IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF THE CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, ET AL.,

Plaintiffs,

CA No. 03-2006
Washington, DC
February 10, 2009

VS.

2:30 p.m.

FELD ENTERTAINMENT, INC.,

PM Session,

Defendant.

TRANSCRIPT OF BENCH TRIAL
BEFORE THE HONORABLE EMMET G. SULLIVAN
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiffs: KATHERINE

KATHERINE A. MEYER, ESQUIRE HOWARD M. CRYSTAL, ESQUIRE TANYA SANERIB, ESQUIRE DELCIANNA WINDERS, ESQUIRE Meyer, Glitzenstein & Crystal 1601 Connecticut Avenue, NW Suite 700

Washington, DC 20009

(202) 588 5206

For the Defendants:

JOHN M. SIMPSON, ESQUIRE LISA ZEILER JOINER, ESQUIRE LANCE L. SHEA, ESQUIRE KARA L. PETTEWAY, ESQUIRE MICHELLE PARDO, ESQUIRE Fulbright & Jaworski, LLP 801 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Suite 500

Washington, DC 20004

(202) 724-6522

Court Reporter:

Lisa M. Hand, RPR Official Court Reporter U.S. Courthouse, Room 6706 333 Constitution Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20001 (202) 354-3269

Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography; transcript produced by computer-aided transcription

1	<u>INDEX</u>
2	<u>WITNESS</u> <u>DIRECT CROSS REDIRECT RECROSS</u>
3	For the Plaintiff:
4	BENJAMIN HART, Ph.D 6/26/35 72 110/122 116
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	PROCEEDINGS
11	THE COURT: Ms. Meyer, let me apologize to you for
12	cutting off at the pass your reader. I should let you do
13	that. It's your case in chief. You were introducing
14	presumably admissions of the parties?
15	MS. MEYER: Yes, Your Honor.
16	THE COURT: I should let you do that. The question
17	becomes, were they going to be a segue into this testimony or
18	not? If not, then there's no harm. If it is, I want to be
19	fair with you about that. I want you to make your case.
20	MS. MEYER: I think we're okay, Your Honor
21	OFF THE RECORD DISCUSSION
22	THE COURT: I want to give you the chance to do
23	that. If you'd planned to do that, and I thought you had, I
24	should not have
25	MS. MEYER: I had planned to do it before Ms.

Sinnott's testimony, and it relates to what Ms. Sinnott was testifying about the transportation orders, because as you saw, she relied heavily on the --

2.2.

THE COURT: Her testimony was extremely helpful in trying to understand those charts.

MS. MEYER: So I think we're okay in terms of — as long as the testimony that we wanted admitted into evidence is now admitted into evidence, we can rely on it, and that will be fine.

THE COURT: I provisionally allowed the charts to come in, subject to whatever weight, if any, I give them. So again, I want to be fair. If there are admissions that you wanted to introduce of your party opponent, I want to be fair about that and give you a chance to do that.

MS. MEYER: I guess, Your Honor, what I'm talking about is if the rest of the testimony that we wanted to use from the 30(b)(6) deposition can just be admitted into evidence, which is what I understood you to say earlier today, I think we're fine with it. You don't have to hear it orally. Is that right?

THE COURT: All right. Unless you think I will really derive a benefit from it. Obviously it was serious enough, important enough for you to block off 30 minutes of time to read it. So again, I just want the record clear, I'm affording you the opportunity. I'll be happy to listen to it,

1 really. 2 I think we can go ahead and rely on the MS. MEYER: 3 deposition testimony now that it's been admitted into 4 evidence, without having to read it to you. That's fine. Call your 5 THE COURT: All right. 6 witness. 7 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: We recall Dr. Hart to the stand. 8 THE COURT: All right. 9 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: One quick housekeeping matter. 10 For the brief on agency authority that is presently due 11 tomorrow at noon --12 If you need more time, that's fine. THE COURT: 13 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: We were going to ask for one 14 additional day, so it would be due Thursday at noon, and I 15 think that would be true for defense counsel as well. 16 MR. SIMPSON: No objection. 17 If you need Friday, that's fine. THE COURT: Sure. 18 I just, I'd like the benefit of your best thoughts, and I'm 19 sure I'll get the benefit of your best thoughts. If you need 20 Friday, that's fine as well. 21 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I think if we could do it by 2.2. Friday, that would be fantastic, Your Honor. Our submission 23 at least would be a lot more coherent if we have that time. 24 THE COURT: That's fine.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

Thank you.

1	THE COURT: Actually, am I going to read it this
2	weekend? I probably won't, only because there are some other
3	matters I have to deal with on Friday. So, there is a holiday
4	coming up. It seems to me that this trial is going to be
5	going on for a while. If I get it if you want to file it
6	over the weekend, counsel want to file it over the weekend,
7	that's fine. If you want to file it on Monday, that's fine.
8	MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I think Monday is a holiday. I
9	don't know. We can still file it by then.
10	MR. SIMPSON: They all kind of blend together.
11	MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I think if we can get till
12	Friday, we'd be fine.
13	THE COURT: Friday noon then.
14	MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Thank you. Appreciate the
15	latitude on that.
16	Good afternoon, Dr. Hart.
17	THE WITNESS: Good afternoon.
18	DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED
19	BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:
20	Q. I think when we finished off we were talking about your
21	research on brain cognition in elephants. We put up on the
22	screen, I want to identify this and make sure that this is the
23	same publication we're talking about. It reads "Large brains
24	and cognition: Where do elephants fit in?" Is that correct?
25	A. That's correct.

- Q. And this is the publication in which you discussed the research you were talking about, where elephants compare with other animals?
 - A. That's right.

2.2.

- Q. If we can look at Page 7 of that. That is the seventh page of that publication. Figure 1. And if you could just look at sorry, Figure 2. If you could just describe for Judge Sullivan what that represents and how it correlates with the description you were giving a little bit earlier.
- A. Your Honor, I had mentioned earlier that the elephant's brain was three times the volume of the human brain. And it's pictured here, you can see, if you take the total volume, it is much larger, as it is of the chimpanzee brain. So it represents in a scale drawing what we know to be true.
- Q. And if we could then look over at two pages later, Page 9, the ninth page, Figure 3. And again, what does this figure depict?
- A. This figure represents the modeling of the neurons in the elephant brain compared with the primate brain of human and chimpanzee, where, as I was explaining, the neurons in the elephant brain are spread out. They are more globally reaching across the cerebral cortex, allowing the animal to have access to all domains in the cerebral cortex, memory, sensory input. And the human brain and the chimpanzee brain, it's been found by neurobiologists that a lot of action goes

on locally, in concentrated neurons, more intrinsic local action for fast action, say quick, fine-grained activities.

- Q. And I think before you were making some reference to this information as it may relate to elephant memory and other capacities?
- A. Well, yes, it is. I mean how do elephants really excel? That is a long-term memory. And you can see how this type of a brain organization, that is the hard wiring, is going to give the animal access to memories of distant water holes or forage areas, maybe as much as 35 years ago, in one report in the literature, water holes that are 40 miles apart. Knowing which one is closest when you're out in the middle of nowhere. Social details, details about dialects or parts of the vocalization to different elephants, remembering so many elephants, remembering chemosensory smells, a domain of factors that play into memory.
- Q. And if we can just go to the end of this publication. The last couple of pages starting with the references.

 Looking this over, I counted 87 different publications that you cite at the end of this piece of work. Does that sound about right?
 - A. That's about right.
- Q. Did you read all of those 87 publications in order to prepare this?
- 25 A. Yes.

2.2.

- Q. Now, what kind of a paper is this paper called?
- A. This is called a review paper.
 - Q. What does that mean?

2.2.

- A. Well, there are two kinds of review papers. One is just kind of review what has been known and you don't add anything into it. This one in this particular journal, you specialize in bringing together information from wide, diverse resources, and coming up with some information that really wasn't all that clear before. So that's what this review paper was. You're bringing things together that are well established but they've never been brought together in that way before.
- Q. As far as you know, is this the only paper which engages in that kind of review with respect to elephant cognition?
- A. Well, it is of this type, except that we had a chapter in a book that was published the year before, of a smaller version of this, and that's referenced here.
 - Q. And what publication is this article published in?
- A. This one, the chapter was in the Evolution of Nervous Systems, a four-volume work by a leading National Academy of Science editor. And when we asked our colleague at Davis who's a specialist in neurobiology and large brains if she'd look at this paper and give us some feedback, she said look, look, Dr. Hart, can you give us in very short order a chapter

for this to put in our book? It's going to go to press in a couple of months, but we'd really love to have this in there because there's nothing like this in the literature and it 4 would make the book more complete. So that was put together 5 while we were working on this longer, more definitive paper. I object to the hearsay portion, move to MR. SHEA: 7 strike it.

THE COURT: To the extent it impacted his state of mind and what he did afterwards, I'll allow it, not for the truth of the matter asserted. But you did something in response to that request?

> THE WITNESS: That's right.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

1

2

3

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

21

2.2.

23

24

25

- This particular one that's up on the screen says Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Review, is that --
- That is a journal name. Α.
- Q. And is that a reputable --
 - It's a very highly respected journal. Α.
- 19 Is it hard to get articles placed in that publication? Q. 20 MR. SHEA: Objection. Objection.

THE COURT: It's somewhat argumentative also. What is the process for getting articles placed in that publication?

THE WITNESS: You submit an article and it is -the editor sends it out to specialists to review, and then the editor looks at them and decides if it's going to go in the journal, if it meets certain standards, and what kind of modifications you might be asked to make to get that in there.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

- Q. In preparing this article, did you discuss elephant behavior and cognition with other experts?
- A. Indeed. We have colleagues on the Davis campus; they were acknowledged. It was sent to people who know elephant behavior very well. I did that as well. So it has been looked at from a behavior standpoint and from the standpoint of specialists in neurobiology of large brains.
- Q. Have you participated in conferences and symposia based upon your research into elephant cognition?
- A. I participated in two symposia based on this work. One was in 2005, an invitation to participate in a symposium on cognition at the Animal Behavior Society meeting. And secondly, last summer, in August 2008, to participate in a conference on minds of animals. And those are the two where we discussed this work.
- Q. Other than the field research and the review that we've been talking about and the other aspects of your background, have there been any other opportunities for you to observe elephants, either in captive situations or in the wild?
- A. Well, there have been, I mean, in some way. We traveled to Asia when we were looking over the study sites,

1 and spent time watching elephants out there. And the same 2. with Africa. As I mentioned before, my wife has a graduate 3 student, she's now a postdoctoral person, who is doing 4 research on seismic communication. And that was done in 5 Africa as well. So I've been to that study site where they 6 were looking at a water hole. Playback studies and recording 7 studies of elephants visiting a water hole. And spent a 8 couple weeks at those study sites watching those elephants 9 carefully. My wife was a participant in these studies, but I 10 went along to help and observe, see what was going on. 11

- Q. Do you consider yourself an expert in animal behavior?
- 12 Α. Yes, I do.
- 13 Do you consider yourself an expert in elephant Ο. 14 cognition and behavior?
- 15 Α. Yes, I do.

16

17

18

19

20

2.2.

24

25

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Your Honor, I tender Dr. Hart as an expert in those topics.

THE COURT: Any voir dire?

MR. SHEA: Yes, Your Honor.

VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

- 21 BY MR. SHEA:
 - Good afternoon, Dr. Hart. Q.
- 23 Α. Good afternoon.
 - Dr. Hart, you have never been in private veterinary practice, have you?

- 1 A. No, I have not.
- 2 Q. You have been an expert witness in several prior
- 3 matters, is that correct?
- 4 A. Yes, I have.
- 5 Q. And those matters involve dogs and cats, is that true?
- 6 A. Dogs and cats. There's one involving goats.
- 7 Q. Any others?
- 8 A. Actually it didn't involve cats; it's been dogs and goats. That's it for right now.
- 10 Q. This is the first case in which you're testifying about 11 elephants, correct?
- 12 A. Yes, it is.
- Q. Some of the topics, Dr. Hart, of your current research
- are behavioral profiles on breeds of dogs, is that correct?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- Q. Another is behavioral profiles on different breeds of
- cats, correct?
- 18 A. That's right.
- 19 Q. Another is the phenomenon of grass eating by cats, 20 correct?
- 21 A. That's right.
- 22 Q. Another -- well, that was a follow-up to the project
- 23 you did on why dogs eat grass, is that true?
- 24 A. That's true.
- 25 Q. And another one is the value of companion animals for

- 1 people with AIDS, correct?
 - A. That's true.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

2.2.

- Q. None of your current research involves elephants, correct?
- A. Current research with regard to field studies, but the interest in elephant biology and elephant cognition is an ongoing topic. For example, I have been asked to write a chapter for a book that is coming out of this Animal Mind Symposium that is that I haven't written yet, that is for the future. I have been asked to participate. So again, it's an ongoing process with regard to studying the latest on elephant behavior and biology.
- Q. And that ongoing work that you mentioned is reviewing the literature rather than doing empirical studies, correct?
 - A. Rather than being out in the field.
- Q. The articles that you've published after writing your report in this case do not involve elephants, do they?
- A. No. You have the publications in front of you there.
- Q. Dr. Hart, the example of ongoing research that you gave me in our deposition was an article involving why dogs eat grass, is that true?
 - A. That's true.
- Q. And you've published only four articles that involve elephants, correct?
- 25 A. That's true.

- Q. And you've gone through three of those articles today, true?
 - A. I think we touched on all four, I mean, the book chapter and that final one in 2008, and these other two on the fly switching tool use.
 - Q. Dr. Hart, the 2008 cognition article that was shown to the Court is a longer version of the 2007 cognition book chapter that you wrote, did I understand that correctly?
 - A. That's right, with more extensive discussion and more complete coverage.
 - Q. When I asked for a typical example of your research at deposition, you told me that you were one of the leaders in urine marking by cats, correct?
 - A. That's right.

2.2.

- Q. And you pointed out to me at deposition that your research on urine marking by cats had nothing to do with elephants, correct?
- A. If I recall that conversation, I was referring to the urine marking itself not being related to elephants. But anytime you're involved in study design, it gives you an overall perspective of how to look at literature and how to interpret things, regardless of the animal species.
- Q. I see. Dr. Hart, let me show you Page 55 of your deposition, beginning on line 8. Sorry, beginning on line 20.

 I asked, question: Now, you as a part of your behavioral

service you conducted medical research on animals, correct?

A. You asked that, yes.

2.2.

Q. Answer: Yes, we did. Question: Okay. Were those animals given drugs as part of that research? Answer: That's right. I can give you if you want a typical example.

Question: That would be fine. Please.

Answer: We were one of the leaders in urine marking by cats — by the way, it's not elephants — urine marking by cats in the house. It's a major problem that pet owners have, and we could try all kinds of behavioral manipulations and usually not solve the problem. So we tried one of the psychotropic drugs, the trademark is Prozac, or fluoxetine, and found, you know, in a few pilot animals, found that it stopped the behavior.

So then we set up a clinical trial, so then we outlined a trial with a placebo group and a drug group, and then we recruit cats that come in, or we send letters to veterinarians in the surrounding areas and we say we're conducting this trial on urine marking, if you have clients who have such a cat, we've got some sponsorship on this trial, we will do a physical exam, maintain contact with the client and then we will have the drug administered, sent to that client, that either may be a coated drug, a placebo, or a drug, and we will keep track of the urine marking by calling the owner on a weekly basis and having him fill out a form.

So that is a typical medical paradigm. You might be testing drugs for arthritis and do the same design. We were using it for a behavioral pattern.

Did I read your testimony correctly, Dr. Hart?

A. Yes.

2.2.

- Q. Dr. Hart, you've written no articles about the veterinary care of elephants, true?
- A. That's right.
- Q. Now, as you've mentioned today, you assisted your wife and her graduate student with some research on seismic communication in elephants, correct?
- A. That's right.
 - Q. This was not your research as author or lead investigator, was it?
- 15 A. That's true.
 - Q. And those articles have not been completed yet, correct?
 - A. Some have. I don't think they are mentioned here in the literature that has been cited, but I know of one.
 - Q. I thought I understood you to say this morning that that research had not been completed?
 - A. That was in India, and I thought your question was referring to work on elephants in general. And some of the work in Africa, in Namibia, at the Etosha National Park, has been.

- Q. Dr. Hart, has that study been published yet?
- A. Well, it's several papers and I cannot tell you at the moment exactly which ones have been, but some of that work has come out.
 - Q. Dr. Hart, you have not conducted empirical research on elephants except for your fly switching studies and helping with your wife's elephant seismic studies, correct?
 - A. That's true.

2.2.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: There's no definition of empirical research means.

THE COURT: Do you understand the question?

THE WITNESS: My understanding is he's talking about being in the field and observing animals, not looking at empirical studies, looking at empirical studies — and you can call that research, that is literature research, you're looking at empirical studies. Depends on how you interpret.

THE COURT: Why don't you rephrase the question so there's no misunderstanding about what you're asking.

MR. SHEA: Your Honor, I may be able to clear this up by showing him his deposition, beginning on Page 97, line 8.

- BY MR. SHEA:
- Q. Dr. Hart, if you would read with me. Page 97, line 7.
 I apologize. I asked a question: Have you conducted any
 empirical research on elephants other than your research on

fly switching behavior? Answer: No.

And then you said: Oh, can I — Question: If you need to clarify, please do. Answer: My wife, Lynette Hart, collaborates with a graduate student, Caitlin Rodwell O'Connell, on the seismic communication in elephants, and they publish together, and that deals with elephants when they make low-pitched rumbles, the energy, some of the energy is transmitted into the feet, and then it's transmitted into Rayleigh waves in the ground — R—A—L—I—E, something like that. I'm not sure of the spelling.

Did I read that correctly?

- A. That's right, you did. I might add then your question about empirical research was within this context it would refer to in the field.
- Q. In the field where you're gathering data, correct?
- A. Yes.

2.2.

- Q. Now, Dr. Hart, you have performed no studies on stereotypic behavior in wild elephants, correct?
- 19 A. No, I haven't. I've never seen it.
 - Q. You have performed no studies on stereotypic behavior in captive elephants, correct?
 - A. Sorry. Say that again.
 - Q. You have performed no studies on stereotypic behavior in captive elephants, correct?
 - A. That's true. The captive elephants I'm experienced

- 1 | with in India, I have not seen it.
- 2 Q. You have performed no studies on the welfare of
- 3 elephants that are transported or -- well, strike that. Dr.
- 4 Hart, you've also performed no studies on the effects of ankus
- 5 use on elephant behavior, have you?
- 6 A. What kind of use?
 - Q. Ankus?

- 8 A. The bull hook? No, I haven't.
- 9 Q. And you have performed no studies on the effects of
- 10 ankus use on elephant cognition, correct?
- 11 A. The use of bull hooks on cognition, no, I have not.
- 12 Q. And you have performed no studies on the effects of
- 13 ankus use on elephant welfare, correct?
- 14 A. No, I have not performed studies on that.
- 15 Q. And you have performed no studies on ankus use on
- 16 elephant emotions, correct?
- 17 A. No direct studies, no.
- 18 Q. Dr. Hart, you've performed no studies on tethering or
- 19 chain use on elephant behavior, have you?
- 20 A. No, I have not.
- 21 Q. And you've performed no studies on elephant -- or on
- 22 the use of chains with elephants and effects on cognition,
- 23 have you?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q. And you've performed no studies on the use of chains

- 1 | with elephants and elephant welfare, correct?
- 2 A. No studies per se.
 - Q. And you've performed no studies on the use of chains
- 4 with elephants on elephant emotions, correct?
- 5 A. No studies per se.
- Q. You're not a member of the Elephant Managers
- 7 Association, are you?
- 8 A. I am not.

- 9 Q. You're not a member of the International Elephant
- 10 Foundation, correct?
- 11 A. I am not.
- 12 Q. Not a member of the American Zoo and Aquarium
- 13 Association, correct?
- 14 A. No, I'm not.
- Q. And you're not a member of the Elephant Taxon Advisory
- 16 Group of the American Zoo and Aquarium Association, are you?
- 17 \blacksquare A. I am not.
- 18 Q. And you've not been asked to consult with any of those
- 19 entities, have you?
- 20 A. I have not.
- 21 Q. Dr. Hart, you've never rendered veterinary care for
- 22 elephants, have you?
- 23 A. No, I haven't.
- Q. And you've never provided foot care for elephants, is
- 25 that correct?

1 A. I have not.

4

5

6

7

8

9

13

14

15

16

17

- Q. You've never prescribed a proper diet for elephants, correct?
 - A. I have not.
 - Q. You've never diagnosed any disease in elephants, correct?
 - A. I have not.
 - Q. And you've never euthanized an elephant, true?
 - A. That's true.
- Q. And you've never developed the expertise necessary to train an elephant to be managed by free contact methods, correct?
 - A. Well, I'd like to qualify my answer there. You said would you rephrase your question. I think you said develop the could you rephrase that, please.
 - Q. I'll ask you again, you have never developed the expertise necessary to train an elephant to be managed by free contact methods, correct?
- A. I'll give that in two parts if I may, the answer. One part is that I have not trained elephants per se. The other part is understanding the principles of learning apply regardless of species. There's a broad range of species. So positive reinforcement, punishment, negative reinforcement, ratios of reinforcement, I know these very well, I've written about them many times. We use them clinically with dogs, we

use them with goats, you can use them with horses.

Those are general principles that you can apply to a wide variety of species, of course including elephants. So yes, I have been trained, I have learned the principles that would apply to training elephants in a noncontact arena.

Q. Dr. Hart, I'd like to show you Page 111 of your deposition in this case, beginning on line 9, and I'd ask you to read along with me. Question: Now, elephant training, have you developed the expertise necessary to train an elephant to be managed by free contact methods? Answer: No.

Did I read your testimony correctly?

A. That's right.

2.2.

- Q. Did Hart, you've not developed the expertise necessary to train an elephant to be managed by protected contact methods, correct?
- A. Within the context that question was asked, I was thinking of familiar with those particular elephants, working with a zoo or something, you know, within that context. I was not, when I answered I wasn't thinking about the principles in general. The expertise about that particular elephant or that particular place that it's done in, that requires a different kind of expertise. You wouldn't walk into a zoo or strange setting and just start applying your principle of learning.
- Q. Dr. Hart, let me show you Page 111 of your deposition, beginning on line 14. I'd ask that you read with me.

Question: Have you developed the expertise necessary to train an elephant to be managed by protected contact methods?

Answer: No.

Did I read your testimony correctly?

A. That's right.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

18

- Q. You're not an expert in elephant training, are you?
- A. No, I'm not an expert in having trained a lot of elephants. I know the procedures very well. They are very common principles of learning.
 - O. Dr. Hart --

THE COURT: You know all the procedures for training elephants?

THE WITNESS: I don't know all the procedures. I know the general principles, Your Honor.

- 15 BY MR. SHEA:
- 16 Q. Dr. Hart, you've never trained an elephant, correct?
- 17 A. No, I haven't.
 - Q. You've never managed an elephant, is that correct?
- A. Well, I mean, we've done these studies in India and
 Nepal, and you have to manage experiments on them, you have to
 conduct the studies, you have to set it up.
- 22 THE COURT: Why don't you rephrase that question.
- 23 I'm not sure what you mean by manage. Rephrase it.
- 24 BY MR. SHEA:
- 25 Q. Dr. Hart, you've not provided day-to-day husbandry

management for an elephant, have you?

- A. No. That's true.
- Q. And you've never handled an elephant with a guide or ankus, correct?
 - A. I have not.

2.2.

Q. And in your report — well, Your Honor, that's the end of our voir dire. We move to strike Dr. Hart's testimony for the reasons stated in our notice of Daubert objections and his testimony today. He has not provided veterinary care for an elephant; he has not provided foot care, diet for an elephant, or diagnosed disease in an elephant; has not provided husbandry care; has written no articles about the veterinary care of elephants and conducted no empirical studies regarding elephants except his two fly switching studies, and helping with his wife's seismic studies.

We do not believe that he can be qualified to address anything other than fly switching in elephants, and he should not be permitted to testify that FEI's use of the guide or FEI's use of tethering in the management of its elephants at issue in this case constitutes a taking or inflicts physical or psychological wounds, nor should be allowed to offer opinions regarding elephant conservation in general, or whether FEI's success in breeding captive elephants meets a goal of elephant conservation.

THE COURT: All right. Any further questions?

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Yes, Your Honor. Two follow-up. And then if it would help the Court, I could just explain exactly what it is we're using Dr. Hart to address, because a lot of those topics are not things we were going to get into in any event.

THE COURT: Then I'm going to ask the doctor to step outside for a few minutes so we can discuss.

DIRECT EXAMINATION CONTINUED

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

Q. If we can take a look at Page 111 through 112 of your deposition, Dr. Hart. You were asked by defense counsel questions that he posed. But just to complete the testimony, the question was: So I take it you're not an expert in elephant training, correct? This is at the bottom of Page 111.

Answer: Training per se? That's true.

Question: You qualified your answer. What is your qualification? Continuing over at Page 112: Well, I have opinions about training. I know behavioral principles. I know positive reinforcement, negative reinforcement, punishment, I know that field. That is relevant to training.

Was that your testimony?

- A. That's true.
- Q. What did you mean by that you know behavioral principles and -- let me start with that.

- A. Well, the principles are widely known among
 behaviorists, the conditioning, positive reinforcement, the
 use of punishment, the use of negative reinforcement,
 schedules of reinforcement. And those are true regardless of
 the mammalian species. Humans in fact, they hold with
 chimpanzees, they hold with dogs, and they hold with
 elephants.
 - Q. When you say you know behavioral principles, you know them based upon what, Dr. Hart?
 - A. The principles have been based on multitude of studies on animals in general to work out these principles of behavior.
 - Q. I think you testified earlier that you began research, the field research in the early 1990s, is that correct?
 - A. True.

2.2.

- Q. Since that time, over the last 18, 20 years, would you say you've spent a significant amount of time on the study of elephants?
- A. I would say I have. We've traditionally gone back for one to two months in the summers while we're conducting these studies. And each study takes more than one trip back there, two or three years to get the data together. So you're watching, you're going back quite a bit, and you're thinking about it, you're dealing with that topic for a long period of time.

- Q. And over that time do you believe -- and again independent of this case -- that you've become familiar with literature about elephant behavior?
 - A. Yes, I have.

2.2.

- Q. You were asked questions by Mr. Shea relating to cat urine. Do you believe that your research on cat urine let me ask it this way. How was it you can become somebody who does research on cats and dogs and also do research on elephants?
- A. Well, if you spend 40, 42 years in the area, you've developed an expertise in a number of areas, and in veterinary school I'm expected to give some attention to dog and cat problems, and I do. When I have my own my free time, the other half of my time if you will, I do field studies, and field studies on a number of species.

So the wider you get exposed to animal behavior and among — in the species, the better perspective you have to view the subject of interest, in this case elephants. You've got a context of animal behavior to view you the elephant behavior, not just looking at the elephant alone, but you understand its behavior relative to what behaviorists know about animals in general.

Q. In going back to your research, the review paper that we were talking about a little bit ago on elephant cognition.

Your Honor, I neglected, especially since there

1 is this outstanding Daubert issue, to move the admission of 2 that final publication of Dr. Hart's that we had relied upon, 3 on the same rationale that we had previously discussed with 4 the Court. 5 THE COURT: I'll allow it over objection. 6 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: For the record, it would be 7 Plaintiffs' Exhibit 155. I thank you, Your Honor. 8 THE COURT: Over objection. 9 MR. SHEA: Your Honor, that is for the limited 10 purpose of qualifications, is that true? 11 THE COURT: Yes. Yes. 12 MR. SHEA: Thank you. 13 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Thank you, Your Honor. 14 BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 15 In terms of empirical research, and how animal behavior 16 scientists approach their field, is field research in your 17 view the only way in which one can become an expert in an 18 area? 19 No, field research is not the only way. Field research Α. 20 is complementary to other ways of -- going to meetings, 21 conferences, learning about behavior, reading the literature, 2.2. putting things together. So the field studies complement an overall intellectual approach. 23 24 When I asked you before whether you consider yourself

to be an expert in elephant behavior and cognition, why did

you answer yes to that question?

2.2.

- A. I answered yes because I think I've done ground-breaking research in understanding the elephants' relationship, with their large brain, to an array of intellectual capacities that is really as I said, it's ground-breaking research and it hasn't been done by someone else, so I actually bring something to this field that I think is quite unique.
- Q. And as -- Your Honor, I don't want to ask him his opinion because I know Your Honor hasn't ruled yet on the Daubert issue. But I was going to ask him one question, not getting into his opinion, but why he thinks his expertise may be helpful to the Court in sifting through the issue.

THE COURT: I was going to ask that question myself. Go ahead.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

- Q. Insofar as your expertise you've discussed, why do you believe that your research into elephant brains and the other things you've talked about would be of any value to Judge Sullivan in addressing the issues in this case as you understand them?
 - MR. SHEA: Objection, vague.
- 23 THE COURT: Do you understand the question?
- 24 THE WITNESS: I do.
- 25 THE COURT: All right. So do I. I'll allow the

1 question to be answered.

2.2.

THE WITNESS: Thank you. The issues involve chaining --

THE COURT: Before you answer that, what is your understanding of the issues in this case?

THE WITNESS: My understanding of the issues in this case are chaining and confinement for long periods of time, and the use of the bull hook in managing the animals. And understanding the chaining and confinement, I think it's a very important question to ask, the animal that is being confined and chained for long periods of time, what is their — what is their awareness, what is their intellectual domain? Is it just the same as taking a rat and confining them, or is this an animal with higher mental powers, with a large brain, is it going to be much more impactful on this species than other species?

So I think it's important to understand the elephant's brain and cognitive capacities in the context.

THE COURT: And am I correct — if I'm incorrect tell me, but am I correct in saying that the majority of your work involving elephants has focused on elephant brain, brain capacity and the extent of knowledge that it requires?

THE WITNESS: That's right, cognitive behavior, cognitive processing, yes, right. So it has to do with their -- again, their higher -- the importance of a large

1 brain animal that is aware, can sense what is going on in 2 other elephants, can sense what is going on in its own brain 3 So that's important to understand the harmfulness therefore. 4 of confinement, long-term confinement, and being able to just 5 do nothing for hours and hours and hours. 6 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Your Honor, I have nothing 7 further on voir dire. THE COURT: All right. Can I ask you to step 8 9 outside the courtroom for just a few minutes so the attorneys 10 and I can talk about the case. 11 THE WITNESS: Yes. 12 (Witness exits the courtroom). 13 So, you're offering him on the issue of THE COURT: 14 an expert with respect to elephant cognitive behavior. 15 that what it is? 16 That's correct, Your Honor. MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 17 THE COURT: He can't testify about bull hooks or --18 sorry, did you have an objection? 19 MR. SHEA: No, I thought you were addressing both 20 of us. I apologize. 21 THE COURT: I'm going to hear from you. 2.2. want counsel to make his argument. I didn't want to talk about the doctor in his presence. So persuade me why should I 23

allow him to testify as an expert. And if so, should it be

limited just to that issue, cognitive behavior of an elephant?

24

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I think cognition and behavior. We're not talking about veterinary care, We're not talking about anything relating to physical wounding. He is a vet, but we're not asking to qualify him as that.

THE COURT: Are you trying to elicit opinions about the use of the bull hook?

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: The only thing we would ask about the bull hook are two things based on his research. One is that they have developed this capacity for fly switching, tool development, and that says something about the elephants' exposure to discomfort, even from a fly. And this is something he's personally observed. So that is the only thing that we would be asking him.

And the other thing is going to their memory abilities, their cognition, something Your Honor had asked about. You had posed the question the other day, does this mean if an elephant remembers being struck when young, is that something they are likely to carry with them for the rest of their lives. This is the expert who can talk about something like that.

So we're not talking about ongoing bull hook use, anything relating to that. He's not opining on that. This all relates to the cognitive ability of the elephant and how injury manifests itself, as Dr. Hart has put it, in a large brain sociable animal. That is what we're going to limit his

1 testimony to.

2.2.

THE COURT: Why shouldn't I allow that for that limited purpose, counsel? Come forward. It helps the court reporter.

Subject to the Court giving it whatever weight, if any, it's entitled to.

MR. SHEA: Sure, Your Honor. One point, regarding an elephant remembering being struck while young. His cognition articles are literature reviews on existing literature. And frankly, I don't know that they establish anything regarding that specifically. And he said he's not done any studies regarding ankus use. And I can assume only that the striking would be done with an ankus. So I don't see how he's qualified to address that issue. And —

THE COURT: You can certainly probe that during cross-examination in an effort -- you can probe that during cross-examination in an effort to persuade the Court that his opinion is not worthy of any weight.

MR. SHEA: Your Honor, I understand I can, and I probably will, but the point is --

THE COURT: I have no doubt you will.

MR. SHEA: -- if he's not qualified, he shouldn't be testifying about that in the first place.

THE COURT: I'll let him testify for that limited purpose, subject to cross-examination, and of course subject

to whatever weight the Court gives his ultimate testimony. 1 2 Over objection. 3 Thank you, Your Honor. MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 4 (Witness takes the stand again.) 5 Thank you, Doctor. You may proceed, THE COURT: 6 counsel. 7 DIRECT EXAMINATION RESUMED 8 BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 9 Dr. Hart, are you a member of any animal rights or 10 protection organizations? 11 Α. No, I'm not. 12 Are you philosophically opposed to all elephants being Ο. 13 in captivity? 14 No. Α. 15 Are you being compensated for your testimony? 0. 16 My time is being compensated, yes. Α. 17 And what is -- how much are you being compensated? Q. 18 It's \$100 an hour for time spent on studying, writing Α. 19 reports. 20 Is that your usual rate for such services? 0. 21 No, my usual rate is \$300 an hour. Α. 2.2. Q. Why are you charging a hundred dollars an hour? 23 I feel this is in -- the topic is in the public Α. 24 interest, people are interested in elephants, they read about 25 them, they are intrigued by them, they know that they are

- particularly intelligent special animals, and so as a public service, that I feel it is my duty to come forth and represent whatever I can to the topic, the discussion.
 - Q. Did you go on a site inspection in connection with this case?
 - A. Pardon me?

5

6

- Q. Did you go on a site inspection in connection with this case?
- 9 A. I did a site inspection at the Auburn Hills circus area 10 in Michigan.
- 11 Q. About when did you do that?
- 12 A. What did I do?
- 13 Q. When did you do it?
- A. Oh, when did I do it? Exactly when that trip was, I
 don't recall. It wasn't in the last year at any rate. It was
 before the deposition and after report. I forgot. I don't
 want to guess.
 - Q. If I said about November 2007 would that seem about right?
- 20 A. Yeah.

18

- Q. Did you go on the site inspection to the CEC facility in Florida?
- 23 A. No, I did not.
- Q. And when you went on the Auburn Hills inspection, what did that entail?

- A. It entailed standing around a lot waiting for these elephants to be released from the boxcar, watching them walk out, the two which we were allowed to watch. Going in and looking at the boxcar after the elephants have exited. And then waiting until they had been taken to the pen. I call it the staging area. And then later on put on the chains and put in what they call a picket line.
 - Q. If we can take a look at Plaintiffs' Will Call Exhibit 118, these are the photos that have already been admitted into evidence. And look first at Page 4 of that exhibit. And then look at Page 5 of the same exhibit, and then look at Page 8. Do these look like the boxcars that you saw in your inspection?
 - A. Yes, they do.

2.2.

- MR. SHEA: If I could ask that the P.L. numbers be read into the record so we know what we're talking about here.
- 17 THE COURT: I agree.
 - MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I'd be happy to do that, Your Honor.
- 20 BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:
 - Q. I believe I'm correct in saying that they are P.L. 15017, 15018, and 15118, in the order in which they were presented. Could you describe the railroad cars?
- A. The cars? Well, you saw the pictures. They are about 10 feet wide, 20-some, 20, 30 feet long. You can see this one

here, there's not much space above the elephant's head. Four walls, pretty barren, just four walls and blocked over windows there. That's --

THE COURT: I can't see. It's hard to tell how
much space there is, or is his head touching the top of that?

THE WITNESS: To be honest with you, we weren't
allowed in until they came out, so I could not see myself how
close they were, but I'm going by this photograph here, and
looking at the — my recollection of how high they were. This
is not unrealistic.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

- Q. And in terms of the chain setup, can you describe that?
- A. Well, there's a chain, the elephant's usually chained on opposite feet, one chain on the front foot and one in the back, and they can move one step forward, one step backwards, and that's it.
- Q. If you'd take a look at what has been provisionally admitted as Plaintiffs' Exhibit 50. And this is the chart that was discussed this morning, Your Honor. And particularly Page 34. And the data on times that are reflected in that chart, or some of those times. And this is for the Blue Unit.

And just to, say, take an example of one of the numbers that is in there, 37 hours. Assuming for the sake of the following question that elephants were chained for 37 hours in a railroad car like that one, without being allowed

to get off the train, do you have an opinion on whether that would have an effect on the behavior of the elephant?

MR. SHEA: Your Honor, I object. This is beyond the scope of the offer for this expert, the two issues counsel enunciated. Additionally, confinement for long periods of time I don't believe is subject to the notice letters that were filed in this case, and therefore it's not properly before the Court.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Number 1, on the last point, our notice letter, which I don't think Your Honor is probably going to want to entertain argument over at this particular juncture, specifically talks about chaining, and this is chaining in a railroad car, just like we're talking about —

THE COURT: I'll let him answer over objection.
What is your answer?

THE WITNESS: Okay. Let's state the question one more time.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Can the question be read back?

THE WITNESS: You had asked me a question about

what effect would I feel this would have, being in a railroad

car like this under these conditions for 37 hours, right?

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

Q. Correct.

2.2.

A. There are in my mind kind of two ways of looking at it.

One is just you can imagine any, almost any animal, being, I

mean a chimpanzee, a dog or a person, in a car like this, so you can step one step forward, one step back, for three days, and you're fed water, but you would expect an animal -- you would expect abnormal behavior. You would expect misery. It's just in my sense, given -- especially given the large brain intelligent capacities of an elephant, to sit there like that, stand there like that for that period of time is in my mind, you know, it just speaks for itself is a harmful, injurious situation.

2.2.

THE COURT: So, in other words, you're not invoking your expert privilege then, your answer is just as a matter of common sense then, is that correct?

THE WITNESS: I'm saying given the elephant's brain, its intellectual capacities, it makes it a more serious concern than it does with other animals. Plus the fact that the elephant's brain is hard-wired to be moving around, to go to water holes, to be foraging all day, that is the way their brain is put together, not to stand in one place and move one foot forward, one foot backward. So it is invoking my expertise to understand this.

Now, the other area of my expertise that's relevant here is, is there a way of looking for markers, is there a way of measuring how bad it is. And one could then ask the question, well, what is a good marker? A good marker is what's called stereotypic behavior, just kind of repetitive

things done over and over again.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

24

25

THE COURT: What do you mean by your testimony that the elephant's brain is hard-wired to be moving around?

THE WITNESS: Okay. In the field of animal behavior and cognitive behavior, it's understood that the brain reflects an animal's, what they call ecological niche. In other words, if you forage for fruits and vegetables, you're going to be aware of where the fruits and vegetables are and how to get at those. And if you're foraging on low quality forage all day long, and you're just -- you're geared up to remember where the forage is and where the water holes are, your brain is put together to reflect that predisposition. It supports that ecological importance and your own biology, because elephants need to move around to find their forage in nature. Sure, you can supply it to them in grass, but that is what the brain is kind of hard-wired to facilitate. That's why the memory is important for an elephant, to remember where water holes are or where forage is going to occur this time of year a hundred miles away. brain is put together that way, and that's why I referred to these neurons that stretch from one side to the other.

THE COURT: So the saying having a memory like an elephant is not just a gratuitous saying?

THE WITNESS: No, it's not. You hear that and it's actually true.

1 THE COURT: What is the origin of that?

2.2.

THE WITNESS: I think, you know, there have been a lot of field studies on elephants over the time, people have written books, and they've talked about they remember something, they remember something that happened 20 years ago, and I gave the example of a female matriarch who 35 years ago could remember where she was as a youngster, where you could take your family to and survive when the park dried up. So when that happened, she was still with that — she could lead that group to that spot 35 years later. And the other animals who didn't have that kind of a matriarch that old, they suffered in that park, they didn't know where to go.

So that's the memory, and that's a very convincing — they remember social things too. They remember yearning of their mother decades later. They have amazing memory.

THE COURT: Go ahead. I don't want to monopolize --

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Your Honor, I'm happy to defer. BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

- Q. You just referred to the social memories. Does that have anything to do with your opinion about the effect of keeping the elephants chained for a long period of time in the railroad cars?
- A. Just like elephants are -- their biology is to move

around to forage, be active, they also are very — they are put together to respond socially. They are very social animals. And they have family groups and they can communicate and they recognize the dialects of their own family members, and they can — even if it's degraded they can figure that out out of hundreds of others, they can figure out which one is their family or that individual. So their brain facilitates the social interactions, and they have an affinity to be with a group of course, the females especially.

2.2.

So I was saying, if you don't mind, I'll just —
there are some — one could look for a marker of the
adversity. One would be abnormal behaviors. And stereotypic
behavior is an abnormal behavior, it's kind of doing something
over and over again, repetitive. In elephants it's weaving,
it's head tossing or trunk waving. And so you can measure
that, you can put video cameras up there and measure that.

As it turns out, one of the studies that I remember that's dealt with this in railroad cars shows that elephants that just go on the car for a relatively short period of time, say an hour, up to three hours, they make the movements, that abnormal movements. You know, sometimes it's zero, sometimes it may reach up to 30 percent of the time.

But if you keep them on for say seven hours or longer, and of course that's going to be more — the longer they are there, the more adverse it becomes. Then the

stereotypic behavior sort of plateaus out and reaches a max, and there you are, 50 percent of the time. 50 percent of the time in these boxcars, if you're there for long enough periods of time, eight hours or more, you are weaving back and forth. And that's on average, looking at the work on five elephants, that is the average, 50 percent of the time, moving. And just maxes out. You keep them on for 36 hours, whatever, it maxes at 50 percent. To me that is a strong marker of the adversity.

2.2.

- Q. Dr. Hart, just one last point on the information that is before you. We just used 37 hours, if I'm not mistaken, as an example. You said above seven hours was your view. Are many of these numbers that are just taken from this chart over seven hours?
- A. As I look at them I don't think there is anything less than seven hours. The nine hour one, but you know, no, those are long.
- Q. In your view those are the kinds of long trips you're talking about?
 - A. These are very long trips, yeah.
- Q. Could we go to Plaintiffs' Will Call Exhibit 143. And we're talking here about the 4 hour, 46 minute mark, and we'll go through the 4 hour, 48 minute mark. And this, Your Honor, again is the video inspection from the Auburn Hills inspection that has already been admitted as an exhibit.

1 (Video played). 2 And Dr. Hart, if you can tell me if that video 3 looks familiar to you? 4 That's right, this was taken at Auburn Hills, yes, 5 right. 6 Does that have anything to do with the kind of behavior 7 that you were just describing? 8 Well, look at the elephant over here on the left. Α. 9 Do you know which elephant that is? Ο. 10 Α. I believe it's Karen. Just back and forth. 11 Your Honor, can I back up one moment. Q. 12 mistake. Can you hold that for a second. I had thought that 13 that one was admitted. It was the other inspection video that 14 we talked about. This one has not yet -- this is 143. I 15 assume the same principle would apply. I don't believe 16 there's an objection to the official inspection video coming 17 in. 18 THE COURT: Any objection? 19 MR. SHEA: No, we have no objection as long as we 20 know what parts we're referring to, counsel is referring to in his direct. 21 2.2. Fine. THE COURT: 23 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Once again, 4 hours, 46 minute 24 mark, through 4 hours, 48 minutes.

THE COURT: Okay.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

Q. We can resume the video.

(Video played).

I'm sorry, Dr. Hart, to have interrupted. Car you proceed with your --

- A. I'm just saying the one you see here on the left side is back and forth, back and forth. She's got some hay here, but she just keeps doing it.
 - Q. Why would you describe that as stereotypical behavior?
- A. Well, in the literature that is described as stereotypic behavior, back and forth, back and forth, functionless, repetitive, has no function. I mean, that each species of animal has stereotypic behavior, kind of has their own pattern. In elephants it's been seen over and over again, they sway back and forth, they swing their trunks back and forth, and they head bob. Those are what they record when they are looking at recording stereotypic behavior.

THE COURT: How do I know that's not an indicator that the elephant is happy that she's eating hay or playing with hay? Is the elephant ingesting that hay?

THE WITNESS: If they, the elephants — we were watching the elephants for about two hours, and this one has hay in it, but after the hay was finished or she had eaten all she wants, then she's still doing it. She was just doing it continuously.

THE COURT: How do I know she's not doing it because she's happy with that hay?

THE WITNESS: Because this is --

THE COURT: Better still, how do you know she's not doing it because she's happy?

THE WITNESS: Sure. Right. There's no indication that she's happy with the hay, because when the hay is gone, she is still doing it. As a matter of fact, the hay is a bit of a distractor. And if you look at — you have to look at this in the context of these movements in general, the reports of the animals in a picket line, they do this, they do this a lot. The elephants in the railroad cars, they are doing this. And the elephants in different contexts.

So it's not just being fed some hay. I mean if you are showing — if you have been in this situation year after year after year, and it's adversive, and you engage in this, how do you deal with it? Okay, maybe I'm just going to sway, I'll sway, it's all I can do. Then you're fed some hay, of course you're going to eat. And so you're going to see this mixed in. When the hay is gone, you're swaying back and forth again.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

Q. Dr. Hart, in your -- I think you mentioned earlier in response to testimony that you hadn't seen this type of stereotypical behavior when doing your studies. Is that a

correct statement about what you said?

2.2.

A. We're referring to studies in Asia, we have not seen — all the hours we spend watching elephants in wild, we haven't seen it. The elephants that were in captivity there that had what is in the literature referred to as kind of a seminatural captivity. They were allowed to walk around at night, or taken out during the day and had long — when they were chained, it was a long chain, 8-foot chain. I did not see stereotypic behavior in those animals.

THE COURT: Is this the type of behavior that you would observe in a zoo setting as opposed to a circus?

THE WITNESS: I think some zoos you could see this too. There are zoos where you would not, generally, but there are zoos where there is confinement and you will -- you can see this. I haven't done a survey, but I certainly have talked to colleagues, and it's one of the pressures behind zoos, to change their management from small pens to more open space.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

- Q. So I understand, when you said confinement, did you mean chaining in a small space?
- A. I mean chaining here, yes.
 - Q. And are you aware of any research that would support the opinions you just offered to the Judge?
- 25 A. Well, I certainly would -- there's two kinds of

studies, if you will. One is just to look at when animals are chained, the elephants are chained, how often, how much time they spend on average with this weaving back and forth or the head bobbing. And a number of studies have shown that it averages between 20 to 50 percent of the time, they do that. As they are chained, that is what they do, the average over long periods of time, and repeatedly on the same animal.

2.2.

And then there are studies that show but when you've got animals in large pens, a different place, different location, but they are elephants nonetheless, Asian elephants, they engage in relatively little stereotypic behavior.

Generally the smaller the pen, the more they do it, but it's never as much as when they are chained, with this moving one foot forward and one foot backwards. Those are comparisons of animals in situation A or situation B.

Now, there are some studies showing the same elephants taken from a chain, tethering, to putting into a pen, and then compare the rate of these movements. And the studies that I've referred to in my report show a reduction in average stereotypic movement, marked reduction going from the pen condition — or the chained condition to the pen. When you go to the pen, there's less, not zero, it's not like a big place.

There is one place it pretty much goes to zero, and that is at Zoo Atlanta, where they have a large outdoor

arena, and they bring them in at night, and they see relatively — in one study no stereotypic behavior even at night, and the other one is like 3 percent when the animals are first brought into the barn. But it's nothing compared to these.

So then in zoos you're going to find, in my opinion and recollection, you're going to find a variety of prevalence of this behavior.

- Q. Just so I understand, the prevalence that you suggested relates to the amount of chaining?
- A. That's right. Prevalence of a stereotypic behavior.

 And in zoos, if they are chained like this, it's going to be more frequent than if they are free ranging.
 - Q. If I heard you correctly before, you referred to research specifically on the elephants on the train for the circus.
- 17 A. That's right.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

21

2.2.

- 18 Q. Which study were you referring to?
- A. On one that is by the authors are Williams and Friend, 2003, I believe.
 - Q. If we can call up your Deposition Number 14 and ask you if this is the study you're referring to?
- 23 A. That's right.
- Q. And why is it that you say that this study supports what you just suggested?

A. Well, I alluded to, just imagine an elephant with that high degree of brain development, intellectual development, or mental, higher nervous function if you will instead, being put in that condition. And it just seems like it's natural assumption that it's going to be very aversive. But what is a marker? A marker is a stereotypic movement. How do you find a study that measures that. And it turns out these authors did measure it in a circus that was moving from one place to another in various periods of time. And so they are reporting the frequency of stereotypic movement, and it's a marker of abnormal behaviors.

2.2.

- Q. And what did it say about the frequency of those kinds of behaviors with relationship to the amount of time on the train?
- A. What this study shows is that if an animal or elephant is put in and it's relatively short, maybe, from what we can read from the data, three hours or something like that, they may have no stereotypic behavior, or maybe 30 percent, but relatively little. And then if they are in that train for a longer period of time, then it goes up to well, this study it goes up to 88 percent of the time, but if you look on the average, it's 50 percent of the time across the board for elephants. And they had five elephants that they looked at. Every elephant engaged in stereotypic behavior, from the 30 percent to the above 50 percent, around 70 percent, when

put on for a long period of time.

2.2.

- Q. By long period of time, can you give the Judge at least some thumbnail sketch of what you're referring to?
 - A. A long period of time is anything over seven hours.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: And Your Honor, I would move the admission of this study as an exhibit. I anticipate an objection, which we can get, and then I can explain to you why I think it makes sense under the circumstances.

THE COURT: Tell me why it makes sense first.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Let me tell you that.

Anticipating Mr. Shea's objection. As he suggested earlier, it is the case that ordinarily, and certainly in jury trials, you would not allow scientific publications to be admitted into evidence, because you don't want jurors reading them and drawing their own conclusions.

THE COURT: So why should judges read them?

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Because judges I think — two
reasons. One, there's a relatively small number of studies
that both parties are going to be talking about. Certainly
the experts everybody agrees can opine upon them and what they
mean. Your Honor, I am fully confident that Your Honor can
read them, these particular studies. We're not —

THE COURT: I assure you I can read them.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Not just read them, Your Honor, but actually fully understand them.

1 THE COURT: Does this article focus on the studies 2 that both sides will be talking about? 3 They do, Your Honor. And it MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 4 just seems to us to make an enormous amount of sense in a 5 These are published peer reviewed studies for bench trial. 6 the most part. Actually I'm not sure exactly what the status 7 of this one, but this is actually coauthored by one of 8 defendant's expert witnesses. You're going to hear a lot 9 about these particular studies. 10 THE COURT: That expert witness is going to talk 11 about this study as well? 12 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: He is. 13 THE COURT: What is the objection, counsel? Why 14 not let it in for whatever weight? 15 MR. SHEA: Number 1, Dr. Hart didn't write it. 16 didn't conduct the research. 17 THE COURT: Your expert --18 It's frank hearsay, and the rules MR. SHEA: 19 clearly state that learned treatises don't come in in paper. 20 They can be read in, you can hear -- the Court can hear his 21 opinions, as they can Dr. Friend's when we bring him to court. 2.2. THE COURT: He's one of your experts, the coauthor 23 of this? 24 MR. SHEA: Yes. 25 THE COURT: I assume he's going to talk about his

1 studies as well? 2 We would have him talk about his MR. SHEA: 3 studies, certainly. THE COURT: You don't want me to read his treatise 4 5 that he coauthored? 6 MR. SHEA: Your Honor, I'm more concerned with 7 setting a precedent of letting these in over hearsay in the 8 trial, because of all of the long list of science articles that plaintiffs tendered to us on their 72-hour notice for 9 10 this witness, the next, and I assume the next witness as well. 11 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Quickly, Your Honor, for 12 clarification, we're not invoking the learned treatise 13 exception for this. We don't think it's a learned treatise. 14 Rather we're simply relying on the general exception to the 15 hearsay rule, the residual exception. 16 And in terms of making precedent, there in fact is 17 precedent within this court, Richardson versus 18 Richardson-Merrell, Inc., 649 F.Supp. 799, 802, Footnote 9, 19 noting that a judgment affirmed by the D.C. Circuit, 857 F.2d 20 823 --21 I'm sorry, what's the citation? THE COURT: 2.2. I apologize, Your Honor. MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 23 Richardson v. Richardson-Merrell, M-E-R-R-E-L-L, Inc. 649 24 F.Supp. 799 at 802, Footnote 9, District of D.C. 1986.

Judgment affirmed on other grounds, 857 F.2d 823, D.C. Circuit

1 1988.

2.2.

THE COURT: So that was not an issue on appeal?

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: That was not an issue on appeal.

What I was simply citing it for is the court did note,

apparently without addressing the issue, that the District

Court had admitted studies which appeared in peer reviewed

professional journals, under the residual exception to the

hearsay rule. I don't believe that was a bench trial, but I'm

not positive about that.

And then another citation is Dolcin Corp. versus Federal Trade Commission, 219 F.2d 742 at 748. And unfortunately — we can get this to you later — I don't have the court that that was from. I think D.C. Circuit, but I'm not positive about that. We're not sure. That's left off my notes.

I think in a bench trial with a discrete number of publications, we're not going to try to besiege the Court with this kind of material. And I'm happy to proceed whatever way they want to, but frankly —

THE COURT: I will provisionally allow it. If I rely upon it I'll tell the parties the reasons why I'm relying upon it. I didn't get the citation for the appellate decision at page 823 that recognizes an affirmance for other reasons. It was something F.2d 823. What is the --

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: What's the page citation?

1 THE COURT: No, the volume.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 857 F.2d 823.

THE COURT: Over objection I'll allow it provisionally. If I rely upon it, I'll tell everyone the reasons why I relied upon it. But the objection is noted. Let's proceed.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Thank you, Your Honor. So I think we're up to Plaintiffs' Will Call Exhibit 156, is what this would be.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

- Q. Dr. Hart, in addition to that study are there any others that you found particularly informative on the topic we've been discussing?
- A. That are informative. Well, not with railroad cars, but with the penning versus the on a chain, the two conditions. There are other studies there that have some data on this kind of behavior that we've been talking about.
 - O. What would that be?
- A. Well, there's a Friend and Parker study, and then there's a Gruber, et al. that compared animals that were elephants that were penned that were chained, and then they were put into pens, and they could look at their behavior under the two conditions.
- Q. If we can take a look at Deposition Exhibit 13 from your deposition, and ask you if that's the Gruber, et al.

study you're referring to?

- A. That's true.
- Q. Is Dr. Friend a coauthor of that study as well?
- A. He is.

2.2.

- Q. And why is it that you say that this study supports your view about stereotypic behavior?
- A. Okay. This paper by the way focuses on stereotypic behavior. It's in the title. They acknowledge that it's a concern on welfare and acknowledge that it's an important issue. And they looked at the same group of elephants that were on chains, and then they were allowed into pens. So they did they have individual data on the individual elephants and they've got the average data across the board for the elephants.

And if you look at the -- you know, the best scientific way of looking at the data is if you take the average for the elephants in that circumstance, and then the same elephants in the pen, you look at the reduction in the average amount of stereotypic behavior. And there is a substantial reduction. I don't recall exactly what it is on this one, but let's say it's about 30 percent of the time -- one of these has a much higher level than the other one -- anywhere between 30 and 50 percent of the time while they are chained they are doing this back and forth, back and forth kind of all the time. And --

THE COURT: You have to describe it. I mean I saw you swaying.

THE WITNESS: I'm sorry, the stereotypic behavior. Thank you.

THE COURT: That was a swaying motion.

THE WITNESS: Swaying back and forth, swaying the trunk back and forth, head bobbing, the types of stereotypic behavior, that goes from anywhere between like 27 to 50 percent to down to less than half of that when they are penned. So there is a marked reduction. Not an elimination, because I don't think that small pens are that good either, but it's going from bad to not as bad.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

Q. If you can take a look at the bottom of the first page of that study, Dr. Hart, the last sentence leading over to the next reads: As a result of chaining, species-typical behavior, such as foraging for food, social interactions, play behavior and locomotion, are greatly restricted. This inability to perform species-typical behaviors may contribute to the development of stereotypies in elephants.

Did I read that correctly?

- A. Yes, that's read correctly.
- Q. Does that comport with your own view?
- A. Well, I mean, let's take it. Elephants cannot exhibit anything like natural species-specific behavior while they are

chained up. They can move one foot forward and one foot backwards. There's nothing that's in their natural behavior repertoire. So that's what they're referring to.

THE COURT: Wouldn't that be true for any animal chained?

THE WITNESS: I believe it would be, but if you —
if I could add a little bit. If you took, let's say a tiger
or a lion, that hunts and gets their food and then they maybe
sleep for as long as a day — we've seen that in Africa, their
bellies are full and they just lie around and sleep the rest
of the day — if you were to take an animal in the zoo like
that, feed it very well and it lies around, you'd say well,
that's not going to be as interruptive of their natural
behavior as it is an elephant, an animal that spends all day
moving around, moving around.

THE COURT: Looking for food.

THE WITNESS: Foraging for food, right.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

- Q. How about if a dog were chained front leg and back leg for 36 hours? Do you think that would be adversive to a dog?
- A. I think it certainly would. Everything I know about dogs, it would be very adversive.
 - Q. Based upon your review of literature, et cetera, that sentence that I just read about the relationship between chaining and inability to perform species-typical behaviors

for elephants, do you have an opinion about whether that is a widely held view in the animal behavior community?

A. I think it's a very widely held view. You see it in these papers that focus on stereotypic behavior, it's often mentioned in an introduction, and among behaviorists in general at work in this field, it's considered to be a primary, not the only, but the primary, one of the primary factors that evokes or leads to stereotypic behavior.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: For the same reasons we just went through, I would move the admission of this study also as an exhibit.

MR. SHEA: Same objection.

THE COURT: Over objection, I'll admit it.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I think this is Plaintiffs' Will Call Exhibit 157 then.

THE COURT: All right.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

- Q. Dr. Hart, any other studies that you think are particularly pertinent?
- A. One in the same group of animals, I think by Friend and Parker, basically found the same basically found the same picture.
- Q. If we can take a look at what was your deposition Exhibit 12, Exhibit 158. Is this the article you were referring to?

- A. That's the one, right.
 - Q. This is also coauthored by Dr. Friend?
- $3 \quad \blacksquare \quad A. \quad True.$

2.2.

- Q. Is there any significance to the fact that he's the first person listed?
- A. I don't think it's particularly significant whether he's first or second. It depends on if they were a graduate student or some colleague. Academicians have different ways. Sometimes the most important person's name is last, sometimes it's first. It depends on and I don't know the circumstances here.
- Q. And again, why does this study support the opinion you've offered?
- A. Well, this is again you look at the title, stereotypic behavior, they are concerned about stereotypic behavior or they would not have done the study. And it's penning versus picketing. And again, if you looked at the data, you'd find, if you look at the animals as a group, when they are picketed, can move just this little bit, they engage in much more of this abnormal stereotypic behavior than they do when they are, same animals, are allowed into a pen. And it doesn't disappear, as I mentioned, in a pen, it just goes down, because I don't think pens are it's not like an open field, but it's not as bad as being penned up. At least they can interact with other elephants and move around a bit.

1 Q. Any other studies --

2.

2.2.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Your Honor, just to complete the record, if we can move the admission of this exhibit on the same rationale as the other one.

THE COURT: Same ruling, over objection.

MR. SHEA: Objection.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Which would be Plaintiffs' Will Call Exhibit 158.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

- Q. Before we move on, any other studies?
- A. Well, there is a relevant paper by Schmid. It's done in another country. And I don't know if you want to pull that one up, but it's basically saying the same thing. They actually found a little bit more stereotypic behavior when animals were when they were chained versus when they are in a pen. The pens were larger in this case, by the way.
- Q. And if we can take a look at page 87 of that publication, which I believe is near the beginning of the article. And take a look at the last sentence of the first full paragraph under Introduction, there is a statement that says: Stereotypies, also called weaving, are connected with unsuitable keeping systems.

Do you see that statement?

- A. I do.
- 25 Q. Is that a statement that you agree with?

MR. SHEA: Objection, leading. This line is 1 2 leading. 3 THE COURT: It was leading. Sustained. 4 BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 5 Do you have any opinion about that statement? 6 MR. SHEA: It's still leading. 7 THE COURT: If he has an opinion he can render it. 8 What is it? 9 THE WITNESS: They're making a -- this is in the 10 introduction, it's the authors' opinion who are studying this. 11 This is their opinion, that they are connected with 12 unsuitable --13 THE COURT: This is --14 THE WITNESS: -- keeping conditions. 15 THE COURT: -- the authors' opinion. All right. 16 THE WITNESS: And I agree. 17 THE COURT: Why? 18 BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 19 Why do you agree with that? 0. 20 Why do I agree? Because I think they are connected 21 with not allowing the animal to engage in its natural 2.2. behaviors. That is the most severe thing. They cannot 23 interact with other elephants, they cannot walk about for 24 food, which their whole biology is geared up for walking 25 about. They're highly social, they cannot interact and choose who they interact with. They don't show comfort behavior with other animals in the group. So it's a very severe disruption of their normal behaviors, and I think that's -- it's unsuitable conditions. THE COURT: All right. But then that would apply

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

24

25

to any animal in captivity, it would be unsuitable in your opinion then, correct?

THE WITNESS: Not really. In the sense that if you have a -- if you have an elephant in a large arena or large place and moves around, can -- it's not like in the wild, but they can move around some, and they can maybe --

THE COURT: Let's limit it to circuses. That would be unsuitable in your opinion then, keeping any animal in a circus?

THE WITNESS: Well, I think that would be -- I don't think I'd go along with that.

THE COURT: How about elephants?

THE WITNESS: Keeping any elephants -- if you didn't have to -- you'd have to -- I quess --

THE COURT: If I understood you correctly, you just told me that limiting its movement, its ability to interact, its ability to socialize is unsuitable. And my question is then, it must be your opinion that an elephant in a circus setting under those conditions is an unsuitable environment, is in an unsuitable keeping system, is that right?

1 THE WITNESS: I'd like to qualify my answer there. 2 THE COURT: Give me an answer. Am I correct or 3 not? If I'm not --THE WITNESS: I think you're incorrect in my 4 5 assumption. 6 THE COURT: Am I correct? 7 THE WITNESS: No, I don't think you are expressing 8 my feelings. 9 THE COURT: What is your opinion? 10 THE WITNESS: Okay. All right. If you are going 11 to haul elephants in these cars from one circus setting to 12 another, and it's going to be on average 24 hours, I think 13 that's unsuitable, and keeping them on pickets for 8, 10 hours 14 a day. However, if you had a circus that was in a location 15 and there was a large arena out there, and the animals were 16 moving, they could get some water, they could play with water, 17 they could interact a little bit, and then you bring them in 18 to perform and lead them in, I think that would be a perfectly 19 good show, as long as you weren't expecting them to do things 20 that were maybe painful to do in the circus. But you could 21 have them --2.2. THE COURT: Limit it to Ringling Brothers and the 23 type of confinement that elephants are subjected to there. Unsuitable keeping system there? 24

THE WITNESS: Well, I'm not in a position to say

1 what would be manageable for them. I can tell you what I 2 think is not appropriate. And if they can put together 3 something where the animals are not penned or not on a picket 4 line for that period of time --THE COURT: I'm talking about as it exists now. 5 6 THE WITNESS: As it exists now? 7 THE COURT: Yeah. 8 THE WITNESS: All right. As it exists now, the way they are doing it right now, from what I've seen -- now I 9 10 haven't seen all their circuses and I haven't seen what else 11 they can do, but --12 THE COURT: Based on what you've seen --THE WITNESS: Based on what I've seen. 13 14 THE COURT: -- is it an unsuitable keeping system? 15 THE WITNESS: This is unsuitable condition for 16 these elephants the way I see it happening. 17 THE COURT: All right. 18 BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 19 Just to summarize, why is it you have that opinion? 0. 20 Because from what -- again the point of reference is 21 can animals engage in any kind of naturalistic behavior when 2.2. they are in this picket line for all the time, or in a very, 23 very little, small pen, then that's -- they are not allowed to 24 engage in that naturalistic behavior. And to the -- it is

reflected in their high degree of abnormal stereotypic

behavior, then I think that is unsuitable. That is -- it's
that's harming the elephants.

And does your answer to Judge Sullivan's question

relate to the amount of time they are spending in those conditions?

2.2.

A. Well, it does relate to the amount of time. I mean, anytime you're going to give some care to elephants, you're going to have veterinary care, examination, you'll have to chain them up. And you may chain them for an hour or maybe two hours. That is a different story than this long periods of time.

THE COURT: Then correct me if I'm wrong, but is it your opinion that keeping elephants under conditions that Ringling Brothers keeps elephants is indeed an unsuitable keeping system?

THE WITNESS: For the ones I'm familiar with, for example, at that site visit --

THE COURT: You would be opposed to keeping them in captivity under those circumstances?

THE WITNESS: Keeping them, not in captivity but for that kind of performance venue where they are not allowed to engage in their naturalistic behavior.

THE COURT: Well, they are in captivity then.

THE WITNESS: They're in captivity, but there are elephants in captivity that move around and they don't show

these --

2.2.

THE COURT: I'm focusing on Ringling Brothers and the circumstances in which they are kept in captivity. That is unsuitable then, correct?

THE WITNESS: From what I've seen, my familiarity with that, yes, sir.

THE COURT: And then as an expert you're opposed to keeping those elephants in captivity under those circumstances?

THE WITNESS: Under these circumstances here, those elephants.

THE COURT: All right. How much more time? I'm not trying to curtail you, but if we're going to 5:30, maybe we should take an afternoon recess.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I probably have no more than five or 10 minutes.

THE COURT: All right. Why don't you go ahead and finish your direct.

19 BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

- Q. Just so we're clear about your answer on captivity, based upon what you've seen or read, are there other elephants in captive situations where you would not have those concerns?
- A. Oh, certainly, there's other captive situations where I would not have those concerns.
 - Q. For example?

A. Well, for example, in situations where they have freedom to move about. Maybe even just during the night moving around, where you let them go loose at night, or in a large arena and then you bring them in. That kind of arrangement. And there are a number of zoological settings where the elephants are given a lot of space. That is captivity. I haven't given thought to how you could have performing circus animals where they wouldn't have this degree of abnormality, and one thing that occurs to me is they are —at nighttime they could have a big open area so they are not confined that much.

THE COURT: Maybe a stationary circus. Maybe a stationary circus somewhere.

THE WITNESS: Exactly.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

- Q. Dr. Hart, does your research on fly bites and switching behavior indicate anything to you at all about the sensitivity of elephants' skin?
- A. Well, it influences my opinion about the sensitivity of elephant skin in the sense that you know, the term pachyderm means thick skin, and you'd think well, maybe it's not that sensitive. But in fact when we were doing this work on fly switching, we could tell when there are flies alighting on an elephant and taking a blood meal, that is why they have this fly switch, getting these flies away.

THE COURT: Does that depend on the type of fly that is alighting and biting?

THE WITNESS: I think it does depend on the type of fly, and these are — entomologists refer to them as tabanids, for example, they are big horse flies. And they've got — I've been bit by horse flies. And they hurt. And so it's — elephants, they switch these off. If you can swat one with your hand you'll have a palm full of blood, because they take a lot of blood. And these elephants undoubtedly feel it, because that's what they are fly switching for, so it does show that these parts of the body are sensitive.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

- Q. Do you have an opinion about whether an elephant hit with a bull hook would remember that even years after the fact?
- A. If an elephant was hit with a bull hook, and assuming it was painful, adversive, they would certainly probably —

 I've been saying and know about elephant memory, they would remember that. And if they had been hit several times and reinforces that memory, certainly they would remember that bull hook.
- MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I have nothing further, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: All right. We'll take a 15-minute recess. How much time do you need? Can you finish your

1 cross-examination this afternoon, do you think? 2 I would hope to, Your Honor. MR. SHEA: 3 THE COURT: Thank you, Doctor. You don't have to 4 stand. You can take a recess for 15 minutes. You should not 5 discuss your testimony with anyone. 6 THE WITNESS: Okay. 7 BRIEF RECESS 8 AFTER RECESS 9 THE COURT: Counsel. 10 MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Your Honor, I had neglected to 11 move our last exhibit into evidence, which was that Schmid 12 study. So, for the same rationale we would just move that 13 one --THE COURT: Same ruling, same objection. 14 15 admitted. 16 158. 159, Your Honor. MR. GLITZENSTEIN: 17 THE COURT: Let me do this, also. Let me encourage 18 the time keepers to talk among themselves and see where they 19 are, see if they're on the same clock. Let me know if there's 20 any problem with that. My guess is you're fairly accurate. I 21 don't need to jump in unless there's a conflict. 2.2. MR. SIMPSON: We're pretty close. They think we've used less time than we do. I think we've got the better view 23 24 on that.

THE COURT: You're pretty close. Let's just see --

that's good. I have no doubt about that. I know there are time keepers on both sides and we're keeping time. I'd just as soon stay out of it unless I need to jump in. All right.

There's enough to jump in here.

MR. SHEA: If it please the Court.

THE COURT: Yes. What I'm talking about, they're keeping time for each side -- all right, you know.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. SHEA:

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

16

17

18

19

20

- Q. Dr. Hart, during your Direct Examination you discussed the Schmid, SCHMID study from 1995 with counsel, did you not?
- 12 **A.** Yes.
- Q. That counsel or I'm sorry, that study does not prove that chaining elephants causes stereotypic behavior in them, does it?
 - A. Well, I'm not sure what you mean by causes it, could you explain?
 - Q. Dr. Hart, in my deposition with you we discussed the Schmid, the Brockett and the Wilson studies?
 - A. Right.
 - Q. Regarding stereotypic behavior, correct?
- 22 A. That's right.
- Q. And that's because you cited them in your report, didn't you?
- 25 A. Yes, I did.

- Q. And you also cited several studies by Dr. Friend that you discussed today, correct?
 - A. That's true.

2.2.

- Q. And as to Brockett, Wilson and Schmid articles, those studies do not prove that chaining causes stereotypic behavior, correct?
- A. Those studies were not intended to prove that the chaining causes it because the Brockett and the Wilson one, they're looking at elephants in pens. Their intention is to show you can manage elephants in pens, and they don't they aren't aggressive, they aren't there's no problems that arise, so, they are showing the advantage of doing that.
- Q. I see. But then they don't prove that chaining causes stereotypic behavior in elephants?
 - A. They didn't set out to do that, no.
- Q. Dr. Hart, in your opinion there is some threshold of chaining that causes stereotypic behavior, correct?
- A. I would say there is the studies point to a threshold being I don't know of any studies that address, say, being on a chain for just an hour, you know, once a day, if you're going to see stereotypic behavior then. But the fact that you see it when they're chained for a long period of time and then they're taken off suggests that it's aversive. But the studies do not correlate per se intentionally looking at the period of time chained versus the degree of stereotypic

- behavior. And if they vary in the period of time, again, I would refer to my comments about in the railroad cars, you know, once you reach a certain point you kind of max out on your stereotypic behavior.
 - Q. Dr. Hart, if I understood your answer correctly, then you believe there is some threshold of chaining that causes stereotypic behavior in elephants, is that right?
 - A. Well, I believe that you could argue that there's a threshold. Where that threshold is going to be, I can't at the moment tell you. I can tell you for the railroad cars because we've got some data that kind of addressed that.
- Q. And you're referring to Dr. Friend's study in 2003, Williams and Friend, is that correct?
 - A. Yes, I was.

2.2.

- Q. Well, in your opinion, if an elephant is chained over that threshold, it doesn't matter whether the elephant was chained longer than that period of time, correct?
- A. Well, I think it matters to the elephant. You're going to max out on the abnormal behavior to the observer. If you're going to be chained for I'm just going to give you a figure now, eight hours, or are you going to be chained for 15 hours. My opinion is that they would max out on that abnormal stereotypic behavior. So, you're not going to see more at 24 than at eight or at 12 hours than eight.

But if you were to look at a half hour of

- chaining and that's it, then my opinion is that you could very
 well see relatively little. But those studies have not
 addressed that particular issue.
 - Q. So, Dr. Hart, if I understood it correctly, the length of time threshold that you're alluding to, there's no science to select or to state how long that threshold is, correct?
 - A. To give you that threshold, I would say there isn't, but the studies all assume that you're going to they're looking at chaining the way it's customarily done, which is for eight hours or nine hours or whatever. So, they're not looking at trying to find out what that threshold is. So, the studies don't have that context to look at a threshold.
 - Q. Dr. Hart, do you recall mentioning to me or telling me in deposition that it could be 12 hours?
 - A. That the chaining that the threshold could be 12 hours?
- 17 | Q. Yes.

2.2.

A. If I recall, we were referring to a study where it went from 12 to something else, and that at 12 there wasn't that much difference between 12 and maybe more than that, 16, or whatever, I don't recall the figures. And I said, well, if I recall, I said something like, you know, they would probably max out at about 12. That could be — you could call that the threshold, but I was saying they max out, I don't think I referred to that as a threshold.

But once you reach that level you're going to -it doesn't matter whether it's 12 or longer. But I wasn't -there's no data to address: What if it's only one hour.?

- Q. Dr. Hart, did I just understand you to say that you did not tell me there was a threshold at deposition?
- A. I probably used that term, I'm just telling you right now the way in which I would the way the conversation as it's going right now using threshold, I probably I could well have used that in that discussion because that was the minimum period of time, if I recall in the study that we're talking about, that was reflected in those data. So, 12 would certainly be the threshold, and the threshold may be less than that. But in this case you'd have to say that 12 is at least a threshold.
- Q. Dr. Hart, regarding 12 being the threshold, are there any studies that establish 12 hours to be the threshold that we've been discussing?
 - A. Not that I'm aware of.
- Q. Dr. Hart, you mentioned or discussed stereotypic behavior with counsel during your Direct Examination today, correct?
- A. That's right.

2.2.

- Q. Stereotypic behavior can be habit-like and persist even when welfare conditions have improved, correct?
- 25 A. Well, you're referring to some studies that are looking

- at stereotypic behavior, if I recall, in animals in general,
 not particularly elephants. They're speaking about
 stereotypic behavior in a variety of animals. In a variety of
 animals sometimes they've got it even in -- what looks like
- fairly good conditions. So, that's what the authors are
- 6 saying, and so I take their word for it that the confinement
- 7 isn't the end all and be all, but it's a very important 8 aspect.
- 9 Q. Do you recall what article you're speaking of there?
- 10 A. Well, if I recall our conversation, it was Mason the
 11 Mason paper.
- 12 Q. Was it Mason and Latham?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. And you cited that article in your report, correct?
- 15 A. I do.
- Q. And, Doctor, the authors well, strike that. Let me
- start again. I'll just ask you, stereotypic behaviors are likely be unreliable indicators of the current state of
- 19 | welfare, isn't that true?
- 20 A. You're asking me if I believe that or if they said that?
- Q. I'm asking you if those authors in Mason and Latham said that?
- 24 A. Well, I'd have to see if that's the exact wording.
- Q. Let's see if I can refresh your recollection because we

discussed this. Page 193 of your deposition on Line 14. I asked — and if you'd follow along, please. Question: If you'd like at Page S-64 of Mason and Latham with me, please, and you could look down the second column against the right margin, you'll see the word — well, you'll see the sentence beginning "In addition" stereotypies that had become centrally controlled (habit-like) or that arise from autistic-like changes in the control of all behavior (preservation) are likely to be unreliable indicators of current state because they can be elicited by other circumstances that improve welfare. Then I asked, did I did read that correctly?

And you answered: That's right. That, in my sense, addresses what I just said, that's one that seems to occur whatever the habitat. So, autistic-like is the give away. There are some instances where this seems to be an ongoing abnormality, perhaps putting words in their mouth, going back to the animals' experience as a young animal.

Did I read that correctly?

A. Yes, you did.

2.2.

- Q. Dr. Hart, now, in your opinion well, strike that. Dr. Hart, you discussed ecotourism trips where you had seen captive elephants in home range countries with your counsel earlier today, correct?
 - A. Say that again, please.
 - Q. Certainly. You discussed earlier today taking

- ecotourism trips to home range countries where you observed captive elephants, correct?
 - A. I don't know if I would refer to our trip as ecotourism, but we were visiting, for one reason or another, where animals were kept in captivity. For example, in one area I was asked by a colleague that was studying tourist effects on rhino, to look in on the study and offer what advice I could. So, that's where we saw elephants using these fly switches for the first time.
 - Q. So, Doctor, have you seen tourists riding elephants in home range countries?
 - A. I've seen tourists writing on a haute in Nepal and India, yes.
 - Q. And the haute is a large wooden platform, is that right?
- 16 A. That's right.

- 17 Q. The platform is put on the elephant's back and strapped under her belly, is that true?
- 19 A. That's true.
 - Q. And what kind of trips did you see this activity during?
- A. Well, in Nepal. On our first visit, I referred to -- I
 went to a colleague's study site, and our work subsequently at
 the same study site and another one in Nepal. We've seen them
 in India where -- this is why -- the reason -- this is the

- reason the elephants are in captivity there, because they're used to take tourists on a little walk twice a day.
 - Q. And that activity is referred to as ecotourism, is it not?
 - A. Some people would, I don't want to be restricted to that term, ecotourism. I'm not sure if you ask these tourists if they were ecotourists or just tourists, I don't know.
 - Q. Dr. Hart, now, the tourists sit on top of that large wooden platform, is that right?
 - A. That's right.
- 11 Q. And the mahout sits on top of that as well, the elephant guide?
- 13 A. No.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

19

20

- 14 Q. They do not?
- 15 A. The mahout sits behind the elephant's head, their feet
 16 are usually behind the ears, that's how they guide the
 17 elephant and get the elephant stopped, go forward with their
 18 feet.
 - Q. Now, elephants in home range countries are kept in stables and chained, are they not?
 - A. The elephants in their what?
- 22 Q. In home range countries?
- A. Home range? You mean elephants in India that are used to take tourists on rides?
- Q. Well, let's start with those. Those are kept on chains

in stables, correct?

2.

2.2.

A. For part of the day. They are kept on a nine foot, let's say, nine or ten foot chain, connected to a stake. The elephant is usually in a circle. They're brought food during the day. And they are either, as I said, they are saddled up, if you will, to take the tourists on a ride in the morning and the evening. At one location they are taking out in the day for five or six hours and allowed to forage, move around, they've got a mahout on their back. The mahout gathers branches for the evening meal and the elephant moves around and has some freedom. In another situation the elephants are allowed to go into the forest at night.

THE COURT: So, the person who sits — the guide, I'm sorry, what's the name of the guide?

THE WITNESS: They call it mahout.

THE COURT: Mahout. That person is able to guide the elephant with the use of his feet or her feet?

THE WITNESS: That's right.

THE COURT: And control the elephant?

THE WITNESS: It does control the elephant. These elephants are highly trained, of course.

THE COURT: Do you have an opinion about the people in circuses who ride on the elephants, are they able to control the elephants that are riding on them. It's more often than not a woman sitting on top of the elephant. Are

they controlling?

2.2.

THE WITNESS: No, I could not tell you. I have not ridden or talked with them. They are probably controlled in some way, yes. And I would — my opinion would be these elephants are trained to do a particular act, so they know what to do, and they've been trained prior to that at some winter location perhaps. And, so, whether they've got Person A or Person B on their back, they know what to do. So, maybe they're given a signal, forward or back.

The mahouts are really bonded to their elephants, I mean, they know their — they're the ones in the stable feeding them, carrying for them, they are — a much closer relationship. So, I would feel much more direct control by a mahout than in a circus where the elephants are trained to do certain performances.

THE COURT: Do the mahouts use the ankus or a hook or anything equivalent to --

THE WITNESS: They often will have kind of a small ankus or bull hook. I've never seen them jab. They may poke or something. I think it's kind of a status symbol because people are used to seeing a mahout with this hook. And I've never seen them use it in a painful way.

THE COURT: But, nevertheless, it has a point on it, I assume?

THE WITNESS: Usually it's got that kind of curve

1 on it, yes.

2.2.

THE COURT: Similar to like a fireplace poker?

THE WITNESS: Kind of like that, yes.

THE COURT: Go ahead.

BY MR. SHEA:

- Q. Dr. Hart, now, in Nepal elephants are chained to stakes, right?
- A. They're chained during the night and they're then chained during the day just before they're going to be taking tourists for a ride, and then they are ridden out into the forest to forage after the first batch of tourists finish their ride. And then they are out there for five or six hours. You can usually see them from the camp, you can see the mahouts and the elephants wondering around, the elephants foraging and the mahouts gathering things. And they come back in time for the 5:00 or 6:00 o'clock ride in the evening. And then in that place, they stay there all night and they're given some food, a lot of branches.

THE COURT: How do the mahouts restrain the elephants, if at all, from being assaultive towards those tourists, eco or otherwise, who are about to board them?

THE WITNESS: Right. They can -- I mean, the elephants are just -- they're pretty trained. These are females, you wouldn't do it with a male.

THE COURT: You would not do that with a male?

THE WITNESS: You would not do it with a male.

Males are not nearly as easily managed as females.

2.2.

THE COURT: It is rare to see a male elephant in a circus?

THE WITNESS: I don't want to say yes or no, I'm sure most of them are females, almost all of them are females, but no guarantees. You see males in zoos. I mean, sometimes they breed — try to breed elephants. But I don't recall a male in a zoo, to be honest with you, an adult male.

THE COURT: All right. But getting back to my question. How do they — this is a — it's the center of attention for a lot of tourists, eco or otherwise, to go on a safari or go on a tour or ride on the back of an elephant. How are they controlled? How does the mahout or — is the mahout in control of the situation, the interaction between the tourist and the elephant?

THE WITNESS: They do.

THE COURT: How do they control the elephant? How do they control the elephant? How do they keep them from wading into the lines of tourists waiting to board them on a day that they don't want to be boarded.

THE WITNESS: They get off, they hold the elephant and they say, stay, a lot of verbal commands that elephants understand.

THE COURT: No weapons are used?

1 THE WITNESS: Not to hit. They may move them with 2 the stick or the ankus. 3 THE COURT: What does that mean, move it with a 4 stick or ankus? 5 THE WITNESS: They may push them to go back or --6 with the other hand they --7 THE COURT: With the point of that stick? 8 THE WITNESS: Not necessarily with the point, just 9 the end. 10 THE COURT: The point -- with their hand, with the 11 blunt end of the stick? 12 THE WITNESS: Or you can use the -- I'm going by 13 recollection now. You could use the curved end, but you're 14 not going to hit them with it. 15 Is it -- am I correct or not then that THE COURT: 16 this ankus is universally used to control elephants to a 17 certain extent? 18 THE WITNESS: The ankus, as far as I know, goes 19 back thousands of years, and it used to be used brutally with 20 elephants, but then they stopped doing it that way. 21 learned that you can use some positive reinforcement, some 2.2. foot, verbal commands. You got that bond between the mahout 23 and the elephant, and they say, move back. As I said, there 24 are a lot of verbal commands that the elephants understand.

Elephants I think like doing this kind of tourist ride thing.

So, for one thing, they aren't going to object to it that much.

And then they get to go out and then they come back in the stables. The mahouts are giving them special treats, they have a — it's quite a large treat of molasses and stuff, and they give them that. And they get them to lift their leg up, they can get them to go in the water. I've gotten on the back of an elephant. The mahout says something like, lift your front left. The elephant does that. You stand on the front leg. And then put their head down, you can get over their back and back off again. And that's just all verbal commands.

THE COURT: All right. This is not -- I'm not cutting into your time, Counsel, by asking questions. I'm not charging that against you. Go ahead.

MR. SHEA: Certainly, Your Honor.

BY MR. SHEA:

2.2.

- Q. Now, Dr. Hart, in India the elephants are -- again, they are kept in stables during the day and they are chained by drag chains, isn't that true, at night?
 - A. You mean at nighttime?
- Q. Yes.
- A. No, they are they pull around a chain. In other words, you can't just say, you know, go out and have a good time. The chain slows them down, so, it's a chain that they

drag around, maybe nine feet long, and then they drag that and they can move. And they can interact with wild elephants. As a matter of fact, it's customarily for the females there to be bred by the wild males, and that's how they get pregnant.

Then but easier then for the mahout to go out and find where they are, whether it's a Jeep or walking around, because they can't move that fast and that far kind of dragging this chain around.

- Q. Dr. Hart, the chains are so heavy that the elephants can't go very far from the stable, isn't that true?
- A. I wouldn't say how heavy they are. I would say that it's long enough to prevent them from going very far. So they stay within walking distance or a Jeep ride distance.
 - O. A substantial chain?

2.2.

- A. It depends on your definition. It's substantial enough to keep them from walking away.
- Q. Let me show you Page 214 of your deposition, beginning on Line 1. I'm going to start with Line 1 to provide context. If you'd follow along. Dr. Hart, I asked you Question: Have you seen a mahout train a baby elephant in any of your travels? Answer: No, I haven't. Now, I might finish my comment, in India it's slightly different. Question: I'm sorry, I didn't mean to interrupt you. Answer: No. In India it's slightly different, they keep them in stables during the day, some food, and they take them for rides, tourist rides,

but at night they are released in the park so they are free ranging. And they pull like a nine foot chain on one foot so that slows them down so they can't run around with the wild elephants that they interact with, but they do interact with wild elephants and the mahouts gather the elephants in the morning. Question: How do though do that? Answer: they can't go very far, maybe ride around in a Jeep and find out where they are, and they get on the elephant and ride them back. Question: I take it this is a pretty substantial chain that goes around the elephant's -- Answer: Yeah. Right. Yeah. That slows them down. Actually, the females get bred by the wild bulls. Question: And that chain would be something like an anchor or chain on a ship or something heavy enough to really slow to elephant down? Answer: No, I mean, I don't know, something like that, I mean (indicating) sure.

1

2.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

23

24

25

Did I read your testimony correctly?

- A. Well, the reason you saw me hesitate there is because I don't know what you mean by an anchor chain. I've seen anchor chains that are like that (indicating), and I know they aren't that big. I thought I made myself clear. It's large enough to slow them down. And I was not very definite when you asked me if it's an anchor chain because in my mind there's different kinds of anchor chains.
 - Q. Dr. Hart, did I read your testimony correctly?

- 1 A. Yes, you did.
- Q. Dr. Hart, you discussed some of the articles this
 morning or today with counsel that were written by Dr. Friend,
 correct?
- 5 A. True.

7

8

9

10

11

14

- Q. One of those articles was Hart Deposition Exhibit 11, and I'm sorry, Your Honor, I don't have the record cite in front of me, it was just admitted. Could you display that, please?
- MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Your Honor, this was not one of the ones we had discussed on the record in Direct Examination.
- 12 MR. SHEA: I apologize, I thought it was one that 13 had been discussed.
 - THE COURT: You both want it to come into the record?
- 16 MR. SHEA: I'm not moving it into the record at this time, Your Honor.
- 18 BY MR. SHEA:
- Q. Dr. Hart, this is an article by Dr. Friend that you cited in your report, correct?
- 21 A. That's right.
- Q. And I'd like to show you Page 81, and going to the paragraph under Section 3.3, Time Budgets, 2400 to 0400 hours.

 Do you see that paragraph in front of you?
- 25 A. I do.

Q. Dr. Hart, that paragraph states: Consistent with previous observations, behavior was highly variable across elephants even during this time period, Tables 5 and 6. Six of the elephants displayed no stereotypic weaving, although, one of those displayed head bobbing. Bunny, Table 5, and Kelly, Table 6, spent half of this period weaving.

Did I read that correctly?

A. Yes, you read that correctly.

2.2.

- Q. As to this statement, you have no basis to disagree that stereotypic behavior was highly variable across the elephants, do you?
- A. Well, in my mind that discussion of that by the author is somewhat misleading because stereotypic behavior consists more than just weaving, it also consists of head bobbing.

 So and this author has explained that stereotypic behavior includes more than just weaving. So, head bobbing would also be called stereotypic behavior. He's speaking of the weaving only, but it's not just there are other kinds of stereotypic behavior.
- Q. Dr. Friend (sic), have you completed your answer to my question?
- A. You wanted to know if I agreed about it being variable --
- Q. Dr. Hart, that wasn't my question. Let me ask it. As to this statement, you have no basis to disagree that

stereotypic behavior was highly variable across the elephants, do you?

A. I do not disagree when he's speaking of these tables, right. He's referring to these tables and I would agree.

2.2.

Q. Dr. Hart, let me show you Page 234 in your deposition, starting on Line 16, and I'll ask you to follow along.

Question: We'll get to that in just a minute. Now, in this study — well, let's turn to Page 81, that will probably speed it up. There's a heading right in the middle of the page, the sentence right below that heading says, quote, consistent with previous observations, behavior was highly variable across elephants, even during this time period, end quote. And then he reports that — he says, quote, six of the elephants displayed no stereotypic weaving, although one of those displayed head bobbing, end quote. So, first off, do you have any basis to disagree that the behavior was highly variable across the elephants in this study? Answer: No.

Did I read your testimony correctly?

- A. Yes, you read my testimony correctly.
- Q. Let's go to Page 84 of this article, and if we can look at the sentence beginning midway down the page, beginning the paragraph, first word, overall. Dr. Hart, this says:

 Overall, these elephants spend less than half the time performing weaving during roughly comparable time periods than the elephants in five smaller European circuses studied by

1 | Schmid (1995).

2.2.

Did I lead that sentence correctly?

- A. Right.
- Q. And, Dr. Hart, you have no basis to disagree with this statement, correct?
- A. No.
- Q. And the Schmid (1995), that's the article that you discussed with counsel earlier today, is that correct?
- 9 A. That's right.
 - Q. And, Dr. Hart, I'd like to show you Page 87 of this article. I'd like to show you the last paragraph right above acknowledgments. That paragraph states: After traveling with this circus and studying its elephants on numerous occasions, over three years, this author's experience concurs with the conclusions of Kiley-Worthington (1990) that the physical and psychological welfare of circus elephants is not as a rule inferior to that of other animal husbandry systems in zoos, stables, kennels or farms.

Did I read that correctly?

- A. You read that correctly.
 - Q. And you have no basis in the literature to disagree with that statement, do you?
- A. Well, I mean, this is the discussion of the author, of course, he has a prerogative of making whatever statements he likes to. So, I don't disagree that this is his opinion.

- Q. Dr. Hart, let's look -- I believe you did discuss
 Friend and Parker (1999), correct?
 - A. That's correct.

2.2.

- Q. I'd like to show it's Hart Deposition Exhibit 12. I'd like to show you that article. This is another article that you cited in your report, correct?
 - A. That's right.
- Q. I'd like to show you Page 224 of this article. It's basically the last sentence of the conclusion right above Acknowledgments, beginning with the word "Even with".

Dr. Hart, this article states: Even with the occasional use of chaining, our experience concurs with the conclusions of Kiley-Worthington (1990) that the physical and psychological welfare of circus elephants is not as a rule inferior to that of other animal husbandry systems in zoos, stables, kennels — and I believe the next line says, or farms.

Did I read that correctly?

- A. That sentence follows immediately a previous one about chaining required for veterinary examination and treatment.

 And then following that, he said, you know, you certainly need it for these occasions, and he's basically it's the same sentence as in the other publication.
- Q. I'm sorry, I didn't understand --
- 25 A. That's right. You're reading it correctly.

- Q. And do you have any basis to disagree with that statement?
 - A. Again, it's the author's conclusion. And I agree that that's the author's conclusion. I have not read I haven't done the analysis that Kiley-Worthington has done, so I can't give you my opinion, but I can certainly say that this is the author's opinion and he wrote that, clearly.
 - Q. Now, Dr. Hart, you mentioned or you discussed Williams and Friend (2003) with counsel earlier today, correct?
 - A. That's right.
- Q. And you cited that in your report, correct?
- 12 A. Right.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

- Q. Now, during your deposition could we show that as Exhibit 14, the first page? During your deposition you were critical of a statement made by Dr. Friend that weaving on train cars was highly variable, weren't you?
- 17 A. Yes, I was.
- 18 Q. But that was not an untrue statement, was it?
- 19 A. On my part, you mean?
- Q. No, on Dr. Friend's part. That statement that weaving on train cars was highly variable was not an untrue statement, was it?
- 23 A. You mean, in other words, he made that statement, yes.
- Q. Let's look at Page 8 in the abstract, this statement which I will read to you: Occurrence of weaving was highly

1 variable between elephants. Did I read that correctly, first off?

- A. You read that correctly.
- Q. And you were critical of that statement in your deposition, weren't you?
 - A. That's right.

2.2.

- Q. And you were critical of it because you would have said something else about the data that were in Table 1 of the article, is that true?
 - A. That's true.
- Q. Yet, you acknowledge that Dr. Friend's statement highlighted here was not an untrue statement, correct?
- 13 A. In other words, it's there. I mean, do I agree that 14 that's in print? Yes.
 - Q. Let me show you Page 260 of your deposition, starting on Line 17. Starting on Line 17. Page 260, Line 17, I apologize. Dr. Hart. Please follow along. Question: Isn't it a statement in isn't it standard in literature to report the range. Answer: It is. Question: Of values, which is what they're doing here, 0 to 68.5. Answer: 0 to 88, I think that's the abstract is not portray the data as one should logically look at it. Question: So, you would have written it up differently? Answer: Yes, I would have. Question: Okay. But that's not an untrue statement. Answer: It's not untrue.

Did I read your testimony correctly?

A. That's right.

2.5

- Q. Dr. Hart, you also told the Court in your deposition that it was standard in the literature to report the range of such values, did you not?
- A. Range is reported in two ways. One way reporting the range is you have X numbers of animals, let's say you've got five animals and you've got several measurements per animal, and you get an average for that animal and you report the range of averages for each of your five subjects. That's the range. Or you can you've got, say, three different measurements on each of five animals, you can report the lowest of one animal and the highest of the other animal. So, the author will usually tell you what these ranges that he's reporting to refer to.
- Q. And you say here that it is standard to report the range of values, correct?
 - A. As I've just explained it, yes.
- Q. Dr. Hart, you've talked about elephants sensing pain earlier today, is that true?
 - A. Elephants being --
- 22 Q. -- sensing pain?
- 23 A. Yes.
 - Q. Is that true? In your opinion, it's difficult to determine whether an elephant is experiencing pain from its

- 1 | actions or its affect, correct?
 - A. That's true.

2.2.

- Q. Thus, an elephant could be experiencing pain and not displaying outward signs of that pain, correct?
- A. It could be because they do not have like facial expressions, they can't grimace, they don't yelp.
- Q. So, if an elephant looks comfortable, you can't tell one way or the other if she's experiencing pain, is that true?
- A. Yes, there are ways of detecting whether an animal feels pain.
- Q. But not from their actions or affect, correct?
- A. Not by their what?
- 13 Q. Actions or affect, correct?
 - A. You know, you have to look at species typical or species specific, biology and behavior. And if you're dealing with an animal that doesn't have the facial musculature to grimace or show you something. You can look at other ways whether they experience pain. One would be, do they try to get away from it, do they escape from it, do they move from it?
 - Q. And I was asking about actions and affect?
 - A. You were asking for referring to my comment about the facial expressions of elephants don't really tell you the degree of suffering or pain or agony.
 - Q. So, you can't tell one way or the other by looking at

- 1 | their facial expressions, right?
- A. Well, maybe you could if that work could be done, maybe there might be some slight things you could look for, but I'm
- 4 not aware of any literature that deals with it at that level.
- 5 Q. Dr. Hart, you did not attend the elephant inspection
- 6 ordered by this Court at the Ringling Brothers Center for
- 7 Elephant Conservation, correct?
- 8 A. I did not attend that facility.
- 9 Q. Thus, the only elephants that you observed directly
- 10 were at the Auburn Hills inspection, correct?
- 11 A. That's right.
- 12 Q. Do you recall the names of those two elephants at
- 13 Auburn Hills?
- 14 A. Karen and Nicole.
- Q. And you were shown a film clip of Karen and Nicole
- 16 earlier today, correct?
- 17 A. That's right.
- 18 Q. Nicole was not swaying in that film clip, was she?
- 19 A. That's right.
- 20 THE COURT: Let me ask you something. You talked
- 21 about the facial expressions, the elephant not having facial
- 22 expressions in reaction to pain, but are there not some
- reactions, physical sequella reactions to pain by elephants,
- 24

or not?

25 THE WITNESS: Well, I would think that --

1 THE COURT: I don't want you to think, based on 2 expertise. 3 THE WITNESS: From what I've seen, yes. Move away 4 from pain. If you were to strike them with something painful, 5 they move away. 6 THE COURT: What about the raising of the trunk, is 7 that a reaction or not? 8 THE WITNESS: That's not a very good predictor in 9 my mind. For one thing, if they did it they'd get at least 10 stabbed on the trunk when they raise it, they learned not to 11 do that. There's not a real give away that, you know, this 12 hurts other than their movements away from it. 13 THE COURT: What about their sounds? Any sounds 14 that emanate as a result of pain? 15 THE WITNESS: Elephants are pretty quiet. They do 16 have some sounds that we tend not to hear called infrasonic, 17 but we can't hear those. They trumpet, people know that, but 18 they usually trumpet to chase away some other elephants, you 19 know, to chase a strange male or something they trumpet. But 20 there's not like a yelp like a dog. 21 THE COURT: Not to react to a handler with a 2.2. bull -- with one of these ankus? 23 THE WITNESS: Right. 24 THE COURT: Not to do that --25 THE WITNESS: I don't believe they vocalize or make

1 a sound. 2 THE COURT: What's your opinion about that? Why 3 don't they? THE WITNESS: Why don't they? 4 5 THE COURT: Yeah. 6 THE WITNESS: Well --7 THE COURT: Is it because it doesn't hurt them? 8 THE WITNESS: No, I would go back to my perspective 9 of an animal behaviorist and interested in biology and 10 elephant behavior in biology. In nature -- in nature they 11 aren't ever confronted with a pointed ankus. They aren't 12 confronted with the things --13 THE COURT: You tell me a little while ago --14 THE WITNESS: They have not evolved --15 THE COURT: People have used ankuses over the years 16 from when the Egyptians were --17 THE WITNESS: Right. 18 THE COURT: They were using these ankus things, 19 right? 20 THE WITNESS: But the evolution of the elephant 21 hasn't changed, I mean, it is the same elephants as they were 2.2. in nature. And they have not evolved to respond with a 23 yelping, they move away from it. 24 THE COURT: Is that the only way that pain can be 25 measured, they are move away?

1 THE WITNESS: Well, nothing comes to mind readily 2 right now. 3 That's very interesting because you THE COURT: tell me that they swat the flies because they hurt. 4 5 THE WITNESS: Well, that's right. But they can do 6 that and they're used to flies and they learn to be around 7 flies. Whether they would swat at an ankus, I mean, maybe 8 some do and some don't because I haven't seen that many ankus 9 hits, to be honest with you. 10 THE COURT: So, it's not easy then to determine? 11 THE WITNESS: It's not easy, no, no. I mean, I 12 would say if -- but at some point you have to make 13 generalizations about animals in general, I would say. 14 example, if you hit any animal with a sharp object and you 15 make a wound --16 THE COURT: Let me -- I've been looking at film 17 footage of elephants maybe on the Blue Team, maybe on the Red 18 Team, being arguably hit upwards with the bull hook, and I 19 pull back because I sense the pain. 20 THE WITNESS: Yeah. 21 THE COURT: Maybe I'm overreacting. 2.2. THE WITNESS: I think it's very realistic. I mean, if any animal were stabbed like that, you would expect -- pain 23 24 is a very basic feeling, a very basic emotion. All animals,

all mammals -- all animals that we know of have pain receptors

1 and pain responses, so it's a very -- I flinch as well, I 2 mean, it's a very -- and I would imagine elephants if they're 3 hit like that do pop up, you know. 4 THE COURT: But is that just a reaction, though? 5 Could that be some reaction other than a reaction to pain 6 itself? 7 THE WITNESS: I would say it's a reaction to pain. 8 I think that's the most logical explanation from a behavioral 9 standpoint. 10 THE COURT: But you agree that my reaction could be 11 an overreaction, though? 12 THE WITNESS: Well, I'm not going to argue with you 13 about whether --14 THE COURT: Look, I'm trying to figure out this 15 myself -- I'm sorry, we're giving the court reporter a fit. 16 Look, no, I'm wrestling with this, and if I'm overreacting I 17 want you to tell me that. I'm not arguing with -- I've seen 18 lot of film footage and I have -- there have been a couple 19 times I closed my eyes, put my hands over and maybe I'm 20 overreacting to what I see. THE WITNESS: I'm --21 2.2. THE COURT: Not pain. 23 THE WITNESS: I'm an animal behaviorist --24 THE COURT: That's why I'm asking. 25 THE WITNESS: And I react the same way. And I

1 would react the same way when my dog is jabbed, if she ever 2 was. If my dog yelped, I would react the same way. If a 3 chimpanzee in a circus were jabbed and yelped, I'd react the 4 If I see an elephant jabbed like that, I react the same wav. 5 same way. I think it's not an exaggeration. 6 THE COURT: Elephants in the wild fight among 7 themselves and fight other animals and predators and 8 otherwise? 9 THE WITNESS: They do. 10 THE COURT: In your opinion, do they experience 11 pain during those fights? 12 THE WITNESS: Well, one thing about pain in 13 fighting animals is it tends to go -- if you're already 14 emotionally involved in a fight, that painful stimulus makes 15 you fight harder. 16 Sometimes the rush of adrenaline masks THE COURT: 17 pain, though, and athletes will tell you that. 18 They probably are -- it goes on the THE WITNESS: 19 fighting, and then with the emotion of the moment they don't 20 necessarily feel it. 21 THE COURT: All right. So, it's difficult to 2.2. measure pain, though, is that a fair statement? 23 THE WITNESS: It's difficult unless you're going to set up a laboratory study where you're going to measure 24

something in the brain, you measure the brain light up in

1	certain places. Or you look at how hard the animal worked to
2	get away from that, and it's been studied in laboratory in
3	that way, or at least it used to be. You can use pain
4	blockers to see how well they block pain, that's is the way
5	human pain medicines are sometimes developed, is you
6	measure you have a pain and you see how well it blocks it.
7	THE COURT: It is a fair statement then that on
8	occasion when these hooks are used, then it's within the realm
9	of reason that an elephant may not experience pain as such by
LO	the use of the bull hook?
11	THE WITNESS: That an elephant may not experience
12	pain?
L3	THE COURT: Or are you saying that every time a
L4	bull hook is used an elephant experiences pain?
15	THE WITNESS: No, I would not say that.
L6	THE COURT: All right. Sorry, this time is not
L7	being counted against you. I'm sorry, it gave me time to
L8	think of two other questions. When fighting in the wild, do
19	elephants make noise?
20	THE WITNESS: They trumpet, yes, they do. They
21	make noise.
22	THE COURT: All right. During the fight or in an
23	effort to scare away antagonists?
24	THE WITNESS: I think it's both. If they are

involved in a fight they'll trumpet and go at each other and

1 trumpet. But they'll also use the trumpet to scare away --2 they might scare away people in a Jeep driving up too close. 3 That's interesting because you don't THE COURT: 4 have an opinion that they use that trumpeting sound in 5 captivity, though, in circuses? 6 THE WITNESS: I think it's been trained. You can 7 train elephants to trumpet. 8 THE COURT: All right. In the wild, while 9 fighting, do they use a swatting motion of their tail as they 10 would use to swat away a meddlesome fly? 11 THE WITNESS: Not in fighting, I think the stakes 12 are higher. 13 THE COURT: It wouldn't accomplish any objective? 14 THE WITNESS: That's true. 15 THE COURT: And is it your opinion that they don't 16 use the swatting method in circuses as a reaction to the use 17 of bull hooks or chains? 18 THE WITNESS: Not that I'm aware of. 19 THE COURT: Do you have an opinion as to why not, 20 if this is antagonizing -- antagonistic to touch or pain? If 21 it produces pain, why they don't use the natural swatting 2.2. method? There's a natural swatting method used to -- because 23 they are disturbed by a fly that's biting them and hurting 24 them, but they don't use it in the circus in reaction to

either chains or the hooks, if I understand you correctly.

1 THE WITNESS: The fly swatting is --2 usually there's three or four flies buzzing around, one bites, 3 it's kind of an ongoing process, and it takes awhile to get 4 that branch -- find a branch, move it up there and swat them 5 off. If an ankus -- one jab with an ankus, it's -- there 6 isn't really time to kind of move it away, you just got to get 7 out of there because it's -- in my mind, and my professional 8 opinion, it would be more painful than a fly bite. 9 THE COURT: What about the use of the ankus while 10 the elephant is in one of these -- being paraded and holding 11 onto the tail of an elephant in front of him as a constant --12 not constant as if I'm moving my hand rapidly, but fairly 13 consistent use of the bull hook to keep the elephant in the 14 parade? You've seen the parades from the train stations to 15 the venue? 16 THE WITNESS: Part of it, actually, we weren't --17 THE COURT: Have you seen the use of the bull hook 18 during those parades? 19 THE WITNESS: To be honest with you, I think we did 20 not participate in that parade, so I cannot say. 21 THE COURT: All right. Sorry. Go ahead. This is 2.2. not counted to your time. Go ahead.

Q. Dr. Hart, to follow up one question regarding what you were just discussing. Different elephants will have different

23

24

25

BY MR. SHEA:

- 1 responses to use of the ankus, correct? 2 Did I say that? Α. 3 Ο. I'm asking you. You're asking me? 4 Α. 5 I'm asking you. Will different elephants have 6 different responses to use of the ankus? 7 THE COURT: When you say different, are you 8 referring to Asia versus African or --9 MR. SHEA: No, different individuals. 10 THE COURT: Individual elephants. 11 THE WITNESS: If I give you kind of a long answer 12 to that, is that all right? If you took a sharp ankus and you 13 stabbed behind the ear, I'm giving you an example, three 14 elephants in a row, three stabbed, I think all three of them 15 will have a similar response. They'll move away. There will 16 be a reaction to that blow, which would be painful. 17 THE COURT: Move away, no noise, no swatting, just 18 move away? 19 THE WITNESS: Move away, yes. 20 BY MR. SHEA: 21 Let me show you Page 204 of your deposition, starting 2.2. on Line 8. 204. Starting on Line 8 going through 13.
- on Line 8. 204. Starting on Line 8 going through 13. And,
 Dr. Hart, I asked, Question: And different elephants'
 responses to the bull hook, you would expect to be different
 correct? Answer: In well, there is individual differences

just like there are in people and how they manifest stress?

Did I read that correctly?

A. Yes, I did.

2.2.

- Q. Dr. Hart, going back to --
- A. Do you want me to elaborate? I'm sorry --

THE COURT: I'd like you to, yes.

THE WITNESS: I was asked the question differently, and I was giving you an example where I can — I would say all animals would act the same way. The context in this deposition was, are they going to respond differently to the bull hook. Now, if you were to show — put in front of the elephant, you know, put in front of their face a bull hook, one might respond differently than the other.

I'm not talking about stabbing. It would depend on their recent history with that bull hook. It would depend on what happened last. It depends on their memory of the context. So that you would expect some individual differences, and in the context in which I perceived that question was asked, I said individual differences. So, I gave you one answer, the first one, or I can expect that they would all react the same way. The other one, right now, how they can respond differently.

BY MR. SHEA:

Q. Dr. Hart, going back to your — the inspections in this case. Now, you didn't inspect elephant Jewell, did you?

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. Elephant Lutzi?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Elephant Mysore?
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. Elephant Susan?
- 7 | A. No.
- 8 Q. And you didn't inspect an elephant named Zina, correct?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. Other than at the Auburn Hills inspection -- let me
- 11 back up a second. You were shown pictures of the insides of
- 12 train cars earlier today, correct?
- 13 A. That's true. That's right.
- 14 Q. Other than -- and that occurred at the Auburn Hills
- 15 inspection, correct?
- 16 A. The train ride arrival of the trains.
- Q. When you viewed the inside of train cars, that occurred at the Auburn Hills inspection, correct?
- 19 A. That's right.
- 20 Q. And other than the Auburn Hills inspection, you have
- 21 not seen the inside of any FEI train car, correct?
- 22 A. That's right.
- 23 MR. SHEA: Those are all the questions I have.
- 24 THE COURT: All right. Redirect, Counsel.

2.2.

REDIRECT EXAMINATION

2 BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

- Q. Dr. Hart, going back to the question you were asked a short while ago about variability in response to a bull hook?
 - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. Were you suggesting that there is variability as to whether or not the elephants jabbed with a sharp end of a bull hook would experience pain?
- A. My first answer if they took three elephants and you jabbed them you jabbed them behind the ear good and hard, right? I would say all three were experiencing pain.
 - Q. What is your basis for saying that?
- A. I think it's within the just reading animal biology in general. When any animal is hit with a very sharp object, and they especially if they flinch, then it's a scientific and a very reasonable conclusion that they're experiencing pain.
- Q. Do elephants have similar pain receptors to other mammals?
- A. As far as I'm aware, yes.
- Q. Do you have any reason to think that they don't?
- A. No, they don't. One thing that people don't understand about elephant skin, I mean, we call it pachyderm, but there are papillae that stick up in the skin that carry blood vessels and nerve fibers. So, it's there are places where

nerves are kind of brought close to the surface by virtue of these papillae that stick up.

Q. Are you were aware of any other biological differences between elephants and other mammals, subject to which elephants would not experience pain when other animals would?

MR. SHEA: Objection, leading and argumentative.

THE COURT: I'll allow the question to be answered.

THE WITNESS: Okay. As to whether the perception of pain in elephants is different qualitatively than other species, that's what you're asking?

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

- Q. Qualitatively or physiologically?
- A. Right. No reason to believe that it is any different.

 Not that I'm aware of, no.
 - Q. You were asked about the Mason and Latham study, if we can pull that up for a moment. This is the study, just for the record, that reads: Can't stop, won't stop, stereotypia reliable animal welfare indicater, and you were asked about one portion of that. I'd ask you to take a look at the abstract. There's a first question: Do you know whether this study was specifically about elephants?
 - A. No, this wasn't.
 - Q. If you take a look at the second sentence of this study, I will read that: Where data exists most, approximately 68 percent situations that cause increased

stereotypies also decrease welfare. Stereotypy eliciting situations are less likely to be poor for welfare, although exceptions exist. Do you see that?

A. Yes.

2.2.

2.5

- Q. Do you think those sentences are an accurate summary of this study based on your reading of it?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Do you have an opinion about whether elephants that are carried on the trains for take the examples we were using before, I think 35 hours was about the timeframe we talked about, would be the kind of stereotypy eliciting situation that this article is referring to?

MR. SHEA: Objection.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I just asked if he had an opinion.

THE COURT: I'll allow it.

THE WITNESS: I actually used the term more than seven hours. But, yes, I would say that falls into the category of poor welfare.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

Q. You were asked some questions about the mahouts and the conditions of those elephants. The elephants that you were describing, are they able to engage in more naturalistic behavior than the Ringling Brothers' elephants based on your observations?

A. Definitely.

2.2.

MR. SHEA: Objection, leading.

THE COURT: I'll allow it.

THE WITNESS: Yeah, definitely.

THE COURT: Let him testify. Start rephrasing your questions, Counsel. I want him to testify. I want to be able, if appropriate, to credit testimony — not the testimony of the lawyer.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

Q. My question was whether you have an opinion on whether or not the elephants you described in India — how they deal with the mahouts, are able to engage in more naturalistic behaviors than the elephants in the Ringling Brothers circus?

MR. SHEA: Same objection and it's argumentative.

THE COURT: All right. It's overruled. You do have an opinion, what's the opinion?

THE WITNESS: My opinion is, naturalistic usually means referring to the animal living in the wild situation. So, we're familiar with them moving around, engaging in family groups and going to waterholes and so forth. Looking at an approximation of that, the elephants kept in India and Nepal have a much closer approximation to that, they're out in the day foraging, they're out at night foraging. They're not near as closely chained or tethered as they are in the Ringling Brothers situation, so they can move back and forth and touch

the animal next to them and engage in eating these branches, which is their natural food.

So, certainly they're engaging in something much closer approximation to naturalistic behavior than the Ringling Brothers case that we're talking about where they are picketed in a line and they can move one foot forward and one foot backwards, they are brought hay, they are brought water once in awhile. That's very minimum naturalistic behavior, in my mind.

BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:

2.2.

- Q. You were asked some questions on Cross about the -what's been marked as Plaintiff's 157, Will Call 157, the
 Variation and Stereotypic Behavior article by Gruber Friend,
 et al., do you recall that?
 - A. That's right.
- Q. And I'd ask you to take a look at the first full paragraph on the second page of that article, which is Page 210. And it's a sentence beginning with: Stereotypies can be defined as unvarying repetitive behaviors that have no obvious goal or function. Then some citations. And then:

 Stereotypies have been associated with suboptimal housing or management systems. Closed quote. Do you see that statement?
 - A. I do.
- 24 Q. Do you agree with those statements?
- 25 A. Yes, I do. This is statement by Dr. Friend and the

1 colleagues at the beginning of this paper -- giving the 2 context of the paper.

- Q. With regard to the mahout situation, again, that you referred to. You said that they had never seen the elephants or seen the ankuses or bull hooks used in a painful way on those elephants, what did you mean by that?
- A. Where they jabbed the elephant and it flinched away.

 I've seen them push or touch it or move it around, but not hit it. Or, to me as an observer, looked like a painful reaction, which would be a flinch or a move away from it.
- Q. Do the mahouts transport their elephants for many hours at a time in railroad cars?
- A. No, they don't.

2.2.

- Q. And going back to the study that we had referred to about the behavior of elephants in railroad cars, which was marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 156, is there anything in the data in this article or any of the other articles that we've discussed which in your view would suggest that these elephants are not experiencing the level of stereotypical behavior because of anything other than poor welfare conditions?
 - MR. SHEA: Objection, leading.
- 23 | THE COURT: I'll allow it.
 - THE WITNESS: No, I can think of no other reason that you would find this abnormal level of stereotypic

1	behavior other than this long term confinement where you move
2	forward, back one foot and the other, and 36 hours or whatever
3	on end.
4	BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:
5	Q. Did you have an opinion about whether that's injurious
6	to the elephants?
7	A. As to
8	Q. Whether it's injurious to the
9	MR. SHEA: Objection, it goes beyond the proffer
10	the offer of this witness.
11	THE COURT: I'll allow it.
12	THE WITNESS: Yeah, it is injurious to the animal's
13	welfare, to its engagement in naturalistic behaviors, yes.
14	MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I have nothing further, Your
15	Honor?
16	THE COURT: Do you have any questions before I
17	excuse the witness?
18	MR. SHEA: I do, and they are follow-alongs.
19	RECROSS-EXAMINATION
20	BY MR. SHEA:
21	Q. Dr. Hart, just now you mentioned seven hours again, and
22	I understand it's your opinion that elephants should not be
23	chained more than seven hours per day, did I understand that
24	correctly?
25	A. I think we were referring to the train rides. I might

- 1 have misunderstood, but I think it was in the boxcars in the 2 train rides.
 - Q. Well, is it your opinion that elephants should not be chained more than seven hours per day?
 - A. Are you talking about chaining now.
 - Q. Yes.

2.2.

- A. In my opinion they should not be chained more than seven hours a day, that's true.
- Q. That's means that elephants, in your opinion, should not be chained overnight, correct?
- A. Well, I think there's plenty of examples. They can be turned loose in a pen at nighttime, they'd do just fine. Even small pens, they aren't going to fight, they aren't going to get into trouble. I would see that there's no particular reason to chain them up overnight. So, I would but, again, in the elephants we have seen in India and Nepal, they would be in the Nepal they were chained on this long chain, giving them more than one foot backward and one foot forwards, they can move many, many lengths backwards and forwards. They are chained overnight, and I've never seen stereotypic behavior in them. So, it depends on the context.
- Q. Then if I understand your testimony, elephants should not be chained overnight if they are chained to a tether that goes to some point to which it is affixed, correct?

- A. And they are allowed only one foot forward, one foot back. I would say that is not a desirable situation.
 - Q. Is that the only situation in which elephants shouldn't be chained overnight, Dr. Hart?
 - A. I'm sorry.

2.2.

- Q. Is that the only situation in your mind, in your opinion, that elephants should not be chained overnight?
 - A. In what situation?
- Q. What you just described? The type of tethering you just described?
- A. Is that the only -- I'm not sure what other ones there would be. I'm talking about chain them so you can move one foot forward, one foot back, can't go anyplace else, I'm referring to that. Now, if you want to say, can we chain them and give them -- tether the back foot and give them 10 foot of chain and stake it someplace and move around on some dirt, you know, that's a different story.
- Q. Dr. Hart, is it your opinion that elephants shouldn't be chained for 12 hours a day?
- A. Again, chaining meaning what I'm familiar with with the Ringling Brothers' situation, which is chained so you can move one foot forward, one foot backwards, and that's all you can move for a 12-hour period, I don't think they should be chained that long.
- Q. It is your opinion that an elephant can be chained for

12 hours a day on a longer chain?

2.2.

- A. Well, again, I would have to qualify my answer, it depends on the substrate. It depends on I would say you'd look at whether stereotypic behavior develops in these animals as a marker for how aversive it is. Chaining with a 10-foot chain, and you got one next to you with a 10-foot chain, and one over here this way and you can interact, and you get something that takes longer than a bale a batch hay to eat, then that's a different story. But if they showed a high degree of stereotypic behavior, I'd say there's something wrong. But if they don't show stereotypic behavior, then I think you can consider it.
- Q. Dr. Hart, if you take an elephant that has been chained for a period of years and put that elephant out in a field with, let's say, a square mile of room, would that elephant stop stereotypic behavior?
- A. I'll answer according to what my perception is where it's probably been done. And some of these rescue organizations for elephants where they take elephants in that are turned over to them from Animal Control or from some place and they have such a wild not wild, wide space. I've not seen any stereotypic behavior or seen any reported in these animals.

THE COURT: Let me ask you this. Do you have an opinion as to how a circus such as Ringling Brothers could

transport elephants from say New York to Chicago by train without producing stereotypic behavior in the elephants?

2.2.

THE WITNESS: Boy, that's a tough one. You know, I would think — well, maybe two hours and get off and move around, and then two hours back on, move around. And if you built some reinforcement into it, maybe some food treat when they get back on, something to do, so it doesn't take on that aversive atmosphere of a 24-hour ride.

So, you could determine how long you could keep them on a train before they start — before stereotypic behavior shows up. And even in the Williams and Friend study there was a pretty low level for three hours. You can put them on three hours and then take them off, get them a good field to go around in and bring them back and another three hours. It will take longer than otherwise, but I would think that you could put together a reasonable system where it would work.

THE COURT: It may take longer, may cost more, but in the long run it might be — the elephant's best interest might be better served, huh?

THE WITNESS: The elephant's best interest, yes. BY MR. SHEA:

Q. Dr. Hart, let me so you Williams and Friend (2003), the first page, the last sentence of the abstract. You were just asked questions about this, correct? This article, is that

- 1 right?
- 2 A. I was asked questions about this article?
- 3 Q. Yes.
- 4 A. By you or the previous --
- 5 Q. By your counsel.
- 6 A. Okay.
- 7 Q. Dr. Hart --
- A. I was asked questions about this article, I don't know about this line.
 - O. Dr. Hart --
- 11 THE COURT: I'm not trying to stop you -- maybe I
- 12 am. We promised the court reporter 5:30 -- I'd be happy to
- 13 ask the doctor -- one more question, that's it? All right.
- 14 BY MR. SHEA:

- Q. Dr. Hart, it says here: Because the elephants observed
- 16 in this study engaged in a range of activities while weaving
- 17 and were not in a trance-like state, weaving during transport
- did not appear to be indicative of poor behavior. Did I read
- 19 that correctly?
- 20 A. You read that correctly.
- Q. And you disagree with Dr. Williams and Dr. Friend's opinion that I just read, correct?
- 23 A. I do.
- 24 MR. SHEA: I have nothing further.
- 25 THE COURT: Do you have any other questions?

1	MR. GLITZENSTEIN: No, Your Honor.
2	THE COURT: Are you sure?
3	MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Yes.
4	THE COURT: Thank you very much. Good talking to
5	you. Have a safe trip home. Are you returning home this
6	evening?
7	THE WITNESS: No, tomorrow.
8	THE COURT: Have a safe trip home. Let me ask you
9	something, don't put this on the record, it has nothing to
10	do
11	OFF THE RECORD.
12	MR. GLITZENSTEIN: I neglected to ask my co-counse
13	whether they had any final questions. Could I pose one final
14	question?
15	THE COURT: It should be on the record. Not about
16	dogs and vomiting?
17	MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Although we could use some
18	advice on that.
19	REDIRECT EXAMINATION
20	BY MR. GLITZENSTEIN:
21	Q. You were asked the last question from counsel for
22	the defendant was whether you disagreed with that statement
23	from the Friend study, and you just said you did not agree
24	with it. I'd just ask you why you don't agree with it?
25	A. Well, I don't agree with it for two reasons. One, he

says they were not in a trance-like state. I've never seen in the literature that if you were in a trance, it's not stereotypic behavior, and if there was a reason to believe that, there was no measurement of trance-like behavior. I mean, it didn't describe it, didn't report it, didn't measure it, so I didn't see where the data had come from.

And the fact this they would throw some — throw some hay around once in awhile, that was by the author's own statements in there, it's a relatively small period of time that they did have hay or throw hay around. So, that did not explain engaging in stereotypic behavior 50 percent of the time.

MR. GLITZENSTEIN: Thank you, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Do you have a last question, Counsel?

MR. SHEA: No, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Thank you very much, Doctor.

MS. WINDERS: Can quickly clear something up for the record.

THE COURT: Yes.

2.

2.2.

MS. WINDERS: Delcianna Winders. I'm meant to bring this up when Ms. Sinnott was on the stand, and I'm sorry I neglected to that. The defendant has also listed Ms. Sinnott as a witness and subpoenaed Ms. Sinnott. My co-counsel has talked to opposing counsel, and they indicated that that was just to question her about the chart we

discussed earlier, Will Call 50. 1 2 THE COURT: After her testimony this morning. 3 MS. WINDERS: No, no. THE COURT: Her testimony is going to come in 4 5 anyway at some point about the chart. I found it very 6 helpful. 7 MS. WINDERS: I'm glad. As you know, she's a very essential part of our trial team, and we just wanted to clear 8 9 up, if they do have more questions about the chart, and if so, 10 if we can go ahead and get those taken care of sooner rather 11 than later. 12 MR. SIMPSON: We have no further questions. 13 have no further questions. 14 THE COURT: All right. Have a nice evening, we'll 15 start at 10:00 tomorrow. 16 MR. SIMPSON: Your Honor, before we break can we 17 find out what it is we're actually going to do tomorrow. 18 THE COURT: I thought I laid down the law earlier. 19 Didn't you tell them which witnesses, which exhibits --20 MR. SIMPSON: We know we've got one live witness 21 that was going to follow Dr. Hart, but --2.2. THE COURT: Doctor, you can step down. Enjoy your 23 I really don't think this is necessary. I thought I 24 said quite clearly earlier, tell them who the witnesses are 25 and what the exhibits are.

MS. MEYER: Your Honor, I had a discussion with Ms. Joiner earlier during the break and we agreed that as soon as I get back to the office I'm going to give her — we've already given them 72 hours notice on everything, but I'm going to tell her specifically, since we're behind, what we're planning on doing tomorrow.

THE COURT: Let them know before you leave this evening, that's only fair. They shouldn't have to wait for a telephone call. Let them know before you leave. I don't think that's unfair to plaintiffs, counsel. Everyone is here, let them know before they go. All right. And the same procedure for tomorrow, let them know before you leave court tomorrow who the witnesses are for Thursday and the exhibits, that's only fair. Everyone have a wonderful evening.

COURT ADJOURNED AT 5:35 p.m.

1	CERTIFICATE			
2	I, Lisa M. Hand, RPR, certify that the			
3	foregoing is a correct transcript from the record of			
4	proceedings in the above-titled matter.			
5				
6				
7				
8				
9	Lisa M. Hand, RPR			
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				

\$	2:30 [1] 1/5	abnormal [10] 40/4 43/12 43/13 43/21 51/11
\$100 [1] 35/18	3	61/20 66/25 74/19 74/22 115/25 abnormality [2] 69/9 78/16
\$300 [1] 35/18 \$300 [1] 35/21	3 percent [1] 50/3	about [129]
0	3.3 [1] 89/23	above [6] 38/1 44/12 51/25 92/11 93/9 126/4
03-2006 [1] 1/4	30 [3] 4/17 4/23 57/23 30 feet [1] 37/25	above-titled [1] 126/4 abstract [4] 94/24 95/21 111/20 120/24
0400 [1] 89/23	30 percent [4] 43/22 51/18 51/25 57/21	Academicians [1] 61/8
1	3269 [1] 2/4	Academy [1] 9/21
10 [4] 1/5 65/13 68/16 118/15	.333 [1] 2/3	access [2] 7/23 8/9 accomplish [1] 105/13
10 feet [1] 37/25	35 [5] 3/4 8/10 42/6 42/10 112/10	according [1] 119/17
10-foot [2] 119/5 119/6	354-3269 [1] 2/4	accurate [2] 71/20 112/5
10:00 [1] 124/15 11 [1] 89/6	36 [3] 44/7 59/20 116/2 37 [4] 38/23 38/24 39/21 44/11	acknowledge [3] 57/8 57/9 95/11 acknowledged [1] 11/8
110/122 [1] 3/4	4	acknowledgments [2] 92/12 93/10
111 [4] 23/6 23/24 26/10 26/15		across [8] 7/22 51/22 57/13 90/2 90/10 91/1
112 [2] 26/10 26/18 116 [1] 3/4	40 [1] 28/10 40 miles [1] 8/11	91/11 91/17 act [2] 82/5 108/9
118 [1] 37/9	42 [1] 28/10	action [3] 7/25 8/2 8/2
12 [16] 60/24 74/24 75/14 75/15 75/19 75/19	46 [2] 44/22 45/23	actions [4] 97/1 97/11 97/13 97/21
75/20 75/23 76/2 76/11 76/13 76/15 76/16 93/4 118/19 119/1	48 [2] 44/23 45/24 -	active [1] 43/1
12-hour [1] 118/23	5	activities [2] 8/2 121/16 activity [2] 79/20 80/3
122 [1] 3/4	50 [2] 38/18 124/1	actually [12] 6/1 13/8 30/7 41/25 52/25 53/6
13 [2] 56/24 107/22 14 [4] 23/25 50/21 78/1 94/14	50 percent [10] 44/2 44/2 44/6 44/8 49/5 51/22 51/25 57/23 58/9 123/11	53/7 62/14 88/11 106/16 112/17 124/17 add [3] 9/5 19/12 59/7
143 [2] 44/21 45/14	500 [1] 1/23	addition [2] 56/11 78/6
15 [2] 71/4 74/21	5206 [1] 1/18	additional [1] 5/14
15-minute [1] 70/24 15017 [1] 37/22	55 [1] 15/23	Additionally [1] 39/5 address [5] 25/17 26/3 34/14 73/19 76/3
15018 [1] 37/22	5:00 [1] 83/16	addressed [2] 74/11 75/3
15118 [1] 37/22	5:30 [2] 68/13 121/12	addresses [1] 78/13
155 [1] 29/7 156 [2] 56/8 115/16	5:35 p.m [1] 125/15	addressing [3] 30/20 32/19 55/5 ADJOURNED [1] 125/15
157 [3] 60/15 114/12 114/12	6	administered [1] 16/22
158 [3] 60/24 62/8 71/16	6/26/35 [1] 3/4	admission [4] 29/1 52/6 60/10 62/3
159 [1] 71/16 16 [2] 75/20 91/6	64 [1] 78/3 649 [2] 54/18 54/23	admissions [2] 3/14 4/12 admit [1] 60/13
1601 [1] 1/17	6522 [1] 1/24	admitted [12] 4/7 4/8 4/17 5/3 37/9 38/18
17 [3] 95/16 95/16 95/16	6706 [1] 2/3	44/25 45/13 52/13 55/6 71/15 89/8
18 [1] 27/16 193 [1] 78/1	68 percent [1] 111/25 68.5 [1] 95/20	adrenaline [1] 103/16
1986 [1] 54/24	6:00 o'clock [1] 83/16	adult [1] 84/9 advantage [1] 73/12
1988 [1] 55/1	7	adverse [1] 43/25
1990 [2] 92/15 93/13 1990 s [1] 27/14	70 percent [1] 51/25	adversity [2] 43/12 44/9 adversive [4] 47/16 59/20 59/22 70/17
1995 [3] 72/11 92/1 92/7	700 [1] 1/17	advice [2] 79/8 122/18
1999 [1] 93/2	72 [2] 3/4 125/4	Advisory [1] 21/15
2	 72-hour [1] 54/9 724-6522 [1] 1/24	affect [4] 97/1 97/11 97/13 97/21 affinity [1] 43/8
20 [5] 15/24 27/16 37/25 42/5 49/5	742 [1] 55/11	affirmance [1] 55/23
20-some [1] 37/25	748 [1] 55/11 799 [2] 54/18 54/24	affirmed [2] 54/19 54/25
20001 [1] 2/4 20004 [1] 1/24	8	affixed [1] 117/25 affording [1] 4/25
20009 [1] 1/18		Africa [4] 12/2 12/5 17/24 59/9
2003 [4] 50/20 74/12 94/9 120/23 2005 [1] 11/15	8-foot [1] 48/8 801 [1] 1/23	African [1] 107/8
2005 [1] 11/13 2006 [1] 1/4	802 [2] 54/18 54/24	after [11] 14/16 36/16 37/4 46/23 47/15 47/16 70/14 71/8 83/11 92/12 124/2
2007 [2] 15/7 36/18	81 [2] 89/22 91/8	afternoon [6] 6/16 6/17 12/22 12/23 68/14
2008 [3] 11/17 15/4 15/6	823 [5] 54/20 54/25 55/23 55/24 56/2 84 [1] 91/20	71/1
2009 [1] 1/5 202 [3] 1/18 1/24 2/4	857 [3] 54/19 54/25 56/2	afterwards [1] 10/9 again [30] 4/12 4/24 7/16 14/10 19/22 22/16
204 [2] 107/21 107/22	87 [4] 8/19 8/23 62/17 92/10	28/1 31/25 35/4 41/1 43/14 44/24 45/23
210 [1] 114/18 214 [1] 87/17	88 [2] 51/21 95/20	46/15 47/21 61/12 61/14 61/17 66/20 74/1
214 [1] 8//1/ 219 [1] 55/11	9	77/17 78/24 86/11 86/18 94/3 115/3 116/21 117/15 118/20 119/2
224 [1] 93/8	97 [2] 18/20 18/23	against [3] 78/4 86/15 104/17
234 [1] 91/5 24 [2] 65/12 74/23	A	agency [1] 5/10
24 2J 6 3/12 /4/23 24-hour [1] 120/8	abilities [1] 33/15	aggressive [1] 73/11 ago [6] 8/10 28/24 42/5 42/6 100/13 110/4
2400 [1] 89/23	ability [3] 33/23 64/21 64/22	agony [1] 97/24
260 [2] 95/15 95/16 27 [1] 58/8	able [7] 18/19 32/4 81/16 81/23 112/23 113/7 113/12	agree [13] 37/17 62/25 63/16 63/19 63/20
21 [1] 30/0		

answer [38] 16/3 16/4 16/7 19/1 19/3 22/13 17/6 17/16 25/12 34/9 54/8 73/4 89/2 89/6 A 22/19 23/10 24/3 26/16 26/17 30/1 31/4 115/17 agree... [8] 91/4 94/3 95/13 102/10 114/24 39/14 39/15 40/11 65/1 65/2 67/3 68/20 74/5 as [123] 4/2 4/6 4/7 5/15 5/20 7/13 7/20 8/4 122/23 122/24 122/25 87/21 87/23 88/6 88/10 88/14 90/20 91/17 8/10 8/10 9/13 9/13 11/9 12/2 12/5 12/16 agreed [2] 90/22 125/2 95/19 95/20 95/23 95/24 107/11 107/25 15/25 16/4 17/9 17/13 30/5 30/9 30/17 30/20 agrees [1] 52/20 31/13 32/24 33/4 33/24 36/1 38/18 40/11 108/20 110/9 119/2 119/17 ahead [9] 5/2 30/15 42/17 68/17 83/4 86/15 answered [5] 23/19 30/2 31/1 78/12 111/7 42/7 43/17 44/11 44/15 44/25 45/19 45/19 106/21 106/22 124/10 antagonistic [1] 105/20 46/9 46/10 47/8 48/5 48/11 49/6 49/13 49/13 aided [1] 2/25 **antagonists** [1] 104/23 52/6 52/11 53/11 53/21 54/1 54/10 57/3 58/12 58/16 58/17 59/9 59/9 59/13 59/14 **AIDS** [1] 14/1 antagonizing [1] 105/20 **al** [**4**] 1/3 56/20 56/25 114/14 60/10 61/18 61/22 61/24 61/24 62/4 65/19 anticipate [1] 52/6 alighting [2] 69/23 70/2 65/19 66/5 66/6 66/8 68/7 70/4 72/3 73/4 Anticipating [1] 52/11 **all [68]** 4/21 5/5 5/8 6/10 7/23 8/23 9/9 15/3 any [52] 4/11 11/22 12/18 13/7 18/24 21/18 75/25 76/7 78/17 79/3 80/3 80/11 81/5 84/2 16/10 24/11 24/13 25/25 30/25 32/8 33/23 22/5 25/25 26/5 30/19 34/6 34/12 34/18 35/9 84/2 85/18 85/18 85/23 87/2 90/9 90/24 35/12 40/17 41/10 46/23 47/18 48/3 54/8 36/15 39/25 39/25 45/18 48/23 56/11 59/4 92/16 93/14 93/23 94/13 95/21 96/18 99/14 57/25 59/14 60/16 63/15 64/5 65/10 66/8 60/18 61/4 62/1 62/10 63/5 64/6 64/13 64/18 100/21 102/1 104/9 105/9 105/16 105/19 66/10 66/17 66/22 68/12 68/17 69/17 70/24 66/21 71/20 73/19 76/16 87/20 91/16 94/1 106/11 106/12 110/6 110/20 110/20 111/8 72/3 72/7 75/8 77/7 77/7 78/8 83/17 83/20 98/4 99/13 101/14 101/23 105/13 109/21 113/24 113/24 114/12 114/19 115/9 115/16 84/6 84/10 86/11 86/13 101/24 101/25 110/14 110/21 111/3 111/13 115/17 116/16 116/7 119/5 119/25 119/25 123/23 124/7 101/25 103/21 104/16 104/22 105/8 106/21 119/22 119/22 121/25 122/13 125/2 125/2 107/12 107/14 108/8 108/21 109/23 109/24 **Asia [3]** 11/25 48/2 107/8 anyone [1] 71/5 110/11 113/15 118/22 121/13 124/14 125/11 anvplace [1] 118/13 Asian [1] 49/10 **allow [13]** 10/9 29/5 30/25 32/24 34/2 52/13 anything [14] 9/6 25/17 33/3 33/22 34/11 ask [28] 5/13 22/16 23/7 23/25 26/6 28/7 55/20 56/3 111/7 112/16 113/3 115/23 42/22 44/15 45/6 52/4 58/25 69/17 82/17 30/9 30/11 30/14 31/10 32/8 33/7 37/15 115/16 115/20 40/23 50/21 56/25 77/17 80/6 90/24 91/6 **allowed [13]** 4/10 25/21 37/3 38/7 38/25 48/6 anytime [2] 15/20 67/7 98/20 111/19 114/16 119/24 121/13 122/8 57/11 61/21 66/23 67/21 81/8 81/12 118/1 anyway [1] 124/5 122/12 122/24 allowing [2] 7/22 63/21 asked [33] 9/22 11/3 14/7 14/10 15/11 15/25 anywhere [2] 57/23 58/8 alluded [1] 51/1 16/2 18/24 21/18 23/16 26/11 28/5 29/24 apart [1] 8/11 alluding [1] 75/5 apologize [6] 3/11 18/24 32/20 54/22 89/12 33/15 39/19 78/2 78/11 79/6 87/19 88/23 almost [2] 39/25 84/6 107/23 108/7 108/19 110/3 111/15 111/18 alone [1] 28/20 apparently [1] 55/5 112/14 112/21 114/11 120/25 121/2 121/8 appeal [2] 55/2 55/3 along [7] 12/10 23/8 64/16 78/2 87/19 91/6 122/21 95/17 asking [13] 18/18 33/4 33/13 77/20 77/22 appear [1] 121/18 alongs [1] 116/18 APPEARANCES [1] 1/13 86/14 97/21 97/22 102/24 107/3 107/4 107/5 already [4] 37/9 44/25 103/13 125/4 appeared [1] 55/6 111/10 **also [15]** 10/21 20/4 28/8 43/1 60/10 61/2 appellate [1] 55/22 aspect [1] 77/8 62/21 71/17 73/1 90/14 90/16 96/3 105/1 apply [5] 22/21 23/2 23/5 45/15 64/5 aspects [1] 11/21 assaultive [1] 83/20 112/1 123/22 applying [1] 23/23 although [4] 90/4 91/14 112/2 122/17 Appreciate [1] 6/14 asserted [1] 10/10 **am** [11] 6/1 21/8 21/11 21/17 31/19 31/20 approach [2] 29/16 29/23 assisted [1] 17/9 52/21 65/2 65/6 85/15 121/12 appropriate [2] 66/2 113/7 associated [1] 114/21 amazing [1] 42/15 approximately [1] 111/25 **Association [3]** 21/7 21/13 21/16 **AMERICAN [3]** 1/3 21/12 21/16 approximation [3] 113/21 113/22 114/4 assume [6] 34/12 45/15 53/25 54/10 75/8 among [5] 27/1 28/17 60/5 71/18 103/6 **Aquarium [2]** 21/12 21/16 82/24 **amount** [7] 27/17 50/10 51/13 53/4 57/19 assuming [2] 38/23 70/16 are [215] area [7] 28/10 29/18 36/9 37/6 40/21 69/10 67/4 67/6 assumption [2] 51/5 65/5 analysis [1] 94/5 assure [1] 52/23 anchor [5] 88/13 88/19 88/19 88/23 88/24 areas [3] 8/10 16/18 28/11 athletes [1] 103/17 animal [47] 7/22 8/9 11/16 12/11 14/8 15/22 aren't [8] 73/11 73/11 86/1 88/21 100/11 Atlanta [1] 49/25 28/16 28/19 29/15 31/10 31/14 32/1 33/25 100/11 117/13 117/13 atmosphere [1] 120/8 35/9 39/25 40/3 41/4 46/13 49/7 51/15 59/4 arena [5] 23/5 50/1 64/9 65/15 69/4 attend [2] 98/5 98/8 59/11 59/14 60/2 63/21 64/6 64/13 78/17 arguably [1] 101/18 attention [2] 28/12 84/12 92/17 93/15 96/8 96/9 96/13 96/13 97/9 argue [2] 74/8 102/12 attorneys [1] 32/9 97/16 100/9 101/14 101/23 102/23 104/1 **Auburn [10]** 36/9 36/24 44/24 45/4 98/10 arguing [1] 102/17 110/13 110/14 111/18 113/18 114/1 119/20 argument [2] 32/22 39/11 98/13 109/10 109/14 109/18 109/20 animal's [2] 41/6 116/12 argumentative [3] 10/21 111/6 113/14 August [1] 11/17 animals [47] 1/3 7/3 11/18 13/25 16/1 16/4 August 2008 [1] 11/17 arise [2] 73/12 78/7 **author [5]** 17/13 90/12 90/15 92/23 96/14 16/13 18/13 27/11 28/22 31/8 36/1 40/15 around [36] 37/1 40/16 41/3 41/14 43/1 48/6 42/10 43/3 47/11 48/9 49/1 49/9 49/15 50/3 51/25 59/10 59/12 59/15 59/15 61/25 64/10 author's [5] 92/14 94/3 94/4 94/7 123/8 56/20 60/20 61/18 61/21 62/15 64/2 65/15 64/11 67/25 69/3 81/8 81/10 83/14 86/23 authority [1] 5/10 66/3 66/21 69/8 77/1 77/3 77/4 79/5 96/7 87/1 87/6 87/8 88/3 88/7 88/10 101/6 106/2 authors [5] 50/19 51/7 77/5 77/16 77/22 96/8 96/12 101/13 101/24 101/25 103/7 113/19 115/8 118/16 120/5 120/5 120/14 authors' [2] 63/10 63/15 103/13 108/9 111/5 119/4 119/23 123/8 123/10 autistic [2] 78/7 78/14 animals' [1] 78/17 arrangement [1] 69/5 autistic-like [2] 78/7 78/14 ankus [25] 20/4 20/7 20/10 20/13 20/15 25/4 array [1] 30/4 Avenue [3] 1/17 1/23 2/3 34/12 34/13 82/16 82/19 85/2 85/4 85/16 arrival [1] 109/16 average [11] 44/5 44/6 49/3 49/6 49/20 51/22 85/18 99/22 100/11 100/18 101/7 101/8 arthritis [1] 17/2 57/13 57/17 57/19 65/12 96/9 106/5 106/5 106/9 107/1 107/6 107/12 article [26] 9/19 10/24 11/5 14/20 15/6 53/1 averages [2] 49/5 96/10 ankuses [2] 100/15 115/5 60/24 62/19 77/9 77/14 89/19 91/20 92/7 aversive [4] 51/5 73/23 119/5 120/8 another [13] 13/16 13/19 13/22 13/25 51/9 92/11 93/5 93/5 93/8 93/11 95/9 112/12 aware [9] 32/1 41/8 48/23 76/18 98/4 105/18 55/10 62/12 65/12 79/4 79/24 81/11 93/5 114/13 114/17 115/17 120/25 121/2 121/8 110/20 111/3 111/14

articles [14] 10/19 10/22 14/16 14/23 15/1

awareness [1] 31/12

120/14

A

away [24] 41/19 69/25 78/15 87/16 97/19 99/3 99/5 99/11 99/12 99/18 100/23 100/25 104/2 104/23 105/1 105/2 105/10 106/6 107/15 107/17 107/18 107/19 115/7 115/10 awhile [3] 106/3 114/8 123/8

baby [1] 87/20

back [55] 27/19 27/21 27/23 28/23 38/15 39/18 40/2 44/4 45/10 45/11 46/7 46/7 46/11 46/11 46/15 46/15 47/20 49/3 57/24 57/24 58/6 58/7 59/19 78/17 79/17 81/9 82/8 82/9 83/15 84/10 84/13 85/5 85/19 85/23 86/3 86/8 86/11 86/11 88/9 100/8 101/19 108/4 108/24 109/11 110/3 113/25 115/14 116/2 118/2 118/13 118/15 120/5 120/7 120/14 125/3

background [1] 11/21 **backward [2]** 40/19 117/18

backwards [6] 38/15 49/14 59/2 114/7 117/19 118/22

bad [4] 40/23 58/12 58/12 61/24

bale [1] 119/8 barn [1] 50/4

barren [1] 38/2

based [12] 11/12 11/14 27/9 27/10 33/8 59/23 66/12 66/13 68/21 99/1 112/6 112/24

basic [2] 101/24 101/24 basically [5] 60/21 60/21 62/13 93/9 93/22

basis [8] 16/25 90/9 90/25 91/16 92/4 92/21 94/1 110/12

batch [2] 83/11 119/8

be [137]

because [44] 4/2 6/2 10/3 26/3 30/2 30/10 41/14 47/2 47/3 47/5 47/7 52/14 52/17 54/8 58/11 61/23 63/20 66/20 70/8 70/10 72/23 73/8 74/11 76/9 77/25 78/9 80/1 82/20 87/7 88/18 88/23 90/13 95/7 97/5 100/7 101/3 101/4 101/8 101/19 105/3 105/22 106/7 115/20 121/15

become [4] 28/2 28/7 29/17 78/6 becomes [2] 3/17 43/25

been [47] 5/3 7/25 9/5 9/11 11/9 11/21 11/22 11/24 12/5 12/24 13/2 13/8 14/7 14/10 17/16 17/19 17/21 17/25 18/1 18/3 21/18 23/4 27/10 30/6 37/5 37/9 38/17 42/2 44/25 46/14 47/15 56/13 56/17 70/6 70/18 70/19 76/17 82/6 89/13 101/16 102/18 104/2 105/6 114/12 114/21 119/13 119/18

before [24] 1/10 3/25 8/3 9/9 9/12 9/17 12/2 29/24 31/4 36/16 39/8 44/11 50/14 62/10 83/9 112/10 116/16 120/10 120/10 124/16 125/7 125/9 125/11 125/12

began [1] 27/13

beginning [13] 15/24 15/24 18/20 23/7 23/25 62/18 78/6 87/17 91/21 91/21 93/10 114/18

behavior [120] 11/6 11/9 11/10 11/16 12/11 12/14 14/12 16/14 19/1 19/18 19/20 19/23 20/5 20/19 27/12 28/3 28/16 28/19 28/20 28/21 29/15 29/21 29/25 31/23 32/14 32/25 33/1 39/2 40/4 40/25 41/5 41/5 43/13 43/13 44/1 45/6 46/9 46/11 46/13 46/17 47/25 48/9 48/10 49/11 50/2 50/8 50/11 51/18 51/24 56/17 56/22 57/6 57/8 57/19 58/3 58/8 58/17 58/18 58/25 59/2 59/14 60/2 60/4 60/8 61/15 61/16 61/20 62/14 64/1 66/21 66/24 67/1 67/22 69/17 72/14 72/21 73/6 73/14 73/17 73/21 74/1 74/4 74/7 74/19 74/23 76/20 76/23 77/1 77/3 78/8 90/2 90/10 90/13 90/15 90/17 90/19 91/1 91/11 91/16 97/15 100/10

112/24 114/4 114/8 114/13 115/15 115/20 116/1 117/21 119/4 119/10 119/11 119/16 119/22 120/2 120/11 121/18 123/3 123/4

behavioral [9] 13/14 13/16 15/25 16/10 17/3 26/19 26/24 27/8 102/8

behaviorist [2] 100/9 102/23 behaviorists [3] 27/2 28/21 60/5 behaviors [11] 43/12 51/11 51/13 58/19

59/25 63/22 64/3 77/17 113/13 114/19 116/13

behind [6] 48/16 80/15 80/16 107/13 110/10

being [26] 14/15 15/19 18/13 31/10 32/4 33/17 34/8 35/12 35/15 35/16 35/17 38/25 39/20 39/25 47/14 51/3 61/24 73/19 73/20 76/15 83/20 90/22 96/21 101/18 104/17 106/10

believe [20] 25/16 28/1 28/6 30/18 37/21 39/6 45/10 45/15 50/20 55/8 59/6 62/18 74/6 74/8 77/20 93/1 93/16 99/25 111/13 123/3

bellies [1] 59/10 belly [1] 79/18 below [1] 91/10

bench [4] 1/10 53/5 55/8 55/16

benefit [3] 4/22 5/18 5/19

BENJAMIN [1] 3/4

besiege [1] 55/17

best [5] 5/18 5/19 57/15 120/19 120/21 better [4] 28/17 47/4 71/23 120/20

between [9] 49/5 57/23 58/8 59/24 75/20 84/15 85/22 95/1 111/4

beyond [2] 39/3 116/9

big [4] 49/22 69/10 70/5 88/21

Biobehavioral [1] 10/15

biological [1] 111/3 biology [9] 14/6 14/12 41/14 42/25 63/24

97/15 100/9 100/10 110/13

bit [10] 7/9 27/23 28/24 47/8 59/7 61/19 61/25 62/14 65/17 70/6

bite [1] 106/8

bites [2] 69/16 106/2

biting [2] 70/2 105/23

blend [1] 6/10

block [2] 4/23 104/4

blocked [1] 38/2

blockers [1] 104/4

blocks [1] 104/6

blood [4] 69/24 70/8 70/9 110/24

blow [1] 107/16

Blue [2] 38/21 101/17

blunt [1] 85/11

board [4] 51/22 57/13 83/21 84/20

boarded [1] 84/21

bob [1] 46/16

bobbing [6] 49/4 58/7 90/5 90/14 90/16 91/15

body [1] 70/11

bond [1] 85/22

bonded [1] 82/10

book [6] 9/17 10/1 10/4 14/8 15/3 15/7

books [1] 42/4

both [6] 32/19 52/19 53/2 72/2 89/14 104/24

bottom [2] 26/14 58/14

boxcar [2] 37/2 37/4

boxcars [3] 37/12 44/3 117/1

Boy [1] 120/3

brain [31] 6/21 7/11 7/11 7/13 7/19 7/19 7/21 7/24 7/24 8/8 30/4 31/15 31/18 31/21 31/21 32/1 32/2 33/25 40/6 40/14 40/16 40/18 41/3 41/6 41/12 41/16 41/20 43/7 51/2 103/25 103/25

brains [4] 6/23 9/23 11/11 30/18

106/20

capacities [5] 8/5 30/5 31/18 40/6 40/14 capacity [2] 31/22 33/9

captive [9] 11/23 19/21 19/24 19/25 25/23 68/22 68/23 78/22 79/2

captivity [16] 35/13 48/4 48/6 64/6 67/19 67/20 67/23 67/24 67/25 68/3 68/8 68/20 69/7 79/5 80/1 105/5

car [6] 38/25 39/13 39/21 40/1 43/19 109/21 care [11] 17/7 21/21 21/24 25/9 25/10 25/12

25/13 33/2 67/7 67/8 124/10 carefully [1] 12/9 carried [1] 112/9

carry [2] 33/18 110/24 carrying [1] 82/12

cars [15] 37/23 37/24 42/24 43/18 47/12 56/14 65/11 74/2 74/10 94/16 94/21 109/12 109/17 115/12 115/15

case [20] 3/13 3/19 13/10 14/17 23/7 25/20 28/2 28/18 30/20 31/5 31/7 32/10 36/5 36/8

39/7 52/12 62/16 76/13 108/25 114/5

cat [4] 16/20 28/5 28/6 28/12

category [1] 112/19

cats [11] 13/5 13/6 13/8 13/17 13/19 15/13 15/16 16/8 16/9 16/17 28/8

cause [1] 111/25

branch [2] 106/4 106/4 branches [3] 81/10 83/18 114/1 break [2] 124/16 125/2 breaking [2] 30/3 30/6 bred [2] 87/4 88/12 breed [2] 84/8 84/8 breeding [1] 25/23 breeds [2] 13/14 13/16 brief [2] 5/10 71/7 bring [7] 30/7 50/1 53/21 65/17 69/4 120/14 123/21 **bringing [2]** 9/7 9/10 broad [1] 22/22 **Brockett [3]** 72/19 73/4 73/8 Brothers [8] 65/22 67/14 68/2 98/6 113/13 113/25 114/5 119/25 **Brothers' [2]** 112/24 118/21 **brought [6]** 9/11 50/4 81/4 111/1 114/7 114/7brutally [1] 85/19 **Budgets** [1] 89/23 built [1] 120/6 **bull [25]** 20/8 20/11 31/8 32/17 33/6 33/8 33/21 70/14 70/16 70/21 82/19 99/22 101/18 104/10 104/14 105/17 106/13 106/17 107/24 108/11 108/12 108/15 110/4 110/7 115/5 bulls [1] 88/12 Bunny [1] 90/5 buzzing [1] 106/2

CA [1] 1/4

Caitlin [1] 19/4

call [17] 5/5 18/15 37/5 37/7 37/8 41/6 44/21 50/21 56/8 60/15 62/8 75/23 81/15 110/23 114/12 124/1 125/9

called [6] 9/1 9/2 40/25 62/21 90/17 99/16

calling [1] 16/24 came [1] 38/7

cameras [1] 43/16

camp [1] 83/13

campus [1] 11/7

can [128]

can't [15] 32/17 38/4 74/9 86/24 87/7 87/10 88/3 88/7 94/5 97/6 97/7 97/25 99/17 111/17 118/13 cannot [6] 18/2 58/24 63/22 63/23 63/25

clinically [1] 22/25 conflict [1] 71/21 \mathbf{C} clip [2] 98/15 98/18 confronted [2] 100/11 100/12 causes [7] 72/14 72/16 73/5 73/8 73/13 73/17 clock [1] 71/19 connected [4] 62/21 63/11 63/20 81/3 close [5] 38/8 71/22 71/25 105/2 111/1 Connecticut [1] 1/17 CEC [1] 36/21 **closed [2]** 102/19 114/22 connection [2] 36/4 36/7 center [2] 84/11 98/6 closely [1] 113/24 conservation [3] 25/22 25/24 98/7 **consider [4]** 12/11 12/13 29/24 119/12 centrally [1] 78/6 closer [3] 82/12 113/22 114/4 cerebral [2] 7/22 7/23 closest [1] 8/12 considered [1] 60/6 certain [5] 11/2 74/3 82/15 85/17 104/1 co [2] 122/12 123/24 consistent [3] 90/1 91/10 106/13 certainly [16] 34/15 48/15 48/25 52/12 52/19 consists [2] 90/13 90/14 co-counsel [2] 122/12 123/24 54/3 59/21 68/23 70/17 70/20 76/12 78/25 coated [1] 16/23 **constant [2]** 106/11 106/12 86/16 93/21 94/6 114/3 coauthor [2] 53/22 57/3 constitutes [1] 25/20 certify [1] 126/2 coauthored [3] 53/7 54/5 61/2 Constitution [1] 2/3 cetera [1] 59/23 cognition [18] 6/21 6/24 9/15 11/6 11/13 consult [1] 21/18 11/16 12/14 14/6 15/6 15/7 20/10 20/11 **chain [31]** 20/19 38/12 38/13 38/14 48/8 48/8 contact [6] 16/21 22/11 22/18 23/10 23/14 49/17 56/15 67/9 67/9 73/20 81/3 86/23 20/22 28/24 29/25 33/1 33/15 34/9 24/2 86/25 86/25 87/8 87/14 88/2 88/9 88/12 cognitive [7] 31/18 31/23 31/24 32/14 32/25 context [13] 19/13 23/16 23/18 28/19 31/18 88/13 88/19 88/23 117/15 117/17 118/12 47/10 75/12 87/18 108/9 108/17 108/18 33/23 41/5 118/14 118/16 119/1 119/6 119/6 coherent [1] 5/23 115/2 117/21 chained [44] 31/11 38/13 38/24 42/23 48/8 collaborates [1] 19/4 contexts [1] 47/13 49/2 49/2 49/6 49/13 49/21 50/12 56/21 **colleague [3]** 9/22 61/8 79/6 **CONTINUED [2]** 6/18 26/8 57/24 59/1 59/5 59/19 62/15 73/22 73/25 colleague's [1] 79/23 **Continuing** [1] 26/18 74/15 74/17 74/20 74/21 80/20 83/6 83/8 colleagues [3] 11/7 48/16 115/1 continuously [1] 46/25 83/9 86/19 113/24 116/23 117/4 117/7 COLUMBIA [1] 1/1 contribute [1] 58/19 117/10 117/17 117/20 117/24 117/24 118/4 column [1] 78/4 control [10] 78/8 81/19 81/20 81/24 82/13 118/7 118/19 118/21 118/24 118/25 119/13 come [11] 4/11 16/17 18/4 34/3 36/2 53/19 84/15 84/18 84/19 85/16 119/20 **chaining [24]** 31/3 31/7 31/9 39/12 39/13 83/15 86/3 89/14 123/6 124/4 controlled [3] 78/7 82/3 84/14 48/21 48/22 50/10 58/16 59/25 72/14 73/5 comes [1] 101/1 controlling [1] 82/1 comfort [1] 64/1 73/8 73/13 73/17 74/6 75/1 75/9 75/15 93/12 conversation [3] 15/18 76/7 77/10 93/20 117/5 118/20 119/5 comfortable [1] 97/7 convincing [1] 42/14 chains [12] 20/22 20/25 21/3 37/6 57/11 **coming [4]** 6/4 9/8 14/8 45/16 Corp [1] 55/10 80/25 86/20 87/9 88/20 88/24 105/17 105/25 commands [4] 84/23 85/22 85/24 86/12 correct [96] 6/24 6/25 13/3 13/11 13/14 chance [2] 3/22 4/14 comment [2] 87/22 97/22 13/15 13/17 13/20 14/1 14/4 14/14 14/24 change [1] 48/17 15/13 15/17 16/1 17/11 17/17 18/7 19/15 comments [1] 74/2 changed [1] 100/21 **Commission** [1] 55/11 19/18 19/21 19/24 20/10 20/13 20/16 21/1 changes [1] 78/8 common [2] 24/9 40/12 21/4 21/10 21/13 21/25 22/3 22/6 22/12 **chapter [6]** 9/16 9/20 9/25 14/8 15/4 15/8 22/18 23/15 24/16 24/18 25/4 26/14 27/14 communicate [1] 43/3 charging [2] 35/22 86/15 communication [3] 12/4 17/11 19/5 31/19 31/20 32/16 37/21 39/23 40/12 48/1 chart [6] 38/18 38/21 44/13 123/25 124/5 community [1] 60/2 64/7 65/2 65/6 67/12 68/4 72/21 73/2 73/6 124/9 companion [1] 13/25 73/17 74/13 74/17 75/6 76/21 76/24 77/14 charts [2] 4/5 4/10 comparable [1] 91/24 78/23 79/2 81/1 85/15 89/4 89/20 92/5 92/8 chase [2] 99/18 99/19 compare [2] 7/2 49/18 93/2 93/3 93/6 94/9 94/11 95/12 96/17 97/1 chemosensory [1] 8/15 compared [3] 7/19 50/4 56/20 97/4 97/11 97/13 98/7 98/10 98/16 107/1 Chicago [1] 120/1 comparisons [1] 49/14 107/25 109/8 109/12 109/15 109/18 109/21 chief [1] 3/13 compensated [3] 35/15 35/16 35/17 117/10 117/25 120/25 121/22 126/3 **complement** [1] 29/22 **chimpanzee [5]** 7/13 7/20 7/24 40/1 103/3 correctly [32] 15/8 17/4 19/11 23/11 24/4 chimpanzees [1] 27/6 50/14 58/21 58/22 64/20 74/5 75/4 78/11 complementary [1] 29/20 choose [1] 63/25 complete [4] 10/4 15/10 26/12 62/2 78/18 88/17 88/25 90/7 90/8 91/18 91/19 circle [1] 81/4 completed [3] 17/16 17/21 90/20 92/2 92/19 92/20 93/18 93/25 95/1 95/3 96/1 Circuit [3] 54/19 54/25 55/13 comport [1] 58/23 105/25 108/2 116/24 121/19 121/20 circumstance [1] 57/17 computer [1] 2/25 correlate [1] 73/24 circumstances [7] 52/8 61/11 67/19 68/3 computer-aided [1] 2/25 correlates [1] 7/8 68/9 68/10 78/10 concentrated [1] 8/1 cortex [2] 7/22 7/23 circus [21] 36/9 48/11 50/16 51/8 64/14 concern [2] 40/15 57/9 cost [1] 120/18 could [53] 5/21 7/6 7/7 7/15 16/10 22/15 26/2 64/23 65/11 65/14 65/20 69/8 69/12 69/13 concerned [2] 54/6 61/15 82/14 84/4 92/13 92/16 93/14 103/3 105/24 concerns [2] 68/22 68/24 37/15 37/23 38/7 40/23 42/7 42/7 42/9 43/11 113/13 119/25 conclusion [4] 93/9 94/3 94/4 110/16 44/21 48/12 56/22 59/7 65/16 65/16 65/17 circuses [6] 64/12 66/10 81/23 91/25 105/5 65/20 69/7 69/10 69/23 72/16 74/8 75/1 conclusions [3] 52/15 92/15 93/13 75/14 75/15 75/23 75/23 76/8 78/4 79/8 82/2 105/16 concurs [2] 92/14 93/12 condition [4] 49/21 49/21 51/4 66/15 citation [4] 54/21 55/10 55/22 55/25 85/13 89/8 94/13 97/3 97/5 98/2 98/2 98/3 citations [1] 114/20 conditioning [1] 27/2 102/5 102/10 119/25 120/9 120/9 120/16 cite [2] 8/20 89/7 conditions [12] 39/21 56/16 56/23 63/14 64/4 122/13 122/17 cited [7] 17/19 72/23 73/1 77/14 89/20 93/6 64/24 67/5 67/13 76/24 77/5 112/22 115/21 counsel [27] 5/15 6/6 26/11 32/22 34/3 35/6 94/11 39/4 45/20 53/13 71/9 72/11 72/13 76/20 **conduct** [2] 24/21 53/16 citing [1] 55/4 conducted [4] 16/1 18/5 18/24 25/13 78/22 86/14 89/3 92/8 94/9 109/24 113/6 clarification [1] 54/12 conducting [2] 16/19 27/20 121/5 122/12 122/21 123/14 123/24 123/24 clarify [1] 19/3 conference [1] 11/18 125/10 counted [3] 8/19 104/17 106/22 clear [7] 4/24 9/9 18/19 68/20 88/21 123/17 conferences [2] 11/12 29/21 confident [1] 52/21 countries [5] 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19 80/22 clearly [3] 53/19 94/7 124/24 confined [2] 31/11 69/11 country [1] 62/12 client [2] 16/21 16/23 confinement [10] 31/7 31/9 32/4 32/4 39/5 couple [4] 8/18 10/2 12/8 102/18 clients [1] 16/19 48/14 48/20 65/23 77/6 116/1 course [7] 23/3 34/25 43/9 43/24 47/19 81/21 clinical [1] 16/15 confining [1] 31/13 92/24

description [1] 7/9 70/1 70/3 70/10 72/13 72/15 81/20 84/14 C design [2] 15/20 17/2 85/3 86/9 court [26] 1/1 2/2 2/2 15/7 26/2 29/4 30/13 doesn't [6] 61/22 74/16 76/2 97/16 100/7 desirable [1] 118/2 34/3 34/5 34/17 35/1 39/8 53/20 53/21 54/17 details [2] 8/13 8/13 55/4 55/6 55/13 55/17 72/5 96/3 98/6 102/15 dog [7] 28/12 40/1 59/19 59/20 99/20 103/1 detecting [1] 97/9 121/12 125/12 125/15 determine [3] 96/25 101/10 120/9 103/2 dogs [11] 13/5 13/6 13/8 13/14 13/23 14/20 Courthouse [1] 2/3 develop [1] 22/14 courtroom [2] 32/9 32/12 **developed** [8] 22/10 22/16 23/9 23/13 24/1 22/25 27/6 28/8 59/22 122/16 coverage [1] 15/10 28/11 33/9 104/5 doing [19] 12/3 14/14 43/13 46/8 46/24 development [4] 33/10 51/2 51/2 58/20 credit [1] 113/7 46/24 47/1 47/5 47/8 47/12 47/25 57/24 66/9 develops [1] 119/4 critical [3] 94/15 95/4 95/7 69/22 73/12 85/20 85/25 95/20 125/6 cross [7] 3/2 34/16 34/17 34/25 71/1 72/8 diagnosed [2] 22/5 25/11 **Dolcin** [1] 55/10 dollars [1] 35/22 dialects [2] 8/13 43/4 cross-examination [5] 34/16 34/17 34/25 did [71] 8/23 10/9 10/10 11/5 11/9 13/23 domain [2] 8/15 31/13 71/1 72/8 15/8 16/3 17/4 19/11 19/12 23/11 23/13 24/4 domains [1] 7/23 don't [77] 4/19 6/9 9/5 17/18 18/17 24/13 CRUELTY [1] 1/3 26/24 29/25 32/18 36/4 36/7 36/9 36/11 CRYSTAL [2] 1/15 1/16 36/12 36/13 36/14 36/21 36/23 36/25 48/8 24/22 30/9 34/10 34/13 36/15 36/16 39/6 current [5] 13/13 14/3 14/5 77/18 78/9 48/20 51/8 51/12 55/4 57/12 58/21 72/11 39/10 42/17 43/10 44/15 45/15 52/14 53/19 **curtail [1]** 68/13 54/4 54/13 55/8 55/12 57/20 58/11 61/6 72/25 76/4 76/4 78/11 78/11 78/18 78/19 curve [1] 82/25 79/20 88/17 88/25 89/1 90/7 91/18 92/2 61/10 61/23 62/12 64/1 64/16 65/7 67/25 curved [1] 85/13 92/19 93/1 93/18 95/1 96/1 96/5 98/5 98/8 68/17 71/3 71/21 73/10 73/13 73/19 75/12 **customarily [2]** 75/9 87/3 99/9 106/19 107/2 108/2 108/3 108/25 115/6 75/21 75/24 79/3 80/5 80/7 84/5 84/8 84/21 cutting [2] 3/12 86/14 116/5 116/23 121/18 121/18 122/23 123/10 88/15 88/19 89/7 92/25 97/6 97/23 99/1 123/10 99/25 100/3 100/4 101/8 103/19 105/3 D didn't [19] 13/8 32/22 42/11 42/12 53/15 105/15 105/21 105/24 110/21 110/22 110/22 **D.C** [4] 54/19 54/24 54/25 55/13 53/16 55/22 64/19 72/24 73/15 87/23 93/24 115/13 118/23 119/11 121/8 122/9 122/24 data [17] 19/15 27/22 38/20 51/17 56/16 108/25 109/8 123/5 123/5 123/5 123/6 122/25 124/23 125/9 57/12 57/13 57/16 61/18 74/11 76/3 76/11 **done [16]** 12/4 23/21 24/19 30/2 30/6 34/12 124/19 95/8 95/21 111/24 115/17 123/6 diet [2] 22/2 25/10 34/13 41/1 48/15 61/16 62/11 75/9 94/5 94/5 Daubert [3] 25/8 29/1 30/11 difference [1] 75/20 98/2 119/18 Davis [2] 9/22 11/7 differences [4] 107/25 108/18 108/19 111/3 doubt [2] 34/21 72/1 day [26] 5/14 24/25 24/25 33/16 40/17 41/10 down [12] 58/9 61/23 78/4 86/10 86/25 88/3 different [25] 8/14 8/19 13/16 23/21 47/13 48/7 59/9 59/11 59/14 65/14 73/20 80/2 81/2 49/9 49/9 61/8 67/10 87/22 87/24 88/24 88/11 88/14 88/22 91/21 124/18 124/22 81/5 81/7 83/9 84/21 86/19 87/25 113/23 96/11 106/25 106/25 107/5 107/6 107/7 Dr [95] 5/7 6/16 9/25 13/13 14/19 15/6 15/23 116/23 117/4 117/8 118/19 119/1 107/9 107/23 107/24 111/9 111/13 118/17 17/4 17/6 18/1 18/5 18/23 19/17 20/3 20/18 day-to-day [1] 24/25 119/9 21/21 23/24 24/10 24/16 24/25 25/7 26/3 days [1] 40/2 differently [5] 95/23 108/7 108/10 108/13 26/11 27/9 29/2 33/24 35/9 44/10 45/2 46/4 DC [4] 1/4 1/18 1/24 2/4 108/22 47/23 53/15 56/11 57/3 58/15 60/18 61/2 deal [3] 6/3 47/17 113/11 difficult [3] 96/24 103/21 103/23 69/16 72/10 72/18 73/1 73/16 74/5 74/12 dealing [2] 27/24 97/15 dire [4] 12/18 12/20 25/7 32/7 75/4 75/13 76/4 76/15 76/19 78/20 78/21 deals [2] 19/6 98/4 direct [11] 3/2 6/18 20/17 26/8 35/7 45/21 80/8 83/6 86/18 87/9 87/19 88/25 89/2 89/3 dealt [1] 43/18 68/18 72/10 76/20 82/13 89/11 89/19 89/19 90/1 90/20 90/24 91/5 91/22 decades [1] 42/15 92/4 92/10 93/1 93/11 94/8 94/15 94/20 directly [1] 98/9 decides [1] 11/1 dirt [1] 118/16 95/11 95/17 96/3 96/19 98/5 106/24 107/23 decision [1] 55/22 disagree [9] 90/9 90/25 91/3 91/16 92/4 108/4 108/24 110/3 114/25 116/21 118/4 decrease [1] 112/1 92/21 92/25 94/1 121/21 118/18 119/13 120/23 121/7 121/10 121/15 **defendant [3]** 1/7 122/22 123/22 disagreed [1] 122/22 121/21 121/21 124/21 defendant's [1] 53/8 disappear [1] 61/22 Dr. [5] 12/16 12/22 12/24 23/6 53/21 Defendants [1] 1/20 discomfort [1] 33/11 Dr. Friend's [1] 53/21 defense [2] 5/15 26/11 Dr. Hart [4] 12/16 12/22 12/24 23/6 discrete [1] 55/16 defer [1] 42/19 discuss [4] 11/5 26/7 71/5 93/1 drag [3] 86/20 87/1 87/1 discussed [19] 7/1 11/19 29/3 30/17 38/19 **defined** [1] 114/19 dragging [1] 87/8 definite [1] 88/22 72/10 72/18 73/2 76/19 78/1 78/21 78/25 drawing [2] 7/14 52/15 definitely [2] 113/1 113/4 dried [1] 42/8 89/2 89/11 89/13 92/8 94/8 115/18 124/1 **definition [2]** 18/9 87/15 discussing [3] 56/13 76/17 106/25 driving [1] 105/2 definitive [1] 10/5 discussion [7] 3/21 15/9 36/3 76/9 90/12 drug [4] 16/16 16/22 16/23 16/24 **drugs** [3] 16/4 16/12 17/2 **due** [2] 5/10 5/14 degraded [1] 43/5 92/23 125/1 degree [6] 51/2 66/25 69/8 73/25 97/24 disease [2] 22/5 25/11 119/10 display [1] 89/8 during [22] 34/15 34/16 48/7 69/2 72/10 **DELCIANNA** [2] 1/16 123/20 displayed [4] 90/4 90/5 91/14 91/15 76/20 79/21 81/4 83/8 83/9 86/19 87/24 90/3 **depend [4]** 70/1 70/3 108/14 108/15 91/12 91/24 94/13 94/14 103/11 104/22 displaying [1] 97/4 **depends** [8] 18/16 61/7 61/10 87/15 108/16 disruption [1] 64/2 106/18 121/17 125/2 117/21 119/3 119/3 **distance** [2] 87/13 87/13 duty [1] 36/2 depict [1] 7/17 distant [1] 8/9 E deposition [30] 4/17 5/3 14/20 15/12 15/15 distractor [1] 47/9 15/24 18/20 23/7 23/24 26/11 36/16 50/21 each [6] 27/21 46/13 72/7 96/10 96/12 **DISTRICT [5]** 1/1 1/1 1/11 54/24 55/5 56/24 56/25 60/23 72/18 75/14 76/5 78/1 disturbed [1] 105/23 104/25 87/17 89/6 91/5 93/4 94/13 94/14 95/5 95/15 diverse [1] 9/7 ear [2] 107/13 110/10 96/3 107/21 108/10 do [148] earlier [17] 4/18 7/9 7/10 27/13 47/23 52/11 derive [1] 4/22 doctor [9] 26/6 32/23 35/5 71/3 77/16 79/10 78/23 78/25 92/8 94/9 96/20 98/16 109/12 describe [6] 7/7 37/23 38/12 46/9 58/1 123/5 121/13 123/16 124/22 124/1 124/18 124/24 125/2 **described [4]** 46/10 113/11 118/9 118/10 early [1] 27/14 does [23] 7/16 8/20 9/3 28/8 33/16 40/15

42/21 45/6 53/1 58/23 61/12 67/3 67/6 69/16

ears [1] 80/16

describing [2] 45/7 112/23

E	entitled [1] 34/6	99/2
	entomologists [1] 70/4	experts [3] 11/6 52/20 53/22
easier [1] 87/5 easily [1] 84/2	enunciated [1] 39/5 environment [1] 64/24	explain [4] 26/2 52/7 72/17 123/11 explained [2] 90/15 96/18
easy [2] 101/10 101/11	equivalent [1] 82/17	explaining [1] 7/20
eat [4] 13/23 14/20 47/19 119/8	escape [1] 97/19	explanation [1] 102/8
eaten [1] 46/23	especially [4] 28/25 40/5 43/9 110/15	exposed [1] 28/16
eating [3] 13/19 46/19 114/1 eco [2] 83/21 84/12	ESQUIRE [9] 1/14 1/15 1/15 1/16 1/20 1/20 1/21 1/21 1/22	exposure [1] 33/11 expressing [1] 65/7
ecological [2] 41/6 41/13	essential [1] 124/8	expressions [5] 97/6 97/23 98/1 98/21 98/22
ecotourism [5] 78/21 79/1 79/4 80/3 80/6	establish [2] 34/10 76/16	extensive [1] 15/9
ecotourists [1] 80/7 editor [3] 9/22 10/25 11/1	established [1] 9/11	extent [3] 10/8 31/22 85/17
effect [3] 39/2 39/20 42/22	et [5] 1/3 56/20 56/25 59/23 114/14 Etosha [1] 17/24	extremely [1] 4/4 eyes [1] 102/19
effects [5] 20/4 20/9 20/12 20/22 79/7	European [1] 91/25	F
effort [3] 34/16 34/17 104/23	euthanized [1] 22/8	
Egyptians [1] 100/16 eight [5] 44/4 74/21 74/24 74/24 75/10	even [13] 33/11 43/5 50/2 69/2 70/14 76/23 77/4 90/3 91/12 93/10 93/11 117/12 120/11	F.2d [5] 54/19 54/25 55/11 55/24 56/2 F.Supp [2] 54/18 54/24
either [5] 11/23 16/23 58/11 81/5 105/25	evening [8] 81/7 81/10 83/16 122/6 124/14	face [1] 108/12
elaborate [1] 108/5	124/23 125/8 125/14	facial [6] 97/5 97/16 97/23 98/1 98/21 98/21
elephant [124] 7/19 7/21 8/4 9/14 11/5 11/8 11/13 12/13 14/6 14/6 14/12 18/7 20/5 20/10	event [1] 26/5	facilitate [1] 41/17 facilitates [1] 43/7
20/13 20/16 20/19 20/21 21/1 21/4 21/6 21/9	ever [2] 100/11 103/1 every [2] 51/24 104/13	facility [2] 36/21 98/8
21/15 22/8 22/11 22/17 23/8 23/10 23/14	everybody [1] 52/20	fact [10] 27/5 40/15 47/8 54/16 61/4 69/22
23/20 24/2 24/6 24/16 24/18 25/1 25/3 25/10	everyone [3] 56/4 125/10 125/14	70/15 73/22 87/3 123/7
25/10 25/11 25/22 25/24 26/14 28/3 28/20 28/20 28/24 29/25 30/18 31/21 32/14 32/25	everything [2] 59/21 125/4 evidence [7] 4/7 4/8 4/18 5/4 37/10 52/14	factors [2] 8/16 60/8 fair [7] 3/19 4/12 4/13 103/22 104/7 125/8
33/17 33/23 34/8 39/2 40/6 41/18 41/23 45/8	71/11	125/14
45/9 46/19 46/20 51/1 51/15 51/24 59/14	evokes [1] 60/8	fairly [3] 71/20 77/5 106/12
64/9 64/23 69/20 69/24 70/13 70/16 70/18 74/15 74/16 74/18 80/12 80/17 80/17 81/4	evolution [2] 9/20 100/20	falls [1] 112/18
81/10 81/17 81/19 81/20 81/25 84/3 84/13	evolved [2] 100/14 100/22 exact [1] 77/24	familiar [6] 23/17 28/2 45/3 67/16 113/19 118/20
84/16 84/18 84/19 84/22 85/23 86/8 86/9	exactly [6] 18/3 26/3 36/14 53/6 57/20 69/14	familiarity [1] 68/5
87/20 88/8 88/14 96/25 97/3 97/7 98/5 98/7	exaggeration [1] 103/5	family [5] 42/8 43/3 43/4 43/7 113/19
98/21 100/10 100/20 103/4 104/9 104/11 104/14 106/10 106/11 106/13 108/12 108/25	exam [1] 16/21 examination [17] 6/18 12/20 26/8 34/16	fantastic [1] 5/22 far [7] 9/13 85/18 87/7 87/10 87/12 88/7
109/2 109/4 109/6 109/8 110/23 115/7	34/17 34/25 35/7 67/8 71/1 72/8 72/10 76/20	110/20
118/25 119/13 119/14 119/15	89/11 93/20 110/1 116/19 122/19	farms [2] 92/18 93/17
elephant's [12] 7/10 31/18 38/1 38/13 40/13 40/16 41/3 79/17 80/15 88/10 120/19 120/21	example [15] 14/7 14/19 15/11 16/5 38/22 42/6 44/12 67/17 68/25 69/1 70/5 79/5	fast [2] 8/2 87/7 February [1] 1/5
elephants [208]	101/14 107/13 108/8	fed [3] 40/3 47/14 47/18
elephants' [4] 30/3 33/10 69/18 107/23	examples [2] 112/9 117/11	Federal [1] 55/11
elicit [1] 33/5 elicited [1] 78/10	excel [1] 8/7	feed [1] 59/12 feedback [1] 9/24
eliciting [2] 112/1 112/11	except [3] 9/16 18/6 25/14 exception [4] 54/13 54/14 54/15 55/7	feeding [1] 82/12
elimination [1] 58/10	exceptions [1] 112/3	feel [6] 35/23 36/2 39/20 70/9 82/13 103/20
else [5] 30/7 66/10 75/19 95/8 118/13	excuse [1] 116/17	feeling [1] 101/24
emanate [1] 99/14 EMMET [1] 1/10	exhibit [22] 29/7 37/8 37/10 37/11 38/18 44/21 44/25 52/6 56/8 56/24 58/24 60/11	feelings [1] 65/8 feels [1] 97/10
emotion [2] 101/24 103/19	60/15 60/24 60/24 62/3 62/8 71/11 89/6 93/4	feet [9] 19/8 37/25 37/25 38/14 80/15 80/18
emotionally [1] 103/14	94/14 115/16	81/17 81/17 87/1
emotions [2] 20/16 21/4 empirical [10] 14/14 18/5 18/10 18/14 18/14	exhibits [3] 124/19 124/25 125/13 exist [1] 112/3	FEI [1] 109/21 FEI 's [3] 25/18 25/19 25/23
18/16 18/25 19/13 25/13 29/15	existing [1] 34/9	FELD [1] 1/6
encourage [1] 71/17	exists [4] 66/5 66/6 66/8 111/24	female [1] 42/6
end [11] 8/17 8/20 25/6 77/7 85/9 85/11 85/13 91/12 91/15 110/7 116/3	exited [1] 37/4 exits [1] 32/12	females [7] 43/9 83/24 84/2 84/6 84/6 87/3 88/11
energy [2] 19/7 19/7	expect [7] 40/3 40/4 40/4 101/23 107/24	few [3] 16/13 26/7 32/9
engage [10] 47/16 49/11 61/19 63/21 66/21	108/17 108/20	fibers [1] 110/25
66/24 67/22 112/23 113/12 114/1	expected [1] 28/12	field [22] 11/20 14/5 14/15 18/13 19/14 19/15 26/21 27/14 28/14 28/15 29/16 29/16 29/19
engaged [2] 51/24 121/16 engagement [1] 116/13	expecting [1] 65/19 experience [9] 78/17 92/14 93/12 97/18	29/19 29/22 30/7 41/4 42/3 60/6 61/24
engages [1] 9/14	103/10 104/9 104/11 110/8 111/5	119/14 120/14
engaging [3] 113/19 114/3 123/11	experienced [1] 19/25	fight [7] 103/6 103/7 103/14 103/15 104/22
Enjoy [1] 124/22 enormous [1] 53/4	experiences [1] 104/14 experiencing [6] 96/25 97/3 97/8 110/11	104/25 117/13 fighting [5] 103/13 103/19 104/18 105/9
enough [8] 4/23 4/23 44/3 72/4 87/12 87/15	110/16 115/19	105/11
88/14 88/22	experiments [1] 24/20	fights [1] 103/11
entail [1] 36/25 entailed [1] 37/1	expert [18] 12/11 12/13 12/17 13/2 24/6 24/7 26/13 29/17 29/25 32/14 32/24 33/19 39/4	figure [9] 7/6 7/7 7/16 7/16 7/18 43/5 43/6 74/21 102/14
entaned [1] 3//1 entertain [1] 39/11	40/11 53/8 53/10 53/17 68/7	figures [1] 75/21
ENTERTAINMENT [1] 1/6	expertise [13] 22/10 22/17 23/9 23/13 23/20	file [4] 6/5 6/6 6/7 6/9
entities [1] 21/19	23/22 24/1 28/11 30/12 30/17 40/20 40/21	filed [1] 39/7

F	frequent [1] 50/13	58/11 65/19 72/1 77/5 86/24 99/8 110/10
	Friday [6] 5/17 5/20 5/22 6/3 6/12 6/13	120/13 122/4
fill [1] 16/25 film [4] 98/15 98/18 101/16 102/18	Friend [18] 50/20 56/19 57/3 60/20 61/2 73/1 74/13 89/3 89/19 90/20 93/2 94/9 94/15	got [19] 16/20 28/19 46/7 49/9 57/13 70/5 71/23 74/11 77/4 81/9 82/7 82/25 85/22 96/7
final [4] 15/4 29/2 122/13 122/13	114/13 114/25 120/11 120/23 122/23	96/8 96/11 106/6 119/6 124/20
find [11] 41/15 50/6 50/7 51/6 61/18 75/11	Friend's [5] 53/21 74/12 94/20 95/11 121/21	gotten [1] 86/7
87/6 88/7 106/4 115/25 124/17	front [10] 14/18 38/14 59/19 86/9 86/10 89/8	graduate [4] 12/2 17/10 19/4 61/7
fine [14] 4/9 4/19 5/5 5/12 5/17 5/20 5/24 6/7 6/7 6/12 8/2 16/6 45/22 117/12	89/24 106/11 108/11 108/12 fruits [2] 41/7 41/8	grained [1] 8/2 grass [4] 13/19 13/23 14/21 41/16
fine-grained [1] 8/2	Fulbright [1] 1/22	gratuitous [1] 41/23
finish [4] 68/18 70/25 83/11 87/21	full [4] 59/10 62/20 70/8 114/16	greatly [1] 58/18
finished [2] 6/20 46/23	fully [2] 52/21 52/25	grimace [2] 97/6 97/17
fireplace [1] 83/2 first [22] 13/10 34/23 37/10 50/4 52/9 58/14	function [3] 46/12 51/3 114/20 functionless [1] 46/12	ground [3] 19/9 30/3 30/6 ground-breaking [2] 30/3 30/6
61/5 61/7 61/10 62/19 79/9 79/22 83/11	further [7] 25/25 32/7 70/22 116/14 121/24	grounds [1] 54/25
91/15 91/22 94/14 95/1 108/20 110/9 111/20	124/12 124/13	group [9] 16/16 16/16 21/16 42/10 43/9
114/16 120/24 5.131 6/24 102/15	future [1] 14/10	57/10 60/20 61/18 64/2
fit [2] 6/24 102/15 five [9] 44/5 51/23 68/16 81/8 83/12 91/25	\mathbf{G}	groups [2] 43/3 113/20 Gruber [3] 56/20 56/25 114/13
96/8 96/10 96/12	gather [1] 88/5	guarantees [1] 84/7
flies [8] 69/23 69/25 70/5 70/6 101/4 101/6	gathering [2] 19/15 83/15	guess [4] 4/15 36/17 64/19 71/20
101/7 106/2 flinch [3] 102/1 110/15 115/10	gathers [1] 81/9 gave [4] 14/19 42/6 104/17 108/19	guide [7] 25/3 25/18 80/12 80/16 81/13 81/1
flinched [1] 115/7	geared [2] 41/10 63/24	81/16
Florida [1] 36/22	general [13] 17/23 23/2 23/20 24/14 25/22	Н
fluoxetine [1] 16/13	27/11 28/22 47/10 54/14 60/6 77/1 101/13	habit [2] 76/23 78/7
fly [18] 15/5 18/6 19/1 25/14 25/17 33/9 33/11 69/16 69/23 69/25 70/1 70/4 70/10	110/14 generalizations [1] 101/13	habit-like [2] 76/23 78/7 habitat [1] 78/14
79/9 105/10 105/23 106/1 106/8	generally [2] 48/13 49/12	had [31] 3/23 3/25 7/10 9/16 15/16 17/21
focus [2] 53/1 60/4	get [37] 5/19 6/5 6/11 10/19 11/3 26/4 27/22	29/2 29/3 33/15 33/16 37/5 39/19 45/12
focused [1] 31/21	28/16 39/1 41/9 52/7 55/12 55/22 65/16	46/23 48/4 48/7 51/23 55/6 65/14 70/19
focuses [1] 57/7 focusing [1] 68/2	80/17 84/22 86/3 86/6 86/7 86/10 87/4 88/8 88/12 91/7 96/9 97/19 99/9 104/2 106/3	71/10 78/6 78/21 89/11 89/13 112/14 115/4 115/14 122/13 123/6 125/1
follow [9] 13/22 26/1 78/2 87/19 91/6 95/17	106/6 117/14 119/7 120/4 120/7 120/13	hadn't [1] 47/24
106/24 116/18 124/21	124/10 125/3	half [5] 28/14 58/9 74/25 90/6 91/23
follow-alongs [1] 116/18	gets [1] 59/8	hand [7] 2/2 70/8 85/6 85/10 106/12 126/2
follow-up [2] 13/22 26/1 following [2] 38/24 93/21	getting [4] 10/22 30/12 69/25 84/10 give [22] 3/22 4/11 4/14 8/9 9/24 9/25 16/5	126/9 handled [1] 25/3
follows [1] 93/19	22/19 28/12 52/2 65/2 67/7 74/20 75/7 78/14	handler [1] 99/21
food [10] 58/17 59/8 59/16 59/17 63/24 81/4	86/6 94/6 99/11 107/11 118/15 118/15 125/3	hands [1] 102/19
83/18 87/25 114/2 120/6	given [9] 16/4 40/5 40/5 40/13 69/6 69/7 82/9 83/18 125/4	happened [3] 42/5 42/9 108/16
foot [30] 21/24 25/10 38/14 40/19 40/19 48/8 49/14 49/14 59/1 59/1 81/2 81/3 85/22 88/2	gives [2] 15/20 35/1	happening [1] 66/16 happy [9] 4/25 37/18 42/19 46/19 47/2 47/5
88/2 114/6 114/7 116/2 117/18 117/18 118/1	giving [8] 7/9 34/5 86/4 102/15 107/13 108/8	47/7 55/18 121/12
118/1 118/13 118/13 118/15 118/15 118/22	115/1 117/18	hard [8] 8/8 10/19 38/4 40/16 41/3 41/16
118/22 119/5 119/6	glad [1] 124/7	104/1 110/10 hard-wired [3] 40/16 41/3 41/16
footage [2] 101/17 102/18 Footnote [2] 54/18 54/24	Glitzenstein [1] 1/16 globally [1] 7/21	harder [1] 103/15
forage [9] 8/10 41/7 41/10 41/11 41/15 41/18	go [41] 5/2 8/17 10/1 11/1 30/15 36/4 36/7	harm [1] 3/18
43/1 81/8 83/11	36/21 40/16 42/12 42/17 43/19 44/21 44/23	harmful [1] 40/8
foraging [7] 40/17 41/9 58/17 59/17 83/15 113/23 113/23	49/22 64/16 68/17 69/3 80/17 81/12 83/4 84/12 84/13 85/5 86/3 86/7 86/15 86/24 87/5	harmfulness [1] 32/3 harming [1] 67/2
foregoing [1] 126/3	87/10 88/7 91/20 100/8 103/13 104/25	HART [89] 3/4 5/7 6/16 9/25 12/16 12/22
forest [2] 81/12 83/11	106/21 106/22 118/13 120/14 124/10 125/11	12/24 13/13 14/19 15/6 15/23 17/4 17/6 18/1
forgot [1] 36/16	goal [2] 25/24 114/20	18/5 18/23 19/4 19/17 20/4 20/18 21/21 23/6
form [1] 16/25 forth [17] 36/2 44/4 45/10 46/7 46/7 46/11	goats [3] 13/6 13/9 23/1 goes [11] 7/25 49/24 51/20 51/21 58/8 61/22	23/13 23/24 24/10 24/16 24/25 26/3 26/11 27/9 33/24 35/9 44/10 45/2 46/4 47/23 53/15
46/11 46/15 46/16 47/20 49/3 57/24 57/24	85/18 88/10 103/18 116/9 117/25	56/11 58/15 60/18 69/16 72/10 72/18 73/16
58/6 58/7 113/20 113/25	going [83] 3/17 5/13 6/1 6/4 6/5 8/9 10/1 11/1	74/5 75/4 75/13 76/4 76/15 76/19 78/20
forward [13] 34/3 38/15 40/2 40/19 49/14	12/10 26/4 26/6 27/23 28/23 29/20 30/11	78/21 80/8 83/6 86/18 87/9 87/19 88/25 89/2
59/1 80/17 82/9 114/6 116/2 118/1 118/13 118/22	30/14 31/15 32/1 32/2 32/21 33/14 33/25 37/3 38/8 39/11 41/8 41/19 43/24 47/17	89/6 89/19 90/1 90/24 91/5 91/22 92/4 92/10 93/1 93/4 93/11 94/8 95/17 96/3 96/19 98/5
forwards [2] 117/18 117/19	47/19 47/19 49/20 50/6 50/7 50/12 51/5	106/24 107/23 108/4 108/24 110/3 116/21
found [8] 7/25 16/13 16/13 56/12 60/21	52/19 53/8 53/10 53/25 55/17 58/12 59/13	118/4 118/18 119/13 120/23 121/7 121/10
60/21 62/14 124/5 Foundation [1] 21/10	65/10 65/12 67/7 67/8 68/13 73/21 74/9 74/18 74/20 74/20 74/21 74/23 75/8 76/1	121/15 124/21 Hart's [2] 25/7 29/2
four [6] 9/21 14/23 15/3 38/1 38/2 106/2	76/8 78/17 83/9 85/12 85/14 86/1 87/12	has [32] 9/5 11/9 12/2 17/19 17/24 18/1 18/3
four-volume [1] 9/21	87/18 89/22 102/12 103/23 103/24 107/22	25/9 25/10 25/11 25/12 31/21 31/24 33/24
frank [1] 53/18	108/4 108/10 108/24 110/3 113/20 115/14	38/17 44/25 45/14 46/12 46/13 46/13 46/22
frankly [2] 34/10 55/19 free [6] 22/11 22/17 23/10 28/13 50/13 88/1	117/13 117/13 124/4 124/17 124/21 125/3 125/5	57/22 63/7 81/11 82/23 90/15 92/24 94/5 119/13 122/9 123/22 123/24
freedom [2] 69/2 81/11	gone [4] 15/1 27/19 47/7 47/20	hasn't [3] 30/6 30/10 100/21
frequency [2] 51/10 51/12	good [15] 6/16 6/17 12/22 12/23 40/24 40/24	haul [1] 65/11
I		

H	123/13 123/15 124/16 125/1	identify [1] 6/22
	HONORABLE [1] 1/10	imagine [3] 39/25 51/1 102/2
haute [2] 79/12 79/14 have [194]	hook [22] 20/8 31/8 33/6 33/8 33/21 70/14 70/16 70/21 82/16 82/19 82/21 101/18	immediately [1] 93/19
haven't [13] 14/9 19/19 20/8 21/23 24/17	104/10 104/14 106/13 106/17 107/24 108/11	impacted [1] 10/8 impactful [1] 31/15
48/3 48/15 66/10 66/10 69/7 87/21 94/4	108/12 108/15 110/4 110/8	importance [2] 31/25 41/13
101/8	hooks [6] 20/11 32/17 104/8 105/17 105/25	important [8] 4/23 31/10 31/17 32/3 41/17
having [5] 5/4 16/25 24/7 41/22 98/21	115/5	57/9 61/9 77/7
hay [18] 46/7 46/19 46/20 46/20 46/23 46	1	improve [1] 78/10
47/2 47/7 47/7 47/8 47/14 47/18 47/20 114 119/8 123/8 123/10 123/10	/7 horse [2] 70/5 70/6 horses [1] 23/1	improved [1] 76/24 in 2003 [1] 74/12
he [27] 10/9 25/9 25/10 25/16 25/17 26/12		in 2008 [1] 15/4
30/12 32/17 33/3 34/11 34/22 52/11 53/12	44/22 44/23 54/9 67/9 73/20 74/25 76/3	inability [2] 58/19 59/25
53/15 54/5 57/4 63/7 63/7 91/13 91/13 92/		INC [3] 1/6 54/18 54/23
92/24 93/21 94/7 94/23 112/14 122/25	hours [51] 32/5 32/5 32/5 38/23 38/25 39/21	includes [1] 90/16
he's [15] 18/12 33/12 33/22 34/11 34/14 34/22 53/22 53/25 61/4 61/7 90/17 91/3 91	43/20 43/23 44/4 44/7 44/11 44/12 44/14 44/16 45/23 45/24 46/22 48/3 51/17 52/4	including [1] 23/3 incorrect [2] 31/19 65/4
93/22 96/14	59/20 65/12 65/13 67/10 74/21 74/22 74/24	increased [1] 111/25
head [12] 38/1 38/5 43/15 46/16 49/4 58/7		indeed [2] 11/7 67/14
80/15 86/10 90/5 90/14 90/16 91/15	89/23 112/10 112/18 115/11 116/2 116/21	independent [1] 28/2
heading [2] 91/9 91/10	116/23 117/4 117/8 118/19 119/1 120/4	India [12] 17/22 20/1 24/19 79/13 79/25
hear [8] 4/19 32/21 41/24 53/8 53/20 53/2		80/23 86/18 87/22 87/23 113/11 113/21
99/16 99/17 heard [1] 50/14	house [1] 16/9 housekeeping [1] 5/9	117/16 indicate [1] 69/17
hearsay [5] 10/6 53/18 54/7 54/15 55/8	housing [1] 114/21	indicate [1] 09/17 indicated [1] 123/24
heavily [1] 4/3	how [49] 7/8 8/6 8/7 15/21 15/21 18/16 28/7	indicater [1] 111/18
heavy [3] 87/9 87/11 88/14	29/15 33/23 34/14 35/17 38/4 38/7 38/9	indicating [2] 88/15 88/20
held [2] 60/2 60/3	40/23 41/9 46/18 47/1 47/4 47/17 49/2 49/2	indication [1] 47/6
help [2] 12/10 26/2 helpful [3] 4/4 30/13 124/6	51/6 59/19 64/17 68/12 69/7 70/25 75/6 80/16 83/19 84/11 84/14 84/14 84/18 84/18	indicative [1] 121/18 indicator [1] 46/18
helping [2] 18/6 25/14	84/19 87/4 87/11 88/6 104/1 104/4 104/6	indicators [2] 77/18 78/9
helps [1] 34/3	108/1 108/21 113/11 119/5 119/25 120/9	individual [7] 43/7 57/12 57/12 107/10
her [9] 4/4 17/10 79/18 81/17 123/25 124/	2 HOWARD [1] 1/15	107/25 108/17 108/19
124/4 125/3 125/5	However [1] 65/14	individuals [1] 107/9
here [21] 7/12 9/18 17/18 37/16 38/1 38/8 40/22 44/22 45/8 46/6 46/7 48/22 61/11	huh [2] 110/5 120/20	inferior [2] 92/17 93/15
68/10 72/4 95/12 95/20 96/16 119/7 121/1	human [4] 7/11 7/19 7/24 104/5 Humans [1] 27/5	inflicts [1] 25/20 influences [1] 69/19
125/10	hundred [2] 35/22 41/19	information [4] 8/4 9/7 9/8 44/10
hesitate [1] 88/18	hundreds [1] 43/6	informative [2] 56/12 56/14
high [4] 38/9 51/2 66/25 119/9	hunts [1] 59/8	infrasonic [1] 99/16
higher [5] 31/14 31/25 51/3 57/22 105/12 highest [1] 96/13	hurt [3] 70/6 100/7 101/4 hurting [1] 105/23	ingesting [1] 46/20
highlighted [1] 95/12	hurts [1] 99/12	injurious [4] 40/9 116/5 116/8 116/12 injury [1] 33/24
highly [11] 10/18 63/25 81/21 90/2 90/10	husbandry [4] 24/25 25/12 92/17 93/15	input [1] 7/24
91/1 91/11 91/16 94/16 94/21 94/25	T	inside [2] 109/17 109/21
Hills [10] 36/9 36/24 44/24 45/4 98/10 98/		insides [1] 109/11
109/10 109/14 109/18 109/20 him [15] 16/25 18/20 30/9 30/11 32/13 32	I would [1] 82/4 24 I'd 23 5/18 22/13 23/6 23/7 23/25 37/18	Insofar [1] 30/17 inspect [2] 108/25 109/8
33/4 33/13 34/24 39/14 53/21 54/2 106/11	64/16 65/1 72/2 77/24 89/22 92/10 92/11	inspect [2] 108/23 109/8 inspection [16] 36/4 36/7 36/9 36/21 36/24
113/5 113/6	93/4 93/5 93/8 103/3 108/6 111/19 114/16	37/13 44/24 44/24 45/13 45/16 98/5 98/10
his [23] 10/8 18/20 25/8 25/14 25/15 30/9	119/10 121/12 122/24	109/10 109/15 109/18 109/20
30/12 30/12 32/22 32/23 33/8 33/25 34/8	I'll [23] 4/25 5/19 10/9 22/16 22/19 29/5	inspections [1] 108/24
34/17 35/1 38/5 45/21 53/20 53/25 54/2 54/81/17 92/25	/4 30/25 34/24 39/14 43/10 47/18 55/21 56/3 56/4 60/13 77/17 91/6 111/7 112/16 113/3	instances [1] 78/15 instead [1] 51/3
history [1] 108/15	115/23 116/11 119/17	intellectual [5] 29/23 30/5 31/12 40/14 51/2
hit [10] 70/13 70/16 70/19 85/1 85/14 101		intelligent [2] 36/1 40/6
101/18 102/3 110/14 115/8	- Lango, 1	
hits [1] 101/9	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11	intended [1] 73/7
hold [5] 27/5 27/6 27/6 45/12 84/22	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6	intention [1] 73/9
holding [1] 106/10	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24
holding [1] 106/10 hole [2] 12/6 12/7	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21
holding [1] 106/10 hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24
hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18 holiday [2] 6/3 6/8	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2 68/12 72/6 72/13 72/16 74/20 76/6 76/18 77/22 80/6 81/14 84/5 85/12 86/13 86/14 87/18 87/22 89/7 89/16 93/24 98/3 101/21	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21 65/17 87/2 88/4 88/4 119/7 interaction [1] 84/15 interactions [2] 43/8 58/17
hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18 holiday [2] 6/3 6/8 home [9] 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19 80/22 80	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2 68/12 72/6 72/13 72/16 74/20 76/6 76/18 77/22 80/6 81/14 84/5 85/12 86/13 86/14 87/18 87/22 89/7 89/16 93/24 98/3 101/21 /23 102/12 102/14 102/15 102/16 102/16 102/17	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21 65/17 87/2 88/4 88/4 119/7 interaction [1] 84/15 interactions [2] 43/8 58/17 interest [5] 14/6 28/18 35/24 120/19 120/21
hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18 holiday [2] 6/3 6/8 home [9] 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19 80/22 80 122/5 122/5 122/8	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2 68/12 72/6 72/13 72/16 74/20 76/6 76/18 77/22 80/6 81/14 84/5 85/12 86/13 86/14 87/18 87/22 89/7 89/16 93/24 98/3 101/21 102/12 102/14 102/15 102/16 102/16 102/17 102/19 102/21 102/23 102/24 104/17 105/18	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21 65/17 87/2 88/4 88/4 119/7 interaction [1] 84/15 interactions [2] 43/8 58/17 interest [5] 14/6 28/18 35/24 120/19 120/21 interested [2] 35/24 100/9
hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18 holiday [2] 6/3 6/8 home [9] 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19 80/22 80	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2 68/12 72/6 72/13 72/16 74/20 76/6 76/18 77/22 80/6 81/14 84/5 85/12 86/13 86/14 87/18 87/22 89/7 89/16 93/24 98/3 101/21 102/12 102/14 102/15 102/16 102/16 102/17 102/19 102/21 102/23 102/24 104/17 105/18 106/12 107/3 107/5 107/13 108/5 108/14	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21 65/17 87/2 88/4 88/4 119/7 interaction [1] 84/15 interactions [2] 43/8 58/17 interest [5] 14/6 28/18 35/24 120/19 120/21 interested [2] 35/24 100/9 interesting [2] 101/3 105/3
hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18 holiday [2] 6/3 6/8 home [9] 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19 80/22 80 122/5 122/5 122/8 honest [4] 38/6 84/9 101/9 106/19 Honor [54] 3/15 3/20 4/15 5/22 7/10 12/1 12/19 18/19 24/14 25/6 26/1 28/25 29/7 29	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2 68/12 72/6 72/13 72/16 74/20 76/6 76/18 77/22 80/6 81/14 84/5 85/12 86/13 86/14 87/18 87/22 89/7 89/16 93/24 98/3 101/21 102/12 102/14 102/15 102/16 102/16 102/17 102/19 102/21 102/23 102/24 104/17 105/18 106/12 107/3 107/5 107/13 108/5 108/14	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21 65/17 87/2 88/4 88/4 119/7 interaction [1] 84/15 interactions [2] 43/8 58/17 interest [5] 14/6 28/18 35/24 120/19 120/21 interested [2] 35/24 100/9
hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18 holiday [2] 6/3 6/8 home [9] 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19 80/22 80 122/5 122/5 122/8 honest [4] 38/6 84/9 101/9 106/19 Honor [54] 3/15 3/20 4/15 5/22 7/10 12/1 12/19 18/19 24/14 25/6 26/1 28/25 29/7 29 29/13 30/9 30/10 32/6 32/16 33/15 34/7	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2 68/12 72/6 72/13 72/16 74/20 76/6 76/18 77/22 80/6 81/14 84/5 85/12 86/13 86/14 87/18 87/22 89/7 89/16 93/24 98/3 101/21 102/12 102/14 102/15 102/16 102/16 102/17 102/19 102/21 102/23 102/24 104/17 105/18 106/12 107/3 107/5 107/13 108/5 108/14 110/20 111/14 118/5 118/11 118/12 118/13 118/20 121/11 123/20 123/21 124/7 125/3 125/4	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21 65/17 87/2 88/4 88/4 119/7 interaction [1] 84/15 interactions [2] 43/8 58/17 interest [5] 14/6 28/18 35/24 120/19 120/21 interested [2] 35/24 100/9 interesting [2] 101/3 105/3 International [1] 21/9 interpret [2] 15/22 18/16 interrupt [1] 87/23
hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18 holiday [2] 6/3 6/8 home [9] 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19 80/22 80 122/5 122/5 122/8 honest [4] 38/6 84/9 101/9 106/19 Honor [54] 3/15 3/20 4/15 5/22 7/10 12/1 12/19 18/19 24/14 25/6 26/1 28/25 29/7 29 29/13 30/9 30/10 32/6 32/16 33/15 34/7 34/19 35/3 37/19 38/19 39/3 39/10 42/19	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2 68/12 72/6 72/13 72/16 74/20 76/6 76/18 77/22 80/6 81/14 84/5 85/12 86/13 86/14 87/18 87/22 89/7 89/16 93/24 98/3 101/21 102/12 102/14 102/15 102/16 102/16 102/17 102/19 102/21 102/23 102/24 104/17 105/18 106/12 107/3 107/5 107/13 108/5 108/14 110/20 111/14 118/5 118/11 118/12 118/13 118/20 121/11 123/20 123/21 124/7 125/3 125/4 I've [23] 12/5 19/19 22/24 30/2 49/19 66/9	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21 65/17 87/2 88/4 88/4 119/7 interaction [1] 84/15 interactions [2] 43/8 58/17 interest [5] 14/6 28/18 35/24 120/19 120/21 interested [2] 35/24 100/9 interesting [2] 101/3 105/3 International [1] 21/9 interpret [2] 15/22 18/16 interrupt [1] 87/23 interrupted [1] 46/4
hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18 holiday [2] 6/3 6/8 home [9] 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19 80/22 80 122/5 122/5 122/8 honest [4] 38/6 84/9 101/9 106/19 Honor [54] 3/15 3/20 4/15 5/22 7/10 12/1 12/19 18/19 24/14 25/6 26/1 28/25 29/7 29 29/13 30/9 30/10 32/6 32/16 33/15 34/7 34/19 35/3 37/19 38/19 39/3 39/10 42/19 44/23 45/11 52/5 52/21 52/21 52/24 53/3	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2 68/12 72/6 72/13 72/16 74/20 76/6 76/18 77/22 80/6 81/14 84/5 85/12 86/13 86/14 87/18 87/22 89/7 89/16 93/24 98/3 101/21 102/12 102/14 102/15 102/16 102/16 102/17 102/19 102/21 102/23 102/24 104/17 105/18 106/12 107/3 107/5 107/13 108/5 108/14 110/20 111/14 118/5 118/11 118/12 118/13 118/20 121/11 123/20 123/21 124/7 125/3 125/4 I've [23] 12/5 19/19 22/24 30/2 49/19 66/9 66/13 68/5 70/6 70/18 79/12 82/19 82/21	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21 65/17 87/2 88/4 88/4 119/7 interaction [1] 84/15 interactions [2] 43/8 58/17 interest [5] 14/6 28/18 35/24 120/19 120/21 interested [2] 35/24 100/9 interesting [2] 101/3 105/3 International [1] 21/9 interpret [2] 15/22 18/16 interrupt [1] 87/23 interrupted [1] 46/4 interruptive [1] 59/13
hole [2] 12/6 12/7 holes [5] 8/10 8/11 40/17 41/11 41/18 holiday [2] 6/3 6/8 home [9] 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19 80/22 80 122/5 122/5 122/8 honest [4] 38/6 84/9 101/9 106/19 Honor [54] 3/15 3/20 4/15 5/22 7/10 12/1 12/19 18/19 24/14 25/6 26/1 28/25 29/7 29 29/13 30/9 30/10 32/6 32/16 33/15 34/7 34/19 35/3 37/19 38/19 39/3 39/10 42/19	24/7 24/23 26/6 28/12 31/19 32/21 35/11 37/21 38/8 40/13 42/19 44/11 46/4 46/6 47/17 53/6 54/6 54/21 55/8 55/13 55/18 55/21 58/3 65/3 65/25 66/5 67/12 67/16 68/2 68/12 72/6 72/13 72/16 74/20 76/6 76/18 77/22 80/6 81/14 84/5 85/12 86/13 86/14 87/18 87/22 89/7 89/16 93/24 98/3 101/21 102/12 102/14 102/15 102/16 102/16 102/17 102/19 102/21 102/23 102/24 104/17 105/18 106/12 107/3 107/5 107/13 108/5 108/14 110/20 111/14 118/5 118/11 118/12 118/13 118/20 121/11 123/20 123/21 124/7 125/3 125/4 I've [23] 12/5 19/19 22/24 30/2 49/19 66/9 66/13 68/5 70/6 70/18 79/12 82/19 82/21 86/7 88/19 96/18 99/3 101/16 102/17 115/8	intention [1] 73/9 intentionally [1] 73/24 interact [10] 61/25 63/23 63/25 64/1 64/21 65/17 87/2 88/4 88/4 119/7 interaction [1] 84/15 interactions [2] 43/8 58/17 interest [5] 14/6 28/18 35/24 120/19 120/21 interested [2] 35/24 100/9 interesting [2] 101/3 105/3 International [1] 21/9 interpret [2] 15/22 18/16 interrupt [1] 87/23 interrupted [1] 46/4

т	Kiley-Worthington [3] 92/15 93/13 94/5	light [1] 103/25
I	kind [35] 6/10 9/1 9/5 9/14 11/2 20/6 23/22	like [59] 5/18 10/3 19/9 22/13 23/6 33/20
introduce [1] 4/13 introducing [1] 3/13	39/24 40/25 41/16 42/11 43/13 45/6 46/13 48/5 55/18 56/17 57/25 66/21 67/21 69/4	37/12 38/25 39/13 39/21 40/1 40/6 40/7 41/22 42/25 49/22 50/3 50/12 51/4 51/17
introducting [1] 5/15 introduction [3] 60/5 62/20 63/10	74/3 74/11 79/20 82/18 82/20 82/25 83/3	58/8 58/25 59/11 61/23 64/10 65/1 75/22
investigator [1] 17/14	85/25 87/7 106/3 106/6 107/11 111/1 112/11	76/23 77/4 78/3 78/7 78/7 78/14 83/2 83/3
invitation [1] 11/15	kinds [7] 9/4 16/10 44/18 48/25 51/12 88/24	85/25 86/8 88/2 88/13 88/15 88/20 89/22
invoking [3] 40/10 40/19 54/12 involve [5] 13/5 13/8 14/17 14/23 31/2	90/18 know [75] 6/9 7/14 9/13 11/8 16/13 17/19	92/10 92/11 93/4 93/5 93/8 97/5 99/20 99/20 101/23 102/3 103/4 108/1 108/6 115/9
involved [3] 15/20 103/14 104/25	22/24 23/18 24/8 24/11 24/13 24/14 26/19	121/17 123/1 123/4
involves [1] 14/3	26/20 26/21 26/24 27/8 27/8 28/21 30/10	likely [4] 33/18 77/18 78/9 112/2
involving [3] 13/6 14/20 31/21	34/10 35/25 37/16 40/8 42/2 42/12 43/21 44/16 45/9 45/20 46/18 47/1 47/4 57/15	likes [1] 92/25
is [339] isn't [8] 75/7 77/7 77/19 86/20 87/10 95/17	59/21 61/10 62/12 69/20 70/18 71/19 72/1	limit [3] 33/25 64/12 65/22 limited [4] 29/9 32/25 34/3 34/24
95/18 106/6	72/7 73/19 73/20 74/3 75/22 79/3 80/7 82/5	limiting [1] 64/21
issue [12] 25/20 29/1 30/11 30/13 32/13	82/8 82/11 85/18 86/24 88/15 88/19 88/20	line [23] 15/24 15/24 18/20 18/23 23/7 23/25
32/25 34/14 55/2 55/3 55/5 57/10 75/3 issues [5] 30/20 31/2 31/5 31/6 39/4	90/22 93/21 97/14 99/11 99/17 99/19 101/25 102/3 108/12 111/20 118/17 120/3 121/8	37/7 47/11 63/1 66/4 66/22 78/1 87/18 87/18 91/6 93/16 95/16 95/16 95/16 107/22 107/22
it [295]	124/7 124/20 125/7 125/9 125/11 125/12	114/6 121/9
it's [128]	Knowing [1] 8/12	lines [1] 84/20
its [12] 25/19 28/21 32/2 40/14 63/21 64/21 64/21 64/21 92/13 96/25 97/1 116/13	knowledge [1] 31/22 known [2] 9/5 27/1	lion [1] 59/8 LISA [4] 1/20 2/2 126/2 126/9
itself [4] 15/19 33/24 40/8 102/6		list [1] 54/8
T	L	listed [2] 61/5 123/22
jab [2] 82/19 106/5	laboratory [2] 103/24 104/2	listen [1] 4/25
jabbed [7] 103/1 103/3 103/4 110/7 110/10	laid [1] 124/18 LANCE [1] 1/21	literature [18] 8/11 10/3 14/14 15/21 17/19 18/15 28/3 29/21 34/9 34/10 46/10 48/5
110/10 115/7	large [18] 6/23 9/23 11/11 30/4 31/15 31/25	59/23 92/21 95/18 96/4 98/4 123/2
Jaworski [1] 1/22	33/24 40/5 49/9 49/25 64/9 64/9 65/15 69/4	little [12] 7/9 28/24 49/11 51/19 59/7 61/19
Jeep [4] 87/6 87/13 88/7 105/2 Jewell [1] 108/25	79/14 80/8 86/5 88/21 larger [2] 7/13 62/16	62/14 65/17 66/23 75/2 80/2 100/13 live [1] 124/20
JOHN [1] 1/20	last [16] 8/18 11/17 27/16 36/15 39/9 44/10	lives [1] 33/19
JOINER [2] 1/20 125/2	58/15 61/9 62/19 71/11 92/11 93/9 108/16	living [1] 113/18
journal [4] 9/6 10/16 10/18 11/2 journals [1] 55/7	120/24 122/21 123/14 later [6] 7/15 37/6 42/10 42/15 55/12 124/11	LLP [1] 1/22
JUDGE [6] 1/11 7/8 30/19 48/24 52/2 67/3	latest [1] 14/11	local [1] 8/1 locally [1] 8/1
judges [2] 52/16 52/17	Latham [4] 77/12 77/22 78/3 111/15	location [4] 49/10 65/14 81/7 82/7
judgment [2] 54/19 54/25	latitude [1] 6/15	locomotion [1] 58/18
jump [3] 71/21 72/3 72/4 juncture [1] 39/12	law [1] 124/18 lawyer [1] 113/8	logical [1] 102/8 logically [1] 95/22
jurors [1] 52/14	lead [4] 17/13 42/9 65/18 92/2	long [35] 4/7 8/7 27/24 31/7 31/11 32/4 37/25
jury [1] 52/12	leaders [2] 15/12 16/7	39/5 41/10 42/23 44/3 44/17 44/18 44/20
just [98] 4/17 4/24 5/18 7/6 7/7 8/17 9/5 23/23 26/2 26/12 28/20 31/13 32/4 32/9	leading [9] 9/21 58/15 63/1 63/2 63/3 63/6 111/6 113/2 115/22	45/19 48/7 48/8 49/7 52/1 52/2 52/4 54/8 59/9 65/19 67/10 73/22 75/6 87/1 87/12
32/21 32/25 38/2 38/22 39/13 39/25 40/5	leads [1] 60/8	107/11 116/1 117/17 118/24 120/9 120/19
40/8 40/11 40/25 41/10 41/23 42/21 42/25	learn [1] 101/6	long-term [2] 8/7 32/4
43/10 43/19 44/6 44/10 44/11 44/13 45/7 45/10 46/6 46/8 46/24 47/14 47/17 48/24	learned [6] 23/4 53/19 54/12 54/13 85/21 99/10	longer [11] 10/5 15/7 43/24 43/24 51/20
49/1 50/9 50/25 51/1 51/4 52/24 53/4 59/10	learning [4] 22/21 23/23 24/9 29/21	74/17 76/2 119/1 119/8 120/15 120/18 look [49] 7/5 7/7 7/15 9/24 9/24 9/25 15/21
59/24 60/9 61/19 61/22 62/2 64/20 66/19	least [6] 5/23 52/2 61/24 76/13 99/9 104/3	26/10 37/8 37/10 37/11 37/11 37/12 38/17
68/20 69/2 71/12 71/25 72/2 73/20 74/20 76/4 76/6 77/17 78/13 80/7 83/9 83/23 85/8	leave [3] 125/7 125/9 125/12	43/11 44/15 45/8 47/9 47/9 49/1 51/21 56/22
86/11 86/24 89/8 90/14 90/16 90/18 91/7	left [4] 45/8 46/6 55/14 86/9 leg [4] 59/19 59/19 86/6 86/10	56/24 57/15 57/18 58/14 60/23 61/14 61/18 62/17 62/19 74/25 75/12 78/4 79/7 91/20
96/18 102/4 106/6 106/25 107/17 108/1	length [1] 75/4	93/1 94/24 95/22 97/14 97/17 98/3 102/14
110/13 111/16 112/14 116/21 117/12 118/9	lengths [1] 117/19	102/16 104/1 111/19 111/23 114/16 119/4
118/10 120/24 121/22 122/23 122/24 123/25 124/8	less [7] 44/15 49/22 58/9 71/23 76/12 91/23 112/2	looked [5] 11/10 51/23 57/10 61/17 115/9 looking [23] 8/19 11/25 12/6 18/13 18/14
K	let [32] 3/11 3/12 3/16 15/23 23/24 26/25	18/16 28/20 37/4 38/9 39/24 40/22 44/5
	28/6 34/24 39/14 52/10 53/14 69/3 71/17	46/17 57/16 59/16 73/9 73/24 75/9 75/11
KARA [1] 1/21 Karen [3] 45/10 98/14 98/15	71/17 71/19 77/16 87/17 90/24 91/5 95/15 98/20 101/16 107/21 109/10 113/5 119/24	76/25 97/25 101/16 113/20 looks [4] 11/1 45/3 77/4 97/7
KATHERINE [1] 1/14	120/23 122/8 125/7 125/9 125/11 125/12	loose [2] 69/3 117/12
keep [8] 16/24 43/23 44/7 84/19 87/16 87/24	let's [16] 39/16 56/6 57/21 58/24 59/7 64/12	lot [15] 5/23 7/25 24/7 26/4 37/1 42/3 47/12
106/13 120/9 keepers [2] 71/18 72/2	71/25 77/25 80/25 81/3 91/8 91/20 93/1 94/24 96/7 119/15	53/8 69/6 70/9 83/18 84/12 84/23 85/24
keeping [16] 42/23 62/22 63/14 64/13 64/18	94/24 96/7 119/15 letter [1] 39/10	102/18 love [1] 10/2
64/25 65/13 65/24 66/14 67/13 67/15 67/18	letters [2] 16/17 39/6	low [3] 19/7 41/9 120/12
67/20 68/8 72/2 72/7	letting [1] 54/7	low-pitched [1] 19/7
keeps [2] 46/8 67/14 Kelly [1] 90/6	level [6] 57/22 76/1 98/4 115/19 115/25 120/12	lowest [1] 96/13 Lutzi [1] 109/2
kennels [2] 92/18 93/16	lie [1] 59/10	Lynette [1] 19/3
kept [7] 68/3 79/5 80/19 80/25 81/2 86/19	lies [1] 59/12	M
113/21 Kiley [3] 92/15 93/13 94/5	lift [2] 86/6 86/8	
INICY [J] 74113 93113 9713		M-E-R-R-E-L-L [1] 54/23

88/15 88/19 92/23 94/19 94/23 95/13 100/21 move [48] 10/6 25/7 29/1 38/15 40/18 41/14 M 42/25 52/5 59/1 60/10 61/19 61/25 62/3 101/7 101/11 101/22 102/2 110/23 115/6 made [4] 45/11 88/21 94/15 94/23 62/10 64/11 67/25 69/2 71/11 71/12 81/8 123/5 mahout [15] 80/11 80/15 81/9 81/9 81/15 meaning [1] 118/20 85/1 85/3 85/23 87/2 87/7 97/19 99/3 99/5 81/16 82/14 82/21 84/14 84/15 85/22 86/8 means [4] 18/10 69/21 113/18 117/9 100/23 100/25 106/4 106/6 107/15 107/17 87/5 87/20 115/3 meant [1] 123/20 107/18 107/19 113/25 114/6 115/8 115/10 mahouts [10] 82/10 82/16 83/14 83/15 83/19 measure [8] 43/15 43/16 51/8 103/22 103/24 116/1 117/19 118/12 118/16 118/21 118/23 86/4 88/5 112/21 113/12 115/11 103/25 104/6 123/5 120/4 120/5 maintain [1] 16/21 measured [1] 100/25 movement [4] 49/20 51/6 51/10 64/21 measurement [1] 123/4 major [1] 16/9 movements [5] 43/21 43/21 47/10 49/18 majority [1] 31/20 measurements [2] 96/8 96/12 99/12 make [13] 3/19 6/22 10/4 11/3 19/6 32/22 moves [2] 64/10 81/10 measures [1] 51/7 43/20 53/4 99/25 101/12 101/15 104/19 moving [12] 40/16 41/3 44/6 49/13 51/8 measuring [1] 40/23 mechanical [1] 2/25 104/21 59/15 59/15 65/16 69/3 89/16 106/12 113/19 makes [4] 40/14 52/8 52/9 103/14 meddlesome [1] 105/10 Mr [1] 52/11 making [4] 8/3 54/16 63/9 92/24 medical [2] 16/1 17/1 Mr. [1] 28/5 male [7] 83/24 83/25 84/1 84/3 84/9 84/9 medicines [1] 104/5 Mr. Shea [1] 28/5 99/19 Ms [7] 3/11 3/25 4/1 123/21 123/22 123/23 meeting [1] 11/16 males [3] 84/2 84/7 87/4 meetings [1] 29/20 125/1 mammalian [1] 27/5 much [22] 7/13 8/10 31/15 35/17 38/1 38/5 meets [2] 11/2 25/23 mammals [3] 101/25 110/19 111/4 member [5] 21/6 21/9 21/12 21/15 35/9 49/2 49/13 49/24 57/22 61/20 68/12 69/11 manage [3] 24/20 24/23 73/10 members [1] 43/4 70/25 75/20 82/12 82/13 86/2 113/22 114/3 manageable [1] 66/1 122/4 123/16 memories [2] 8/9 42/21 managed [7] 22/11 22/17 23/10 23/14 24/2 memory [12] 7/23 8/4 8/7 8/16 33/14 41/17 multitude [1] 27/10 24/18 84/2 41/22 42/13 42/16 70/18 70/20 108/16 **musculature** [1] 97/16 management [4] 25/1 25/19 48/17 114/22 mental [2] 31/14 51/3 must [1] 64/23 Managers [1] 21/6 mentioned [11] 7/10 12/2 14/13 17/9 17/18 my [63] 12/2 12/9 18/12 19/3 22/13 28/13 managing [1] 31/8 28/13 28/14 31/6 35/16 35/21 36/2 38/9 47/23 60/5 61/22 76/19 94/8 116/21 manifest [1] 108/1 39/24 40/5 40/7 40/19 40/21 49/19 50/6 mentioning [1] 75/13 Merrell [2] 54/18 54/23 method [3] 105/16 105/22 105/22 manifests [1] 33/24 55/14 64/22 65/1 65/4 65/8 68/5 69/19 71/20 manipulations [1] 16/11 72/18 74/2 74/22 75/1 78/12 82/4 84/10 many [7] 8/14 22/25 44/13 101/8 115/11 methods [5] 22/11 22/18 23/10 23/15 24/2 87/21 88/23 90/12 90/20 90/24 91/19 94/6 117/19 117/19 **MEYER [3]** 1/14 1/16 3/11 94/19 97/22 99/9 100/8 102/10 102/19 margin [1] 78/5 MICHELLE [1] 1/22 102/19 103/1 103/2 106/7 106/7 106/12 mark [3] 44/22 44/23 45/24 Michigan [1] 36/10 110/9 113/10 113/17 114/9 117/7 119/2 marked [4] 49/20 58/10 114/12 115/16 middle [2] 8/12 91/9 119/17 122/12 123/23 marker [8] 40/24 40/24 43/11 44/8 51/6 51/6 midway [1] 91/21 myself [4] 30/15 38/7 88/21 102/15 might [10] 11/3 17/1 19/12 87/21 98/3 105/2 51/10 119/5 Mysore [1] 109/4 markers [1] 40/22 108/13 116/25 120/19 120/20 N marking [7] 15/13 15/16 15/19 16/8 16/9 mile [1] 119/15 16/19 16/24 name [3] 10/16 61/9 81/14 miles [2] 8/11 41/19 masks [1] 103/16 named [1] 109/8 mind [12] 10/9 14/8 39/24 40/8 43/10 88/23 **Mason [6]** 77/10 77/11 77/12 77/22 78/3 90/12 99/9 101/1 106/7 114/9 118/6 names [1] 98/12 Namibia [1] 17/24 111/15 minds [1] 11/18 National [2] 9/21 17/24 material [1] 55/18 minimum [2] 76/10 114/8 natural [8] 51/4 58/25 59/2 59/13 63/21 matriarch [2] 42/6 42/11 minute [5] 44/22 44/23 45/23 70/24 91/7 matter [8] 5/9 10/10 40/11 47/8 74/16 76/2 minutes [6] 4/23 26/7 32/9 45/24 68/16 71/4 105/21 105/22 114/2 naturalistic [9] 66/21 66/24 67/22 112/23 87/3 126/4 misery [1] 40/4 matters [4] 6/3 13/3 13/5 74/18 113/12 113/17 114/4 114/8 116/13 misleading [1] 90/13 max [6] 44/1 74/3 74/19 74/22 75/23 75/24 mistake [1] 45/12 nature [4] 41/15 100/10 100/10 100/22 maxes [2] 44/7 44/7 mistaken [1] 44/11 near [2] 62/18 113/23 may [18] 8/4 16/23 18/19 22/19 30/12 35/5 misunderstanding [1] 18/18 nearly [1] 84/2 43/22 51/18 58/19 67/9 76/12 82/19 85/1 necessarily [2] 85/8 103/20 misunderstood [1] 117/1 85/5 104/9 104/11 120/18 120/18 necessary [6] 22/10 22/17 23/9 23/13 24/1 mixed [1] 47/20 modeling [1] 7/18 maybe [27] 8/10 47/17 51/16 51/18 59/8 124/23 64/11 65/20 67/9 68/13 69/2 69/12 69/12 modifications [1] 11/3 need [9] 5/12 5/17 5/19 19/3 41/14 70/25 69/21 75/20 82/8 87/1 88/7 98/2 98/2 101/7 molasses [1] 86/5 71/21 72/3 93/21 101/17 101/17 101/21 102/19 120/4 120/6 negative [3] 22/23 26/20 27/3 moment [5] 18/3 45/11 74/10 103/19 111/16 121/11 Monday [2] 6/7 6/8 neglected [4] 28/25 71/10 122/12 123/22 me [55] 3/11 6/4 14/20 15/12 15/15 15/23 Nepal [8] 24/20 79/12 79/22 79/24 83/6 monopolize [1] 42/18 18/23 23/8 23/24 23/25 26/25 28/7 31/20 months [2] 10/2 27/20 113/21 117/16 117/17 32/23 36/6 39/19 44/8 45/2 52/9 52/10 54/4 more [40] 5/12 5/23 7/21 8/1 10/4 10/5 15/9 nerve [1] 110/25 64/21 65/2 67/12 69/9 71/17 71/17 71/19 15/9 27/21 31/15 39/17 40/14 43/24 43/25 nerves [1] 111/1 nervous [2] 9/20 51/3 75/13 75/13 76/5 77/16 77/20 78/3 87/17 44/4 48/17 49/12 50/13 54/6 61/20 62/14 88/18 88/23 89/8 90/24 91/5 95/15 98/20 68/12 68/15 74/23 75/20 81/24 82/13 90/14 neurobiologists [1] 7/25 100/13 101/4 101/16 102/17 104/17 107/4 neurobiology [2] 9/23 11/11 90/16 106/8 112/17 112/23 113/12 116/23 neurons [4] 7/18 7/20 8/1 41/21 107/21 108/5 109/10 115/9 119/24 120/23 117/4 117/7 117/18 120/18 121/13 124/9 122/8 morning [6] 17/20 38/19 81/6 88/6 89/3 Neuroscience [1] 10/15 meal [2] 69/24 81/10 never [19] 9/11 12/24 19/19 21/21 21/24 22/2 124/2 mean [41] 8/6 9/3 11/24 15/3 24/19 24/23 most [6] 53/6 61/9 63/22 84/6 102/8 111/24 22/5 22/8 22/10 22/16 24/16 24/18 25/3 26/24 33/17 40/1 41/2 46/12 47/14 48/21 mother [1] 42/15 49/13 82/19 82/22 115/4 117/20 123/1 motion [2] 58/5 105/9 48/22 52/21 58/1 58/24 67/6 72/16 80/23 nevertheless [1] 82/23 82/11 83/22 84/7 85/3 86/21 87/23 88/15 mouth [1] 78/16 New [1] 120/1

obvious [1] 114/19 out [42] 7/21 8/12 10/25 12/1 14/8 14/15 15/15 16/25 18/4 27/11 37/3 38/7 43/5 43/6 Obviously [1] 4/22 next [6] 54/10 54/10 58/16 93/16 114/1 119/6 occasion [1] 104/8 43/6 43/17 44/1 44/7 48/7 51/7 65/15 72/3 nice [1] 124/14 occasional [1] 93/12 73/15 74/3 74/19 74/22 75/11 75/23 75/24 occasions [2] 92/13 93/22 niche [1] 41/6 81/7 83/10 83/12 86/3 86/24 87/5 88/8 Nicole [3] 98/14 98/15 98/18 occur [2] 41/19 78/14 102/14 106/7 113/22 113/23 119/14 124/17 night [11] 48/6 50/1 50/3 69/2 69/3 81/12 occurred [2] 109/14 109/17 outdoor [1] 49/25 83/8 83/17 86/20 88/1 113/23 outlined [1] 16/16 Occurrence [1] 94/25 **nighttime [3]** 69/10 86/21 117/12 occurs [1] 69/9 outside [2] 26/7 32/9 off [16] 3/12 3/21 4/23 6/20 39/1 55/14 70/7 nine [6] 44/16 75/10 81/2 81/3 87/1 88/2 outstanding [1] 29/1 outward [1] 97/4 nine feet [1] 87/1 73/23 84/22 86/11 91/15 95/2 106/5 120/4 ninth [1] 7/16 120/13 122/11 over [37] 6/6 6/6 7/15 8/19 11/25 26/18 27/16 no [111] 1/4 3/18 5/16 13/1 14/18 17/6 18/9 offer [4] 25/22 39/4 79/7 116/10 28/1 29/5 29/8 35/2 38/2 39/11 39/14 41/1 18/18 19/1 19/17 19/19 19/20 19/23 20/2 offered [2] 48/24 61/13 41/1 42/3 43/14 43/14 44/13 45/8 46/14 20/4 20/8 20/9 20/11 20/12 20/14 20/15 46/14 49/6 52/4 54/7 56/3 58/15 60/13 62/5 offering [1] 32/13 20/17 20/17 20/18 20/20 20/21 20/24 20/25 office [1] 125/3 74/15 86/10 92/14 100/15 102/19 119/7 21/2 21/3 21/5 21/14 21/23 23/10 24/3 24/7 official [2] 2/2 45/16 119/20 24/17 25/2 25/12 25/13 29/19 32/19 34/21 overall [4] 15/21 29/23 91/22 91/23 often [4] 49/2 60/4 81/25 82/18 35/11 35/14 35/21 36/23 41/24 44/16 45/19 overnight [6] 117/10 117/15 117/20 117/24 **Oh [3]** 19/2 36/14 68/23 45/19 46/12 47/6 50/2 51/18 56/1 65/7 68/15 okay [13] 3/20 4/6 16/3 39/16 41/4 45/25 118/4 118/7 72/1 73/11 73/15 75/5 76/3 80/13 82/2 84/5 47/17 57/7 65/10 71/6 95/24 111/8 121/6 overreacting [3] 101/21 102/16 102/20 84/7 84/25 86/23 87/21 87/23 88/14 90/4 old [1] 42/11 overreaction [1] 102/11 90/9 90/25 91/14 91/17 92/4 92/6 92/21 once [6] 45/23 73/20 74/3 76/1 114/8 123/8 overruled [1] 113/15 94/20 100/8 101/11 101/11 102/16 104/15 own [8] 28/13 32/2 41/14 43/4 46/14 52/15 one [129] 107/9 107/17 107/17 109/1 109/3 109/5 ones [5] 18/3 67/16 82/11 89/11 118/11 58/23 123/8 109/7 109/9 110/22 111/13 111/14 111/22 ongoing [7] 14/7 14/11 14/13 14/19 33/21 owner [1] 16/25 114/19 115/13 115/24 115/24 117/14 122/1 78/16 106/3 owners [1] 16/10 122/7 123/4 123/15 124/3 124/3 124/12 only [19] 6/2 9/13 14/23 29/17 29/19 33/7 P 124/13 33/12 34/12 60/7 76/3 90/18 98/9 100/24 noise [3] 104/19 104/21 107/17 118/1 118/3 118/6 118/11 125/8 125/14 P.L [2] 37/15 37/21 p.m [2] 1/5 125/15 noncontact [1] 23/5 **open [3]** 48/17 61/23 69/10 opine [1] 52/20 pachyderm [2] 69/21 110/23 None [1] 14/3 nonetheless [1] 49/10 opining [1] 33/22 page [39] 7/5 7/6 7/15 7/16 15/23 18/20 noon [3] 5/11 5/14 6/13 opinion [54] 30/10 30/12 34/18 39/1 42/22 18/23 23/6 23/24 26/10 26/14 26/18 37/10 normal [1] 64/3 50/7 60/1 61/12 63/5 63/7 63/10 63/11 63/15 37/11 37/11 38/20 55/23 55/25 58/14 62/17 78/1 78/3 87/17 89/22 91/5 91/8 91/9 91/20 not [226] 64/7 64/13 64/23 65/9 66/19 67/13 69/19 91/21 92/10 93/8 94/14 94/24 95/15 95/16 note [1] 55/4 70/13 73/16 74/15 74/22 75/1 78/20 81/22 107/21 114/17 114/17 120/24 noted [1] 56/5 82/4 92/25 94/6 94/7 96/24 100/2 103/10 notes [1] 55/15 105/4 105/15 105/19 106/8 112/8 112/15 pages [2] 7/15 8/18 pain [40] 96/19 96/22 96/25 97/3 97/4 97/8 **nothing [11]** 10/3 15/16 32/5 32/6 50/4 59/2 113/10 113/16 113/16 113/17 116/5 116/22 70/22 101/1 116/14 121/24 122/9 97/10 97/18 97/24 98/22 98/23 99/4 99/14 117/3 117/7 117/9 118/7 118/18 118/25 notice [5] 25/8 39/6 39/10 54/9 125/4 119/25 121/22 100/24 101/19 101/23 101/25 102/1 102/5 noting [1] 54/19 opinions [5] 25/22 26/19 33/5 48/24 53/21 102/7 102/22 103/11 103/12 103/17 103/22 104/3 104/4 104/5 104/6 104/9 104/12 November [1] 36/18 **opponent** [1] 4/13 104/14 105/20 105/21 110/8 110/11 110/17 November 2007 [1] 36/18 opportunities [1] 11/22 now [36] 4/8 5/3 9/1 12/3 13/9 15/25 17/9 opportunity [1] 4/25 110/18 111/5 111/9 19/17 23/8 40/21 49/16 66/5 66/6 66/8 66/9 painful [9] 65/20 70/17 82/22 99/4 103/14 opposed [4] 35/12 48/11 67/18 68/7 66/9 74/21 76/7 76/8 78/20 80/8 80/19 83/6 opposing [1] 123/24 106/8 107/16 115/5 115/9 85/13 86/18 87/21 91/7 94/8 94/13 101/2 palm [1] 70/8 opposite [1] 38/14 paper [14] 9/1 9/1 9/2 9/10 9/13 9/24 10/5 108/11 108/21 108/25 116/21 117/5 118/14 orally [1] 4/19 order [3] 8/23 9/25 37/22 nowhere [1] 8/13 28/23 53/19 57/7 62/11 77/11 115/1 115/2 **number [9]** 28/11 28/15 39/9 49/4 50/21 ordered [1] 98/6 papers [3] 9/4 18/2 60/4 papillae [2] 110/24 111/2 52/18 53/15 55/16 69/5 orders [1] 4/2 numbers [4] 37/15 38/23 44/13 96/7 parade [2] 106/14 106/20 ordinarily [1] 52/12 numerous [1] 92/13 paraded [1] 106/10 organization [1] 8/8 NW [3] 1/17 1/23 2/3 organizations [2] 35/10 119/19 parades [2] 106/14 106/18 origin [1] 42/1 paradigm [1] 17/1 paragraph [8] 62/20 89/23 89/24 90/1 91/22 other [75] 6/2 7/3 8/4 11/6 11/20 11/21 11/22 o'clock [1] 83/16 15/4 18/25 22/20 25/17 28/14 29/20 30/18 92/11 92/12 114/17 PARDO [1] 1/22 O'Connell [1] 19/5 31/16 32/2 33/14 33/16 40/10 40/15 40/21 **object [5]** 10/6 39/3 86/1 101/14 110/14 41/7 41/21 42/10 45/13 50/3 54/25 55/23 Pardon [1] 36/6 **objection [29]** 5/16 10/20 10/20 29/5 29/8 56/16 57/22 60/18 61/25 62/1 62/4 62/10 park [4] 17/24 42/8 42/12 88/1 30/22 32/18 35/2 39/14 45/16 45/18 45/19 Parker [3] 56/19 60/21 93/2 63/23 64/2 68/21 68/23 78/10 85/6 86/23 52/7 52/11 53/13 56/3 56/5 60/12 60/13 62/5 90/18 92/17 93/15 93/23 94/23 95/13 96/13 part [10] 15/25 16/4 22/20 22/21 53/6 81/2 62/6 63/1 71/14 111/6 112/13 113/2 113/14 97/8 97/17 97/25 99/12 99/18 102/5 103/7 94/19 94/20 106/16 124/8 115/22 116/9 104/18 104/25 108/13 108/21 109/10 109/14 participant [1] 12/9 objections [1] 25/8 participate [4] 11/15 11/17 14/10 106/20 109/20 110/18 111/3 111/4 111/5 111/9 objective [1] 105/13 115/17 115/20 115/24 116/1 116/2 118/11 participated [2] 11/12 11/14 particular [11] 9/6 10/14 23/17 23/20 23/21 observations [3] 90/2 91/11 112/25 121/25 observe [3] 11/22 12/10 48/11 others [3] 13/7 43/6 56/12 39/11 52/22 53/9 75/3 82/5 117/14

otherwise [4] 83/21 84/12 103/8 120/15

our [14] 5/22 9/22 10/1 14/20 25/7 25/8 39/9

71/11 77/10 79/3 79/22 79/23 93/12 124/8

particularly [6] 36/1 38/19 56/12 60/19 61/6

parties [3] 3/14 52/19 55/21

77/2

observed [4] 33/12 79/1 98/9 121/15

observer [2] 74/19 115/9

observing [1] 18/13

n	plaintiffs [4] 1/4 1/14 54/9 125/10	l
P	Plaintiffs' [7] 29/7 37/8 38/18 44/21 56/8	
parts [4] 8/13 22/19 45/20 70/11 party [1] 4/13	60/14 62/7 planned [2] 3/23 3/25	
pass [1] 3/12	planning [1] 125/6]
pattern [2] 17/3 46/14 peer [2] 53/5 55/6	plateaus [1] 44/1 platform [3] 79/14 79/17 80/9]
pen [12] 37/5 49/12 49/18 49/21 49/21 49/22	play [3] 8/16 58/17 65/16	
57/18 61/21 61/22 62/16 66/23 117/12	Playback [1] 12/6]
penned [4] 56/21 58/10 61/24 66/3 penning [2] 56/15 61/17	played [2] 45/1 46/3 playing [1] 46/19	
Pennsylvania [1] 1/23	please [9] 16/6 19/3 22/15 72/5 78/2 78/3]
pens [10] 48/17 49/9 56/22 57/11 58/11 61/23 62/16 73/9 73/10 117/13	78/24 89/9 95/17 plenty [1] 117/11	
people [12] 11/8 14/1 35/24 42/3 80/5 81/22	Plus [1] 40/15	
82/21 99/17 100/15 105/2 108/1 110/22 per [8] 21/2 21/5 22/20 26/16 73/24 96/8	PM [1] 1/6 point [14] 34/7 34/20 39/9 44/10 66/20 73/18]
116/23 117/4	74/3 82/23 85/7 85/8 85/10 101/12 117/25	
perceived [1] 108/18	124/5]
percent [18] 43/22 44/2 44/2 44/6 44/8 49/5 50/3 51/18 51/21 51/22 51/25 51/25 51/25	pointed [2] 15/15 100/11 poke [1] 82/19	
57/21 57/23 58/9 111/25 123/11	poker [1] 83/2	l
perception [2] 111/8 119/17 perfectly [1] 65/18	poor [4] 112/2 112/19 115/20 121/18 pop [1] 102/3	
perform [3] 58/19 59/25 65/18	portion [2] 10/6 111/19	
performance [1] 67/21 performances [1] 82/15	portray [1] 95/21 pose [1] 122/13	l.
performed [13] 19/17 19/20 19/23 20/2 20/4	posed [2] 26/12 33/16	
20/9 20/12 20/14 20/15 20/18 20/21 20/25 21/3	position [1] 65/25]
performing [2] 69/8 91/24	positive [6] 22/23 26/20 27/2 55/9 55/14 85/21	l
perhaps [2] 78/16 82/7	postdoctoral [1] 12/3]
period [20] 27/24 40/7 42/23 43/20 51/20 52/1 52/2 52/4 66/4 73/22 73/25 74/1 74/17	powers [1] 31/14 practice [1] 12/25]
76/10 90/3 90/6 91/12 118/23 119/14 123/9	precedent [3] 54/7 54/16 54/17]
periods [8] 31/7 31/11 39/5 44/3 49/7 51/9 67/10 91/24	predators [1] 103/7 predictor [1] 99/8	
permitted [1] 25/18	predisposition [1] 41/13	
persist [1] 76/23 person [7] 12/3 40/1 61/5 81/13 81/16 82/7	pregnant [1] 87/4 prepare [1] 8/24	ď
82/8	preparing [1] 11/5	(
person's [1] 61/9 personally [1] 33/12	prerogative [1] 92/24 prescribed [1] 22/2	
perspective [3] 15/21 28/17 100/8	presence [1] 32/23	ľ
persuade [2] 32/23 34/17	presented [1] 37/23	1
pertinent [1] 60/19 pet [1] 16/9	presently [1] 5/10 preservation [1] 78/8	ľ
PETTEWAY [1] 1/21	press [1] 10/1	ľ
Ph.D [1] 3/4 phenomenon [1] 13/19	pressures [1] 48/16 presumably [1] 3/14	
philosophically [1] 35/12	pretty [8] 38/2 49/24 71/22 71/25 83/23 88/9	
photograph [1] 38/8 photos [1] 37/9	99/15 120/12 prevalence [3] 50/8 50/9 50/11	
physical [6] 16/21 25/21 33/3 92/15 93/13	prevent [1] 87/12	
98/23 physiologically [1] 111/12	PREVENTION [1] 1/3 previous [4] 90/2 91/11 93/19 121/4	
picket [4] 37/7 47/11 66/3 66/22	previously [1] 29/3	l
picketed [2] 61/19 114/6 picketing [1] 61/17	primary [3] 60/7 60/7 60/7 primate [1] 7/19	
pickets [1] 65/13	principle [2] 23/23 45/15	
picture [1] 60/22 pictured [1] 7/12	principles [12] 22/21 23/2 23/4 23/19 24/9 24/14 26/19 26/25 27/1 27/8 27/10 27/11	1
pictureu [1] //12 pictures [2] 37/24 109/11	print [1] 95/14	ľ
piece [1] 8/20	prior [2] 13/2 82/6	ľ
pilot [1] 16/13 pitched [1] 19/7	private [1] 12/24 privilege [1] 40/11	ľ
place [10] 23/21 34/23 40/18 49/9 49/23	probably [12] 6/2 34/20 39/10 68/15 70/17	
49/24 51/8 64/10 83/17 119/20 placebo [2] 16/16 16/23	75/22 76/6 76/8 82/3 91/8 103/18 119/18 probe [2] 34/15 34/16	
placed [2] 10/19 10/22	problem [3] 16/9 16/11 71/20	
places [2] 104/1 110/25 Plaintiff [1] 3/3	problems [2] 28/13 73/11 procedure [1] 125/12]
Plaintiff's [2] 114/12 115/16	procedures [3] 24/8 24/11 24/13	1
		ı

proceed [4] 35/5 46/5 55/18 56/6 proceedings [2] 2/25 126/4 process [3] 10/22 14/11 106/3 processing [1] 31/24 **produced** [1] 2/25 produces [1] 105/21 **producing [1]** 120/2 **professional [2]** 55/7 106/7 **proffer [1]** 116/9 **profiles [2]** 13/14 13/16 **project** [1] 13/22 promised [1] 121/12 **proper [1]** 22/2 properly [1] 39/7 protected [2] 23/14 24/2 **protection [1]** 35/10 **prove [4]** 72/13 73/5 73/7 73/13 provide [1] 87/18 **provided [5]** 21/24 24/25 25/9 25/10 25/11 provisionally [4] 4/10 38/17 55/20 56/4 Prozac [1] 16/12 psychological [3] 25/21 92/16 93/14 psychotropic [1] 16/12 public [2] 35/23 36/1 **publication [10]** 6/23 7/1 7/6 8/17 9/19 10/19 10/23 29/2 62/18 93/23 **publications** [5] 8/19 8/23 14/18 52/13 55/17 **publish** [1] 19/6 published [6] 9/17 9/19 14/16 14/23 18/1 53/5 pull [5] 62/12 86/23 88/2 101/19 111/16 punishment [3] 22/23 26/21 27/3 **purpose [3]** 29/10 34/3 34/25 push [2] 85/5 115/8 put [25] 6/21 10/1 10/4 33/24 37/6 37/6 40/18 41/12 41/20 43/2 43/16 51/3 51/16 52/1 56/22 66/2 79/17 86/10 102/19 108/11 108/12 119/14 120/12 120/16 122/9 putting [3] 29/22 49/17 78/16

qualification [1] 26/18 qualifications [1] 29/10 qualified [4] 25/16 26/17 34/14 34/22 **qualify** [4] 22/13 33/4 65/1 119/2 **qualitatively [2]** 111/9 111/12 **quality [1]** 41/10 question [58] 3/16 15/25 16/3 16/6 17/22 18/11 18/17 18/24 19/2 19/12 22/14 23/8 23/16 24/1 24/22 26/13 26/17 30/1 30/11 30/14 30/23 31/1 31/10 33/16 38/24 39/16 39/18 39/19 40/24 64/22 67/3 78/2 84/11 87/19 87/22 88/6 88/9 88/12 90/21 90/24 91/7 95/17 95/19 95/22 95/23 106/24 107/23 108/7 108/19 110/3 111/7 111/20 113/10 121/13 122/14 122/21 123/14 123/25 questions [18] 25/25 26/12 28/5 86/14 104/18 109/23 112/21 113/6 114/11 116/16 120/25 121/2 121/8 121/25 122/13 124/9 124/12 124/13 quick [2] 5/9 8/2 quickly [2] 54/11 123/17 quiet [1] 99/15 quite [4] 27/23 30/8 86/5 124/24 quote [5] 91/10 91/12 91/13 91/15 114/22

R

R-A-L-I-E [1] 19/9 railroad [12] 37/23 38/25 39/13 39/20 42/24 43/18 47/12 56/14 74/2 74/10 115/12 115/15 raise [1] 99/10 raising [1] 99/6 range [15] 22/22 78/22 79/1 79/11 80/19

reflect [1] 41/12 reviewed [2] 53/5 55/6 R reflected [3] 38/20 66/25 76/11 reviewing [1] 14/13 range... [10] 80/22 80/23 95/19 96/4 96/6 reflects [1] 41/6 reviews [1] 34/9 96/7 96/10 96/11 96/17 121/16 refresh [1] 77/25 rhino [1] 79/7 ranges [1] 96/14 regard [3] 14/5 14/11 115/3 **Richardson [4]** 54/17 54/18 54/23 54/23 ranging [2] 50/13 88/2 regarding [8] 25/13 25/22 34/7 34/11 34/12 **Richardson-Merrell [2]** 54/18 54/23 72/21 76/15 106/24 rapidly [1] 106/12 ridden [2] 82/3 83/10 rare [1] 84/3 regardless [3] 15/22 22/22 27/4 ride [12] 81/6 81/23 83/10 83/12 83/16 84/13 rat [1] 31/13 reinforcement [10] 22/23 22/23 22/24 26/20 85/25 87/13 88/7 88/8 109/16 120/8 rate [4] 35/20 35/21 36/15 49/18 26/20 27/2 27/3 27/4 85/21 120/6 rides [5] 80/24 87/25 87/25 116/25 117/2 rather [4] 14/14 14/15 54/14 124/10 riding [2] 79/10 81/24 reinforces [1] 70/20 rationale [3] 29/3 62/4 71/12 relate [3] 8/4 67/4 67/6 right [107] 4/20 4/21 5/5 5/8 7/4 8/21 8/22 ratios [1] 22/24 related [1] 15/19 10/12 13/9 13/18 13/21 15/9 15/14 16/5 17/8 Rayleigh [1] 19/9 17/12 19/12 23/12 24/5 25/25 30/25 31/23 relates [3] 4/1 33/23 50/10 reach [3] 43/22 74/3 76/1 relating [3] 28/5 33/3 33/22 31/24 32/8 36/19 39/21 45/4 45/5 47/6 50/11 reaches [1] 44/1 **relationship [4]** 30/4 51/13 59/24 82/13 50/17 50/23 59/17 60/16 61/1 63/15 64/5 reaching [1] 7/22 relative [1] 28/21 64/25 65/10 66/8 66/9 66/17 68/12 68/17 react [7] 99/21 102/25 103/1 103/2 103/3 relatively [8] 43/19 49/11 50/2 51/16 51/19 70/24 72/3 72/7 72/20 72/22 74/7 76/6 76/8 103/4 108/21 52/18 75/2 123/9 76/22 78/4 78/12 79/15 79/16 80/9 80/10 reaction [11] 98/22 99/7 102/4 102/5 102/5 released [2] 37/2 88/1 81/18 83/7 83/22 84/10 86/13 88/11 89/21 102/7 102/10 105/16 105/24 107/16 115/9 relevant [3] 26/21 40/21 62/11 91/4 91/9 91/10 92/3 92/9 92/11 93/7 93/9 reactions [2] 98/23 98/23 reliable [1] 111/18 93/25 94/10 94/12 95/6 96/2 98/1 98/11 read [46] 4/24 5/4 6/1 8/23 17/4 18/23 19/11 relied [3] 4/3 29/2 56/5 98/17 98/19 99/23 100/17 100/19 101/2 23/8 23/11 23/25 24/4 35/24 37/16 39/18 rely [4] 4/8 5/2 55/21 56/4 101/5 103/21 104/16 104/22 105/8 106/21 51/17 52/16 52/22 52/23 52/24 53/20 54/4 relying [2] 54/14 55/21 107/12 108/21 109/13 109/19 109/22 109/24 58/21 58/22 59/24 68/21 78/11 78/18 88/17 remember [11] 41/11 41/18 42/4 42/5 42/7 110/11 111/13 113/15 114/15 121/1 121/13 88/25 90/7 90/8 91/18 91/19 92/19 92/20 42/14 42/14 43/18 70/14 70/19 70/20 124/14 125/11 93/18 94/4 94/25 95/1 95/3 96/1 108/2 remembering [3] 8/14 8/15 34/8 rights [1] 35/9 111/24 121/18 121/20 121/22 **Ringling [10]** 65/22 67/14 68/2 98/6 112/24 remembers [1] 33/17 reader [1] 3/12 render [1] 63/7 113/13 113/24 114/5 118/21 119/25 readily [1] 101/1 rendered [1] 21/21 Rodwell [1] 19/4 reading [5] 29/21 52/14 93/25 110/13 112/6 repeatedly [1] 49/7 room [2] 2/3 119/15 roughly [1] 91/24 reads [3] 6/23 58/16 111/17 repertoire [1] 59/3 real [1] 99/11 repetitive [4] 40/25 43/14 46/12 114/19 row [1] 107/14 realistic [1] 101/22 rephrase [5] 18/17 22/14 22/15 24/22 24/23 **RPR [3]** 2/2 126/2 126/9 really [12] 4/22 5/1 8/6 9/8 10/2 30/5 64/8 rephrasing [1] 113/5 rule [4] 54/15 55/8 92/16 93/14 82/10 88/14 97/23 106/6 124/23 report [16] 8/11 14/17 25/6 36/16 49/19 ruled [1] 30/10 72/23 77/14 89/20 93/6 94/11 95/18 96/4 realm [1] 104/8 rules [1] 53/18 reason [10] 79/4 79/25 80/1 88/18 104/9 96/9 96/12 96/16 123/5 ruling [2] 62/5 71/14 110/21 111/13 115/24 117/15 123/3 reported [2] 96/6 119/22 rumbles [1] 19/7 reasonable [2] 110/16 120/16 reporter [5] 2/2 2/2 34/4 102/15 121/12 run [2] 88/3 120/19 rush [1] 103/16 reasons [7] 25/8 52/18 55/21 55/23 56/5 60/9 reporting [3] 51/9 96/6 96/15 122/25 reports [3] 35/19 47/10 91/13 S recall [15] 5/7 15/18 36/15 57/20 75/13 75/18 represent [1] 36/2 75/21 75/22 76/10 77/1 77/9 77/10 84/8 S-64 [1] 78/3 represents [3] 7/8 7/14 7/18 98/12 114/14 reputable [1] 10/17 saddled [1] 81/5 request [1] 10/11 safari [1] 84/13 recent [1] 108/15 required [1] 93/20 receptors [2] 101/25 110/18 safe [2] 122/5 122/8 said [23] 9/24 19/2 22/13 22/14 30/5 34/11 recess [5] 68/14 70/25 71/4 71/7 71/8 requires [2] 23/21 31/22 recognize [1] 43/4 36/18 44/12 48/1 48/20 75/21 75/22 77/20 rescue [1] 119/18 research [41] 6/21 7/2 11/13 11/20 12/4 recognizes [1] 55/23 77/23 78/13 81/5 85/23 93/21 95/7 108/19 recollection [4] 38/9 50/7 77/25 85/13 13/13 14/3 14/5 14/19 15/11 15/16 16/1 16/4 115/4 122/23 124/24 record [16] 3/21 4/24 29/6 37/16 46/16 62/3 17/10 17/13 17/21 18/5 18/10 18/15 18/15 sake [1] 38/23 89/7 89/11 89/15 89/16 111/17 122/9 122/11 same [36] 6/23 12/1 17/2 29/3 31/13 37/11 18/25 18/25 19/13 27/13 27/14 28/6 28/8 122/15 123/18 126/3 28/8 28/23 29/15 29/16 29/19 29/19 30/3 45/15 49/7 49/16 57/10 57/18 60/9 60/12 recorded [1] 2/25 30/6 30/18 33/8 48/23 50/15 53/16 69/16 60/20 60/21 60/21 61/21 62/4 62/5 62/13 recording [2] 12/6 46/17 residual [2] 54/15 55/7 71/12 71/14 71/14 71/19 79/24 93/22 100/21 **RECROSS [2]** 3/2 116/19 102/25 103/1 103/2 103/4 103/5 108/9 resources [1] 9/8 RECROSS-EXAMINATION [1] 116/19 respect [2] 9/14 32/14 108/21 113/14 125/11 recruit [1] 16/17 respected [1] 10/18 **SANERIB** [1] 1/15 Red [1] 101/17 respond [5] 43/2 100/22 108/10 108/13 saw [6] 4/3 37/12 37/24 58/1 79/8 88/18 **REDIRECT [4]** 3/2 109/24 110/1 122/19 108/22 say [51] 4/18 8/2 16/18 17/20 19/22 27/8 **reduction [5]** 49/19 49/20 57/18 57/20 58/10 response [4] 10/11 47/24 107/15 110/4 27/17 27/19 38/22 43/20 43/23 50/24 51/12 refer [5] 19/14 70/4 74/2 79/3 96/15 responses [4] 102/1 107/1 107/6 107/24 57/5 57/21 59/7 59/12 65/25 73/18 73/20 reference [2] 8/3 66/20 rest [3] 4/16 33/18 59/10 75/7 76/4 76/13 78/24 81/3 84/5 84/23 85/23 referenced [1] 9/18 restrain [1] 83/19 86/24 87/11 87/11 94/6 96/7 96/11 96/16 references [1] 8/18 restricted [2] 58/18 80/5 101/12 101/13 102/7 104/15 106/20 107/2 referred [10] 41/20 42/21 48/5 49/19 50/14 result [2] 58/16 99/14 107/7 108/8 110/11 112/18 118/2 118/14 75/25 79/22 80/3 115/4 115/14 resume [1] 46/2 119/3 119/10 119/15 120/1 referring [21] 15/18 17/23 45/20 45/20 48/2 **RESUMED** [1] 35/7 saying [13] 31/20 37/21 40/13 41/22 41/23 50/18 50/22 52/3 57/1 59/3 60/25 74/12 returning [1] 122/5 43/10 46/6 62/13 70/18 75/24 77/6 104/13 75/18 76/25 91/4 97/22 107/8 112/12 113/18 review [10] 9/2 9/4 9/5 9/9 9/14 10/15 10/25 110/12 116/25 118/14 11/20 28/23 59/23 savs [10] 10/14 33/10 62/21 86/8 91/10 91/13

SHEA [2] 1/21 28/5 63/25 Shea's [1] 52/11 socialize [1] 64/22 says... [4] 91/22 93/16 121/15 123/1 **ship [1]** 88/13 socially [1] 43/2 scale [1] 7/14 short [4] 9/25 43/19 51/16 110/4 SOCIETY [2] 1/3 11/16 scare [3] 104/23 105/1 105/2 should [19] 3/12 3/16 3/24 25/18 25/21 32/23 solve [1] 16/11 schedules [1] 27/4 32/24 52/16 68/14 71/4 95/21 116/22 117/3 some [63] 6/2 8/3 9/8 9/24 11/24 13/13 16/20 Schmid [8] 62/11 71/11 72/11 72/11 72/19 117/7 117/9 117/23 118/7 118/23 122/15 17/10 17/18 17/23 18/3 19/7 28/12 37/25 73/4 92/1 92/7 shouldn't [5] 34/2 34/22 118/3 118/18 125/8 38/21 43/11 46/7 47/14 47/18 48/12 49/16 school [1] 28/12 show [24] 15/23 23/6 23/24 49/8 49/19 64/1 52/3 56/16 61/8 64/11 65/16 67/7 73/16 74/6 65/19 67/25 70/11 73/10 87/17 89/22 91/5 science [3] 9/22 54/8 75/5 74/11 76/25 78/15 80/5 81/11 82/4 82/6 scientific [3] 52/13 57/16 110/15 92/10 92/11 93/4 93/5 93/8 94/13 95/15 83/18 85/21 85/21 87/25 89/2 98/3 98/22 scientists [1] 29/16 97/17 107/21 108/11 119/11 99/16 99/18 101/8 101/8 101/12 102/5 scope [1] 39/4 showed [1] 119/9 108/17 112/21 114/11 114/20 117/25 118/16 screen [2] 6/22 10/14 showing [4] 18/20 47/15 49/16 73/12 119/18 119/20 120/6 120/6 122/17 123/7 se [5] 21/2 21/5 22/20 26/16 73/24 **shown [4]** 15/6 49/4 98/15 109/11 123/8 124/5 second [6] 45/12 61/7 78/4 109/11 111/23 shows [3] 43/18 51/15 120/11 somebody [1] 28/7 114/17 sic [1] 90/20 someone [1] 30/6 secondly [1] 11/17 side [3] 41/21 46/6 72/7 **someplace [1]** 118/16 Section [1] 89/23 something [34] 10/10 19/9 23/18 30/7 33/10 sides [2] 53/2 72/2 see [43] 7/12 8/7 12/10 15/23 34/13 37/25 sifting [1] 30/13 33/12 33/15 33/18 33/19 42/5 42/5 43/13 38/4 38/7 46/6 47/19 48/8 48/12 48/15 50/1 signal [1] 82/9 51/17 55/24 66/3 75/19 75/22 82/20 86/8 60/3 62/23 66/16 71/18 71/19 71/25 73/13 significance [1] 61/4 88/13 88/13 88/15 95/8 97/17 98/20 99/4 73/21 73/22 74/23 75/2 77/24 77/25 78/5 significant [2] 27/17 61/6 99/19 103/25 114/3 119/8 119/10 120/7 78/5 79/20 83/13 83/13 84/3 84/7 89/24 signs [1] 97/4 122/9 123/17 similar [3] 83/2 107/15 110/18 102/20 103/4 104/4 104/6 112/3 114/22 sometimes [8] 43/21 43/22 61/9 61/9 77/4 117/14 123/6 simply [2] 54/14 55/4 84/7 103/16 104/5 seeing [1] 82/21 SIMPSON [1] 1/20 somewhat [2] 10/21 90/13 seem [1] 36/18 since [3] 27/16 28/25 125/5 somewhere [1] 69/13 seems [5] 6/4 51/4 53/4 78/13 78/15 **Sinnott [4]** 4/1 123/21 123/23 123/23 soon [2] 72/3 125/2 seen [36] 19/19 20/1 46/14 47/24 48/2 48/4 Sinnott's [1] 4/1 sooner [1] 124/10 59/9 66/9 66/10 66/10 66/12 66/13 68/5 sorry [19] 7/7 15/24 19/22 32/18 46/4 54/21 sir [1] 68/6 68/21 78/21 79/10 79/12 79/24 82/19 82/22 sit [2] 40/6 80/8 58/3 72/13 81/14 87/23 89/7 93/24 102/15 87/20 88/19 99/3 101/8 102/17 106/14 site [8] 12/5 36/4 36/7 36/9 36/21 67/17 104/16 104/17 106/21 108/5 118/5 123/21 106/17 109/21 115/4 115/5 115/8 117/16 79/23 79/24 sort [1] 44/1 117/20 119/22 119/22 123/1 sites [2] 11/25 12/8 sound [3] 8/20 100/1 105/4 segue [1] 3/17 sits [3] 80/11 80/15 81/13 sounds [3] 99/13 99/13 99/16 seismic [5] 12/4 17/10 18/7 19/5 25/15 sitting [1] 81/25 space [6] 38/1 38/5 48/18 48/21 69/6 119/21 select [1] 75/6 situation [15] 40/9 47/15 49/15 49/15 81/11 speaking [4] 77/2 77/9 90/17 91/3 seminatural [1] 48/5 84/15 112/11 113/18 113/25 115/3 118/2 speaks [1] 40/8 send [1] 16/17 118/3 118/6 118/8 118/21 special [2] 36/1 86/4 sends [1] 10/25 specialist [1] 9/23 situations [6] 11/23 68/22 68/23 69/1 111/25 sense [11] 32/1 32/2 40/5 40/12 52/8 52/9 112/2 specialists [2] 10/25 11/11 six [4] 81/8 83/12 90/3 91/13 53/4 64/8 69/20 78/13 101/19 specialize [1] 9/7 sensing [2] 96/19 96/22 sketch [1] 52/3 species [17] 15/22 22/22 22/22 23/3 27/5 sensitive [2] 69/22 70/11 skin [5] 69/18 69/20 69/21 110/23 110/24 28/15 28/17 31/16 31/16 46/13 58/16 58/19 sensitivity [2] 69/17 69/19 sleep [2] 59/9 59/10 58/25 59/25 97/14 97/15 111/10 sensory [1] 7/24 slight [1] 98/3 species-specific [1] 58/25 sent [2] 11/8 16/22 slightly [2] 87/22 87/24 species-typical [3] 58/16 58/19 59/25 sentence [13] 58/15 59/24 62/19 78/5 91/10 specific [2] 58/25 97/15 **slow [2]** 88/14 88/22 91/21 92/2 93/9 93/19 93/23 111/23 114/18 slows [3] 86/25 88/3 88/11 specifically [5] 34/11 39/12 50/15 111/21 120/24 small [8] 48/17 48/21 52/18 58/11 66/23 125/5 sentences [1] 112/5 82/18 117/13 123/9 speed [1] 91/8 sequella [1] 98/23 smaller [3] 9/17 49/12 91/25 spelling [1] 19/10 serious [2] 4/22 40/14 **spend [4]** 28/10 48/3 49/3 91/23 smells [1] 8/15 served [1] 120/20 so [120] 4/6 4/11 4/24 5/14 6/3 7/13 8/14 9/9 spending [1] 67/4 service [2] 16/1 36/2 10/4 11/9 12/5 14/10 16/11 16/15 16/15 17/1 spends [1] 59/14 spent [5] 12/1 12/7 27/17 35/18 90/6 services [1] 35/20 18/17 22/22 23/4 26/7 26/13 27/22 28/16 29/22 30/7 30/25 31/17 31/24 32/3 32/9 **Session** [1] 1/6 sponsorship [1] 16/20 set [4] 16/15 24/21 73/15 103/24 32/13 32/23 32/24 33/12 33/21 34/13 36/1 spot [1] 42/10 setting [5] 23/23 48/11 54/7 64/24 65/11 37/16 38/7 40/1 40/10 40/19 41/19 41/22 spread [1] 7/21 settings [1] 69/5 42/8 42/13 43/7 43/10 43/15 47/14 47/19 square [1] 119/15 setup [1] 38/12 48/20 50/6 50/9 51/9 52/16 55/2 56/7 57/11 stabbed [4] 99/10 101/23 107/13 107/14 seven [10] 43/23 44/12 44/14 44/16 52/4 **stabbing [1]** 108/14 58/10 59/3 64/2 68/20 69/10 70/6 70/10 112/18 116/21 116/23 117/4 117/8 71/12 73/12 74/23 75/4 75/10 75/11 76/11 stable [2] 82/11 87/10 seventh [1] 7/5 77/5 77/6 78/14 79/8 79/10 81/13 82/5 82/7 stables [7] 80/20 81/1 86/4 86/19 87/24 92/18 several [5] 13/2 18/2 70/19 73/1 96/8 82/8 82/13 86/1 86/25 87/9 87/12 88/1 88/2 severe [2] 63/22 64/2 88/3 90/15 90/16 91/15 92/25 94/5 95/22 staging [1] 37/6 sharp [4] 101/14 107/12 110/7 110/14 96/13 97/7 97/25 101/10 102/1 103/21 stake [2] 81/3 118/16 she [12] 4/3 9/24 42/7 42/9 42/9 46/8 46/23 106/20 108/17 108/19 110/25 113/19 113/20 stakes [2] 83/7 105/11 46/24 46/24 47/8 98/18 103/1 113/25 114/3 117/15 117/21 118/12 118/21 stand [7] 5/7 35/4 40/7 40/18 71/4 86/9 she'd [1] 9/23 120/7 120/9 120/23 123/6 123/10 124/9 123/21 she's [11] 12/3 46/7 46/19 46/24 47/1 47/2 standard [3] 95/18 96/4 96/16 sociable [1] 33/25 47/4 47/5 47/7 97/8 124/7 social [7] 8/13 42/14 42/21 43/2 43/8 58/17 standards [1] 11/2

S	studying [5] 14/11 35/18 63/10 79/6 92/13	71/18 talked [9] 30/19 42/4 45/14 48/16 82/3 96/19
standing [1] 37/1	stuff [1] 86/5 subject [7] 4/11 28/18 34/5 34/25 34/25 39/6	98/20 112/10 123/24
standpoint [3] 11/10 11/10 102/9	111/4	talking [25] 4/15 6/20 6/23 7/2 11/21 18/12
start [8] 23/23 26/25 77/17 80/25 87/18 113/5 120/10 124/15	subjected [1] 65/23	28/24 33/2 33/2 33/21 37/16 39/13 44/19 44/22 52/19 53/2 56/17 66/5 72/6 76/11
starting [6] 8/18 91/6 95/15 95/16 107/21	subjects [1] 96/10 submission [1] 5/22	108/14 114/5 117/5 118/12 122/4
107/22	submit [1] 10/24	talks [1] 39/12
state [8] 10/8 39/16 53/19 75/6 77/18 78/9 121/17 123/1	suboptimal [1] 114/21	TANYA [1] 1/15
stated [1] 25/8	subpoenaed [1] 123/23 subsequently [1] 79/23	Taxon [1] 21/15 team [3] 101/17 101/18 124/8
statement [26] 48/1 62/20 62/23 62/25 63/5	substantial [4] 57/20 87/14 87/15 88/9	telephone [1] 125/9
90/9 90/25 92/5 92/22 94/2 94/15 94/18	substrate [1] 119/3	tell [25] 18/2 31/20 38/4 45/2 52/9 52/10
94/20 94/21 94/23 94/24 95/4 95/11 95/12 95/18 95/24 103/22 104/7 114/22 114/25	success [1] 25/23 such [7] 16/20 35/20 58/17 96/5 104/9	55/21 56/4 66/1 69/23 74/10 74/10 76/5 82/2 96/14 97/7 97/23 97/25 100/13 101/4 102/17
122/22	119/21 119/25	103/17 124/19 124/24 125/5
statements [3] 92/24 114/24 123/9	suffered [1] 42/12	telling [2] 75/13 76/6
states [5] 1/1 1/11 90/1 92/12 93/11 stationary [2] 69/12 69/13	suffering [1] 97/24 suggest [1] 115/18	ten [1] 81/3 tend [1] 99/16
stations [1] 106/14	suggested [3] 50/9 50/25 52/11	tender [1] 12/16
status [2] 53/6 82/20	suggesting [1] 110/6	tendered [1] 54/9
stay [4] 72/3 83/17 84/23 87/13 stenography [1] 2/25	suggests [1] 73/23 Suite [2] 1/17 1/23	tends [1] 103/13 term [7] 8/7 32/4 69/20 76/6 80/6 112/17
step [8] 26/7 32/8 38/15 38/15 40/2 40/2 40/2	SULLIVAN [3] 1/10 7/8 30/20	116/1
124/22	Sullivan's [1] 67/3	terms [4] 4/6 29/15 38/12 54/16
stereotypia [1] 111/17 stereotypic [65] 19/18 19/20 19/23 40/25	summarize [1] 66/19 summary [1] 112/5	testified [1] 27/13 testify [6] 25/18 32/17 32/24 34/24 113/5
43/12 44/1 46/11 46/13 46/17 48/9 49/11	summer [1] 11/17	113/6
49/20 50/2 50/11 51/6 51/10 51/18 51/24	summers [1] 27/20	testifying [3] 4/2 13/10 34/23
57/6 57/7 57/19 58/3 58/7 60/4 60/8 61/15 61/15 61/20 62/14 66/25 72/14 72/21 73/5	supply [1] 41/15 support [2] 48/23 61/12	testimony [29] 3/17 4/1 4/4 4/7 4/16 5/3 17/4 23/11 24/4 25/7 25/9 26/12 26/22 34/1 35/1
73/14 73/17 73/21 73/25 74/4 74/7 74/23	support [2] 48/23 01/12 supports [3] 41/13 50/24 57/5	35/15 41/2 47/24 71/5 88/17 88/25 91/18
76/19 76/23 77/1 77/3 77/17 90/4 90/10	sure [16] 5/17 5/19 6/22 19/10 24/23 34/7	91/19 96/1 113/7 113/7 117/23 124/2 124/4
90/13 90/15 90/17 90/19 91/1 91/14 114/13 115/25 117/20 119/4 119/10 119/11 119/16	41/15 47/6 53/6 55/14 72/16 80/6 84/6 88/16 118/11 122/2	testing [1] 17/2
119/22 120/2 120/10 123/3 123/11	116/11 122/2 surface [1] 111/1	tether [2] 117/24 118/15 tethered [1] 113/24
stereotypical [3] 46/9 47/25 115/19	surrounding [1] 16/18	tethering [4] 20/18 25/19 49/17 118/9
stereotypies [6] 58/20 62/21 78/6 112/1 114/18 114/21	survey [1] 48/15	than [48] 11/20 14/14 14/15 18/25 25/17 27/21 31/16 40/15 44/16 50/13 57/22 58/9
stereotypy [2] 112/1 112/11	survive [1] 42/8 Susan [1] 109/6	61/20 67/10 68/15 71/23 74/17 74/24 74/24
stick [6] 85/2 85/4 85/7 85/11 110/24 111/2	Sustained [1] 63/3	75/20 76/12 81/25 82/14 90/14 90/16 91/23
still [6] 6/9 42/9 46/24 47/4 47/8 63/6 stimulus [1] 103/14	swat [5] 70/7 101/4 101/7 105/10 106/4 swatting [6] 105/9 105/16 105/21 105/22	91/24 99/12 102/5 106/8 108/13 109/10 109/14 109/20 111/9 112/17 112/24 113/13
stop [4] 111/17 111/17 119/16 121/11	106/1 107/17	114/4 115/20 116/1 116/23 117/4 117/7
stopped [3] 16/14 80/17 85/20	sway [3] 46/15 47/17 47/18	117/18 119/8 120/15 124/11
story [3] 67/10 118/17 119/9 strange [2] 23/22 99/19	swaying [6] 47/20 58/2 58/5 58/6 58/6 98/18 swing [1] 46/15	thank [14] 5/25 6/14 29/7 29/12 29/13 31/2 35/3 35/5 56/7 58/4 71/3 122/4 123/13
strapped [1] 79/17	swing [1] 40/13 switch [2] 69/25 70/7	123/16
stress [1] 108/1	switches [1] 79/9	that [693]
stretch [1] 41/21 strike [6] 10/7 20/3 25/7 77/16 78/20 99/4	switching [9] 15/5 18/6 19/1 25/14 25/17 33/9 69/16 69/23 70/10	that's [133] the 2007 [1] 15/7
striking [1] 34/13	33/9 09/10 09/23 70/10 symbol [1] 82/20	the 2007 [1] 15/7 the 2008 [1] 15/6
strong [1] 44/8	symposia [2] 11/12 11/14	their [59] 29/16 30/4 31/12 31/12 31/12
struck [2] 33/17 34/8 student [4] 12/3 17/10 19/4 61/8	symposium [2] 11/15 14/9	31/25 31/25 33/14 33/15 33/19 40/17 41/15 42/15 42/25 43/4 43/7 43/7 46/14 46/15
student [4] 12/3 17/10 19/4 01/8 studied [2] 91/25 104/2	system [5] 64/25 65/24 66/14 67/15 120/16 systems [5] 9/21 62/22 92/17 93/15 114/22	48/17 52/15 54/9 56/22 59/2 59/8 59/9 59/13
studies [70] 12/6 12/7 12/9 14/5 14/14 18/6	T	63/11 63/24 64/3 66/10 66/25 67/22 73/9
18/7 18/14 18/14 18/16 19/17 19/20 19/23 20/2 20/4 20/9 20/12 20/14 20/15 20/17	tabanids [1] 70/4	77/6 78/16 80/15 80/17 80/21 81/9 82/8 82/10 82/11 83/12 85/10 86/6 86/10 86/11
20/18 20/21 20/25 21/2 21/3 21/5 24/19	Table [3] 90/5 90/6 95/8	97/11 97/12 98/1 99/12 99/13 105/9 108/12
24/21 25/13 25/14 25/15 27/10 27/21 28/14	tables [3] 90/3 91/3 91/4	108/15 108/16 114/2 115/11
28/15 29/22 34/12 42/3 43/17 47/25 48/2 49/1 49/4 49/8 49/16 49/19 52/18 52/22 53/1	tail [2] 105/9 106/11 take [35] 7/12 26/10 26/13 37/8 38/17 38/22	them [101] 4/11 11/1 22/25 22/25 23/1 23/1 24/20 27/9 30/21 31/14 33/18 35/25 35/25
53/5 53/9 54/1 54/3 55/6 56/16 60/18 62/1	42/8 56/24 57/16 58/14 58/24 59/11 60/23	37/2 41/15 43/23 44/7 44/15 50/1 52/14
62/10 72/19 73/1 73/5 73/7 73/18 73/19	62/17 62/19 68/14 70/8 70/24 71/4 77/6 80/2	52/16 52/20 52/22 52/23 52/24 52/25 65/13
73/24 75/2 75/8 75/12 76/16 76/25 study [46] 11/25 12/5 12/8 15/20 18/1 27/17	80/24 81/6 87/25 88/9 111/19 111/23 112/9 114/16 119/13 119/19 120/7 120/13 120/15	65/17 65/18 65/19 65/21 66/1 67/9 67/9 67/18 67/20 69/3 69/4 70/4 72/14 72/23
27/21 50/2 50/18 50/22 50/24 51/7 51/15	120/18	79/24 81/24 82/3 82/12 82/12 82/19 82/22
51/20 52/6 53/11 56/11 56/19 57/1 57/3 57/5	taken [7] 37/5 44/13 45/4 48/7 49/17 73/23	83/13 83/21 84/6 84/6 84/19 84/20 85/1 85/5
58/15 60/10 61/12 61/16 71/12 72/11 72/13 74/12 75/18 76/10 79/7 79/23 79/24 91/8	124/10 takes [4] 27/21 35/4 106/3 119/8	85/14 86/4 86/6 86/6 86/7 86/25 87/12 87/16 87/24 87/25 88/3 88/8 88/11 88/22 99/4
91/17 103/24 111/15 111/16 111/21 111/24	taking [6] 25/20 31/13 69/24 78/25 81/7 83/9	100/7 105/23 105/24 106/4 107/14 110/10
112/6 115/14 120/11 121/16 122/23	talk [7] 32/10 32/22 33/19 53/10 53/25 54/2	110/10 113/19 114/1 115/8 117/15 117/18

		125/10	90/24 91/6 92/10 92/11 92/21 94/12 94/20
	${f T}$	125/10 thinking [3] 23/17 23/19 27/23	80/24 81/6 83/10 83/11 83/21 84/12 84/20 towards [1] 83/20
ľ	them [18] 117/21 118/12 118/14 118/15	thinks [1] 30/12	track [1] 16/24
	118/15 119/20 120/10 120/13 120/13 120/13	this [223]	Trade [1] 55/11
	120/14 124/19 124/24 125/4 125/7 125/9	those [52] 4/5 8/23 11/18 12/8 12/8 12/17	trademark [1] 16/12
	125/11 125/12	13/5 15/1 16/3 17/16 21/18 23/2 23/17 26/4	traditionally [1] 27/19
	themselves [2] 71/18 103/7	27/4 38/21 41/9 44/16 44/18 46/16 48/9	train [22] 22/11 22/17 23/9 23/14 24/1 39/1
	then [81] 3/18 6/9 6/13 7/15 10/25 16/15	49/14 51/12 64/24 67/4 67/19 68/8 68/8	50/15 51/14 51/19 87/20 94/16 94/21 105/7
	16/15 16/17 16/22 19/2 19/8 19/12 26/2 26/6	68/10 68/22 68/24 73/4 73/7 75/2 76/11	106/14 109/12 109/16 109/17 109/21 116/25
	37/5 37/6 37/10 37/11 40/11 40/12 40/23	77/22 80/25 80/25 83/20 89/6 90/5 91/14	117/2 120/1 120/10
	43/25 46/24 47/18 49/8 49/18 50/6 51/19 51/20 52/7 55/10 56/19 56/21 57/11 57/17	98/12 99/17 103/11 106/18 109/23 112/5 112/22 114/24 115/6 124/10	trained [10] 22/20 23/4 24/7 24/16 81/21 82/5 82/6 82/14 83/23 105/6
	59/8 60/15 64/5 64/7 64/13 64/23 65/17	though [6] 88/6 102/4 102/11 103/17 103/22	training [8] 23/5 23/8 24/6 24/12 26/14
	66/23 67/1 67/12 67/23 68/4 68/7 69/4 73/13	105/5	26/16 26/19 26/21
	73/21 73/23 74/5 75/1 78/11 83/8 83/10	thought [10] 3/23 17/20 17/22 32/19 45/12	trains [2] 109/16 112/9
	83/12 83/17 85/15 85/20 86/3 86/3 86/10	69/7 88/21 89/12 124/18 124/23	trance [4] 121/17 123/1 123/2 123/4
	87/1 87/5 87/5 91/12 93/21 101/10 103/19	thoughts [2] 5/18 5/19	trance-like [3] 121/17 123/1 123/4
	104/7 104/8 110/15 114/20 114/20 117/23	thousands [1] 85/19	transcript [3] 1/10 2/25 126/3
	119/9 119/11 120/5 120/13 there [90] 4/12 6/2 6/3 9/4 10/2 11/3 11/22	three [17] 7/11 15/1 27/22 40/2 43/20 51/17	transcription [1] 2/25
	11/24 12/1 14/18 22/13 27/21 28/25 38/3	92/14 96/11 106/2 107/13 107/14 107/14 110/9 110/11 120/12 120/13 120/14	transmitted [2] 19/8 19/8 transport [3] 115/11 120/1 121/17
	38/5 38/23 39/24 40/6 40/7 40/22 40/22 42/2	threshold [21] 73/16 73/19 74/6 74/9 74/9	transportation [1] 4/2
	43/11 43/16 43/25 44/2 44/3 44/15 48/4	74/16 75/5 75/6 75/7 75/11 75/12 75/15	transported [1] 20/3
	48/13 48/13 48/14 49/8 49/16 49/24 54/16	75/24 75/25 76/5 76/8 76/12 76/12 76/14	traveled [1] 11/25
	56/11 56/16 56/16 57/19 58/10 61/4 62/11	76/15 76/16	traveling [1] 92/12
	62/20 65/1 65/15 65/15 65/23 65/24 67/24	through [7] 15/1 26/10 30/13 44/23 45/24	travels [1] 87/21
	68/21 69/5 69/23 72/1 73/16 73/18 74/6 75/7	60/10 107/22	treat [2] 86/5 120/6
	75/19 76/5 76/15 77/9 78/15 80/1 83/12 83/17 85/23 87/3 88/18 90/18 95/13 97/9	throw [3] 123/7 123/7 123/10	treatise [3] 54/4 54/12 54/13
	98/3 98/22 102/18 106/4 106/5 106/7 107/15	thumbnail [1] 52/3 Thursday [2] 5/14 125/13	treatises [1] 53/19 treatment [1] 93/20
	107/25 108/1 110/6 110/23 110/25 115/16	Thursday [2] 5/14 125/15 Thus [2] 97/3 98/9	treats [1] 86/4
	118/11 120/12 123/3 123/4 123/9	tiger [1] 59/7	trial [11] 1/10 6/4 16/15 16/16 16/19 16/20
	there's [34] 3/18 10/3 13/6 18/9 18/18 22/22	till [1] 6/11	53/5 54/8 55/8 55/16 124/8
	38/1 38/13 45/16 47/6 48/25 49/22 52/18	time [76] 4/24 5/12 5/23 12/1 27/16 27/17	trials [1] 52/12
	56/19 56/20 59/2 68/23 71/19 71/21 72/4	27/25 28/1 28/13 28/14 31/8 31/11 35/16	tried [1] 16/11
	73/11 74/8 75/5 76/3 88/24 91/9 99/11 99/20 105/22 106/2 111/20 117/11 117/14 119/10	35/18 39/6 39/17 40/7 41/19 42/3 42/23 43/20 43/22 44/2 44/3 44/4 44/6 49/2 49/5	trip [5] 27/21 36/14 79/3 122/5 122/8 trips [5] 44/18 44/20 78/21 79/1 79/20
	therefore [2] 32/3 39/7	49/7 51/9 51/13 51/20 51/21 51/22 52/1 52/2	trouble [1] 117/14
	these [53] 12/9 15/4 22/24 24/19 27/11 27/20	52/4 57/21 57/23 57/25 66/4 66/22 67/4 67/6	true [42] 5/15 7/14 13/5 13/23 13/24 14/2
	37/1 37/9 37/12 39/21 41/21 44/3 44/13	67/11 68/12 70/25 71/18 71/23 72/2 72/2	14/21 14/22 14/25 15/2 17/7 17/15 18/8
	44/20 47/10 49/18 50/5 51/7 52/22 53/5 53/9	72/7 73/23 73/25 74/1 74/17 75/5 76/10 79/9	19/25 22/8 22/9 25/2 26/16 26/23 27/4 27/15
	54/7 57/22 60/4 65/11 66/16 68/1 68/10	83/16 86/14 86/25 89/17 89/23 90/3 91/12	29/10 41/25 57/2 59/4 61/3 73/3 77/19 79/18
	69/25 70/4 70/7 70/9 70/11 79/8 80/6 81/20	91/23 91/24 104/13 104/16 104/17 106/6	79/19 86/20 87/10 89/5 95/9 95/10 96/20
	82/4 83/23 91/3 91/4 91/23 93/22 96/14 99/22 100/18 104/8 106/10 111/2 114/1	106/22 115/12 123/9 123/12	96/24 97/2 97/8 105/14 109/13 117/8
	115/18 119/4 119/18 119/22	timeframe [1] 112/10 times [6] 7/11 22/25 38/20 38/21 70/19	trumpet [8] 99/17 99/18 99/19 104/20 104/25 105/1 105/1 105/7
	they [326]	102/19	trumpeting [1] 105/4
	they'd [2] 99/9 117/12	title [2] 57/8 61/14	trunk [4] 43/15 58/7 99/6 99/10
	they'll [3] 104/25 105/1 107/15	titled [1] 126/4	trunks [1] 46/15
	they're [29] 59/3 63/9 63/25 67/24 71/19	today [14] 4/18 15/1 17/9 25/9 73/2 76/20	truth [1] 10/10
	72/6 73/9 73/22 73/23 75/8 75/10 77/2 80/1	78/23 78/25 89/3 92/8 94/9 96/20 98/16	try [4] 16/10 55/17 84/8 97/18
	81/4 82/9 82/11 83/8 83/8 83/9 83/17 83/23 95/20 101/6 102/2 110/16 113/22 113/23	109/12	trying [6] 4/5 33/5 68/13 75/11 102/14 121/11
	113/23 114/3	together [14] 6/10 9/7 9/10 9/11 10/4 19/6 27/22 29/22 40/18 41/12 41/20 43/2 66/2	turn [1] 91/8
	they've [8] 9/11 42/4 57/13 70/5 77/4 81/9	120/16	turned [2] 117/12 119/20
	82/6 82/7	told [3] 15/12 64/21 96/3	turns [2] 43/17 51/7
	thick [1] 69/21	tomorrow [7] 5/11 122/7 124/15 124/17	twice [1] 80/2
	thing [11] 33/7 33/12 33/14 62/13 63/22 69/9	125/6 125/12 125/13	two [26] 7/15 9/4 11/14 11/18 15/4 22/19
	85/25 86/1 99/9 103/12 110/22	too [3] 42/14 48/13 105/2	25/14 26/1 27/20 27/22 33/8 37/3 39/4 39/24
	things [13] 9/10 15/22 26/4 29/22 30/19 33/8 41/1 42/14 65/19 83/15 98/3 100/12 100/18	took [3] 59/7 107/12 110/9 tool [2] 15/5 33/10	46/22 48/25 52/17 56/15 56/23 67/10 96/6 98/12 104/18 120/4 120/5 122/25
	think [85] 3/20 4/6 4/19 4/21 5/2 5/15 5/21	top [4] 38/5 80/8 80/11 81/25	type [8] 8/8 9/16 47/24 48/10 65/23 70/1 70/3
		topic [5] 14/7 27/24 35/23 36/3 56/12	118/9
	30/2 30/7 31/9 31/17 33/1 39/10 42/2 44/15	topics [3] 12/17 13/13 26/4	types [1] 58/7
		tossing [1] 43/15	typical [7] 15/11 16/5 17/1 58/16 58/19 59/25
	56/8 58/11 59/20 59/21 60/3 60/14 60/18	total [1] 7/12	97/14
		touch [3] 105/20 113/25 115/8 touched [1] 15/3	\mathbf{U}
	71/1 71/22 71/23 74/18 75/24 82/20 85/25	touching [1] 38/5	U.S [1] 2/3
		tough [1] 120/3	Uh [1] 110/5
	104/24 105/6 105/11 106/19 107/14 110/13	tour [1] 84/13	Uh-huh [1] 110/5
	110/21 112/5 112/10 115/24 116/25 117/1	tourist [4] 79/6 84/16 85/25 87/25	ultimate [1] 35/1

tourist [4] 79/6 84/16 85/25 87/25

tourists [13] 79/10 79/12 80/2 80/6 80/7 80/8

ultimate [1] 35/1

under [12] 39/21 52/8 55/7 56/23 62/20

110/21 112/5 112/10 115/24 116/25 117/1

117/11 118/23 119/12 120/4 120/15 124/23

U **under...** [7] 64/24 67/13 67/19 68/8 68/10 79/18 89/23 understand [22] 4/5 15/8 18/11 28/21 30/21 30/23 31/17 32/3 34/19 40/20 48/20 50/9 52/25 76/4 84/24 85/24 93/24 105/25 110/22 116/22 116/23 117/23 understanding [6] 18/12 22/21 30/3 31/5 31/6 31/9 understood [6] 4/18 17/20 41/5 64/20 74/5 undoubtedly [1] 70/9 unfair [1] 125/10 unfortunately [1] 55/12 unique [1] 30/8 Unit [1] 38/21 UNITED [2] 1/1 1/11 universally [1] 85/16 unless [4] 4/21 71/21 72/3 103/23 unrealistic [1] 38/10 unreliable [2] 77/18 78/9 unsuitable [15] 62/22 63/12 64/4 64/6 64/13 64/22 64/24 64/25 65/13 65/24 66/14 66/15 67/1 67/14 68/4 until [2] 37/5 38/7 **untrue** [**5**] 94/18 94/21 95/12 95/24 95/25 unvarying [1] 114/19 **up [43]** 6/4 6/21 9/8 10/14 13/22 16/15 18/20 24/21 26/1 41/11 42/8 43/16 43/20 43/22 45/11 50/21 51/20 51/21 56/8 59/1 61/24 62/13 63/24 67/9 81/5 86/7 91/9 95/23 102/3 103/24 103/25 105/2 106/4 106/24 109/11 110/24 111/2 111/16 117/15 120/11 123/17 123/21 124/9 **upon** [10] 11/13 27/9 29/2 52/20 55/21 55/22 56/4 56/5 59/23 68/21 upwards [1] 101/18 urine [9] 15/13 15/16 15/19 16/7 16/8 16/19 16/24 28/6 28/6 us [5] 9/24 9/25 32/20 53/4 54/9

use [46] 4/16 15/5 20/5 20/6 20/10 20/11 20/13 20/15 20/19 20/22 20/25 21/3 22/25 23/1 23/1 25/18 25/19 27/3 27/3 31/8 33/6 33/21 34/12 81/17 82/16 82/22 85/12 85/13 85/21 93/12 104/3 104/10 105/1 105/4 105/9 105/10 105/16 105/16 105/21 105/24 106/9 106/13 106/17 107/1 107/6 122/17

used [19] 44/11 71/23 76/6 76/9 80/2 80/23 82/21 84/25 85/16 85/19 85/19 100/15 101/6 104/3 104/8 104/14 105/22 112/17 115/5 using [6] 17/3 26/3 76/8 79/8 100/18 112/9

usual [2] 35/20 35/21

usually [10] 16/11 38/13 80/16 81/4 82/25 83/13 96/14 99/18 106/2 113/17

usually there's [1] 106/2

vague [1] 30/22 value [2] 13/25 30/19 values [3] 95/19 96/5 96/17 variability [2] 110/4 110/6 variable [9] 90/2 90/10 90/23 91/1 91/11 91/16 94/16 94/21 95/1 Variation [1] 114/13 variety [4] 23/3 50/7 77/3 77/3 various [1] 51/9 vary [1] 74/1 vegetables [2] 41/7 41/8 **venue** [**2**] 67/21 106/15 verbal [4] 84/23 85/22 85/24 86/11 version [2] 9/18 15/7 versus [7] 54/17 55/10 56/15 61/17 62/15 73/25 107/8

very [38] 9/25 10/18 11/9 22/24 24/8 24/8 31/10 42/13 43/1 43/2 44/20 51/5 59/12 59/22 60/3 64/2 66/22 66/23 75/1 77/7 87/10 87/12 88/7 88/22 99/8 101/3 101/22 101/24 101/24 102/1 102/2 110/14 110/16 114/8 122/4 123/16 124/5 124/7

vessels [1] 110/25 vet [1] 33/3

veterinarians [1] 16/18

veterinary [9] 12/24 17/7 21/21 25/9 25/12 28/11 33/2 67/8 93/20

video [8] 43/16 44/24 45/1 45/2 45/13 45/16 46/2 46/3

view [11] 28/18 28/19 29/17 44/12 44/18 57/6 58/23 60/2 60/3 71/23 115/18

viewed [1] 109/17 virtue [1] 111/1 visit [2] 67/17 79/22 visiting [2] 12/7 79/4

vocalization [1] 8/14 vocalize [1] 99/25

voir [4] 12/18 12/20 25/7 32/7 volume [4] 7/11 7/12 9/21 56/1

vomiting [1] 122/16

wading [1] 84/20 wait [1] 125/8 waiting [3] 37/1 37/5 84/20 walk [5] 23/22 37/2 48/6 63/23 80/2 walking [4] 63/24 87/6 87/13 87/16 walls [2] 38/2 38/2 want [31] 3/18 3/19 3/22 4/12 4/13 4/24 6/5 6/6 6/7 6/22 16/5 30/9 32/22 32/22 36/17 39/11 42/17 52/14 54/4 55/19 62/12 80/5 84/5 84/21 89/14 99/1 102/17 108/5 113/6 113/6 118/14 wanted [5] 4/7 4/13 4/16 90/22 124/8

wants [1] 46/24 was [112] 4/1 4/4 4/22 7/11 7/20 9/10 9/17 9/20 10/4 11/8 11/15 12/4 12/9 12/10 13/22 14/20 15/6 15/18 17/13 17/14 17/22 17/22 19/13 23/16 23/16 23/18 26/13 26/22 28/7 30/11 30/14 36/14 36/15 38/19 42/7 42/9 43/10 44/12 45/4 45/13 45/13 46/23 46/24 48/8 51/8 55/2 55/3 55/4 55/8 55/13 55/24 58/5 60/23 63/3 65/14 65/15 70/16 70/17 71/11 74/14 74/16 75/24 76/5 76/9 76/11 77/10 77/12 79/6 79/6 88/22 89/6 89/8 89/10 89/12 90/2 90/10 91/1 91/11 91/16 94/16 94/17 94/18 94/18 94/21 94/21 94/22 94/25 95/12 96/4 97/21 98/18 98/18 103/2 108/7 108/8 108/10 108/19 111/21 112/10 113/10 115/15 117/1 120/12 121/2 121/8 122/22 123/3 123/4 123/8 123/21 123/25 124/21

Washington [4] 1/4 1/18 1/24 2/4 wasn't [7] 9/9 23/19 36/15 75/19 76/2 90/24 111/22

watch [1] 37/3

watching [6] 12/1 12/8 27/23 37/2 46/22 48/3 water [12] 8/9 8/11 12/6 12/7 40/3 40/17 41/11 41/18 65/16 65/16 86/7 114/7

waterholes [1] 113/20 waves [1] 19/9 waving [1] 43/15

way [37] 9/12 11/24 16/8 28/7 29/17 29/19 40/17 40/22 40/22 41/20 55/18 57/7 57/16 62/16 66/8 66/16 75/9 76/7 76/7 82/4 82/22 85/20 96/6 97/8 97/25 100/24 102/25 103/1 103/2 103/4 103/5 104/3 104/4 108/9 108/21 115/5 119/7

ways [6] 29/20 39/24 61/8 96/6 97/9 97/17

we [114] 4/7 4/8 4/16 5/2 5/7 5/13 5/21 5/23 6/9 6/11 6/20 6/20 6/21 7/5 7/14 7/15 8/17 9/16 9/22 10/5 11/7 11/19 11/24 11/25 15/3 16/3 16/7 16/10 16/11 16/15 16/15 16/17 16/17 16/18 16/21 16/22 16/24 17/2 22/25 22/25 25/7 25/16 26/4 26/7 26/10 28/24 29/2 29/3 33/7 33/13 37/3 37/8 37/16 38/6 44/11 44/21 45/14 45/19 45/19 46/2 46/21 48/2 48/3 48/3 50/21 51/16 52/7 53/21 54/2 54/13 55/12 56/24 60/9 60/23 62/3 62/10 62/17 68/14 69/22 69/23 71/12 71/23 72/18 75/18 77/25 79/4 79/8 89/11 91/20 94/13 99/16 99/17 101/25 106/16 106/19 110/23 111/15 112/9 112/10 115/14 116/25 117/16 118/14 121/12 122/17 123/25 124/8 124/10 124/12 124/12 124/16 124/16 124/20 125/2 we'd [2] 6/12 10/2

we'll [4] 44/22 70/24 91/7 124/14 we're [34] 3/20 4/6 4/19 6/23 16/18 26/3 27/20 33/2 33/2 33/4 33/21 33/25 37/16 39/13 44/22 45/20 48/2 52/22 54/12 54/14 55/14 55/17 56/8 68/13 68/20 71/22 72/2 76/10 102/15 113/19 114/5 124/17 125/5 125/5

we've [15] 11/20 16/20 24/19 27/19 56/13 56/17 59/9 71/22 71/23 74/11 76/17 79/24 115/17 124/20 125/3

weapons [1] 84/25

weaving [16] 43/14 44/4 49/3 62/21 90/4 90/6 90/14 90/16 90/17 91/14 91/24 94/15 94/20 94/25 121/16 121/17

weekend [3] 6/2 6/6 6/6 weekly [1] 16/25 weeks [1] 12/8

weight [5] 4/11 34/5 34/18 35/1 53/14 welfare [15] 20/2 20/13 21/1 57/9 76/24 77/19 78/11 92/16 93/14 111/18 112/1 112/2 112/19 115/20 116/13

well [84] 5/15 5/20 8/6 9/4 9/10 9/16 11/9 11/9 11/24 12/5 13/22 18/2 20/3 22/13 22/24 24/8 24/19 25/6 26/18 27/1 28/10 37/24 38/13 40/24 45/8 46/10 48/25 51/1 51/20 53/11 54/1 54/10 56/14 56/19 57/3 58/24 59/12 59/12 61/14 62/11 64/15 65/25 67/6 67/23 69/1 69/19 69/21 72/16 74/8 74/15 74/18 75/2 75/21 76/9 76/25 77/10 77/16 77/24 78/5 78/20 79/22 80/11 80/25 88/6 88/18 90/12 91/8 92/23 98/2 98/25 100/6 101/1 101/5 102/1 102/12 103/12 104/4 104/6 107/25 117/3 117/11 119/2 120/4 122/25

went [5] 12/10 36/24 60/10 75/18 79/23 were [88] 3/13 3/17 5/13 6/20 7/2 7/9 8/3 10/5 11/8 11/25 12/6 15/12 16/3 16/7 17/3 26/4 26/11 28/5 28/24 32/19 37/3 37/22 38/8 38/9 38/24 39/7 45/7 46/21 48/4 48/6 48/7 50/18 56/20 56/21 56/21 56/22 57/11 57/11 59/11 59/19 60/24 61/7 62/15 62/15 62/16 65/15 65/20 69/22 73/7 74/25 75/18 79/4 79/5 80/7 89/3 94/14 95/4 95/7 95/8 97/22 98/10 98/15 99/4 100/16 100/18 100/21 101/23 103/3 106/25 108/11 109/11 110/3 110/6 110/11 111/3 111/15 111/18 112/9 112/21 112/22 114/11 116/25 117/17 120/24 121/17 122/21 123/1 123/2

weren't [5] 38/6 65/19 94/16 95/5 106/16 **what [113]** 4/1 4/15 4/18 7/8 7/14 7/16 9/1 9/3 9/5 9/9 9/19 10/9 10/21 11/2 12/10 18/18 20/6 24/23 26/3 26/17 26/24 27/9 28/21 31/4 31/11 31/12 31/12 32/1 32/2 32/15 33/25 35/17 36/12 36/24 37/7 37/16 38/17 39/15 39/20 40/24 41/2 41/6 41/16 42/1 45/20 46/16 48/1 48/5 49/6 50/25 51/5 51/12 51/15

W

what... [60] 51/16 52/3 52/20 53/6 53/13 55/4 55/24 56/8 56/18 57/20 59/3 60/23 63/8 65/9 66/1 66/1 66/9 66/10 66/12 66/13 66/20 68/5 68/21 70/10 72/6 72/16 75/11 76/3 77/4 77/5 77/9 78/13 79/7 79/20 80/21 82/6 82/8 85/3 88/19 95/20 96/14 97/12 99/3 99/6 99/13 102/20 106/9 106/24 108/16 110/12 111/10 115/6 118/8 118/9 118/11 118/20 119/17 124/17 124/25 125/5

what's [7] 40/25 54/21 55/25 81/14 100/2 113/16 114/12

whatever [12] 4/11 34/5 35/1 36/3 44/7 53/14 55/18 75/10 75/21 78/14 92/24 116/2 when [55] 6/20 8/12 9/22 11/25 15/11 19/6 23/19 27/8 28/13 29/24 33/17 36/11 36/13 36/14 36/14 36/24 42/8 42/9 46/16 47/7 47/20 47/25 48/7 48/20 49/1 49/8 49/13 49/21 50/3 51/25 53/21 58/9 61/18 61/21 62/14 62/15 62/15 66/21 69/22 69/23 73/22 76/24 88/22 91/3 99/10 100/16 103/1 104/8 104/18 107/7 109/17 110/14 111/5 120/6 123/21

where [48] 6/24 7/2 7/20 11/18 12/5 19/15 41/8 41/11 41/11 41/18 41/18 42/7 42/7 42/12 48/13 48/14 49/25 66/3 67/21 68/22 68/23 69/1 69/3 69/6 69/8 71/18 74/9 75/18 78/15 78/21 79/1 79/5 79/8 79/25 82/14 87/6 88/8 103/24 108/8 110/25 111/24 114/5 115/7 116/1 119/17 119/19 120/16 123/6 whether [26] 25/23 29/24 39/1 60/1 61/6 70/13 74/16 76/2 82/7 87/6 96/25 97/9 97/18 101/7 102/13 110/7 111/8 111/20 112/8 113/10 113/10 116/5 116/8 119/4 122/13

which [37] 4/18 7/1 8/12 9/13 13/10 18/3 29/17 37/3 37/22 39/10 43/6 45/9 50/18 52/7 55/6 62/7 62/18 63/24 68/3 71/11 75/9 76/7 94/25 95/19 107/16 108/18 111/4 114/2 114/17 115/10 115/15 115/18 117/25 118/3 118/21 124/19 124/19

while [11] 6/5 10/5 27/20 34/8 57/23 58/25 100/13 105/8 106/9 110/4 121/16

who [14] 11/8 12/3 16/20 28/7 33/19 42/6 42/11 63/10 64/1 81/13 81/23 83/21 124/24 125/13

who's [1] 9/23 whole [1] 63/24

122/22

why [35] 13/23 14/20 18/17 24/22 29/25 30/12 30/17 32/23 34/2 35/22 41/17 41/20 46/9 50/24 52/7 52/9 52/16 53/13 55/21 56/5 57/5 61/12 63/17 63/19 63/20 66/19 68/17 69/24 79/25 100/2 100/4 102/24 105/19 105/21 122/24

wide [4] 9/7 23/3 37/25 119/21 widely [3] 27/1 60/2 60/3

wider [1] 28/16

wife [4] 12/2 12/9 17/9 19/3

wife's [2] 18/7 25/15

wild [15] 11/23 19/18 48/3 64/10 87/2 87/4 88/3 88/5 88/12 103/6 104/18 105/8 113/18 119/21 119/21

will [32] 4/8 4/21 16/21 16/22 16/24 28/14 34/20 34/21 37/8 44/21 48/14 49/1 51/3 53/2 55/20 56/8 60/14 62/7 81/6 82/18 91/8 94/25 96/14 103/17 106/25 107/5 107/15 107/15 111/24 114/12 120/15 124/1

Williams [6] 50/19 74/13 94/8 120/11 120/23 121/21

Wilson [3] 72/19 73/4 73/8 WINDERS [2] 1/16 123/20 windows [1] 38/2

winter [1] 82/7 wired [3] 40/16 41/3 41/16 wiring [1] 8/8

within [7] 19/13 23/16 23/18 54/17 87/13 104/8 110/13

without [4] 5/4 38/25 55/5 120/2 witness [12] 3/2 5/6 13/2 32/12 35/4 53/10

54/10 54/10 116/10 116/17 123/23 124/20

witnesses [4] 53/8 124/19 124/24 125/13 woman [1] 81/25 won't [2] 6/2 111/17

wonderful [1] 125/14 wondering [1] 83/14

wooden [2] 79/14 80/9

word [4] 77/6 78/5 91/22 93/10

wording [1] 77/24

words [6] 40/10 41/7 78/16 86/24 94/23 95/13

work [16] 8/20 9/21 11/14 11/19 14/13 17/23 17/24 18/3 27/11 31/21 44/5 60/6 69/22 79/23 98/2 120/17

worked [1] 104/1

working [2] 10/5 23/17

Worthington [3] 92/15 93/13 94/5

worthy [1] 34/18

would [123] 5/14 5/15 5/22 5/23 10/4 16/6 18/23 19/13 22/14 23/5 26/2 27/16 27/19 29/6 30/19 33/7 33/13 34/13 36/18 39/2 39/20 39/20 40/3 40/4 40/4 43/12 45/15 46/9 48/11 48/13 48/23 48/25 52/5 52/13 54/2 56/9 56/18 59/6 59/20 59/21 59/22 60/10 61/16 62/7 64/5 64/6 64/12 64/15 65/18 66/1 67/18 68/22 68/24 70/14 70/17 70/18 70/20 71/2 71/12 73/18 74/2 74/22 75/7 75/22 76/7 76/11 79/3 80/5 82/4 82/4 82/13 83/25 84/1 87/11 88/12 90/16 91/4 95/7 95/22 95/23 97/18 98/25 100/8 101/7 101/12 101/13 101/23 102/2 102/7 103/1 103/2 104/15 105/10 106/8 107/16 107/24 108/8 108/9 108/14 108/15 108/17 108/20 110/8 110/11 111/5 111/5 112/11 112/18 115/10 115/18 115/25 117/14 117/15 117/16 118/2 118/12 119/2 119/3 119/15 120/4 120/15 120/16 123/7

wouldn't [6] 23/22 59/4 69/8 83/24 87/11 105/13

wound [1] 101/15

wounding [1] 33/3

wounds [1] 25/21

wrestling [1] 102/16

write [2] 14/7 53/15

writing [3] 14/16 35/18 79/12

written [7] 14/9 17/6 22/24 25/12 42/4 89/3 95/22

wrong [2] 67/12 119/11 wrote [2] 15/8 94/7

yeah [9] 36/20 44/20 66/7 88/10 88/11 100/5 101/20 113/4 116/12

year [6] 9/17 36/15 41/19 47/15 47/16 47/16 yearning [1] 42/15

years [12] 8/10 27/16 27/22 28/10 42/5 42/6 42/10 70/14 85/19 92/14 100/15 119/14

yelp [2] 97/6 99/20

yelped [2] 103/2 103/3

yelping [1] 100/23

yes [68] 3/15 8/6 8/25 12/12 12/15 12/19 13/4 13/12 16/2 16/3 17/5 19/16 23/4 26/1 28/4 29/11 29/11 30/1 30/2 31/24 32/11 35/16 37/14 45/4 48/22 53/24 58/22 68/6 72/6 72/12 72/25 74/14 75/17 77/13 78/19 79/13 82/4 83/1 83/3 84/5 86/22 88/10 89/1 90/8

91/19 94/17 94/23 95/14 95/23 96/18 96/23 97/9 99/3 104/20 107/19 108/3 108/6 110/20 112/4 112/7 112/18 114/25 116/13 117/6 120/21 121/3 122/3 123/19 yet [6] 14/9 17/16 18/1 30/10 45/14 95/11 York [1] 120/1 you [602] **vou'd [11]** 3/23 38/17 59/12 61/18 64/19 69/21 76/13 78/2 78/3 87/19 119/3 you'll [4] 67/8 70/8 78/5 78/5 you're [60] 8/12 9/10 13/10 15/20 18/15 18/18 19/15 21/6 21/9 21/15 24/6 26/13 27/22 27/23 27/23 27/24 32/13 40/3 40/10 41/8 41/9 41/10 41/10 44/3 44/18 47/18 47/19 47/19 47/20 50/6 50/7 50/22 52/3 53/8 57/1 65/4 67/7 67/7 68/7 71/20 71/25 73/21 74/12 74/18 74/20 74/23 75/5 75/8 76/1 76/25 77/9 77/20 85/13 93/25 97/15 103/13 103/23 103/24 107/4 111/10 you've [37] 14/16 14/23 15/1 17/6 17/9 20/4

20/18 20/21 20/25 21/3 21/18 21/21 21/24 22/2 22/5 22/8 22/10 23/13 24/16 24/18 24/25 25/3 27/17 28/2 28/10 28/19 30/17 30/19 49/9 61/13 66/12 68/21 96/7 96/8 96/11 96/19 106/14

young [3] 33/17 34/8 78/17 youngster [1] 42/7

your [187]

yourself [3] 12/11 12/13 29/24

Z

ZEILER [1] 1/20

zero [3] 43/22 49/22 49/24

Zina [1] 109/8

zoo [8] 21/12 21/16 23/18 23/22 48/11 49/25 59/11 84/9

zoological [1] 69/5

zoos [9] 48/12 48/13 48/14 48/17 50/6 50/12 84/7 92/17 93/15