

Reported by: Paul Brincau, MBIVR, ACR

24

25

1	Videotaped deposition of Sacha Houcke, taken on
2	behalf of the parties at 47, avenue Georges Mandel,
3	75116, Paris, France, on Monday, January 7, 2008, at
4	1:12 p.m. before Paul Brincau, ACR, pursuant to
5	notice.
6	APPEARANCES:
7	For the Plaintiffs: (Present via videoconference)
9	MEYER GLITZENSTEIN & CRYSTAL
10	By: Katherine A. Meyer, Esq. 1601 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Suite 700
11	Washington, D.C. 20009 - U.S.A. Telephone: (202) 588-5206
12	E-mail: KatherineMeyer@meyerglitz.com
13 14	For the Defendant:
15	FULBRIGHT & JAWORSKI LLP By: Lisa Zeiler Joiner, Esq.
16	Market Square 801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20004-2623 - U.S.A.
17	Telephone: (202) 662-0200 E-mail: ljoiner@fulbright.com
18	- and -
19	
20	HUGHES HUBBARD & REED LLP By: Marc-Olivier Langlois, Esq.
21	47, avenue Georges Mandel 75116 Paris - France
22	Telephone: +33 1 44 05 80 13 E-mail: langlois@hugheshubbard.com
23	ALSO PRESENT:
24	Julie Strauss, In-house Counsel, Feld Entertainment
25	Stephen Faigenbaum, Videographer

1	Monday, January 7, 2008, Paris, France
2	
3	
4	Sacha Houcke,
5	having been duly sworn,
6	was examined and testified as follows:
7	
8	EXAMINATION
9	
10	BY MS. JOINER:
<mark>11</mark>	Q. Mr. Houcke, would you give us your full
12	name?
13	A. Sacha Houcke.
14	Q. Okay. Is there any reason today why you
15	could not testify truthfully and completely?
16	A. No.
17	Q. Okay. And at any time, if you do not
18	understand what I am asking, do you agree to stop me
19	for clarification?
20	A. Yes.
21	Q. What time period did you work for Ringling
22	Brothers Circus?
23	A. From November 2000 to November 2006.
24	Q. What was your title?
25	A. Animal Care Director and Trainer.

tell me?

21

22

23

24

25

A. From the Blue Unit?

Q. Yes --

A. No.

-- I will give the names of them. Are you Q.

familiar with an elephant named Karen?

```
1
       And now in France it is obligated, if you show
2
       animals, to have a licence, and I just took it
3
       6 months ago.
                What is the difference between elephant
4
            0.
       handlers and elephant trainers?
5
6
                The trainer of the elephant teach the
7
       elephants, and the handler is the people who helps.
8
            Ο.
                And while you were at Ringling Brothers did
9
       you do both handling and training of the elephants?
10
                I did the training and handling, yes.
11
                Which elephants were on the Red Unit while
            Q.
       you worked there?
12
13
            Α.
                Asia, Donca, Luna, Baby, Assam, Banana,
       Sarah, Toby, Banco, Siam.
14
15
            Q.
                Do elephants vocalize?
16
                Yes, they do, sometimes.
17
                And why do they do that?
            Q.
                When they speak between each other. And
18
19
       then if they are happy and they want to play. And
20
       then if they know somebody and you talk to them, they
21
       will talk back to you.
22
                What kind of behavior does an elephant
23
       exhibit if it is happy?
24
                MS. MEYER: Objection to form.
       111
25
```

## EUROPEAN COURT REPORTING www.EuropeanCourtReporting.com

```
Did anyone else discuss your staying with
 1
            Q.
 2
       Feld Entertainment?
 3
            Α.
                 No.
                 Were you informed by any Feld Entertainment
 4
            Q.
 5
       official that your contract will not be renewed?
 6
            A.
                 No.
 7
                Did you have any discussions with anyone,
       other than Mr. Holst at Feld Entertainment concerning
 8
9
       your leaving the Red Unit in November 2006?
10
            A.
                No.
11
                You did not discuss your leaving with anyone
12
       else on the Red Unit?
13
                No. My contract was with Mr. Holst, and I
            A.
       discussed my contract with Mr. Holst.
14
15
            Q. I am asking you whether or not you discussed
16
       with any of the other employee the fact that you were
17
       leaving the Red Unit in November 2006?
18
            A.
                Everybody knew I was leaving, yes.
19
            Q.
                 I am asking you if you had any conversation
20
       with anyone about the fact that you were leaving in
21
       November 2006?
22
            Α.
                 No.
23
            0.
                 No?
24
            Α.
                 No.
25
                 Mr. Houcke, you worked at the Red Unit for
            Q.
```

Feld Entertainment in November 2006 have anything to 1 do at all with allegations that you were mistreating 2 animals at the Red Unit? 3 Α. No. 4 Did the termination of employment with Feld 5 Entertainment (in November 2006 have anything to do 6 7 with allegations (that you were too aggressive (to the 8 animals? 9 A. No. 10 Did your termination of employment at Feld 11 Entertainment in November 2006 have anything to do 12 with allegations that you were mistreating animals 13 had been publicly disseminated? 14 No. I left on my own decision. **A**. 15 Did you ever receive a written reprimand 16 with respect to your treatment of any of the animals 17 on the Red Unit? 18 Α. Never. 19 Did you ever receive an oral reprimand with Q. 20 respect to your treatment of any of the animals on the Red Unit? 21 22 Α. No. 23 You were never reprimanded by anyone working Q. 24 at Feld Entertainment concerning your treatment of 25 any of the animals during your tenure at Feld

1 No, not that I remember. Α. You worked for Mr. Gaipo for 5 years; is 2 0. 3 that correct? 4 Α. Yes. 5 And what was your title when you worked for 6 Mr. Gaipo? 7 Director of Animal Care and Trainer and 8 Presenter. 9 Is it correct to say that you were the head 10 of care of elephants during the time your worked for Mr. Gaipo? 11 12 Yes, elephants and horses and exotics. 13 Q. But Mr. Gaipo did not come to you and tell 14 you that he was leaving the Red Unit when he left? 15 Α. No. 16 Q. Is that correct? 17 Yes, it is correct. Α. 18 Do you remain on good terms with Feld 19 Entertainment even though you are not employed there 20 anymore? 21 **A**. Yes, I think so. 22 If you wanted to return to work there, do 23 you think you have an opportunity to secure 24 employment there? 25 A. Maybe. I do not know yet. It is a good

1 place to work for. Do you have any plans to return to Feld 2 Entertainment in the future? 3 For now, no. 4 **A**. At any time in the future? 5 No idea, I do not know. A. 6 7 **O**. Have you ever discussed the possibility of vour return to work for Feld Entertainment? 8 9 A. No. 10 Q. You never discussed that with anyone? No. 11 A. Did you discuss with anyone when you left 12 Q. Feld Entertainment the possibility that you could 13 come back? 14 15 Mr. Feld said I could come back any time I 16 want. 17 Q. And you mentioned a woman named Carey Coleman. Who is she? 18 19 Veterinary technician. A. 20 0. And did she work on the Red Unit when you 21 worked on the Red Unit? 22 Α. Yes, she did. 23 Q. What time period did she work on the Red 24 Unit? 25 Excuse me? A.

trailer, and the 2 last years I travelled with the 1 2 train. 3 Q. Did you ever have an opportunity to see how the elephants on the Blue Unit are maintained on the 4 trains when they travel from city to city? 5 No, I never went to see it. 6 7 And it is true that the elephants are 8 chained on the train as soon as they are loaded onto 9 the train; is that correct? 10 It is correct, and the reason why they are 11 chained --12 Excuse me, there is no question pending. I Q. 13 did not ask you the reason. 14 MS. JOINER: You are interrupting his 15 answer. MS. MEYER: I only asked him one question 16 17 and --18 MS. JOINER: He is answering that question 19 and you cut him off. 20 BY MS. MEYER: 21 Q. Okay, I will repeat the question. The 22 question was, the elephants are chained as soon as 23 they are loaded on the train; is that correct? 24 It is correct. And the reason why they are 25 chained is like a safety belt, that they stay in

## 1 their place. 2 Q. It is true elephants are sometimes loaded on the train several hours before the train actually 3 leaves a venue for the next venue; isn't that 4 correct? 5 6 It depends how fast the train is ready to 7 leave, yes. And it's also true that the elephants are 8 9 sometimes loaded on the train the night before the 10 train leaves a venue for the next venue; is that 11 correct? 12 No. The train leaves always in the night or 13 early in the morning. It's true though that the elephants are 14 Q. 15 sometimes (loaded onto) the (train) -- (strike (that.) When the train arrives at a new venue, it is 16 17 true the elephants are sometimes left on the train 18 for some period of time before they are unloaded; is that correct? 19 20 As soon as the train is in place, we unload 21 the elephants. 22 Well, isn't it true that sometimes you have 23 to wait for the police to show up before the 24 elephants could be unloaded? 25 A. That can happen.

```
1
            Q. And if Mr. Vargas testified that you made
 2
       the elephants at this time hold the position of being
 3
       down on the four legs and trunks held up for 5-to-10
       minutes, would that be incorrect testimony?
 4
 5
                MS. JOINER: Objection to form.
       Argumentative. Misstates the testimony.
 6
 7
                THE WITNESS: That was a bit long. Maybe
       5-minutes maximum.
 8
 9
       BY MS. MEYER:
                Okay. You said 30 seconds before --
10
            Ο.
11
                No, you asked me the leg up and the trunk
12
       up, not laying down. You asked me before to put
13
       their leg up and the trunk up, not laying down with
14
       the trunk up.
15
                Did you make the elephants put their trunk
16
       up when they were laying down on all four legs?
17
           A.
                Yes.
18
                How long did you make the elephants Baby and
           Q.
       Banco hold position of lying down on all four legs
19
20
       with their trunks up in the air?
21
            A.
                About 5 minutes.
22
           0.
                Okay. Could it have been as long as 10
23
       minutes?
24
                I don't remember, but I do not think so.
           A.
25
                You don't remember?
           Q.
```

1 A. No. It seems very long, 10 minutes. 2 And do you agree that one of the elephants 3 was not immediately obeying the command to lie 4 down --5 **A**. Exactly. -- when you were disciplining the elephants 6 7 for getting into the fight? A. Exactly. 8 And the elephant who would not obey your 9 Q. 10 command (immediately was Banco; is that correct? 11 A Correct. 12 And is it your testimony that you never hit 13 either Banco or Baby with a bullhook during the 14 incident when you were disciplining them for getting into a fight; is that correct? 15 16 Correct. Α. 17 But you did testify that you tapped Banco on 18 the head and behind the ear with your guide to make 19 her lie down; is that correct? 20 A. Not on the head, on the top of her back. 21 So you do agree that you tapped Banco on the 22 top of her head with your quide to make her lie down, to make her lie down during this incident; is that 23 24 correct? 25 MS. JOINER: Objection. Misstates the

It depends. 1 A. 2 0. Was it a daily occurrence? 3 Α. Could have been. 4 And is it your testimony that you never made Q. 5 an elephant bleed as a result of hitting it with a 6 bullhook when you worked on the Red Unit? 7 A. Exactly. 8 So if anyone testified that they saw you hit 9 an elephant with a bullhook and then saw a bloody 10 wound on that elephant, they would be mistaken or 11 lying; is that correct? 12 Α. Mistaken. 13 MS. JOINER: Objection. Argumentative. 14 Calls for speculation. 15 BY MS. MEYER: 16 Sorry. When you worked on the Red Unit, did Q. 17 you ever hit an elephant with a whip? 18 Α. No. 19 Did you carry a whip when you worked on the Q. 20 Red Unit? 21 Α. No. 22 You never used a whip at all when you worked 23 on the Red Unit? 24 No, not with the elephants. 25 Did you use the whip with the horses? Q.

## EUROPEAN COURT REPORTING www.EuropeanCourtReporting.com

109

```
1
           Q.
                While you worked at the Red Unit,
 2
       Mr. Houcke, did you ever bop an elephant with a
 3
       bullhook?
 4
           A.
                No.
 5
           Q.
                Did you ever whack an elephant with a
 6
       bullhook?
 7
           A.
                No.
 8
           Q.
                Did you ever grab the skin of an elephant
       behind its ear with a hook end of the bullhook and
 9
       pull the elephant towards you?
10
11
           A.
                No.
12
            Q.
                You never did that?
13
                I just touched them towards me, but not
            A.
14
       behind the ear. If I did something like that it
       would be under the chin, or I take the guide, I put
15
16
       it under the chin and pull the elephant to me.
17
           Q.
                And you would put the hook and the bullhook
18
       in the skin of the elephant under the chin?
19
                Not in the skin.
           A.
20
           Q.
                I am sorry?
21
           A.
               Not in the skin. It goes around. It
22
       doesn't go into the skin.
23
                What end of the bullhook would you use to
           Q.
24
       bring the elephant towards you, under his chin?
25
                I would use the bent side to pull it to me.
           A.
```

EUROPEAN COURT REPORTING
www.EuropeanCourtReporting.com

```
Q. The hooked end of the bullhook?
1
2
            Α.
                Yes.
3
              Why did you use the hooked end of the
           Q.
       bullhook?
4
5
               I use the guide because it's like a line on
       the dog. If the elephant sees the line, then he
6
7
       comes to me, I am holding on the line.
8
           Q.
                There is no hooked end on the line for a
       dog, is there?
9
10
                Yes, but some dogs, they have this collar
           A.
11
       that you pull on it and it chokes them; it does not
12
       matter.
13
                But I am asking you why you use the hooked
           Q.
14
       end as opposed to the other end of the bullhook if
15
       you did not hook the skin of the elephants?
16
                If I had done badly, I would have wounded
           A.
17
       the elephant; but he was not wounded.
18
           Q.
                Have you ever seen any handler at the Red
19
       Unit hit an elephant with a bullhook?
20
           A.
                No.
21
           Q.
                Have you ever seen any handler of the Red
22
       Unit bop an elephant with a bullhook?
23
           A. No, they were not allowed. We would not
24
       allow it.
25
           Q.
                If you had seen a handler at the Red Unit
```

1 Yes, to make her come towards me. Α. 2 0. Do you remember doing that? 3 Α. It could have happened. 4 Ο. How often would that have happened? 5 Α. No idea. 6 And if you had touched her behind the ear 7 with a bullhook, would it be with the hooked end of 8 the bullhook? 9 It depends. Could have been. 10 Q. It could have been? 11 Α. Yes. 12 And did you ever cause Tonka to bleed behind 13 the ear as a result of the use of the bullhook behind 14 her ear? 15 I don't recall. Α. 16 Q. You might have done? 17 Α. I don't remember. 18 Q. But you might have? 19 MS. JOINER: Objection. Argumentative. 20 Asked and answered. 21 THE WITNESS: I suppose so, but I don't 22 think so. 23 BY MS. MEYER: 24 Q. But it's possible, you said?

It's a possibility.

25

A.

1 0. There wouldn't be a show every single day, 2 was there, when you worked on the Red Unit? 3 A. Nearly every day. 4 There were some days when there was no show; Q. 5 is that correct? 6 A. Correct. On the day when there was no show, when 7 Q. 8 would the elephant be chained for the night? 9 Yes, every day they were chained up for the 10 night. 11 0. What time would that be, on a day when there 12 was no show, what time where they chained? 13 At night around 9/10 -- 9 o'clock/10 o'clock 14 at night until the next morning. 15 And you said that they were on chains when Q. 16 they were being bathed in the morning; is that 17 correct? 18 **A**. Yes. 19 And Mr. Gaipo, when he was the unit, General 20 Manager for the Red Unit would have had an 21 opportunity when he worked during 2000 to 2005 to see the elephants on chains when they were being bathed; 22 23 is that correct. 24 Α. Yes. 25 Q. And he would have had an opportunity to see

1 6 years that you worked for the Red Unit? 2 A. Yes, about. 3 And when he came to visit the Red Unit, 4 would he have had an opportunity to see how the 5 elephant handlers handled the elephants? 6 Yes, he walked around, always walked around, 7 yes. Q. And would he have had an opportunity the see 8 9 the elephants on chains? 10 Maybe. I don't know. It depends what time 11 of the day he came. 12 And did he have an opportunity to see you 13 handle the elephants when you worked on the Red Unit? 14 Α. Yes. 15 Did he have an opportunity to see Mr. Vargas 16 handle the elephants when Mr. Vargas worked on the 17 Red Unit? 18 Α. Yes. 19 Did he have an opportunity to see Jimmy 20 Strickland work with the elephants when Jimmy 21 Strickand --22 Α. Yes. 23 Q. -- worked on the Red Unit? 24 Α. Yes. 25 Q. Did he have an opportunity to see Pista

Α. November 2006. 1 2 November 2006? Q. 3 Or October; when we were in Boston, yes, 4 2006. 5 0. And what did Mr. Feld say to you? 6 He thanked me for the work I did for him 7 over the years, and told me that I could -- I thanked 8 him too for giving me the work, that I enjoyed 9 working for him, and then he said to me I could come 10 back any time I wanted. 11 And did Mr. Feld, during that conversation, Q. 12 say anything about allegations that had been made 13 about your mistreating any of the animals on the Red 14 Unit? 15 **A**. No. 16 Has Ms. Julie Strauss ever had any a 17 conversation with you about allegations that you have 18 mistreated animals on the Red Unit? 19 Α. No. 20 0. Do you know who Jim Antok is? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Who is he? Q. 23 He was -- I do not know -- a man from the Α. 24 direction.

## EUROPEAN COURT REPORTING www.EuropeanCourtReporting.com

25

Q.

I am sorry?

discuss with you allegations that you had mistreated 1 2 any of the elephants on the Red Unit? 3 No, not that I recall. Q. And you said you never mistreated animals on 4 5 the Red Unit; is that correct? A. Correct. 6 7 So if one of your superiors had a 8 conversation with you about allegations that you 9 mistreated the animals on the Red Unit you would 10 probably remember it; wouldn't you? 11 Α. Sorry? 12 MS. JOINER: Objection. Calls for 13 speculation. 14 BY MS. MEYER: 15 If one of your superiors had had a conversation with you about allegations that you had 16 17 mistreated animals on the Red Unit, you probably 18 remember it; wouldn't you? 19 MS. JOINER: Objection. Calls for 20 speculation. 21 THE WITNESS: Maybe. It depends. 22 BY MS. MEYER: 23 Q. Why wouldn't you remember it? 24 Α. It depends. 25 MS. JOINER: Objection. Calls for