

McWethy, Amy

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Tuesday, September 18, 2007 10:28 AM
To: Redacted
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

In response to your e-mail, we want you to know that for 137 years Ringling Bros. has been a committed animal steward and we believe in promoting conservation education. In fact, our guests say that the #1 reason they come to Ringling Bros. is to see the Asian elephants and that by seeing these magnificent animals up-close inspires in them to learn more about the plight of this endangered species, including human encroachment which is one of many issues facing these animals in their range countries.

Ringling Bros. provides the highest level of care for all its animals including the largest herd of Asian elephants in the Western Hemisphere. The animals are healthy and comfortable in their surroundings and they receive nutritious food, exercise and mental stimulation and excellent veterinary care. Additionally, all of Ringling Bros. animals and operations are inspected regularly by federal, state and local officials who enforce the animal welfare laws including the federal Animal Welfare Act. All USDA and many state and local inspections are unannounced. Ringling Bros. has an excellent record of meeting and exceeding the highest standards of animal care and has never been found in violation of the Animal Welfare Act.

If you would like more information on Ringling Bros. animal care and conservation efforts, please visit: www.elephantcenter.com

Sincerely,

Animal Care
Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey

-----Original Message-----

From:
Sent: Saturday, September 15, 2007 10:20 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted: Redacted

Name:
City:
State:
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Suggestions
Comments:

I know you may get alot of comments of the negative ways you treat your animals, but i think the animal acts in your show are stupid, like there



just dumb, i dont find them entertaining or funny, my FAVORITE part and im sure alot agree with me was those circle things that spin around and it does in a curcle that was really cool. And when they climbed that really high pole. I'd much rather see those things than watch an elephant disco dance when all it really wants to do is be free and happy. Is that too much to ask. For once think with your heart, not your wallet. Maybe if you guys change your show and it WILL become way more popular with everyone then other smaller circuses might get the idea and not use animals. Thanks and please reply. I really vaule your feedback. Thanksss.

McWethy, Amy

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Tuesday, September 18, 2007 10:14 AM
To: Redacted:
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: General Comments

In response to your e-mail, we want you to know that Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey is a committed animal steward and for more than a decade animal rights activist groups have been trying to distort Ringling Bros. outstanding record of animal care with false allegations and old, misleading edited videotape. It is important to note that these groups oppose human and animal interaction no matter how sound the animal care and they refuse to see that Ringling Bros. provides diligent humane treatment to all its animals. Fortunately in every city we visit, our guests see for themselves that Ringling Bros. animals are healthy and comfortable in their surroundings. Additionally, they have the opportunity to speak with our animal staff and see that the animals get nutritious food, exercise and mental stimulation and excellent veterinary care.

You should also know that Ringling Bros. animals and operations are inspected regularly by federal, state and local officials who enforce the animal welfare laws including the federal Animal Welfare Act. All USDA and many state and local inspections are unannounced. Ringling Bros. has an excellent record of meeting and exceeding the highest standards of animal care and has never been found in violation of the Animal Welfare Act.

If you would like more information on Ringling Bros. animal care and our conservation efforts, please visit: www.elephantcenter.com

Animal Care
Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey

-----Original Message-----

From: Redacted
Sent: Saturday, September 15, 2007 3:58 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: General Comments

The following form was submitted:

disgusting and very disturbing to see this sort of cruelty. ALL animal circuses should be banned especially Ringling brothers! Animal care what a joke!

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

91607 I just took my children, ages 3 and 5, to the circus at the staples center. They had a wonderful time! But what they really enjoyed was the acrobatics and stunts performed by the clowns and other entertainers, they didn't seem interested in the animals at all. While the dogs in the dog show seemed to be having a good time, the elephants looked really sad, and that ruined the show for me, even my kids noticed. I think having elephants is outdated and unnecessary, the acrobatics were so incredible they could have carried the show successfully. I felt really bad for the elephants, I think you should leave them out of the show, they belong in the jungle or something.

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

43204 Nice cover up! How ever the public is now becoming better educated and informed on the cruelty you inflict on the elephants.It has been proven there is a cooralation between animal abuse and child/spousal abuse. I would never come to one of your preformances nor will my children or grand children.Please stay out of our city!Columbus

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

20732 I am writing you to ask that you omit the animals from your circus. My family went to the circus tonight in Baltimore and felt really uneasy with the demeanor of the animals. I am a 34 year old man, not a PETA freak or anything, but was really moved by the expressions of the animals. The elephants in particular. They seemed very afraid of the trainers and even my 3 year old asked my why the elephants were sad. Many people around us during intermission were talking about the animals and how the circus is great without them. You put on a hell of a show, but are the animals nescessary? I think that you would still pack the house with the talent that you have. We all enjoyed the show, but would really enjoy it more if the animals were not there. There is no way the in downtown Baltinore, that there is enough room for those elephants to roam, without being tied up. I know that this e-mail will probobly go on deaf ears, and I am not someone who would normally write something like this, but was moved enough to write you. I will not be taking my family to your show anymore until you return the animals to the wild or to a santuary where they belong. As we were leaving the show we were stopped by police so that the elephants could walk down the city street, in weather that was less than 40 degrees. I know that is the easiest way to transport the animals, but couldnt they have used a large truck? or many trucks? Just thought I would e-mail you and hopefully someone receives this and thinks about a possible change in the show. Like I said before - I am not a member of Peta or any other group, just a dad who had to explain to a 3 year old little girl why the elephants were so sad. What is really sad is that a 3 year old can see that the elephants are not happy. Respectfully,
Scott [REDACTED]

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

84087 my family recently saw your circus...in slc...wonderful seats...the show was fabulous. but i wish that you would stop using animals in your show...elephants, lions etc. a majority of your audience feels the same...just watch their faces....my children felt sad as did i as a child. no need to continue this bad practice . i'm not sure that we will go again otherwise.

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

60603 I was just at your show in Chicago at the United Center 11/16/04. What a great show it was!! I think the acts and stunts that the people are performing are what really make your show the "greatest show on earth." I realize the animals have had a great deal to do with the success of your show, but are they really necessary anymore? It was just very disheartening to see the animals paraded around as they were. I think it is great that you have created the elephant conservation, but what about the elephants that you have traveling from city to city right now? I wouldn't have been prompted to write this e-mail, but when my 7 year old son said, "Mom, why aren't these animals running around in the jungle with their families," I thought to myself, he is right! Granted, this is the comment of a 7 year old, but that is also probably your audience target age. I realize this is only one e-mail and the opinion of only two people, but listen to your audience during the next show. After my son made that comment, I paid attention to how your audience reacted during the different performances. There is a lot more cheering going on for the funny clown acts and the daring stunts of your performers then there are for the animals!

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

80550 Hello - My five year old son really wants to see your circus. We, however, are not sold on the fact that you are doing your share of protecting endangered animals. We have read about your center in Florida, but it seems that those baby elephants are nothing more than new recruits for your circus. What other ways are you helping animals in the wild? What percentage of your revenues or profits go to helping endangered animals outside of your own programs? We would love to find a reason to promote your circus to our family as we all love watching animals, but we must make sure we are doing what is morally right to us. Thank you for your feedback. Sincerely, Jana [REDACTED]

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

92845 Saw the show in Anaheim, Sunday. Took my wife to the circus for her 21st birthday. She'll be a real 49 on Saturday. One question, while watching the elephants, outside, several were swaying back and forth. Both before and after the show. It was like they had music in their ears and were wavering to some unheard sounds. We asked several people but no one had an answer. Was great to see Gunther Gable Williams son, glad the traditionis being carried on, we marveled at his father and still have the programs, from a long, long time ago. Bob [REDACTED]

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

11738 I recently attended your show at Nassau Coliseum with my 2 year old. We went downstairs before the show to see all the animals up close and I was pleased to see how well they were taken care of - especially the elephants who

were thankfully not tied down by chains around their feet. However, while watching the show I kept thinking how it was not even necessary to have these gentle creatures in your circus. The show would be just as good with just daredevil acts, clowns, acrobatics and the horses - (domestic animals). These wild animals do not belong and should never have been a part of a show where the number one reason for existing is the almighty dollar. I was shocked after purchasing the circus brochure that Mr. Gebel states that he has known some of these elephants for 30 years. 30 years?!?! For god's sake they've put in their time - retire them already! Think of them - not of the dollar - for once. In the end it really doesn't matter how well they are treated in your care - I'm sure if they could talk they would chose the wild or at least retirement than perform stupid and senseless tricks for humans - example - lining up in a row so that men can jump over them? Have a heart - elephants, tigers, zebras, camels, llamas - do not belong in that type of atmosphere. The people that you have working for you are entertainment enough and will still draw in crowds and money. Thank you for your time. Heidi [REDACTED]

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

Non-Responsive Comment Redacted

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Thursday, July 26, 2007 2:44 PM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Thank you for writing and giving us the opportunity to address your concerns about video footage you've seen.

Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey is perhaps the most open -- and openly scrutinized -- form of entertainment in the world. The public is able to see exotic animals not only in our performances, but also during animal walks and at our Animal Open Houses. We are regularly inspected by federal and local animal authorities. We welcome the chance to show members of the media and representatives of animal control organizations our animals' living quarters and the their interaction with our animal care staff.

Being this open gives our critics the opportunity to videotape our daily activities. In some cities, we are taped 10 hours a day for six or seven days straight. Our critics then display selected bits of footage and misrepresent animal care at Ringling Bros. by showing isolated moments out of context. You never see what occurred in the seconds before and the seconds after the footage that was shown.

If you are a parent, or if you care for a pet, take a moment and imagine a camera directed at you for thousands of hours. Now imagine a group of political extremists wants to destroy your life simply because they disagree with you. Now give those extremists access to those thousands of hours of videotape in which you interact with a child or pet. How difficult would it be for that someone to select a few seconds of footage that could paint you as an irresponsible parent or pet guardian?

Most of the footage organizations like PeTA circulate to bolster their political campaign against Ringling Bros. is more than 10 years old and is shorter than 10 seconds long. It is not uncommon for the footage to be inaccurately described, as well. Often, the use of an ankus is mentioned as if the very presence of an ankus were an issue. Improper use of an ankus is strictly against Ringling Bros. policies. The ankus is a guide tool that has been used by elephant professionals worldwide for hundreds of years.

What our critics will never show you is tape of the incalculable hours during which Ringling Bros. handlers bathe, feed, care for, and play with the animals. Anyone who spends time with our animal care professionals can easily see how much they love the animals and how much the animals rely on their caretakers.

We hope you will spend some time exploring the truth about animal care at Ringling Bros by visiting the animal care area of our Web site:

<http://www.ringling.com/AmazingAnimals/care/care.html>

Thank you for writing.

Ringling Bros. Animal Care

-----Original Message-----

REDACTED

From:
Sent: Monday, July 23, 2007 3:53 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City:
State: REDACTED
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Suggestions

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City: Never Will Attend
State:
Email:
Topic: Comments
Comment type: Suggestions **REDACTED**
Comments:

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Thursday, July 26, 2007 2:52 PM
To: **REDACTED**
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Ringling Bros. and our guests are helping to save the endangered Asian elephant species through our Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Center for Elephant Conservation.

With more than 5 percent of ticket proceeds contributed solely to support the Ringling Bros. Center for Elephant Conservation, millions of people who attend our circuses are helping to save the endangered Asian elephant.

Sincerely,
Ringling Bros. Animal Care

-----Original Message----- **REDACTED**
From:
Sent: Monday, July 23, 2007 1:51 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City: **REDACTED**
State:
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Other
Comments:
There were announcements that a portion of my ticket price goes to the Elephant Center.
How much or what percentage?

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Thursday, July 26, 2007 2:26 PM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Thank you for writing us here at Ringling.com. We appreciate your concern about our animals.

Ringling Bros. provides the highest standards of care to all our animal performers and employs an animal husbandry team that provides a stable, stimulating and rewarding environment where animals thrive year round. Contrast this with people whose expertise is in advocacy, misinformation and speculation and who provide other unsuspecting people with inaccurate, dated and out of context materials. We appreciate the opportunity to set the record straight.

We realize that some people have different opinions on whether or not animals should be used in entertainment. However, be assured that animals are an important and beloved part of our circus community, and their care and well being are a commitment we take very seriously. We care for the animals in a knowledgeable, concerned and humane way, both because that is the right thing to do and because the animals are among the most important and valuable parts of the circus experience. It would be foolhardy for us to do anything but give them the best of care.

Our animals are not actors. To be assured of their well being, one only has to see them in the ring. Because the performances are based on what the animals do during play and socialization, training is simply a matter of encouraging the animals to do what comes naturally on cue to music. Any type of training involving abuse, mistreatment or fear is counterproductive, and produces an animal that is unpredictable - not a desired characteristic in performing animals.

At the Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Center for Elephant Conservation, the world's leading facility for the reproduction, research and retirement of the endangered Asian elephant, we are very fortunate to have added 16 elephants to the worldwide population of this endangered species that now numbers fewer than 40,000. In fact, thanks to the hands-on care developed over 130 years of our partnership with this magnificent species, we are now expecting four more elephants to join our family next year. In addition to our Conservation Center Ringling Bros. is a founding member of the International Elephant Foundation. Ringling Bros. has helped sponsor efforts to provide emergency veterinary care, supplies, research scholarships and grants, and management training to elephant trainers in Sumatra, Indonesian.

Throughout the history of the circus, animals have been a major attraction for young and old alike, and with good reason -- they amaze and educate their audience with feats of intelligence, strength and beauty. In every city we visit, our audiences have the opportunity to view both exotic and domestic animals that many would otherwise never have the chance to enjoy. Independent studies have shown that the public display of animals contributes to heightened public awareness of the animals themselves and of man's responsibility for their well being and protection. This is especially true for children, who not only become more aware of the animals and their special needs and abilities, but also experience first hand the importance of caring for and respecting all animals. Judging from the feedback we receive from our millions of patrons, exotic animals continue to be a unique and treasured part of the circus experience. At Ringling Bros., we are very proud of the role we have played in introducing these magnificent animals to generation after generation of circus goers and their families.

We hope that we have addressed some of your concerns about our animal care policies and practices.

For more information, we invite you to visit the following:

. For more information about Ringling Bros. animals and how we care for them:
www.ringling.com/amazinganimals.com

. For information on Ringling Bros. Asian elephant conservation efforts: www.elephantcenter.com . For information on the Animal Welfare Act and the strict rules protecting all performing animals: www.aphis.usda.gov/ac . For information on Wildlife and Conservation efforts: www.fws.gov/index.html and www.cites.org/

Ringling Bros. Animal Care

-----Original Message----- REDACTED
From:
Sent: Wednesday, July 25, 2007 6:48 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City: REDACTED
State:
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Other
Comments:

REDACTED

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Thursday, July 26, 2007 2:28 PM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Barnum & bailey show 7/22.07 7:30 p.m. Show

Ringling Bros. is committed to the highest standards in the care of all our animal performers, and we deliver exemplary, hands-on-care, 365 days a year. Our animal care staff consists of animal experts who devote their lives to living, working with and caring for animals. Training and handling of the animals are based on constant contact, daily routines and nurturing which builds a rapport between the animals and the handlers based on trust and affection.

Our animals are trained to respond to the cues from the whip. This is not a "whip" as you might see in an Indiana Jones movie, but rather pieces of string on a long pole. When used properly, it does not touch the animal. The strings snap together in the air and make the "crack" sound, which is an audible signal to the animal. If one of the whips does touch the animal, it is a light touch on the back, to get the attention of the animal. This device is used extensively when working with horses in many different disciplines - for example, carriage horses and horse shows, The "whip" is considered an extension of the arm.

Sincerely,
Ringling Bros. Animal Care

Subject: Barnum & bailey show 7/22.07 7:30 p.m. Show

-----Original Message-----

REDACTED

From:
Sent: Saturday, July 21, 2007 6:29 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City: REDACTED
State:
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Suggestions
Comments:

We attended (a 3yr. old, 26 yr. old, and a 45 yr. old..basically 3 generations) your Circus of Dreams. Overall, we enjoyed the show. The human tricks were incredible. The tiger performance lacked something to be desired to all of us. my grandson had no interest, but of course he is only 3.

REDACTED

I was skeptical about the elephants and yet 1 or 2 has the same impact as 10. I have a border collie who loves perform, he doesn't need 10 other border collies performing simultaneously. It would take the impact away from the performance. You asked for comments and if asked about your show, I will have to mention what happened with these tigers. Sadness is what I'm feeling. Less is best. Animal preservation is great thing, but do it right. Maybe you are just numb from all of years, but from a 2nd row view, it wasn't very pretty.

Disappointed,

REDACTED

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Monday, July 30, 2007 11:34 AM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Thank you for contacting Ringling Bros. Animal Care.

The guide (sometimes referred to as an ankus or bullhook) is a widely accepted tool by many zoos that can be used as an extension of the handler's arm. For instance, the guide enables animal care staff to reach up 8 feet to touch an elephant on the shoulder.

Sincerely,
Ringling Bros. Animal Care

-----Original Message-----

REDACTED

From:
Sent: Saturday, July 28, 2007 11:46 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City: REDACTED
State:
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Other
Comments:
Why do you use bull hooks on elephants?

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Monday, July 30, 2007 11:38 AM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Thank you for contacting Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey. The treatment and care of all our animal performers is of paramount importance.

REDACTED

Sincerely,
Ringling Bros. Animal Care

-----Original Message-----

REDACTED

From:
Sent: Friday, July 27, 2007 10:35 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City:
State: REDACTED
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Suggestions
Comments:

REDACTED

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Friday, July 27, 2007 11:35 AM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Thank you for contacting Ringling Bros. Animal Care.

The tool our elephant handlers use is called a bullhook or an ankus. The bullhook is used as an extension of the arm to guide the animal. Elephant professionals all over the world, including Thailand and Sumatra, use the bullhook. For more information on the bullhook, please visit the "Training and Performance" page in the Amazing Animals section of www.ringling.com.

Sincerely,
Ringling Bros.

-----Original Message----- **REDACTED**
From:
Sent: Thursday, July 19, 2007 10:34 AM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City:
State: **REDACTED**
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Suggestions
Comments:

On your website you claim that you don't use bullhooks to train elephants but it has been documented that you use them often and inflict pain to get elephants to perform. The bullhook has been placed on the extremely sensitive skin behind their ears, isn't this true? Elephants are not meant to perform and travel in captivity. In the wild, elephants walk for 30 miles a day and this is considered a stroll for them. Their feet cannot tolerate hard surfaces and they often develop joint problems in them and die prematurely. These feet injuries cause unbearable pain. What's wrong with a circus without animals?
REDACTED elephants are big animals that don't deserve to be poked, injured and constantly contained in small areas.

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Monday, August 13, 2007 12:24 PM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: A letter to Feld Entertainment

Thank you for contacting Ringling.com. We appreciate your concern for our animals.

It is unfortunate that once again PETA and animal activists have repackaged old allegations, misinformation, and conjecture with selectively edited video snippets in a vain effort to discredit a respected breeding program that is helping to save the Asian elephant here and abroad. We appreciate the opportunity to set the record straight.

The video of the inappropriate treatment of Angelica is an example of how animal activists put their staged media campaigns ahead of the welfare of animals. *Ringling Bros.* was unable to take disciplinary action against the handler because by the time we learned of the incident he had already left our employment. Most importantly, veterinarians determined that Angelica was unfazed and unharmed.

Once again we appreciate your concern for our animals.

For more information about Ringling Bros. animals and how we care for them see:
<http://www.ringling.com/menagerie/?borschtid=94645005731047831915>

This link will take you to our Center for Elephant Conservation: <http://www.elephantcenter.com/>

And here you will find links to more circus and animal information: <http://www.ringling.com/fun/links/index.itmpl>

Sincerely,

Ringling Bros. Animal Care

REDACTED

From:
Sent: Thursday, August 02, 2007 5:19 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: A letter to Feld Entertainment

August 2, 2007

To Feld Entertainment:

I recently saw a video of one of your elephant trainers teaching other trainers how to train elephants, for the Ringling Bros. show. I watched for about half a minute and had to turn off the video and not watch any longer. What I saw and heard was cruel, brutal, and totally unfeeling behavior and attitude towards the animals.

If I had known years ago what was entailed in training elephants to do your circus tricks, I would never have sent my son to the circus, but instead would have steadfastly worked against you, as I intend to do now. I will get behind PETA and any other animal protection organizations from now on, and tell everyone I know about this barbaric cruelty!

If you cannot train animals to do tricks without subjecting them to cruelty, pain, breaking their spirits,

and making them miserable, then you should not do it at all! People DO NOT need to see animals do tricks in order for their lives to run smoothly!!

Your business is a shameful one based purely on profit. Do not tell me of your conservation efforts. Do not tell me of any other good things you may do. This one fact makes anything else about your business dirty and disgraceful.

Sincerely,

REDACTED

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Monday, August 13, 2007 12:23 PM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Thank you for contacting Ringling.com. We appreciate your concern for our animals. It is unfortunate that once again PETA and animal activists have repackaged old allegations, misinformation, and conjecture with selectively edited video snippets in a vain effort to discredit a respected breeding program that is helping to save the Asian elephant here and abroad. We appreciate the opportunity to set the record straight. The video of the inappropriate treatment of Angelica is an example of how animal activists put their staged media campaigns ahead of the welfare of animals. Ringling Bros. was unable to take disciplinary action against the handler because by the time we learned of the incident he had already left our employment. Most importantly, veterinarians determined that Angelica was unfazed and unharmed.

Once again we appreciate your concern for our animals.

For more information about Ringling Bros. animals and how we care for them see:
<http://www.ringling.com/menagerie/?borschtid=94645005731047831915>

This link will take you to our Center for Elephant Conservation:

<http://www.elephantcenter.com/> And here you will find links to more circus and animal information: <http://www.ringling.com/fun/links/index.jttml>

Sincerely,

Ringling Bros. Animal Care

-----Original Message-----

REDACTED

From:
Sent: Sunday, August 12, 2007 1:21 AM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City: REDACTED
State:
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Other
Comments:

REDACTED

elephant, we are very fortunate to have added 16 elephants to the worldwide population of this endangered species that now numbers fewer than 40,000. In fact, thanks to the hands-on care developed over 130 years of our partnership with this magnificent species, we are now expecting four more elephants to join our family next year. In addition to our Conservation Center Ringling Bros. is a founding member of the International Elephant Foundation. Ringling Bros. has helped sponsor efforts to provide emergency veterinary care, supplies, research scholarships and grants, and management training to elephant trainers in Sumatra, Indonesian.

Throughout the history of the circus, animals have been a major attraction for young and old alike, and with good reason -- they amaze and educate their audience with feats of intelligence, strength and beauty. In every city we visit, our audiences have the opportunity to view both exotic and domestic animals that many would otherwise never have the chance to enjoy. Independent studies have shown that the public display of animals contributes to heightened public awareness of the animals themselves and of man's responsibility for their well being and protection. This is especially true for children, who not only become more aware of the animals and their special needs and abilities, but also experience first hand the importance of caring for and respecting all animals. Judging from the feedback we receive from our millions of patrons, exotic animals continue to be a unique and treasured part of the circus experience. At Ringling Bros., we are very proud of the role we have played in introducing these magnificent animals to generation after generation of circus goers and their families.

We hope that we have addressed some of your concerns about our animal care policies and practices.

For more information, we invite you to visit the following:

- . For more information about Ringling Bros. animals and how we care for them: www.ringling.com/amazinganimals.com
- . For information on Ringling Bros. Asian elephant conservation efforts: www.elephantcenter.com
- . For information on the Animal Welfare Act and the strict rules protecting all performing animals: www.aphis.usda.gov/ac
- . For information on Wildlife and Conservation efforts: www.fws.gov/index.html and www.cites.org/

Ringling Bros. Animal Care

-----Original Message----- REDACTED
 From:
 Sent: Tuesday, July 31, 2007 4:35 PM
 To: Customerservice
 Subject: Ringling.com: General Comments

The following form was submitted:

Name:
 City:
 State: REDACTED
 Email:
 Topic: Comments
 Comment type: Other
 Comments:

I am wondering if it is true that you use bullhooks to train your elephants? As well as using whips and other abusive techniques to train? I had no idea this was a practice in the circus and I will say it was quite disturbing to read this recently. I have been a huge fan of the circus and in particular Ringling brothers for over 25 years and was under the impression that it was a humane enterprise. I am deeply disturbed to find out that I may have been wrong. I am also surprised your website doesn't adequately describe the care that your animals receive. I am sad to say that I believe this may be the end of my attendance at the circus unless it is an animal free circus. I sincerely hope that the treatment of your animals changes in the near future or that the allegations against you are false. If they are not false I beg in the change and will do everything in my power to stop this abusive treatment.

Regards,

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Friday, August 17, 2007 4:01 PM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

This is in regard to your e-mail about Ringling Bros. animal care practices. We hope our response will set the record straight to the misleading communication you have received. Once again, it comes as no surprise that PETA's fundraising tactics include repackaged allegations and misinformation by a former employee in its ongoing effort to discredit Ringling Bros. respected animal care program.

It is important for you to know that Ringling Bros. is open to inspections by authorized local, state and federal agencies and has never been found in violation of the Federal Animal Welfare Act. These inspections are unannounced and that means the authorities are free to enter and inspect our animal care practices and typically they may remain or return to the premises at their discretion. These animal welfare inspectors visit all of Ringling Bros. facilities throughout the year and consistently find that our animal care is managed by well-qualified and knowledgeable professionals.

With 137 years of experience in traveling and living closely with exotic and domestic animals, Ringling Bros. is a leader animal care and we are committed to animal welfare.

For more information about Ringling Bros. cares for its animals please visit <http://www.elephantcenter.com>

Sincerely,
Ringling Bros. Animal Care

-----Original Message----- REDACTED
From:
Sent: Thursday, August 16, 2007 11:13 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City:
State: REDACTED
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Suggestions
Comments:

I am not a member of PETA and I have been to the circus as a child but I have a question.. After seeing the videos of Ringling Bros employees abusing the elephants how can you defend them? What is the company doing to prevent this from happening? No, I have never tried to train an elephant but.. isn't there a less painful way? It seems so horrifying. Please reply..

Hi. Do the elephants living at the Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Center for Elephant Conservation used in your shows?

McGaughy, Alicia

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Friday, August 17, 2007 3:52 PM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Thank you so much for writing us here at Ringling.com. We are sorry that the horse act upset you. We would like to take the opportunity to explain to you how horses and all of our animals are treated here at Ringling Bros.

Animals are an important and beloved part of our circus community, and their care and well-being are a commitment we take very seriously. We care for the animals in a knowledgeable, concerned and humane way, both because that is the right thing to do and because the animals are among the most important and valuable parts of the circus experience. It would be foolhardy for us to do anything but give them the best of care.

Our horses are trained to respond to the cues from the whip. This is not a "whip" as you might see in an Indiana Jones movie, these are pieces of string on a long pole. They make a crack in the air, which is an audible signal to the horse. If one does touch the horse, which it usually does not, it feels like a light touch. This device is used extensively when with working with horses in many different disciplines - for example, carriage horses, horse shows, jumping, etc. It is considered merely an extension of the trainer's arm, not a punishment device.

The cornerstone of all animal training at Ringling Bros. is positive reinforcement, an approach that involves a great deal of patience, repetition, praise and food rewards. Any type of training involving abuse, mistreatment or fear is counterproductive, and produces an animal that is unpredictable - not a desired characteristic in performing animals. Indeed, animal experts and those familiar with the circus industry know that a positive, healthy environment is the only acceptable and successful method of animal training. Many of our trainers grew up with the animals they work with, so relationships of mutual trust and respect are established from the very beginning. Performances are carefully designed to mimic the animals' natural athletic abilities and reflect their individual personalities in an entertainment setting. The animals are never forced to perform any maneuver that could cause them harm.

I hope this has eased your mind about the horses and other animals here at Ringling Bros. Please let us know if you have any further questions.

Ringling Bros. Animal Care

-----Original Message----- REDACTED
From:
Sent: Monday, July 30, 2007 8:48 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City:
State: REDACTED
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Suggestions REDACTED
Comments:

My family and i went to the circus. When we saw the elephants and they were getting whipped because they weren't moving. That is animal abuse. I will not go back to this circus or recomend it!

-----Original Message-----

REDACTED

From:
Sent: Tuesday, August 28, 2007 8:44 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City: **REDACTED**
State:
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Other
Comments:

I was in process of arranging to bring a larg group to the Indianapolis show. I have since seen a hidden video taken of how you treat your animals. This video showed your trainer beating a baby elephant and then looking around to make sure no one saw him. Too bad...they did! Not only have I decided against bringing my group but I will do whatever necessary to notify other people and spread the word about your abuse of the wonderful animals that you have captured! You all should be very ashamed of your selves.

McWethy, Amy

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Tuesday, September 04, 2007 6:31 PM
To: **REDACTED**
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Dear **REDACTED**

We want you to know that Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey is a committed animal steward and provides the highest level of care for all its animals including the largest herd of Asian elephants in the Western Hemisphere. You should know that for more than a decade critics and animal rights activist groups have been trying to distort Ringling Bros. outstanding record of animal care. These groups oppose human and animal interaction no matter how sound the animal care and they refuse to see that Ringling Bros. provides diligent humane treatment and care to all its animals. Fortunately, our guests including the media know that they can come see for themselves that Ringling Bros. animals are healthy and comfortable in their surroundings. They also see that the animals get nutritious food, exercise and mental stimulation and excellent veterinary care.

You should also know that Ringling Bros. animals and operations are inspected regularly by federal, state and local officials who enforce the

animal welfare laws including the federal Animal Welfare Act. All USDA and many state and local inspections are unannounced. Ringling Bros. has an excellent record of meeting and exceeding the highest standards of animal care and has never been found in violation of the Animal Welfare Act.

We are also dedicated to saving the endangered Asian elephant species. It has been twelve years since the Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Center for Elephant Conservation opened in Central Florida and this 200-acre facility is dedicated to the research, reproduction and retirement of the Asian elephant. In fact just last year our 20th calf, a rare second generation was born in the program.

If you would like more information on Ringling Bros. animal care and its conservation efforts, please visit: www.elephantcenter.com

Sincerely,

Animal Care
Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey

-----Original Message----- REDACTED
From:
Sent: Sunday, August 26, 2007 8:01 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City:
State: REDACTED
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Suggestions
Comments:

REDACTED

Name:
City:
State: REDACTED
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Suggestions
Comments:

I have a 24 year old son, whom from the time he was 2 years old, we took to the circus EVERY year for his b-day. I now have a 6 year old son, and 3 grand children, who I would LOVE to continue this tradition with. I have become aware recently of allegations of abuse towards the elephants that belong to your circus. I understand that these accusations are directed toward the elephant handlers and trainers. These accusations are EXTREMELY upsetting to me, and I sincerely hope that when all is said and done, it turns out that there was nothing to it, and NONE of your animals are being mistreated.

I believe in innocent untill proven guilty, and I believe in your company. As I stated, bringing our kids to your shows has been a family tradition for over twenty years.

I haven't been this upset about an animal abuse allegation in a long time, if ever, and WILL be watching this story closely.

If it turns out that there is no truth to these charges, then we will continue our tradition of bringing our grandkids to your shows yearly. If however, there is truth to these charges, I cannot continue to have our family attend your shows, knowing that my ticket money helps pay the salary of someone who is abusing these circus animals. I just CANT. Hooks in elephants ears, beatings with sticks, and these elephants being terrified of their trainers and handlers is absolutely unacceptable.

Please.... If this is true, please get rid of these people. Don't have there actions attached to your name.

Thank you for your time.

Sincerely,

REDACTED

McWethy, Amy

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Tuesday, September 04, 2007 6:12 PM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Dear REDACTED

Thank you for contacting us. Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey is committed to providing the very best of care for its animals. If you are interested in a career in animal husbandry click here: <http://www.feldentertainment.com/careers.htm> to find out what opportunities are currently available.

Sincerely,

Name:
City:
State: **REDACTED**
Email:
Topic: Comments
Comment type: Other
Comments:

I just watched circuses.com and I am very disturbed. I recognize many of your employees and they are abusing the elephants. Especially Sasha Houcke. I cannot believe you allow this to happen! I have been an avid circus going person 18 years straight. I was previously not believing most of this/but now i see it. Now what? will you clean up your act? I think my children will be not going to the circus again. Seeomg the injuries and how some of your top named people act on the screen, I am emotionally torn. I am one of Bello Noch's biggest fans. And my four year old worships him. Now she will have to do without the circus in her life. I cannot believe your employers!

McWethy, Amy

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Friday, August 31, 2007 8:18 PM
To: **REDACTED**
Subject: RE: Please either treat your elephants better, or don't use them

Dear **REDACTED**

We want you to know that Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey is a committed animal steward and for more than a decade animal rights activist groups have been trying to distort Ringling Bros. outstanding record of animal care. These groups oppose human and animal interaction no matter how sound the care and they refuse to see that Ringling Bros. provides diligent humane treatment to all its animals. Fortunately, as you saw yourself Ringling Bros. animals are healthy and comfortable in their surroundings. They get nutritious food, exercise and mental stimulation and excellent veterinary care.

You should also know that Ringling Bros. animals and operations are inspected regularly by federal, state and local officials who enforce the animal welfare laws including the federal Animal Welfare Act. All USDA and many state and local inspections are unannounced. Ringling Bros. has an excellent record of meeting and exceeding the highest standards of animal care and has never been found in violation of the Animal Welfare Act.

We are also dedicated to saving the endangered Asian elephant species. It has been twelve years since the Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Center for Elephant Conservation opened in Central Florida and this 200-acre facility is dedicated to the research, reproduction and retirement of the Asian elephant. In fact just last year our 20th calf, a rare second generation was born in the program.

If you would like more information on Ringling Bros. animal care and its conservation efforts, please visit: www.elephantcenter.com

Sincerely,

Animal Care
Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey

-----Original Message-----

REDACTED

From:
Sent: Thursday, August 30, 2007 1:55 PM
To:
Subject: Please either treat your elephants better, or don't use them

Mr. Feld,

Hello. I obtained this e-mail address from a card that I received when I attended a Ringling Bros. circus about a week ago, with my 5 year old son. The card, requesting my comments, was given to me by the vendor along with a toy that I had purchased for my son, and this card had a cute cartoon elephant on it saying "WE ARE ALL EARS!" Well, I was also handed a flyer from a group of people standing outside the circus who were protesting the event, because of what they claimed was cruel treatment of the elephants at the circus. The allegations were most disturbing (beatings, chaining the elephants for long periods of time in uncomfortable places, etc.) Although my son did enjoy the show very much, I'm afraid that I cannot in good conscience patronize any further performances by your organization, unless these issues of animal cruelty are adequately addressed. Thank you very much for your time and attention to this matter. Sincerely,

REDACTED

McWethy, Amy

From: AnimalCare
Sent: Friday, August 31, 2007 8:02 PM
To: REDACTED
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

Thank you for contacting Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey. We are committed animal stewards and for more than a decade animal rights activist groups have been trying to distort Ringling Bros. outstanding record of animal care. It is hard to find common ground with groups that oppose human and animal interaction no matter how sound the care or refuse to see that Ringling Bros. provides diligent humane treatment to all its animals. Fortunately our public knows better because our audiences see for themselves that Ringling Bros. animals are healthy and comfortable in their surroundings. They get nutritious food, exercise and mental stimulation and excellent veterinary care.

You should also know that Ringling Bros. animals and operations are inspected regularly by federal, state and local officials who enforce the

animal welfare laws including the federal Animal Welfare Act. All USDA and many state and local inspections are unannounced. Ringling Bros. has an excellent record of meeting and exceeding the highest standards of animal care and has never been found in violation of the Animal Welfare Act.

We are also dedicated to saving the endangered Asian elephant species. It has been twelve years since the Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Center for Elephant Conservation opened in Central Florida and this 200-acre facility is dedicated to the research, reproduction and retirement of the Asian elephant. In fact just last year our 20th calf, a rare second generation was born in the program.

We also host international conservation researchers and scientists who visit the Ringling Bros. Center for Elephant Conservation to study the largest sustainable population of captive Asian elephants in the Western Hemisphere. Ringling Bros. supports conservation efforts in Thailand and other parts of Southeast Asia and Asia; International Elephant Foundation emergency efforts; and we are regularly contacted by zoos, vets, researchers from around the world regarding elephant husbandry. If you would like more information on Ringling Bros. animal care and its conservation efforts, please visit: www.elephantcenter.com

Sincerely,

Animal Care
Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey

-----Original Message----- **REDACTED**
From:
Sent: Thursday, August 30, 2007 4:57 PM
To: Customerservice
Subject: Ringling.com: Animal Care

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City:
State: **REDACTED**
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Other
Comments:

REDACTED

The following form was submitted:

Name:
City:
State: REDACTED
Email:
Topic: Care
Comment type: Other
Comments:

Hi, We saw your show today and would like to know why endangered species are used in your show? i wasn't aware that was allowed, so I'm hoping you can let us know more info

REDACTED

McWethy, Amy

From: REDACTED
Sent: Tuesday, September 04, 2007 7:41 PM
To: AnimalCare
Subject: RE: Ringling.com: Animal Care

That's good enough for me then. I'm satisfied, and thank you for your response.

Sincerely,

REDACTED

----- Original message -----

From: "AnimalCare" <AnimalCare@feldinc.com>

- > Dear REDACTED
- >
- > Thank you for contacting us. We want you to know that Ringling Bros. and
- > Barnum & Bailey is a committed animal steward and for more than a decade
- > animal rights activist groups have been trying to distort Ringling Bros.
- > outstanding record of animal care with false allegations and old,
- > misleading edited videotape. These groups oppose human and animal
- > interaction no matter how sound the animal care and they refuse to see
- > that Ringling Bros. provides diligent humane treatment and care to all
- > its animals. Fortunately, our guests know that they can come see for
- > themselves that Ringling Bros. animals are healthy and comfortable in
- > their surroundings. They will also see that our animals get nutritious
- > food, exercise and mental stimulation and excellent veterinary care.
- >
- > You should also know that Ringling Bros. animals and operations are
- > inspected regularly by federal, state and local officials who enforce
- > the animal welfare laws including the federal Animal Welfare Act. All
- > USDA and many state and local inspections are unannounced. Ringling
- > Bros. has an excellent record of meeting and exceeding the highest
- > standards of animal care and has never been found in violation of the
- > Animal Welfare Act.
- >