

1
 2 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 3 FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
 4 Case No. 03-2006 (EGS)
 5 Judge Emmet G. Sullivan
 6
 7 AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF
 8 CRUELTY TO ANIMALS
 9 THE ANIMAL WELFARE INSTITUTE
 10 THE FUND FOR ANIMALS

11 TOM RIDER
 12 Plaintiffs
 13 v.

ORIGINAL

14 RINGLING BROTHERS AND BARNUM AND BAILEY CIRCUS
 15 FELD ENTERTAINMENT
 16 Defendant

17 DEPOSITION of BETSY SWART
 18 Friday, March 18, 2005, 10:26 a.m. to 1:10 p.m.
 19 Offices of Foley, Hoag and Eliot LLP
 20 World Trade Center West, 155 Seaport Boulevard
 21 Boston, Massachusetts

22
 23
 24 ----- JONATHAN H. YOUNG, RDR, CRR
 25 COURT REPORTER



Betsy Swart

Boston, MA

March 18, 2005

Page 7

1 Q. Did you take any biology classes during
2 that time?

3 A. Just the most basic ones, I suppose.

4 Q. So, no classes in zoology?

5 A. No.

6 Q. And following your undergraduate education,
7 did you attend any graduate programs?

8 A. I have a master's from Carnegie-Mellon
9 University in Pittsburgh.

10 Q. In what subject?

11 A. In English.

12 Q. Again, did you take any classes in biology?

13 A. No.

14 Q. Zoology?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Anything to do with the care and treatment
17 of animals?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Is that your only graduate degree?

20 A. I have up to the dissertation level of a
21 PhD.

22 Q. In what subject?

23 A. American studies.

24 Q. And again, did you have any classes in
25 biology?

1 A. No.

2 Q. Zoology?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Anything about the care or treatment of
5 animals?

6 A. Not in the way you're meaning, no.

7 There were courses that had to with the
8 sociology of animals, the treatment of animals in
9 America, cultural history of animals, things like
10 that; but strictly speaking zoology classes, no.

11 Q. Anything about the care and treatment of
12 animals?

13 A. Well, historically, the historical care
14 and treatment of animals; but not from a zoological
15 perspective, how to care for and treat animals.
16 I think that's what you mean; right.

17 Not in the biology department. In a
18 history department or a cultural-studies department,
19 yes.

20 Q. During your undergraduate education, did
21 you work at all?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Did you hold any positions or work in
24 between your undergraduate and graduate studies?

25 A. No.

1 Q. During your graduate education, did you
2 hold any jobs?

3 A. Just as a teaching assistant at the
4 university.

5 Q. And in what subjects?

6 A. American studies and cultural history.

7 Q. Following your graduate studies, what was
8 your first job?

9 A. Greenpeace.

10 Q. And what was your title?

11 A. Campaign department, program department.

12 Q. And what years were you there?

13 A. That would have been 1982 to about '84.

14 Q. And what were your responsibilities there?

15 A. Public relations, press releases, writing,
16 talking to media, things like that.

17 Q. Were you involved with any animal-activist
18 activities while you were at Greenpeace?

19 A. You mean outside of...

20 Q. Right now I'd like to concentrate on your
21 actual responsibilities with your job.

22 A. With my job, right. So you mean...

23 Q. Was Greenpeace involved with any animal-
24 activist activities while you were there?

25 A. Well, I guess it depends how you define

1 A. I was interested in doing other sorts of
2 animal work; and also my father was ill, which
3 necessitated a move to the East Coast.

4 Q. And what was your next position following
5 Greenpeace?

6 A. I worked briefly at PETA.

7 Q. And what years were you there?

8 A. '85, '86.

9 Q. And when you were at PETA, can you tell me
10 what your title was?

11 A. Again, it was campaign department, writer;
12 and, yes. Campaign department and writer.

13 Q. And what were your responsibilities there?

14 A. Pretty much the same. I am a good writer.
15 I have degrees in English, and that's often what I
16 do. I write press releases, media work, things
17 like that.

18 Q. Were you involved in any specific
19 animal-activist activities as part of PETA?
20 Let me phrase that another way. With the group
21 PETA, obviously you were.

22 Were you involved in any particular
23 campaigns, or any particular activities?

24 A. At that time it was the Silver Spring
25 monkeys.

1 Q. If you could tell me a little bit about
2 that, please.

3 A. It was a public-relations and media
4 campaign asking for the release of the Silver Spring
5 monkeys.

6 Q. And what in particular was your role on
7 that?

8 A. I wrote things, and talked to the public
9 and talked to the media.

10 Q. In addition to the Silver Spring monkeys,
11 were you involved in any other campaigns while you
12 were there?

13 A. No.

14 Q. Were you involved with the circus at all
15 while you were there?

16 A. No.

17 Q. So you had nothing to do with the Ringling
18 Brothers while you were there?

19 A. No.

20 Q. While you were there, did you have any
21 contact with other activist groups?

22 A. No.

23 Q. And you said you left PETA in roughly 1986.
24 What was your next job after that?

25 A. My next job was In Defense of Animals.

Betsy Swart

Boston, MA

March 18, 2005

Page 13

1 Q. And what was your title there?

2 A. Program director.

3 Q. And how many years were you there?

4 A. I believe I was there until 1989.

5 Q. And what were your responsibilities while
6 at In Defense of Animals?

7 A. Pretty much the same. You're going to
8 think I was in a rut. Writing public relations,
9 media, writing newsletter, things like that.

10 Q. Was your work related to a particular
11 animal-activist campaign?

12 A. Not to a particular campaign, no.

13 Q. If you could discuss, then, the general
14 subject matter of your efforts there.

15 A. The general subject of those years I think
16 was antivivisection; animals and laboratories.

17 Q. And in addition to writing, did you have
18 any other responsibilities while there?

19 A. Other general responsibilities; you know,
20 conducting conferences or press conferences, things
21 like that.

22 Q. Did you have any dealings with the circus
23 while you were there?

24 A. I don't think so, no.

25 Q. Did the organization have a position

1 regarding the circus?

2 A. No, not to my knowledge. I don't think so.

3 Q. So there were no dealings with Ringling
4 Brothers during that time?

5 A. No. Not to the best of my recollection,
6 no.

7 Q. Do you remember working with any other
8 activist groups during your time at In Defense of
9 Animals?

10 A. No.

11 Q. You said you left In Defense of Animals in
12 1989. Tell me where you went next.

13 A. I went back to the East Coast, again mostly
14 because of family obligations, and worked for
15 Friends of Animals in that city.

16 Q. And what was your title at Friends of
17 Animals?

18 A. Program director. It does sound like I was
19 in a rut!

20 Q. And your years there?

21 A. Until 2000, I think.

22 Q. So you were there from 1989 to 2000?

23 A. No, that's not right.

24 No, I was there for ten years. Yes.

25 Yes. 1989, 11 years. Yes, that's right. 1989 to

1 2000.

2 Q. And during that tenure there, what specific
3 campaigns were you working on?

4 A. We did a variety of campaigns. Wolves in
5 Alaska.

6 The focus was mostly wildlife work.
7 Wolves, marine mammals, predators within the US, and
8 CITES-related issues. That's elephants; in regard
9 to like international protection of elephants.

10 Q. I'd like to ask you a few questions about
11 that in a moment.

12 Did you have any position regarding the
13 circus while you were there?

14 A. I don't know. Do you mean a written
15 position?

16 Q. Yes.

17 A. I don't think they had a written
18 position. By that time, I think they were
19 talking about thinking that animals should not
20 be in circuses. However, I don't know if there
21 was a written position to that effect.

22 Q. Did they have any position regarding
23 Ringling Brothers in particular?

24 A. Again, I don't think there was anything
25 written. I do think they thought animals should not

1 be in any circus; not particularly Ringling
2 Brothers's circus, but any circus.

3 Q. During your time at Friends of Animals, did
4 you have any contact with any other activist groups?

5 A. I don't know what you mean by contact,
6 really.

7 I knew of other groups, and certainly
8 we would have run into other groups; but there's
9 nothing that I did officially with other groups,
10 no.

11 Q. There were no coordinated campaigns?

12 A. No.

13 Q. No coordinated fundraising efforts?

14 A. No.

15 Q. You said you dealt with the issue of
16 elephants in the wild. If you could give me a
17 brief description of those efforts.

18 A. I attended CITES meetings, and discussed
19 and learned about and campaigned for an
20 international ban on the ivory trade.

21 Q. When you said you attended meetings, where
22 were those meetings?

23 A. From 1989 on, they were in Lausanne,
24 Switzerland; Kyoto, Japan; Harare, Zimbabwe;
25 Nairobi; and Fort Lauderdale, I believe.

1 Q. Did those deal with African elephants?

2 A. Yes. Mostly.

3 Q. Did those deal also with Asian elephants?

4 A. I dealt mostly with African elephants.

5 The meetings would certainly have dealt
6 with Asian elephants; they're endangered, and they
7 certainly would have been brought up at the
8 meetings.

9 But the focus was African elephants;
10 because the ivory trade was affecting them brutally
11 at the time, and they were working to try to achieve
12 an international ban on the ivory trade, which they
13 did in 1989.

14 And then the ban was increasingly
15 loosened until the Harare meeting, where it was
16 pretty much reversed.

17 Q. Other than those meetings, what activities
18 were you involved in regarding elephants?

19 A. That's primarily it, I think.

20 Q. After you left Friends of Animals in 2000,
21 what was your next position?

22 A. Performing Animal Welfare Society in
23 California.

24 Q. And what was your title there?

25 A. Program director. I really wish I could

1 find another title for you.

2 Q. And your years there?

3 A. It wasn't solid, but roughly from 2001 to
4 2002. Maybe 2000 to 2002, but not solidly for that
5 time.

6 Q. And what were your responsibilities there?

7 A. Again, as program director, I oversaw
8 campaigns and I wrote press releases and I dealt
9 with the media and organized press conferences.

10 Q. And what specific campaigns were you
11 involved in?

12 A. Let's see. There was a Get Animals Out
13 of Circuses campaign, and several conferences on
14 surplus animals, the captive breeding of exotic
15 animals, and the overbreeding of those animals.

16 So there was a surplus-animal campaign,
17 so-called surplus.

18 Q. When you were dealing with the circus, what
19 types of activities did your Get Animals Out of
20 Circuses campaign entail?

21 A. Well, it would entail maybe having a
22 rally at the site where the circus train would come
23 to town and offload the animals; maybe have a rally
24 there holding signs or saying, you know, that we
25 protested the use of animals in circuses, things

1 like that.

2 Q. Anything else?

3 A. There was a federal bill; what was it, the
4 Captive Elephant Protection Act.

5 Q. And what did you do in regard to that
6 legislation?

7 A. I worked with members of Congress and our
8 members, with PAWS members, and members of the
9 media.

10 Q. Doing what?

11 A. Discussing the bill; discussing why it was
12 good, and helpful to elephants and to animals in
13 general.

14 Q. Do you know what came of the bill?

15 A. I know the bill went forward to a hearing
16 before the House Judiciary Committee, but then it
17 did not go forward from there.

18 Q. Did you testify before the Judiciary
19 Committee?

20 A. I personally did not testify, no.

21 Q. Did any individual from PAWS testify?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And what was their position at the hearing?

24 A. You mean their position within the
25 organization, or their position...

1 Q. Let's start with their position within the
2 organization.

3 A. Director of PAWS.

4 Q. What was her name?

5 A. Pat Derby.

6 Q. And I can assume that she was testifying in
7 support of the legislation?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And what year was this?

10 A. It was 2001, I think; and I may be wrong,
11 but I can correct that by looking at my files, I
12 think. 2001, I think, 2000.

13 Q. To the best of your knowledge, do you know
14 if that legislation is still pending before
15 Congress?

16 A. No, it is not.

17 Q. Do you know why it's not?

18 A. No, I don't know why it's not.

19 Technically, I don't know why it's not.

20 If you want me to say what committee did
21 what to stop it, I don't know.

22 Q. No; just whatever your knowledge is.

23 A. Okay.

24 Q. During your time at PAWS, did you have a
25 position regarding Ringling Brothers in particular?

1 A. Not in particular. It was that elephants
2 should not be in circuses in general, so Ringling
3 would have been included in that; but it wasn't
4 just an anti-Ringling thing.

5 Q. During your time at PAWS, did you have any
6 contact with other animal-activist groups?

7 A. Only in that we knew other groups and
8 worked with their members. People who belonged
9 to other groups came to our events. But if you're
10 meaning did we have campaigns that were coordinated
11 in conjunction with other groups, no.

12 Q. So there were no coordinated fundraising
13 efforts?

14 A. No.

15 Q. You said you were with PAWS from 2001 until
16 what year?

17 A. 2002.

18 I started working for them in 2000, but
19 it wasn't a continuous full-time job for me until
20 2002.

21 Q. Until 2002?

22 A. I mean, I worked for them from 2000 to
23 2002; but it wasn't at that time a continuous
24 full-time job during that time.

25 Q. Were you acting as a consultant?

1 Q. And what animal-activist activities were
2 you primarily involved in at the Trust?

3 A. None.

4 Q. If you could speak very briefly as to what
5 the Trust does.

6 A. In the United States, we support and create
7 public awareness around the project, which is based
8 in Kenya, which is Cynthia Moss's research project.

9 Q. And what does that research project do?

10 A. Well, for the last 32 years the project
11 has sort of delineated everything that we really
12 know about African elephants. The project began
13 in 1972, observing elephants in Amboseli National
14 Park in Kenya.

15 And it's through that observation that
16 we now know about elephants' family life and social
17 life and hierarchy, and many, many other things.

18 So, there have been many books that have
19 come out of that; and academic articles, and films.

20 Q. And your efforts in the United States are
21 to raise awareness of this?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Do you have fundraising efforts as well?

24 A. Well, limited, yes.

25 Q. Does your work with the African Elephant

1 Conservation Trust deal at all with Asian elephants?

2 A. No.

3 Q. If we could go back, I just want to touch
4 base with some of the positions you said you've held
5 in the past.

6 You said that when you were at
7 Greenpeace you didn't do any work with circuses, or
8 with Ringling Brothers in particular. Do you know
9 if during that time Greenpeace had a position
10 regarding the circus?

11 A. I don't think so.

12 Q. And your next job was with PETA. Do you
13 know what PETA's position regarding circuses was
14 while you were there?

15 A. No, I don't, honestly; no. I could say
16 what I assume it was, but there was no circus
17 campaign that I was ever involved in.

18 Q. And with In Defense of Animals, the same
19 question. Do you know what their position was
20 regarding circuses while you were there?

21 A. Again, they would have thought animals
22 should not be in circuses; but there was no circus
23 campaign that I know of.

24 Q. Do you agree with that position personally?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Were there any discussions regarding the
2 formulation of that policy?

3 A. At?

4 Q. Were there any discussions when the group
5 decided to come out with that position?

6 A. In In Defense of Animals, you mean?

7 Q. Yes.

8 A. I don't know that we ever came out with
9 that position while I was there. I don't think it
10 was a front-burner issue at that time with that
11 organization.

12 And so, no; I was never involved in
13 discussion to formulate that position.

14 Q. What about Friends of Animals? Did they
15 have a position regarding circuses while you were
16 there?

17 A. I don't recall.

18 Q. And PAWS; did PAWS have a position on
19 circuses while you were there?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And what was that position?

22 A. That animals should not be in circuses.

23 Q. And do you agree with that position
24 personally?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. When you were at PAWS, did you have any
2 contact with any employees of the circus?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Any former employees?

5 A. If you're referring to Tom Rider, yes.

6 I know Tom Rider.

7 Q. Did you know Tom during your time at PAWS?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Anybody else in addition to Tom Rider?

10 A. No.

11 Q. How about other people at PAWS? Do you
12 know if they had any contact with any other
13 employees of the circus?

14 A. No, I don't know for sure; no.

15 Q. With your current position at the African
16 Elephant Conservation Trust, does the Trust have a
17 position regarding circuses?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And what is that position?

20 A. That elephants should not be used in
21 circuses.

22 Q. And you agree with that position
23 personally?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Did you have a role in formulating that

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And in your office?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And you have no correspondence with Tom
5 Rider?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Are you a veterinarian?

8 A. No.

9 Q. Have you ever worked in a zoo?

10 A. No.

11 Q. Have you ever worked for a circus?

12 A. No.

13 Q. Have you ever been employed as an elephant
14 handler?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Do you have any experience handling Asian
17 elephants?

18 A. Well, at PAWS I participated in some
19 activities on protected-contact barriers with Asian
20 elephants yes.

21 Q. What type of activities?

22 A. Helping to feed or bathe them.

23 Q. If you could describe those efforts.

24 A. Protected contact means that there is a bar
25 facility between the caretaker and the elephant.

1 So, outside of those protective
2 barriers, I would have a hose or wash an elephant's
3 foot or wash an elephant's back; or toss carrots or
4 apples to an elephant.

5 Q. Do you have any experience training Asian
6 elephants?

7 A. No.

8 Q. So you're not a veterinarian, you've never
9 worked in a circus and you've never been employed as
10 an elephant handler; is that correct?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. Are you familiar with the way that Ringling
13 trains its elephants?

14 A. Do you mean have I ever seen it?

15 Q. Are you familiar; whatever you think that
16 that means?

17 Do you know about Ringling's treatment
18 of elephants?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What is the source of that knowledge?

21 A. One thing that comes to mind is the USDA
22 inspection report that I've read, that had to do
23 with elephants in the Conservation Center.

24 Q. I'm sorry; when you say Conservation
25 Center...

Betsy Swart

Boston, MA

March 18, 2005

Page 44

1 Q. And the temperature of the train cars
2 transporting elephants in particular?

3 A. Correct.

4 Q. Do you know whether or not there are
5 misters in the train cars?

6 A. No, I don't.

7 Q. Do you know how much room the elephants
8 have in the train cars?

9 A. I know what I have seen. In terms of
10 square feet, I couldn't tell you, no.

11 I have seen, well, I don't want to say;
12 because it's been a long time, and I'm not sure I
13 remember accurately.

14 Q. When did you make these observations?

15 A. I have seen the Ringling elephants coming
16 off the train cars. I have seen the doors opened;
17 and I have seen the elephants inside very close
18 together, swaying back and forth and chained.

19 Q. When did you make those observations?

20 A. I have seen that in Sacramento, and
21 probably in 2000 and 2001.

22 I have seen it in Mexico City.

23 Q. When did you see it in Mexico City?

24 A. In 1998.

25 Q. Do you know how the elephants are monitored

1 on the trains?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Have you ever been inside one of the
4 trains?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Have you ever been inside one of the trucks
7 that transports elephants?

8 A. No.

9 Q. Do you know if there's water inside the
10 trucks?

11 A. I don't know.

12 Q. Do you know if the temperature is regulated
13 inside the trucks?

14 A. I don't know.

15 Q. Do you know about Ringling's policies
16 regarding the transportation of elephants?

17 A. Again, I know what they say about
18 themselves, yes.

19 Q. Which is?

20 A. Which is that transporting elephants in
21 train cars the way they do is appropriate; which I
22 vehemently disagree with.

23 Q. And do you know if Ringling's policies
24 regarding the transportation of elephants have
25 changed over time?

1 A. I don't know.

2 Q. I'm going to ask you a series of questions
3 about your knowledge regarding Ringling's housing of
4 elephants, and I'm going to start with their housing
5 of elephants while they're out on travelling units
6 first.

7 Do you know anything about how Ringling
8 houses its elephants on the units?

9 A. You mean...

10 Q. When with they're travelling in different
11 cities?

12 A. No, I don't; because it's usually not
13 visible to the public.

14 Q. Do you know anything about Ringling's
15 policies for housing elephants while they're on the
16 road?

17 A. No.

18 Q. So you don't know anything about the
19 policies?

20 A. No.

21 Q. Do you know what a Ringling Brothers
22 elephant trainer's responsibilities are?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Do you know what a Ringling Brothers
25 elephant handler's responsibilities are?

1 A. No.

2 Q. And do you know what a Ringling Brothers
3 barnman's responsibilities are?

4 A. No.

5 Q. Have you ever been to Ringling's Center for
6 Elephant Conservation?

7 A. No.

8 Q. Do you know anything about Ringling's
9 medical care regarding its elephants?

10 A. No.

11 Q. Do you know anything about the way that
12 juvenile elephants are cared for at the CEC? When I
13 say CEC, I'm referring to the Center for Elephant
14 Conservation.

15 A. Again, only what they say about themselves
16 and their own method of care.

17 Q. Which is?

18 A. Which is that things like forced separation
19 of babies from mothers are standard operating
20 procedure. As I understand it, that is their
21 policy.

22 Q. Going back, generally speaking, for all of
23 the knowledge that you have regarding Ringling's
24 treatment of elephants, you cited two different
25 sources of that information.

1 Mexico City.

2 Q. Did you also attend Ringling performances
3 at any of those three times?

4 A. I have, yes.

5 Q. Let's take them one at a time.

6 When you saw the offloading of elephants
7 in Washington, DC, did you also attend the
8 performance?

9 A. Yes, I did.

10 Q. And the same question for Sacramento. Did
11 you also attend the performance?

12 A. No, I do not think so.

13 Q. And in Mexico City, did you attend the
14 performance?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Did you witness the elephants after the
17 show in Washington, DC?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And in Sacramento?

20 A. No.

21 Q. And in Mexico City?

22 A. No.

23 Q. So you witnessed the elephants after the
24 show only in Washington, DC?

25 A. Yes.

1 A. Yes. I remember there was a lot of concern
2 about an elephant that was limping, and I remember
3 local humane people taking note of that and trying
4 to ascertain what elephant it was who was limping,
5 and whether or not something should be done about
6 that.

7 Q. You said that there was hooking. Can you
8 describe that, please?

9 A. You know, with a bullhook, with a hooked
10 end, prodding with that, and hooking and moving
11 and directing an elephant with a stick.

12 Q. Was there anything else that you could
13 specifically say regarding that treatment of
14 elephants during the offloading the first
15 time in Washington, DC?

16 A. No, nothing more.

17 Q. What about the second time you saw the
18 elephants being offloaded in Washington, DC?

19 A. Same.

20 Q. There was the same guiding of the elephants
21 off the...

22 MS. MEYER: I object to that question;
23 putting words in the mouth of the witness. She
24 didn't say anything about guiding.

25 A. They're not guided. They are prodded and

1 A. No.

2 Q. So there are no benefits that accrue from
3 having other elephant populations in North America?

4 MS. MEYER: Again, I object to the use
5 of the term population.

6 Q. Again, there are no benefits to elephants
7 in North America from Ringling's...

8 A. From what I know of Ringling's breeding
9 programs, they produce babies that are separated
10 from their mothers under harsh circumstances, and
11 they're put on the road in difficult conditions and
12 forced to perform unnatural kinds of tricks and
13 behaviors; and I can't see any benefit in that
14 to them, or any other benefits.

15 Q. So you're saying that there are no benefits
16 to any elephants, either in North America or Asia or
17 Europe or anywhere else, as a result of Ringling's
18 breeding program?

19 A. No.

20 Q. Have you ever witnessed Asian elephants in
21 the wild?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Have you ever witnessed Asian elephants in
24 government-owned sanctuaries in Asia?

25 A. No.

1 had any contact with activists over the years?

2 A. Other than that? Other than all that? No,
3 I don't think so.

4 Q. Have you ever volunteered for any other
5 groups?

6 A. I don't think so.

7 Q. Have you ever had any contact with the
8 Animal Liberation Front?

9 A. No.

10 Q. How about Stop Hunting and Animal Cruelty?

11 A. No.

12 Q. Have you ever held any positions with any
13 other animal-rights groups other than Greenpeace,
14 PETA, In Defense of Animals, Friends of Animals,
15 PAWS and the African Elephant Conservation Trust?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Have you ever served as a member of the
18 board of directors for any other groups?

19 A. I'm currently on the board of directors of
20 In Defense of Animals.

21 Q. Have you ever served on the board of
22 directors for any other group in the past?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And which group?

25 A. I was on the PETA board in the 1980s for a

1 brief time.

2 Q. And you said in the 1980s. Can you be more
3 specific than that?

4 A. Again, you've got the dates here. The
5 dates, I don't know. The dates, whether it went
6 into the 1990's or not...

7 Q. Just generally, what you can remember.

8 A. I think it was all in the eighties, and
9 probably in maybe a three-year period.

10 Q. And when did your tenure on the board of
11 directors for In Defense of Animals begin and end?
12 I'm sorry; you said that's current, so, when did it
13 begin?

14 A. Around about 1990, I believe.

15 Q. You mentioned that you acted as a
16 consultant for PAWS. Have you served as a
17 consultant for any other groups?

18 A. Well, sometimes, does she mean...

19 MR. COLLIER: Do you mean just animal
20 groups?

21 MS. DALTON: Yes, animal groups.

22 A. No.

23 MS. DALTON: If we could go off the
24 record for one moment.

25 VIDEOGRAPHER: 12:44, going off the

1 Q. Yes; I'm excluding the present situation.

2 A. So you know that, yes. I thought you meant
3 before this case, and before this day.

4 Q. Let's just make sure we're on the...

5 MR. COLLIER: Let me be really clear.

6 PAWS originally brought a lawsuit
7 around this stuff so there was an attorney-client
8 relationship there at a time when she was a PAWS
9 consultant. She assumed you were excluding that,
10 and I understood that to be true as well.

11 MS. DALTON: That's what I was excluding
12 as well.

13 MR. COLLIER: That's the only one.

14 MS. DALTON: Okay.

15 Q. Have you had any other contacts with
16 lawyers from Ms. Meyer's firm?

17 A. No.

18 Q. Do you know Mr. Tom Rider?

19 A. Yes. I have met Tom Rider.

20 Q. When did you first meet him?

21 A. You don't want a date, do you? You do?

22 Q. As close a date as you can, to describe the
23 circumstances surrounding your first meeting with
24 him.

25 A. I do not remember my first meeting with

1 him. I know that I have seen him at PAWS, and not
2 recently. Certainly not recently. When did I last
3 see Tom Rider?

4 PAWS, probably the hearing on the
5 federal elephant bill that Tom testified for.

6 Q. The first time you ever saw Tom was at the
7 hearing?

8 A. No, but I don't remember the first time I
9 saw him.

10 I have seen him at the PAWS office
11 there; or not at the office, even. I have seen
12 him at the PAWS conference in Sacramento, and I have
13 seen him at the federal hearing. The first time
14 I ever saw him, I don't know.

15 Q. Do you remember the general circumstances
16 surrounding the first time you ever met him?

17 A. Tom was in England. He had gotten
18 publicity in England, I'm not really clear on
19 whether it was at Chipperfield Elephant or what;
20 but he had gotten publicity about an elephant-
21 welfare issue in the UK.

22 When he came to this country he was
23 directed to contact PAWS, which was a group that
24 was doing very-high-profile elephant-protection
25 work; and Tom contacted PAWS, and I believe

1 I took the call.

2 So, Tom was told to contact PAWS, and
3 contacted PAWS; and that's the best of my memory.

4 Q. Do you know who directed him to call PAWS?

5 A. No, I don't.

6 Q. What did Mr. Rider tell you about his time
7 at Ringling Brothers?

8 A. I don't think he ever told me. Do you mean
9 just told me personally?

10 Q. You personally; and I'll get to...

11 A. I know about what Tom says about his
12 time at Ringling, because I've heard him speak
13 at the hearing, and I've heard him speak in public
14 presentations. So, he's very articulate about what
15 he saw.

16 Q. But you've never had any specific
17 conversations with him regarding his time at
18 Ringling?

19 A. No. If you're talking what he saw in terms
20 of abuse and what he's contributing to this case,
21 no.

22 Q. Have you ever had any conversations with
23 him regarding the presentation of animals in
24 circuses generally?

25 A. Probably very generally, just inasmuch as

1 that elephants should not be there.

2 I recall Tom saying to me things like
3 I would never do that, I would never hook him, they
4 always told me to but I wouldn't do it, things like
5 that.

6 So I know his position, where he was
7 coming from; but I didn't know a lot of specifics in
8 terms of chapter and verse and time and place and
9 things like that.

10 Q. Do you know what Mr. Rider's position was
11 while he was at Ringling Brothers?

12 A. What his actual title was?

13 Q. Yes.

14 A. No.

15 Q. Do you know what his responsibilities were?

16 A. I know what I think they were, but I'm not
17 sure...

18 He's one of those people who were
19 supposed to be there with the bullhook and prod
20 them and keep them in line and all that.

21 Q. Did Mr. Rider ask PAWS for any financial
22 support?

23 A. That I don't know.

24 Q. Did he ask PAWS for a job?

25 A. Did he ask PAWS for a job. I don't know.