_AW_Scan_072007
	Unit (FEI 2284) Duplicate – PL 11814	1.	(pg. 146)
		PL 13715	07-487 Master AC
30	6/16/06 Interoffice Memo from Lisa MacElderly to	1 15/10	(pg. 169)
50	a survey and the survey of the	PL 13677-13678	
21	Charles Litzappelli i Illillicitivoi to Amorra	PL 13077-13070	(ng. 130-131)
31	TED group classifications of RB's elephants	77 12025 12020	
	7/5/98 Consent Decision relating to the elephant	PL 13925-13929	AN (pg. 19-23)
32	(1.110(.1100)	10.50	
	Kenny (A 1126-1129) 7/21/04 Memo from Michael Smith to Dr. Garland	PL 13535-13536	IESAZ04156168ppMAI
33	regarding a 7/12/04 Ringling Brothers train arrival		
			N
	inspection		(pg. 157-158)
1	D + (EELD 001-	PL 13989-1399	0 FL98026_AW_061907_SC
34	9/5/97 Animal Care Inspection Report (FELD 001-		AN
	002)		(pg. 83-84)
		PL 13841	07-487 Master AC
35	3/29/07 Letter from Elizabeth Goldentyer to Robert		(pg. 295)
) ) )	ling Cose # VA07015, as reducted	DI 12566	07-487 Master AC
26	Huttenlocker regarding Case # VIGOUS 15/3/06 Inspection Report from the CEC (FEI 39957)	PL 13566	(pg. 20)
36			345(MASTER)IESAZ0415
	10/26/04 Report of Investigation on case AZ40156AC	PL 013390-	.168pp ,MAIN (pg. 12-14,
37	10/20/04 Report of M	013392; PL	
		013407- 01342	6 29-48)

Doc	Document	Certified Bates	PDF File
No		Label	
	<u> </u>		
38	Photographs taken during the Riccardo investigation	PL 14472-14479	DSC00001
			DSC00002
			DSC00003
			DSC00004
			DSC00006
			DSC00007
	, i		DSC00010
			DSC00011
39	VIDEO - Ringling Bros Oakland CAD Aug 4 Violation	PL 14913	#18 Ringling Bros Oakland
	2.131(2)(1) Exhibit 3A to VA 05008		CAD Aug 4 Violation
			2.131(2)(1) Contact Bolbol
			650-654-9955
40	2/5/01 Memo from Frank Keyser to Diane Ward	PL 17994-17995	CA00136AC, 2pp.
	regarding additional information for case # CA00136-		
	AC (PL 1412-1413)		01-363 Part 1 of (Records) 2
41	1/31/01 Affidavit of Robert Brandes concerning FL	FELD 265-266	1
	01095 (FELD 265-266)		(pg. 30-31)
	O. C. T. J. D. Willows regarding a	FELD	01-363 Part 1 of
42	Memo from S. Taylor to R. Willems regarding a		Records 4
	12/9/98 and 12/11/98 TB inspection of Ringling	0265-	
	Brothers Williston facility (PL 11118-11120)	0266	(pg. 97-99)
	C. D. 'd C. Hard to Don	FELD	01-363 (Records)
43	6/3/98 Letter from David Smith to Ron		3
	DeHaven documenting the 6/2/98	01086 -	· -
	inspection of Ringling Brothers Blue	01087	(pg. 424-425)
	Unit (FELD 1086-1087)		
			01-363 Part 1 of
44	2/16/99 Memo from Miava Binkley	FELD	
	documenting USDA inspection of Doc	817 -	(Records) 2
	and Angelica (FEI 817-818)	818	(pg. 20, 22)
		FEI	01-363 Part 1 of
45			
	Julie Strauss regarding the 2/10/99	843-844	(Records) 2
	inspection at Ringling Brothers CEC		(pg. 115, 117)
	(FEI 843-844)		

Doc	Document	Certified Bates	PDF File
No		Label	
46	Undated Memo from S. Taylor to R.	FELD	01-363 Part 1 of
	Williams documenting a 12/22/98	1529-	Records 4
	inspection (FELD 1529-1531)	1531	(pg. 246-248)
47	4/16/01 Affidavit of Janet Payuer re; TB	PL	01-363 Part 2 of
	(PL 11102-11103)	11102 -	Records 4
		11103	(pg. 222-223)
48	8/27/01 Memorandum from Charmain	PL 4607	01-363 Part 1 of
	Zordan to Diane Ward regarding		Record 4
	additional information on Investigation		(pg. 205)
	#CA00136-AC (PL 4607)		
49	1/12/01 Affidavit of Miava Binkley	PL 4067	01-363 Part 1 of
	concerning FL 01095 (PL 4067), as		(Records) 2
	redacted		(pg. 24-25)
50	2/9/99 Narrative concerning inspection	FEI	01-363 Part 1 of
	at the CEC (FEI 819-820)	819-820	(Records) 2
		4	(pg. 26, 28)
	2/13/01 Interview Log from Charmain	PL 4102	01-363 Part 1 of
	Zordan with Gary Jacobson at the CEC		(Records) 2
	egarding the separation process (PL		(pg. 165)
V	02)		•

In testimony whereof, I have hereunto caused the seal of the Department of Agriculture to be affixed and my name subscribed in the District of Columbia this

5 day of February 20 09

SECRETARY OF AGRICULTURE

By 2 By 306

Office of the General Counsel