

Feld Entertainment, Inc.'s Responses and Counter Designations
FEI Exhibit 322A

Troy J. Metzler

July 25, 2006

Washington, DC

Page 1

UNITED DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE)

PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO

ANIMALS, et al.) Case No.

Plaintiffs,) 1:03-cv-02006

-vs-) (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM &)

BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,)

Defendant.)

Tuesday, July 25, 2006

Washington, D.C.

Video Deposition of TROY J. METZLER called for examination by counsel for the Plaintiff, pursuant to notice, held at the offices of Meyer Glitzenstein & Crystal, 1601 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Washington D.C., beginning at 9:35 a.m., before Karen N. McConnell, CSR-RMR-CRR, a notary public in and for the District of Columbia, when were present on behalf of the respective parties:



Alderson Reporting Company

1111 14th Street , NW Suite 400 1-800-FOR-DEPO

	Page 2
1	APPEARANCES:
2	On behalf of the Plaintiffs:
3	KATHERINE A. MEYER, ESQ.
4	KIMBERLY OCKENE, ESQ.
5	Meyer Glitzenstein & Crystal
6	1601 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
7	Suite 700
8	Washington D.C. 20009
9	(202) 588-5206
10	katherinemeyer@meyerglitz.com
11	
12	On behalf of the Defendants:
13	LISA ZEILER JOINER, ESQ.
14	MICHELLE C. PARDO, ESQ.
15	Fulbright & Jaworski
16	801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
17	Washington, D.C. 20004-2623
18	(202) 662-0200
19	ljoiner@fulbright.com.
20	Also present: Tracy Silverman, Animal Welfare
21	Institute
22	Dustin Lavallee, Videographer

```
Page 6
 1
      subpoena that was issued to him on June 8th,
      2006, which I would like to have marked as
      Exhibit 1.
             (Metzler Deposition Exhibit Number 1 was
             marked for identification and attached to
 6
             the transcript.)
7
                MS. MEYER: There was a difference of
      opinion between the parties as to whether or not
9
      Mr. Metzler would have to be made available for
10
      a deposition pursuant only to a Notice of
11
      Deposition under Rule 30, or whether or not a
12
      subpoena would be required. And in any event,
13
      to resolve that difference of opinion, the
14
      plaintiffs issued a subpoena to Mr. Metzler, and
15
      the counsel for defendants agreed to accept that
16
      subpoena on behalf of him, and he is here now
17
      and ready to be deposed.
18
      BY MS. MEYER:
19
                Mr. Metzler, would you state your full
20
      name, please, for the record.
21
                Troy J. Metzler.
           Α.
22
                And how old are you?
           Ο.
```

		Page 36
1	Q.	And is that a female?
2	Α.	Yes.
3	Q.	Do you remember when she arrived?
4	Α.	No.
5	Q.	And Rajah, Sheena, and Tova, were they
6	Asian ele	phants?
7	A.	Yes.
8	Q.	All three of them?
9	A.	Yes.
10	Q.	And were they adult elephants?
11	A.	Yes.
12	Q.	Were there any other elephants that
13	you worke	d with when you worked with Bobby Moore
14	in Michig	an?
15	A.	No.
16	Q.	Okay. And when you said that you
17	received	training from Mr. Jones and Mr. Moore
18	in how to	make the elephants do their routines,
19	how much	training did you receive in terms of
20	hours?	
21	A.	That's a hard answer. That would be
22	with prac	tice every day, exercise every day.

	Page 37
1	It's a 45-acre farm. So it was throughout the
2	day we lived and slept elephants.
3	Q. And what was the routine for these
4	elephants?
5	A. We would start off in the morning
6	around 7:30; go in and exercise.
7	Q. I'm sorry. I actually meant what was
8	their performing routine. You mentioned earlier
9	that the various tricks that the elephants
10	did in the entity that you worked with in
11	Canada, so I was wondering what kind of tricks
12	did these elephants do?
13	A. The basic tricks like the other
14	elephants.
15	Q. Anything different than the other
16	elephants?
17	A. No, not really.
18	Q. Now, with respect to the four young
19	elephants, Tonka, Luna, Smokey, and Roman?
20	A. Yes.
21	Q. Where did they come from, do you know?
22	A. Busch Gardens.

```
Page 43
 1
      calculation, about eight years?
 2
                 About that, yes.
           Α.
3
                 Did your job duties change during the
4
      course of those eight years at all?
5
           Α.
                 With my experience, yes.
 6
                 Can you explain chronologically how
            0.
7
           job duties changed?
8
                 I -- I can't recall all of them, but
9
      just I -- we went on the road and started
10
      performing with the elephants.
11
                 So at some point you became an actual
12
      performer with the elephants?
13
                 Yes.
           Α.
14
                 And you would be responsible for
15
      having them go through their routine?
16
                 Yes.
           Α.
17
           Q.
                 And how many years did you do that?
18
                 I was three years into the job when I
           Α.
19
      started.
20
                 When you started performing with the
           Q.
21
      animals?
22
                 Yes, and driving a truck.
           Α.
```

			Page 56
1		Α.	In Canada.
2		Q.	When did Smokey Jones give you a copy
3	of th	at bo	ook?
4		Α.	I'm not very good with my years.
5		Q.	Would it have been soon after you met
6	him?		
7		Α.	Yes.
8		Q.	And did he give you that book as part
9	of yo	ur tı	raining in how to train elephants to
10	perfo	rm ir	circuses?
11		A.	No. It's not something that you can
12	read	in a	book.
13		Q.	Okay. Why did he give you a book?
14		A.	Because I'm an elephant man, and to be
15	an el	ephar	nt man you collect anything and
16	every	thing	g that has to do with elephant history
17	and w	here	they come from, and what they do with
18	the,,	and	their past, and so forth.
19		Q.	Did he give you any other written
20	mater	ials	
21		Α.	Not that I recall.
22		Q.	Okay. And as far as you know, did Mr.

```
Page 58
1
                        I'm just trying to find out if
                 Okay.
2
      you had any tangible materials like books,
3
      training videos, anything like that that taught
4
      you or supplemented your training in how to
5
      train elephants to do any of these tricks
6
      that --
7
                No.
           Α.
8
                -- that you were doing in the circus
           0.
9
      with them?
10
                No. There really aren't any books
           Α.
11
      like that.
12
                 Okay. And I'm just -- we are still up
           0.
13
      to the point where you left Bobby Moore's?
14
                Right.
           Α.
15
                All right. Where did you go after you
           Ο.
16
      left Bobby Moore's?
17
           Α.
                 I stayed there for a year.
18
                Doing what?
           Ο.
19
                 Taking care of the elephants until
           Α.
20
      they could be transported to Florida.
21
                      So that would have been '91 to
           0.
                 Okay.
22
      '92, is that correct?
```

```
Page 63
 1
      different from Asian elephants?
 2
                 Where they come from.
           Α.
 3
           0.
                 Right.
                 I mean, they are all different.
5
      one has got a different personality. Its just
      like two different dogs, I guess. You know,
7
      they are --
                        Is the skin of an African
           0.
                 Okay.
      elephant similar to the skin of an Asian
10
      elephant?
11
                 Similar, yes.
           Α.
12
                 And are they both very sensitive?
            0.
13
                 Yes. Like people. Some are very
           Α.
14
      sensitive and some aren't sensitive at all.
15
                 And are both African and Asian social
           Ο.
16
      animals?
17
           Α.
                 Yes.
18
                 They like to be with other elephants?
           Ο.
19
           Α.
                 Yes.
20
                 And are both African and Asian
           0.
21
      intelligent animals?
22
                 Just like people, some are very
```

```
Page 67
 1
      from anyone else?
 2
                 Not that I know of.
            Α.
 3
                 Did Ms. Jacob also train any of the
            Q.
      elephants?
            Α.
                 She would assist, yes
                 Do you know where she received her
            Ο.
      training from?
            Α.
                 From Pancho Magana.
                 How do you know that?
            Q.
10
                 It was his girlfriend when I was a
            Α.
11
      child.
12
                 Add when Feld Entertainment acquired
      the Bobby Moore elephants, did you say that Reba
13
14
      also went to Feld Entertainment?
15
            Α.
                 Yes.
16
                 And how long did you work for Jacob
17
      Barrada?
18
                 About a year.
            Α.
19
                 And, again, your duties were what?
            0.
20
                 Took three on the road performing,
            Α.
21
      animal husbandry, all around care.
22
                 And what kind of tricks or routines
```

```
Page 68
1
      did those elephants do?
2
                 Long mount, spindles.
            Α.
3
                 What does that mean?
            0.
4
                 Foot on one spindle like a -- well, a
            Α.
5
      spindle.
                 It's a pyramid where their foot goes
6
      on top, and then the rest of their body turns.
7
                 Foot on the ground on top of what?
8
                 Of a pyramid, a small pyramid with an
            Α.
9
                                                I'm
      axle on top. It is hard to describe.
10
      sorry.
11
                 No, you are doing a good job. So that
12
      a foot goes on the pyramid --
13
            Α.
                 Yes.
14
                 -- that rotates?
            Q.
15
            Α.
                 Yes.
16
                 And then?
            0.
17
                 They pick up one foot and their back
            Α.
18
      end turns.
19
                        Any other tricks or routines?
            Q.
                 Okay.
20
                 Lay down, sit up, wave hankies.
            Α.
21
                 Wave hankies?
            Q.
22
            Α.
                 Yes.
```

		Page 69
1	Q.	What can you describe that?
2	A.	They take a hanky and wave it.
3	Q.	Take it in their foot?
4	A .	Truck.
5	Q.	In their trunk?
6	Α.	They can't pick things up with their
7	feet.	
8	Q.	Okay. Any other tricks?
9	Α.	Yeah. There's quite a few, a
10	harmonica	•
11	Q.	What's that? I mean, I know what a
12	harmonica	is, but what's the trick?
13	Α.	They play it.
14	Q.	How do they do that?
15	Α.	With their nose.
16	Q.	Do they pick it up?
17	Α.	Yes.
18	Q.	With their trunk?
19	Α.	Yes.
20	Q.	And play the harmonica?
21	Α.	Yes.
22	Q.	Did you teach them how to do that?

```
Page 73
 1
                 And were you employed at all during
 2
      those nine months?
 3
            Α.
                 No.
4
                 And then where did you go for
5
      employment?
 6
                 African Lion Safari in Cambridge,
7
      Ontario.
8
                 And that's Charlie Gray's place?
            Q.
9
            Α.
                 Yes.
10
                 Cambridge, Ontario? Is that what you
            Q.
11
      said?
12
                 Yes.
            Α.
13
                 And what were your duties there?
            Q.
14
                 Well, I started off by going over to
            Α.
15
      Israel to pick up two young Asian elephants for
16
      him.
17
                 Why were the two Asian elephants in
            0.
18
      Israel?
19
                 They belonged to the Ramat-Gan Zoo and
            Α.
20
      Safari Park.
21
                 How do you spell that?
            Q.
22
                 I don't recall.
            Α.
```

Γ	
	Page 74
Q.	Can you say it again?
(A.	Ramat-Gan, which is in Tel Aviv.
Q .	Okay. Charlie Gray had purchased
these t	wo elephants?
5 A.	Yes.
6 Q.	And what is Charlie Gray's lion
⁷ safari?	What kind of an operation is that?
8 A.	It is a drive-through safari and park.
9 Q.	Do you know how many acres it is?
¹⁰ A.	1200.
11 Q.	And do you know what kind of animals
12 he has?	Or let's talk about the time that you
went to	work there. What kind of animals did he
¹⁴ have?	
¹⁵ A.	He doesn't own all of the animals. He
owns th	e two. He had owned the two Asians at
17 the tim	ne.
¹⁸ Q.	Okay.
¹⁹ A.	And the park owner owned the rest.
20 Q.	Who was the park owner?
²¹ A.	James Daley.
22 Q.	So James Daley actually owned the

Alderson Reporting Company

	Page 77
1	there?
2	A. Yes.
3	Q. How many other elephants were there?
4	A. I want to say eight.
5	Q. Were they all Asians?
6	A. Yes.
7	Q. Were they adults?
8	A. Four of them.
9	Q. Four adults and four young elephants?
10	A. That's what I recall, yes.
11	Q. Okay. And did as far as you know,
12	did Mr. Gray make an arrangement with Mr. Daley
13	to allow Mr. Gray to go buy these two elephants
14	to add to the herd?
15	A. Yes.
16	Q. But those were the only two elephants
17	that Mr. Gray actually owned?
18	A. At the time, yes.
19	Q. Okay. How long did you work for him?
20	A. Oh, until '98, late '98.
21	Q. Okay. So from '93 to '98 you worked
22	for Mr. Gray?

```
Page 78
1
                 Yes.
 2
                 And did you have a title while you
 3
      were there?
           Α.
                 Assistant superintendent.
                 Assistant superintendent.
           0.
 6
                 Of elephants.
           Α.
                 Okay. And did you have that title for
           Ο.
 8
      the entire time that you worked for Mr. Gray?
           Α.
                 Yes.
10
                 So when he hired you, he hired you to
11
      be the assistant superintendent of elephants?
12
                 Yes.
           Α.
13
                 And what did your duties entail?
            Q.
14
                 Everything with elephants. We took
           Α.
15
      them on the road, commercials, fairs, anywhere
16
      you might need elephants. We also -
17
           Q.
                 Sorry?
18
                 We also did shows in the summer when
19
      the park was open, and rides.
20
                 Okay. And when you say took the
           0.
21
      elephants to fairs, was that also for elephant
22
      rides?
```

```
Page 80
                 There was a captive breeding program
            0.
 2
      there?
 3
            Α.
                 Yes.
 4
            0.
                 At that zoo in Tel Aviv?
            Α.
                 Yes.
                 And when you picked those elephants
            Ο.
      up, had they been trained to do any of these
      tricks that were done on the road with the
      elephants later?
10
            Α.
                 No.
11
                       So who trained the elephants to
            Ο.
12
      do those tricks?
13
                 Charlie Gray.
            Α.
14
                 And did you assist him in that
            Ο.
15
      training?
16
            Α.
                 Yes.
17
                 And do you know where Charlie Gray got
18
      his training in elephant -- how to train
19
      elephants to do routines?
20
                 Basically, himself, you know, learning
21
      from other people.
22
                 Do you know who he learned from?
```

		Page 81
1	A.	I would say some from Smokey Jones,
2	Mike Hack	enberg.
3	Q.	Hackenberg?
4	A.	Hackenberg.
5	Q.	Okay. Anybody else?
6	A.	Bobby Moore. And that's all I could
7	recall.	
8	Q.	Did these trainers, Smokey Jones, Mike
9	Hackenber	g, Bobby Moore, did they all pretty
10	much use	the same techniques to train the
11	elephants	?
12	Α.	Pretty much so, yes.
13	Q.	And those were the techniques that
14	were also	taught to you by Smokey Jones and
15	Bobby Moo	re?
16	Α.	Yes.
17	Q.	And those would be the same techniques
18	that were	taught to Jody Watkins as well?
19	Α.	Yes.
20	Q.	And were you also involved in training
21	the two A	sian elephants that you picked up in
22	Israel to	perform tricks and routines?

Page 100 1 And where are you in terms of the 2 current contract? Where in the two years are you? When is that contract up? Α. 2008. All right. Now, at some point after 0. you were hired at the CEC, did your duties for Feld Entertainment change over the course of time at all? Α. Yes. 10 Ο. When was that? 11 I don't recall the exact time. Α. 12 Somewhere at the end of 2003-2004. 13 So before the end of 2003 -- strike Ο. 14 that. 15 All right. When you got to the CEC in 16 1999, those five young elephants, Romeo, 17 Shirley, Juliet, Bonnie, and Kelly Anne were 18 already there, is that correct? 19 They were at the fairgrounds in Tampa. Α. 20 And do you know the ages of the 0. 21 elephants at that time? 22 Not their exact ages, no.

Alderson Reporting Company

```
Page 101
1
                 Approximate ages?
2
                 Kelly was 3-and-a-half. Bonnie would
            Α.
3
      have been 4-and-a-half. Juliet would have been
          Romeo would have been 6, around that.
                 How about Shirley?
                 Shirley would have been 7 -- no, I'm
            Α.
7
      sorry, 6 -- 5-and-a-half, 6.
 8
                 Now, when you got to the CEC in 1999,
            0.
      had those five elephants already been trained to
10
      perform in the circus?
11
                 Yes.
            Α.
12
                 Who had trained them?
            0.
13
            Α.
                 Gary Jacobson.
14
                 Had anybody else been responsible for
15
      training the elephants?
16
                 Working with them or training them?
            Α.
17
            Q.
                 Training them.
18
                 The assistants.
            Α.
19
                 Who were those?
            Q.
20
                 I don't recall.
            Α.
21
                 Do you remember any of them?
            Q.
22
            Α.
                 No.
```

Alderson Reporting Company

```
Page 109
1
                        What if an elephant was having
                 Okav.
2
      difficulty doing the routines?
3
                 Then they would go to CEC.
           Α.
4
                 And would they get more training at
           0.
5
      that point in time?
6
                 Not likely.
           Α.
7
                 What would happen to an elephant who
           Ο.
8
      went to the CEC because she was having trouble
9
      doing the routines?
10
                 She would hang out all day, just go
11
      through their routine down there.
12
                 So they would receive more rehearsals
13
      of the routines?
14
                 No. Most of the adults down there
15
      don't do anything but hang out, eat and sleep,
16
      exercise, basic husbandry.
17
                 When did you receive your first
           0.
18
      promotion at Feld Entertainment?
19
                 I have never really received a
           Α.
20
      promotion.
21
                 Has your job title changed at all?
           0.
22
           Α.
                 Yes.
```

```
Page 112
1
                 Who is in charge of the Red Unit?
                                                        Who
2
      is the head of the Red Unit?
3
                 It would be John Griggs.
            Α.
                 Okay. And Mr. Vargas works under
            Q.
5
      Mr. Griggs?
                 Yes.
            Α.
                 And what's Mr. Griggs' title?
            Q.
                 He is the general manager.
            Α.
9
                 Right. Of the Red Unit?
            Q.
10
            Α.
                 Yes.
11
                 Okay. And who is the -- is there a
            Ο.
      general manager of the Blue Unit as well?
12
13
            Α.
                 Yes.
14
                 Who is that?
            0.
15
                 Mike Stuart.
            Α.
16
            0.
                 And is there an animal superintendent
17
      of the Blue Unit?
18
                 Yes.
            Α.
19
                 Who is that?
            Ο.
20
                 David Polke.
            Α.
21
                 Polke?
            Ο.
22
            Α.
                 Yes.
```

Alderson Reporting Company

```
Page 126
                 There were approximately 10 or 11 --
            Ο.
 2
            Α.
                 Yes.
 3
                 -- elephants on the Blue Unit when you
            Q.
      became the superintendent of elephants?
                 Yes.
            Α.
                 And I'm asking which elephants are no
      longer on the Blue Unit who were on the Blue
      Unit when you became the superintendent of
      elephants?
10
                 Got you. Lutsie.
            Α.
11
            0.
                 Lutsie?
12
                 Lutsie, Susan, Mysore, Tova.
            Α.
13
            Ο.
                 Tova?
14
            Α.
                 Tova.
15
                 Where are Lutsie, Susan, Mysore, and
            0.
16
      Tova now?
17
            Α.
                 Mysore is on the Gold show, and the
18
      other three are at the CEC.
19
                 Do you know the ages of these
20
      elephants?
21
                 Approximately.
            Α.
22
                 Okay. How old is Lutsie?
```

```
Page 127
1
                  She is about 55.
            Α.
                 How about Susan?
            Q.
                  She is about 54.
            Α.
            Q.
                 How about Mysore?
5
                  58.
            Α.
                 And Tova?
            0.
                  Early 40s.
            Α.
8
                 And do you know what Lutsie, Susan,
            Q.
9
      and Tova are doing at the CEC?
10
                 Hanging out.
            Α.
11
                 Are they being bred?
            Q.
12
            Α.
                 No.
13
                 Do you know why they are not being
            Q.
14
      bred?
15
                 Their ages.
16
                 Are there any other additional duties
            0.
17
      that you acquired when you became the
18
      superintendent of animals -- I'm sorry,
19
      superintendent of elephants -- that you haven't
20
      told us about?
21
            Α.
                 No.
22
                 And are you currently performing with
            Ο.
```

```
Page 128
 1
      the Blue Unit?
 2
            Α.
                 Yes.
 3
            Ο.
                 And what does your performance entail?
                 Anything with elephants.
            Α.
                 Is there a regular routine that you
            0.
      use during the performance?
                 Yes.
            Α.
                 In every city that you go to, it's the
            0.
9
      same routine?
10
            Α.
                 Yes.
11
            Q.
                 All right. What is the routine?
12
                 With the elephants?
            Α.
13
            Q.
                  Yes.
14
                 Oh, they are in opening.
            Α.
15
                 What does that mean?
            Q.
16
                 A parade of the opening of the show.
            Α.
17
                 How long does that take?
            Q.
18
                  90 seconds.
            Α.
19
                         And is that where all of the
            Ο.
                 Okay.
20
      elephants or all of the animals and performers
21
      come out?
22
                 Yes.
            Α.
```

```
Page 136
 1
                 Get on the cart, and the girl gets
 2
           Kelly turns and leaves.
3
                 And when do any of the elephants next
      perform?
5
                 Kelly goes back, and then Nicole comes
6
      down.
                 Before we get to Nicole, how long is
      the part of the act that where Kelly is on the
      cart?
10
                 Maybe 60 seconds.
           Α.
11
                 Okay. And then the next part of the
           Ο.
12
      performance?
13
                 Would be when Nicole comes down.
           Α.
14
                 Mm-hmm. And what does Nicole do?
           0.
15
                 She is in the diner gag.
           Α.
16
           Ο.
                 I'm sorry?
17
           Α.
                 A diner gag.
18
                 A diner gag?
           Ο.
19
           Α.
                 Yes.
20
                 Can you describe that?
           Q.
21
                 Sure. There's a bunch of clowns out
           A.
22
      there, and it is a diner's kind of set up, and
```

```
Page 137
1
      there is a maitre d', and then they are all
2
      hanging out, and the cue comes. Nicole goes in
3
      and sits down at the table. She runs out two
4
      clowns, sits down at the table, rings a bell for
5
      the maitre d' to bring something to drink.
6
                How does she ring the bell?
           0.
7
                With her trunk. A drink comes. She
8
      grabs the maitre d's leq. He spills it onto the
9
      clowns, and those clowns blame the other clowns,
10
      and she rings the bell again. Then she gets
11
      water. Sprays it on a clown. That clown blames
12
      it on the other clowns. Then she knocks a tray
13
      from the clown's hand and then leaves, which
14
      leads into a big food fight with the clowns.
15
                Okay. And who taught Nicole how to do
16
      that part of the routine?
17
           Α.
                Mike Hayward.
18
           Q.
                And who is he?
19
                He works under me.
           Α.
20
                What's his title?
           Q.
21
                Presenter.
           Α.
22
                How long has he been with Feld
           Q.
```

		Page 138
1	Entertain	ment?
2	A.	Since 2002.
3	Q.	Has he worked under you since 2002?
4	A.	Yes.
5	Q.	And do you know his background, where
6	he came f	rom?
7	A.	From England.
8	Q.	And do you know who trained him to
9	work with	elephants?
10	Α.	I don't recall the gentleman's name.
11	Lee. I d	o know his first name was Lee.
12	Q.	And who trained Kelly Anne to do the
13	bit on th	e cart?
14	A.	I did.
15	Q.	All right. And how long is the Nicole
16	diner gag	? How long is Nicole involved in the
17	Nicole di	ner gag?
18	A.	A little over 90 seconds.
19	Q.	Okay. And then what happens next in
20	terms of	when the elephants perform?
21	A.	That would be the second half of the
22	show.	

		Page 149
1	Α.	Evenson is one of the leg carries,
2	Q.	I'm sorry, Evenson?
3	Α.	Evenson.
4	Q.	Is one of
5	А.	One of the clowns.
6	Q.	During the leg carry, did you say?
7	Α.	Yes.
8	Q.	Who is the other one?
9	Α.	Neil.
10	Q.	Is Evenson a first name or a last
11	name?	
12	А.	First name.
13	Q.	Do you know his last name?
14	А.	No.
15	Q.	What about Neil?
16	А.	No.
17	Q.	Don't know his last name either?
18	Α.	No. There's 300 people in the show.
19	Q.	Okay. And who taught the elephants to
20	do the va	rious parts of the performance that you
21	described	?
22	A.	Most of them were already taught to do

Alderson Reporting Company

```
Page 150
1
      the basic stuff.
2
                  By whom?
            Q.
                  I would guess Axel.
            Α.
                  What is your basis for saying that?
            Q.
                  Because he was on the Blue Show for
            Α.
      many years.
                  What about the nonbasic stuff?
            Q.
                  We did.
            Α.
9
                  When you say we --
            Q.
10
                  Myself and Mike.
            Α.
11
                  And is Mike Hayward involved in the
            Q.
12
      performance with the elephants?
13
                  Oh, yes.
            Α.
14
                  And who else is involved?
            Q.
15
                  Isham.
            Α.
16
                  How do you spell that?
            0.
17
            Α.
                  I-S-H-A-M.
                               Sunny.
18
                  Is Isham a last name or a first name?
            Ο.
19
            Α.
                  First name.
20
                  Sunny is a first name?
            Q.
21
            Α.
                  Yes.
22
                  Last name?
            Q.
```

```
Page 179
 1
      something if that you are doing nails and you
 2.
      clip your cuticle too short, you just got slight
      bleeding, that's when you would use it.
4
                Okay.
                        Have you ever seen a wound on
5
      an elephant that was caused by a bullhook?
6
                 MS. JOINER: Object to form.
7
                 THE WITNESS: Just explain to me what
8
      you mean by wound.
9
                 BY MS. MEYER:
10
           Q.
                 Do you know what a wound is?
11
                        There's different sizes of
           Α.
12
                There's different --
      wounds.
13
                 I'm talking about any wound right now.
           Q.
14
                 That word can mean many different
           Α.
15
      things.
                What is your definition of wound?
16
                Well, I asked you if you knew what a
17
      wound was, and you said yes, so I'm asking you
18
      to use your definition of a wound.
19
                A wound to me would be an open cut, a
20
      gash.
                        Do you know what a bullhook is?
21
           Q.
                 Okay.
22
                 Yes, I do.
           Α.
```

```
Page 180
1
                 Have you ever seen a wound as you have
2
      described it on an elephant that was caused by a
3
      bullhook?
4
                 No.
            Α.
5
            0.
                 Never?
 6
            Α.
                 No.
7
                        Have you ever seen an elephant
            0.
                 Okay.
8
      with a hook boil?
9
                 Yes.
            Α.
                 Do you know what a hook boil is?
10
            Q.
11
            Α.
                 Yes.
12
                 What is it?
            0.
13
                 It can be caused from a splinter from
            Α.
      a tree, improper use of a hook.
14
15
                 Why would it be called a hook boil if
16
      it was caused by a splinter?
17
                 That's what people call it.
            Α.
18
            0.
                 Who? Who calls it that?
19
                 Everybody calls it that. We don't
            Α.
20
      call them boils. We call them -- we don't call
21
      them. We just fix them.
22
                 But you are familiar with the term
            Ο.
```

```
Page 187
            Α.
                 No.
 2
                 Have you ever witnessed any other
            Q.
      Ringling Bros. Employee, Feld Entertainment
      employee reprimanded for the way he or she
      treated an elephant?
            Α.
                 No.
7
                 Have you ever reprimanded a Ringling
      Bros. employee or Feld Entertainment employee
9
      for the way he or she treated an elephant?
10
            Α.
                 Yes.
11
                 Who would that be?
            Q.
12
                 They are no longer there.
            Α.
13
                 Who was it?
            Q.
14
            Α.
                 It was a newer quy,
15
                 What was his name?
            Q.
16
                 I don't recall.
            Α.
17
            Q.
                 Was it Brian Clark?
18
            Α.
                 No.
19
                 You don't recall who the person is?
            Q.
20
            Α.
                 No.
21
                 Would there be a written record of it?
            Q.
22
                 He was not a handler.
            Α.
```

```
Page 188
1
           Q.
                 What was his role?
 2
                 General work.
           Α.
3
                 General work?
            Q.
 4
                 Yes. General, you know, we have got
           Α.
5
      three people, four people that are there.
6
                 When did you reprimand this person?
           Q.
7
                 About two, three years ago.
           Α.
8
                 Do you remember where that happened?
           Q.
9
            Α.
                 No.
10
                 Do you remember the circumstances?
            Q.
11
                 Had to do with a tool, trying to move
           Α.
12
      them over with a broom when he is not supposed
13
      to be talking to them or anything.
14
                 I'm sorry. Tried to move whom over?
           Q.
15
                 You know, touching them with a broom,
           Α.
16
      sweeping up and getting their feet.
17
           Q.
                 You are talking about the elephants?
18
           Α.
                 The human pushing the broom, pushing
19
      and pushing into their feet.
20
                 Mm-hmm. And what kind of action did
           Q.
21
      you take against this person?
22
                 I just let -- a verbal reprimand.
```

		Page 193
1	I saw her	when she was born.
2	Q.	And she is at the CEC?
3	A.	Yes.
4	Q.	And as far as you know, is she being
5	trained t	o go out on the road?
6	A.	I don't know if he started that yet.
7	Q.	And he would be Gary Jacobson?
8	A.	Yes.
9	Q.	And what about Asha? Are you familiar
10	with Asha	?
11	A.	Yes.
12	Q.	And do you know how old she is?
13	A.	She is almost she is going on 4.
14	Q.	And where is she?
15	A.	The CEC.
16	Q.	And what is she doing at the CEC?
17	A.	Hanging out.
18	Q.	Is she being trained to perform?
19	Α.	No, she is already trained.
20	Q.	And she was trained by whom?
21	Α.	All of the youngsters were trained by
22	Gary Jaco	bson.

19

20

21

22

Washington, DC

	Page 202
1	elephants coming to visit at winter quarters?
2	A. Socialization.
3	Q. Is part of the purpose to see if they
4	are ready to go out on the road?
5	A. Yeah. And just give them a look at
6	what is out there. And with Juliet and Bonnie
7	and Kelly, that is a good start for them.
8	Q. And when they come for a visit to
9	winter quarters, are they rehearsed to see how
10	they would do in a performance?
11	A. We will practice and exercise and do
12	your normal daily husbandry with all of them.
13	Q. So are the young elephants who are
14	being trained by Gary Jacobson down at the CEC
15	specifically being trained to perform the tricks
16	that you need to be done in the Blue Unit?
17	A. They learn all of the basics. From
18	there, we would pick who would be more agile to

Q. And is that kind of -- strike that.

Is the time that you make that

decision with the newer elephants at winter

do things different than the others.

Page 224 1 Other than the walks from the train, 2 what else did she do that made you think that 3 she didn't --4 Dancers --Α. 5 Let me just finish the question. Q. 6 What else did she do that made you 7 think that she didn't like the life-style? 8 Dancers wear big costumes. At that 9 time we had a man that got in a big uniform kind 10 of thing like a robot that was 9 feet tall. 11 Those kind of things that are part of the show. 12 And how would she act around that 13 individual that made you think that she didn't 14 agree with the life-style? 15 It wasn't the individual. It would be 16 around certain objects and things. And she 17 would be antsy. They all show it in different 18 ways. They all have different personalities. 19 So... 20 But just talking about Shirley. 21 just interested in what kinds of behavior she

Alderson Reporting Company

manifested that made you think that she didn't

22

Page 225 1 agree with the life-style? 2 Big eyes. She would never settle. Α. 3 And how did you deal with that? Ο. Α. We sent her to the CEC. 5 Before you sent her to the CEC? 0. We would practice and calm her down Α. 7 and reassure her with carrots or apples or jelly beans, anything that we could find that might be 9 her favorite to reassure her that everything was 10 cool. The boogeyman under the bed. 11 Now, at the time that you sent her to Ο. 12 the CEC because you determined she didn't agree 13 with the life-style, had Benjamin already died? 14 Α. Yes. 15 And who was Benjamin? 0. 16 Α. A little male elephant. 17 And was Benjamin significant in Q. 18 Shirley's life? 19 That was before my time. Α. 20 Do you know whether or not Benjamin 0. 21 and Shirley traveled together in the circus? 22 As far as I know, they did, yes.

		Page 226
1	Q.	And do you know whether or not they
2	had trave	led together since they were very young
3	elephants'	?
4	Α.	That I do not know.
5	Q.	And do you know how soon after
6	Benjamin o	died that Shirley was manifesting these
7	behaviors	that made you think she didn't agree
8	with the I	life-style?
9	A.	Shirley has always been like that,
10	from what	I'm told.
11	Q.	Okay. Well, the five-month period
12	that you a	are talking about in the Blue Unit
13	occurred v	when?
14	Α.	2000.
15	Q.	Okay. Do you know when Benjamin died?
16	Α.	I don't recall. I wasn't working for
17	the compar	ny then.
18	Q.	And when in 2000 were those five
19	months?	
20	Α.	I'm sorry?
21	Q.	What part of the year were those five
22	months?	

		Page 232
1	Α.	It wouldn't come up because something
2	like that	, we we wouldn't have to analyze
3	something	like that. We wouldn't believe it
4	true to ha	ave an animal that would show that much
5	behavior t	towards something, another elephant,
6	through so	ome experiences of other elephants.
7	Q.	So I just want to be clear because I'm
8	not sure	I asked the question as clearly.
9		Is it your position that the death of
10	Benjamin h	nad no negative impact on Shirley's
11	behavior?	
12	A.	At the time she was acting like that
13	on the sho	ow, no.
14	Q.	Okay. Did it at some point?
15	Α.	I wasn't there then.
16	Q.	So you don't know?
17	Α.	I don't know. I can only speak for
18	when I was	s working with her.
19	Q.	But you don't know when Benjamin died?
20	Α.	I don't recall, no.
21	Q.	Well, if you don't know when Benjamin
22	died, how	do you know that the death of Benjamin

```
Page 233
 1
      had no negative impact on Shirley's behavior?
 2
                MS. JOINER:
                              Objection, argumentative.
 3
                THE WITNESS: From experience.
 4
                BY MS. MEYER:
                Did you understand the question?
           0.
 6
                Can you repeat it, please.
           Α.
7
           0.
                If you don't know when Benjamin died,
      then how do you know that the death of Benjamin
9
      had no negative impact on Shirley's behavior?
10
           Α.
                Basically we are talking about a
11
      mourning situation, an animal's mourning, which
12
      I have been around elephants that have passed
13
      on, fortunately, not that often.
14
                They do not mourn like we do, like you
15
      would like to perceive it. That's what I feel
16
      that you are trying to get to, that she reacted
17
      like she did because she was mourning for
18
      Benjamin. I don't believe that that would have
19
      been the cause for it. In my experiences with
20
      elephants, that would not be the cause.
21
                It would have some effect for a
22
      certain amount of time, but even with a mother
```

1

10

15

16

17

19

20

21

22

Washington, DC

that loses a baby, she will rumble for that baby

for a while, then instinct will kick in, so she

will cycle again so she can reproduce.

But elephants don't go on thinking

about tomorrow or yesterday or the next hour or five hours previous to that.

Q. So you do agree that at the time that Benjamin died, Shirley may have had a negative reaction at that very time to the death of Benjamin? Is that correct?

MS. JOINER: Objection. Asked and answered. Calls for speculation.

THE WITNESS: I wasn't there.

BY MS. MEYER:

Q. Okay. I'm just trying to understand your answer. You were suggesting there is a time issue involved in whether or not the death of Benjamin would have a negative impact on Shirley, based on your experience with elephants. That's what I understood your testimony to be, correct?

A. With the other elephants, yes.

Page 235 1 How much time would go by before the 2 elephant would be completely over the death of a 3 companion elephant? 4 They are all individuals. Α. 5 0. Can you give me any time frame? 6 Just because they were together Α. 7 doesn't mean that it would last a week, two 8 There is no time frame. I don't think 9 there has ever been any studies on it in 10 captivity, and she came from there to the herd 11 of young elephants where we were --12 0. Mm-hmm. 13 -- and was put in that herd, and from Α. 14 there, that is what happened. 15 And you also mentioned during your Ο. 16 testimony before we broke for lunch that there 17 was a time when you reprimanded an individual 18 for I think you said hitting the foot of an 19 elephant with a broom? 20 He was pushing the broom, and he kept, Α. 21 you know, like moving her out of the way, but... 22 Where was he pushing the broom on the Ο.

Page 237 1 reprimanding employees? 2 They are written up with a signature Α. from the general manager and Dave Polke and myself, which they would sign. And then it would go on record. 6 But as I understand your testimony, 7 first you would give them an oral, a verbal warning before you would proceed to a written 9 reprimand, is that correct? 10 It would depend on the situation. Α. 11 Okay. What factors would determine 0. 12 whether or not you prepared a written reprimand 13 the first time an incident occurred with respect 14 to the mistreatment of an elephant? 15 It would depend on the situation. 16 Can you give me an idea of what kind 0. 17 situation would warrant a written reprimand 18 as opposed to a verbal reprimand? 19 I have never had to do it. 20 Okay. I just want to go through the 0.

Alderson Reporting Company

the record is clear, to the best of your

tricks that you described for the Blue Unit.

21

22

So

```
Page 307
 1
      elephants for the Red Unit at that time, is that
 2
      correct?
                 Yes. There was three rings of
            Α.
      elephants.
                 Is Sasha Houcke still with the Red
            0.
 6
      Unit?
                 I think he is, yes.
            Α.
                 Is he still titled head presenter?
            0.
            Α.
                 I think so, yes.
10
            Ο.
                 Does very responsibility for training
11
      the elephants used by the Red Unit?
12
                 They are pretty much all trained.
            Α.
13
                        Does he have responsibility for
            0.
                 Okay.
14
      helping the elephants learn how to do new
15
      routines?
16
            Α.
                 Yes.
17
                 Okay. And do you know where he
            Q.
18
      received his training in handling elephants
19
      from?
20
                 No.
            Α.
21
                 Do you know what country he is from?
            Q.
22
                 France.
            Α.
```

```
Page 338
 1
      on the --
 2
                 No, I don't.
           Α.
 3
                 You didn't make any bullhooks for any
           Ο.
      of these individuals, did you?
                 No.
           Α.
                 And did any of these individuals ever
           Ο.
      make a bullhook for you?
           Α.
                 No.
9
                 Are elephant handlers and trainers
10
      required to have bullhooks if they work at Feld
11
      Entertainment?
12
                 Anybody that works with elephants
13
      would have a bullhook.
14
                 Are they required to have a bullhook?
15
                 It's something that's necessary to
           Α.
16
      have, yes.
17
           Q.
                 Is it a requirement of the job?
18
                 Yes. Any elephant job.
19
                 Do you know whether Adam Hill ever
            Ο.
20
      made any bullhooks for use by individuals at the
21
      Feld Entertainment?
22
                 I know that he does make bullhooks.
```

	Page 342
1	A. I do not.
2	Q. Have you ever used a bullhook to
3	discipline an elephant?
4	A. I have corrected elephants with
5	bullhooks, yes.
6	Q. And what do you mean by that?
7	A. If they are doing something wrong,
8	fighting, things of that nature.
9	Q. And how do you correct them with the
10	bullhook?
11	A. There's various ways. It depends on
12	what they are doing. It depends on the
13	situation.
14	Q. Well, let's go through the situation.
15	You said if they are fighting.
16	How would you correct an elephant with
17	a bullhook if it was fighting?
18	A. You back them up away from each other
19	and bop them on the head. Depends on the
20	severity of the confrontation.
21	Q. Okay. And when you say you would bop

them on the head, with what end of the bullhook

22

		Page 343
1	would you	bop them on the head?
2	A.	With the handle.
3	Q.	Could you describe what a bullhook
4	looks like	≘?
5	A.	It's a stick with a hook on the end of
6	it.	
7	Q.	Okay. Does it have one or two hooks?
8	Α.	One.
9	Q.	What is the hook made out of?
10	A.	Normally it's stainless steel or
11	titanium.	
12	Q.	Okay. Now, what other instances would
13	you have t	to correct an elephant with a bullhook
14	besides f	ighting if they are fighting?
15	A.	That would vary from time to time.
16	Q.	What if an elephant isn't moving fast
17	enough for	r your purposes?
18	Α.	Then you guide her with it.
19	Q.	You would how would you do that?
20	А.	You would pull her with the hook.
21	Q.	You would pull it with the hook.
22	Where woul	ld you put the hook to pull the

```
Page 352
                I'm talking about correction with a
           Ο.
 2
      bullhook, which is what we were talking about.
 3
           Α.
                 It is not a way of life, no.
                 So if, in fact, you were quoted as
      saying that by a reporter in Chicago in the year
      2002, he misquoted you?
                He very well could have. I don't
      recall the instance in 2002.
9
                Do you ever use the bullhook to punish
10
      an elephant?
11
                We correct the elephants with that.
12
                And do you use the word correct as a
           Q.
13
      synonym for punishment?
                No. What is your definition of
14
           Α.
15
      punishment?
16
                If an elephant does something it's not
           0.
17
      supposed to do, you --
18
                Depending on the situation.
           Α.
19
                -- inflict punishment on it in order
           0.
20
      to teach it a lesson?
21
                No. Depending on the situation.
           Α.
22
                Well, if its depending on the
```

```
Page 353
1
      situation, then that would indicate that under
2
      some circumstances you would use a bullhook to
3
      punish an elephant, is that correct?
4
                 No. We correct with the bullhook.
           Α.
5
           0.
                 Okay.
6
                 Correction and punishment to me are
           Α.
7
      two different things.
8
                 Okay. How do they differ?
           0.
9
           A.
                 Punishment to them would be time out.
10
      They get put off in a pen by themselves. They
11
      don't get to hang out with each other for a bit.
12
      Take their mind set away from whatever they were
13
      thinking.
14
                Do you ever use that kind of
           0.
15
      punishment with an elephant?
16
                 Yes.
           Α.
17
                 Under what kind of circumstances?
           Q.
18
                 It could vary from day to day.
           Α.
19
                 And what would you do under those
           0.
20
      circumstances?
21
                 Put them in time out.
           Α.
22
                 Would the elephant be chained?
```

```
Page 353
1
      situation, then that would indicate that under
2
      some circumstances you would use a bullhook to
3
      punish an elephant, is that correct?
4
                 No. We correct with the bullhook.
           Α.
5
           0.
                 Okay.
6
                 Correction and punishment to me are
           Α.
7
      two different things.
8
                 Okay. How do they differ?
           0.
9
           A.
                 Punishment to them would be time out.
10
      They get put off in a pen by themselves. They
11
      don't get to hang out with each other for a bit.
12
      Take their mind set away from whatever they were
13
      thinking.
14
                Do you ever use that kind of
           0.
15
      punishment with an elephant?
16
                 Yes.
           Α.
17
                 Under what kind of circumstances?
           Q.
18
                 It could vary from day to day.
           Α.
19
                 And what would you do under those
           0.
20
      circumstances?
21
                 Put them in time out.
           Α.
22
                 Would the elephant be chained?
```

```
Page 354
1
                 On occasion, yes.
2
                How long would an elephant remain in a
           Q.
3
      time out?
4
                 That depends on the situation.
 5
                 MS. MEYER: Do you need to change
 6
      tapes?
                                     This is the end of
                 THE VIDEOGRAPHER:
      tape number 4 in the deposition of Troy Metzler.
      We are off the record at 4:13:37 p.m. on July
10
      25, 2005.
11
                 (Recess was taken from 4:14 p.m.to
12
      4:20 p.m.)
13
                 THE VIDEOGRAPHER:
                                     This is the
14
      beginning of tape number 5 in the video
15
      deposition of Troy Metzler. We are on the
16
      record at 4:20:23 p.m. on July 25, 2006.
17
                 BY MS. MEYER:
18
                Mr. Metzler, how much does a typical
           Ο.
19
      bullhook weigh?
20
                 That would depend on what it's made
           Α.
21
      of.
22
                 Okay. Let's talk about the three
           Ο.
```