IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF THE CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, ET AL.,

Plaintiffs,

CA No. 03-2006
Washington, DC
February 19, 2009
10:15 a.m.

VS.

FELD ENTERTAINMENT, INC.,

Defendant.

TRANSCRIPT OF BENCH TRIAL
BEFORE THE HONORABLE EMMET G. SULLIVAN
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiffs:

KATHERINE A. MEYER, ESQUIRE HOWARD M. CRYSTAL, ESQUIRE TANYA SANERIB, ESQUIRE DELCIANNA J. WINDERS, ESQUIRE Meyer, Glitzenstein & Crystal 1601 Connecticut Avenue, NW Suite 700 Washington, DC 20009 (202) 588 5206

For the Defendants:

JOHN M. SIMPSON, ESQUIRE LISA ZEILER JOINER, ESQUIRE LANCE L. SHEA, ESQUIRE KARA L. PETTEWAY, ESQUIRE MICHELLE PARDO, ESQUIRE Fulbright & Jaworski, LLP 801 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Suite 500 Washington, DC 20004

(202) 724-6522

Court Reporter:

Lisa M. Hand, RPR Official Court Reporter U.S. Courthouse, Room 6706 333 Constitution Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20001 (202) 354-3269

Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography; transcript produced by computer-aided transcription

1	<u>INDEX</u>
2	<u>WITNESS</u> <u>DIRECT CROSS REDIRECT RECROSS</u>
3	For the Plaintiff:
4	COLLEEN KINZLEY 5 25 34
5	MARGARET TOM
6	(Presented by reading deposition and video clips from deposition) Page 56
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	PROCEEDINGS
12	COURTROOM DEPUTY: Civil Action 03-2006. American
13	Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals, et al.
14	versus Feld Entertainment. Would counsel please identify
15	yourselves for the record.
16	MS. SANERIB: Good morning, Your Honor. Tanya
17	Sanerib for the plaintiffs.
18	THE COURT: Good morning, counsel.
19	MS. MEYER: Katherine Meyer for the plaintiffs.
20	MR. CRYSTAL: Howard Crystal for the plaintiffs.
21	MS. WINDERS: Good morning, Your Honor. Delcianna
22	Winders for the plaintiffs.
23	MS. SINNOTT: Good morning. Michelle Sinnott, tech
24	for the plaintiffs.
25	MR. SIMPSON: Good morning, Your Honor. John

1 Simpson for the defendant.

2.2.

MR. SHEA: Good morning, Your Honor. Lance Shea for the defendant.

MS. PETTEWAY: Good morning. Kara Petteway for the defendant.

MS. JOINER: Lisa Joiner for the defendant.

MS. PARDO: Michelle Pardo for the defendant.

MS. STRAUSS: Good morning, Your Honor. Julie Strauss for the defendant.

THE COURT: Ms. Strauss.

MR. PALISOUL: Derek Palisoul, tech for the defendant.

THE COURT: Counsel, there's a sealed matter that I have at 12:15. It will take me about 15 minutes. I just need to bring that to your attention now. We're not going to break before then. But I just wanted to bring that to your attention. Also, there is a matter that I have to focus on for about 15 minutes at 2:00 o'clock. So we may get creative with respect to the lunch hour. We may take a little more testimony than normal this morning, and probably reconvene at 2:30 or so. But I just want to give you a heads-up on that. And I don't have any other matters on my calendar.

I do want to say with respect to the two evidentiary issues that came up yesterday, one was the agent documents issue, and there was another evidentiary issue, I'm

going to just request that counsel for plaintiff file no more than a three-page memo that addresses those two issues. I believe they both were yours, you were the lucky person with those issues yesterday.

Just file that. I need to resolve that before plaintiffs' case in chief — before you rest your case in chief. That's not going to happen — we're not going to rest today. I'll just direct that you file that by Monday, and I'll give — actually do you need more than a day after that? I'll say Tuesday for defense counsel, but I don't want to be unfair about it and give plaintiff four days to prepare a three-page memo.

MR. SIMPSON: If they limit it to three pages, a day is fine.

THE COURT: Okay. Monday at noon and Tuesday at noon. All right. Let's proceed. We were in cross-examination. I believe counsel had a few more questions to ask the witness.

MR. SHEA: I do, Your Honor.

(Colleen Kinzley resumed the stand.)

THE COURT: You're still under oath. We're still proceeding with cross-examination. Counsel.

CROSS-EXAMINATION (Resumed)

24 BY MR. SHEA:

2.

2.2.

Q. If it please the Court. Good morning, Ms. Kinzley.

1 How are you?

2

8

9

- A. Good morning. I'm fine, thank you.
- Q. I'd like to show you a picture here about an elephant you mentioned yesterday, and this is is this Ned, the elephant that you called the USDA about and was confiscated from a circus?
- 7 A. Yes.
 - Q. And you remember your testimony about this elephant yesterday, is that right?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 12 You had seen his pictures on YouTube and then called the USDA, is that your testimony?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 Q. He was part of a circus, is that true?
- 15 A. Yes, he there was a private owner and he was
 16 contracted with a circus, I think in Massachusetts maybe at
 17 the time the photographs were taken.
 - Q. I see. And that wasn't Ringling Brothers, was it?
- 19 A. No, it was not.
- 20 Q. This elephant is very much underweight, isn't he?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. And by the way, this is a picture on the Elephant
 Sanctuary website, is that correct?
- 24 A. Yes, I believe so.
- Q. And he's there temporarily while waiting to be

1 transported to the PAWS sanctuary once a barn is finished, is 2 that true?

- A. Yeah. My understanding is that they didn't want to move him very far because of his condition, they were hoping to get him in better health before he made a longer move.
- Q. I see. And he is extremely underweight, isn't he?
- A. Yes, he is.
- Q. None of the FEI elephants at issue that you saw are underweight, are they?
- 10 A. No, I didn't see any underweight elephants.
- 11 Q. None of them certainly look like this, did they?
- 12 | A. No.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

- Q. Now, the size of your elephant herd at the Oakland Zoo today, am I correct it is three African females and one African male?
- 16 A. That's correct.
 - Q. There are no other elephants there?
- 18 **A.** No.
- Q. Now, you testified yesterday that you visited the
 Center for Elephant Conservation in Florida, that Ringling
 Brothers facility, in connection with a conference in Florida
 in the early years of your profession. Do you recall that
- 23 testimony?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. And when was that visit?

- 1 A. I believe it was in November of 2001.
- 2 Q. November 2001?
 - A. I believe so.

3

4

5

8

9

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

- Q. It wasn't in 1997 in association with an EMA meeting in Jacksonville, Florida?
- A. I thought it was 2001, but perhaps I am mistaken. It was with the Jacksonville EMA conference.
 - Q. So whenever that conference was held, that's when you would have gone to see the Center for Elephant Conservation?
- 10 A. Yes, exactly.
- 11 Q. You don't recall clearly as you sit here today when 12 that was?
- 13 A. Well, like I said, I thought it was 2001, but I could be mistaken.
 - Q. Now, you testified yesterday about being part of the elephant species survival program of the Association of Zoos and Aquariums. Do you recall that testimony?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. And when was the last year you were involved in that species survival program for elephants?
 - A. Well, I'm the institutional representative for the Oakland Zoo, so in that capacity, I'm involved at this time. I served on the steering committee a number of years ago, I would say maybe six or eight years ago.
- 25 Q. I see. So it was six or eight years ago was the last

- 1 time you were on the steering commit, that's your testimony?
- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 Q. Now, regarding African elephants imported to the San
- 4 Diego Wild Animal Park, I asked you a question about that
- 5 yesterday, do you recall?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Those were imported from Swaziland specifically, were
- 8 they not?
- 9 A. Yes, I believe that's correct.
- 10 Q. You're aware there was litigation opposing that
- 11 | importation, aren't you?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. You were not part of that litigation at the Oakland
- 14 Zoo, were you?
- 15 A. No, I was not.
- 16 Q. And the Oakland Zoo was not part of it either, is that
- 17 | true?
- 18 A. No, I don't believe so.
- 19 Q. So it was not, correct?
- 20 A. Not that I'm aware of.
- 21 Q. Now, when you went to local animal control officers --
- 22 sorry, yesterday you testified about going with local animal
- 23 control officers to look at the Ringling Brothers circus. Do
- 24 you recall that testimony?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. When was that?
- A. A number of years ago I went to San Jose, and also was asked to inspect at the Oakland facility, the Coliseum.
 - Q. That was a number of years ago?
- 5 A. Yes.

2.2.

- Q. Did you see any misuse of the bull hook while you were on that visit?
- A. I did not.
 - Q. Did you request that any tickets or citations be issued for the treatment of the elephants?
- A. That's not my role. I'm there to look at the elephants and answer any questions that the animal control officer might have.
 - Q. All right. Now, yesterday you testified that you were not surprised to find a lack of fresh injuries from the bull hook or chains on the elephants at the CEC inspection in this case, because that inspection was scheduled ahead of time. Do you recall that testimony?
 - A. Yes, I do.
 - Q. Now, Ms. Kinzley, is it really your testimony that the handlers at the CEC were beating those elephants, wounding those elephants, that they stopped doing that, allowed those wounds to heal, showed the elephants with no such beating or hooking, and then during the inspection, and then went right back to it after the inspection? Is that your

testimony?

2.2.

MS. SANERIB: Objection. That's argumentative.

THE COURT: She can answer the question, if she can. Can you?

THE WITNESS: I certainly don't think that was my testimony.

THE COURT: What was your testimony?

THE WITNESS: My point was that in my experience if we know as a free contact handler that an elephant is going to be shown to somebody, you know, whether it's -- whatever person who's inspecting, or certainly -- when I worked in free contact if we knew that we were going to be having a VIP tour, we would be more careful with how we used the hook. And that is certainly something that any handler in free contact would be aware of.

There are less forceful ways to use the hook, so that you might not cause an injury. And I would think that in the case where you know a team is coming out to inspect, you would be very careful to use the hook in a less forceful way. And I think the video of that inspection demonstrates that. The handlers are extremely careful not to even apply the hook while we're there. And consequently the elephants' behavior reflected that. Particularly one of the elephants was very unresponsive to the handlers, and it was clear that it was a very frustrating situation for the handler, to not be able to

use the hook. So I think that's very common practice, and I have been in that situation myself.

BY MR. SHEA:

2.2.

- Q. You don't know that any such thing was done in this case, though, that the hooking or that the use of the bull hook was changed in any way from during the inspection from prior to the inspection, do you?
 - A. No, I don't know. I can only speak from my experience.
- Q. Right. You don't know that those handlers were handling those elephants any different in the inspection than they ordinarily would with respect to the use of the bull hook, correct?
- A. I definitely think they were handling the elephants different from how they ordinarily would. I have seen the handlers with the Ringling elephants a number of times over my career, and I've never seen them not apply the bull hook at all. So I definitely think that that was very different from everything I've observed in the past.
- Q. You haven't been to the CEC and you don't know that anything was changed with respect to handling those elephants for the CEC inspection, do you?
- A. I had been to the CEC, and when I visited the CEC previously, the handlers were using the bull hook and applying the bull hook in a much more normal manner.
 - Q. And you hadn't been to the CEC, though, in a number of

1 years, correct?

2.2.

- A. That's correct, yes.
- Q. All right. And you're saying that Zina's failure to cooperate, if there was any such failure, at the CEC inspection, was because she was not hooked, is that what you're telling the Court?

MS. SANERIB: Objection. I don't believe that the witness used any names of elephants.

THE COURT: She can answer the question.

THE WITNESS: As I mentioned, my observation was is that the elephants were not responsive in the normal manner to the handlers. And it appeared to me to be very frustrating to the handlers and confusing to the elephants. The elephants were not responsive in the way that I have typically seen Ringling Brothers elephants be. And it was very clear that the handler was working hard not to apply the hook. He was raising his arm and bringing the hook near the elephant in the position that he would be hooking, but stopped short of actually using the hook. I believe that was for the benefit of the inspectors that were there.

- BY MR. SHEA:
 - Q. But you don't know, do you?
- A. No, I don't know. I'm just speaking from my experience.
 - Q. And you do know that these are retired elephants; they

- 1 are no longer being exhibited in circus shows, correct?
- 2 A. That is what I have been told.
- Q. The elephants were chained for over three hours in your presence at the CEC inspection, correct?
 - A. That's correct.

5

6

7

8

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

- Q. And you didn't see any fresh injuries from the chains occur, did you, during that time period?
- A. No, I did not.
- 9 Q. Now, regarding the Elephant Husbandry Resource Guide,
 10 if I recall correctly yesterday, you wrote a page -- or sorry,
 11 you wrote a chapter in this, correct?
- 12 A. That's correct.
 - Q. And you list it on your CV, don't you, as one of your publications, isn't that true?
- 15 A. That's correct.
 - Q. It's listed as the first under the topic of papers presented and published, isn't it?
 - A. Okay. I don't remember exactly how it's listed, but I certainly won't argue with that.
 - Q. Would you bring up Ms. Kinzley's CV, please. And go to the next page, please. Ms. Kinzley, right here, where we have papers presented and published, the first entry is "Hand-raising and diet supplement of calves" by Colleen Kinzley, Karen Emanuelson, DVM, published in AZA Elephant
- 25 Husbandry Manual. That refers to your chapter, does it not,

- 1 | in the Elephant Husbandry Resource Guide?
 - A. That's correct.
 - Q. You didn't pull your name from this chapter or pull your chapter from this guide, did you, because you disagreed with other things that were said in it?
 - A. No.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

- Q. Now, Ms. Kinzley, I'd like to show you an article that we discussed in your deposition. It was Exhibit 11 to Ms. Kinzley's deposition. If you can bring that up, please. No, Exhibit 11, the other article. Go to the third page, please.
- Ms. Kinzley, this is an article from the San Francisco Chronicle that we discussed in your deposition, correct?
- 14 A. Yes, that's correct.
 - Q. It was published on November 7, 2004, is that right?
- 16 A. Okay.
- 17 Q. Could you show the first page, please, Mr. Palisoul.
- San Francisco Chronicle, Sunday, November 7, 2004, is that right?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. Now if we can go back to that third page, I'd like to ask you about a couple of portions of this. The first paragraph, it says: Oakland Zoo General Curator Colleen Kinzley has handled elephants for 20 years. Still she's not sure they belong in the zoo, and she's less sure they belong

in the circus. Kinzley, 39, recently received a stealth tape of circus disciplinary methods and aired her grievances on National Public Radio.

Did I read that correctly?

A. Yes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

17

- Q. Had you received a tape of Ringling Brothers circus, a stealth tape?
- A. Yes.
 - Q. And did you in fact air your grievances on National
- 10 Public Radio?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 O. Now in the next --
- THE COURT: You need to keep your voice up. That was a yes?
- 15 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 16 BY MR. SHEA:
 - Q. In the next paragraph the reporter started asking you questions, didn't she?
- 19 A. Yes, she did.
- Q. And it says: How did the Ringling video come to you?

 I was contacted by Citizens for Cruelty-Free Circuses and

 asked to review some videotape they shot while Ringling
- Brothers was here in Oakland.
- 24 Did I read that correctly?
- 25 A. Yes.

- Q. Is that true? Is that where you got the videotape, from Citizens for Cruelty-Free Circuses?
 - A. Yes.

3

8

9

17

18

19

20

23

24

- Q. And specifically that came to you from Pat Cuviello, is that correct?
- A. I believe actually Deniz Bolbol is the person who gave me the videotape.
 - Q. Do you know Mr. Cuviello?
 - A. I have met him before.
- Q. I see. And both of them are involved in Citizens for Cruelty-Free Circuses, correct?
- 12 A. I believe so.
- Q. And given this newspaper article was in 2004, the footage that you refer to here is on the order of five years old at least, is it not?
- 16 A. That would be correct.
 - Q. Now, as you testified yesterday, as I understood it, the main reason you changed to protected contact at the Oakland Zoo was because a trainer was killed in January of 1991, is that correct?
- 21 A. That's correct.
- 22 Q. The trainer was killed in January of '91, right?
 - A. Yes. But as I mentioned yesterday, there were two main reasons. That was sort of the point that the change was made, but the other major concern that we had was the level of

physical discipline that was needed in handling one of our female elephants.

2.2.

Q. I see. I'd like to show you another part of this article, where the --

THE COURT: There was a certain level of unaccepted aggression exhibited by that elephant?

THE WITNESS: Yes. That elephant was a particularly defiant elephant and became aggressive toward her handlers.

THE COURT: Do you have an opinion as to the reason why there was that high level of aggression?

THE WITNESS: I think her history of handling probably contributed to that, but in my experience there are some individual elephants — I mean, they are such intelligent, highly social animals, that they really have a range of personalities. I've worked with maybe three different elephants that sort of had that particular personality, where they were more challenging, they just were not as compliant.

And part of that, if an elephant is not compliant, is that they are going to challenge the dominance of the handlers on a much more frequent basis. And in her case she challenged the dominance of new handlers. So typically new handlers were injured. And as — this situation often arises as an elephant reaches sexual maturity, and that was the case

with her, she was coming into her teenage years, and we were seeing this increased level of aggression. And I experienced the same thing at the Brookfield Zoo with a female Asian elephant named Patience.

2.2.

In those cases it's very common for the discipline to get very extreme, where multiple handlers are beating the elephant or, as I mentioned yesterday, using the 110 electricity. So, clearly that kind of severe discipline is very abusive. And in that situation we really felt like we wanted to find some alternative for her.

THE COURT: So just to be clear, is your -- the aggression is what, as a result of genes, elephant genes or --

THE WITNESS: I think it's a combination, you know. And certainly I think that there are --

THE COURT: Is it your opinion or not that that level of aggression is attributed to the use of the hook?

THE WITNESS: I think it is. I think it's a combination of genetics, predisposition, and the experience that the animal has had. And sometimes it's not necessarily all bad experience. In the case of Patience, she was raised in a children's zoo setting. She had a lot of early contact with people where people were petting her and teasing her, and she didn't have sort of the — raised with the same boundaries that some elephants are.

And that is also a pattern that has been sort of

typical, of when elephants are raised, young elephants are raised in a setting with lots of contact with the public, that they may be more aggressive, may have less inhibition about interacting with the public because they have had those early opportunities to slap out or grab or —

THE COURT: But it's a combination of factors, not just one factor?

THE WITNESS: I think it's a combination, yes, exactly.

BY MR. SHEA:

2.2.

2.5

Q. Ms. Kinzley, I'd like to ask you about another part of this article. It says here, the reporter asked: Isn't it dangerous? And the article goes on to say: On average one keeper is killed by an elephant per year in the United States. Question: Have you been attacked? I was only here for about a month when one of the female elephants went after me, and I was going through a doorway to get away, and she sit my hand and took off my index finger and the end of my thumb.

Did I read that correctly?

- A. That's correct.
- Q. And you sustained that serious injury in, what, midsummer of 1990, is that correct?
- A. That's correct.
- Q. And within a year of that or so, and six months after the trainer being killed, you took the Oakland Zoo to

1 protected contact, is that right? 2 That's correct. Α. 3 MR. SHEA: No further questions, Your Honor. 4 THE COURT: How could elephants be transported 5 without chaining them? 6 THE WITNESS: Well, there are a number of trucks 7 that are used, or crates. Elephants can be trained to go into 8 a crate and conditioned to that, and then it's not necessary 9 to have leg chains on them. It's not actually uncommon for 10 them to be transported without leg chains. 11 THE COURT: It is not uncommon? 12 THE WITNESS: Not within the zoo community. Like I 13 said, there are trucks that can be specially designed so that 14 they are reinforced, so that it's more of an enclosure, and 15 then also if an animal is conditioned to a large metal crate 16 that they can be transported in. 17 THE COURT: A large metal crate that is then placed 18 on a train or something, a boxcar? 19 THE WITNESS: Train, truck, plane, yeah. 20 THE COURT: And in your opinion that's more humane 21 than the chaining? The crate? 2.2.

THE WITNESS: Well, it still severely restricts the animal's movement. You don't have the physical restraints on the animal, so from that standpoint, particularly if the animal is going to fight the chains — if they are frightened

23

24

or stressed an animal will pull against the chains, and it's possible that they are going to injure themselves, kind of like I was talking about with the injuries that you can have particularly on the hind leq. But it's still very confining, so I would be concerned about an animal being in that kind of a situation for an extended period of time, if it was a regular thing. It's one thing in my opinion if it's the occasional -- if it's necessary to move an animal for some reason for its well-being. But if it's something that is happening on a regular basis and they are again in a situation where they can only move a little bit in each direction, you know, perhaps there's a way to create much larger crates that the animal would have greater freedom of movement. typically the crates that elephants are moved in, or trucks, still greatly limit their movement, that they can't turn around, they can only move a couple steps in any one direction.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

24

25

THE COURT: Let me ask you this. Would it be possible, feasible, to regulate the use of a bull hook?

THE WITNESS: Well, attempts have been made. In California it is illegal to wound, cause a bloody wound, to break the skin. But I think it can be very difficult for the handlers to have that sort of restriction, because of the way they need to control the elephants.

And again, in the circus situation, it's a much

more difficult situation, I believe, for the handlers to use the hook in a more gentle manner, because they are out amongst the public and they have no control of the public, there's no barriers, particularly when they are moving the elephants from the train to the circus arena, there's vehicles, there is all sorts of other things.

2.

2.2.

THE COURT: For that matter when the fans are in the arena.

THE WITNESS: Usually there's some kind of — in that situation there usually is some sort of a barrier, and there's a little bit more control once the elephants get to their particular locations, but it is still a situation that is much more potentially volatile than the zoo setting, where the elephants are almost always in a confined area that the public would have a difficult time getting to, and the elephant can't get out of, so you don't require the same level of control.

THE COURT: But the level of control and protection is far less in the circus setting, under the big top, than it is in a zoo setting?

THE WITNESS: Oh, yes, absolutely.

THE COURT: There's no comparison, is there?

THE WITNESS: There's no comparison. And what the elephants are being asked to do is also in most cases very different, because you really don't see in the zoo setting a

situation where elephants are asked to move very quickly and in a synchronized fashion and doing these very high-powered behaviors, which they are not at all natural behaviors for the elephant. So the handlers have to use a lot of force and use the hook very frequently to keep the elephants moving.

2.

2.2.

And as we saw on the video, just an example, I mean, those elephants, many of them have probably been doing the same routine for many, many years, and yet still the trainer or handler has to sort of run around the ring and force them to move more quickly so that the behaviors stay synchronized and fast moving.

So I think it is a challenging situation for those trainers and handlers to try to keep people safe, to keep the elephants doing what they are supposed to be doing, but also to keep the performance at the level that the public expects.

THE COURT: Have you studied any instances in which elephants have lashed out against members of the public in these circus settings?

THE WITNESS: There's been a few. I think most of the time when the public is injured it's more incidental, that they've just been in the way, or for circuses that do rides, certainly that's a more dangerous situation. Oftentimes I think it's just a matter of luck. When the elephant breaks or does something that it's not supposed to do, you know, whether or not people are in the way or not is kind of a matter of

1 luck. 2 THE COURT: Okay. Redirect? 3 REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. SANERIB: 4 5 Good morning. Ο. 6 Α. Good morning. 7 Just to follow up. You and Judge Sullivan were talking Ο. about the transport of elephants. Do zoos routinely transport 8 9 their elephants? 10 No, I would not say routinely. It's very occasional. 11 We had talked a little bit about the AZA standards 12 yesterday. Are those voluntary standards or mandatory 13 standards? 14 Those are mandatory standards and they are connected to 15 accreditation, so if a zoo does not comply with the standards 16 they might not be able to maintain their accreditation. 17 And you had mentioned yesterday Dr. Sukumar. Who is Q. 18 that? 19 He is one of the leading researchers with Asian Α. 20 elephants. 21 And you had a discussion yesterday about your elephant 0.

A. Her swaying has been dramatically reduced. Over the

Donna and her stereotypic behavior. I wanted to find out how

much does she sway now versus how much she swayed when she was

2.2.

23

24

2.5

chained overnight?

course of the day she may only sway for 20 or 30 minutes. And that's kind of spread out over the day. Compared to when she was chained at night it might be as much as six or seven hours over the overnight time.

THE COURT: Excuse me one second.

BY MS. SANERIB:

2.

2.2.

- Q. Mr. Shea raised a number of elephants that have passed away at the Oakland Zoo. In your opinion did those deaths have anything to do with the zoo's use of protected contact?
- A. No, those were deaths that took place over a large number of years, and they, starting with the initial birth in '95, one of them was a result of literally how the calf landed when it came out of the birth canal. It splayed its hind legs and there was really nothing that could be done for that animal.

And then the other calf — the other calf we raised, hand-raised for 11 months, and it was doing very well when it died of the herpes virus, which is a virus that we've been struggling with within the elephant community. A number of elephants have died of the herpes virus. So I think — none of them I would say had anything to do with protected contact, and they were all very unrelated situations, and it's part of the struggle, particularly with African elephants, not so much the breeding but successful reproduction of African elephants in North America has been a real struggle.

Q. Mr. Shea also asked you about your elephant Lisa and that her first pregnancy was something that the zoo wasn't aware of. Can you explain why that was?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

24

25

Yes. Our male elephant, Smoky, at the time, was raised and handled in a free contact situation and he had the same handler his whole life, who dominated him in a very extreme way, in what I would describe as fairly old school technique in that he was not allowed to extend his penis when anybody was around, and was disciplined for that because it just didn't make for a good family environment. And so Smoky did not do that, and we believe was very inhibited. And so the breeding took place at night, and nobody ever saw the breeding, which is very unusual. Typically elephant breeding is something that you could not miss. And in the breedings that occurred after that one, once Smoky came into musth, then started behaving in a more normal way, the breedings were very obvious, very noisy, something that you would not be able to miss. But before that it truly was something that was sort of concealed in the evening.

And then also with Africans, their first pregnancies are not particularly obvious, they don't get very large, because of course the calf at its maximum is only about 200 pounds, and the elephant weighs about 8,000 or 9,000 pounds. And they don't particularly have any mammary development. In fact she did not have mammary development at

1 all until after the birth.

2.2.

- Q. Who's the bull Smoky named for?
- A. He was named after Smoky Jones, a fairly famous free contact trainer who was in California for many years. And Smoky the elephant and Lisa were transported down to his facility for their initial breaking and training.
- Q. Was it Mr. Jones who taught Smoky not to have his penis extended in front of people?
- A. I don't know who initially taught that behavior. I know I observed Val De Leon, the head trainer when I began at the zoo, correcting Smoky and hitting his penis with the bull hook and telling him to put it away.
- Q. Ms. Kinzley, you discussed foot care with Mr. Shea yesterday. I wanted to ask you, do any of your elephants at the Oakland Zoo have nail bed abscesses?
- A. No.
- Q. And I believe that you mentioned the possibility of nail cracks becoming infected in elephants?
- 19 A. Yes.
 - Q. Why would that happen, or how would that happen?
 - A. Well, if something gets into the crack or if the crack is deep enough, then you potentially could have a problem with infection. And, you know, one of the things that I mentioned as a concern about chaining is that the elephants are forced to stand in feces and urine, and I think that potentially is a

problem for the health of the nails and the feet.

One of the things I observed when I was on the Ringling inspection and had seen at other times is the staining, the discoloration and the abnormal skin on the hind feet that I believe is from urine.

Q. And I think Mr. Shea asked you about whether any of the elephants at the CEC had nail cracks. I wanted to show you a photograph. If we can look at Plaintiffs' May Call Exhibit page 201.

MR. SHEA: I object. That wasn't the precise question I asked.

MS. SANERIB: In any event --

THE COURT: I'll allow the question. I don't recall that to be the precise question either.

BY MS. SANERIB:

2.2.

- Q. How would you describe what is depicted in this photograph?
- A. Well, I would not call it a crack. I would say about a third of the nail is missing, and I don't know how what the history is on that, if the nail blew out, a portion of it, and then once the nail becomes disconnected to the nail bed, often times what needs to be done is to trim off that unhealthy nail, to try to allow the tissue below to harden up and become healthy again and grow back nail.

But in a typical nail crack you don't have a

situation where you're actually removing the nail from the nail bed. So that whole portion of the nail to the right is missing, there is no nail there.

- Q. Okay. And Ms. Kinzley, do your elephants at the Oakland Zoo have arthritis?
- A. No.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

24

- Q. Yesterday, we discussed a video clip that showed young elephants being forced to defecate. The record in this case shows that that video footage was taken in Oakland, California. And I'd like to show you the very beginning of that clip, what has been admitted into evidence as Plaintiff's Will Call Exhibit 133A, and just ask you a couple questions about that footage.
- MR. SHEA: Specifically what portions are being shown?
- MS. SANERIB: It's the very beginning of clip 133A, I think it's the first 30 to 40 seconds.

(Video played).

- 19 BY MS. SANERIB::
 - Q. Starting at 10:37, going to 11 minutes. You can see a handler there?
- A. Yes. There is a handler there. And they are carrying the bull hook just down to their side.
 - Q. Did you see them waving?
- 25 A. Yes.

- Q. Do you have any idea why they would be waving?
- A. I assume they are waving at the person holding the camera. Now one fellow is holding his hand in front of his face, it looked like.
 - Q. So you think they are aware of the camera being present?
 - A. Yes.

2.2.

MR. SHEA: Your Honor, I object. I don't recall this being shown yesterday or this witness being asked about it on direct or cross. It's beyond the scope.

THE COURT: I think it was inquired about during the examination, at least the subsequent portion of it. You didn't go into the beginning portion. It's within the scope.

MS. SANERIB: Thank you.

BY MS. SANERIB:

- Q. Now, you and Mr. Shea this morning were having a conversation about a film that you were sent by Deniz Bolbol in 2004. Do you remember watching that film?
- A. I remember watching it. I'm not sure that I can recall exactly what was on that particular piece of video.

MS. SANERIB: I'd like to show Ms. Kinzley that video footage and ask her if it's the video footage that she remembers watching for Ms. Bolbol. This is Plaintiffs' Will Call Exhibit 128, and it's 17 seconds to 2:22.

MR. SHEA: Your Honor, we object. This is a tape

that they tried to show Mr. Rider. There has been no predicate laid for this tape. For the same reasons we objected, it cannot be shown here, and she's not shown any connection to this being the tape that Ms. Kinzley saw. So, we strenuously object to it being shown now.

THE COURT: What is the purpose of this?

MS. SANERIB: The purpose of this is Mr. Shea asked Ms. Kinzley whether she in fact reviewed video footage by Deniz Bolbol taken in 2004. And we have attempted to get this video footage into evidence. It was taken by Ms. Bolbol and it was eventually given to the USDA. And Ms. Kinzley has testified that she reviewed this footage, and so I'd like to show it to her and see if this is in fact the video footage that she reviewed for Deniz Bolbol, and if she recalls it, and if she can describe the events depicted in this video footage.

MR. SHEA: This is all subject to the briefing that the plaintiffs filed this morning, that we have a response due in right now. We object to it being shown. And I did not ask her about a video clip from Ms. Bolbol. I asked her about a video clip in an article mentioned which was not identified.

THE COURT: All right. I'm not going to allow this to proceed at this point. It may well be that once she returns — she has seen this, you have already shown her this, I assume, off the stand. Is that correct?

MS. SANERIB: Yes.

2.2.

1 THE COURT: Then if there are follow-up questions, 2 we can ask her questions by way of telephone. So until I 3 resolve the issue I'm not going to allow it. 4 MS. SANERIB: Thank you, Your Honor. 5 THE COURT: This is the film allegedly sent to the 6 USDA, is that correct? 7 MS. SANERIB: That is correct. 8 BY MS. SANERIB: 9 Ms. Kinzley, I asked you yesterday if you were opposed 10 to elephants being used in the circus, and I neglected to ask 11 you the basis for your opinion. Could you tell me why? 12 THE COURT: What was your question? 13 MR. SHEA: Your Honor, it goes beyond the direct, 14 obviously. 15 THE COURT: I'm interested in the answer. What was 16 your answer yesterday? 17 THE WITNESS: My answer about that has to do with 18 the chaining and the --19 THE COURT: You're opposed to elephants being in 20 circuses? 21 THE WITNESS: Yes. 2.2. THE COURT: And the reason -- I thought that is consistent with what you said earlier at some point, probably 23 24 during your direct. Because of the chaining and what else. 25 THE WITNESS: The chaining and forceful and

1 frequent use of the bull hook. 2 THE COURT: All right. 3 MS. SANERIB: I have no further questions at this 4 time. 5 THE COURT: Any questions, counsel? 6 MR. SHEA: Just a few, Your Honor. 7 THE COURT: Sure. 8 RECROSS-EXAMINATION 9 BY MR. SHEA: 10 Ms. Kinzley, I believe you just testified that one of 11 the baby elephants died because the baby was dropped out of 12 the birth canal and injured, is that correct? 13 That's correct. 14 Is it your testimony that that would have happened --15 had the elephant been chained under traditional free contact 16 approaches, couldn't that have been controlled and prevented? 17 It could not have been controlled. You don't have 18 access to the calf when it's in the birth canal. 19 Are you saying it was injured when it hit the ground? Q. 20 It was injured when it hit the ground. Α. 21 You're saying that could not have been controlled under Q. 2.2. free contact methods of birthing? 23 No, it could not have. Α. 24 The calf getting the herpes virus and dying, was that 0.

2.5

another one you just mentioned?

1 A. Yes.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

24

Q. Is it your testimony that the herpes virus could not have been found earlier, symptoms of it and treated earlier, and that elephant given a much better chance of surviving the herpes virus, if the animal were managed in free contact training, where people were with the elephant up close and personal a lot of the time during the day?

8 MS. SANERIB: I think that's argumentative.
9 Objection, Your Honor.

THE COURT: I'll let her answer the question if she can.

THE WITNESS: That calf was hand-raised, we were with it 24 hours a day, and it was thoroughly examined many, many times over the course of the day. We discovered any problems that that calf had immediately, and any necessary treatment was given to that calf. And many calves have died in free contact of the herpes virus.

- BY MR. SHEA:
- Q. So you're saying that that calf was actually managed in a free contact environment at that time, correct?
- A. In the sense that it was with people and in contact with people all the time, but a bull hook or any other tool for controlling his behavior or disciplining him was not ever used.
- 25 MR. SHEA: No further questions, Your Honor.

THE COURT: All right. If you wanted to ask a question about her opinion about elephants in circus, you may do so. Although I think you explored that on cross-examination. If you have any other follow-up questions, you may.

MR. SHEA: No, Your Honor.

2.2.

THE COURT: All right. That's fine. Your witness. Any other questions?

MS. SANERIB: No, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Have a safe trip home. Call your next witness.

MR. CRYSTAL: Good morning, Your Honor. At this time we're going to introduce the deposition testimony of Margaret Tom.

THE COURT: All right.

MR. SIMPSON: Your Honor, if I could, if I can just be heard on that, just for the record. There was a colloquy about deposition designations and objections thereto, I think the second day of trial. And I apologize that I was caught a little flat-footed about that. But Your Honor's pretrial order of October 15 at docket 373, paragraph 7, stated that any objection to any portion of the proffered prior testimony or accompanying exhibits, and any counter-designation of the testimony shall be filed in the objection to the pretrial statement on September 16, 2008.

1 And when the defendant filed its September 16 2 filing, we specifically said -- and I'm reading now from the 3 red-line version that was filed later, but this was in the 4 original version on September 16th: That FEI -- and this was 5 plaintiffs' deposition designations. FEI objects to any 6 witnesses providing testimony regarding FEI's Red Unit as 7 irrelevant, improper character evidence, and for other reasons 8 set forth in its motion in limine filed on August 29, 2008, 9 docket number 345. FEI therefore objects to plaintiffs' 10 designations of the depositions of the following current and 11 former Red Unit employees for use at trial. Number 1, Joseph 12 Frisco, Jr. Number 2, Sacha Houke. Number 3, Margaret Tom. 13 And number 4, Carrie Coleman. FEI reserves any and all 14 testimonial objections for trial.

So we think we have preserved our objections, and I think, given what is about to come -

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

24

25

THE COURT: What may come? What is your objection?

MR. SIMPSON: There are going to be a lot of things
that are going to come up in these depositions that I think
are very far afield, and I don't anticipate a lot of
interference, but I think there are going to be some things
like electric prods, other elephants, et cetera, dead
elephants, that are way out of bounds, and I think we should
be allowed to object to that.

I don't anticipate line by line objection to the

form, that kind of thing. But I do think that certain issues like that that would narrow this trial, that is appropriate to deal with at this point.

THE COURT: All right. Counsel? Ms. Tom is a former employee of the circus, is that correct?

MR. CRYSTAL: I'm sorry?

2.2.

THE COURT: Ms. Tom is a former employee?

MR. CRYSTAL: That's right. She's a Red Unit employee, and we have already of course discussed the Red Unit issue. But I believe the issue that Mr. Simpson is addressing is this question about — it's our position that by not specifically raising objections in their objections to the pretrial statement, they have waived testimonial objections. And particularly any objection — relevance is not waived, but as to any other objections, that those objections are waived at this time, because they weren't specifically raised.

So I think Mr. Simpson may be tying together some other statements that they made to suggest they have preserved those objections. Our position is that those objections have been waived at this time since they weren't raised in the pretrial statement.

MR. SIMPSON: Well, Your Honor, I've got it right here. This is the document that was filed in January of '09, red-lined to show what was added in January of '09, and it was already in there in black in September of '08. And we

believe — and of course when this first came up, it was my faulty recollection that we had simply relied on Rule 32, and in fact we had not. So, I just wanted to bring that to the Court's attention.

2.2.

I think that under Your Honor's order, as well as Rule 32 together, that this has been preserved. And there was really no vehicle in the pretrial order for laying all this out. They didn't do it, there would have been a further counter-designation procedure had it been done that way. And I think, given what the rule says, given what Your Honor's order said, that this properly preserves all such objections.

THE COURT: Counsel, why haven't they preserved their objections?

MR. CRYSTAL: Your Honor, on Page 6 of your pretrial statement --

THE COURT: The order? The pretrial order?

MR. CRYSTAL: The pretrial order, yes, of course. You wrote: Any objection to any portion of the proffered prior testimony or accompanying exhibits, and any counter-designation of the testimony, shall be filed in the objection to the pretrial statement on September 16, 2008.

We did do that, and Your Honor already ruled in the context of the Gary Jacobson deposition on this issue in light of the pretrial order. So our view is the same result should apply.

1 THE COURT: Anything else on that? 2 MR. SIMPSON: Well, just that Jacobson was a 3 30(b)(6), the deposition of a party, which under the rule can 4 be used for any purpose. So, I think that's a little 5 different. And we didn't make any objections in Hagan because 6 I don't think there were any to be made. But this one, this 7 group that is coming up now, I think there are some things 8 that should be raised. 9 THE COURT: I don't have my order up here. 10 going to take a very short recess. I want my order -- a more 11 recent statement. You didn't file counter-designations, did 12 you, deposition testimony? 13 MR. SIMPSON: Yes, we did, and we're prepared to 14 read those if they are appropriate to do so as 15 cross-examination. 16 THE COURT: All right. I'll take a very short 17 recess, counsel. 18 (Brief recess). 19 THE COURT: Counsel, correct me if I'm wrong, but 20 it seems clear that Ms. Tom and other -- she was a Red Unit 21 employee, right? 2.2. MR. SIMPSON: That's correct, Your Honor. 23 THE COURT: Ms. Tom and other employees' deposition 24 or portions of depositions were indeed designated as former 25 Red Unit employees. This is consistent with your pattern and

1 practice argument, right? 2 MR. CRYSTAL: That's correct, Your Honor. THE COURT: And it's also true that defendants 3 4 reserved their objection consistent with their motion in 5 limine. And my recollection is, and it's confirmed by the 6 pleadings, the paper, the voluminous amount of paper, that I 7 allowed defendants the opportunity to counter-designate. 8 you've preserved your objection, you haven't waived it. 9 That's clear. 10 Now, what is wrong with what I just said? They did 11 preserve -- their motion in limine was indeed, Judge, this 12 404, this pattern and practice, should not come in at all. 13 And basically that is your case, because without that, you 14 don't have a case, do you? 15 MR. CRYSTAL: And you ruled that the Red Unit 16 evidence could come in, Your Honor. 17 THE COURT: For that purpose. 18 MR. CRYSTAL: And that was last October, so I think 19 we have --20 THE COURT: And their objection is still preserved. 21 They didn't waive objection, they preserved it consistent with 2.2. their in limine motion to exclude pattern and practice 23 evidence. 24 MR. CRYSTAL: And their right to object on

relevance grounds, which is basically I think the nature of

the objection, is fine. I think the question is whether or not they have preserved the right to make testimonial objections now to those depositions.

THE COURT: Well -- go ahead.

2.2.

MR. CRYSTAL: And the concern we have is again your order, which I know you've now read, required specific, we designated, they were required under your order to say what they objected to. We did that, Your Honor. Our pretrial statement objections specifically cited the portions of the depositions and the basis for our testimonial objections.

We've now made decisions about what we're going to show the Court, what we're going to elicit regarding the depositions, based on the fact that there were no testimonial objections made specifically. We don't believe their statement in their pretrial statement that says that they reserve any and all testimonial objections is sufficient.

THE COURT: Which one are you referring to now?
Which one? Because — which one are you referring to? I'm looking at their objections. The objections filed
September 16, 2008.

MR. CRYSTAL: I'm looking at --

THE COURT: Wait a minute. Wherein defendants made reference to the Red Unit testimony, specifically objecting to any witness providing testimony. And this is pursuant to your pattern and practice argument. And Feld essentially objected

to the testimony of the following employees — period. Just objected. So. And your argument now is that because they failed to make any more precise evidentiary objections on relevance, they waived them?

2.2.

MR. CRYSTAL: That is exactly right. Again, they have specifically said with regard to this portion, we object on hearsay grounds or other grounds, which is what we did in our response, what we believe your order required.

And if I could just finally refer Your Honor, I mentioned the Gary Jacobson colloquy that happened. We pulled that out. That was on February 10th, and this is --

THE COURT: He was a 30(b)(6) witness, though. A little bit different.

MR. CRYSTAL: We don't believe there would be any reason -- in fact, the plaintiffs designated the entire Gary Jacobson deposition. So if there were any cause for concern about --

THE COURT: You talked about that, and basically defendant's position was they relied on Rule 32, notwithstanding my directive to file any objections that they had to that testimony. They relied on Rule 32 to preserve objections, and making objections at the time of trial.

MR. CRYSTAL: Your Honor's ruling on February 10 was -- and I'm quoting from line 22, on February 10 -- Page 22, excuse me. There were no objections. Notwithstanding

what Rule 32 says, there were no objections. I expressly said in my order, in my court order, if there are objections, state them. There were no objections, and that's the reason why, without any qualifications, the 30(b)(6) testimony comes in.

2.2.

And our view is the same would be true with regard to other deposition testimony that we specifically have designated and they have not specifically provided in advance testimonial objections so that we could be prepared to tailor our testimony that we're going to introduce based on those testimonial objections. So would ask the Court to apply the same rule, based on their failure to provide those testimonial objections in their filing, as required by the Court's order.

THE COURT: What about in the filing in January?

Did they not file --

MR. CRYSTAL: I was reading — earlier I was reading from their January 12 filing, which I believe Mr. Simpson was reading from, which has exactly the language Your Honor referred to earlier. It has a general objection to any Red Unit evidence, consistent with their motion in limine. But then it further says, and I'm getting, FEI reserves any and all testimonial objections for trial. And we don't believe that that is what Your Honor's order — Your Honor's order didn't allow that, that kind of a broad preservation.

THE COURT: Counsel.

MR. SIMPSON: Well, Your Honor, as I stated when I

started this, with respect to Jacobson, I was unaware that we had done this. That was my mistake. When I said it was just Rule 32. I was wrong, and we did more than that. And I've referred Your Honor to that.

2.

2.2.

We have an issue here because when the depositions were taken, many of these objections were made on the record during the time the deposition was taken. So when we went back and looked at that, we saw no function to be repeating all that again when it's already in the very parts of the depositions that they —

THE COURT: Didn't I say, though, make your objections? The whole purpose of saying that was to streamline this trial.

MR. SIMPSON: But these were encapsulated in what they had designated. So, they would designate a question, there was an objection and then an answer. So it seems to me that was preserved by operation of their own designations and our counter-designations.

I think what the issue here is, do we now get to object, as the deposition is being read here today, on the basis of something that is not actually in the transcript. That's the debate. We thought we preserved that. If we didn't, we didn't.

THE COURT: I don't think you did. I'll go back -I need to look at one more order. I don't think you did. In

fairness, that was the whole purpose of this, if we're going to look at a potentially six-week trial and try to get it down to maybe I could try it in 10 days or more. But that was the whole purpose, to put everyone on fair notice just what the objections were.

2.2.

MR. SIMPSON: But these particular witnesses were flagged, and I think he's -- he doesn't seem to disagree that on the ground of relevance has not been -- has been preserved.

And I think --

no problems with that. You have objected to that line of evidence and the witnesses. I totally agree with that. But I don't think that you've reserved your other objections, though, although you raise an interesting point. To the extent they were objected to in the deposition and they are objected to, query whether or not that reserves your objection.

MR. SIMPSON: It is an unnecessary additional list, if they give you a transcript that has a bunch of green highlighting, and in that green highlighting are all the objections that were made at the time, I don't know what is served at that point by making an additional list of the objections.

THE COURT: I think what is served is if they

aren't stated in response to the directive to state them, then they're waived, I think.

2.2.

MR. SIMPSON: Well, Your Honor, I think that that's how we interpreted it, Your Honor. And I apologize if there's any inconvenience to the Court.

THE COURT: It's not an inconvenience.

MR. CRYSTAL: Just briefly. I could sort of cut through that last part, because there is an area of agreement that Mr. Simpson may not understand. If they counter-designated portions of the depositions where an objection was made, we don't disagree that that objection is preserved in their counter-designation. What we're talking about is new objections that they can make now.

THE COURT: This is academic then, if they -MR. CRYSTAL: No, I think Mr. Simpson was
suggesting that they could make objections now, standing here
now, when there wasn't an objection made at the time the
deposition was taken. That is the area of disagreement.

THE COURT: I guess — he can tell me if I'm wrong — my guess is that whatever objections he wanted to make now would be the objections that he maintained or made during the course of the deposition, I assume.

MR. SIMPSON: That is correct, Your Honor. But I think the way we read Rule 32, notwithstanding the way this has played out here this morning, is that certain objections

are preserved by the rule until trial. For example, if he asks a compound question that wasn't cured, if you ask somebody to speculate about something and they went ahead and speculated, I think under the rule that can be raised now. Your Honor's order seems to suggest pretty clearly that is not the case if it wasn't preserved.

2.2.

THE COURT: If you preserved it -- and I don't hear plaintiffs' counsel disagreeing -- if you preserved it, it comes in. And that's why I said it's very interesting. I don't see why it doesn't come in if you preserved it in your counter-designation to that designation, whatever it is, it comes in.

MR. SIMPSON: It's not just --

THE COURT: If it was new objections — I can't imagine there would be any new objections, but if there are, make them, because it may be something that I want to address notwithstanding the fact that it wasn't preserved.

MR. SIMPSON: But there also were objections made in the parts that they designated, not just in our counter-designations, but in the parts that they designated. And remember, we started with a broad universe of deposition designations that in these 72-hour lists have been cut down. And so we've had to respond. And we responded with counter-designations to a universe of designations that have been narrowed. So I think some of those have to be, I think,

also dealt with too, to the extent they come up. The ones
that are in their designations.

THE COURT: Let's proceed with Ms. Tom. Let me

2.2.

just see just what the problem is, if there is a problem at all. Because there may not be a problem. I understand exactly what you're saying. But let's proceed, and I want you to tell me what you didn't preserve at the time of her deposition that you would have made objections to pursuant to Rule 32.

MR. SIMPSON: Like I say, I don't think there are very many of those, as a practical matter.

THE COURT: Let's proceed with Ms. Tom's deposition.

MR. SIMPSON: I don't want to be a problem, but there is one other issue that is specific to Margaret Tom that Ms. Petteway will address because that is her witness.

THE COURT: All right.

MR. CRYSTAL: Can I say one other thing before we turn on to that, which is, it seems like there may be a final area of disagreement, and I agree with Your Honor, we'll see what happens. But our position is with regard to specific designated pages that we designated —

THE COURT: And you did. I want that clear on the record. You did.

MR. CRYSTAL: If they wanted to introduce an

objection that they made within that page, they were obligated — and this again is what we did — to counter-designate that objection. I think Mr. Simpson is suggesting that they can now raise an objection that they didn't counter-designate. And we don't think that's consistent with your order.

THE COURT: I thought I understood you to say that you essentially have no objections — which would be consistent with the Court — indicated that there were objections preserved during the deposition testimony; those objections would become a part of the deposition testimony that you offer into evidence, if they were preserved.

MR. SIMPSON: As far as — if they are on the transcript of the deposition, the Court ought to hear them, if those questions and answers are read. If they are not, then it's academic. But I think the problem we had is they started with a lot of designations that they wanted to proceed with that they've cut way back on. We relied on that when they were originally made, and we relied on those designations when we counter-designated. And that's been subsequently winnowed down in the 72-hour process, and I don't want to get —

THE COURT: Which is not unusual, and you may do the same, you may winnow some of yours down, which is not unusual.

MR. SIMPSON: Exactly. But just because we didn't

2.2.

1 counter-designate an objection in something they've 2 highlighted in green I don't think waives it. I think if they highlighted it in green, which was their color, then the Court 3 4 should consider it. 5 THE COURT: Anything else on that? 6 MR. CRYSTAL: No. Again, our view is that the 7 obligation under the Court's order was to counter-designate. 8 So it needed to be something they designated, so we knew that that was an objection that they were preserving. That's all. 9 10 THE COURT: Yes. 11 MS. PETTEWAY: Well, I'd like to renew our 12 objection that it's Red Unit, cumulative, and irrelevant. 13 addition to that, though, the plaintiffs have raised certain 14 concerns about portions of Ms. Tom's testimony being 15 embarrassing. And it's our position --16 THE COURT: Embarrassing to her? 17 MS. PETTEWAY: Embarrassing to her. 18 THE COURT: Is she a current employee? 19 She's a former employee. MS. PETTEWAY: It's our 20 recommendation that neither party rely on Ms. Tom's deposition 21 testimony for that reason. If plaintiffs do want to rely on 2.2. her deposition testimony, the embarrassing portions have to 23 come out as part of our cross-examination. We don't think

The embarrassing testimony goes to why she was

that our right of cross-examination can be cut off.

24

terminated from her employment with the circus. It also goes to why she's targeted one individual as an alleged elephant abuser. Plaintiffs have not sought a protective order. Ms. Tom was represented by counsel at her deposition.

2.2.

THE COURT: She was not represented?

MS. PETTEWAY: She was represented, by Scad & Arps. And her counsel and plaintiffs' counsel have not sought a protective order over the testimony. So it's our position if they are going to rely on her testimony, then the embarrassing portions of her testimony also have to come in.

MR. CRYSTAL: Your Honor, Ms. Tom is separately represented, and her counsel is aware that we're going to be introducing portions of her testimony. We were not asking — I'm not sure what is being referred to — but we were not asking for the exclusion of particular counter-designations.

Excuse me a second. Excuse me for just one second. THE COURT: Sure.

MR. CRYSTAL: We're not asking that any portion of any of the counter-designations be excluded at this time. There are some embarrassing materials that were suggested at the deposition. We think the Court could not allow the public to hear those portions. But I haven't been asked and her counsel is not here today to ask for that to happen.

THE COURT: So what is your position? You are not asking -- you're asking that -- are you saying that you have

1 no objections to excluding those portions from the public 2 record? Is that what you're saying? 3 MR. CRYSTAL: I think that's what is being 4 suggested, basically. I think it would be appropriate to 5 exclude those portions from the public record. 6 THE COURT: That's fine. I'll do that. I'll seal 7 those portions. 8 MR. CRYSTAL: Thank you. THE COURT: How does the Court utilize those 9 10 portions? Are those portions relevant to the Court's 11 resolution of any issue? 12 MR. CRYSTAL: We certainly don't think so. 13 assume they're going to maintain that it goes to credibility. 14 We certainly don't think so. 15 MS. PETTEWAY: We don't think it's necessary to be 16 part of the public record. We just wanted to highlight this 17 issue, that before plaintiffs put this into play, we wanted to 18 make them aware that the embarrassing testimony is --19 THE COURT: It's no one's intent to put any 20 embarrassing testimony on the public -- it's no one's 21 intention --2.2. MS. PETTEWAY: That's exactly right. 23 THE COURT: I'll seal that portion. But it's 24 defendant's position that the embarrassing portion, the Court 25 may have to rely upon the embarrassing issues to resolve some

1 | further issues in this case, is that right?

2.2.

MS. PETTEWAY: That's correct.

THE COURT: And that's -- if it's appropriate, then I'll seal that portion.

MS. PETTEWAY: Two other housekeeping matters. We designated Ms. Tom's testimony, and plaintiffs designated it as well, so I wanted to make it clear we're going to be reading in our own designations at this time for efficiency purposes.

Also we have one completeness objection to the plaintiffs' designations in the 72-hour list. So we'd like to read that concurrently as they are reading their portions of the testimony. Also for efficiency purposes.

MR. CRYSTAL: That's fine. Just as a housekeeping matter, what we were going to do is a member of our staff, Katherine Graff (phonetic), was going to sit in the box, I was going to read the questions, and she would give the answers. So if you just want to tell me what the portion is you want to read the rest, then she can just read the rest.

THE COURT: Why don't you do that. I still want to read one more order, if you need to talk off the record for a second. And then we'll proceed with this. This is going to take three hours?

MR. CRYSTAL: No, from our standpoint, our designations should take 10 or 15 minutes.

THE COURT: That's good. All right. Because the matter I have at 12:15 will take no more than 15 minutes. It's sealed but it will take no more than 15 minutes. I may want to bring everyone back for — I forgot about the cafeteria closing. Do you folks go downstairs to the cafeteria to eat lunch? Do you use that?

MR. CRYSTAL: Sometimes.

2.2.

THE COURT: The reason I'm asking, I'm not inviting you out to lunch, I'm just asking — I'm asking because it closes at 2:00 and I want to be sensitive to that. If I'm inviting you folks, I'll invite everyone.

MS. PETTEWAY: The defendant's counter-designations should be about 20, 25 minutes.

THE COURT: All right. Give me five minutes. (Brief recess).

THE COURT: All right. So the record is crystal clear, with respect to Tom or anyone else who was deposed and plaintiff is offering deposition testimony, if an objection was made to a question asked during the deposition, there was not a need to further object pursuant to my pretrial order.

My pretrial order encompassed any objections that were not previously made during the course of the deposition. I think that's — are we missing someone? Where is Mr. Simpson? And you agree with that, counsel, right?

MR. SIMPSON: I apologize.

THE COURT: That is a bad habit I have, if I'm focused on what I want to say, sometimes I don't look out there to see who's sitting out there.

2.2.

What I was saying is this. With respect to Tom's testimony or anyone else's testimony, plaintiff for example wishes to offer Ms. Tom's testimony. And if there are objections made to portions of her testimony, her testimony subject to the objection made, and indeed that objection as preserved comes in. The intent of my order was to require parties to designate or to make objections not previously made during the course of the deposition. So, it would be no new objections. But if you made objections, they designated a portion that was objected to, that portion plus the objection comes in.

MR. SIMPSON: I agree with that.

THE COURT: That was the intent of my order.

MR. SHEA: I understand, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Let's proceed.

MR. CRYSTAL: We'd be reading portions of the deposition of Margaret Tom, which was conducted on December 17, 2007. And we're going to begin on Page 6 of that deposition where Ms. Tom was sworn. The court reporter said: Thereupon, Margaret Tom was called for examination by counsel, and after having been duly sworn by the notary, was examined and testified as follows.

1 And the first question was:

- Q. Ms. Tom, is there any reason today why you cannot testify truthfully and accurately?
 - A. There is none.
 - Q. And you have kind of a soft voice so if you would try to speak up a little bit, and I will try to listen very closely. What timeframe did you work for the circus?
 - A. I do not remember.
 - Q. Does this let me give you some dates and see if this sounds right to you. Okay. From approximately April 2005 to August 2006?
- 12 **A.** Yes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

- Q. And the timeframe that you worked there, was that also the same timeframe that your husband worked there?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Which unit did you work on?
- 17 A. The Red.
 - Q. Is that the only unit you have ever worked on?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. What was your job there?
- 21 A. Backstage.
- 22 Q. And what were your duties as a backstage person?
- 23 A. Taking care of props and getting animals ready to go
- 24 out. We would get them ready to go out on the floor.
- 25 Q. So you were taking care of props. When you say getting

- ready to go out on the floor, you mean to go out to the performance?
- 3 A. Yes.
- Q. Why did you end up leaving Ringling Brothers in August of 2006?
 - A. They said they suspended me, and I left to go back to the train. And then about two hours later my husband called and said we got fired.
 - Q. So that wasn't your decision to leave?
- 10 A. No.

7

8

- 11 MR. CRYSTAL: The next portion begins on Page 14, 12 line 6. Ouestion:
- 13 Q. You said that your husband was there?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. What was your husband's job?
- 16 A. Taking care of the animals.
- 17 Q. Which animals?
- 18 A. He was the horses mostly.
- 19 Q. Did you ever complain to anybody about the way the 20 animals were treated?
- 21 MR. CRYSTAL: And then there's an objection to the 22 form of the question.
- 23 A. Yes.
- MR. CRYSTAL: Now we're going to read the portions
 that the defendants have asked us to also read into the

1 record.

- 2 THE COURT: Fine.
- 3 BY MR. CRYSTAL:
 - Q. When did you do that?
- 5 A. I don't remember exactly the dates.
- 6 Q. Was it while you were still working?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Do you have an idea as to how many times you did that?
- 9 A. I'm not really sure.
- 10 Q. Do you think it is more or less than five times?
- 11 A. I'm not really sure.
- 12 Q. Do you think it is more or less than 10 times?
- 13 A. I'm not really sure.
- 14 Q. Did you do that the entire time you worked there?
- 15 A. I don't remember.
- 16 MR. CRYSTAL: Now we're back to our designations.
- 17 Q. Do you remember any of the complaints that you made?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Can you tell me what those were?
- 20 A. About the Asia incident.
- 21 Q. What was the complaint about Asia?
- 22 A. They beat Asia coming off of the floor.
- 23 MR. CRYSTAL: Now we turn to page 19 of the
- deposition. At this point there's a discussion about Exhibit
- 25 1 introduced in the deposition, which is Defendant's Exhibit

1 | 140, which we just display for Your Honor's understanding of the discussion. The question is --

MS. PETTEWAY: We object to this document as hearsay.

MR. CRYSTAL: I'm simply showing it to Your Honor to help you understand the questions and answers. We're not introducing it at this time.

THE COURT: That's fine.

BY MR. CRYSTAL:

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

18

20

- Q. If you would look, please, at the second paragraph, the very first sentence of your letter states: It was common for the elephants to be hit, whacked and prodded with bull hooks just before going into the arena, end quote. Do you see that?
- 14 A. Yes.
- Q. So can you explain what you mean by the elephants being hit, whacked and prodded?
- 17 A. They would get hit, poked with the bull hooks.
 - O. Which ones?
- 19 A. All of them.
 - MR. CRYSTAL: And then there was an objection to the form of the question.
- 22 Q. All of the elephants?
- 23 A. (Indicating).
- Q. How often did this happen?
- 25 A. All the time.

- Q. And you were standing by the door to the show because that is part of your job, right?
- 3 A. Yes.
- Q. And then the animals would come line up by the door, correct?
 - A. Yes.

7

- Q. And is that when you saw this?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And which employees did you see doing this to the elephant?
 - A. I'm not sure of the names right now.
- 12 Q. Did you ever know any of their names?
- 13 A. I knew some of their names.
- 14 Q. Which names do you remember?
- 15 A. I just know them by their first names.
- 16 Q. That is okay. You can give me their first names.
- 17 A. Jimmy.
- 18 Q. Jimmy?
- 19 A. Yes, that is the only one I remember.
- 20 Q. Do you remember any other names?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. So explain to me, you started to do this, the incident
- with Asia that you referenced, can you tell me what happened
- 24 | with Asia?
- 25 A. She defecated on one of the performers and they took

- 1 her off of the floor and started hitting her.
- 2 Q. Who's they?
- A. Jimmy was the only one I seen, but they said there were others there, but I don't remember.
 - Q. Who said there were others?
- 6 A. The people that worked with me.
- 7 Q. And who was that?
- 8 A. The backstage crew.
 - Q. What other names that saw this?
- 10 A. Victor and Joe. That is all I know.
- 11 Q. I'm sorry. Victor?
- 12 A. Victor and Joe.
- 13 Q. Did you say Joe Solito (phonetic)? I am sorry.
- 14 A. No, I don't know their last names.
- 15 Q. So you only saw Jimmy?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. So you said they took her backstage and started hitting
- 18 her?

- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Can you describe for me how Jimmy was hitting her?
- 21 A. I do not remember the whole -- how he was swinging or
- 22 whatever. I don't remember.
- 23 Q. Do you remember how long this lasted?
- 24 A. I'm not sure, because I walked away.
- 25 Q. Where did you go to?

- 1 A. I went backstage.
- 2 Q. You went backstage?
- 3 A. Yes.

6

7

17

- Q. So how long were you there while Jimmy was doing this?
- 5 A. I'm not really sure.
 - Q. A short time? A long time?
 - A. I was just trying to do my job.
- Q. So you walked backstage and you were not able to see then how it ended?
- 10 A. No.
- Q. In this letter, if you look at the very last sentence,
 do you see that? It says, quote, I witnessed two guys beat
 Asia the minute she left the stage, hitting her at least 10
 times with bull hooks, making her scream. Do you see that?
- 15 MR. CRYSTAL: And then we turn to Page 24, line 9, and the question continues.
 - Q. Right here, the last sentence of that paragraph, do you see that?
- 19 A. Yes, I see it.
- 20 Q. So there you write: I witnessed two guys beat Asia.
- A. Jimmy was the only one near me. There was another image there, but like I said, I couldn't tell you who it was.
- 23 Q. You saw two people?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. But you don't know the name of one of them?

- 1 A. No, I do not.
- 2 Q. How far away were you standing from Asia when this
- 3 happened?
- 4 A. I couldn't really tell you. I was close enough, but
- 5 | not too close.
- 6 Q. Maybe 10 feet?
- 7 A. No, it was a little closer than that.
- 8 Q. Closer, maybe five feet?
- 9 A. It could have been.
- 10 Q. So you recognized Jimmy?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And then tell me what you saw of this other person.
- 13 A. I just seen an image, and they were hitting Asia too.
- 14 And then I just turned around and walked out. I couldn't
- 15 handle it no more.
- Q. Was it the person -- was it the front of the person or
- 17 the back of the person?
- 18 A. I couldn't really tell.
- 19 Q. Did Asia go back into the show that night?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. How long after this happened?
- 22 A. Right after it.
- 23 Q. Was she bleeding?
- 24 A. She was, but they didn't care.
- 25 Q. Did she have blood on her when she went back into the

- 1 show?
- 2 A. I'm not really sure.
- 3 Q. Did you see her go back into the show?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. So at some point you returned?
- 6 A. Yes. I was at the back curtain.
- 7 Q. So you walked away?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And how long were you gone?
- 10 A. I can't really tell.
- 11 Q. You don't know how many minutes?
- 12 A. I don't remember.
- 13 Q. A short time or a long time?
- 14 A. I'm not really sure.
- 15 Q. But why did you come back then?
- 16 A. I came up to the back curtain to get the other animals
 17 ready to go out.
- Q. So when you went back to the curtain, that is when you saw Asia go in?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. So you saw Asia come back out a second time then?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. And did anything happen to Asia the second time she
- 24 came back out?
- 25 A. They got her out of the curtain and started hitting her

- 1 again. Then that was it.
- 2 Q. Who was hitting her the second time?
 - A. Jimmy is the only one I seen.
 - Q. How was he hitting her?
- 5 A. He was hitting her with a bull hook.
- 6 \blacksquare Q. Where at?

- 7 A. I can't really tell you. I don't remember exactly 8 where.
- 9 Q. So how long did Jimmy spend hitting Asia?
- 10 A. Right after we seen him start hitting, they left with 11 the animals, so I don't really know.
- 12 Q. They left. You mean they took the elephants back to 13 the tent?
- 14 A. Yes, because we had to bring other animals in and they
 15 were in the way.
- Q. So the second time when they came out, did Jimmy stop
 with Asia or did he just keep going straight from the curtain
 to the tent?
- 19 A. No, he stopped.
- Q. He stopped?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And what did the other elephants do?
- 23 A. They stopped also.
- 24 Q. They all stopped?
- 25 A. Uh-huh.

- 1 Q. Do you have any idea how long they were stopped for?
- 2 A. No, because I was doing the horses.
 - Q. So you were trying to get the horses ready to go on?
- 4 A. Yes.

7

8

- 5 Q. What do you have to do to get the horses ready?
- 6 \blacksquare A. We was just getting them just up to go out.
 - Q. You put their costumes on?
 - A. No, we just do like little blankets on them.
- 9 Q. By the time you finished putting the blankets on the
- 10 horses, had the elephants moved off?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Is there anything else that you can remember about what 13 you call the Asia incident?
- 14 A. Just how she squealed.
- 15 Q. What did she do? Can you describe that?
- 16 A. A deafening squeal.
- 17 MR. CRYSTAL: Now we're at the bottom of page 30, 18 picking up from line 20.
- Q. You say in the very last paragraph of this letter that we were looking at that you grew very fond of the elephants.
- 21 Do you see that?
 - A. Yes.

2.2.

- 23 Q. Which elephants did you grow very fond of?
- 24 A. All of them.
- 25 Q. All of them. Do you remember how many elephants there

1 were?

3

- 2 A. Ten that I dealt with.
 - Q. Do you remember their names?
- 4 A. I remember some names.
- 5 Q. Which ones can you remember?
- A. Asia, Baby, Tonka is the only ones I can remember right now.
- Q. Did you have any of the elephants that were your favorites?
- 10 A. The ones I named.
- 11 Q. Asia, Baby and Tonka?
- 12 A. Uh-huh.
- 13 Q. Why were they your favorites?
- 14 A. Just how I dealt with them, how they were on the line 15 is how I dealt with them.
- 16 Q. How did you deal with them?
- 17 A. Just got them ready for the show, talked to them.
 - Q. What did you have to do to get them ready for the show?
- 19 A. Nothing, just put blankets on them and got ready.
- 20 MR. CRYSTAL: The last section moves to Page 45 of 21 the deposition, beginning on line 20. And this is a 22 discussion of Exhibit 3 to the deposition, which is
- Defendant's Exhibit 142, which again we'll just display so the Court can understand the questions.
- 25 MS. PETTEWAY: We again object to the document as

- 1 hearsay, but not to the testimony.
- 2 THE COURT: All right.
- 3 BY MR. CRYSTAL:

- 4 Q. Number 3, please.
 - MR. CRYSTAL: And the document referred to marked
- 6 Deposition Exhibit Number 3 for identification and
- 7 subsequently attached to the deposition.
- 8 Q. Please take your time and let me know when you are
- 9 ready. Okay?
- 10 MR. CRYSTAL: And it indicates that the witness
- 11 reviewed the document.
- 12 Q. Have you looked at this?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Have you ever seen this before?
- 15 A. I have seen it before.
- 16 Q. Is that your signature at the bottom?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. It says a date of April 4th, 2007 at the bottom. Do
- 19 you see that?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Is that when you signed this?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Where did you sign this at?
- 24 A. I'm not really sure.
- 25 Q. Do you remember speaking with somebody named Carol

- 1 Ballard?
- 2 A. I don't remember the name.
- 3 Q. Do you remember speaking with somebody from the USDA?
- 4 A. Yes.
- Q. Did you understand when you signed this that this was
- 6 submitted under oath?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. When you reference in here that, at the very bottom of
- 9 that first paragraph, it says, quote: I believe I was fired
- 10 because I saw them abusing the animals and I voiced my
- 11 concerns to management and the corporate office, end quote.
- 12 **A.** Yes.
- 13 Q. Do you see that? Who did you mean when you said
- management?
- 15 A. My supervisor and the manager.
- 16 Q. Who was your supervisor?
- 17 A. I'm not really sure.
- 18 Q. And the manager, do you mean the general manager?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. What concerns did you tell your supervisor?
- 21 A. That it very -- that it upset me very badly.
- 22 Q. What upset you very badly?
- 23 A. The beatings and the abuse to the animals.
- Q. When did you tell your supervisor that?
- 25 A. I'm not really sure.

- 1 Q. Was it before or after the incident with Asia?
- 2 A. It was after the incident.
- 3 Q. With Asia?
- 4 A. Uh-huh.
- 5 Q. Do you know how long after the incident with Asia?
- 6 A. No, I'm not really sure.
 - Q. When did you voice your concerns with the manager?
- 8 A. The same day.
- 9 Q. The same day. Was it the same conversation?
- 10 A. Yes.

- 11 Q. Was there anybody else there?
- 12 | A. No.
- 13 Q. When you voiced your concern, what did they say?
- 14 A. Keep quiet or you will be fired.
- 15 Q. Did they say anything else?
- 16 A. No, they just told me to go back to work. That is what
- 17 | I did.
- 18 Q. And then you also referenced there at the corporate
- 19 office. Who did you tell at the corporate office?
- 20 A. I'm not really sure. I just know someone was there.
- 21 Q. I didn't hear the last part.
- 22 A. Someone was there from the corporate office. That is
- 23 all I remember.
- Q. Was it male or female?
- 25 A. I'm not really sure.

```
1
            Did you speak in person?
       Q.
 2
       Α.
            Yes.
 3
                MR. CRYSTAL: That's all, Your Honor. Thank you.
 4
                THE COURT: All right.
                                        Thank you.
 5
                               We're going to be playing video for
                MS. PETTEWAY:
 6
    Ms. Tom's deposition. And the first section is Page 12, lines
 7
     7 to 22.
 8
                (Video deposition played).
                MS. PETTEWAY: The next portion we'd like to play
 9
10
     is Page 16, lines 3 through 10.
11
                THE COURT:
                           All right.
12
                (Video deposition played).
13
                MS. PETTEWAY: For the record, this is Plaintiffs'
14
     Will Call 116. The next section is Page 16, line 18, to Page
15
     17, line 22.
16
                (Video deposition played).
                               The next portion we'd like to play
17
                MS. PETTEWAY:
18
     is Page 54, line 15, to Page 55, line 20.
19
                THE COURT: All right.
20
                (Video deposition played).
21
                MS. PETTEWAY: The next portion is Page 56, line
2.2.
     11, to 57, line 8.
23
                (Video deposition played).
24
                MS. PETTEWAY: For the record, Deposition Exhibit 4
25
    has been marked as Defendant's Trial Exhibit 143.
```

1 THE COURT: All right. 2 (Video deposition played). 3 MS. PETTEWAY: For the record Deposition Exhibit 5 is Defendant's Trial Exhibit 144. 4 5 THE COURT: All right. 6 (Video deposition played). 7 MS. PETTEWAY: Deposition 6 is Defendant's Trial 8 Exhibit 145. 9 THE COURT: All right. 10 (Video deposition played). 11 MS. PETTEWAY: For the record, the previous portion 12 that was played was Page 57, line 20, to 62, line 4. And the 13 next portion that we'll play is Page 62, line 9, to 65, line 14 21. 15 THE COURT: All right. 16 (Video deposition played). 17 MS. PETTEWAY: Exhibit 7 to the deposition is Defendant's Trial Exhibit 146. 18 19 (Video deposition played). 20 MR. CRYSTAL: Your Honor, we're going to -- at this 21 time I think we're about to get to the embarrassing portion. 2.2. Are you continuing? 23 MS. PETTEWAY: This is the embarrassing portion of 24 the testimony. 25 THE COURT: We can skip over that. I don't know

1 any other way to handle it. I'm going to receive it sealed. 2 MR. CRYSTAL: That's right. 3 MS. PETTEWAY: We'd request that we can provide you 4 with the video portion of the deposition. 5 THE COURT: Do I need that? 6 MS. PETTEWAY: We request that you do to assess 7 this witness's credibility and her ability to make 8 allegations. THE COURT: That's fine. All right. That's fine. 9 10 MR. CRYSTAL: All I'd raise, Your Honor, is we did 11 preserve some objections to some of that testimony, so when 12 that gets filed, if we could have an opportunity to file any 13 objections that we reserved with regard to that portion. 14 THE COURT: Absolutely. 15 MS. PETTEWAY: We'll resume playing at Page 77, 16 line 16. 17 THE COURT: All right. 18 (Video deposition played). MS. PETTEWAY: That's Defendant's Trial Exhibit 19 20 152. 21 (Video deposition played). 2.2. MR. CRYSTAL: We preserved some objections to the 23 hearsay in these portions. That is in our objections. 24 THE COURT: All right. 25 (Video deposition played).

1 MS. PETTEWAY: The next section is Page 80, line 2 10, to 81, line 1. 3 (Video deposition played). The final portion is Page 83, line 4 MS. PETTEWAY: 5 13, to 85, line 7. 6 (Video deposition played). 7 MS. PETTEWAY: And for the record the portions that 8 we'll submit to the Court are Page 64, line 14, to 65, line 9 21. Page 66, line 5, to Page 68, line 2. And Page 68, line 10 10, to Page 76, line 10. 11 THE COURT: All right. 12 Thank you. MS. PETTEWAY: 13 MR. CRYSTAL: Your Honor, I just have two very 14 brief additional, and I think it may be easiest for me to just 15 read them in at this point rather than bringing the witness 16 back. 17 The witness is here, if you want to THE COURT: 18 recall the witness, that's fine. 19 MR. CRYSTAL: Recall my witness. If we can turn to 20 Page 35 of the deposition, we're going to start reading from 21 line 18, and we're going to read until -- sorry, we're going 2.2. to start at line 1 and read until line 17 on Page 35. 35, line 1. 23

What did you do in Wagon 16?

We sit down and talked to the manager.

24

25

Ο.

Α.

- 1 Q. Mr. Griggs?
- 2 A. I'm not really sure. I do not remember names.
 - Q. That is okay. A man?
- 4 A. Yes.

3

8

9

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

24

25

- 5 Q. What did you talk to this man about?
- A. Just we were not supposed to talk about what we had seen. And that we were gone.
 - Q. I am sorry. And we were?
 - A. We were gone, we got fired.
- 10 Q. This man told you you are not supposed to talk about what you saw?
- 12 **A.** Yes.
 - MR. CRYSTAL: And then the other section, if we can turn to Page 73. We're going to begin at line 19 and go until Page 74, also line 19.
 - Q. Did you agree never to do that?
- 17 A. I agreed just to keep my job at the time.
 - MS. PETTEWAY: We object to this testimony because it wasn't designated by plaintiffs.
 - MR. CRYSTAL: Your Honor, we're in redirect now, so just in fact, this is in part responsive to what you're going to see under seal. We can submit this in response to the under seal portions, but again, this is responsive to what you're going to be hearing on the cross—examination ultimately.

1 THE COURT: I'll allow it over objection. 2 MR. CRYSTAL: Again, we're on line 19. 3 Did you agree never to do that? Q. I agreed just to keep my job at the time. 4 Α. 5 So somebody --0. 6 MS. PETTEWAY: Your Honor, we also object that if 7 the portion of the testimony is going to be sealed, then all 8 of it as a whole should be sealed. 9 THE COURT: I agree. 10 MR. CRYSTAL: That's fine. We can submit that or 11 agree to include that in the portion. 12 That's fine, if the plaintiffs' MS. PETTEWAY: 13 counsel will give us page and line numbers. 14 THE COURT: All right. Anything else? 15 MR. CRYSTAL: No, Your Honor. 16 THE COURT: All right. It's only 12:30. You have 17 one other witness for today, is that correct? The fact 18 witness? 19 MR. CRYSTAL: We have another live witness and we 20 have some other deposition testimony for today. 21 THE COURT: Because the matter is sealed I need to 2.2. speak with Carol in the hallway first for a moment. 23 trying to juggle. 24 OFF THE RECORD 25

THE COURT: We'll start back at 2:30. I'm sorry I

1	can't do it any earlier than 2:30. So, enjoy your lunch.
2	LUNCHEON RECESS
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	CERTIFICATE
9	I, Lisa M. Hand, RPR, certify that the
10	foregoing is a correct transcript from the record of
11	proceedings in the above-titled matter.
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	Lisa M. Hand, RPR
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
	d .

,	3269 [1] 2/4	access [1] 34/18
100 (41 20/05	333 [1] 2/3	accompanying [2] 36/23 39/19
'08 [1]	34 [1] 3/4	accreditation [2] 25/15 25/16
19 2 38/23 38/24	345 [1] 37/9 35 [3] 75/20 75/22 75/23	accurately [1] 57/3 Action [1] 3/12
'95 [1] 26/12	354-3269 [1] 2/4	actually [7] 5/9 13/19 17/6 21/9 30/1 35/19
0	373 [1] 36/21	45/21
	39 [1] 16/1	added [1] 38/24
<u>03-2006 [2]</u> 1/4 3/12	4	addition [1] 51/13 additional [3] 46/19 46/23 75/14
1	40 [1] 30/17	address [2] 48/16 49/16
10 [10] 43/23 43/24 46/3 54/25 59/12 63/13	404 [1] 41/12	addresses [1] 5/2
72/10 75/2 75/10 75/10	45 [1] 68/20	addressing [1] 38/10
10 feet [1] 64/6	5	admitted [1] 30/11
10:15 [1] 1/5 10:37 [1] 30/20	500 [1] 1/23	advance [1] 44/7
10th [1] 43/11	500 [1] 1/25 5206 [1] 1/18	afield [1] 37/20 African [5] 7/14 7/15 9/3 26/23 26/24
11 [5] 15/8 15/10 26/17 30/20 72/22	54 [1] 72/18	Africans [1] 27/20
110 [1] 19/7	55 [1] 72/18	after [14] 5/9 10/25 20/16 20/24 27/15 28/1
116 [1] 72/14	56 [2] 3/6 72/21	28/3 56/24 64/21 64/22 66/10 71/1 71/2 71/5
12 [2] 44/16 72/6 128 [1] 31/24	57 [2] 72/22 73/12 588 [1] 1/18	again [13] 22/10 22/25 29/24 42/5 43/5 45/9
12:15 [2] 4/14 55/2		50/2 51/6 66/1 68/23 68/25 76/23 77/2 against [2] 22/1 24/17
12:30 [1] 77/16	6	agent [1] 4/24
13 [1] 75/5	62 [2] 73/12 73/13	aggression [5] 18/6 18/11 19/2 19/12 19/16
133A [2] 30/12 30/16	64 [1] 75/8 65 [2] 73/13 75/8	aggressive [2] 18/8 20/3
14 [2] 58/11 75/8 140 [1] 60/1	65 [2] 73/13 75/8 6522 [1] 1/24	ago [5] 8/23 8/24 8/25 10/2 10/4
140 [1] 60/1 142 [1] 68/23	10322	agree [8] 46/12 49/20 55/24 56/15 76/16 77/3 77/9 77/11
143 [1] 72/25	6706 [1] 2/3	agreed [2] 76/17 77/4
144 [1] 73/4	68 [2] 75/9 75/9	agreement [1] 47/8
145 [1] 73/8 146 [1] 73/18	7	ahead [3] 10/17 42/4 48/3
15 [7] 4/14 4/18 36/21 54/25 55/2 55/3 72/18	700 [1] 1/17	aided [1] 2/25 air [1] 16/9
152 [1] 74/20	72-hour [3] 48/22 50/21 54/11	aired [1] 16/2
16 [6] 37/1 42/20 72/10 72/14 74/16 75/24	724-6522 [1] 1/24	al [2] 1/3 3/13
1601 [1] 1/17	73 [1] 76/14	all [57] 5/16 10/14 12/17 13/3 19/20 23/5
16th [1] 37/4 17 [3] 31/24 72/15 75/22	74 [1] 76/15 76 [1] 75/10	24/3 26/22 28/1 32/16 32/21 34/2 35/22 36/1
18 [2] 72/14 75/21	77 [1] 74/15	36/7 36/15 37/13 38/4 39/7 39/11 40/16 41/12 42/16 44/21 45/9 46/21 49/5 49/17
19 [5] 1/5 59/23 76/14 76/15 77/2	8	51/9 55/1 55/14 55/16 60/19 60/22 60/25
1990 [1] 20/22		62/10 66/24 67/24 67/25 69/2 71/23 72/3
1991 [1] 17/20	8,000 [1] 27/23 80 [1] 75/1	72/4 72/11 72/19 73/1 73/5 73/9 73/15 74/9
1997 [1] 8/4	801 [1] 1/23	74/10 74/17 74/24 75/11 77/7 77/14 77/16 allegations [1] 74/8
2	81 [1] 75/2	alleged [1] 52/2
20 [7] 15/24 26/1 55/13 67/18 68/21 72/18	83 [1] 75/4	allegedly [1] 33/5
73/12	85 [1] 75/5	allow [7] 29/13 29/23 32/21 33/3 44/23 52/21
200 pounds [1] 27/23 20001 [1] 2/4	9	77/1
20004 [1] 2/4 20004 [1] 1/24	9,000 pounds [1] 27/24	allowed [4] 10/22 27/8 37/24 41/7 almost [1] 23/14
20009 [1] 1/18	A	already [5] 32/23 38/9 38/25 39/22 45/9
2001 [4] 8/1 8/2 8/6 8/13	a.m [1] 1/5	also [21] 4/17 10/2 19/25 21/15 23/24 24/14
2004 [5] 15/15 15/18 17/13 31/18 32/9 2005 [1] 57/10	a.m [1]	27/1 27/20 41/3 48/18 49/1 52/1 52/10 54/10
2006 [4] 1/4 3/12 57/11 58/5	able [4] 11/25 25/16 27/17 63/8	54/13 57/13 58/25 66/23 71/18 76/15 77/6 alternative [1] 19/10
2007 [2] 56/21 69/18	abnormal [1] 29/4	although [2] 36/3 46/14
2008 [4] 36/25 37/8 39/21 42/20	about [56] 4/14 4/18 5/11 6/3 6/5 6/8 8/15	always [1] 23/14
2009 [1] 1/5 201 [1] 29/9	9/4 9/22 15/22 20/3 20/11 20/15 22/3 22/5 25/8 25/11 25/21 27/1 27/22 27/23 28/24	am [4] 7/14 8/6 62/13 76/8
201 [1] 29/9 202 [3] 1/18 1/24 2/4	29/6 29/18 30/13 31/9 31/11 31/17 32/19	America [1] 26/25
21 [2] 73/14 75/9	32/19 33/17 36/2 36/2 36/18 36/20 37/16	AMERICAN [2] 1/3 3/12 amongst [1] 23/2
22 [4] 43/24 43/25 72/7 72/15	38/11 42/11 43/17 43/18 44/13 47/13 48/3	amount [1] 41/6
24 [2] 35/13 63/15	51/14 55/4 55/13 58/7 58/19 59/20 59/21 59/24 67/12 73/21 76/5 76/6 76/10	animal [14] 9/4 9/21 9/22 10/12 19/19 21/15
25 [2] 3/4 55/13 2:00 [1] 55/10	39/24 67/12 73/21 76/3 76/6 76/10 above [1] 78/11	21/24 21/25 22/1 22/5 22/8 22/13 26/15 35/5
2:00 [1] 33/10 2:00 o'clock [1] 4/18	above-titled [1] 78/11	animal's [1] 21/23 animals [13] 1/3 3/13 18/15 57/23 58/16
2:22 [1] 31/24	abscesses [1] 28/15	58/17 58/20 61/4 65/16 66/11 66/14 70/10
2:30 [3] 4/21 77/25 78/1	absolutely [3] 23/21 46/10 74/14	70/23
3	abuse [1] 70/23 abuser [1] 52/3	another [6] 4/25 18/3 20/11 34/25 63/21
30 [6] 26/1 30/17 40/3 43/12 44/4 67/17	abuser [1] 32/3 abusing [1] 70/10	77/19
32 [8] 39/2 39/6 43/19 43/21 44/1 45/3 47/24	abusive [1] 19/9	answer [8] 10/12 11/3 13/9 33/15 33/16 33/17 35/10 45/16
49/9	academic [2] 47/14 50/16	55,17 55/10 15/10

52/25 55/8 55/9 55/9 behaving [1] 27/16 A behavior [4] 11/22 25/22 28/9 35/23 asks [1] 48/2 **answers [3]** 50/15 54/17 60/6 assess [1] 74/6 behaviors [3] 24/3 24/3 24/10 anticipate [2] 37/20 37/25 association [2] 8/4 8/16 being [21] 8/15 14/1 20/25 22/5 22/9 23/24 any [64] 4/22 7/10 10/6 10/9 10/12 11/14 assume [4] 31/2 32/24 47/22 53/13 30/8 30/14 31/5 31/9 31/9 32/4 32/5 32/18 12/4 12/6 12/10 13/4 13/8 14/6 22/16 24/16 attached [1] 69/7 33/10 33/19 45/20 51/14 52/14 53/3 60/15 27/24 28/14 29/6 29/12 31/1 32/3 34/5 35/14 attacked [1] 20/15 believe [24] 5/3 5/17 6/24 8/1 8/3 9/9 9/18 35/15 35/22 36/4 36/8 36/22 36/22 36/23 attempted [1] 32/9 13/7 13/19 17/6 17/12 23/1 27/11 28/17 29/5 37/5 37/13 38/14 38/15 39/18 39/18 39/19 attempts [1] 22/20 34/10 38/10 39/1 42/14 43/8 43/14 44/16 40/4 40/5 40/6 42/16 42/24 43/3 43/14 43/16 attention [3] 4/15 4/17 39/4 44/22 70/9 belong [2] 15/25 15/25 43/20 44/4 44/18 44/20 47/5 48/15 52/18 **attributed** [1] 19/16 52/19 53/11 53/19 55/21 57/2 59/17 61/12 August [3] 37/8 57/11 58/4 below [1] 29/23 August 2006 [1] 57/11 61/20 67/1 68/8 74/1 74/12 78/1 BENCH [1] 1/10 anybody [3] 27/8 58/19 71/11 August 29, 2008 [1] 37/8 benefit [1] 13/19 better [2] 7/5 35/4 anyone [2] 55/17 56/5 **Avenue [3]** 1/17 1/23 2/3 anything [9] 12/20 26/9 26/21 40/1 51/5 beyond [2] 31/10 33/13 average [1] 20/13 aware [7] 9/10 9/20 11/15 27/3 31/5 52/12 65/23 67/12 71/15 77/14 big [1] 23/19 **apologize** [3] 36/19 47/4 55/25 birth [5] 26/11 26/13 28/1 34/12 34/18 53/18 away [6] 20/17 26/8 28/12 62/24 64/2 65/7 APPEARANCES [1] 1/13 birthing [1] 34/22 **appeared [1]** 13/12 **AZA [2]** 14/24 25/11 bit [5] 22/11 23/11 25/11 43/13 57/6 apply [5] 11/21 12/16 13/16 39/25 44/10 black [1] 38/25 B applying [1] 12/23 blankets [3] 67/8 67/9 68/19 baby [4] 34/11 34/11 68/6 68/11 approaches [1] 34/16 bleeding [1] 64/23 blew [1] 29/20 appropriate [4] 38/2 40/14 53/4 54/3 back [23] 10/25 15/21 29/24 45/8 45/24 approximately [1] 57/10 50/18 55/4 58/6 59/16 64/17 64/19 64/25 blood [1] 64/25 **April [2]** 57/10 69/18 65/3 65/6 65/15 65/16 65/18 65/21 65/24 bloody [1] 22/21 April 2005 [1] 57/10 66/12 71/16 75/16 77/25 Bolbol [7] 17/6 31/17 31/23 32/9 32/10 32/14 **April 4th, 2007 [1]** 69/18 backstage [7] 57/21 57/22 62/8 62/17 63/1 32/19 **Aquariums** [1] 8/17 63/2 63/8 both [2] 5/3 17/10 are [78] 6/1 7/8 7/9 7/17 11/16 11/21 13/25 bad [2] 19/20 56/1 **bottom [4]** 67/17 69/16 69/18 70/8 14/1 17/10 18/13 18/14 18/21 19/6 19/14 badly [2] 70/21 70/22 **boundaries** [1] 19/23 Ballard [1] 70/1 19/24 20/1 20/1 21/6 21/7 21/13 21/14 21/25 bounds [1] 37/23 22/2 22/10 22/14 23/2 23/4 23/7 23/14 23/24 barn [1] 7/1 box [1] 54/16 boxcar [1] 21/18 24/1 24/3 24/14 24/25 25/12 25/14 25/14 barrier [1] 23/10 27/21 28/24 30/14 30/22 31/2 31/5 33/1 barriers [1] 23/4 break [2] 4/15 22/22 34/19 37/18 37/19 37/20 37/21 37/23 38/15 based [3] 42/13 44/9 44/11 breaking [1] 28/6 40/7 40/14 42/17 42/18 44/2 46/15 46/16 basically [4] 41/13 41/25 43/18 53/4 breaks [1] 24/23 46/21 48/1 48/15 49/2 49/10 50/13 50/15 basis [5] 18/22 22/10 33/11 42/10 45/21 breeding [4] 26/24 27/12 27/13 27/13 50/15 52/9 52/20 52/24 52/25 53/10 54/12 be [75] 5/10 6/25 8/14 10/9 11/10 11/12 breedings [2] 27/14 27/16 55/23 56/6 69/8 73/22 75/8 76/10 11/13 11/15 11/19 11/25 13/12 13/15 13/18 brief [3] 40/18 55/15 75/14 **area [4]** 23/14 47/8 47/18 49/20 17/16 19/11 20/3 21/4 21/7 21/10 21/13 briefing [1] 32/16 21/16 22/5 22/18 22/22 24/14 25/16 26/3 briefly [1] 47/7 aren't [2] 9/11 47/1 arena [3] 23/5 23/8 60/13 26/14 27/17 29/14 29/22 31/1 32/3 32/22 bring [7] 4/15 4/16 14/20 15/9 39/3 55/4 36/17 36/24 37/18 37/21 37/24 38/17 39/20 arguably [1] 46/16 66/14 40/4 40/6 40/8 43/14 44/5 44/8 45/8 47/21 argue [1] 14/19 **bringing [2]** 13/17 75/15 **argument** [3] 41/1 42/25 43/2 48/4 48/15 48/16 48/25 49/5 49/14 49/19 **broad [2]** 44/23 48/21 argumentative [2] 11/2 35/8 50/8 51/8 51/24 52/12 52/19 53/4 53/15 54/7 **Brookfield** [1] 19/3 arises [1] 18/24 55/10 55/13 56/11 56/19 60/12 71/14 72/5 **Brothers** [7] 6/18 7/21 9/23 13/15 16/6 16/23 75/14 76/24 77/7 77/8 arm [1] 13/17 around [4] 22/16 24/9 27/9 64/14 beat [3] 59/22 63/12 63/20 **bull [17]** 10/6 10/15 12/5 12/11 12/16 12/23 Arps [1] 52/6 beating [3] 10/21 10/23 19/6 12/24 22/19 28/2 28/11 30/23 34/1 35/22 **arthritis** [1] 30/5 beatings [1] 70/23 60/12 60/17 63/14 66/5 article [8] 15/7 15/10 15/11 17/13 18/4 20/12 became [1] 18/8 **bunch** [1] 46/20 20/13 32/20 because [33] 7/4 10/17 13/5 15/4 17/19 20/4 \mathbf{C} as [45] 8/11 11/9 13/10 14/13 14/16 17/17 22/23 23/2 23/25 27/9 27/22 33/24 34/11 17/17 17/23 18/10 18/19 18/24 18/25 19/7 38/16 40/5 41/13 42/18 43/2 45/5 47/8 48/16 CA [1] 1/4 19/12 24/6 26/3 26/3 27/7 28/24 30/11 37/6 49/5 49/16 50/25 55/1 55/9 61/1 62/24 66/14 cafeteria [2] 55/5 55/6 67/2 70/10 76/18 77/21 calendar [1] 4/22 38/15 39/5 39/5 40/14 40/24 44/12 44/25 45/20 49/11 50/13 50/13 51/23 52/2 54/7 become [2] 29/23 50/11 calf [10] 26/12 26/16 26/16 27/22 34/18 becomes [1] 29/21 34/24 35/12 35/15 35/16 35/19 54/12 54/14 56/8 56/25 57/22 59/8 60/3 68/25 72/25 77/8 becoming [1] 28/18 California [3] 22/21 28/4 30/10 **Asia [21]** 59/20 59/21 59/22 61/23 61/24 bed [3] 28/15 29/21 30/2 call [7] 29/8 29/18 30/12 31/24 36/10 67/13 63/13 63/20 64/2 64/13 64/19 65/19 65/21 been [34] 12/2 12/19 12/22 12/25 14/2 19/25 72/14 65/23 66/9 66/17 67/13 68/6 68/11 71/1 71/3 20/15 22/20 24/7 24/19 24/21 25/25 26/19 called [4] 6/5 6/11 56/23 58/7 26/25 30/11 32/1 34/15 34/16 34/17 34/21 calves [2] 14/23 35/16 35/3 38/20 39/6 39/8 39/9 46/8 46/8 48/22 came [8] 4/24 17/4 26/13 27/15 39/1 65/16 **Asian [2]** 19/3 25/19 ask [14] 5/18 15/22 20/11 22/18 28/14 30/12 48/25 50/20 52/22 56/24 64/9 72/25 65/24 66/16 camera [2] 31/3 31/5 31/22 32/18 33/2 33/10 36/1 44/10 48/2 before [13] 1/10 4/16 5/5 5/6 7/5 17/9 27/18 49/18 53/17 60/13 69/14 69/15 71/1 can [46] 11/3 11/4 11/4 12/8 13/9 15/9 15/21 52/23 asked [16] 9/4 10/3 16/22 20/12 23/24 24/1 began [1] 28/10 21/7 21/13 21/16 22/3 22/11 22/16 22/22 27/1 29/6 29/11 31/9 32/7 32/19 33/9 52/22 begin [2] 56/21 76/14 27/3 29/8 30/20 31/19 32/15 33/2 35/11 beginning [4] 30/10 30/16 31/13 68/21 55/19 58/25 36/16 40/3 47/13 47/19 48/4 49/18 50/4 asking [9] 16/17 52/13 52/15 52/18 52/25 begins [1] 58/11 51/24 54/19 59/19 60/15 61/16 61/23 62/20

committee [1] 8/23 50/5 50/20 51/1 51/7 52/15 52/19 55/12 C common [3] 12/1 19/5 60/11 counter-designate [5] 41/7 50/3 50/5 51/1 can... [11] 67/12 67/15 68/5 68/6 68/24 73/25 community [2] 21/12 26/19 51/7 74/3 75/19 76/13 76/22 77/10 Compared [1] 26/2 counter-designated [2] 47/10 50/20 can't [6] 22/15 23/16 48/14 65/10 66/7 78/1 comparison [2] 23/22 23/23 **counter-designation** [**5**] 36/23 39/9 39/20 canal [3] 26/13 34/12 34/18 complain [1] 58/19 47/12 48/11 cannot [2] 32/3 57/2 complaint [1] 59/21 counter-designations [7] 40/11 45/18 48/20 **complaints** [1] 59/17 capacity [1] 8/22 48/24 52/15 52/19 55/12 care [5] 28/13 57/23 57/25 58/16 64/24 completeness [1] 54/10 couple [3] 15/22 22/16 30/12 course [9] 26/1 27/22 35/14 38/9 39/1 39/17 career [1] 12/16 compliant [2] 18/19 18/20 careful [3] 11/13 11/19 11/21 comply [1] 25/15 47/22 55/22 56/11 Carol [2] 69/25 77/22 compound [1] 48/2 court [18] 1/1 2/2 2/2 5/25 13/6 42/12 44/2 Carrie [1] 37/13 computer [1] 2/25 44/10 47/5 50/9 50/14 51/3 52/21 53/9 53/24 carrying [1] 30/22 computer-aided [1] 2/25 56/22 68/24 75/8 case [13] 5/6 5/6 10/17 11/18 12/5 18/22 concealed [1] 27/19 Court's [4] 39/4 44/12 51/7 53/10 concern [5] 17/25 28/24 42/5 43/16 71/13 18/25 19/20 30/8 41/13 41/14 48/6 54/1 Courthouse [1] 2/3 cases [2] 19/5 23/24 concerned [1] 22/5 crack [4] 28/21 28/21 29/18 29/25 caught [1] 36/19 concerns [4] 51/14 70/11 70/20 71/7 cracks [2] 28/18 29/7 cause [3] 11/17 22/21 43/16 concurrently [1] 54/12 crate [4] 21/8 21/15 21/17 21/21 crates [3] 21/7 22/12 22/14 **CEC** [10] 10/16 10/21 12/19 12/21 12/22 condition [1] 7/4 12/22 12/25 13/4 14/4 29/7 conditioned [2] 21/8 21/15 create [1] 22/12 Center [2] 7/20 8/9 conducted [1] 56/20 creative [1] 4/18 certain [4] 18/5 38/1 47/25 51/13 conference [3] 7/21 8/7 8/8 credibility [2] 53/13 74/7 confined [1] 23/14 certainly [9] 7/11 11/5 11/11 11/14 14/19 crew [1] 62/8 confining [1] 22/4 19/14 24/22 53/12 53/14 cross [10] 3/2 5/17 5/22 5/23 31/10 36/4 certify [1] 78/9 confirmed [1] 41/5 40/15 51/23 51/24 76/24 cetera [1] 37/22 confiscated [1] 6/5 cross-examination [8] 5/17 5/22 5/23 36/4 **chained [4]** 14/3 25/24 26/3 34/15 confusing [1] 13/13 40/15 51/23 51/24 76/24 chaining [6] 21/5 21/21 28/24 33/18 33/24 connected [1] 25/14 CRUELTY [5] 1/3 3/13 16/21 17/2 17/11 Connecticut [1] 1/17 Cruelty-Free [3] 16/21 17/2 17/11 chains [6] 10/16 14/6 21/9 21/10 21/25 22/1 crystal [4] 1/15 1/16 3/20 55/16 connection [2] 7/21 32/4 challenge [1] 18/21 **cumulative** [1] 51/12 consequently [1] 11/22 **challenged** [1] 18/23 **Conservation [2]** 7/20 8/9 Curator [1] 15/23 **challenging [2]** 18/18 24/12 cured [1] 48/2 consider [1] 51/4 chance [1] 35/4 consistent [7] 33/23 40/25 41/4 41/21 44/19 **current** [2] 37/10 51/18 change [1] 17/24 50/6 50/9 curtain [5] 65/6 65/16 65/18 65/25 66/17 changed [3] 12/6 12/20 17/18 Constitution [1] 2/3 cut [4] 47/7 48/22 50/18 51/24 **chapter [4]** 14/11 14/25 15/3 15/4 contact [17] 11/9 11/12 11/14 17/18 19/21 Cuviello [2] 17/4 17/8 character [1] 37/7 20/2 21/1 26/9 26/22 27/5 28/4 34/15 34/22 CV [2] 14/13 14/20 chief [2] 5/6 5/7 35/5 35/17 35/20 35/21 D children's [1] 19/21 contacted [1] 16/21 dangerous [2] 20/13 24/22 Chronicle [2] 15/12 15/18 context [1] 39/23 circus [17] 6/6 6/14 6/16 9/23 14/1 16/1 16/2 continues [1] 63/16 date [1] 69/18 16/6 22/25 23/5 23/19 24/18 33/10 36/2 38/5 dates [2] 57/9 59/5 **continuing** [1] 73/22 day [10] 5/9 5/14 26/1 26/2 35/7 35/13 35/14 52/1 57/7 contracted [1] 6/16 36/19 71/8 71/9 circuses [5] 16/21 17/2 17/11 24/21 33/20 contributed [1] 18/13 control [8] 9/21 9/23 10/12 22/24 23/3 23/11 citations [1] 10/9 days [2] 5/11 46/3 DC [4] 1/4 1/18 1/24 2/4 cited [1] 42/9 23/17 23/18 **Citizens [3]** 16/21 17/2 17/10 **De** [1] 28/10 controlled [3] 34/16 34/17 34/21 Civil [1] 3/12 controlling [1] 35/23 dead [1] 37/22 clear [8] 11/24 13/15 19/11 40/20 41/9 49/23 conversation [2] 31/17 71/9 **deafening** [1] 67/16 54/7 55/17 deal [2] 38/3 68/16 cooperate [1] 13/4 dealt [4] 49/1 68/2 68/14 68/15 clearly [3] 8/11 19/8 48/5 corporate [4] 70/11 71/18 71/19 71/22 deaths [2] 26/8 26/10 clip [5] 30/7 30/11 30/16 32/19 32/20 correct [44] 6/13 6/23 7/14 7/16 9/2 9/9 9/19 clips [1] 3/5 12/12 13/1 13/2 14/1 14/4 14/5 14/11 14/12 debate [1] 45/22 close [3] 35/6 64/4 64/5 14/15 15/2 15/13 15/14 17/5 17/11 17/16 December [1] 56/21 closely [1] 57/7 17/20 17/21 20/20 20/22 20/23 21/2 32/24 **December 17, 2007 [1]** 56/21 closer [2] 64/7 64/8 33/6 33/7 34/12 34/13 35/20 38/5 40/19 decision [1] 58/9 closes [1] 55/10 40/22 41/2 46/10 47/23 54/2 61/5 77/17 decisions [1] 42/11 closing [1] 55/5 deep [1] 28/22 78/10 Coleman [1] 37/13 correcting [1] 28/11 defecate [1] 30/8 **Coliseum [1]** 10/3 correctly [4] 14/10 16/4 16/24 20/19 defecated [1] 61/25 **COLLEEN [4]** 3/4 5/20 14/23 15/23 **defendant [9]** 1/7 4/1 4/3 4/5 4/6 4/7 4/9 4/12 costumes [1] 67/7 **colloquy [2]** 36/17 43/10 could [21] 8/13 15/17 21/4 26/14 27/14 28/22 color [1] 51/3 33/11 34/17 34/21 34/23 35/2 36/16 41/16 **defendant's [10]** 43/19 53/24 55/12 59/25 **COLUMBIA** [1] 1/1 43/9 44/8 46/3 47/7 47/16 52/21 64/9 74/12 68/23 72/25 73/4 73/7 73/18 74/19 **combination [4]** 19/13 19/18 20/6 20/8 couldn't [5] 34/16 63/22 64/4 64/14 64/18 defendants [5] 1/20 41/3 41/7 42/22 58/25 come [13] 16/20 37/16 37/17 37/19 41/12 counsel [22] 3/14 3/18 4/13 5/1 5/10 5/17 defense [1] 5/10 41/16 48/10 49/1 51/23 52/10 61/4 65/15 5/22 34/5 38/4 39/12 40/17 40/19 44/24 48/8 defiant [1] 18/8 definitely [2] 12/13 12/17 65/21 52/4 52/7 52/7 52/12 52/23 55/24 56/23 comes [5] 44/4 48/9 48/12 56/9 56/14 77/13 **DELCIANNA [2]** 1/16 3/21 coming [4] 11/18 19/1 40/7 59/22 counter [19] 36/23 39/9 39/20 40/11 41/7 demonstrates [1] 11/20 **Deniz** [4] 17/6 31/17 32/9 32/14 commit [1] 9/1 45/18 47/10 47/12 48/11 48/20 48/24 50/3

D	documents [1] 4/25	employee [6] 38/5 38/7 38/9 40/21 51/18 51/19
depicted [2] 29/16 32/15	does [6] 14/25 24/24 25/15 25/23 53/9 57/9 doesn't [2] 46/7 48/10	employees [4] 37/11 40/25 43/1 61/9
deposed [1] 55/17	doing [9] 10/22 24/2 24/7 24/14 24/14 26/17	employees' [1] 40/23
deposition [64] 3/5 3/6 15/8 15/9 15/12 36/13 36/18 37/5 39/23 40/3 40/12 40/23 43/16		employment [1] 52/1
44/6 45/7 45/20 46/15 47/18 47/22 48/21	dominance [2] 18/21 18/23 dominated [1] 27/6	encapsulated [1] 45/14 enclosure [1] 21/14
49/8 49/13 50/10 50/11 50/14 51/20 51/22	don't [63] 4/22 5/10 8/11 9/18 11/5 12/4 12/8	encompassed [1] 55/21
52/4 52/21 55/18 55/19 55/22 56/11 56/20	12/9 12/19 13/7 13/22 13/23 14/13 14/18	end [4] 20/18 58/4 60/13 70/11
56/22 59/24 59/25 68/21 68/22 69/6 69/7 72/6 72/8 72/12 72/16 72/20 72/23 72/24	21/23 23/16 23/25 27/21 27/24 28/9 29/13 29/19 29/25 31/8 34/17 37/20 37/25 40/6	ended [1] 63/9
73/2 73/3 73/6 73/7 73/10 73/16 73/17 73/19	40/9 41/14 42/14 43/14 44/21 45/24 45/25	enjoy [1] 78/1 enough [2] 28/22 64/4
74/4 74/18 74/21 74/25 75/3 75/6 75/20	46/13 46/22 47/11 48/7 48/10 49/10 49/14	ENTERTAINMENT [2] 1/6 3/14
77/20	50/5 50/21 51/2 51/23 53/12 53/14 53/15	entire [2] 43/15 59/14
depositions [10] 37/10 37/19 40/24 42/3 42/10 42/13 45/5 45/10 46/16 47/10	54/20 56/2 59/5 59/15 62/4 62/14 62/22 63/25 65/11 65/12 66/7 66/11 70/2 73/25	entry [1] 14/22 environment [2] 27/10 35/20
Derek [1] 4/11	done [5] 12/4 26/14 29/22 39/9 45/2	ESQUIRE [9] 1/14 1/15 1/15 1/16 1/20 1/20
describe [5] 27/7 29/16 32/15 62/20 67/15	Donna [1] 25/22	1/21 1/21 1/22
designate [7] 41/7 45/15 50/3 50/5 51/1 51/7	door [2] 61/1 61/4	essentially [2] 42/25 50/8
56/10 designated [16] 40/24 42/7 43/15 44/7 45/15	doorway [1] 20/17 down [7] 28/5 30/23 46/2 48/22 50/21 50/23	et [3] 1/3 3/13 37/22 even [1] 11/21
47/10 48/19 48/20 49/22 49/22 50/20 51/8	75/25	evening [1] 27/19
54/6 54/6 56/12 76/19	downstairs [1] 55/5	event [1] 29/12
	Dr. [1] 25/17	events [1] 32/15
48/11 designations [20] 36/18 37/5 37/10 40/11	Dr. Sukumar [1] 25/17 dramatically [1] 25/25	eventually [1] 32/11 ever [6] 27/12 35/23 57/18 58/19 61/12 69/14
45/17 45/18 48/20 48/22 48/24 48/24 49/2	dropped [1] 34/11	everyone [3] 46/4 55/4 55/11
50/17 50/19 52/15 52/19 54/8 54/11 54/25	due [1] 32/17	everything [1] 12/18
55/12 59/16	duly [1] 56/24	evidence [8] 30/11 32/10 37/7 41/16 41/23
designed [1] 21/13 development [2] 27/25 27/25	during [12] 10/24 12/6 14/7 31/11 33/24 35/7 45/7 47/22 50/10 55/19 55/22 56/11	44/19 46/12 50/12 evidentiary [3] 4/24 4/25 43/3
did [73] 7/11 10/6 10/8 10/9 14/7 14/8 15/4	duties [1] 57/22	exactly [11] 8/10 14/18 20/9 31/20 43/5
16/4 16/9 16/19 16/20 16/24 20/19 26/8	DVM [1] 14/24	44/17 49/6 50/25 53/22 59/5 66/7
27/10 27/25 30/24 32/18 39/22 40/11 40/13 41/10 42/8 43/7 44/14 45/3 45/24 45/25	dying [1] 34/24	examination [12] 5/17 5/22 5/23 25/3 31/12
49/23 49/24 50/2 57/7 57/16 58/4 58/19 59/4	\mathbf{E}	34/8 36/4 40/15 51/23 51/24 56/23 76/24 examined [2] 35/13 56/24
59/8 59/14 60/24 61/9 61/12 62/13 62/25	each [1] 22/11	example [3] 24/6 48/1 56/5
64/19 64/25 65/3 65/15 65/23 66/9 66/16	earlier [6] 33/23 35/3 35/3 44/15 44/18 78/1	exclude [2] 41/22 53/5
66/17 66/22 67/15 67/23 68/8 68/16 68/18 69/23 70/5 70/13 70/20 70/24 71/7 71/13	early [3] 7/22 19/21 20/4 easiest [1] 75/14	excluded [1] 52/19 excluding [1] 53/1
71/15 71/17 71/19 72/1 74/10 75/24 76/5	eat [1] 55/6	exclusion [1] 52/15
76/16 77/3	efficiency [2] 54/8 54/13	excuse [4] 26/5 43/25 52/16 52/16
didn't [21] 7/3 7/10 14/6 15/3 16/18 19/23 27/10 31/13 39/8 40/5 40/11 41/21 44/23	eight [2] 8/24 8/25 either [2] 9/16 29/14	Exhibit [18] 15/8 15/10 29/8 30/12 31/24
45/11 45/23 45/23 49/7 50/5 50/25 64/24	electric [1] 37/22	59/24 59/25 68/22 68/23 69/6 72/24 72/25 73/3 73/4 73/8 73/17 73/18 74/19
71/21	electricity [1] 19/8	exhibited [2] 14/1 18/6
died [4] 26/18 26/20 34/11 35/16	elephant [38] 6/3 6/5 6/8 6/20 6/22 7/13 7/20	exhibits [2] 36/23 39/19
Diego [1] 9/4 diet [1] 14/23	8/9 8/16 11/9 13/17 14/9 14/24 15/1 18/6 18/7 18/8 18/20 18/25 19/4 19/7 19/12 20/14	expects [1] 24/15 experience [6] 11/8 12/8 13/24 18/13 19/18
different [7] 12/10 12/14 12/17 18/17 23/25	23/16 24/4 24/23 25/21 26/19 27/1 27/4	19/20
40/5 43/13	27/13 27/23 28/5 34/15 35/4 35/6 52/2 61/10	experienced [1] 19/2
difficult [3] 22/22 23/1 23/15	elephants [73] 7/8 7/10 7/17 8/20 9/3 10/10	explain [3] 27/3 60/15 61/22
direct [5] 3/2 5/8 31/10 33/13 33/24 direction [2] 22/11 22/17	10/11 10/16 10/21 10/22 10/23 11/23 12/10 12/13 12/15 12/20 13/8 13/11 13/13 13/13	explored [1] 36/3 expressly [1] 44/1
directive [2] 43/20 47/1	13/15 13/25 14/3 15/24 18/2 18/14 18/17	extend [1] 27/8
disagree [2] 46/7 47/11	19/24 20/1 20/1 20/16 21/4 21/7 22/14 22/24	extended [2] 22/6 28/8
disagreed [1] 15/4	23/4 23/11 23/14 23/24 24/1 24/5 24/7 24/14	extent [2] 46/15 49/1
disagreeing [1] 48/8 disagreement [2] 47/18 49/20	24/17 25/8 25/9 25/20 26/7 26/20 26/23 26/25 28/14 28/18 28/24 29/7 30/4 30/8	extreme [2] 19/6 27/6 extremely [2] 7/6 11/21
disciplinary [1] 16/2	33/10 33/19 34/11 36/2 37/22 37/23 60/12	F
discipline [3] 18/1 19/5 19/8	60/15 60/22 66/12 66/22 67/10 67/20 67/23	
disciplined [1] 27/9 disciplining [1] 35/23	67/25 68/8 elephants' [1] 11/22	face [1] 31/4 facility [3] 7/21 10/3 28/6
discoloration [1] 29/4	elicit [1] 42/12	fact [10] 16/9 27/25 32/8 32/13 39/3 42/13
disconnected [1] 29/21	else [8] 33/24 40/1 51/5 55/17 67/12 71/11	43/15 48/17 76/21 77/17
discovered [1] 35/14	71/15 77/14	factor [1] 20/7
discussed [5] 15/8 15/12 28/13 30/7 38/9 discussion [4] 25/21 59/24 60/2 68/22	else's [1] 56/5 EMA [2] 8/4 8/7	factors [1] 20/6 failed [1] 43/3
display [2] 60/1 68/23	Emanuelson [1] 14/24	failure [3] 13/3 13/4 44/11
DISTRICT [3] 1/1 1/1 1/11	embarrassing [13] 51/15 51/16 51/17 51/22	fair [1] 46/4
do [82]	51/25 52/9 52/20 53/18 53/20 53/24 53/25 73/21 73/23	fairly [2] 27/7 28/3
docket [2] 36/21 37/9 document [5] 38/23 60/3 68/25 69/5 69/11	73/21 73/23 EMMET [1] 1/10	fairness [1] 46/1 family [1] 27/10
[5] 23/25 50/5 50/25 50/11		

P	frequent [2] 18/22 34/1	hand [8] 2/2 14/23 20/17 26/17 31/3 35/12
F	frequently [1] 24/5	78/9 78/16
famous [1] 28/3	fresh [2] 10/15 14/6	hand-raised [2] 26/17 35/12
fans [1] 23/7 far [5] 7/4 23/19 37/20 50/13 64/2	frightened [1] 21/25 Frisco [1] 37/12	Hand-raising [1] 14/23 handle [2] 64/15 74/1
fashion [1] 24/2	front [3] 28/8 31/3 64/16	handled [2] 15/24 27/5
fast [1] 24/11	frustrating [2] 11/25 13/12	handler [8] 11/9 11/14 11/25 13/16 24/9 27/6
faulty [1] 39/2	Fulbright [1] 1/22	30/21 30/22
favorites [2] 68/9 68/13 feasible [1] 22/19	function [1] 45/8 further [7] 21/3 34/3 35/25 39/8 44/20 54/1	handlers [17] 10/21 11/21 11/24 12/9 12/15 12/23 13/12 13/13 18/9 18/22 18/23 18/24
February [4] 1/5 43/11 43/23 43/24	55/20	19/6 22/23 23/1 24/4 24/13
February 10 [2] 43/23 43/24	G	handling [5] 12/10 12/13 12/20 18/1 18/12
February 10th [1] 43/11		happen [6] 5/7 28/20 28/20 52/23 60/24
feces [1] 28/25 feet [4] 29/1 29/5 64/6 64/8	Gary [3] 39/23 43/10 43/15 gave [1] 17/6	65/23 happened [5] 34/14 43/10 61/23 64/3 64/21
FEI [6] 7/8 37/4 37/5 37/9 37/13 44/20	general [3] 15/23 44/18 70/18	happening [1] 22/10
FEI's [1] 37/6	genes [2] 19/12 19/12	happens [1] 49/21
FELD [3] 1/6 3/14 42/25	genetics [1] 19/18	hard [1] 13/16
fellow [1] 31/3 felt [1] 19/9	gentle [1] 23/2 get [18] 4/18 7/5 19/6 20/17 23/11 23/16	harden [1] 29/23 has [19] 15/24 19/19 19/25 24/9 25/25 26/25
female [4] 18/2 19/3 20/16 71/24	27/21 32/9 45/19 46/2 50/21 57/24 60/17	30/11 32/1 32/11 32/23 33/17 39/6 44/17
females [1] 7/14	65/16 67/3 67/5 68/18 73/21	44/18 46/8 46/8 46/20 47/25 72/25
few [3] 5/17 24/19 34/6	gets [2] 28/21 74/12 getting [6] 23/15 34/24 44/20 57/23 57/25	have [104]
fight [1] 21/25 file [7] 5/1 5/5 5/8 40/11 43/20 44/14 74/12	getting [6] 23/15 34/24 44/20 57/23 57/25 67/6	haven't [4] 12/19 39/12 41/8 52/22 having [3] 11/12 31/16 56/24
filed [9] 32/17 36/24 37/1 37/3 37/8 38/23	give [9] 4/21 5/9 5/11 46/20 54/17 55/14 57/9	he [27] 6/14 6/15 6/15 6/20 7/5 7/6 7/6 7/7
39/20 42/19 74/12	61/16 77/13	13/16 13/18 25/19 27/5 27/8 28/3 43/12 46/7
filing [4] 37/2 44/12 44/13 44/16 film [3] 31/17 31/18 33/5	given [7] 17/13 32/11 35/4 35/16 37/16 39/10 39/10	47/19 47/20 47/21 48/1 58/18 62/21 66/4 66/5 66/17 66/19 66/20
final [2] 49/19 75/4	39/10 Glitzenstein [1] 1/16	he's [2] 6/25 46/7
finally [1] 43/9	go [22] 14/20 15/10 15/21 21/7 31/13 42/4	head [1] 28/10
find [3] 10/15 19/10 25/22	45/24 55/5 57/23 57/24 58/1 58/1 58/6 62/25	heads [1] 4/21
fine [13] 5/14 6/2 36/7 42/1 53/6 54/14 59/2 60/8 74/9 74/9 75/18 77/10 77/12	64/19 65/3 65/17 65/19 67/3 67/6 71/16 76/14	heads-up [1] 4/21 heal [1] 10/23
finger [1] 20/18	goes [5] 20/13 33/13 51/25 52/1 53/13	health [2] 7/5 29/1
finished [2] 7/1 67/9	going [45] 4/15 5/1 5/7 5/7 9/22 11/9 11/12	healthy [1] 29/24
fired [4] 58/8 70/9 71/14 76/9	18/21 20/17 21/25 22/2 30/20 32/21 33/3	hear [4] 48/7 50/14 52/22 71/21
first [15] 14/16 14/22 15/17 15/22 27/2 27/20 30/17 39/1 57/1 60/11 61/15 61/16 70/9 72/6	36/13 37/18 37/19 37/21 40/10 42/11 42/12 44/9 46/1 52/9 52/12 53/13 54/7 54/15 54/16	heard [1] 36/17 hearing [1] 76/24
77/22	54/17 54/22 56/21 58/24 60/13 66/17 72/5	hearsay [4] 43/7 60/4 69/1 74/23
five [4] 17/14 55/14 59/10 64/8	73/20 74/1 75/20 75/21 75/21 76/14 76/22	held [1] 8/8
five feet [1] 64/8 flagged [1] 46/7	76/24 77/7 gone [4] 8/9 65/9 76/7 76/9	help [1] 60/6 her [50] 16/2 18/8 18/12 18/22 19/1 19/1
flat [1] 36/20	good [15] 3/16 3/18 3/21 3/23 3/25 4/2 4/4	19/10 19/22 19/22 25/22 25/25 27/2 31/22
flat-footed [1] 36/20	4/8 5/25 6/2 25/5 25/6 27/10 36/12 55/1	32/13 32/19 32/19 32/23 33/2 35/10 36/2
floor [4] 57/24 58/1 59/22 62/1 Florida [3] 7/20 7/21 8/5	got [7] 17/1 38/22 58/8 65/25 68/17 68/19 76/9	49/7 49/16 51/16 51/17 51/22 52/1 52/4 52/7 52/9 52/10 52/12 52/13 52/22 56/7 56/7 62/1
focus [1] 4/17	grab [1] 20/5	62/1 62/17 62/18 62/20 63/13 63/14 64/25
focused [1] 56/2	Graff [1] 54/16	65/3 65/25 65/25 66/2 66/4 66/5 74/7
folks [2] 55/5 55/11	greater [1] 22/13	herd [1] 7/13
follow [3] 25/7 33/1 36/4 follow-up [2] 33/1 36/4	greatly [1] 22/15 green [4] 46/20 46/21 51/2 51/3	here [19] 6/3 8/11 14/21 16/23 17/14 20/12 20/15 32/3 38/23 40/9 45/5 45/19 45/20
following [2] 37/10 43/1	grew [1] 67/20	47/16 47/25 52/23 63/17 70/8 75/17
follows [1] 56/25	grievances [2] 16/2 16/9	herpes [6] 26/18 26/20 34/24 35/2 35/5 35/17
fond [2] 67/20 67/23 foot [1] 28/13	Griggs [1] 76/1 ground [3] 34/19 34/20 46/8	high [2] 18/11 24/2
footage [10] 17/14 30/9 30/13 31/22 31/22	grounds [3] 41/25 43/7 43/7	high-powered [1] 24/2 highlight [1] 53/16
32/8 32/10 32/12 32/13 32/15	group [1] 40/7	highlighted [2] 51/2 51/3
footed [1] 36/20	grow [2] 29/24 67/23	highlighting [2] 46/21 46/21
force [2] 24/4 24/10 forced [2] 28/24 30/8	guess [2] 47/19 47/20 guide [3] 14/9 15/1 15/4	highly [1] 18/15 him [7] 7/4 7/5 17/9 27/6 28/12 35/23 66/10
forceful [3] 11/16 11/19 33/25	guys [2] 63/12 63/20	hind [3] 22/4 26/13 29/4
foregoing [1] 78/10	Н	his [11] 6/11 7/4 13/17 27/6 27/8 28/5 28/7
forgot [1] 55/4 form [3] 38/1 58/22 60/21	habit [1] 56/1	28/11 31/3 31/3 35/23 history [2] 18/12 29/20
former [5] 37/11 38/5 38/7 40/24 51/19	had [29] 5/17 6/11 12/22 16/6 17/25 18/17	hit [5] 34/19 34/20 60/12 60/16 60/17
forth [1] 37/8	19/19 19/21 20/4 25/11 25/17 25/21 26/21	hitting [12] 28/11 62/1 62/17 62/20 63/13
found [1] 35/3	27/5 29/3 29/7 34/15 35/15 39/2 39/3 39/9 43/21 45/2 45/15 48/23 50/16 66/14 67/10	64/13 65/25 66/2 66/4 66/5 66/9 66/10
four [1] 5/11 Francisco [2] 15/12 15/18	76/6	holding [2] 31/2 31/3 home [1] 36/10
free [13] 11/9 11/11 11/14 16/21 17/2 17/11	hadn't [1] 12/25	Honor [43] 3/16 3/21 3/25 4/2 4/8 5/19 21/3
27/5 28/3 34/15 34/22 35/5 35/17 35/20	Hagan [1] 40/5	31/8 31/25 33/4 33/13 34/6 35/9 35/25 36/6
freedom [1] 22/13	hallway [1] 77/22	36/9 36/12 36/16 38/22 39/14 39/22 40/22

Н	infection [1] 28/23	63/7 64/13 64/14 66/17 67/6 67/6 67/8 67/14
Honor [21] 41/2 41/16 42/8 43/9 44/18	inhibited [1] 27/11	68/14 68/17 68/19 68/23 71/16 71/20 75/13
44/25 45/4 47/3 47/4 47/23 49/20 52/11	inhibition [1] 20/3 initial [2] 26/11 28/6	75/14 76/6 76/17 76/21 77/4
56/17 60/5 72/3 73/20 74/10 75/13 76/20	initially [1] 28/9	K
77/6 77/15	injure [1] 22/2	KARA [2] 1/21 4/4
Honor's [8] 36/20 39/5 39/10 43/23 44/22 44/22 48/5 60/1	injured [5] 18/24 24/20 34/12 34/19 34/20 injuries [3] 10/15 14/6 22/3	Karen [1] 14/24 KATHERINE [3] 1/14 3/19 54/16
HONORABLE [1] 1/10	injury [2] 11/17 20/21	keep [9] 16/13 24/5 24/13 24/13 24/15 66/17
hook [24] 10/6 10/16 11/13 11/16 11/19	inquired [1] 31/11	71/14 76/17 77/4
11/21 12/1 12/6 12/12 12/16 12/23 12/24	inspect [2] 10/3 11/18	keeper [1] 20/14
13/16 13/17 13/19 19/16 22/19 23/2 24/5 28/12 30/23 34/1 35/22 66/5	inspecting [1] 11/11 inspection [12] 10/16 10/17 10/24 10/25	killed [4] 17/19 17/22 20/14 20/25 kind [9] 19/8 22/2 22/5 23/9 24/25 26/2 38/1
hooked [1] 13/5	11/20 12/6 12/7 12/10 12/21 13/5 14/4 29/3	44/23 57/5
hooking [3] 10/24 12/5 13/18	inspectors [1] 13/20	KINZLEY [19] 3/4 5/20 5/25 10/20 14/21
hooks [3] 60/12 60/17 63/14	instances [1] 24/16	14/24 15/7 15/11 15/24 16/1 20/11 28/13
hoping [1] 7/4 horses [5] 58/18 67/2 67/3 67/5 67/10	institutional [1] 8/21 intelligent [1] 18/15	30/4 31/21 32/4 32/8 32/11 33/9 34/10 Kinzley's [2] 14/20 15/9
Houke [1] 37/12	intengent [1] 13/13 intent [3] 53/19 56/9 56/16	knew [3] 11/12 51/8 61/13
hour [4] 4/19 48/22 50/21 54/11	intention [1] 53/21	know [31] 11/9 11/10 11/18 12/4 12/8 12/9
hours [5] 14/3 26/3 35/13 54/23 58/7	interacting [1] 20/4	12/19 13/22 13/23 13/25 17/8 19/13 22/12
housekeeping [2] 54/5 54/14 how [35] 6/1 11/13 12/14 14/18 16/20 21/4	interested [1] 33/15	24/24 28/9 28/10 28/23 29/19 42/6 46/22
how [35] 6/1 11/13 12/14 14/18 16/20 21/4 25/22 25/23 26/12 28/20 29/16 29/19 47/4	interesting [2] 46/14 48/9 interference [1] 37/21	61/12 61/15 62/10 62/14 63/25 65/11 66/11 69/8 71/5 71/20 73/25
53/9 59/8 60/24 62/20 62/21 62/23 63/4 63/9	interpreted [1] 47/4	
64/2 64/21 65/9 65/11 66/4 66/9 67/1 67/14	introduce [3] 36/13 44/9 49/25	L
67/25 68/14 68/14 68/15 68/16 71/5	introduced [1] 59/25	lack [1] 10/15
HOWARD [2] 1/15 3/20 huh [3] 66/25 68/12 71/4	introducing [2] 52/13 60/7 invite [1] 55/11	laid [1] 32/2 LANCE [2] 1/21 4/2
humane [1] 21/20	invite [1] 55/11 inviting [2] 55/8 55/11	landed [1] 26/12
husband [3] 57/14 58/7 58/13	involved [3] 8/19 8/22 17/10	language [1] 44/17
husband's [1] 58/15	irrelevant [2] 37/7 51/12	large [4] 21/15 21/17 26/10 27/22
Husbandry [3] 14/9 14/25 15/1	is [222]	larger [1] 22/12 lashed [1] 24/17
I	isn't [5] 6/20 7/6 14/14 14/17 20/12 issue [12] 4/25 4/25 7/8 33/3 38/10 38/10	last [10] 8/19 8/25 41/18 47/8 62/14 63/11
I'd [10] 6/3 15/7 15/21 18/3 20/11 30/10	39/23 45/5 45/19 49/15 53/11 53/17	63/17 67/19 68/20 71/21
31/21 32/12 51/11 74/10	issued [1] 10/9	lasted [1] 62/23
I'll [13] 5/8 5/9 5/10 29/13 35/10 40/16 45/24 53/6 53/6 53/23 54/4 55/11 77/1	issues [6] 4/24 5/2 5/4 38/1 53/25 54/1 it [156]	later [2] 37/3 58/7 laying [1] 39/7
I'm [47] 4/25 6/2 8/21 8/22 9/20 10/11 13/23	it's [50] 11/10 14/16 14/18 19/5 19/13 19/17	leading [1] 25/19
31/19 32/21 33/3 33/15 37/2 38/6 40/9 40/19	19/19 20/6 20/8 21/8 21/9 21/14 22/1 22/4	least [3] 17/15 31/12 63/13
42/18 42/21 43/24 44/20 47/19 52/14 55/8 55/8 55/9 55/9 55/10 56/1 59/9 59/11 59/13	22/7 22/7 22/8 22/9 22/25 24/20 24/23 24/24 25/10 26/22 30/16 30/17 31/10 31/13 31/22	leave [1] 58/9 leaving [1] 58/4
60/5 61/11 62/11 62/24 63/5 65/2 65/14	31/24 34/18 38/11 41/3 41/5 45/9 47/6 48/9	left [4] 58/6 63/13 66/10 66/12
69/24 70/17 70/25 71/6 71/20 71/25 74/1	48/13 50/16 51/12 51/15 51/19 52/8 53/15	leg [3] 21/9 21/10 22/4
76/2 77/22 77/25	53/19 53/20 53/23 54/3 55/3 77/16	legs [1] 26/13
I've [5] 12/16 12/18 18/16 38/22 45/3 idea [3] 31/1 59/8 67/1	its [5] 22/9 26/13 27/22 37/1 37/8	Leon [1] 28/10 less [7] 11/16 11/19 15/25 20/3 23/19 59/10
identification [1] 69/6	\mathbf{J}	59/12
identified [1] 32/20	Jacksonville [2] 8/5 8/7	let [5] 22/18 35/10 49/3 57/9 69/8
identify [1] 3/14	Jacobson [5] 39/23 40/2 43/10 43/16 45/1	let's [5] 5/16 49/3 49/6 49/12 56/18
illegal [1] 22/21 image [2] 63/22 64/13	January [6] 17/19 17/22 38/23 38/24 44/13 44/16	letter [3] 60/11 63/11 67/19 level [8] 17/25 18/5 18/11 19/2 19/16 23/16
imagine [1] 48/15	Jaworski [1] 1/22	23/18 24/15
immediately [1] 35/15	Jimmy [11] 61/17 61/18 62/3 62/15 62/20	life [1] 27/6
importation [1] 9/11	63/4 63/21 64/10 66/3 66/9 66/16	light [1] 39/23
imported [2] 9/3 9/7	job [6] 57/20 58/15 61/2 63/7 76/17 77/4	like [24] 6/3 7/11 8/13 15/7 15/21 18/3 19/9 20/11 21/12 22/3 30/10 31/4 31/21 32/12
improper [1] 37/7 in 2004 [3] 17/13 31/18 32/9	Joe [3] 62/10 62/12 62/13 JOHN [2] 1/20 3/25	37/22 38/2 49/10 49/19 51/11 54/11 63/22
INC [1] 1/6	JOINER [2] 1/20 4/6	67/8 72/9 72/17
incident [6] 59/20 61/22 67/13 71/1 71/2	Jones [2] 28/3 28/7	limine [5] 37/8 41/5 41/11 41/22 44/19
71/5	Jose [1] 10/2	limit [2] 5/13 22/15
incidental [1] 24/20 include [1] 77/11	Joseph [1] 37/11 Jr [1] 37/12	line [40] 37/3 37/25 37/25 43/24 46/11 58/12 61/4 63/15 67/18 68/14 68/21 72/14 72/15
inconvenience [2] 47/5 47/6	JUDGE [3] 1/11 25/7 41/11	72/18 72/18 72/21 72/22 73/12 73/13
increased [1] 19/2	juggle [1] 77/23	73/13 74/16 75/1 75/2 75/4 75/5 75/8 75/8
indeed [3] 40/24 41/11 56/8	Julie [1] 4/8	75/9 75/9 75/9 75/10 75/21 75/22 75/22
index [1] 20/18 indicated [1] 50/9	just [64] 4/14 4/16 4/21 5/1 5/5 5/8 13/23 18/18 19/11 20/7 24/6 24/21 24/23 25/7 27/9	75/23 76/14 76/15 77/2 77/13 lined [1] 38/24
indicates [1] 50/9	30/12 30/23 34/6 34/10 34/25 36/16 36/17	lines [2] 72/6 72/10
Indicating [1] 60/23	39/3 40/2 41/10 43/1 43/9 45/2 46/4 47/7	LISA [7] 1/20 2/2 4/6 27/1 28/5 78/9 78/16
individual [2] 18/14 52/2	48/13 48/19 49/4 49/4 50/25 52/16 53/16	list [4] 14/13 46/19 46/23 54/11
infected [1] 28/18	54/14 54/18 54/19 55/9 60/1 60/13 61/15	listed [2] 14/16 14/18
I		

memo [2] 5/2 5/12 natural [1] 24/3 listen [1] 57/6 mentioned [10] 6/4 13/10 17/23 19/7 25/17 nature [1] 41/25 lists [1] 48/22 28/17 28/23 32/20 34/25 43/10 near [2] 13/17 63/21 literally [1] 26/12 met [1] 17/9 necessarily [1] 19/19 **litigation [2]** 9/10 9/13 necessary [4] 21/8 22/8 35/15 53/15 metal [2] 21/15 21/17 little [10] 4/19 22/11 23/11 25/11 36/20 40/4 methods [2] 16/2 34/22 Ned [1] 6/4 43/13 57/6 64/7 67/8 **MEYER [3]** 1/14 1/16 3/19 need [10] 4/14 5/5 5/9 16/13 22/24 45/25 live [1] 77/19 MICHELLE [3] 1/22 3/23 4/7 54/21 55/20 74/5 77/21 LLP[1] 1/22 midsummer [1] 20/22 needed [2] 18/1 51/8 local [2] 9/21 9/22 might [4] 10/12 11/17 25/16 26/3 needs [1] 29/22 locations [1] 23/12 minute [2] 42/22 63/13 neglected [1] 33/10 long [9] 62/23 63/4 63/6 64/21 65/9 65/13 minutes [10] 4/14 4/18 26/1 30/20 54/25 55/2 neither [1] 51/20 66/9 67/1 71/5 55/3 55/13 55/14 65/11 never [3] 12/16 76/16 77/3 longer [2] 7/5 14/1 new [6] 18/23 18/23 47/13 48/14 48/15 56/11 miss [2] 27/14 27/18 look [9] 7/11 9/23 10/11 29/8 45/25 46/2 56/2 missing [3] 29/19 30/3 55/23 **newspaper** [1] 17/13 60/10 63/11 mistake [1] 45/2 next [11] 14/21 16/12 16/17 36/10 58/11 72/9 looked [3] 31/4 45/8 69/12 mistaken [2] 8/6 8/14 72/14 72/17 72/21 73/13 75/1 looking [3] 42/19 42/21 67/20 misuse [1] 10/6 **night [3]** 26/3 27/12 64/19 **lot** [6] 19/21 24/4 35/7 37/18 37/20 50/17 moment [1] 77/22 no [64] 1/4 5/1 6/19 7/10 7/12 7/17 7/18 9/15 lots [1] 20/2 Monday [2] 5/8 5/15 9/18 10/23 12/8 13/23 14/1 14/8 15/6 15/9 luck [2] 24/23 25/1 month [1] 20/16 21/3 23/3 23/3 23/22 23/23 25/10 26/10 lucky [1] 5/3 months [2] 20/24 26/17 28/16 30/3 30/6 32/1 34/3 34/23 35/25 36/6 lunch [4] 4/19 55/6 55/9 78/1 more [30] 4/19 5/1 5/9 5/17 11/13 12/24 36/9 39/7 42/13 43/25 44/1 44/3 45/8 46/10 LUNCHEON [1] 78/2 18/18 18/22 20/3 21/14 21/20 23/1 23/2 46/11 47/15 50/8 51/6 53/1 53/19 53/20 23/11 23/13 24/10 24/20 24/22 27/16 40/10 54/24 55/2 55/3 56/11 58/10 61/21 62/14 M 43/3 45/3 45/25 46/3 54/21 55/2 55/3 59/10 63/10 64/1 64/7 64/15 66/19 67/2 67/8 71/6 made [24] 7/5 17/24 22/20 38/18 40/6 42/11 59/12 64/15 71/12 71/16 77/15 42/14 42/22 45/6 46/22 47/11 47/17 47/21 morning [17] 3/16 3/18 3/21 3/23 3/25 4/2 nobody [1] 27/12 48/18 49/8 50/1 50/19 55/19 55/22 56/7 56/8 noisy [1] 27/17 none [4] 7/8 7/11 26/21 57/4 4/4 4/8 4/20 5/25 6/2 25/5 25/6 31/16 32/17 56/10 56/12 59/17 36/12 47/25 main [2] 17/18 17/23 most [2] 23/24 24/19 noon [2] 5/15 5/16 maintain [2] 25/16 53/13 mostly [1] 58/18 normal [4] 4/20 12/24 13/11 27/16 maintained [1] 47/21 motion [5] 37/8 41/4 41/11 41/22 44/19 North [1] 26/25 major [1] 17/25 move [7] 7/4 7/5 22/8 22/11 22/16 24/1 24/10 not [119] make [13] 27/10 40/5 42/2 43/3 45/11 47/13 moved [2] 22/14 67/10 notary [1] 56/24 47/16 47/21 48/16 53/18 54/7 56/10 74/7 movement [3] 21/23 22/13 22/15 **nothing [2]** 26/14 68/19 making [3] 43/22 46/23 63/14 notice [1] 46/4 moves [1] 68/20 male [3] 7/15 27/4 71/24 moving [3] 23/4 24/5 24/11 notwithstanding [4] 43/20 43/25 47/24 48/17 mammary [2] 27/24 27/25 **November [4]** 8/1 8/2 15/15 15/18 **Mr [14]** 17/8 26/7 27/1 28/13 29/6 31/16 man [3] 76/3 76/5 76/10 November 2001 [1] 8/2 32/7 38/10 38/17 44/16 47/9 47/15 50/3 managed [2] 35/5 35/19 55/23 November 7, 2004 [2] 15/15 15/18 now [40] 4/15 7/13 7/19 8/15 9/3 9/21 10/14 management [2] 70/11 70/14 Mr. [4] 15/17 28/7 32/1 76/1 manager [5] 70/15 70/18 70/18 71/7 75/25 Mr. Griggs [1] 76/1 10/20 14/9 15/7 15/21 16/12 17/17 25/23 mandatory [2] 25/12 25/14 Mr. Jones [1] 28/7 31/3 31/16 32/5 32/18 37/2 40/7 41/10 42/3 manner [3] 12/24 13/11 23/2 Mr. Palisoul [1] 15/17 42/6 42/11 42/17 43/2 45/19 47/13 47/16 Manual [1] 14/25 47/17 47/21 48/4 50/4 58/24 59/16 59/23 Mr. Rider [1] 32/1 many [12] 24/7 24/8 24/8 28/4 35/13 35/14 Ms [36] 4/10 5/25 10/20 14/20 14/21 15/7 61/11 67/17 68/7 76/20 35/16 45/6 49/11 59/8 65/11 67/25 15/8 15/11 20/11 28/13 30/4 31/21 31/23 number [16] 8/23 10/2 10/4 12/15 12/25 21/6 MARGARET [6] 3/5 36/14 37/12 49/15 32/4 32/8 32/10 32/11 32/19 33/9 34/10 38/4 26/7 26/11 26/19 37/9 37/11 37/12 37/12 56/20 56/23 38/7 40/20 40/23 49/3 49/12 49/16 51/14 37/13 69/4 69/6 marked [2] 69/5 72/25 51/20 52/3 52/11 54/6 56/6 56/22 57/2 72/6 numbers [1] 77/13 Massachusetts [1] 6/16 NW [3] 1/17 1/23 2/3 much [11] 6/20 12/24 18/22 22/12 22/25 materials [1] 52/20 23/13 25/23 25/23 26/3 26/24 35/4 О matter [10] 4/13 4/17 23/7 24/23 24/25 49/11 multiple [1] 19/6 54/15 55/2 77/21 78/11 musth [1] 27/15 o'clock [1] 4/18 matters [2] 4/22 54/5 Oakland [13] 7/13 8/22 9/13 9/16 10/3 15/23 my [36] 4/22 7/3 10/11 11/5 11/8 11/8 12/8 maturity [1] 18/25 16/23 17/19 20/25 26/8 28/15 30/5 30/9 12/15 13/10 13/23 18/13 20/17 20/18 20/18 22/7 33/17 39/1 40/9 40/10 41/5 43/20 44/2 oath [2] 5/21 70/6 maximum [1] 27/22 may [20] 4/18 4/19 20/3 20/3 26/1 29/8 32/22 object [14] 29/10 31/8 31/25 32/5 32/18 44/2 45/2 47/20 55/20 55/21 56/9 56/16 58/7 36/2 36/5 37/17 38/17 47/9 48/16 49/5 49/19 63/7 70/10 70/15 75/19 76/17 77/4 37/24 41/24 43/6 45/20 55/20 60/3 68/25 50/22 50/23 53/25 55/3 75/14 myself [1] 12/2 76/18 77/6 **objected [8]** 32/3 42/8 42/25 43/2 46/11 maybe [6] 6/16 8/24 18/16 46/3 64/6 64/8 me [31] 4/14 13/12 17/7 20/16 22/18 26/5 46/15 46/17 56/13 33/11 40/19 43/25 45/16 47/19 49/3 49/7 nail [14] 28/15 28/18 29/7 29/19 29/20 29/21 objecting [1] 42/23 52/16 52/16 54/18 55/14 57/9 58/6 59/19 **objection [35]** 11/2 13/7 35/9 36/22 36/24 29/21 29/23 29/24 29/25 30/1 30/2 30/2 30/3 61/16 61/22 61/23 62/6 62/20 63/21 64/12 nails [1] 29/1 37/17 37/25 38/14 39/18 39/21 41/4 41/8 69/8 70/21 71/16 75/14 name [3] 15/3 63/25 70/2 41/20 41/21 42/1 44/18 45/16 46/18 47/11 mean [7] 18/14 24/7 58/1 60/15 66/12 70/13 named [5] 19/4 28/2 28/3 68/10 69/25 47/11 47/17 50/1 50/3 50/4 51/1 51/9 51/12 70/18 names [13] 13/8 61/11 61/12 61/13 61/14 54/10 55/18 56/8 56/8 56/13 58/21 60/20 mechanical [1] 2/25 61/15 61/16 61/20 62/9 62/14 68/3 68/4 76/2 77/1 meeting [1] 8/4 narrow [1] 38/2 **objections [60]** 36/18 37/14 37/15 38/12 member [1] 54/15 38/12 38/13 38/15 38/15 38/19 38/19 39/11 narrowed [1] 48/25

members [1] 24/17

National [2] 16/3 16/9

0	out [29] 11/18 20/5 23/2 23/16 24/17 25/22	52/7 54/11 72/13 77/12
objections [49] 39/13 40/5 42/3 42/9 42/10	26/2 26/13 29/20 34/11 37/23 39/8 43/11 47/25 51/23 55/9 56/2 56/3 57/24 57/24 58/1	plane [1] 21/19 play [4] 53/17 72/9 72/17 73/13
42/14 42/16 42/19 42/19 43/3 43/20 43/22	58/1 64/14 65/17 65/21 65/24 65/25 66/16	played [18] 30/18 47/25 72/8 72/12 72/16
43/22 43/25 44/1 44/2 44/3 44/8 44/10 44/12	67/6	72/20 72/23 73/2 73/6 73/10 73/12 73/16
44/21 45/6 45/12 46/5 46/13 46/22 46/24	over [10] 12/15 14/3 25/25 26/2 26/4 26/10	73/19 74/18 74/21 74/25 75/3 75/6
47/13 47/16 47/20 47/21 47/25 48/14 48/15 48/18 49/8 50/8 50/10 50/11 53/1 55/21 56/7	35/14 52/8 73/25 77/1	playing [2] 72/5 74/15
56/10 56/12 56/12 74/11 74/13 74/22 74/23	overnight [2] 25/24 26/4 own [2] 45/17 54/8	pleadings [1] 41/6 please [10] 3/14 5/25 14/20 14/21 15/9 15/10
objects [2] 37/5 37/9	owner [1] 6/15	15/17 60/10 69/4 69/8
obligated [1] 50/2	P	plus [1] 56/13
obligation [1] 51/7		point [10] 11/8 17/24 32/22 33/23 38/3 46/14
observation [1] 13/10 observed [3] 12/18 28/10 29/2	page [41] 3/6 5/2 5/12 14/10 14/21 15/10 15/17 15/21 29/9 39/14 43/24 50/1 56/21	46/23 59/24 65/5 75/15 poked [1] 60/17
obvious [2] 27/17 27/21	58/11 59/23 63/15 67/17 68/20 72/6 72/10	portion [27] 29/20 30/2 31/12 31/13 36/22
obviously [1] 33/14	72/14 72/14 72/18 72/18 72/21 73/12 73/13	39/18 43/6 52/18 53/23 53/24 54/4 54/18
occasional [2] 22/8 25/10	74/15 75/1 75/4 75/8 75/9 75/9 75/9 75/10	56/13 56/13 58/11 72/9 72/17 72/21 73/11
occur [1] 14/7 occurred [1] 27/15	75/20 75/22 75/22 76/14 76/15 77/13 pages [2] 5/13 49/22	73/13 73/21 73/23 74/4 74/13 75/4 77/7 77/11
October [2] 36/21 41/18	Palisoul [2] 4/11 15/17	portions [23] 15/22 30/14 40/24 42/9 46/16
October 15 [1] 36/21	paper [2] 41/6 41/6	47/10 51/14 51/22 52/10 52/13 52/22 53/1
of 2006 [1] 58/5	papers [2] 14/16 14/22	53/5 53/7 53/10 53/10 54/12 56/7 56/19
off [9] 20/18 29/22 32/24 51/24 54/21 59/22 62/1 67/10 77/24	paragraph [7] 15/23 16/17 36/21 60/10 63/17 67/19 70/9	58/24 74/23 75/7 76/23
offer [2] 50/12 56/6	PARDO [2] 1/22 4/7	position [9] 13/18 38/11 38/19 43/19 49/21 51/15 52/8 52/24 53/24
offering [2] 46/16 55/18	Park [1] 9/4	possibility [1] 28/17
office [4] 70/11 71/19 71/19 71/22	part [15] 6/14 8/15 9/13 9/16 18/3 18/20	possible [2] 22/2 22/19
officer [1] 10/12	20/11 26/23 47/8 50/11 51/23 53/16 61/2 71/21 76/21	potentially [4] 23/13 28/22 28/25 46/2
officers [2] 9/21 9/23 Official [1] 2/2	particular [5] 18/17 23/12 31/20 46/6 52/15	pounds [2] 27/23 27/24 powered [1] 24/2
often [3] 18/24 29/21 60/24	particularly [9] 11/23 18/8 21/24 22/4 23/4	practical [1] 49/11
Oftentimes [1] 24/22	26/23 27/21 27/24 38/14	practice [5] 12/1 41/1 41/12 41/22 42/25
Oh [1] 23/21 okay [9] 5/15 14/18 15/16 25/2 30/4 57/10	parties [1] 56/10 parts [3] 45/9 48/19 48/20	precise [3] 29/10 29/14 43/3
61/16 69/9 76/3	party [2] 40/3 51/20	predicate [1] 32/2 predisposition [1] 19/18
old [2] 17/15 27/7	passed [1] 26/7	pregnancies [1] 27/21
once [5] 7/1 23/11 27/15 29/21 32/22	past [1] 12/18	pregnancy [1] 27/2
one [37] 4/24 7/14 11/23 14/13 18/1 20/7 20/13 20/16 22/7 22/16 25/19 26/5 26/12	Pat [1] 17/4 Patience [2] 19/4 19/20	prepare [1] 5/11 prepared [2] 40/13 44/8
27/15 28/23 29/2 31/3 34/10 34/25 40/6	pattern [5] 19/25 40/25 41/12 41/22 42/25	presence [1] 14/4
42/17 42/18 42/18 45/25 49/15 49/18 52/2	PAWS [1] 7/1	present [1] 31/6
52/16 54/10 54/21 61/19 61/25 62/3 63/21	penis [3] 27/8 28/7 28/11 Pennsylvania [1] 1/23	presented [3] 3/5 14/17 14/22
63/25 66/3 77/17 one's [2] 53/19 53/20	people [10] 19/22 19/22 24/13 24/25 28/8	preservation [1] 44/23 preserve [4] 41/11 43/21 49/7 74/11
ones [5] 49/1 60/18 68/5 68/6 68/10	35/6 35/21 35/22 62/6 63/23	preserved [22] 37/15 38/18 39/6 39/12 41/8
only [14] 12/8 20/15 22/11 22/16 26/1 27/22	per [1] 20/14	41/20 41/21 42/2 45/17 45/22 46/8 47/12
57/18 61/19 62/3 62/15 63/21 66/3 68/6 77/16	performance [2] 24/15 58/2 performers [1] 61/25	48/1 48/6 48/7 48/8 48/10 48/17 50/10 50/12 56/9 74/22
operation [1] 45/17	perhaps [2] 8/6 22/12	preserves [1] 39/11
opinion [7] 18/10 19/15 21/20 22/7 26/8	period [3] 14/7 22/6 43/1	preserving [1] 51/9
33/11 36/2	person [10] 5/3 11/11 17/6 31/2 57/22 64/12	pretrial [14] 36/20 36/24 38/13 38/21 39/7
opportunities [1] 20/5 opportunity [2] 41/7 74/12	64/16 64/16 64/17 72/1 personal [1] 35/7	39/15 39/16 39/17 39/21 39/24 42/8 42/15 55/20 55/21
opposed [2] 33/9 33/19	personalities [1] 18/16	pretty [1] 48/5
opposing [1] 9/10	personality [1] 18/18	prevented [1] 34/16
order [30] 17/14 36/21 39/5 39/7 39/11 39/16 39/16 39/17 39/24 40/9 40/10 42/6 42/7 43/8	PETTEWAY [3] 1/21 4/4 49/16 petting [1] 19/22	PREVENTION [2] 1/3 3/13 previous [1] 73/11
44/2 44/2 44/12 44/22 44/23 45/25 48/5 50/6	phonetic [2] 54/16 62/13	previous [1] 73/11 previously [3] 12/23 55/22 56/10
51/7 52/3 52/8 54/21 55/20 55/21 56/9 56/16	photograph [2] 29/8 29/17	prior [3] 12/7 36/22 39/19
ordinarily [2] 12/11 12/14	photographs [1] 6/17	private [1] 6/15
original [1] 37/4 originally [1] 50/19	physical [2] 18/1 21/23 picking [1] 67/18	probably [4] 4/20 18/13 24/7 33/23 problem [7] 28/22 29/1 49/4 49/4 49/5 49/14
other [34] 4/22 7/17 15/5 15/10 17/25 23/6	picture [2] 6/3 6/22	50/16
26/16 26/16 29/3 35/22 36/4 36/8 37/7 37/22	pictures [1] 6/11	problems [2] 35/15 46/11
38/15 38/18 40/20 40/23 43/7 44/6 46/13 49/15 49/18 54/5 61/20 62/9 64/12 65/16	piece [1] 31/20 place [2] 26/10 27/12	procedure [1] 39/9
66/14 66/22 74/1 76/13 77/17 77/20	place [2] 20/10/2//12 placed [1] 21/17	proceed [8] 5/16 32/22 49/3 49/6 49/12 50/17 54/22 56/18
others [2] 62/4 62/5	plaintiff [5] 3/3 5/1 5/11 55/18 56/5	proceeding [1] 5/22
ought [1] 50/14	Plaintiff's [1] 30/11	proceedings [2] 2/25 78/11
our [27] 18/1 27/4 37/15 38/11 38/19 39/24 42/8 42/10 43/8 44/5 44/9 45/18 48/19 49/21	plaintiffs [15] 1/4 1/14 3/17 3/19 3/20 3/22 3/24 32/17 43/15 51/13 51/21 52/3 53/17	process [1] 50/21 prodded [2] 60/12 60/16
51/6 51/11 51/15 51/19 51/23 51/24 52/8	54/6 76/19	prodect [2] 60/12 60/16 prods [1] 37/22
54/8 54/15 54/24 54/24 59/16 74/23	plaintiffs' [10] 5/6 29/8 31/23 37/5 37/9 48/8	produced [1] 2/25
i	1	i

P	recess [5] 40/10 40/17 40/18 55/15 78/2	reviewed [4] 32/8 32/12 32/14 69/11
profession [1] 7/22	recognized [1] 64/10 recollection [2] 39/2 41/5	Rider [1] 32/1 rides [1] 24/21
proffered [2] 36/22 39/18	recommendation [1] 51/20	right [57] 5/16 6/9 10/14 10/25 12/9 13/3
program [2] 8/16 8/20	reconvene [1] 4/20	14/21 15/15 15/19 17/22 21/1 30/2 32/18
properly [1] 39/11	record [18] 3/15 30/8 36/17 45/6 49/24 53/2	32/21 34/2 36/1 36/7 36/15 38/4 38/8 38/22
props [2] 57/23 57/25	53/5 53/16 54/21 55/16 59/1 72/13 72/24	40/16 40/21 41/1 41/24 42/2 43/5 49/17
protected [4] 17/18 21/1 26/9 26/21 protection [1] 23/18	73/3 73/11 75/7 77/24 78/10 recorded [1] 2/25	51/24 53/22 54/1 55/1 55/14 55/16 55/24 57/10 61/2 61/11 63/17 64/22 66/10 68/6
protection [1] 25/16 protective [2] 52/3 52/8	RECROSS [2] 3/2 34/8	69/2 72/4 72/11 72/19 73/1 73/5 73/9 73/15
provide [2] 44/11 74/3	RECROSS-EXAMINATION [1] 34/8	74/2 74/9 74/17 74/24 75/11 77/14 77/16
provided [1] 44/7	red [13] 37/3 37/6 37/11 38/8 38/9 38/24	ring [1] 24/9
providing [2] 37/6 42/24 public [15] 16/3 16/10 20/2 20/4 23/3 23/3	40/20 40/25 41/15 42/23 44/19 51/12 57/17	Ringling [10] 6/18 7/20 9/23 12/15 13/15
23/15 24/15 24/17 24/20 52/21 53/1 53/5	red-line [1] 37/3 red-lined [1] 38/24	16/6 16/20 16/22 29/3 58/4 role [1] 10/11
53/16 53/20	redirect [4] 3/2 25/2 25/3 76/20	Room [1] 2/3
publications [1] 14/14	reduced [1] 25/25	routine [1] 24/8
published [4] 14/17 14/22 14/24 15/15	refer [2] 17/14 43/9	routinely [2] 25/8 25/10
pull [3] 15/3 15/3 22/1 pulled [1] 43/10	reference [2] 42/23 70/8	RPR [3] 2/2 78/9 78/16 rule [13] 39/2 39/6 39/10 40/3 43/19 43/21
purpose [7] 32/6 32/7 40/4 41/17 45/12 46/1	referenced [2] 61/23 71/18 referred [4] 44/18 45/4 52/14 69/5	44/1 44/11 45/3 47/24 48/1 48/4 49/9
46/4	referring [2] 42/17 42/18	ruled [2] 39/22 41/15
purposes [2] 54/9 54/13	refers [1] 14/25	ruling [1] 43/23
pursuant [3] 42/24 49/8 55/20	reflected [1] 11/23	run [1] 24/9
put [6] 28/12 46/4 53/17 53/19 67/7 68/19 putting [1] 67/9	regard [4] 43/6 44/5 49/21 74/13 regarding [4] 9/3 14/9 37/6 42/12	\mathbf{S}
	regular [2] 22/7 22/10	Sacha [1] 37/12
Q	regulate [1] 22/19	safe [2] 24/13 36/10
qualifications [1] 44/4	reinforced [1] 21/14	said [20] 8/13 15/5 21/13 33/23 37/2 39/11
query [1] 46/17 question [21] 9/4 11/3 13/9 20/15 29/11	relevance [4] 38/14 41/25 43/4 46/8	41/10 43/6 44/1 45/2 48/9 56/22 58/6 58/8 58/13 62/3 62/5 62/17 63/22 70/13
29/13 29/14 33/12 35/10 36/2 38/11 42/1	relevant [1] 53/10 relied [5] 39/2 43/19 43/21 50/18 50/19	same [14] 19/3 19/23 23/16 24/8 27/5 32/2
45/15 48/2 55/19 57/1 58/12 58/22 60/2	rely [4] 51/20 51/21 52/9 53/25	39/24 44/5 44/11 50/23 57/14 71/8 71/9 71/9
60/21 63/16	remember [29] 6/8 14/18 31/18 31/19 48/21	San [4] 9/3 10/2 15/11 15/18
questions [16] 5/17 10/12 16/18 21/3 30/12	57/8 59/5 59/15 59/17 61/14 61/19 61/20	sanctuary [2] 6/23 7/1
33/1 33/2 34/3 34/5 35/25 36/4 36/8 50/15 54/17 60/6 68/24	62/4 62/21 62/22 62/23 65/12 66/7 67/12 67/25 68/3 68/4 68/5 68/6 69/25 70/2 70/3	SANERIB [2] 1/15 3/17 saw [14] 7/8 24/6 27/12 32/4 45/8 61/7 62/9
quickly [2] 24/1 24/10	71/23 76/2	62/15 63/23 64/12 65/19 65/21 70/10 76/11
quiet [1] 71/14	remembers [1] 31/23	say [18] 4/23 5/10 8/24 20/13 25/10 26/21
quote [4] 60/13 63/12 70/9 70/11	removing [1] 30/1	29/18 42/7 45/11 49/10 49/18 50/7 56/2
quoting [1] 43/24	renew [1] 51/11	57/25 62/13 67/19 71/13 71/15 saying [9] 13/3 34/19 34/21 35/19 45/12 49/6
R	repeating [1] 45/8 reporter [5] 2/2 2/2 16/17 20/12 56/22	52/25 53/2 56/4
Radio [2] 16/3 16/10	representative [1] 8/21	says [10] 15/23 16/20 20/12 39/10 42/15 44/1
raise [3] 46/14 50/4 74/10	represented [4] 52/4 52/5 52/6 52/12	44/20 63/12 69/18 70/9
raised [14] 19/20 19/23 20/1 20/2 26/7 26/17 26/17 27/4 35/12 38/16 38/20 40/8 48/4	reproduction [1] 26/24	Scad [1] 52/6
51/13	request [4] 5/1 10/9 74/3 74/6 require [2] 23/16 56/9	scheduled [1] 10/17 school [1] 27/7
raising [3] 13/17 14/23 38/12	required [4] 42/6 42/7 43/8 44/12	scope [2] 31/10 31/13
range [1] 18/16	researchers [1] 25/19	scream [1] 63/14
rather [1] 75/15	reserve [1] 42/16	seal [5] 53/6 53/23 54/4 76/22 76/23
reaches [1] 18/25 read [18] 16/4 16/24 20/19 40/14 42/6 45/20	reserved [3] 41/4 46/13 74/13	sealed [6] 4/13 55/3 74/1 77/7 77/8 77/21 second [10] 26/5 36/19 52/16 52/16 54/22
47/24 50/15 54/12 54/17 54/19 54/19 54/21	reserves [3] 37/13 44/20 46/17 resolution [1] 53/11	60/10 65/21 65/23 66/2 66/16
58/24 58/25 75/15 75/21 75/22	resolve [3] 5/5 33/3 53/25	seconds [2] 30/17 31/24
reading [9] 3/5 37/2 44/15 44/16 44/17 54/8	Resource [2] 14/9 15/1	section [5] 68/20 72/6 72/14 75/1 76/13
54/12 56/19 75/20 ready [10] 57/23 57/24 58/1 65/17 67/3 67/5	respect [7] 4/19 4/23 12/11 12/20 45/1 55/17	see [30] 6/18 7/6 7/10 8/9 8/25 10/6 14/6
68/17 68/18 68/19 69/9	56/4 respond [1] 48/23	17/10 18/3 23/25 30/20 30/24 32/13 48/10 49/4 49/20 56/3 57/9 60/13 61/9 63/8 63/12
real [1] 26/25	responded [1] 48/23	63/14 63/18 63/19 65/3 67/21 69/19 70/13
really [24] 10/20 18/15 19/9 23/25 26/14	response [4] 32/17 43/8 47/1 76/22	76/22
39/7 59/9 59/11 59/13 63/5 64/4 64/18 65/2	responsive [4] 13/11 13/14 76/21 76/23	seeing [1] 19/2
65/10 65/14 66/7 66/11 69/24 70/17 70/25 71/6 71/20 71/25 76/2	rest [4] 5/6 5/7 54/19 54/19 restraints [1] 21/23	seem [1] 46/7 seems [4] 40/20 45/16 48/5 49/19
reason [9] 17/18 18/10 22/9 33/22 43/15 44/3	restriction [1] 22/23	seen [13] 6/11 12/14 12/16 13/14 29/3 32/23
51/21 55/8 57/2	restricts [1] 21/22	62/3 64/13 66/3 66/10 69/14 69/15 76/7
reasons [3] 17/24 32/2 37/7	result [3] 19/12 26/12 39/24	sense [1] 35/21
recall [12] 7/22 8/11 8/17 9/5 9/24 10/18 14/10 29/14 31/8 31/19 75/18 75/19	resume [1] 74/15	sensitive [1] 55/10 sent [2] 31/17 33/5
recalls [1] 32/14	resumed [2] 5/20 5/23 retired [1] 13/25	sentence [3] 60/11 63/11 63/17
receive [1] 74/1	returned [1] 65/5	separately [1] 52/11
received [2] 16/1 16/6	returns [1] 32/23	September [6] 36/25 37/1 37/4 38/25 39/21
	returns [1] 32/23 review [1] 16/22	September [6] 36/25 37/1 37/4 38/25 39/21 42/20

27/14 27/17 27/18 28/21 45/21 48/3 48/16 SULLIVAN [2] 1/10 25/7 **Sunday [1]** 15/18 51/1 51/8 **September 16 [2]** 37/1 42/20 sometimes [3] 19/19 55/7 56/2 supervisor [4] 70/15 70/16 70/20 70/24 September 16, 2008 [2] 36/25 39/21 sorry [8] 9/22 14/10 38/6 62/11 62/13 75/21 supplement [1] 14/23 **supposed [4]** 24/14 24/24 76/6 76/10 **September 16th [1]** 37/4 76/8 77/25 serious [1] 20/21 sort [9] 17/24 18/17 19/23 19/25 22/23 23/10 sure [21] 15/25 15/25 31/19 34/7 52/14 52/17 served [3] 8/23 46/23 46/25 59/9 59/11 59/13 61/11 62/24 63/5 65/2 24/9 27/18 47/7 set [1] 37/8 sorts [1] 23/6 65/14 69/24 70/17 70/25 71/6 71/20 71/25 setting [6] 19/21 20/2 23/13 23/19 23/20 sought [2] 52/3 52/7 76/2 23/25 sounds [1] 57/10 surprised [1] 10/15 settings [1] 24/18 speak [4] 12/8 57/6 72/1 77/22 survival [2] 8/16 8/20 seven [1] 26/3 speaking [3] 13/23 69/25 70/3 surviving [1] 35/4 severe [1] 19/8 specially [1] 21/13 suspended [1] 58/6 severely [1] 21/22 species [2] 8/16 8/20 sustained [1] 20/21 sexual [1] 18/25 specific [3] 42/6 49/15 49/21 sway [2] 25/23 26/1 specifically [12] 9/7 17/4 30/14 37/2 38/12 shall [2] 36/24 39/20 swayed [1] 25/23 she [43] 11/3 11/3 13/5 13/9 16/18 16/19 38/16 42/9 42/14 42/23 43/6 44/6 44/7 swaying [1] 25/25 18/22 19/1 19/20 19/21 19/23 20/17 25/23 **speculate** [1] 48/3 Swaziland [1] 9/7 25/23 25/23 26/1 26/2 27/25 31/22 32/8 speculated [1] 48/4 swinging [1] 62/21 32/12 32/14 32/14 32/15 32/22 32/23 35/10 spend [1] 66/9 sworn [2] 56/22 56/24 40/20 51/18 51/25 52/5 52/6 54/17 54/19 splayed [1] 26/13 symptoms [1] 35/3 synchronized [2] 24/2 24/11 61/25 63/13 64/23 64/24 64/25 64/25 65/23 spread [1] 26/2 67/14 67/15 squeal [1] 67/16 she's [6] 15/24 15/25 32/3 38/8 51/19 52/2 squealed [1] 67/14 **SHEA [8]** 1/21 4/2 26/7 27/1 28/13 29/6 staff [1] 54/15 tailor [1] 44/8 take [9] 4/14 4/19 40/10 40/16 54/23 54/25 31/16 32/7 stage [1] 63/13 **short [5]** 13/18 40/10 40/16 63/6 65/13 staining [1] 29/4 55/2 55/3 69/8 taken [7] 6/17 30/9 32/9 32/10 45/6 45/7 shot [1] 16/22 stand [3] 5/20 28/25 32/24 should [8] 37/23 39/24 40/8 41/12 51/4 54/25 standards [5] 25/11 25/12 25/13 25/14 25/15 47/18 55/13 77/8 **standing [3]** 47/16 61/1 64/2 taking [3] 57/23 57/25 58/16 talk [4] 54/21 76/5 76/6 76/10 **show [17]** 6/3 15/7 15/17 18/3 29/7 30/10 standpoint [2] 21/24 54/24 31/21 32/1 32/13 38/24 42/12 61/1 64/19 start [4] 66/10 75/20 75/22 77/25 talked [4] 25/11 43/18 68/17 75/25 talking [3] 22/3 25/7 47/12 65/1 65/3 68/17 68/18 started [9] 16/17 27/16 45/1 48/21 50/16 showed [2] 10/23 30/7 61/22 62/1 62/17 65/25 TANYA [2] 1/15 3/16 tape [6] 16/1 16/6 16/7 31/25 32/2 32/4 showing [1] 60/5 starting [2] 26/11 30/20 shown [8] 11/10 30/15 31/9 32/3 32/3 32/5 state [2] 44/2 47/1 targeted [1] 52/2 32/18 32/23 taught [2] 28/7 28/9 stated [3] 36/21 44/25 47/1 shows [2] 14/1 30/9 team [1] 11/18 statement [9] 36/25 38/13 38/21 39/15 39/21 teasing [1] 19/22 side [1] 30/23 40/11 42/9 42/15 42/15 sign [1] 69/23 statements [1] 38/18 tech [2] 3/23 4/11 signature [1] 69/16 technique [1] 27/7 states [4] 1/1 1/11 20/14 60/11 signed [2] 69/21 70/5 stay [1] 24/10 teenage [1] 19/1 simply [2] 39/2 60/5 stealth [2] 16/1 16/7 telephone [1] 33/2 tell [15] 33/11 47/19 49/7 54/18 59/19 61/23 **SIMPSON [9]** 1/20 4/1 38/10 38/17 44/17 steering [2] 8/23 9/1 63/22 64/4 64/12 64/18 65/10 66/7 70/20 47/9 47/15 50/3 55/23 stenography [1] 2/25 since [1] 38/20 steps [1] 22/16 70/24 71/19 Sinnott [1] 3/23 telling [2] 13/6 28/12 stereotypic [1] 25/22 sit [4] 8/11 20/17 54/16 75/25 still [11] 5/21 5/21 15/24 21/22 22/4 22/15 temporarily [1] 6/25 sitting [1] 56/3 Ten [1] 68/2 23/12 24/8 41/20 54/20 59/6 tent [2] 66/13 66/18 situation [15] 11/25 12/2 18/24 19/9 22/6 stop [1] 66/16 terminated [1] 52/1 22/10 22/25 23/1 23/10 23/12 24/1 24/12 **stopped** [7] 10/22 13/18 66/19 66/20 66/23 testified [8] 7/19 8/15 9/22 10/14 17/17 32/12 24/22 27/5 30/1 66/24 67/1 situations [1] 26/22 34/10 56/25 straight [1] 66/17 Strauss [2] 4/9 4/10 six [5] 8/24 8/25 20/24 26/3 46/2 testify [1] 57/3 streamline [1] 45/13 testimonial [10] 37/14 38/13 42/2 42/10 six-week [1] 46/2 size [1] 7/13 strenuously [1] 32/5 42/13 42/16 44/8 44/10 44/11 44/21 skin [2] 22/22 29/4 skip [1] 73/25 stressed [1] 22/1 testimony [54] 4/20 6/8 6/12 7/23 8/17 9/1 struggle [2] 26/23 26/25 9/24 10/18 10/20 11/1 11/6 11/7 34/14 35/2 slap [1] 20/5 **struggling** [1] 26/19 36/13 36/22 36/24 37/6 39/19 39/20 40/12 Smoky [8] 27/4 27/10 27/15 28/2 28/3 28/5 42/23 42/24 43/1 43/21 44/4 44/6 44/9 50/10 studied [1] 24/16 28/7 28/11 subject [2] 32/16 56/8 50/11 51/14 51/21 51/22 51/25 52/8 52/9 so [89] submit [3] 75/8 76/22 77/10 52/10 52/13 53/18 53/20 54/6 54/13 55/18 56/5 56/5 56/6 56/7 56/7 69/1 73/24 74/11 social [1] 18/15 submitted [1] 70/6 SOCIETY [2] 1/3 3/13 76/18 77/7 77/20 subsequent [1] 31/12 soft [1] 57/5 subsequently [2] 50/20 69/7 than [15] 4/20 5/2 5/9 12/10 21/21 23/13 23/19 45/3 55/2 55/3 59/10 59/12 64/7 75/15 Solito [1] 62/13 successful [1] 26/24 some [23] 16/22 18/14 19/10 19/24 22/8 23/9 such [5] 10/23 12/4 13/4 18/14 39/11 78/1 23/10 33/23 37/21 38/17 40/7 48/25 50/23 sufficient [1] 42/16 thank [7] 6/2 31/14 33/4 53/8 72/3 72/4 suggest [2] 38/18 48/5 52/20 53/25 57/9 61/13 65/5 68/4 74/11 75/12 74/11 74/22 77/20 suggested [2] 52/20 53/4 that [460] somebody [5] 11/10 48/3 69/25 70/3 77/5 that's [56] 5/7 6/13 7/16 8/8 9/1 9/2 9/9 suggesting [2] 47/16 50/4 someone [3] 55/23 71/20 71/22 10/11 11/2 12/1 13/2 14/5 14/12 14/15 15/2 Suite [2] 1/17 1/23 something [14] 11/14 21/18 22/9 24/24 27/2 Sukumar [1] 25/17 15/14 17/21 20/20 20/23 21/2 21/20 24/22

59/12 63/14 unfair [1] 5/11 \mathbf{T} unhealthy [1] 29/22 tissue [1] 29/23 that's... [34] 26/2 34/13 35/8 36/7 38/8 40/4 unit [12] 37/6 37/11 38/8 38/9 40/20 40/25 titled [1] 78/11 40/22 41/2 41/9 44/3 45/22 46/10 47/3 48/9 today [8] 5/8 7/14 8/11 45/20 52/23 57/2 41/15 42/23 44/19 51/12 57/16 57/18 77/17 77/20 50/5 50/20 51/9 53/3 53/6 53/22 54/2 54/3 UNITED [3] 1/1 1/11 20/14 54/14 55/1 55/23 60/8 72/3 74/2 74/9 74/9 together [2] 38/17 39/6 universe [2] 48/21 48/24 74/19 75/18 77/10 77/12 told [3] 14/2 71/16 76/10 unnecessary [1] 46/19 their [34] 22/15 23/12 25/9 25/16 27/20 28/6 **TOM [16]** 3/5 36/14 37/12 38/4 38/7 40/20 unrelated [1] 26/22 30/23 38/12 39/13 41/4 41/4 41/11 41/20 40/23 49/3 49/15 52/4 52/11 55/17 56/20 unresponsive [1] 11/24 41/22 41/24 42/14 42/15 42/19 44/11 44/12 56/22 56/23 57/2 until [6] 28/1 33/2 48/1 75/21 75/22 76/14 44/16 44/19 45/17 47/12 49/2 51/3 54/12 unusual [3] 27/13 50/22 50/24 Tom's [7] 49/12 51/14 51/20 54/6 56/4 56/6 61/12 61/13 61/15 61/16 62/14 67/7 68/3 up [21] 4/21 4/24 14/20 15/9 16/13 25/7 them [34] 7/11 12/16 17/10 21/5 21/9 21/10 Tonka [2] 68/6 68/11 29/23 33/1 35/6 36/4 37/19 39/1 40/7 40/9 24/7 24/10 26/12 26/21 30/24 43/4 44/3 47/1 too [3] 49/1 64/5 64/13 49/1 57/6 58/4 61/4 65/16 67/6 67/18 48/16 50/14 53/18 57/24 60/19 61/15 63/25 took [7] 20/18 20/25 26/10 27/12 61/25 62/17 **upon** [1] 53/25 upset [2] 70/21 70/22 67/6 67/8 67/24 67/25 68/14 68/15 68/16 66/12 68/17 68/17 68/18 68/19 70/10 75/15 tool [1] 35/22 urine [2] 28/25 29/5 themselves [1] 22/2 **top** [1] 23/19 us [2] 58/25 77/13 topic [1] 14/16 then [37] 4/16 6/11 10/24 10/24 21/8 21/15 **USDA** [5] 6/5 6/12 32/11 33/6 70/3 use [14] 11/16 11/19 12/1 12/5 12/11 19/16 totally [1] 46/12 21/17 26/16 27/15 27/20 28/22 29/21 33/1 44/20 45/16 47/1 47/14 50/15 51/3 52/9 54/3 22/19 23/1 24/4 24/4 26/9 34/1 37/11 55/6 tour [1] 11/12 54/19 54/22 58/7 58/21 60/20 61/4 63/9 toward [1] 18/8 used [6] 11/13 13/8 21/7 33/10 35/24 40/4 63/15 64/12 64/14 65/15 65/21 66/1 71/18 traditional [1] 34/15 using [3] 12/23 13/19 19/7 76/13 77/7 train [4] 21/18 21/19 23/5 58/7 usually [2] 23/9 23/10 utilize [1] 53/9 there [84] trained [1] 21/7 there's [12] 4/13 22/12 23/3 23/5 23/9 23/11 trainer [6] 17/19 17/22 20/25 24/9 28/4 23/22 23/23 24/19 47/4 58/21 59/24 28/10 Val [1] 28/10 therefore [1] 37/9 trainers [1] 24/13 thereto [1] 36/18 training [2] 28/6 35/6 vehicle [1] 39/7 **Thereupon** [1] 56/23 transcript [6] 1/10 2/25 45/21 46/20 50/14 vehicles [1] 23/5 version [2] 37/3 37/4 these [9] 13/25 24/2 24/18 37/19 45/6 45/14 46/6 48/22 74/23 versus [2] 3/14 25/23 transcription [1] 2/25 very [46] 6/20 7/4 11/19 11/23 11/25 12/1 they [126] transport [2] 25/8 25/8 they're [2] 47/2 53/13 12/17 13/12 13/15 19/5 19/6 19/9 22/4 22/22 transported [5] 7/1 21/4 21/10 21/16 28/5 they've [3] 24/21 50/18 51/1 treated [2] 35/3 58/20 23/24 24/1 24/2 24/5 25/10 26/17 26/22 27/6 thing [6] 12/4 19/3 22/7 22/7 38/1 49/18 27/11 27/13 27/16 27/17 27/21 30/10 30/16 treatment [2] 10/10 35/16 things [7] 15/5 23/6 28/23 29/2 37/18 37/21 37/20 40/10 40/16 45/9 48/9 49/11 57/6 trial [15] 1/10 36/19 37/11 37/14 38/2 43/22 60/11 63/11 67/19 67/20 67/23 70/8 70/21 44/21 45/13 46/2 48/1 72/25 73/4 73/7 73/18 think [73] 6/16 11/5 11/17 11/20 12/1 12/13 74/19 70/21 70/22 75/13 12/17 18/12 19/13 19/14 19/17 19/17 20/8 Victor [3] 62/10 62/11 62/12 tried [1] 32/1 22/22 24/12 24/19 24/23 26/20 28/25 29/6 video [33] 3/5 11/20 16/20 24/6 30/7 30/9 trim [1] 29/22 30/17 31/5 31/11 35/8 36/3 36/18 37/15 30/18 31/20 31/22 31/22 32/8 32/10 32/13 **trip [1]** 36/10 37/16 37/19 37/21 37/23 38/1 38/17 39/5 32/15 32/19 32/20 72/5 72/8 72/12 72/16 truck [1] 21/19 72/20 72/23 73/2 73/6 73/10 73/16 73/19 39/10 40/4 40/6 40/7 41/18 41/25 42/1 45/19 trucks [3] 21/6 21/13 22/14 45/24 45/25 46/7 46/9 46/13 46/25 47/2 47/3 **true [7]** 6/14 7/2 9/17 14/14 17/1 41/3 44/5 74/4 74/18 74/21 74/25 75/3 75/6 47/15 47/24 48/4 48/25 48/25 49/10 50/3 videotape [3] 16/22 17/1 17/7 truly [1] 27/18 50/5 50/16 51/2 51/2 51/23 52/21 53/3 53/4 view [3] 39/24 44/5 51/6 truthfully [1] 57/3 53/12 53/14 53/15 55/22 59/10 59/12 73/21 try [6] 24/13 29/23 46/2 46/3 57/5 57/6 **VIP [1]** 11/12 75/14 virus [7] 26/18 26/18 26/20 34/24 35/2 35/5 trying [3] 63/7 67/3 77/23 third [3] 15/10 15/21 29/19 35/17 Tuesday [2] 5/10 5/15 turn [6] 22/15 49/19 59/23 63/15 75/19 76/14 this [117] visit [2] 7/25 10/7 thoroughly [1] 35/13 turned [1] 64/14 visited [2] 7/19 12/22 those [36] 5/2 5/4 9/7 10/21 10/22 10/22 12/9 two [9] 4/23 5/2 17/23 54/5 58/7 63/12 63/20 voice [3] 16/13 57/5 71/7 12/10 12/20 19/5 20/4 24/7 24/12 25/12 voiced [2] 70/10 71/13 63/23 75/13 25/14 26/8 26/10 38/15 38/19 38/19 40/14 volatile [1] 23/13 tying [1] 38/17 42/3 44/9 44/11 48/25 49/11 50/10 50/15 typical [2] 20/1 29/25 voluminous [1] 41/6 voluntary [1] 25/12 50/19 52/22 53/1 53/5 53/7 53/9 53/10 59/19 typically [4] 13/14 18/23 22/14 27/13 though [6] 12/5 12/25 43/12 45/11 46/14 W thought [5] 8/6 8/13 33/22 45/22 50/7 **U.S** [1] 2/3 Wagon [1] 75/24 three [7] 5/2 5/12 5/13 7/14 14/3 18/16 54/23 **Uh** [3] 66/25 68/12 71/4 Wait [1] 42/22 three-page [2] 5/2 5/12 **Uh-huh** [3] 66/25 68/12 71/4 waiting [1] 6/25 waive [1] 41/21 **through [3]** 20/17 47/8 72/10 ultimately [1] 76/25 thumb [1] 20/18 unaccepted [1] 18/5 waived [7] 38/13 38/14 38/15 38/20 41/8 tickets [1] 10/9 unaware [1] 45/1 43/4 47/2 waives [1] 51/2 time [40] 6/17 8/22 9/1 10/17 14/7 22/6 23/15 uncommon [2] 21/9 21/11 24/20 26/4 27/4 34/4 35/7 35/20 35/22 36/13 walked [4] 62/24 63/8 64/14 65/7 under [13] 5/21 14/16 23/19 34/15 34/21 39/5 40/3 42/7 48/4 51/7 70/6 76/22 76/23 want [18] 4/21 4/23 5/10 7/3 40/10 48/16 38/16 38/20 43/22 45/7 46/22 47/17 49/7 understand [6] 47/9 49/5 56/17 60/6 68/24 49/6 49/14 49/23 50/21 51/21 54/18 54/18 52/19 54/8 59/14 60/7 60/25 63/6 63/6 65/13 54/20 55/4 55/10 56/2 75/17 65/13 65/21 65/23 66/2 66/16 67/9 69/8 wanted [13] 4/16 19/10 25/22 28/14 29/7 73/21 76/17 77/4 understanding [2] 7/3 60/1 timeframe [3] 57/7 57/13 57/14 36/1 39/3 47/20 49/25 50/17 53/16 53/17 understood [2] 17/17 50/7 times [8] 12/15 29/3 29/22 35/14 59/8 59/10 54/7 underweight [4] 6/20 7/6 7/9 7/10

within [5] 20/24 21/12 26/19 31/13 50/1 W without [4] 21/5 21/10 41/13 44/4 was [202] witness [17] 3/2 5/18 13/8 31/9 36/7 36/11 was **2001** [**2**] 8/6 8/13 42/24 43/12 49/16 69/10 75/15 75/17 75/18 Washington [4] 1/4 1/18 1/24 2/4 75/19 77/17 77/18 77/19 wasn't [10] 6/18 8/4 27/2 29/10 47/17 48/2 witness's [1] 74/7 48/6 48/17 58/9 76/19 witnessed [2] 63/12 63/20 watching [3] 31/18 31/19 31/23 witnesses [3] 37/6 46/6 46/12 waving [3] 30/24 31/1 31/2 won't [1] 14/19 way [19] 6/22 11/19 12/6 13/14 22/12 22/23 work [3] 57/7 57/16 71/16 24/21 24/25 27/7 27/16 33/2 37/23 39/9 worked [7] 11/11 18/16 57/13 57/14 57/18 47/24 47/24 50/18 58/19 66/15 74/1 59/14 62/6 ways [1] 11/16 working [2] 13/16 59/6 we [127] would [46] 3/14 8/9 8/24 11/13 11/14 11/17 we'd [5] 54/11 56/19 72/9 72/17 74/3 11/19 12/11 12/14 13/18 14/20 17/16 22/5 we'll [7] 49/20 54/22 68/23 73/13 74/15 75/8 22/13 22/18 23/15 25/10 26/21 27/7 27/17 77/25 28/20 28/20 29/16 29/18 29/18 31/1 34/14 we're [28] 4/15 5/7 5/21 11/22 36/13 40/13 38/2 39/8 43/14 44/5 44/10 45/15 47/21 42/11 42/12 44/9 46/1 47/12 52/12 52/18 48/15 49/8 50/8 50/11 53/4 54/17 56/11 57/5 54/7 56/21 58/24 59/16 60/6 67/17 72/5 57/24 60/10 60/17 61/4 73/20 73/21 75/20 75/21 75/21 76/14 76/20 wound [2] 22/21 22/21 wounding [1] 10/21 we've [3] 26/18 42/11 48/23 wounds [1] 10/23 website [1] 6/23 write [1] 63/20 wrong [4] 40/19 41/10 45/3 47/20 week [1] 46/2 wrote [3] 14/10 14/11 39/18 weighs [1] 27/23 well [18] 8/13 8/21 21/6 21/22 22/9 22/20 26/17 28/21 29/18 32/22 38/22 39/5 40/2 yeah [2] 7/3 21/19 42/4 44/25 47/3 51/11 54/7 well-being [1] 22/9 year [3] 8/19 20/14 20/24 years [13] 7/22 8/23 8/24 8/25 10/2 10/4 13/1 went [10] 9/21 10/2 10/24 20/16 45/7 48/3 63/1 63/2 64/25 65/18 15/24 17/14 19/1 24/8 26/11 28/4 were [91] yes [84] weren't [2] 38/16 38/20 yesterday [21] 4/24 5/4 6/4 6/9 7/19 8/15 9/5 whacked [2] 60/12 60/16 9/22 10/14 14/10 17/17 17/23 19/7 25/12 what [79] 25/17 25/21 28/14 30/7 31/9 33/9 33/16 **whatever [4]** 11/10 47/20 48/11 62/22 yet [1] 24/8 when [51] 7/25 8/8 8/11 8/19 9/21 10/1 11/11 you [310] 12/22 20/1 20/16 23/4 23/7 24/20 24/23 you're [13] 5/21 9/10 13/3 13/6 30/1 33/19 25/23 26/2 26/13 26/18 27/8 28/10 29/2 34/21 35/19 49/6 52/25 53/2 76/21 76/24 34/18 34/19 34/20 37/1 39/1 44/25 45/2 45/5 you've [3] 41/8 42/6 46/13 45/7 45/9 47/17 50/18 50/19 57/25 59/4 61/7 **young [2]** 20/1 30/7 64/2 64/25 65/18 65/18 66/16 69/8 69/21 your [122] 70/5 70/8 70/13 70/24 71/7 71/13 74/11 yours [2] 5/3 50/23 whenever [1] 8/8 yourselves [1] 3/15 where [19] 11/18 14/21 17/1 18/4 18/18 19/6 **YouTube** [1] 6/11 19/22 22/11 23/13 24/1 30/1 35/6 47/10 55/23 56/22 62/25 66/6 66/8 69/23 **ZEILER [1]** 1/20 Wherein [1] 42/22 whether [6] 11/10 24/24 29/6 32/8 42/1 Zina's [1] 13/3 46/17 **zoo [20]** 7/13 8/22 9/14 9/16 15/23 15/25 **which [31]** 24/3 24/16 26/18 27/13 32/20 17/19 19/3 19/21 20/25 21/12 23/13 23/20 23/25 25/15 26/8 27/2 28/11 28/15 30/5 40/3 41/25 42/6 42/17 42/18 42/18 43/7 44/16 44/17 49/19 50/8 50/22 50/23 51/3 zoo's [1] 26/9 zoos [2] 8/16 25/8 56/20 57/16 58/17 59/25 60/1 60/18 61/9 61/14 67/23 68/5 68/22 68/23 while [6] 6/25 10/6 11/22 16/22 59/6 63/4 **who [14]** 17/6 25/17 27/6 28/4 28/7 28/9 55/17 62/5 62/7 63/22 66/2 70/13 70/16 71/19 who's [4] 11/11 28/2 56/3 62/2 whole [7] 27/6 30/2 45/12 46/1 46/4 62/21 why [16] 18/11 27/3 28/20 31/1 33/11 39/12 44/3 48/9 48/10 51/25 52/2 54/20 57/2 58/4 65/15 68/13 Wild [1] 9/4 will [11] 4/14 22/1 30/12 31/23 49/16 55/2 55/3 57/6 71/14 72/14 77/13 WINDERS [2] 1/16 3/22 winnow [1] 50/23 winnowed [1] 50/20 wishes [1] 56/6