# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS,

. CA No. 03-2006

Plaintiff,

v.

Washington, D.C.

Friday, February 6, 2009

FELD ENTERTAINMENT, INC.,

1:49 p.m.

Defendant.

TRANSCRIPT OF BENCH TRIAL - AFTERNOON SESSION - DAY 3
BEFORE THE HONORABLE EMMET G. SULLIVAN
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

### APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiff:

KATHERINE A. MEYER, ESQ.

TANYA SANERIB, ESQ. DELCIANNA WINDERS, ESQ.

Meyer, Glitzenstein & Crystal 1601 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.

Suite 700

Washington, D.C. 20009

202-364-4092

For the Defendant:

JOHN SIMPSON, ESQ. LISA JOINER, ESQ. KARA PETTEWAY, ESQ. MICHELLE PARDO, ESQ.

LANCE SHEA, ESQ.

Fulbright & Jaworski, LLP 801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20004

202-662-4504

Court Reporter:

JACQUELINE M. SULLIVAN, RPR Official Court Reporter U.S. Courthouse, Room 6820 333 Constitution Avenue, NW Washington, D.C. 20001 202-354-3187

Proceedings reported by machine shorthand, transcript produced by computer-aided transcription.

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	COURTROOM DEPUTY: Civil action 03-2006, American
3	Society For the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals, et al verses
4	Feld Entertainment, Inc.
5	Will counsel please identify yourselves for the
6	record?
7	MS. MEYER: Katherine Meyer for the plaintiffs, your
8	Honor.
9	THE COURT: Good afternoon.
10	MS. SANERIB: Tanya Sanerib for the plaintiffs, your
11	Honor.
12	MS. WINDERS: Delcianna Winders for the plaintiffs.
13	MS. SINNOTT: Michelle Sinnott, tech, for the
14	plaintiffs.
15	MR. SIMPSON: Good afternoon, your Honor. John
16	Simpson for the defendant.
17	MS. PARDO: Michelle Pardo for the defendant.
18	MS. PETTEWAY: Kara Petteway for the defendant.
19	MR. SHEA: Lance Shea for the defendant.
20	MS. JOINER: Good afternoon, your Honor. Lisa Joiner
21	for the defendant.
22	MS. STRAUSS: Julie Strauss with the defendant.
23	MR. PALISOUL: Derrick Palisoul, showing exhibits.
24	THE COURT: Good afternoon to you all. We'll proceed
25	with the direct examination of the witness.

I have a matter that was scheduled some time ago at I'm not sure if the attorneys are here for that matter 2:30. It's not going to take long. It could potentially be sealed, but probably not. It's on the Guantanamo cases, but it won't take long, but that's the only interruption we'll have at 2:30. Let's proceed with the examination of the witness. Good afternoon.

THE WITNESS: Good afternoon.

THE COURT: You're still under oath. We won't administer the oath again, but you're still under oath.

Proceed, counsel.

Thank you. MS. MEYER:

# LANETTE WILLIAMS, WITNESS FOR THE PLAINTIFFS, PREVIOUSLY SWORN

## DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MS. MEYER (continuing):

- Sergeant Williams, yesterday you mentioned a provision of the California Penal Code. What provision is that?
- 500.615PC. Α.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

22

23

24

- What does it involve? 0.
- Abuse of an elephant. I'm sorry. Abuse of an elephant. 20 Α.
- 21 What does it say? 0.
  - Something to the effect that it is unlawful to cause injury Α. to an elephant that, you know, is an open wound, results in an open wound.
  - And during the week in August 1999 when you were observing

1 the Ringling Brothers' handlers with the elephants in San Jose, 2 were you in uniform? 3 Yes, I was. Α. The entire time? 4 Ο. 5 Α. Yes. Did you make your presence known to the circus personnel? 6 Ο. 7 Α. Yes, I did. 8 THE COURT: Was that local statute patterned after any 9 federal statute, do you know? 10 THE WITNESS: No. I think -- no, I don't believe it 11 is. 12 THE COURT: At the time that you were employed on the 13 police force, were you aware of any federal regulations or 14 statutes that governed the treatment of elephants? THE WITNESS: Yes, but I don't specifically -- that 15 wasn't one of them. 16 17

THE COURT: All right. But you were aware that there were some federal regulations that dealt with elephants?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

## BY MS. MEYER:

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q. Now I'd like to go to Exhibit 147, which I think is where we left off yesterday, your Honor.

MS. PARDO: Objection, your Honor.

THE COURT: What's your objection?

MS. PARDO: We don't believe that the proper predicate

has been provided. This witness is not employed by the entity 1 that at all made that tape. She was not the one who filmed the 2 inspection, and she's not the appropriate witness to be 3 testifying on behalf of that organization who made that tape. 4 5 MS. MEYER: Your Honor, I think I established vesterday that Sergeant Williams actually observed the events 6 7 that are depicted on the videotape, that she was there at the time, that she can testify to the events that are depicted on 8 the videotape, accurately depict what she saw that day. 9 THE COURT: All right. I'll allow it over objection. 10 BY MS. MEYER: 11 The first clip that we want to show takes place at 5:37 to 12 13 549. That runs the total length. (Video played.) 14 15 Okay. I'm going to object to the hearsay. 16 MS. PARDO: Actually, I didn't hear anything on there. 17 THE COURT: I heard something; I couldn't discern what it was. You're 18 19 objecting to the voice on the tape? 20 MS. PARDO: That's correct. The voice is narrating 21 what's going on. THE COURT: What about that? 22 That's fine, your Honor. We don't need 23 MS. MEYER: 24 the voice on the tape. THE COURT: I agree with that. Sustained. 25

1 What's that a picture of, if you know? 2 THE WITNESS: That's a picture of the elephant's foot 3 and the cracked toe nail. 4 THE COURT: Right. But which elephant, when, where? 5 Do you know? 6 THE WITNESS: That's during the inspection in San 7 Jose. 8 THE COURT: How do you know that? 9 THE WITNESS: Because I was present when the video was I believe that elephant is Bonco, but I'm not positive. 10 taken. I'm sorry. You said what? 11 THE COURT: THE WITNESS: I believe her name is Bonco, but I'm not 12 13 positive. 14 THE COURT: All right. Sorry, your Honor. Were you through 15 MS. MEYER: 16 asking the witness questions? 17 BY MS. MEYER: Did you actually see that elephant with that cracked toe 18 nail during the inspection, Sergeant Williams? 19 20 Α. Yes. 21 And that was one of the Ringling Brothers' elephants; is 0. 22 that correct? 23 Yes, it was. Α. And is that a true and accurate depiction of what you saw 24 25 that day?

A. Yes.

Q. I'd like to go to the next clip, please, which is 6:14 to 6:25.

(Video played.)

And is what we've observed here a true and accurate depiction of something you saw on that day in August of 1999 in San Jose?

- A. Yes, it was.
- Q. And what did we just see? Could you describe it to the judge?
- A. Those are the elephants that we saw during the inspection under the tent in San Jose, and that's them swaying, chained and swaying.
  - Q. And is this an example of the kind of behavior you testified about yesterday that you had observed the elephants engaging in during that week?
- A. Yes.

 $\mbox{MS. MEYER:} \quad \mbox{I want to move in both of those clips,} \\ \mbox{your Honor.}$ 

THE COURT: All right. Over objection, they're admitted.

(Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 147 was admitted into evidence at about 1:56 p.m.)

BY MS. MEYER:

Q. Now, Sergeant Williams, did you take any enforcement action

- against Ringling Brothers concerning any of the findings that
  you made during that week in August of 1999?
  - A. Yes.

4

9

10

- Q. What did you do?
- 5 A. We referred the case to the district attorney's office.
- 6 Q. Okay. What was the basis for the referral?
- 7 A. We believed it was a violation of 596PC of the California Penal Code.
  - Q. Is that the penal code provision that you just earlier explained?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And did the D.A. bring an enforcement action?
- 13 A. No, they did not.
- Q. Did you report the injuries that you described yesterday that you had observed to any other law enforcement entity?
- 16 A. The case was sent to USDA.
- 17 Q. Okay. And what was the basis for that referral?
- 18 A. It violated -- I don't remember the specific statute that
- 19 | it violated. Animal Welfare Act. Violation of the Animal
- 20 Welfare Act.
- 21 Q. Did the USDA take any enforcement action?
- 22 | A. No.

- Q. All right. Now, when was the next time that you had an opportunity to observe the Ringling Brothers Circus?
  - A. It would have been in August of 2000.

Q. August of 2000?

A. Correct.

2.2

Q. And where would that have been?

A. That was in Compaq Center, our San Jose arena in San Jose, California.

MS. PARDO: I'm going to object to the line of questioning, your Honor. We believe the evidence will show this was a Red Unit incident that was subject to a criminal jury trial in California, and we have evidence of the verdict there. This is essentially going to be a mini trial of that entire process, and we have some --

THE COURT: No, it's not going to be a mini trial, I can assure of that.

What's the relevance of this?

MS. MEYER: First of all, we're talking about the year 2000. I think the event you're talking about took place in 2001.

MS. PARDO: Yes, I am talking about that.

MS. MEYER: So we're not even there yet.

The relevance of this line of questioning is that it concerned an elephant named Jewell who was an elephant that was on the Blue Unit who is an elephant that Tom Rider knows. It's extremely relevant to this case, your Honor.

THE COURT: I'll allow it.

MS. MEYER: Okay.

1 BY MS. MEYER:

4

5

8

- Q. You said the next time you saw it, the circus was in San

  Jose in 2000; is that correct?
  - A. That's correct.
  - Q. All right. And which unit was that?
- 6 A. That was the Blue Unit.
- 7 Q. What were the circumstances of your involvement that year?
  - A. I was again assisting the Humane Society of Santa Clara Valley.
- Q. Did you have an opportunity to see the unloading of the elephants?
- 12 A. Yes, I did.
- Q. Okay. Do you remember any of the observations you made regarding the elephants that year?
- A. I remember one of the elephants had a stiff front leg, right front leg.
- 17 Q. Do you know which elephant that was?
- 18 A. I later learned it was Jewell.
- 19 Q. How did you know the name of the elephant?
- 20 A. I asked one of the Ringling employees.
- 21 Q. What did you observe about Jewell?
- A. She had a difficulty flexing her leg. I believe it was at the elbow joint, It would be, I guess comparable to like our armpit. It's a different anatomy, so it's where the front leg meets the body, and she carried her leg stiffly and kind of

- 1 swung it out to walk.
  - Q. Did you go to a performance that year?
- 3 | A. Yes.

8

9

10

18

- Q. And did you see -- did you observe Jewell in the
- 5 performance?
- A. Yes. In San Jose Christine and I went to a performance to observe Jewell to see how she performed.
  - Q. What did you observe?
  - A. That her leg was stiff throughout the whole entire performance.
- 11 \ Q. Now, what was Jewell doing in the show?
- A. She was made to perform all the different tricks that the other elephants did. She did a long mount. I can't remember the specific things that she did exactly, but she did everything that the other elephants had to do.
- Q. Now, when was the next time that you had an opportunity to see the Ringling Brothers' elephants?
  - A. That would have been in August of 2001.
  - Q. And where was that?
- 20 A. At Oakland.
- 21 Q. And what were you doing in Oakland?
- 22 A. I was observing the loading of the elephants.
- 23 Q. And why were you doing that?
- A. I wanted to see again how it was done, but also I wanted to see how long the elephants were in the railroad cars.

- Q. And what time were the elephants loaded on the train in Oakland that year?
  - A. About nine o'clock at night.
  - Q. When was the next time you saw them?
- 5 A. I saw them in San Jose the following morning.
- 6 Q. And what time did they get off the train in San Jose?
  - A. I believe it was just before one o'clock in the afternoon.
  - Q. And were you on duty during the time you saw them in San Jose?
- 10 A. Yes, I was.

4

7

8

9

11

- Q. And were you assisting the Humane Society again?
- 12 A. Yes, I was.
- Q. Did you have an opportunity to see how the elephants were maintained in August of 2001 at San Jose?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. All right. What did you observe?
- A. At times they were kept in a tent similar to the one that they were in in 1999, and at other times they had enclosures,
- 19 | they were in enclosures.
- 20 Q. When they were in the tent how were they maintained?
- 21 A. They were chained.
- 22 Q. Can you describe the chains?
- A. Similar to I believe 1999: a front leg and then an opposite hind leg.
  - Q. And did you observe the elephants off chains at any

particular time?

A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

1.7

- Q. When was that?
- A. They had what I think it was called open house before the performances and the elephants were allowed into electric fenced areas.
  - Q. Okay. Did you go to any of the open houses during the time frame in August of 2001?
  - A. Yes, I did.
  - Q. How many did you go to?
- 11 A. I was at almost all of them. Let's see. I think I was at 12 seven or eight of them.
- 13 Q. Okay. And what is an open house?
- A. It would allow the public to come back to the area where the elephants were housed and see the elephants and the other animals, get the public more up close to them.
  - Q. When are they held?
  - A. I believe it's about an hour before the shows.
- 19 Q. How long do they last?
- 20 A. I think it's about 40, somewhere between 30 and 45 minutes.
- 21 Q. Who attends the open house?
- 22 A. The public.
- 23 Q. Is the public allowed to take photographs at the open
- 24 house?
- 25 A. Yes.

- Q. Can you describe what you saw at the open house?
- A. They had the electric fence enclosures on asphalt. The elephants were on asphalt, but they put some sand down for the elephants. They had large tubs for the elephants. They had a little bit of bamboo, I think they had an old log, something, old tree or something for them, and I think they also at one point had some straw.
  - Q. How long did the open house last?

- A. I believe it was an hour before each performance, and it lasted 45 minutes or so, I believe.
- Q. Did you have an opportunity to see what happened to the elephants after the open house was over?
- A. They put them back in the tent and chained them up to get ready to go perform.
- Q. And do you remember any other occasions during that week in August of 2001 that involved the display of the elephants?
- A. I'm not sure I understand the question.
- Q. Were there any other times during that week when the elephants were -- there was any special display of the elephants for the public?
  - A. They had a couple of media events.
  - Q. What do you remember about those?
- A. The first day they got there it was a media, like a media

  day, and they had, in addition to the things I described, they

  had frozen cubes of fruit for the elephants, and then one other

time when they had their own P.R. people there, their own 1 2 cameramen and stuff, they did the same thing, they had big ice 3 cubes full of fruit for the elephants. 4 Did you see the elephants provided ice cubes with fruits at 5 any other time during the week that you observed them in August of 2001? 6 7 Α. No. And did you see in August of 1999, did you see the 8 9 elephants provided any ice cubes with fruit? 10 Α. No. Do you remember anything else in particular that occurred 11 that week in 2001 regarding the handling of the elephants? 12 13 Α. Yes. What do you remember? 14 I remember seeing the elephants come out of the tent and 15 16 Mark Gebel strike one of the elephants. 17 MS. PARDO: Objection, your Honor. This is the line 18 of questioning I objected to. 19 THE COURT: I'll allow it. This is what, your other evidence theory? 20 MS. MEYER: Yes, your Honor, and also the routine 21 22 practice theory. I'll allow it. 23 THE COURT:

Thank you.

MS. MEYER:

BY MS. MEYER:

24

- Q. I'm sorry. You said you saw Mark Gebel come out of the tent and what?
  - A. As the elephants came out of the tent and as they were approaching the roadway, I saw Mark Gebel stab one of the elephants.
    - O. Who is Mark Gebel?
- 7 A. Mark Gebel is the son of Gunther Gebel-Williams, and he's one of the headliners, animal trainers.
  - Q. He was one of the headliners at that time?
- 10 | A. Yes.

4

5

6

9

- 11 Q. How do you know who he is?
- A. I had seen him, I had seen him all week handling the animals.
- 14 Q. And do you know the name of the elephant that he stabbed?
- 15 | A. Asia.
- 16 \ Q. And how do you know that's her name?
- A. I'd seen her all week, and I also had asked earlier what her name was.
- 19 Q. What day did this happen?
  - A. I believe it was on August 25th.
- 21  $\square$  Q. What time of day was it?
- 22  $\parallel$  A. It was in the afternoon. I think after one.
- 23 Q. And where were the elephants when this happened?
- A. The elephants, to go to the performance, they'd come out of their tent and then they'd make a left-hand turn through the

parking lot and then go down to I believe it was Montgomery

Street where they would take a right. And the elephants had

come out of the tent and Asia was just, I believe she was just

getting to where they -- the lane where they take the tickets to

let you into the parking lot and I heard Mark yelling and then I

looked over.

- Q. And that's when you saw him stab Asia?
- A. Yes.

7

8

9

13

14

15

17

20

21

22

- Q. And were you with other individuals at that time?
- 10 A. I was by myself there at that time.
- Q. Okay. And when you say he stabbed Asia, could you describe what you mean?
  - A. He, I heard him yell and that's what drew my attention over there. I saw him with his ankus in his hand and he made a like a thrust movement at her.
- Q. Okay. Were you able to see which end of the ankus he used?
  - A. It was the pointed end.
- Q. And were you able to see where on Asia's body he stabbed her?
  - A. It was in the front leg area.
  - Q. And what happened next?
  - A. Asia, the best word I can use is, she bolted forward and then took three fast steps, and then he turned around.
- Q. And can you describe the tone of voice he was using?
- 25 A. It was an angry tone.

- 1 \ Q. And after you saw this what did you do?
- 2 A. I went over and told Christine Franco what I had seen.
  - Q. Who is Christine Franco?
  - A. She's the humane investigator.
- Q. Was she in charge of the inspection that was being
- 6 conducted that week?
  - A. Yes.

4

7

8

- Q. So you were assisting her that week; is that correct?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 Q. And why did you tell Christine Franco what you had seen?
- 11 A. Because I was there to assist them and it was going to be
- 12 her case.
- Q. All right. And did you believe you had seen a violation of
- 14 the law?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 0. And which law was that?
- 17 A. That is 596.5 of the California penal code.
- 18 Q. And what happened next?
- 19 A. I talked to Christine about what she wanted to do as far as
- 20 | handling the situation, and we determined that we'd have to --
- 21 | that there was too many elephants to try to get in front of to
- 22 | stop the elephants and look at the injuries, so we determined it
- 23 was best to let them go ahead and perform and then try to get
- 24 ahold of her after she came out.
  - Q. Do you know which part of the performance the elephants

- 1 were involved in at that point?
- 2 A. This was going to be the final performance.
  - Q. This is the end of the performance?
    - A. This was a final act of the circus that day.
- 5 \ Q. Okay. And when did you next see the elephants?
  - A. We saw them as they came out of the arena.
- Q. And how much time had elapsed since you had seen Mr. Gebel stab Asia?
  - A. I don't know. Maybe ten, ten, fifteen minutes.
- Q. All right. Did you have an opportunity to observe Asia at that point?
- 12 A. Yes.

4

6

- 13 Q. All right. And what did you observe?
- 14 A. I observed a bloody spot behind her left front leg.
- Q. Okay. And can you describe what you saw in detail?
- 16 A. It appeared to be a puncture-type wound with blood around
- 17 lit.
- 18 Q. What did the blood look like?
- 19 A. It was red and fresh.
- 20 | Q. And how did the location of the wound compare to what you
- 21 had seen Mr. Gebel do?
- 22 A. It was in the same location I had seen him stab her.
- Q. Did anyone take photos of the wound?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 | Q. Who?

- Α. Christine. 1 2 Christine Franco? Q. 3 Α. Yes. 4 Now, do you know if any legal action was taken against Mr. 0. 5 Gebel? 6 Α. Yes. 7 0. What happened? He was cited for the misdemeanor violation. 8 Α. 9 Did you have an opportunity to see that citation? Ο. Yes. 10 Α. 11 0. I'd like to go to Exhibit 6. MS. PARDO: Objection; hearsay. 12 THE COURT: What is it? 13 This is going to be a copy of the 14 MS. MEYER: citation, and we believe it's --15 16 THE COURT: I'll allow it. It's a public record, your Honor. 17 MS. MEYER: BY MS. MEYER: 18 Could you take a look at that Exhibit 6, please, for me, 19 20 Sergeant Williams? 21 Α. Okay. 22 Do you recognize that document? Q. 23 Α. Yes.

25

0.

Α.

What is it?

That's the citation that Christine Franco gave Mark Gebel.

THE COURT: I'm not going to allow that to come in for 1 2 the truth of the matter asserted on it. I'll allow it to come 3 in because she can testify that she's seen it before, right? 4 THE WITNESS: Yes. 5 THE COURT: So give it whatever weight, if any, that 6 it's entitled to, but not for the truth of the statements on 7 that document. 8 MS. MEYER: Your Honor, we think this is a public 9 record and it comes under the public record exception. 10 THE COURT: Then you can address that when you file 11 your proposed findings. MS. MEYER: Okay. And I have another basis for 12 getting it into evidence. If I can make a record on that, your 13 Honor, or do you want me to wait for that also? 14 What's your basis? 15 THE COURT: MS. MEYER: We have a declaration from Christine 16 1.7 Franco that explains that this is a citation that she issued, and we believe it comes in under the business record exception. 18 THE COURT: She's not available for cross-examination. 19 Was something prepared in the ordinary course of business with 20 her office? 21 Yes, your Honor. We can go to that 22 MS. MEYER: 23 declaration, which we have electronically. MS. PARDO: Your Honor, we're objecting to the use of 24 that declaration, and we think that bias is an issue here, and 25

we would want to cross-examine that witness. 1 2 THE COURT: I don't know if it comes in as a business 3 record. You're certainly free to attempt to make your record in 4 that regard. 5 MS. MEYER: Okay. 6 THE COURT: And I'll reserve judgment on that. 7 MS. MEYER: All right. It's doubtful that the declaration comes 8 THE COURT: 9 in as a business record, but you can lay your foundation. 10 MS. MEYER: All right. If I could do that, I'd like to go to the affidavit of Christine Franco that we have, and 11 actually paragraph five of that affidavit. 12 13 THE COURT: Wait a minute. When was this prepared? 14 MS. MEYER: Pardon? When was this declaration --1.5 THE COURT: 16 MS. MEYER: This was prepared last October, October 17 17th. THE COURT: That's not a business record. That's 18 19 prepared in connection with this lawsuit, right? The declaration, your Honor, yes. 20 This is MS. MEYER: 21 a 90 --22 THE COURT: She's not available for cross-examination, 23 is she? 24 MS. MEYER: She's not here for cross-examination, your 25 Honor.

THE COURT: So why should I allow this to come in?

It's certainly not a business record. It's some document prepared by someone in connection with this litigation. I know of no exception to the Hearsay Rule that would allow this to come in.

2.2

2.5

MS. MEYER: Your Honor, I'm only offering this declaration under 90211 of the federal rules, which is self-authentication for a business record. This is --

THE COURT: It's not a business record. It was prepared in connection with litigation. It's not a business record.

MS. MEYER: No, your Honor. I'm not offering the declaration as a business record. I'm offering Exhibit 6 as a business record. I'm just presenting the declaration to get Exhibit 6 in.

THE COURT: You want me to consider the hearsay in connection with your request that I allow the record to become a part of the record, the ticket, the citation, to become a part of the record, and it may well be, as I indicated, the citation becomes a part of the record because this sergeant, because the sergeant can testify this is the ticket she saw someone else give this elephant trainer, but this declaration is rank hearsay, but that's your record. As I indicated, I will make a determination subsequent to this trial as to whether it's admissible, and, if so, what weight, if any, I give to it, but

it strikes me as just rank hearsay here.

MS. MEYER: Okay. Just for the record, it's paragraph five of this declaration that addresses this particular exhibit, your Honor. And this was a declaration that was --

THE COURT: Right. And this declarant, who is not here before the Court, says under oath: I have reviewed this exhibit and this is a true and accurate copy of a citation that I issued.

And she's not available for cross-examination. It's rank hearsay, but I don't have to make a ruling today, but in all likelihood, that's going to be my ruling when it's time for me to make it.

MS. PARDO: Your Honor, just so that our position is clear on the record, Rule 90211, Using a Method Other Than Live Testimony to Authenticate Business Records, is not an appropriate source of information for the method of the circumstances indicates lack of trustworthiness, and we believe the testimony would show exactly that, so that is why we're objecting to it.

THE COURT: All right. I'll allow the examination. I want to preserve the record. I'll allow the examination, and subsequent to this trial being over I'll determine the admissibility of this document and what weight, if any, to give to it, but I'd be surprised if I concluded that it was anything other than rank hearsay.

Go ahead. 1 2 MS. MEYER: Okay. At this time the citation comes in not for 3 THE COURT: the truth of the matter asserted on the citation. 4 5 Any other questions? 6 MS. MEYER: Yes, your Honor. 7 BY MS. MEYER: 8 Sergeant Williams, you said you saw the photographs that 9 were taken of Asia that day? 10 Α. Yes. 11 And did you see the events that are depicted in those 12 photographs? I saw the injury, the wound. 13 I'd like to show you photographs that are in 120A, 14 please, and this is for the purpose of ascertaining that these 15 are -- these photographs depict the wounds? 16 THE COURT: Just tell us what this is, 120A. 17 There's actually five photographs, your 18 MS. MEYER: 19 Honor. THE COURT: Tell us what this one is, if you can 20 21 recall. That's the injury to Asia. 22 THE WITNESS: How do you know that that's the injury to THE COURT: 23 Asia as opposed to an injury to a walrus? 24 THE WITNESS: I've seen the photographs numerous 25

times, and you can also see, I mean, it doesn't tell which elephant, but you can see it's a female elephant there.

THE COURT: I'm sorry, I'm naive in that regard.

THE WITNESS: You can see her teat down there (indicating).

THE COURT: All right.

1.8

MS. PARDO: Foundational objection, your Honor.

MS. MEYER: Your Honor, also there was no objection made to these photographs by the defendants when we gave them these exhibits in our pretrial statement. They did not object.

MS. PARDO: We did object to two photographs, your Honor.

MS. MEYER: Not to these photographs.

THE COURT: Well, it should be a simple matter. I'm not going to waste any time today to try to determine who's right. I'll allow the examination to continue and I'll reserve judgement on whether they become a part of the record. I need to know, though, with record citation as whether there were any objections to 120A and the four that follow it.

MS. MEYER: Yes.

I'm looking at their objections, your Honor. Looking at the objections that they filed, it says: 120A, color prints of photos in Exhibit 120, and has the Bates label, and the response is: No objection by the defendant.

THE COURT: All right. Then they're admitted.

1 MS. MEYER: Okay. 2 THE COURT: Objection is waived. (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 120A admitted into evidence 3 at about 2:18 p.m.) 4 5 THE COURT: What's next? 6 BY MS. MEYER: 7 Could we look at the next photo, please? 8 It's the same injury. 9 THE COURT: What's the number? This is 120A at page two. 10 MS. MEYER: THE COURT: All right. That should be noted that way. 11 We need to have a clear record. 12 13 MS. MEYER: Yes, your Honor. BY MS. MEYER: 14 15 Can we go to the next page? 120, page two. You're going to have to THE COURT: 16 17 put some designation on there. What's next? BY MS. MEYER: 18 19 We'll call 120A at page three. That's the same injury? 20 And we'll call 120A at page four. 21 That again is the same injury. Α. 22 And 120A at page five, what is that a picture of? Q. 23 Α. That's Asia. I'm going to make an assumption you've 24 THE COURT: 25 seen these photos multiple times over the past many years.

THE WITNESS: Yes, sir. 1 2 THE COURT: How many times? 3 THE WITNESS: Dozens. 4 THE COURT: Dozens of times. 5 BY MS. MEYER: 6 But you also saw them at the time they were taken; is that 7 correct? 8 I saw them, yes. 9 Do you recall actually seeing that wound on Asia? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Do you know whether Mr. Gebel was prosecuted for the offense for which he received a citation? 12 13 Yes. Α. What kind of case was that? 14 0. 15 Α. It was a jury trial. All right. And was it a criminal case? 16 17 Α. Yes. If Mr. Gebel had been convicted, would he face the 18 19 possibility of incarceration? 20 Α. Yes.

- 21 Q. Did you testify at the trial in that case?
- 22 A. Yes, I did.
- 23 \ Q. And what was the outcome of that case?
- 24 A. The jury found him not guilty.
- 25 Q. Do you have any doubt about what you saw Mr. Gebel do to

Asia at that time in August of 2001? 1 2 No, I do not. Α. We're not going to retry the case. 3 THE COURT: entitled to her observations and I've heard her testimony. 4 5 MS. MEYER: That's fine. THE COURT: Sometimes jurors don't reach the decision 6 7 that other people think that the jury should reach, but there's 8 no doubt in your mind, though, he was guilty, right? 9 THE WITNESS: Absolutely. 10 BY MS. MEYER: 11 Why do you say that? Because I know what I saw. I saw it clearly, and I saw the 12 13 way she reacted. You mentioned that you presently live in Hohenwald, 14 15 Tennessee; is that correct? That's correct. 16 Α. 17 Q. When did you move there? I moved there in March of '03. 18 Α. 19 Q. Why did you move there? I moved there to work at the elephant sanctuary. 20 Α. 21 And what is that? 0.

A. It's a sanctuary for elephants, needy and abused and neglected, where they can live freely.

24 THE COURT: When you say "freely," they're in captivity, right?

22

THE WITNESS: They're on 2,700 acres, so it's as free 1 2 as --3 THE COURT: Free to roam, no constraints around? 4 There must be something. 5 THE WITNESS: There's fencing, and they're divided 6 into -- there's a quarantine section and then there's an Asian 7 section and then there's an African section, so they each have several hundred acres, and there's no human -- they're not asked 8 9 to do anything by humans, so they're as free as they can be in 10 the United States. And are ankus hooks used? THE COURT: 11 THE WITNESS: Absolutely not. There's not even one in 12 13 the place. Chains, any chains on the premises? 14 THE COURT: 15 THE WITNESS: No, no. 16 THE COURT: How many elephants are there? They have two African, and they've lost 17 THE WITNESS: one -- a couple of them, so I'm not exactly sure. I think 18 there's somewhere around 16 or 17. 19 THE COURT: How many Asian elephants? 20 THE WITNESS: Sixteen or seventeen Asians, yes. 21 22 There's only two Africans. Does the federal government routinely 23 THE COURT: 24 inspect the premises? 25 THE WITNESS: I believe so, yes.

THE COURT: The local government?

THE WITNESS: Yes. They have the Tennessee folks do,

yeah.

THE COURT: But you're not aware either Fish and Wildlife Service or Department of Agriculture, do you know whether or not either agency has any oversight responsibility?

THE WITNESS: I believe the federal government does have. I think it's USDA, but I have no dealing with that part of it so I'm not positive.

# BY MS. MEYER:

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. What did you do there?
- 12 A. I was an elephant caretaker.
  - Q. How long did you work there?
- 14 A. Six months.
  - Q. And why did you leave?
- 16 A. I got carpal tunnel in both wrists.
  - Q. I think you said at the beginning of your testimony that you retired. Do you do any volunteer work for animals?
    - A. I do some for the elephant sanctuary, and I started, myself and five other women, started a humane society in Hohenwald, and we take care of stray and neglected dogs and cats, and my husband is a cruelty investigator, so I help take care of cruelty case animals, plus wildlife that needs assistance.

MS. MEYER: I have no further questions, your Honor.

THE COURT: All right. Let me do this. I mentioned

the other case. We're going to take a short recess. You can leave your materials here, but I want to call the other case. It shouldn't take long.

2.4

So you'll have to come in for cross-examination.

And you can leave your materials there, counsel. Just leave a little room, leave room for other attorneys. I don't think there's a need for there to be much activity on the left side because the plaintiff lawyers are on the telephone, so you can just leave the materials there, and I'd ask for government counsel to come forward.

(Recess taken at about 2:22 p.m.)

THE COURT: All right. Let's proceed.

(Back on the record at about 2:42 p.m.)

MS. PARDO: Carol, could you turn on the Elmo for a moment?

Your Honor, I just wanted to make something clear for the record before we get started.

Before, plaintiffs' counsel had represented that Plaintiffs' we'll call Exhibit 120A, photos that are contained in Exhibit 120, was not objected to, and I'm showing you the pretrial statement. 120 contains the Bates-numbered-marked photographs that were exhibited in the courtroom today. We objected to those as being irrelevant and for lack of authenticity. 120A was provided with an additional copy in color. No additional objections were made because of the

objections made in Exhibit 120, but all photographs that were exhibited today by plaintiffs were objected to for the same reasons. I just wanted to make the record clear for you on that.

THE COURT: All right.

### CROSS-EXAMINATION

## BY MS. PARDO:

- Q. Good afternoon, Ms. Williams.
- A. Good afternoon.
- Q. You testified on your direct examination about an inspection of the elephants; is that correct, in August of '99?
- 12 | A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

- Q. This was a Red Unit's, Red Unit elephants; is that right?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. So this occurred over nine years ago; is that correct?
- 16 | A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And you didn't take the photographs in Plaintiffs' we'll
- 18 call Exhibit No. 19 that were showed in the courtroom today?
- 19 A. No, I did not.
- Q. You testified that Christine Franco was the one who did that, right?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And you didn't actually conduct that inspection, did you?
- 24 A. No.
- Q. Representatives from the Humane Society of Santa Clara

- 1 | Valley did so; is that correct?
- 2 | A. Yes.
- Q. And you have no personal knowledge of each of the elephants
- 4 that are in those photographs, do you?
- 5 A. I don't understand the question.
- Q. Could you identify each of the elephants in those
- 7 photographs?
- 8 A. By name, no.
- Q. And you couldn't identify all the body parts that were
- 10 being photographed, could you?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Are you aware that three of the elephants on the Red Unit
- during this time of the inspection weren't owned by Ringling
- 14 | Brothers?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And do you know which elephants those were in the
- 17 photographs?
- 18 A. I know their names. They weren't in the photographs. I
- 19 assume you mean the ones that Larry Cardin was handling.
- 20 Q. Can you identify the Cardin elephants?
- 21 A. Judy, Jenny, and Vicky.
- 22 Q. Can you identify them by sight?
- 23 | A. Not now, no.
- Q. Okay. So going back to the photographs, there is nothing
- on these elephants' photographs to indicate which one -- which

photograph belongs to which elephant; is that correct?

A. There's two of them. One of them has the injury, the outer ear. I think you pronounce it Siam, S-i-a-m, I believe, and then the one with the longer lacerations were the one we first saw, Toby.

- Q. So with the exception of those two elephants, can you identify any of the others in the photos?
- A. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

19

21

24

25

MS. PARDO: Can we bring up what was played as Plaintiffs' we'll call Exhibit 147, and that would be the clip that was played in the beginning.

(Video played.)

BY MS. PARDO:

- Q. Which elephants are featured in this clip that plaintiffs' counsel played for you earlier, Ms. Williams?
- A. All I know is they're the Red Unit elephants.
- Q. Are those indeed the Cardin elephants that were not owned by Ringling Brothers?
  - A. I don't believe so.
- 20 Q. Can you name the elephants?
  - A. No.
- Q. So what would make you think that those weren't the Cardin elephants?
  - A. Because his elephants I believe were at the very last part of the tent.

- Q. But you have no way of knowing and cannot indeed identify those as Ringling elephants?
- 3 | A. No.
- Q. And you testified that you didn't actually have videotape footage of this; is that correct?
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 \ Q. Who was the person who videotaped?
- 8 A. Marcia Mayeda.
  - Q. Were you near the camera when they were filming?
- 10 A. Yes.

- 11 Q. When Ms. Mayeda was filming?
- 12 A. Part of the time, yes.
- 13 \ Q. What were you doing the other part of the time?
- 14 A. Observing.
- 15 Q. Did you have any role in editing this footage?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. What happened to this footage after it was taken?
- 18 A. My understanding, it was given to the Humane Society --
- 19 | Humane Society of Santa Clara Valley kept it.
- Q. Can you say with any certainly what happened to the
- 21 videotape after it was filmed?
- 22 A. No.

24

- Q. Was this tape given by the Humane Society to plaintiffs or
- 25 A. I don't know.

their counsel?

- O. You don't know how it got to plaintiffs' counsel?
  - A. I didn't give it to them.
- Q. Do you know who got a copy of this tape in the intervening time between when it was taken and when it got to plaintiffs'
- 5 counsel?

2

3

4

6

8

17

18

22

23

- A. The only person I know that had it was Christine.
- 7 Q. Can you say for sure if anyone else was given a copy?
  - A. No.
- Q. Ms. Williams, you testified about what you did prior to the
  August 1999 inspection of the Ringling Brothers' elephants on
  direct, did you not?
- 12 A. Prior to the inspection?
- 13 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. Yes.
- Q. Is it typical for a police officer to begin gearing up for assisting with an animal inspection weeks before it's too occur?
  - THE COURT: That's probably argumentative. You can rephrase that.
- 19 BY MS. PARDO:
- Q. Had you ever geared up before an inspection weeks before the actual inspection?
  - MS. MEYER: Your Honor, I'm going to object because it assumes some fact that's not in evidence.
- 24 BY MS. PARDO:
  - O. Well, didn't you testify that you had done some leg work

- before you actually saw the animals in August of '99 when they came into town?
  - A. I said that I had read up on the laws and regulations regarding animals and I went to the Oakland performance.
  - Q. Didn't you testify on direct that you asked for information about what kind of animals and the number of animals that were coming to San Jose?
  - A. I asked that from the arena personnel, if they knew

    Steve -- I can't remember -- it starts with a K, Kirshner or

    something like that. Krishner.
  - Q. You also testified on direct that you hadn't gotten back any response, isn't that correct?
- 13 A. Correct.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

- 14 \ Q. That's not true, is it?
- 15 A. That's true.
- Q. The arena manager that you contacted gave you a response, didn't he?
- A. He said he hadn't received anything as of the time I asked him.
- Q. He also told you that he hoped you hadn't been brainwashed by the animal rights people, did he not?
- 22 A. I don't recall that.
  - O. You don't recall that?
- 24 A. No.

23

25

Q. You didn't stop there, did you?

1 MS. MEYER: Objection, your Honor.

2 BY MS. PARDO:

3

4

5

7

8

Q. Did you do other things in preparation --

THE COURT: Just a minute. Just a minute. That's a little vague question.

6 BY MS. PARDO:

- Q. Did you do anything else in preparation before the inspection of the animals in August of '99?
- 9 A. Yes. I familiarized myself with the laws and regulations
  10 and I went to Oakland.
- Q. You testified on direct that you went to the train unloading?
- 13 A. Yes.
- Q. And you testified on direct that you saw what you believed to be urine coming out of a black box under the elephant cars;
- 16 is that correct?
- 17 A. Yes.
- Q. Is it your testimony that this was some kind of urine collection tank?
- 20 A. That's what I believed at the time, yes.
- Q. Are you aware that there are holes drilled into the floors of the train cars for the urine to drain out?
  - A. No.

23

Q. Could what you have seen been the urine draining on to some part of the under side of the train car?

- A. It looked like it was coming from a plug from that black container.
- Q. But you don't have any knowledge of the specifics of the train car design, do you?
  - A. No.

8

9

- Q. And you're not here as an expert on the Ringling Brothers' train car design?
  - A. No, I'm not.
  - Q. Do you have any knowledge about train car mechanics or design in general?
- 11 A. No.
- Q. You also testified that you went to a performance in Oakland; is that correct?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- Q. And you testified on direct that you were not on duty for this: is that correct?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 Q. You went on your own free time to do that?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. Now, during the performance, you were with the animal rights protesters outside the arena, isn't that right?
- A. I stopped for a few minutes to say hi to somebody I knew, yes, that's right.
- Q. You also testified on your direct that you had seen Gunther
  Gebel-Williams during that 1999 August period; is that right?

- A. Yes.
- Q. Are you aware that he passed away in the summer of 2001?
- 3 | A. Yes.

8

9

- 4 | Q. Now, you also testified on your direct that the photographs
- 5 | that we saw as Plaintiffs' will call Exhibit 119 were forwarded
- 6 to the Santa Clara district attorney for review; is that right?
- 7 A. I don't recall what photographs you're talking about.
  - MS. MEYER: Objection. She did not testify to that, so that's not the scope.
- 10 MS. PARDO: I'm asking her if she knows.
- 11 BY MS. PARDO:
- Q. Do you know if those photographs were forwarded to the
- 13 district attorney?
- 14 A. Which photographs are you speaking of?
- 15 Q. The ones of the August '99 inspection.
- 16 A. 1999?
- 17 | Q. Yes.
  - A. My understanding is they were.
- 19 Q. Do you know if the videotape was also forwarded to the
- 20 district attorney's office?
- 21 A. I do not know that.
- 22 Q. You don't know that?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 | Q. And the district attorney's office declined to prosecute,
- 25 isn't that correct?

A. Yes.

1

8

9

10

- Q. Now, you testified on your direct that you tried to
  determine what could be another cause of marks that you found on
  the elephant; is that right?
- 5 A. Yes.
- Q. And you investigated dancer shoes, the tent area, and head qear. Is that what you testified to on direct?
  - A. And the train, correct.
    - Q. And the train. And did you consider whether these marks were from insect bites?
- 11 A. No.
- Q. You didn't consider whether the tushes that are on an elephant's head caused these?
- 14 A. The what?
- Q. Did you ever consider whether the tushes on an elephant's head caused these during contact with another elephant?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. You did not consider that as a source of the marks?
- 19 A. Typically they're not sharp enough to do that, but no.
- Q. Is it a reasonable conclusion that these could have been
- 21 | from brows?

- 22 A. I didn't see them with any brows.
- Q. You didn't see them that day with any brows; is that correct?
  - A. I didn't see them that week, I don't believe, with any

brows in 1999. 1 Do you know that brows can be a cause of scratches on 2 3 elephants? Α. Yes. 4 5 So the record is clear, you never actually saw anything 0. 6 actually make these marks; is that right? 7 Α. No. And neither did the other officers from the Humane Society 8 of Santa Clara Valley as far as you know? 9 10 MS. MEYER: Objection, your Honor. THE COURT: Sustained. 11 12 BY MS. PARDO: So you didn't investigate all possibilities of what could 13 have caused those marks; is that right? 14 I quess not. I investigated what I said. 15 Well, would it be reasonable to conclude that the marks on 16 0. the elephants could be from other activities, including contact 17 18 with other elephants? THE COURT: That's argumentative. You can rephrase 19 2.0 that. BY MS. PARDO: 21 Have you considered contact from her elephants as a source? 22 23 MS. MEYER: Asked and answered, your Honor. 24 BY MS. PARDO:

Had you considered --

1 | THE COURT: I'll allow it.

THE WITNESS: No.

BY MS. PARDO:

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

- Q. Had you considered whether the drawing of blood samples could be a source of any of the marks on the elephant that you found?
- A. That I have seen done, and I didn't feel that that was the cause. I have seen blood drawn in elephants.
- Q. When had you seen that done?
- A. I'm sorry. Are you talking 1999?
- Q. Yes.
- A. I saw that in 2000.
- 13 Q. So you did not see it the day that you made the inspection.

Now, you spoke in your direct examination that this information was forwarded to the United States Department of Agriculture by the Humane Society of Santa Clara Valley; is that right?

- A. I didn't do that. That was my understanding.
- Q. You weren't the person that did that?
- 20 A. No.
  - Q. But you're here testifying today about that inspection; is that correct?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. And you testified on your direct that the USDA in fact has guidelines on the care of elephants; is that right?

1	A. Under the Animal Welfare Act, yes.
2	Q. And you also testified I believe that you had reviewed
3	those prior to the '99 inspection?
4	A. Yes.
5	MS. PARDO: Can we bring up Defendant's Exhibit 88?
6	This is going to be at pages ten to eleven. I'm sorry, eight,
7	page eight.
8	BY MS. PARDO:
9	Q. This is a memorandum of July 5th, 2001, from Barbara Kohn
10	to Ron DeHaven?
11	MS. MEYER: I'm going to object to this document on
12	hearsay grounds.
13	MS. PARDO: This is a public record, your Honor.
14	THE COURT: What's your response?
15	MS. PARDO: This only contains the impressions of the
16	agency and the role that they are
17	THE COURT: It's a public record found where?
18	MS. PARDO: This is the United States Department of
19	Agriculture record.
20	THE COURT: Do you disagree with that, that it's
21	public?
22	Well, I'll allow the question. Go ahead. The post-
23	trial pleadings can address the admissibility of that document.
24	I don't know whether it's public or not. It's appears to be a
25	memo. I don't know whether it's an internal memo. I don't

know. Can you go to the Department of Agriculture and go to the 1 2 library and find that memo in the library? MS. PARDO: I think we take the position, your Honor, 3 that it is a public record made in the normal course of 4 5 business, a business record of a public agency. It may well be. It can provisionally come 6 THE COURT: 7 in for that purpose. I'll allow the questioning to proceed, 8 though. Go ahead. BY MS. PARDO: 9 10 As you can see in the top paragraph, this references San Jose, California, between August 23rd and 29th, 1999. 11 12 THE COURT: To be clear, so you're not offering it as a public record, you're offering it as a business record 13 maintained by this federal government agency; is that right? 14 MS. PARDO: I think it is a public record, your Honor, 15 but I think it also can be interpreted as a business record of 16 17 this agency, yes. MS. MEYER: Your Honor, just for the record, they made 18 no showing it's a business record. They don't have the 19 20 custodian of the record or a declaration from anyone from the 21 USDA. Was this objected to in pretrial? 22 THE COURT: 23 MS. MEYER: Yes, your Honor. MS. PARDO: There's been no authenticity objections to 24

25

this, your Honor.

THE COURT: Again, it's either objected to or not. I don't want to keep getting into this where someone says it's clear from pretrial it was objected to and someone says it's clear that it wasn't. If it was objected to, what was the basis for the objection?

MS. PARDO: Maybe we can do it this way, your Honor.

BY MS. PARDO:

Q. Is it your testimony that there was --

THE COURT: Wait a minute. Wait just a minute. I want to get an answer to this one. Was it objected to, and, if so, what was the basis?

MS. MEYER: Your Honor, it was objected to on the grounds it was hearsay. What I'm saying is, if they're going to say it's a business record, they have not produced a custodian or a declaration from anyone at the USDA.

THE COURT: You do have to lay a foundation. It may well be a business record or a public record or a combination of both, but there should be something that vouches for its authentication. It sounds as though they objected to it. Do you disagree with counsel saying that they objected to it on the grounds that it's hearsay?

MS. PARDO: I'm sorry?

THE COURT: Do you disagree with that? They said they objected to it on the grounds of hearsay.

MS. PARDO: We believe that it would meet the public

records test, your Honor.

THE COURT: This can be addressed in the post-trial pleadings. I'll allow the questioning only because I want to conclude this trial at some reasonable point in time, but I'll reserve ruling on whether or not it becomes a part of the evidentiary record.

BY MS. PARDO:

Q. I want to direct your attention to the first paragraph. This is --

THE COURT: It may well be one of those, but it's not self-authenticating, that's for sure. There should be some indicia of reliability on this document; otherwise, anyone can come in court and say this is a public record. I don't know if it's a public record. You can print all kinds of nomenclature off the Internet, so there has to be some indicia of reliability of authentication in order for it to come in as an exception to the Hearsay rule.

Go ahead. Maybe you can play that at a later point.

I'll allow the questioning to proceed, though, provisionally.

BY MS. PARDO:

- Q. Now, in the first paragraph it states this is from San Jose, California, between August 23rd and 29th, 1999; is that correct?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And that the allegations involved, abuse via improper use

1 of ankus?
2 A. Yes.
3 Q. And i
4
5
6
7
8
9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

And in the second paragraph --

THE COURT: Is this signed by anyone?

MS. PARDO: It has initials in the "From" portion.

THE COURT: Who?

MS. PARDO: Barbara Kohn.

THE COURT: Who is she?

MS. PARDO: Your Honor, we can take --

THE COURT: Who is Barbara Kohn?

MS. PARDO: She's a USDA official, your Honor.

THE COURT: I don't know that to be a fact. I'm not going to allow this. This is stretching the hearsay rule. I'm not going to allow it. It may well be that you can get it in some other way, but I'm not going to allow it. I don't know who this person is. There's no indicia of authenticity and reliability on this document. You can't just come in and say this is reliable.

BY MS. PARDO:

Q. Ms. Williams, do you have any knowledge as to why the USDA declined to provide for a violation?

A. No.

- Q. But you knew that they decided to issue a no-violation letter or decided no violation was the result?
- A. It wasn't sent to me so I never saw it.

THE COURT: She learned that through hearsay anyway. 1 2 Move on. 3 BY MS. PARDO: Isn't it true that the Humane Society of Santa Clara Valley 4 5 disapproves of the use of elephants in circuses? 6 MS. MEYER: Objection. I'm sorry. That question again was isn't 7 THE COURT: 8 it true that? The Humane Society of Santa Clara Valley 9 MS. PARDO: 10 disapproved of the use of elephants in circuses. THE COURT: I don't think she's the proper witness to 11 12 answer that question. You never worked for that agency, did you? 13 THE WITNESS: I worked for them in 1978. 14 MS. PARDO: She also is here to authenticate and 15 testify to the inspections and the formal documentation from 16 17 that agency. I'm not going to allow that. That's THE COURT: 18 19 hearsay as well. Next question. 20 BY MS. PARDO: Ms. Williams, were you in fact sitting on the board of the 21 Humane Society of Santa Clara Valley at one point? 22 23 Α. Many, many years ago, yes. 24 What year was that? Q.

I think it was in the early '70s.

25

Α.

THE COURT: Was that before you became a police 1 2 officer? THE WITNESS: Way before. 3 Well, I became a police officer in '83, and it was 4 5 sometime in the '70s. BY MS. PARDO: 6 You have no knowledge as to the matter of policy what the 7 8 Humane Society's position statement was at the time that you were liasoning with them and assisting with their inspection? 9 10 MS. MEYER: Objection again. It's hearsay. THE COURT: Sustained, sustained. 11 12 BY MS. PARDO: How long were you a San Jose police officer? 13 Until I retired? 14 Α. 15 0. Yes. 16 Twenty-plus years. Α. 17 As part of your San Jose police officer training, were you 0. 18 trained in the proper use of the guide? 19 Are you speaking of an ankus? Α. 20 0. Yes. 21 Α. No. You have no training on that subject? 22 Q. 23 Α. No. You're not a veterinarian, are you? 24 25 No. Α.

- Q. Have you had any veterinary training?
- 2 A. I was a veterinarian assistant for a brief time in San Diego.
  - Q. Did the Humane Society of Santa Clara Valley require the people participating in the inspection to have training in the ankus?
  - A. I wouldn't know.
    - Q. Were you asked if you have had training in the use of the ankus?
    - A. No.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

11 Q. You've been affiliated with organizations before that -12 strike that.

Have you also had membership in animal rights or animal welfare organizations?

- A. Yes, I have.
  - O. And what are those?
- A. I made donations to Farm Sanctuary, PAWS, The Humane Society of the United States.
  - Q. For how many years?
- A. I don't know exact years, but I can tell you for the last fifteen years before because there were various ones.

PETA.

THE COURT: This is after your service as a police officer terminated?

THE WITNESS: No. This is for probably most of my

adult life at some point I've belonged to various organizations and given donations.

I don't know which one do you want if you want me to list them all.

## BY MS. PARDO:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

1.0

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

- Q. During the 1999 -- from 1999 through the time that you retired from the police force, can you state which organizations you've donated money to?
- A. The only ones I can remember for certain were Farm Sanctuary, I think Animal Protection Institute.
- Q. That's the plaintiff in this case?
- A. Yes, I believe so.

PAWS, In Defense of Animals. At some point I belonged to PETA, and I can't say for sure I belonged at that time or not.

- Q. Did you belong to any of the organizations you just named prior to PETA?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And you also made monetary donations?
- 20 A. That's what I did, is I made donations, yes.
  - Q. And became a member?
    - A. Sometimes you become a member, sometimes you don't.
    - Q. You attended an animal rights conference in Washington,
- D.C. in July of 2000, isn't that correct?
- 25 A. Yes, it is.

And you attended select presentations at this conference? 1 0. 2 Yes, I did. Α. Did you also choose to attend a presentation called New 3 0. Tactics, Banning Circuses? 4 5 I don't remember. I don't remember exactly which ones I attended. 6 7 Q. This is the animal rights conference in 2000 in Washington, 8 D.C. 9 MS. MEYER: Objection, your Honor. THE COURT: What's the basis? I haven't heard a 10 11 question. What are you objecting to? MS. MEYER: This has not been --12 MS. PARDO: This is an impeachment document, your 13 14 Honor. I'm sorry. What's the basis? 15 THE COURT: MS. MEYER: There's no authentication of this 16 17 document. THE COURT: She hasn't asked a question yet. What's 18 19 your objection? 20 BY MS. PARDO: 21 You said you did not know if you attended such a seminar? Q. I couldn't remember if there's a specific one I attended or 22 Α. not. I said I did attend a conference. 23 Did it indeed have a course called New Tactics, Banning 24 Ο.

25

Circuses?

THE COURT: What are you using this for? She said she 1 2 can't remember. Are you using this to refresh her recollection? 3 MS. PARDO: I'm using it to see if she remembers that 4 was the --5 THE COURT: Does that refresh your recollection, 6 looking at that document? 7 THE WITNESS: It doesn't tell me which ones I went to. 8 THE COURT: Does it tell that you attended it? 9 THE WITNESS: I know I went to the conference, I think 10 so. 11 THE COURT: All right. So it doesn't refresh your 12 recollection in any other way? 13 THE WITNESS: No. 14 THE COURT: All right. Move on. 15 BY MS. PARDO: During the time that you accused Mark Gebel of elephant 16 Q. abuse, were you liasoning with the Humane Society at that time? 17 I was. 18 Α. MS. MEYER: Objection, your Honor. I don't know what 19 20 that means, liasoning. 21 THE COURT: I was wondering the same thing. What does 22 that mean? 23 BY MS. PARDO: 24 Were you assisting with them? 25 Α. Yes, I was.

THE COURT: Were you associating with that organization?

THE WITNESS: What happened was, their executive director asked the chief of police if I would assist them for those three years in inspecting the circuses.

BY MS. PARDO:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

- Q. And you mentioned the criminal jury trial that you testified in December 2001 again Mr. Gebel; is that correct?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. You were under oath during those proceedings?
- A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And this was for the incident involving Asia?
- 13 A. Yes.
- Q. You got on the stand and told the jury your story about what happened with respect to the elephant Asia; is that
- 16 correct?
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 Q. And the jury found Mr. Gebel not guilty?
- 19 A. That is correct.
- Q. He didn't even have to put on a defense, did he?
- 21 A. No.

- Q. And in 2001 did you agree that Ringling's handlers -- would you agree that Ringling handlers are people who are trained and skilled in handling elephants?
  - A. Not all of them, no.

- Q. Would you agree that some of them were?
- 2 A. Yes.

7

- 3 \ Q. Now, with respect to the incident itself, you claimed it
- 4 occurred walking from the animal compound to the arena; is that
- 5 correct?
- 6 A. Correct.
  - Q. And this again was an incident over seven years ago?
- 8 A. Correct.
- 9 Q. Now, in fact, you never saw the bullhook actually pierce
- 10 Asia's skin; isn't that correct?
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 Q. You saw no contact at all between the bullhook and the
- 13 elephant?
- 14 A. Correct.
- Q. And in fact, wasn't the elephant obstructing your view from
- 16 seeing the handler at all?
- 17 | A. No.

19

- 18 Q. Was the elephant obstructing any kind of view of the guide?
  - A. I'm not sure how to answer that. Can you reword that?
- Q. Sure. Did you testify or do you recall seeing that the quide didn't in fact touch the skin?
- 22 THE COURT: Wait a minute. Rephrase that question.
- MS. PARDO: I'm sorry.
- 24 BY MS. PARDO:
  - Q. Is it your testimony that you did not see the guide touch

the skin of that elephant?

A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. And despite seeing no contact between the bullhook and the elephant, you considered this to be abuse; is that right?
  - A. I considered -- her movement plus the reaction of the elephant is what made me believe that contact had been made.
  - Q. But you did not immediately go and look at the elephant?
- A. No.
  - Q. You didn't stop the elephants in the line as they were walking by?
- 11 A. I couldn't.
- Q. You could have asked a Ringling Brothers handler to bring
  Asia for an inspection immediately, isn't that correct?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. You didn't have the power to do that?
  - A. There was a lot of hostility between Ringling Brothers and us at that point in time, and the way the circus is, I was told not to interrupt the circus unless it was a life-threatening matter. My chief of police told me that. And also for me to get around to where the handler was to stop them in the street, I had to wait for all the elephants to pass me and then run along the street to meet up with Asia, and that was -- that's a public safety issue, that I wasn't willing to take that risk.
- 24 0. What was the risk?
  - A. The risk was of startling the elephants by running next to

them. 1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

15

16

19

- Now, when the elephants reached their destination did you go up and perform an inspection at that point?
- The elephants went in -- they go down a ramp and then there's an area that's like kind of a loading area, and then beyond that there is an area that is actually going into the arena, and the elephants went into there.
- So you didn't stop Asia before she went into the arena; is that correct?
- Α. No.
- And you didn't inspect Asia while she was waiting to go 11 into the performance; is that right? 12
- 13 Α. No.
- You didn't order Ringling Brothers to keep Asia out of the 14 performance?
  - I didn't think that was possible.
- You're a police officer for the City of San Jose, isn't 17 that correct? 18
  - Correct.
- But you didn't think you had the power to do that? 20 Q.
- My chief instructed me not to stop the circus unless it was 21 a life-threatening matter. I didn't think it was a 22
- life-threatening matter, and we can inspect the elephant as she 2.3 24 came out.
  - You testified earlier you thought it was a stabbing?

- A. Correct.
- Q. But it wasn't something that needed to have Asia held out from the performance, is that your testimony?
  - A. No.

4

5

- Q. And in fact, she went on to perform; is that right?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- Q. Are you aware that there were two more shows that day after the performance?
  - A. That was the final performance of that show.
- Q. Do you have any knowledge that Asia had to sit out of any performances?
- 12 | A. No.
- Q. Now, you were never actually employed by the Humane Society of Santa Clara Valley in the 1991 to 2001 time frame, were you?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. You didn't receive a paycheck from them?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. And they didn't have the power to fire you?
- 19 A. No.
- Q. At some time after Mark Gebel was cited for this, did the
  Humane Society cease having inspecting powers in the City of San
  Jose?
- MS. MEYER: Objection, your Honor.
- 24 THE COURT: Rephrase that question.
- 25 BY MS. PARDO:

- Q. During the time that you were a San Jose police officer, do you know if the Humane Society's inspection powers changed during that time?
  - A. They got, the city of San Jose got their own animal control. I don't know if they took over inspecting or not. I'm not positive about that.
  - Q. You're not sure how it worked?
    - A. I'm not sure who had what jurisdiction.
  - Q. You testified on your direct examination that you know Carol Buckley; is that right?
- 11 A. Yes.

5

6

7

8

9

- 12 Q. Did you know that she's also an expert in this case?
- 13 A. Yes.
- Q. You lived on her compound in Hohenwald, Texas [sic]; is that right?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. You worked there?
- 18 | A. I worked there.
- Q. Ms. Buckley testified at Mark Gebel's trial as well, didn't she?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Did you speak with her during that trial?
- A. During the trial, no, I don't believe so.
- 24 Q. While she was in town for that trial?
- 25 A. I don't believe so.

- Q. You gave monetary contributions to Ms. Buckley's elephant compound, didn't you?
  - A. The Elephant Sanctuary, yes, I have.
- Q. Yes, you have. In fact, in the spring of 2003 you gave a founder donor award of over \$10,000; is that right?
- 6 A. That's correct.

- Q. And in the spring of 2004 you were a patron donor between one thousand and five thousand dollars; is that right?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- Q. You've actually shared membership in an elephant organization with another expert in this case, isn't that right?
- 12 A. I don't know who you're referring to.
- THE COURT: If you give a name, maybe she can answer that.
- 15 BY MS. PARDO:
- Q. Did you serve on the board of directors for the Alliance
  For Elephants with Colleen Kinzley?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Did Ms. Elly also sit on that organization?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And you were board of directors for that organization,
- 22 | right?

- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 | Q. Was Scott Glaze also a vice president of that organization?
  - A. Yes.

1 Q. And he runs the Elephant Sanctuary with Ms. Buckley; is 2 that right? 3 Α. Correct. You never worked in a circus, Ms. Williams, have you? 4 0. 5 Α. No. 6 And you've never been trained in the use of tethers; is 7 that correct? 8 Α. No. 9 That's not correct, or you've never been trained? 0. I've never been trained. 10 Α. You're opposed to elephants being in the circus, aren't 11 Q. 12 you? 13 Α. Yes. I have no more questions. 1.4 MS. PARDO: 15 THE COURT: All right. 16 Redirect? REDIRECT EXAMINATION 17 18 BY MS. MEYER: Sergeant Williams, you in answer to a question by Ms. Pardo 19 said that the three elephants that were owned by someone other 20 21 than Ringling Brothers that you saw during the inspection of 1999, you said they were not in the photo; is that correct? 22 I said in that particular photo there that she showed --23 they were at the very far end where you walked in, where we 24 started the inspection with Toby, they were at the very, very 25

- far end, and they were three of the elephants that had no injuries.
  - Q. Okay. And when you went to the animal rights conference in July of 2000, who paid for you to attend that conference?
    - A. I got release time from the police department to attend.
    - Q. And you said that you were a patron of the Elephant Sanctuary. You gave them a donation; is that correct?
  - A. Correct.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. Why did you do that?
- A. I had just sold my house in San Jose and I made a whole lot of money so I gave them a large donation, and then the other one -- that was a ten thousand, and the other one, that was a gift for a friend.
  - Q. But why did you give a \$10,000 donation to the Elephant Sanctuary?
  - A. Because I had extra money and I believed they're an organization that does a good job for the elephants.
- Q. Okay. And you mentioned some of the animal groups that you've been a member of over the years, and I think you said you had been a member of PETA; is that correct?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. When were you a member of PETA?
- A. It was years ago. I don't remember the exact time. I'm not a member now.
  - Q. Okay. Why did you stop being a member?

- A. I don't believe in the tactics that -- some of the tactics they use. I don't believe in throwing paint on people and some of the protests that they do. I just think for me it's too far out.
  - Q. And are you a member of any other nonprofit organizations other than the ones that you named in response to Ms. Pardo's questions?
- A. Yes. I've been a member of Mothers Against Drunk Drivers,
  Southern Poverty Law Firm, Planned Parenthood, Center For
  Science and the Public Interest, Goodwill, Hope for the
  Retarded, Citizens Committee on Responsible Medicine. I mean,
  I'm sure there's more, but that's what comes to mind.
  - Q. Have you donated money to those organizations as well?
- 14 | A. Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

- Q. When we talk about donating money to those organizations, how much money are we talking about?
- A. I usually give -- when I have a lot money I give money.

  When I don't have money, you know, I give less, but mostly I

  just give money when I can, so I don't have any set amount.
- 20 Usually 25, fifty dollars; something like that.
- Q. And you said that you are opposed to the use of elephants in circuses; is that correct?
- 23 A. Yes.

- 24  $\square$  Q. And why is that?
  - A. Because I don't believe that that's what a life for an

elephant to be. They're very, very social creatures. They need a lot of interaction, they need a lot of exercise. They need room to roam, and being chained and dominated, I don't feel that that's in the best benefit for an elephant or any wild animal.

MS. MEYER: I have no further questions, your Honor.

THE COURT: All right.

Any other questions?

MS. PARDO: No, your Honor.

THE COURT: All right.

Thank you. Are you returning home today?

THE WITNESS: Tomorrow.

THE COURT: Tomorrow? Have a safe trip.

THE WITNESS: Thank you, sir.

THE COURT: I have to ask you, please refrain from talking with any other participants in this trial, any other experts or any other witnesses.

THE WITNESS: Okay.

THE COURT: All right. Thank you.

All right, counsel. I need to take a ten-minute recess. And we'll talk further before we adjourn. I don't think there's any way I can reschedule that matter for Monday at ten o'clock. There are just too many participants involved in that. But I don't think it's going to take more than an hour, but I want to talk about that when I return, but I need to take a ten-minute recess and we'll talk again in ten minutes.

1 All right. How many witnesses do you have for Monday? 2 MS. MEYER: Just two, your Honor. 3 THE COURT: Just two? Are they experts? 4 MS. MEYER: No. 5 THE COURT: All right. Just two witnesses. How long 6 do you anticipate your direct to be? 7 First witness should be very short. MS. MEYER: 8 just to authenticate something. And the second witness is going 9 to take probably around two hours. 10 THE COURT: Two hours? All right. You don't have 11 anyone else lined up? 12 MS. MEYER: We have a lot of deposition testimony that 13 we wanted to cover on Monday. THE COURT: All right, that's fine, because we have a 14 15 full day. With the exception of that ten o'clock matter, we 16 have a full day, so I want to try to get as much accomplished as 17 we can, but give me ten minutes and we'll talk again. There's no need to stand, counsel. Thank you. 18 COURTROOM DEPUTY: This Court is in a ten-minute 19 20 recess. 21 (Recess taken at about 3:18 p.m.) COURTROOM DEPUTY: Remain seated. This Honorable 22 23 Court is again in session. (Back on the record at about 3:44 p.m.) 24 25 THE COURT: All right, counsel. I'm going to let you

25

But you're going to have to do some work, not necessarily over the weekend. I'm not really interested in soliciting the views of any federal agency right now with respect to the scope of some agency's authority, statutory, regulatory, or otherwise over Asian elephants in captivity in American circuses, but I am interested in the parties' views about that, so I want to give the parties an opportunity to, in a very straightforward manner, and probably in respective pleadings of no more than ten pages because I don't think you need more than ten pages, tell me just what is the scope of any statutory or regulatory authority, if any, of any federal agency for the overall responsibility for Asian elephants in captivity in American circuses, and I've defined that question very broadly, and I just don't want some statutory citations. I want you to tell me just what it is, what's the substance, if any, of that regulatory oversight responsibility vis-a-vis obviously abuse. That's what I'm concerned about. I want to know what the federal government's role is, if any. And maybe there is no role with respect to certain pachyderms. I don't know. But I want to be clear about it before I start asking the federal government to tell me what its role is. I want to give the parties an opportunity to clearly tell me. And I don't think that I need a pleading of any more than ten pages, filed maybe Wednesday, Wednesday at noon. That way no one has to work over the weekend, although everyone probably does anyway. At least you won't have to work

But, I mean, you've probably already given it some 1 2 thought. I heard conflicting views yesterday about just what the role is, if any, but based upon your own understanding and 3 awareness of what the scope of authority maybe is. 4 Will a pleading of ten pages educate the Court, or do 5 you need more paragraphs? 6 7 MR. SIMPSON: That's sufficient, your Honor. 8 plenty. 9 THE COURT: You think it's crystal clear what the 10 authority is, right? MR. SIMPSON: I think it's very clear. 11 12 MS. MEYER: Ten pages will do it. THE COURT: You think it's crystal clear as well? 13 14 MS. MEYER: Yes. 15 THE COURT: But you both disagree as to what the 16 authority is? MS. MEYER: Funny how that happens. 17 Addy reminds me that yesterday counsel for THE COURT: 18 defendant mentioned that there have been some circuses who have 19 indeed lost their license, I assume to have -- I'm not sure 20 whether it's Asian elephants or African elephants. The more 21 information you can provide me about that and the reasons why, 22 23 what happened. 24 MR. SIMPSON: There was an investigation, it's my

understanding -- I need to go actually read the decision. It's

not fresh in my mind. There was an investigation involving a corporation, I believe, a Hawthorn Corporation, and it was by the U.S. Department of Agriculture, and it concerned the manner in which that entity was holding Asian elephants. Those elephants either were confiscated or as a result of a consent decision between the government and that holder were sent to a sanc- -- sent to Ms. Buckley's sanctuary. There was an elephant named Ned who coincidentally also currently is being held by Ms. Buckley, who was confiscated by the USDA, he was held by an exhibitor by the last name of Ramos, and again it was because of the USDA's perception of his condition, his weight, etcetera.

There were two elephants, as I remember, who were being held in a mobile trailer in very hot conditions somewhere in Arizona or New Mexico. They were confiscated by I believe the USDA after a local animal or police officer noticed the conditions and placed with a zoo.

The King Royal Circus had its license revoked, and I believe that that's in the summary judgment brief that we filed last -- in 2006. Either it's a citation, either in our main brief or in our reply brief, and at the same time in the Cunio (ph) or the Hawthorne matter, there was a USDA enforcement action that was brought against an elephant handler who had an eastern European name I can't pronounce, who in full view of USDA investigators hooked an elephant named Jane or Jenny, something like that, in a performance. They witnessed it. He

was prosecuted, and that was determined not to be a violation of the Animal Welfare Act, the mere fact that a cut was put on an elephant. So we'd be happy to provide those separately or in connection with this pleading.

THE COURT: All right, that's fine. I said ten pages. I don't know, is that reasonable?

MR. SIMPSON: I think so. I'd just assume not have to do a brief in the middle of this.

THE COURT: That's fine. Ten pages will give me the answer I need, and the answer I need is whether or not I need to ask someone else, but I'm somewhat concerned. You both say the answer is clear, but my guess is you're not going to agree to what the answer is, are you?

MR. SIMPSON: I don't think so, but at the same time, it's not a matter that requires a lot of research because at the end of the day no Court has ever done this so it's not like we're coming in with a bunch of cases.

THE COURT: Right. But still, though, the federal government has done some things over time, I assume, investigations, taken away licenses, and there must be regulations in place, I assume.

MR. SIMPSON: There are, but as far as I know, your Honor, there's never been an enforcement action by Fish and Wildlife against the holder of a captive endangered species.

THE COURT: Even though there having been allegations

of abuse?

1.7

MR. SIMPSON: All of that has been handled by the Department of Agriculture, and I'm not aware of a single action by either the Department of Interior or the United States against a captive holder of an endangered species on the ground that what you're doing is a taking. They've probably not given people permits because they've done things that they believe are violations of the AWA, but I don't know that there's ever been an enforcement action, and I could be wrong, but we've looked and haven't found it.

THE COURT: The other thing is, and I just learned this either in the elevator or at the lunch table one day, I think Ms. Meyer argued a case before Judge Friedman maybe a year or so ago, I don't know, an elephant case.

MS. MEYER: That was actually Ms. Sanerib.

MS. SANERIB: That was me, your Honor.

THE COURT: Maybe Judge Friedman would have gotten this case as related. Anyway, I've just heard that. I don't think there's a published opinion, is there?

MS. SANERIB: No, there's not. There's a transcript.

THE COURT: It had to deal with Asian elephants being transported from the train station to --

MS. SANERIB: It had to deal with actually the same Hawthorne elephants that Mr. Simpson was just discussing, and it's a question of after the USDA brought an enforcement action

against the entity, the Hawthorne Corporation that held those 1 2 animals, it made a decision to transfer some of those animals to a circus in Oklahoma, so it was a challenge to the USDA's 3 4 decision. It had previously decided to send the elephants to the Elephant Sanctuary, reverse course, it was an APA case 5 6 against the USDA for the decision to transfer those animals to 7 Carson & Barnes, and ultimately all but one of those elephants went to the Elephant Sanctuary in Tennessee. 8 9 THE COURT: He didn't issue a written opinion, he 10 issued an oral ruling? That's correct. We have the transcript. 11 MS. SANERIB: THE COURT: Do the issues in this case have any 12 13 bearing on this case before me? MS. SANERIB: There was a consent decree at issue in 14 15 that case. THE COURT: That was an action against the USDA, 16 correct? 17 That's correct, yes. 18 MS. SANERIB: 19 THE COURT: Brought by an animal rights group? MS. SANERIB: Brought by an individual and --20 THE COURT: I'd be interested in the consent decree. 21 I don't think I have a copy of this, and actually I just heard 22 about this. I know there was not a written opinion, but was 23 24 there an oral ruling?

MS. SANERIB: Yes, there was.

25

1 THE COURT: Do you have the transcript of that? 2 MS. SANERIB: We have the transcript, yes. 3 THE COURT: Are you aware of that? 4 MR. SIMPSON: I was not aware of that case, your 5 Honor. 6 THE COURT: Would you be kind enough to share with 7 opposing counsel? MS. SANERIB: Yes, of course. I could e-mail it. 8 9 THE COURT: However you folks want to work it out. 10 Ten pages would be great. That will give me at least 11 some preliminary answers that I need. Everyone have a wonderful weekend. 12 Anything else we have to talk about? 13 MS. SANERIB: Actually, I have one more thing. 14 THE COURT: It's probably going to be noon. I don't 15 want to keep anyone waiting. If I start that matter at ten and 16 it goes over, there's a ton of legal talent here and I don't 17 want to keep folks waiting, so let's just say 12:30 to start on 18 19 Monday. Just eat your lunch before you come here. Or 1:00? quess 12:30, and we'll just go probably till 5:00 or 5:30 or so. 20 MS. SANERIB: Thank you, your Honor. 21 Just one quick question. This is regarding you asked 22 to file the exhibits to get entered into evidence on ECF. 23 24 THE COURT: Yes, I did. MS. SANERIB: We cannot do that with the video. 25

THE COURT: I think we can. I think we figured out a way to do that. We did that in the <u>Stevens</u> case with the videos.

MS. SCHMITT: Have you talked to Joe Burgess?

MS. SANERIB: I have not.

1.2

MS. SCHMITT: Try him first.

THE COURT: You need to speak with Joe Burgess.

MS. SANERIB: Speak with Joe Burgess, okay.

My other question was, we also have photographs that were taken at the inspections of the elephants. It's Plaintiffs' we'll call Exhibit 54 which was entered into evidence, and that because the photographs, in order to keep the quality, to upload them on the public record, it would just diminish the quality, so we gave a copy to our opposing counsel of those photographs on CD and filed with the clerk on CD, so we have a CD for you of those photographs if you would like them, and then I guess the question is, we'll try to work out the video.

THE COURT: You can work it out.

MS. SANERIB: We can work it out? Okay.

THE COURT: Joe, he was a tremendous help in the

Stevens case, and there were a lot of photographs. There was

some film footage. Maybe not film footage. There were a lot of

photographs, though. He helped us out tremendously. He's the

person to speak to. There's an easy way to do that.

MS. SANERIB: We're happy to talk to him. We don't need to take the Court's time with this issue.

THE COURT: He's around?

2.0

2.4

COURTROOM DEPUTY: Yes, he is.

THE COURT: Is he on the phone?

COURTROOM DEPUTY: Yes, sir.

THE COURT: Can he speak with counsel? I'm getting ready to adjourn now. Can he speak with counsel? Actually, if you want to send someone down also, counsel, if you want to post some of your exhibits as well, I'm sure --

MR. SIMPSON: There was an issue related to that that I actually discussed with Ms. Meyer, and that is, we would propose -- well, while we're doing the cross-examination of their witnesses, certain of our exhibits and other materials have been shown to witnesses. Some of them have been marked and some of them haven't. What we would propose is a list of those materials be prepared and filed, not the documents themselves, a list be filed in the court's record so it's clear for the record what's been shown to the witnesses.

THE COURT: Absolutely. I think that's fair and reasonable. Absolutely. Absolutely.

Mr. Burgess is available if you want to send someone down, counsel, to speak with him.

COURTROOM DEPUTY: I'm sorry, your Honor. He's on his way up.

THE COURT: You folks can stay here, but he's our 1 expert and he'll help you any way he can. All right. 2 3 MS. SANERIB: Thank you, your Honor. THE COURT: I'm going to be in chambers. If there's 4 some problem after you talk with him and something can't be 5 6 done, ask him to let us know. 7 Thank you. MS. SANERIB: Just one more question for you. We're wondering in 8 terms of keeping time for both sides, are you going to give us a 9 report at the end of the week of where we stand or would you 10 11 like us to try to --12 THE COURT: We'll go over our records. 13 Let me ask the court reporter as well. When you log 14 on and log in, you have the time recorded, don't you? COURT REPORTER: I do. I don't know about Lisa. 15 THE COURT: That will be another channel as well. 16 17 think our records are fairly accurate. 18 MS. SANERIB: Thank you, your Honor. THE COURT: But you're probably ahead of your time 19 anyway, aren't you? You probably aren't going to use up all of 20 your allotted time anyway in your case, are you? 21 MS. SANERIB: Oh, I think we might. 22 23 THE COURT: All right. 24 Anything further? No need to stand. Have a nice weekend. We'll start 25

```
at 12:30 on Monday. Thank you.
 1
                 COURTROOM DEPUTY: Court is adjourned until Monday at
 2
 3
       12:30 p.m.
                 (Proceedings adjourned at about 3:57 p.m.)
 4
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

			And the state of t						
1		INDEX							
2									
3	WITNESSES:	WITNESSES:							
4	LANETTE WILLIAMS								
5	Direct Exa	4 34							
6	Cross-examination by Ms. Pardo Redirect Examination by Ms. Meyer  64								
7									
8									
9									
10		ЕХНІВІ	TT S						
11	Plaintiffs' Exhibit								
12	No.	Identification	Marked	Admitted					
13	120A			28					
14									
15									
16									
17									
18									
19	1								
20									
21									
22									
23									
24									
25									

CERTIFICATE I, JACQUELINE M. SULLIVAN, Official Court Reporter, certify that the foregoing pages are a correct transcript from the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter. 

\$	<b>20004</b> [1] - 1:22 <b>20009</b> [1] - 1:17	6	address [2] - 22:10, 46:23	50:13, 50:14, 50:15, 51:18
The second secon	<b>20009</b> [1] - 1.17 <b>2001</b> [13] - 10:17,		addressed [1] - 49:2	allowed [2] - 14:5,
#40 000 ··· 00 ·F		6.55 4.6 24.44	addresses [1] - 25:3	14:23
<b>\$10,000</b> [2] - 63:5,	12:18, 13:14, 14:8,	<b>6</b> [5] - 1:6, 21:11,	, ,	almost [1] - 14:11
65:14	15:16, 16:6, 16:12,	21:19, 24:13, 24:15	Addy [1] - 70:18	
	30:1, 42:2, 46:9,	<b>64</b> [1] ~ 80:6	adjourn [2] - 67:20,	American [3] - 3:2,
ŧ	57:8, 57:22, 61:14	<b>6820</b> [1] - 2:3	77:8	69:5, 69:12
	2003 [1] - 63:4	<b>6:14</b> [1] - 8:2	adjourned [2] - 79:2,	<b>AMERICAN</b> [1] - 1:3
	<b>2004</b> [1] - 63:7	<b>6:25</b> [1] - 8:3	79:4	amount [1] - 66:19
<b>'03</b> [1] - 30:18	<b>2006</b> [1] - 71:19		administer [1] - 4:10	anatomy [1] - 11:24
'70s [2] - 51:25, 52:5	2009 [1] - 1:6	7	admissibility [2] -	angry [1] - 18:25
<b>'83</b> [1] - 52:4	202-354-3187 [1] - 2:4		25:23, 46:23	Animal [5] - 9:19,
<b>'99</b> [5] - 34:11, 39:1,	202-364-4092[1] -		admissible [1] - 24:25	46:1, 54:10, 72:2
40:8, 42:15, 46:3	1	<b>700</b> [1] - 1:17	admitted [4] - 8:21,	animal [15] - 17:8,
40.0, 42.10, 40.0	1:18	700[1] - 1:17		
•	202-662-4504 [1] -		8:22, 27:25, 28:3	38:16, 39:21, 41:20,
0	1:23	8	Admitted [1] - 80:12	53:13, 53:14, 54:23,
	<b>23rd</b> [2] - 47:11, 49:22		adult [1] - 54:1	55:7, 58:4, 62:4,
	<b>25</b> [1] - 66:20		affidavit [2] - 23:11,	65:3, 65:18, 67:4,
<b>03-2006</b> [2] <b>-</b> 1:4, 3:2	25th [1] - 17:20	<b>801</b> [1] - 1:22	23:12	71:15, 74:19
	28[1] - 80:13	88 [1] - 46:5	affiliated [1] - 53:11	animals [12] - 14:16,
1	29th [2] - 47:11, 49:22		African [3] - 31:7,	17:13, 32:18, 32:23,
		9	1	39:1, 39:4, 39:6,
	<b>2:18</b> [1] - 28:4	<u> </u>	31:17, 70:21	40:8, 74:2, 74:6
119 [1] - 42:5	<b>2:22</b> [1] - 33:11		Africans [1] - 31:22	
	<b>2:30</b> [2] - 4:2, 4:6	00 (4) 23:24	afternoon [10] - 3:9,	Animals [2] - 3:3,
<b>120</b> [5] - 27:23, 28:16,	2:42 [1] - 33:13	90 [1] - 23:21	3:15, 3:20, 3:24, 4:7,	54:13
33:20, 33:21, 34:1		90211 [2] - 24:7, 25:14	4:8, 13:7, 17:22,	ANIMALS [1] - 1:4
<b>120A</b> [12] - 26:14,	3		34:8, 34:9	ankus [7] - 18:14,
26:17, 27:19, 27:22,	J	<b>A</b>	AFTERNOON [1] -	18:16, 31:11, 50:1,
28:3, 28:10, 28:19,			1:11	52:19, 53:6, 53:9
28:20, 28:22, 33:19,	1.44			answer [9] - 48:10,
33:24, 80:13	3[1] - 1:11	able [2] - 18:16, 18:18	agency [9] - 32:6,	1 1
<b>12:30</b> [4] - 75:18,	<b>30</b> [1] - 14:20	above-entitled [1] -	46:16, 47:5, 47:14,	51:12, 58:19, 63:13,
	<b>333</b> [1] - 2:3	81:4	47:17, 51:13, 51:17,	64:19, 72:10, 72:12,
75:20, 79:1, 79:3	<b>34</b> [1] - 80:5		69:3, 69:11	72:13
<b>147</b> [3] - 5:21, 8:22,	<b>3:18</b> [1] - 68:21	Absolutely [5] - 30:9,	agency's [1] - 69:4	answered [1] - 44:23
36:10	<b>3:44</b> [1] - 68:24	31:12, 77:20, 77:21	ago [6] - 4:1, 34:15,	answers [1] - 75:11
<b>16</b> [1] - 31:19	<b>3:57</b> [1] - 79:4	Abuse [2] - 4:20	51:23, 58:7, 65:23,	anticipate [1] - 68:6
<b>1601</b> [1] - 1:16	3.57 [1] - 7 - 9.4	abuse [5] - 49:25,	73:14	anyway [4] - 51:1,
<b>17</b> <sub>[1]</sub> - 31:19		56:17, 59:4, 69:16,		69:25, 78:20, 78:21
17th [1] - 23:17	4	73:1	agree [5] - 6:25,	
		abused [1] - 30:22	57:22, 57:23, 58:1,	Anyway [1] - 73:18
<b>19</b> [1] - 34:18			72:12	<b>APA</b> [1] - 74:5
<b>1978</b> [1] - 51:14	4 [1] - 80:5	accomplished [1] -	Agriculture [6] - 32:5,	APPEARANCES [1] -
<b>1991</b> [1] - 61:14	40[1] - 14:20	68:16	45:16, 46:19, 47:1,	1:13
<b>1999</b> [16] - 4:25, 8:6,	<b>45</b> [2] - 14:20, 15:10	accurate [4] - 7:24,	71:3, 73:3	appeared [1] - 20:16
9:2, 13:18, 13:23,	.0[2]20, .00	8:5, 25:7, 78:17	ahead [6] - 19:23,	approaching [1] -
16:8, 38:10, 41:25,		accurately [1] - 6:9		17:4
42:16, 44:1, 45:10,	5	accused [1] - 56:16	26:1, 46:22, 47:8,	
		acres [2] - 31:1, 31:8	49:18, 78:19	appropriate [2] - 6:3,
47:11, 49:22, 54:6,		1 1	ahold [1] - 19:24	25:16
64:22	500.615PC [1] - 4:18	act [1] - 20:4	aided [1] - 2:7	area [6] - 14:14, 18:20,
<b>1:00</b> [1] - 75:19	<b>54</b> [1] - 76:11	Act [4] - 9:19, 9:20,	al [1] - 3:3	43:6, 60:5, 60:6
1:49 [1] - 1:7	<b>549</b> [1] - 6:13	46:1, 72:2	allegations [2] -	areas [1] - 14:6
1:56 [1] - 8:23	<b>596.5</b> [1] - 19:17	action [11] - 3;2, 8:25,	49:25, 72:25	arena [8] - 10:4, 20:6,
***	• •	9:12, 9:21, 21:4,		
2	<b>596PC</b> [1] - 9:7	71:22, 72:23, 73:3,	Alliance [1] - 63:16	39:8, 39:16, 41:21,
<b>4</b>	<b>5:00</b> [1] - 75:20	73:9, 73:25, 74:16	allotted [1] - 78:21	58:4, 60:7, 60:8
And the second s	<b>5:30</b> [1] - 75:20	1	allow [23] - 6:10,	argued [1] - 73:13
	<b>5:37</b> [1] - 6:12	activities [1] - 44:17	10:24, 14:14, 16:19,	argumentative [2] -
<b>2,700</b> [1] - 31:1	5th [1] - 46:9	activity [1] - 33:7	16:23, 21:16, 22:1,	38:17, 44:19
<b>2000</b> [8] - 9:25, 10:1,	1	actual [1] - 38:21	22:2, 24:1, 24:4,	Arizona [1] - 71:14
10:16, 11:3, 45:12,		addition [1] - 15:24		armpit [1] - 11:24
54:24, 55:7, 65:4		additional [2] - 33:24,	24:17, 25:20, 25:21,	• • •
20001 [1] - 2:4		33:25	27:16, 45:1, 46:22,	ascertaining [1] - 26:15
			47:7, 49:3, 49:19,	

Asia [22] - 17:15, 18:3, 18:7, 18:11, 18:22, 20:8, 20:10, 26:9, 26:22, 26:24, 28:23, 29:9, 30:1, 57:12, 57:15, 59:13, 59:22, 60:8, 60:11, 60:14, 61:2, 61:10 Asia's [2] - 18:18, 58:10 Asian [7] - 31:6, 31:20, 69:5, 69:12, 70:21, 71:4, 73:21 Asians [1] - 31:21 asphalt [2] - 15:2, 15:3 asserted [2] - 22:2. 26:4 assist [2] - 19:11, 57:4 assistance [1] - 32:23 assistant [1] - 53:2 assisting [6] - 11:8, 13:11, 19:8, 38:16, 52:9, 56:24 associating (1) - 57:1 assume [5] - 35:19, 70:20, 72:7, 72:19, 72:21 assumes [1] - 38:23 assumption [1] -28:24 assure [1] - 10:13 attempt [1] - 23:3 attend [4] - 55:3, 55:23, 65:4, 65:5 attended [6] - 54:23, 55:1, 55:6, 55:21, 55:22, 56:8 attends [1] - 14:21 attention [2] - 18:13, 49:8 attorney [2] - 42:6, 42:13 attorney's [3] - 9:5, 42:20, 42:24 attorneys [2] - 4:2, 33:6 August [21] - 4:25, 8:6, 9:2, 9:25, 10:1, 12:18, 13:14, 14:8, 15:16, 16:5, 16:8, 17:20, 30:1, 34:11, 38:10, 39:1, 40:8, 41:25, 42:15, 47:11, 49:22 Authenticate [1] -25:15 authenticate [2] -51:15, 68:8 authenticating [1] -

49:11 authentication [4] -24:8. 48:19. 49:16. 55:16 authenticity [3] -33:24, 47:24, 50:16 authority [5] - 69:4, 69:10, 70:4, 70:10, 70:16 available [4] - 22:19, 23:22, 25:9, 77:22 Avenue [3] - 1:16, 1:22, 2:3 AWA [1] - 73:8 award [1] - 63:5 aware [10] - 5:13, 5:17, 32:4, 35:12, 40:21, 42:2, 61:7, 73:3, 75:3, 75:4 awareness [1] - 70:4

# В

bamboo [1] - 15:5 Banning [2] - 55:4, 55:24 Barbara [3] - 46:9, 50:7, 50:10 Barnes [1] - 74:7 based [1] - 70:3 basis 181 - 9:6, 9:17. 22:12, 22:15, 48:4, 48:11, 55:10, 55:15 Bates [2] - 27:23, 33:21 Bates-numberedmarked [1] - 33:21 bearing [1] - 74:13 became [3] - 52:1, 52:4, 54:21 become [4] - 24:17, 24:18, 27:17, 54:22 becomes [2] - 24:20, 49:5 BEFORE [1] - 1:11 begin [1] - 38:15 beginning [2] - 32:17, 36:11 behalf [1] - 6:4 behavior [1] - 8:14 behind [1] - 20:14 belong [1] - 54:16 belonged [3] - 54:1, 54:13, 54:14 belongs [1] - 36:1 BENCH[1] - 1:11 benefit [1] - 67:4 best [3] - 18:22, 19:23, 67:4

between [9] - 14:20, 38:4, 47:11, 49:22, 58:12, 59:3, 59:16, 63:7, 71:6 beyond [1] - 60:6 bias [1] - 22:25 big [1] - 16:2 bit [1] - 15:5 bites [1] - 43:10 black [2] - 40:15, 41:1 blood [4] - 20:16, 20:18, 45:4, 45:8 bloody [1] - 20:14 Blue [2] - 10:22, 11:6 board [3] - 51:21, 63:16, 63:21 body [3] - 11:25, 18:18, 35:9 bolted [1] - 18:22 Bonco [2] - 7:10, 7:12 box [1] - 40:15 brainwashed [1] -39:20 brief[5] - 53:2, 71:18, 71:20, 72:8 bring [4] - 9:12, 36:9, 46:5, 59:12 broadly [1] - 69:13 Brothers [8] - 9:1,

brief [5] - 53:2, 71:18, 71:20, 72:8
bring [4] - 9:12, 36:9, 46:5, 59:12
broadly [1] - 69:13
Brothers [8] - 9:1, 9:24, 35:14, 36:18, 59:12, 59:16, 60:14, 64:21
Brothers' [5] - 5:1, 7:21, 12:17, 38:10, 41:6
Brought [2] - 74:19, 74:20
brought [2] - 71:22, 73:25 brows [5] - 43:21,

73:25 brows [5] - 43:21, 43:22, 43:23, 44:1, 44:2 Buckley [4] - 62:10,

Buckley [4] - 62: 10, 62:19, 64:1, 71:9

Buckley's [2] - 63:1, 71:7

bullhook [3] - 58:9, 58:12, 59:3

bunch [1] - 72:17 Burgess [4] - 76:4, 76:7, 76:8, 77:22 Business [1] - 25:15 business [18] - 22:18, 22:20, 23:2, 23:9, 23:18, 24:2, 24:8,

24:9, 24:10, 24:13, 24:14, 47:5, 47:13, 47:16, 47:19, 48:14,

**BY** [45] - 4:15, 5:20,

48:17

6:11, 7:17, 8:24, 11:1, 16:25, 21:18, 26:7, 28:6, 28:14, 28:18, 29:5, 30:10, 32:10, 34:7, 36:13, 38:19, 38:24, 40:2, 40:6, 42:11, 44:12, 44:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:8, 47:9, 48:7, 49:7, 49:20, 50:19, 51:3, 51:20, 52:6, 52:12, 54:5, 55:20, 56:15, 56:23, 57:6, 58:24, 61:25, 63:15, 64:18

#### C

CA [1] - 1:4 California [7] - 4:17, 9:7, 10:5, 10:9, 19:17, 47:11, 49:22 camera [1] - 37:9 cameramen [1] - 16:2 cannot [2] - 37:1, 75:25 captive [2] - 72:24, 73:5 captivity [3] - 30:25, 69:5, 69:12 car[4] - 40:25, 41:4, 41:7, 41:9 Cardin [4] - 35:19, 35:20, 36:17, 36:22 care [3] - 32:21, 32:22, 45:25 caretaker [1] - 32:12 Carol [2] - 33:14, 62:10 carpal [1] - 32:16 carried [1] - 11:25 cars [3] - 12:25, 40:15, 40:22 Carson [1] - 74:7 case [26] - 9:5, 9:16, 10:23, 19:12, 29:14, 29:16, 29:21, 29:23, 30:3, 32:23, 33:1, 33:2, 54:11, 62:12, 63:11, 73:13, 73:14, 73:18, 74:5, 74:12, 74:13, 74:15, 75:4, 76:2, 76:22, 78:21 cases [2] - 4:4, 72:17 cats [1] - 32:21 caused [3] - 43:13, 43:16, 44:14 CD [3] - 76:15, 76:16 cease [1] - 61:21

Center [2] - 10:4, 66:9 certain [3] - 54:9, 69:19, 77:14 certainly [3] - 23:3, 24:2, 37:20 CERTIFICATE [1] -81:1 certify [1] - 81:3 chained [4] - 8:12, 13:21, 15:13, 67:3 Chains [1] - 31:14 chains [3] - 13:22, 13:25, 31:14 challenge [1] - 74:3 chambers [1] - 78:4 changed [1] - 62:2 channel [1] - 78:16 charge [1] - 19:5 chief [3] - 57:4, 59:19, 60:21 choose [1] - 55:3 Christine [12] - 12:6, 19:2, 19:3, 19:10, 19:19, 21:1, 21:2, 21:25, 22:16, 23:11, 34:20, 38:6 circumstances [2] -11:7, 25:17 circus [9] - 5:6, 11:2, 20:4, 59:17, 59:18, 60:21, 64:4, 64:11, 74:3 Circus [2] - 9:24, 71:17 circuses [7] - 51:5, 51:10, 57:5, 66:22, 69:5, 69:12, 70:19 Circuses [2] - 55:4, 55:25 citation [12] - 21:9, 21:15, 21:25, 22:17, 24:18, 24:19, 25:7, 26:3, 26:4, 27:18, 29:12, 71:19 citations [1] - 69:14 cited [2] - 21:8, 61:20 Citizens [1] - 66:11 City [2] - 60:17, 61:21 city [1] - 62:4 Civil [1] - 3:2 claimed [1] - 58:3 Clara [11] - 11:8, 34:25, 37:19, 42:6, 44:9, 45:16, 51:4,

51:9, 51:22, 53:4,

28:12, 33:16, 34:3,

44:5, 47:12, 48:3,

48:4, 69:19, 70:9,

clear [14] - 25:14,

61:14

70:11, 70:13, 72:12, 77:18 clearly [2] - 30:12, 69:22 clerk [1] - 76:15 clip [4] - 6:12, 8:2, 36:10, 36:14 clips [1] - 8:18 close [1] - 14:16 code [2] - 9:9, 19:17 Code [2] - 4:17, 9:8 coincidentally [1] -71:8 collection [1] - 40:19 Colleen [1] - 63:17 color[2] - 27:22, 33:25 COLUMBIA [1] - 1:1 combination [1] -48:17 coming [4] - 39:7, 40:15, 41:1, 72:17 Committee [1] - 66:11 Compaq [1] - 10:4 comparable [1] -11:23 compare [1] - 20:20 compound [3] - 58:4, 62:14, 63:2 computer [1] - 2:7 computer-aided [1] -2:7 concerned [4] - 10:21, 69:17, 71:3, 72:11 concerning [1] - 9:1 conclude [2] - 44:16, 49:4 concluded [1] - 25:24 conclusion [1] - 43:20 condition [1] - 71:11 conditions [2] - 71:13, 71:16 conduct[1] - 34:23 conducted [1] - 19:6 conference [7] -54:23, 55:1, 55:7, 55:23, 56:9, 65:3, 65:4 confiscated [3] - 71:5, 71:9, 71:14 conflicting [1] - 70:2 Connecticut [1] - 1:16 connection [5] -23:19, 24:3, 24:10, 24:17, 72:4 consent [3] - 71:5, 74:14, 74:21 consider [5] - 24:16, 43:9, 43:12, 43:15, 43:18

considered [5] -44:22, 44:25, 45:4, 59:4, 59:5 Constitution [1] - 2:3 constraints [1] - 31:3 contact [6] - 43:16, 44:17, 44:22, 58:12, 59:3, 59:6 contacted [1] - 39:16 contained [1] - 33:19 container [1] - 41:2 contains [2] - 33:21, 46:15 continue [1] - 27:16 **continuing** [1] - 4:15 contributions [1] -63:1 control [1] - 62:5 convicted [1] - 29:18 copy [7] - 21:14, 25:7, 33:24, 38:3, 38:7, 74:22, 76:14 corporation [1] - 71:2 Corporation [2] -71:2, 74:1 Correct [12] - 10:2, 37:6, 39:13, 57:17, 58:6, 58:8, 58:11, 58:14, 60:19, 61:1, 64:3, 65:8 correct [48] - 6:20, 7:22, 11:3, 11:4, 19:8, 19:9, 29:7, 30:15, 30:16, 34:11, 34:15, 35:1, 36:1, 37:5, 39:12, 40:16, 41:13, 41:14, 41:16, 41:17, 42:25, 43:8, 43:24, 45:22, 49:23, 54:24, 57:8, 57:16, 57:19, 58:5, 58:10, 59:13, 60:9, 60:18, 61:6, 63:6, 63:9, 64:7, 64:9, 64:22, 65:7, 65:20, 65:21, 66:22, 74:11, 74:17, 74:18, 81:3 counsel [20] - 3:5, 4:11, 33:5, 33:10, 33:18, 36:15, 37:24, 38:1, 38:5, 48:20, 67:19, 68:18, 68:25, 70:18, 75:7, 76:14, 77:7, 77:8, 77:9, 77:23 couple [2] - 15:21, 31:18

course [5] - 22:20,

75:8

47:4, 55:24, 74:5,

COURT [160] - 1:1, 3:9, 3:24, 4:9, 5:8, 5:12, 5:17, 5:24, 6:10, 6:17, 6:22, 6:25, 7:4, 7:8, 7:11, 7:14, 8:20, 10:12, 10:24, 16:19, 16:23, 21:13, 21:16, 22:1, 22:5, 22:10, 22:15, 22:19, 23:2, 23:6, 23:8, 23:13, 23:15, 23:18, 23:22, 24:1, 24:9, 24:16, 25:5, 25:20, 26:3, 26:17, 26:20, 26:23, 27:3, 27:6, 27:14, 27:25, 28:2, 28:5, 28:9, 28:11, 28:16, 28:24, 29:2, 29:4, 30:3, 30:6, 30:24, 31:3, 31:11, 31:14, 31:16, 31:20, 31:23, 32:1, 32:4, 32:25, 33:12, 34:5, 38:17, 40:4, 44:11, 44:19, 45:1, 46:14, 46:17, 46:20, 47:6, 47:12, 47:22, 48:1, 48:9, 48:16, 48:23, 49:2, 49:10, 50:4, 50:6, 50:8, 50:10, 50:12, 51:1, 51:7, 51:11, 51:18, 52:1, 52:11, 53:23, 55:10, 55:15, 55:18, 56:1, 56:5, 56:8, 56:11, 56:14, 56:21, 57:1, 58:22, 61:24, 63:13, 64:15, 67:6. 67:9, 67:12, 67:14, 67:18, 68:3, 68:5, 68:10, 68:14, 68:25, 70:9, 70:13, 70:15, 70:18, 72:5, 72:9, 72:18, 72:25, 73:11, 73:17, 73:21, 74:9, 74:12, 74:16, 74:19, 74:21, 75:1, 75:3, 75:6, 75:9, 75:15, 75:24, 76:1, 76:7, 76:19, 76:21, 77:3, 77:5, 77:7, 77:20, 78:1, 78:4, 78:12, 78:15, 78:16, 78:19, 78:23 Court [9] - 2:2, 2:2, 25:6, 68:19, 68:23, 70:5, 72:16, 79:2,

court's [1] - 77:18 Courthouse [1] - 2:3 courtroom [2] - 33:22, 34:18 COURTROOM [7] -3:2, 68:19, 68:22, 77:4, 77:6, 77:24, 79:2 cover[1] - 68:13 cracked [2] - 7:3, 7:18 creatures [1] - 67:1 criminal [3] - 10:8. 29:16, 57:7 Cross [1] - 80:5 cross [7] - 22:19, 23:1, 23:22, 23:24, 25:9, 33:4, 77:13 CROSS [1] - 34:6 Cross-examination [1] - 80:5 cross-examination [6] - 22:19, 23:22, 23:24, 25:9, 33:4, 77:13 CROSS-**EXAMINATION** [1] -34:6 cross-examine [1] -23:1 **CRUELTY** [1] - 1:3 cruelty [2] - 32:22, 32:23 Cruelty [1] - 3:3 crystal [2] - 70:9, 70:13 Crystal [1] - 1:16 cubes [4] - 15:25, 16:3, 16:4, 16:9 Cunio [1] - 71:20 custodian [2] - 47:20, 48:14 cut [1] - 72:2 D

D.A [1] - 9:12 D.C [6] - 1:6, 1:17, 1:22, 2:4, 54:24, 55:8 dancer [1] - 43:6 DAY [1] - 1:11 deal [2] - 73:21, 73:23 dealing [1] - 32:8 dealt [1] - 5:18 December [1] - 57:8 decided [3] - 50:23, 50:24, 74:4 decision [6] - 30:6, 70:25, 71:6, 74:2,

74:4, 74:6 declarant [1] - 25:5 declaration [14] -22:16, 22:23, 22:25, 23:8, 23:15, 23:20, 24:7, 24:13, 24:14, 24:22, 25:3, 25:4, 47:20, 48:15 declined [2] - 42:24, 50:21 decree [2] - 74:14, 74:21 Defendant [2] - 1:8, 1:19 defendant [8] - 3:16, 3:17, 3:18, 3:19, 3:21, 3:22, 27:24, 70:19 Defendant's [1] - 46:5 defendants [1] - 27:9 Defense [1] - 54:13 defense [1] - 57:20 defined [1] - 69:13 DeHaven [1] - 46:10 Delcianna [1] - 3:12 **DELCIANNA** [1] - 1:15 department [1] - 65:5 **Department** [7] - 32:5, 45:15, 46:18, 47:1, 71:3, 73:3, 73:4 depict[2] - 6:9, 26:16 depicted [3] - 6:7, 6:8, 26:11 depiction [2] - 7:24, 8:6 deposition [1] - 68:12 **DEPUTY** [7] - 3:2, 68:19, 68:22, 77:4, 77:6, 77:24, 79:2 Derrick [1] - 3:23 describe [6] - 8:9, 13:22, 15:1, 18:11, 18:24, 20:15 described [2] - 9:14, 15:24 design [3] - 41:4, 41:7, 41:10 designation [1] -28:17 despite [1] - 59:3 destination [1] - 60:2 detail [1] - 20:15 determination [1] -24:24 determine [3] - 25:22, 27:15, 43:3 determined [3] -19:20, 19:22, 72:1 Diego [1] - 53:3

different [2] - 11:24,

81:2

78:13

court [2] - 49:13,

Court's [1] - 77:2

12:12 difficulty [1] - 11:22 diminish [1] - 76:14 Direct [1] - 80:5 direct [17] - 3:25, 34:10, 38:11, 39:5, 39:11, 40:11, 40:14, 41:15, 41:24, 42:4, 43:2, 43:7, 45:14. 45:24, 49:8, 62:9, 68:6 DIRECT [1] - 4:14 director[1] - 57:4 directors [2] - 63:16, 63:21 disagree [4] - 46:20, 48:20, 48:23, 70:15 disapproved [1] -51:10 disapproves [1] - 51:5 discern [1] - 6:18 discussed [1] - 77:12 discussing [1] - 73:24 display [2] - 15:16, 15:19 **DISTRICT** [3] - 1:1, 1:1, 1:12 district [5] - 9:5, 42:6, 42:13, 42:20, 42:24 divided [1] - 31:5 document [11] -21:22, 22:7, 24:2, 25:23, 46:11, 46:23, 49:12, 50:17, 55:13, 55:17, 56:6 documentation [1] -51:16 documents [1] - 77:17 dogs [1] - 32:21 dollars [2] - 63:8, 66:20 dominated [1] - 67:3 donated [2] - 54:8, 66:13 donating [1] - 66:15 donation [3] - 65:7, 65:11, 65:14 donations [4] - 53:17, 54:2, 54:19, 54:20 done [8] - 12:24, 38:25, 45:7, 45:9, 72:16, 72:19, 73:7, 78:6 donor[2] - 63:5, 63:7 doubt [2] - 29:25, 30:8 doubtful [1] - 23:8 down [6] - 15:3, 18:1, 27:4, 60:4, 77:9, 77:23 Dozens [2] - 29:3,

29:4 drain [1] - 40:22 draining [1] - 40:24 drawing [1] - 45:4 drawn [1] - 45:8 drew[1] - 18:13 drilled [1] - 40:21 Drivers [1] - 66:8 Drunk [1] - 66:8 During [4] - 54:6, 56:16, 62:1, 62:23 during [19] - 4:25, 7:6, 7:19, 8:11, 8:16, 9:2, 13:8, 14:7, 15:15, 15:18, 16:5, 35:13, 41:20, 41:25, 43:16, 57:10, 62:3, 62:22, duty [2] - 13:8, 41:15

### E

e-mail [1] - 75:8 ear[1] - 36:3 early [1] - 51:25 eastern [1] - 71:23 easy [1] - 76:25 eat [1] - 75:19 ECF [1] - 75:23 editing [1] - 37:15 educate [1] - 70:5 effect [1] - 4:22 eight [3] - 14:12, 46:6, 46:7 either [7] - 32:4, 32:6, 48:1, 71:5, 71:19, 73:4, 73:12 Either [1] - 71:19 elapsed [1] - 20:7 elbow [1] - 11:23 electric [2] - 14:5, 15.2 electronically [1] -22:23 elephant [42] - 4:20, 4:23, 7:4, 7:10, 7:18, 10:21, 10:22, 11:17, 11:19, 17:14, 24:22, 27:2, 30:20, 32:12, 32:19, 36:1, 40:15, 43:4, 43:16, 45:5, 56:16, 57:15, 58:13, 58:15, 58:18, 59:1, 59:4, 59:6, 59:7, 60:23, 63:1, 63:10, 67:1, 67:4, 71:7, 71:22, 71:24, 72:3, 73:14 Elephant [6] - 63:3,

74:5, 74:8 elephant's [3] - 7:2, 43:13, 43:15 elephants [94] - 5:1, 5:14, 5:18, 7:21, 8:11, 8:15, 11:11, 11:14, 11:15, 12:13, 12:15, 12:17, 12:22, 12:25, 13:1, 13:13, 13:25, 14:5, 14:15, 15:3, 15:4, 15:12, 15:16, 15:19, 15:25, 16:3, 16:4, 16:9, 16:12, 16:15, 16:16, 17:3, 17:5, 17:23, 17:24, 18:2, 19:21, 19:22, 19:25, 20:5, 30:22, 31:16, 31:20, 34:11, 34:13, 35:3, 35:6, 35:12, 35:16, 35:20, 36:6, 36:14, 36:16, 36:17, 36:20, 36:23, 36:24, 37:2, 38:10, 44:3, 44:17, 44:18, 44:22, 45:8, 45:25, 51:5, 51:10, 57:24, 59:9, 59:21, 59:25, 60:2, 60:4, 60:7, 64:11, 64:20, 65:1, 65:17, 66:21, 69:5, 69:12, 70:21, 71:4, 71:5, 71:12, 73:21, 73:24, 74:4, 74:7, 76:10 Elephants [1] - 63:17 elephants' [1] - 35:25 elevator [1] - 73:12 eleven [1] - 46:6 Elly [1] - 63:19 Elmo [1] - 33:14 EMMET [1] - 1:11 employed [3] - 5:12, 6:1, 61:13 employees [1] - 11:20 enclosures [3] -13:18, 13:19, 15:2 end [7] - 18:16, 18:17, 20:3, 64:24, 65:1, 72:16, 78:10 endangered [2] -72:24, 73:5 enforcement [8] -8:25, 9:12, 9:15, 9:21, 71:21, 72:23, 73:9, 73:25 engaging [1] - 8:16 entered [2] - 75:23, 76:11

64:1, 65:6, 65:14,

- 1:7

3:4

Entertainment [1] -

entire [3] - 5:4, 10:10, 12:9 entitled [3] - 22:6, 30:4, 81:4 entity [4] - 6:1, 9:15, 71:4, 74:1 ESQ[8] - 1:14, 1:15, 1:15, 1:19, 1:19, 1:20, 1:20, 1:21 essentially [1] - 10:10 established [1] - 6:5 et[1] - 3:3 etcetera [1] - 71:11 European [1] - 71:23 event [1] - 10:16 events [4] - 6:6, 6:8, 15:21, 26:11 evidence [9] - 8:23, 10:7, 10:9, 16:20, 22:13, 28:3, 38:23, 75:23, 76:12 evidentiary [1] - 49:6 exact [2] - 53:20, 65:23 exactly [4] - 12:14, 25:18, 31:18, 55:5 Examination [2] -80:5, 80:6 examination [15] -3:25, 4:6, 22:19, 23:22, 23:24, 25:9, 25:20, 25:21, 27:16, 33:4, 34:10, 45:14, 62:9, 77:13, 80:5 **EXAMINATION** [3] -4:14, 34:6, 64:17 examine [1] - 23:1 example [1] - 8:14 exception [6] - 22:9, 22:18, 24:4, 36:6, 49:16, 68:15 executive [1] - 57:3 exercise [1] - 67:2 exhibit [2] - 25:3, 25:7 Exhibit [17] - 5:21. 8:22, 21:11, 21:19, 24:13, 24:15, 27:23, 28:3, 33:19, 33:20, 34:1, 34:18, 36:10, 42:5, 46:5, 76:11, 80:11 exhibited [2] - 33:22, 34:2 exhibitor [1] - 71:10 exhibits [5] - 3:23, 27:10, 75:23, 77:10, 77:14

expert [4] - 41:6, 62:12, 63:11, 78:2 experts [2] - 67:16, 68:3 explained [1] - 9:10 explains [1] - 22:17 extra [1] - 65:16 extremely [1] - 10:23

#### F

face [1] - 29:18 fact [10] - 38:23, 45:24, 50:12, 51:21, 58:9, 58:15, 58:21, 61:5, 63:4, 72:2 fair [1] - 77:20 fairly [1] - 78:17 familiarized [1] - 40:9 far [6] - 19:19, 44:9, 64:24, 65:1, 66:3, 72:22 Farm [2] - 53:17, 54:9 fast [1] - 18:23 featured [1] - 36:14 February [1] - 1:6 federal [12] - 5:9, 5:13, 5:18, 24:7, 31:23, 32:7, 47:14, 69:3, 69:11, 69:17, 69:20, 72:18 Feld [1] - 3:4 FELD[1] - 1:7 female [1] - 27:2 fence [1] - 15:2 fenced [1] - 14:5 fencing [1] - 31:5 few [1] - 41:22 fifteen [2] - 20:9, 53:21 fifty [1] - 66:20 figured [1] - 76:1 file [2] - 22:10, 75:23 filed [6] - 27:22, 69:23, 71:18, 76:15, 77:17, 77:18 film [2] - 76:23 filmed [2] - 6:2, 37:21 filming [2] - 37:9, 37:11 final [3] - 20:2, 20:4, 61:9 findings [2] - 9:1, 22:11 fine [5] - 6:23, 30:5, 68:14, 72:5, 72:9 fire [1] - 61:18 Firm [1] - 66:9 First [2] - 10:15, 68:7

**ENTERTAINMENT** [1]

indicates [1] - 25:17

indicating) [1] - 27:5

first [6] - 6:12, 15:23, 36:4, 49:8, 49:21, 76:6 Fish [2] - 32:4, 72:23 five [6] - 23:12, 25:3, 26:18, 28:22, 32:20, 63:8 flexing [1] - 11:22 floors [1] - 40:21 folks [4] - 32:2, 75:9, 75:18, 78:1 **follow** [1] - 27:19 following [1] - 13:5 foot[1] - 7:2 footage [5] - 37:5, 37:15, 37:17, 76:23 FOR [3] - 1:1, 1:3, 4:13 force [2] - 5:13, 54:7 foregoing [1] - 81:3 formal [1] - 51:16 forward [2] - 18:22, 33:10 forwarded [4] - 42:5, 42:12, 42:19, 45:15 foundation [2] - 23:9, 48:16 Foundational [1] -27:7 founder [1] - 63:5 four [2] - 27:19, 28:20 frame [2] - 14:8, 61:14 Franco [8] - 19:2, 19:3, 19:10, 21:2, 21:25, 22:17, 23:11, 34:20 Free [1] - 31:3 free [4] - 23:3, 31:1, 31:9, 41:18 freely [2] - 30:23, 30:24 fresh [2] - 20:19, 71:1 Friday [1] - 1:6 Friedman [2] - 73:13, 73:17 friend [1] - 65:13 front [7] - 11:15, 11:16, 11:24, 13:23, 18:20, 19:21, 20:14 frozen [1] - 15:25 fruit [3] - 15:25, 16:3, 16:9 fruits [1] - 16:4 Fulbright [1] - 1:21 full [4] - 16:3, 68:15, 68:16, 71:23 Funny [1] - 70:17

# G

gear [1] - 43:7 geared [1] - 38:20 gearing [1] - 38:15 Gebel [18] - 16:16, 17:1, 17:4, 17:6, 17:7, 20:7, 20:21, 21:5, 21:25, 29:11, 29:18, 29:25, 41:25, 56:16, 57:8, 57:18, 61:20 Gebel's [1] - 62:19 Gebel-Williams [2] -17:7, 41:25 general [1] - 41:10 gift[1] - 65:13 given [6] - 37:18, 37:23, 38:7, 54:2, 70:1, 73:6 Glaze [1] - 63:24 Glitzenstein [1] - 1:16 Goodwill [1] - 66:10 governed [1] - 5:14 government[8] -31:23, 32:1, 32:7, 33:9, 47:14, 69:20, 71:6, 72:19 government's [1] -69:17 great [1] - 75:10 ground [1] - 73:5 grounds [4] - 46:12, 48:13, 48:21, 48:24 group [1] - 74:19 groups [1] - 65:18 Guantanamo [1] - 4:4 guess [5] - 11:23, 44:15, 72:12, 75:20, 76:17 guide [4] - 52:18, 58:18, 58:21, 58:25 guidelines [1] - 45:25 guilty [3] - 29:24, 30:8, 57:18 Gunther [2] - 17:7, 41:24

# Н

hand [2] - 17:25, 18:14 handled [1] - 73:2 handler [4] - 58:16, 59:12, 59:20, 71:22 handlers [3] - 5:1, 57:22, 57:23 handling [5] - 16:12,

43:16 headliners [2] - 17:8, 17:9 hear [1] - 6:17 heard [8] - 6:18, 18:5, 18:13, 30:4, 55:10, 70:2, 73:18, 74:22 Hearsay [2] - 24:4, 49:17 hearsay [15] - 6:16, 21:12, 24:16, 24:23, 25:1, 25:10, 25:25, 46:12, 48:13, 48:21, 48:24, 50:13, 51:1, 51:19, 52:10 held [6] - 14:17, 61:2, 71:8, 71:9, 71:13, 74:1 help [3] - 32:22, 76:21, 78:2 helped [1] - 76:24 hi[1] - 41:22 hind [1] - 13:24 Hohenwald [3] -30:14, 32:20, 62:14 holder [3] - 71:6, 72:24, 73:5 holding [1] - 71:4 holes [1] - 40:21 home [1] - 67:10 Honor [64] - 3:8, 3:11, 3:15, 3:20, 5:22, 5:23, 6:5, 6:23, 7:15, 8:19, 10:7, 10:23, 16:17, 16:21, 21:17, 22:8, 22:14, 22:22, 22:24, 23:20, 23:25, 24:6, 24:12, 25:4, 25:13, 26:6, 26:19, 27:7, 27:8, 27:12, 27:21, 28:13, 32:24, 33:16, 38:22, 40:1, 44:10, 44:23, 46:13, 47:3, 47:15, 47:18, 47:23, 47:25, 48:6, 48:12, 49:1, 50:9, 50:11, 55:9, 55:14, 56:19, 61:23, 67:5, 67:8, 68:2, 70:7, 72:23, 73:16, 75:5, 75:21, 77:24, 78:3, 78:18 HONORABLE [1] -

17:12, 19:20, 35:19,

happy [2] - 72:3, 77:1

Hawthorn [1] - 71:2

71:21, 73:24, 74:1

head [3] - 43:6, 43:13,

Hawthorne [3] -

57:24

1:11 Honorable [1] - 68:22 hooked [1] - 71:24 hooks [1] - 31:11 Hope [1] - 66:10 hoped [1] - 39:20 hostility [1] - 59:16 hot[1] - 71:13 hour [3] - 14:18, 15:9, 67:23 hours [2] - 68:9, 68:10 house [8] - 14:4, 14:13, 14:21, 14:24, 15:1, 15:8, 15:12, 65:10 housed [1] - 14:15 houses [1] - 14:7 human [1] - 31:8 Humane [18] - 11:8, 13:11, 34:25, 37:18, 37:19, 37:23, 44:8, 45:16, 51:4, 51:9, 51:22, 52:8, 53:4, 53:17, 56:17, 61:13, 61:21, 62:2 humane [2] - 19:4, 32:20 humans [1] - 31:9 hundred [1] - 31:8 husband [1] - 32:22

#### ١

ice [3] - 16:2, 16:4, 16:9 Identification [1] -80:12 identify [7] - 3:5, 35:6, 35:9, 35:20, 35:22, 36:7, 37:1 immediately [2] -59:7, 59:13 impeachment [1] -55:13 impressions [1] -46:15 improper [1] - 49:25 INC [1] - 1:7 Inc [1] - 3:4 incarceration [1] -29:19 incident [4] - 10:8, 57:12, 58:3, 58:7 including [1] - 44:17 indeed [4] - 36:17, 37:1, 55:24, 70:20 indicate [1] - 35:25 indicated [2] - 24:19, 24:23

indicia [3] - 49:12, 49:15, 50:16 individual [1] - 74:20 individuals [1] - 18:9 information [4] -25:16, 39:5, 45:15, 70:22 initials [1] - 50:5 injuries [3] - 9:14, 19:22, 65:2 injury [9] - 4:22, 26:13, 26:22, 26:23, 26:24, 28:8, 28:19, 28:21, 36:2 insect [1] - 43:10 inspect [3] - 31:24, 60:11, 60:23 inspecting [3] - 57:5, 61:21, 62:5 inspection [25] - 6:3, 7:6, 7:19, 8:11, 19:5, 34:11, 34:23, 35:13, 38:10, 38:12, 38:16, 38:20, 38:21, 40:8, 42:15, 45:13, 45:21, 46:3, 52:9, 53:5, 59:13, 60:3, 62:2, 64:21, 64:25 inspections [2] -51:16, 76:10 Institute [1] - 54:10 instructed [1] - 60:21 interaction [1] - 67:2 Interest [1] - 66:10 interested [3] - 69:2, 69:6, 74:21 Interior [1] - 73:4 internal [1] - 46:25 Internet [1] - 49:15 interpreted [1] - 47:16 interrupt [1] - 59:18 interruption (1) - 4:5 intervening [1] - 38:3 investigate [1] - 44:13 investigated [2] -43:6, 44:15 investigation [2] -70:24, 71:1 investigations [1] -72:20 investigator [2] - 19:4, 32:22 investigators [1] -71:24 involve [1] - 4:19 involved [4] - 15:16, 20:1, 49:25, 67:22 involvement[1] - 11:7 involving [2] - 57:12, 71:1 irrelevant [1] - 33:23 issue [7] - 22:25, 50:23, 59:23, 74:9, 74:14, 77:2, 77:11 issued [3] - 22:17, 25:8, 74:10 issues [1] - 74:12 itself [1] - 58:3

#### J

JACQUELINE [3] -

2:2, 81:2, 81:5 Jane [1] - 71:24 Jaworski [1] - 1:21 Jenny [2] - 35:21, 71:24 Jewell [6] - 10:21, 11:18, 11:21, 12:4, 12:7, 12:11 job [1] - 65:17 Joe [4] - 76:4, 76:7, 76:8, 76:21 John [1] - 3:15 JOHN [1] - 1:19 Joiner[1] - 3:20 JOINER [2] - 1:19, 3:20 joint [1] - 11:23 Jose [22] - 5:1, 7:7, 8:7, 8:12, 10:4, 11:3, 12:6, 13:5, 13:6, 13:9, 13:14, 39:7, 47:11, 49:22, 52:13, 52:17, 60:17, 61:22, 62:1, 62:4, 65:10 Judge [2] - 73:13, 73:17 JUDGE [1] - 1:12 judge [1] - 8:10 judgement [1] - 27:17 judgment [2] - 23:6, 71:18 Judy [1] - 35:21 Julie [1] - 3:22 July [3] - 46:9, 54:24, 65:4 jurisdiction [1] - 62:8 jurors [1] - 30:6 jury [7] - 10:8, 29:15, 29:24, 30:7, 57:7, 57:14, 57:18

# K

KARA [1] - 1:20

Kara [1] - 3:18 **KATHERINE** [1] - 1:14 Katherine [1] - 3:7 keep [5] - 48:2, 60:14, 75:16, 75:18, 76:12 keeping [1] - 78:9 kept [2] - 13:17, 37:19 kind [8] - 8:14, 11:25, 29:14, 39:6, 40:18, 58:18, 60:5, 75:6 kinds [1] - 49:14 King [1] - 71:17 Kinzley [1] - 63:17 Kirshner [1] - 39:9 knowing [1] - 37:1 knowledge [6] - 35:3, 41:3, 41:9, 50:20, 52:7, 61:10 known [1] - 5:6 knows [2] - 10:22, 42:10 Kohn [3] - 46:9, 50:7, 50:10 Krishner [1] - 39:10

### L

label [1] - 27:23 lacerations [1] - 36:4 lack [2] - 25:17, 33:23 LANCE [1] - 1:21 Lance [1] - 3:19 lane [1] - 18:4 LANETTE [2] - 4:13, 80:4 large [2] - 15:4, 65:11 Larry [1] - 35:19 last [7] - 14:19, 15:8, 23:16, 36:24, 53:20, 71:10, 71:19 lasted [1] - 15:10 law [3] - 9:15, 19:14, 19:16 Law [1] - 66:9 laws [2] - 39:3, 40:9 lawsuit [1] - 23:19 lawyers [1] - 33:8 lay [2] - 23:9, 48:16 learned [3] - 11:18, 51:1, 73:11 least [2] - 69:25, 75:10 leave [6] - 32:15, 33:2, 33:5, 33:6, 33:9 left [4] - 5:22, 17:25, 20:14, 33:7 left-hand [1] - 17:25 leg [11] - 11:15, 11:16, 11:22, 11:24, 11:25, 12:9, 13:23, 13:24,

licenses [1] - 72:20 life (5) - 54:1, 59:18, 60:22, 60:23, 66:25 life-threatening [3] -59:18, 60:22, 60:23 likelihood [1] - 25:11 line [4] - 10:6, 10:20, 16:17, 59:9 lined [1] - 68:11 LISA [1] - 1:19 Lisa [2] - 3:20, 78:15 list [3] - 54:4, 77:16, 77:18 litigation [2] - 24:3, 24:10 live [2] - 30:14, 30:23 Live [1] - 25:14 lived [1] - 62:14 LLP[1] - 1:21 loaded [1] - 13:1 loading [2] - 12:22, 60:5 local [3] - 5:8, 32:1, 71:15 location [2] - 20:20, 20:22 log [3] - 15:5, 78:13, 78:14 look [5] - 19:22, 20:18, 21:19, 28:7, 59:7 looked [3] - 18:6, 41:1, 73:9 looking [2] - 27:21, 56:6 Looking [1] - 27:21 lost [2] - 31:17, 70:20 lunch [2] - 73:12, 75:19

18:20, 20:14, 38:25

legal [2] - 21:4, 75:17

length [1] - 6:13

less [1] - 66:18

letter[1] - 50:24

56:17, 56:20

library [2] - 47:2

71:17

license [2] - 70:20,

liasoning [3] - 52:9,

# M

machine [1] - 2:7 mail [1] - 75:8 main [1] - 71:19 maintained [3] -13:14, 13:20, 47:14 manager [1] - 39:16 manner [2] - 69:7, 71:3

March [1] - 30:18 Marcia [1] - 37:8 Mark [10] - 16:16. 17:1, 17:4, 17:6, 17:7, 18:5, 21:25, 56:16, 61:20, 62:19 Marked [1] - 80:12 marked [2] - 33:21, 77:15 marks [7] - 43:3, 43:9. 43:18, 44:6, 44:14, 44:16, 45:5 materials [5] - 33:2, 33:5, 33:9, 77:14, 77:17 matter [15] - 4:1, 4:2, 22:2, 26:4, 27:14, 52:7, 59:19, 60:22, 60:23, 67:21, 68:15, 71:21, 72:15, 75:16, 81:4 Mayeda [2] - 37:8, 37:11 mean [6] - 18:12, 27:1, 35:19, 56:22, 66:11, 70:1 means [1] - 56:20 mechanics [1] - 41:9 media [3] - 15:21, 15:23 Medicine [1] - 66:11 meet [2] - 48:25, 59:22 meets [1] - 11:25 member [9] - 54:21, 54:22, 65:19, 65:20, 65:22, 65:24, 65:25, 66:5, 66:8 membership [2] -53:13, 63:10 memo [3] - 46:25, 47:2 memorandum [1] -46:9 mentioned [6] - 4:16, 30:14, 32:25, 57:7, 65:18, 70:19 mere [1] - 72:2 Method [1] - 25:14 method [1] - 25:16 Mexico [1] - 71:14 MEYER [80] - 1:14, 3:7, 4:12, 4:15, 5:20, 6:5, 6:11, 6:23, 7:15, 7:17, 8:18, 8:24, 10:15, 10:19, 10:25, 11:1, 16:21, 16:24, 16:25, 21:14, 21:17, 21:18, 22:8, 22:12, 22:16, 22:22, 23:5, 23:7, 23:10, 23:14,

23:16, 23:20, 23:24, 24:6, 24:12, 25:2, 26:2, 26:6, 26:7, 26:18, 27:8, 27:13, 27:20, 28:1, 28:6, 28:10, 28:13, 28:14, 28:18, 29:5, 30:5, 30:10, 32:10, 32:24, 38:22, 40:1, 42:8, 44:10, 44:23, 46:11, 47:18, 47:23, 48:12, 51:6, 52:10, 55:9, 55:12, 55:16, 56:19, 61:23, 64:18, 67:5, 68:2, 68:4, 68:7, 68:12, 70:12, 70:14, 70:17, 73:15 Meyer [6] - 1:16, 3:7, 73:13, 77:12, 80:5, 80:6 MICHELLE [1] - 1:20 Michelle [2] - 3:13, 3:17 middle [1] - 72:8 might [1] - 78:22 mind [3] - 30:8, 66:12, 71:1 mini [2] - 10:10, 10:12 minute [9] - 23:13, 40:4, 48:9, 58:22, 67:19, 67:25, 68:19 minutes [6] - 14:20, 15:10, 20:9, 41:22, 67:25, 68:17 misdemeanor[1] -21:8 mobile [1] - 71:13 moment [1] - 33:15 Monday [6] - 67:21, 68:1, 68:13, 75:19, 79:1, 79:2 monetary [2] - 54:19, 63:1 money [10] - 54:8, 65:11, 65:16, 66:13, 66:15, 66:16, 66:17, 66:18, 66:19 Montgomery [1] - 18:1 months [1] - 32:14 morning [1] - 13:5 most [1] - 53:25 mostly [1] - 66:18 Mothers [1] - 66:8 mount [1] - 12:13 move [3] - 8:18, 30:17, 30:19 Move [2] - 51:2, 56:14 moved [2] - 30:18, 30:20

movement [2] - 18:15,

59:5 MR [12] - 3:15, 3:19, 3:23, 70:7, 70:11, 70:24, 72:7, 72:14, 72:22, 73:2, 75:4, 77:11 MS [174] - 3:7, 3:10, 3:12, 3:13, 3:17, 3:18, 3:20, 3:22, 4:12, 4:15, 5:20, 5:23, 5:25, 6:5, 6:11, 6:16, 6:20, 6:23, 7:15, 7:17, 8:18, 8:24, 10:6, 10:15, 10:18, 10:19, 10:25, 11:1, 16:17, 16:21, 16:24, 16:25, 21:12, 21:14, 21:17, 21:18, 22:8, 22:12, 22:16, 22:22, 22:24, 23:5, 23:7, 23:10, 23:14, 23:16, 23:20, 23:24, 24:6, 24:12, 25:2, 25:13, 26:2, 26:6, 26:7, 26:18, 27:7, -27:8, 27:11, 27:13, 27:20, 28:1, 28:6, 28:10, 28:13, 28:14, 28:18, 29:5, 30:5, 30:10, 32:10, 32:24, 33:14, 34:7, 36:9, 36:13, 38:19, 38:22, 38:24, 40:1, 40:2, 40:6, 42:8, 42:10, 42:11, 44:10, 44:12, 44:21, 44:23, 44:24, 45:3, 46:5, 46:8, 46:11, 46:13, 46:15, 46:18, 47:3, 47:9, 47:15, 47:18, 47:23, 47:24, 48:6, 48:7, 48:12, 48:22, 48:25, 49:7, 49:20, 50:5, 50:7, 50:9, 50:11, 50:19, 51:3, 51:6, 51:9, 51:15, 51:20, 52:6, 52:10, 52:12, 54:5, 55:9, 55:12, 55:13, 55:16, 55:20, 56:3, 56:15, 56:19, 56:23, 57:6, 58:23, 58:24, 61:23, 61:25, 63:15, 64:14, 64:18, 67:5, 67:8, 68:2, 68:4, 68:7, 68:12, 70:12, 70:14, 70:17, 73:15, 73:16, 73:20, 73:23, 74:11, 74:14, 74:18, 74:20, 74:25, 75:2, 75:8, 75:14, 75:21, 75:25, 76:4,

76:5, 76:6, 76:8, 76:20, 77:1, 78:3, 78:7, 78:18, 78:22 multiple [1] - 28:25 must [2] - 31:4, 72:20

#### Ν

N.W[2] - 1:16, 1:22 nail [2] - 7:3, 7:19 naive [1] - 27:3 name [10] - 7:12, 11:19, 17:14, 17:16, 17:18, 35:8, 36:20, 63:13, 71:10, 71:23 named [5] - 10:21, 54:16, 66:6, 71:8, 71:24 names [1] - 35:18 narrating [1] - 6:20 near[1] - 37:9 necessarily [1] - 69:1 Ned [1] - 71:8 need [21] - 6:23, 27:17, 28:12, 33:7, 67:1, 67:2, 67:19, 67:24, 68:18, 69:9, 69:22, 70:6, 70:25, 72:10, 75:11, 76:7, 77:2, 78:25 needed [1] - 61:2 needs [1] - 32:23 needy [1] - 30:22 neglected [2] - 30:23, 32:21 never [10] - 44:5, 50:25, 51:13, 58:9, 61:13, 64:4, 64:6, 64:9, 64:10, 72:23 New [3] - 55:3, 55:24, 71:14 next [13] - 8:2, 9:23, 11:2, 12:16, 13:4, 18:21, 19:18, 20:5, 28:5, 28:7, 28:15, 28:17, 59:25 Next [1] - 51:19 nice [1] - 78:25 night [1] - 13:3 nine [2] - 13:3, 34:15 no-violation [1] -50:23 nomenclature [1] -49:14 nonprofit [1] - 66:5 noon [2] - 69:24, 75:15

normal [1] - 47:4

noted [1] - 28:11

nothing [1] - 35:24 noticed [1] - 71:15 number [2] - 28:9, 39:6 numbered [1] - 33:21 numerous [1] - 26:25 NW [1] - 2:3

### 0

o'clock [4] - 13:3, 13:7, 67:22, 68:15 Oakland [6] - 12:20, 12:21, 13:2, 39:4, 40:10, 41:13 oath [5] - 4:9, 4:10, 25:6, 57:10 object [6] - 6:16, 10:6, 27:10, 27:11, 38:22, 46:11 objected [13] - 16:18, 33:20, 33:23, 34:2, 47:22, 48:1, 48:3, 48:4, 48:10, 48:12, 48:19, 48:20, 48:24 objecting [4] - 6:19, 22:24, 25:19, 55:11 Objection [12] - 5:23, 16:17, 21:12, 28:2, 40:1, 42:8, 44:10, 51:6, 52:10, 55:9, 56:19, 61:23 objection [8] - 5:24, 6:10, 8:20, 27:7, 27:8, 27:24, 48:5, 55:19 objections [6] - 27:19, 27:21, 27:22, 33:25, 34:1, 47:24 observations [2] -11:13, 30:4 observe [9] - 9:24, 11:21, 12:4, 12:7, 12:8, 13:16, 13:25, 20:10, 20:13 observed [6] - 6:6, 8:5, 8:15, 9:15, 16:5, 20:14 Observing [1] - 37:14 observing [2] - 4:25, 12:22 obstructing [2] -58:15, 58:18 obviously [1] - 69:16 occasions [1] - 15:15 occur[1] - 38:16 occurred [3] - 16:11, 34:15, 58:4

24:12, 24:13, 47:12, 47:13 office [4] - 9:5, 22:21, 42:20, 42:24 officer [9] - 38:15, 52:2, 52:4, 52:13, 52:17, 53:24, 60:17, 62:1, 71:15 officers [1] - 44:8 Official [2] - 2:2, 81:2 official [1] - 50:11 Oklahoma [1] - 74:3 old [2] - 15:5, 15:6 one [35] - 5:16, 6:2, 7:21, 11:15, 11:20, 13:7, 13:17, 15:6, 15:25, 16:16, 17:4, 17:8, 17:9, 17:22, 26:20, 31:12, 31:18, 34:20, 35:25, 36:4, 48:10, 49:10, 51:22, 54:3, 55:22, 63:8, 65:12, 69:24, 73:12, 74:7, 75:14, 75:22, 78:8 One [1] - 36:2 ones [7] - 35:19, 42:15, 53:21, 54:9, 55:5, 56:7, 66:6 open [10] - 4:23, 4:24, 14:4, 14:7, 14:13, 14:21, 14:23, 15:1, 15:8, 15:12 opinion [3] - 73:19, 74:9, 74:23 opportunity [9] - 9:24, 11:10, 12:16, 13:13, 15:11, 20:10, 21:9, 69:7, 69:21 opposed [3] - 26:24, 64:11, 66:21 opposing [2] - 75:7, 76:14 opposite [1] - 13:24 oral [2] - 74:10, 74:24 order [3] - 49:16, 60:14, 76:12 ordinary [1] - 22:20 organization [7] - 6:4, 57:2, 63:11, 63:19, 63:21, 63:24, 65:17 organizations [8] -53:11, 53:14, 54:1, 54:7, 54:16, 66:5, 66:13, 66:15 otherwise [2] - 49:12,

**OF** [3] - 1:1, 1:3, 1:11

offense [1] - 29:12

offering [5] - 24:6,

outcome [1] - 29:23 outer [1] - 36:2 outside [1] - 41:21 overall [1] - 69:11 oversight [2] - 32:6, 69:15 own [5] - 16:1, 41:18, 62:4, 70:3 owned [3] - 35:13, 36:17, 64:20

#### F

p.m [9] - 1:7, 8:23, 28:4, 33:11, 33:13, 68:21, 68:24, 79:3, 79:4 P.R[1] - 16:1 pachyderms [1] -69:19 page [7] - 28:10, 28:15, 28:16, 28:19, 28:20, 28:22, 46:7 pages [10] - 46:6, 69:8, 69:9, 69:23, 70:5, 70:12, 72:5, 72:9, 75:10, 81:3 paid [1] - 65:4 paint [1] - 66:2 PALISOUL [1] - 3:23 Palisoul [1] - 3:23 paragraph [6] - 23:12, 25:2, 47:10, 49:8, 49:21, 50:3 paragraphs (1) - 70:6 PARDO [67] - 1:20, 3:17, 5:23, 5:25, 6:16, 6:20, 10:6, 10:18, 16:17, 21:12, 22:24, 25:13, 27:7, 27:11, 33:14, 34:7, 36:9, 36:13, 38:19, 38:24, 40:2, 40:6, 42:10, 42:11, 44:12, 44:21, 44:24, 45:3, 46:5, 46:8, 46:13, 46:15, 46:18, 47:3, 47:9, 47:15, 47:24, 48:6, 48:7, 48:22, 48:25, 49:7, 49:20, 50:5, 50:7, 50:9, 50:11, 50:19, 51:3, 51:9, 51:15, 51:20, 52:6, 52:12, 54:5, 55:13, 55:20, 56:3, 56:15, 56:23, 57:6, 58:23, 58:24, 61:25, 63:15, 64:14, 67:8 Pardo [3] - 3:17,

October [2] - 23:16

69:4

64:19, 80:5 Pardo's [1] - 66:6 Pardon [1] - 23:14 Parenthood [1] - 66:9 parking [2] - 18:1, 18:5 Part [1] - 37:12 part [11] - 19:25, 24:18, 24:20, 27:17, 32:8, 36:24, 37:13, 40:25, 49:5, 52:17 participants [2] -67:15, 67:22 participating [1] -53:5 particular [4] - 14:1, 16:11, 25:3, 64:23 parties [2] - 69:7, 69:21 parties' [1] - 69:6 parts [1] - 35:9 pass [1] - 59:21 passed [1] - 42:2 past [1] - 28:25 patron [2] - 63:7, 65:6 patterned [1] - 5:8 PAWS [2] - 53:17, 54:13 paycheck [1] - 61:16 penal [2] - 9:9, 19:17 Penal [2] - 4:17, 9:8 Pennsylvania [1] -1:22 people [7] - 16:1, 30:7, 39:21, 53:5, 57:23, 66:2, 73:7 perception (1) - 71:11 perform [5] - 12:12, 15:14, 19:23, 60:3, 61:5 performance [18] -12:2, 12:5, 12:6, 12:10, 15:9, 17:24, 19:25, 20:2, 20:3, 39:4, 41:12, 41:20, 60:12, 60:15, 61:3, 61:8, 61:9, 71:25 performances [2] -14:5, 61:11 performed [1] - 12:7 period [1] - 41:25 permits [1] - 73:7 person [5] - 37:7, 38:6, 45:19, 50:16, 76:25 personal [1] - 35:3 personnel [2] - 5:6, 39:8 PETA [5] - 53:22, 54:14, 54:17, 65:20,

65:22 **PETTEWAY** [2] - 1:20, 3:18 Petteway [1] - 3:18 ph [1] - 71:21 phone [1] - 77:5 photo [3] - 28:7, 64:22, 64:23 photograph [1] - 36:1 photographed [1] -35:10 photographs [29] -14:23, 26:8, 26:12, 26:14, 26:16, 26:18, 26:25, 27:9, 27:11, 27:13, 33:22, 34:1, 34:17, 35:4, 35:7, 35:17, 35:18, 35:24, 35:25, 42:4, 42:7, 42:12, 42:14, 76:9, 76:12, 76:15, 76:16, 76:22, 76:24 photos [5] - 20:23, 27:23, 28:25, 33:19, picture [3] - 7:1, 7:2, 28:22 pierce [1] - 58:9 place [4] - 6:12, 10:16, 31:13, 72:21 placed [1] - 71:16 Plaintiff [2] - 1:5, 1:14 plaintiff [2] - 33:8, 54:11 PLAINTIFFS [1] - 4:13 plaintiffs [6] - 3:7, 3:10, 3:12, 3:14, 34:2, 37:23 Plaintiffs' [8] - 8:22, 28:3, 33:19, 34:17, 36:10, 42:5, 76:11, 80:11 plaintiffs' [4] - 33:18, 36:14, 38:1, 38:4 Planned [1] - 66:9 play [1] - 49:18 played [6] - 6:14, 8:4, 36:9, 36:11, 36:12, pleading [3] - 69:22, 70:5, 72:4 pleadings [3] - 46:23, 49:3, 69:8 plenty [1] - 70:8 plug [1] - 41:1 plus [3] - 32:23, 52:16, 59:5 point [10] - 15:7, 20:1, 20:11, 49:4, 49:18,

51:22, 54:1, 54:13,

59:17, 60:3 pointed [1] - 18:17 police [14] - 5:13, 38:15, 52:1, 52:4, 52:13, 52:17, 53:23, 54:7, 57:4, 59:19, 60:17, 62:1, 65:5, 71:15 policy [1] - 52:7 portion [1] - 50:5 position [3] - 25:13, 47:3, 52:8 positive [4] - 7:10, 7:13, 32:9, 62:6 possibilities [1] -44:13 possibility [1] - 29:19 possible [1] - 60:16 post [3] - 46:22, 49:2, 77:9 post-trial [1] - 49:2 potentially [1] - 4:3 Poverty [1] - 66:9 power (3) - 59:15, 60:20, 61:18 powers [2] - 61:21, 62:2 practice [1] - 16:22 predicate [1] - 5:25 preliminary [1] - 75:11 premises [2] - 31:14, 31:24 preparation [2] - 40:3, 40:7 prepared [7] - 22:20, 23:13, 23:16, 23:19, 24:3, 24:10, 77:17 presence [1] - 5:6 present [1] - 7:9 presentation [1] -55:3 presentations [1] -55:1 presenting [1] - 24:14 presently [1] - 30:14 preserve [1] - 25:21 president[1] - 63:24 pretrial [4] - 27:10, 33:21, 47:22, 48:3 PREVENTION (1) - 1:3 Prevention [1] - 3:3 PREVIOUSLY [1] -4:13 previously [1] - 74:4 print[1] - 49:14 prints [1] - 27:22 problem [1] - 78:5 proceed [5] - 3:24, 4:6, 33:12, 47:7,

Proceed [1] - 4:11 Proceedings [2] - 2:7, 79:4 proceedings [2] -57:10, 81:4 process [1] - 10:11 produced [2] - 2:7, 48:14 pronounce [2] - 36:3, 71:23 proper [3] - 5:25, 51:11, 52:18 propose [2] - 77:13, 77:16 proposed [1] - 22:11 prosecute [1] - 42:24 prosecuted [2] -29:11, 72:1 Protection [1] - 54:10 protesters [1] - 41:21 protests [1] - 66:3 provide [3] - 50:21, 70:22, 72:3 provided [4] - 6:1. 16:4, 16:9, 33:24 provision [3] - 4:16, 4:17, 9:9 provisionally [2] -47:6, 49:19 public [22] - 14:14, 14:16, 14:22, 14:23, 15:20, 21:17, 22:8, 22:9, 46:13, 46:17, 46:21, 46:24, 47:4, 47:5, 47:13, 47:15, 48:17, 48:25, 49:13, 49:14, 59:23, 76:13 Public [1] - 66:10 published [1] - 73:19 puncture [1] - 20:16 puncture-type [1] -20:16 purpose [2] - 26:15, 47:7 put [5] - 15:3, 15:13, 28:17, 57:20, 72:2

### Q

quality [2] - 76:13, 76:14 quarantine [1] - 31:6 questioning [6] - 10:7, 10:20, 16:18, 47:7, 49:3, 49:19 questions [7] - 7:16, 26:5, 32:24, 64:14, 66:7, 67:5, 67:7 quick [1] - 75:22

# R

railroad [1] - 12:25 Ramos [1] - 71:10 ramp [1] - 60:4 rank [4] - 24:22, 25:1, 25:10, 25:25 reach [2] - 30:6, 30:7 reached [1] - 60:2 reacted [1] - 30:13 reaction [1] - 59:5 read [2] - 39:3, 70:25 ready [2] - 15:14, 77:8 really [1] - 69:2 reasonable [5] -43:20, 44:16, 49:4, 72:6, 77:21 reasons [2] - 34:3, 70:22 receive [1] - 61:16 received [2] - 29:12, 39:18 recess [4] - 33:1, 67:20, 67:25, 68:20 Recess [2] - 33:11, 68:21 recognize [1] - 21:22 recollection [3] - 56:2, 56:5, 56:12 record [54] - 3:6, 21:17, 22:9, 22:13, 22:18, 23:3, 23:9, 23:18, 24:2, 24:8, 24:9, 24:11, 24:13, 24:14, 24:17, 24:18, 24:19, 24:20, 24:23, 25:2, 25:14, 25:21, 27:17, 27:18, 28:12, 33:13, 33:17, 34:3, 44:5, 46:13, 46:17, 46:19, 47:4, 47:5, 47:13, 47:15, 47:16, 47:18, 47:19, 47:20, 48:14, 48:17, 49:6, 49:13, 49:14, 68:24, 76:13, 77:18, 81:4 recorded [1] - 78:14 records [3] - 49:1, 78:12, 78:17 Records [1] - 25:15 Red [5] - 10:8, 34:13, 35:12, 36:16 red [1] - 20:19 Redirect [2] - 64:16, **REDIRECT** [1] - 64:17 references [1] - 47:10 referral [2] - 9:6, 9:17 referred [1] - 9:5

49:19

referring [1] - 63:12 refrain [1] - 67:14 refresh [3] - 56:2, 56:5, 56:11 regard [2] - 23:4, 27:3 regarding [4] - 11:14, 16:12, 39:4, 75:22 regulations [5] - 5:13, 5:18, 39:3, 40:9, 72:21 regulatory [3] - 69:4, 69:10, 69:15 related [2] - 73:18, 77:11 release [1] - 65:5 relevance [2] - 10:14, 10:20 relevant [1] - 10:23 reliability [3] - 49:12, 49:15, 50:17 reliable [1] - 50:18 Remain [1] - 68:22 remember [17] - 9:18, 11:13, 11:15, 12:13, 15:15, 15:22, 16:11, 16:14, 16:15, 39:9, 54:9, 55:5, 55:22, 56:2, 65:23, 71:12 remembers [1] - 56:3 reminds [1] - 70:18 rephrase [2] - 38:18, 44:19 Rephrase [2] - 58:22, 61:24 reply [1] - 71:20 report [2] - 9:14, 78:10 reported [1] - 2:7 reporter [1] - 78:13 Reporter [3] - 2:2, 2:2, 81:2 REPORTER [1] -78:15 Representatives [1] -34:25 represented [1] -33:18 request [1] - 24:17 require [1] - 53:4 requires [1] - 72:15 reschedule [1] - 67:21 research [1] - 72:15 reserve [3] - 23:6, 27:16, 49:5 respect [4] - 57:15, 58:3, 69:3, 69:18 respective [1] - 69:8 response [5] - 27:24, 39:12, 39:16, 46:14, 66:6 responsibility [3] -

32:6, 69:11, 69:16 Responsible [1] -66:11 result [2] - 50:24, 71:5 results [1] - 4:23 Retarded [1] - 66:11 retired [3] - 32:18, 52:14, 54:7 retry [1] - 30:3 return [1] - 67:24 returning [1] - 67:10 reverse [1] - 74:5 review [1] - 42:6 reviewed [2] - 25:6, 46:2 revoked [1] - 71:17 reword [1] - 58:19 Rider [1] - 10:22 rights [7] - 39:21, 41:21, 53:13, 54:23, 55:7, 65:3, 74:19 Ringling [16] - 5:1, 7:21, 9:1, 9:24, 11:20, 12:17, 35:13, 36:18, 37:2, 38:10, 41:6, 57:23, 59:12, 59:16, 60:14, 64:21 Ringling's [1] - 57:22 risk [3] - 59:23, 59:24, 59:25 roadway [1] - 17:4 roam [2] - 31:3, 67:3 role [6] - 37:15, 46:16, 69:18, 69:21, 70:3 Ron [1] - 46:10 room [3] - 33:6, 67:3 Room [1] - 2:3 routine [1] - 16:21 routinely [1] - 31:23 Royal [1] - 71:17 RPR[1] - 2:2 rule [2] - 49:17, 50:13 Rule [2] - 24:4, 25:14 rules [1] - 24:7 ruling [5] - 25:10, 25:11, 49:5, 74:10, 74:24 run [1] - 59:21 running [1] - 59:25 runs [2] - 6:13, 64:1

### S

safe [1] - 67:12 safety [1] - 59:23 samples [1] - 45:4 San [23] - 5:1, 7:6, 8:7, 8:12, 10:4, 11:2, 12:6, 13:5, 13:6,

52:17, 53:2, 60:17, 61:21, 62:1, 62:4, 65:10 sanc [1] - 71:7 Sanctuary [8] - 53:17, 54:10, 63:3, 64:1, 65:7, 65:15, 74:5, 74:8 sanctuary [4] - 30:20, 30:22, 32:19, 71:7 sand [1] - 15:3 Sanerib [2] - 3:10, 73:15 **SANERIB** [23] - 1:15, 3:10, 73:16, 73:20, 73:23, 74:11, 74:14, 74:18, 74:20, 74:25, 75:2, 75:8, 75:14, 75:21, 75:25, 76:5, 76:8, 76:20, 77:1, 78:3, 78:7, 78:18, 78:22 Santa [11] - 11:8, 34:25, 37:19, 42:6, 44:9, 45:16, 51:4, 51:9, 51:22, 53:4, 61:14 saw [35] - 6:9, 7:24, 8:6, 8:11, 11:2, 13:4, 13:5, 13:8, 15:1, 17:1, 17:4, 18:7, 18:14, 19:1, 20:6, 20:15, 24:21, 26:8, 26:13, 29:6, 29:8, 29:25, 30:12, 36:5, 39:1, 40:14, 42:5, 44:5, 45:12, 50:25, 58:9, 58:12, 64:21 scheduled [1] - 4:1 **SCHMITT** [2] - 76:4, 76:6 Science [1] - 66:10 scope [4] - 42:9, 69:3, 69:10, 70:4 Scott [1] - 63:24 scratches [1] - 44:2 sealed [1] - 4:4 seated [1] - 68:22 second [2] - 50:3, 68:8 section [3] - 31:6, 31:7 see [30] - 7:18, 8:9, 11:10, 12:4, 12:7, 12:17, 12:24, 12:25, 13:13, 14:11, 14:15, 15:11, 16:4, 16:8, 18:16, 18:18, 20:5,

13:8, 13:14, 39:7,

47:10, 49:21, 52:13,

21:9, 26:11, 27:1, 27:2, 27:4, 43:22, 43:23, 43:25, 45:13, 47:10, 56:3, 58:25 seeing [5] - 16:15, 29:9, 58:16, 58:20, 59:3 select [1] - 55:1 self [2] - 24:7, 49:11 self-authenticating [1] - 49:11 seminar[1] - 55:21 send [3] - 74:4, 77:9, 77:22 sent [4] - 9:16, 50:25, 71:6, 71:7 separately [1] - 72:3 sergeant [2] - 24:20, 24:21 Sergeant [7] - 4:16, 6:6, 7:19, 8:25, 21:20, 26:8, 64:19 serve [1] - 63:16 service [1] - 53:23 Service [1] - 32:5 **SESSION** [1] - 1:11 session [1] - 68:23 set [1] - 66:19 seven [2] - 14:12, 58:7 seventeen [1] - 31:21 several [1] - 31:8 share [1] - 75:6 **shared** [1] - 63:10 **sharp** [1] - 43:19 Shea [1] - 3:19 SHEA [2] - 1:21, 3:19 shoes [1] - 43:6 short[2] - 33:1, 68:7 shorthand [1] - 2:7 show [6] - 6:12, 10:7, 12:11, 25:18, 26:14, 61:9 showed [2] - 34:18, 64:23 showing [3] - 3:23, 33:20, 47:19 shown [2] - 77:15, 77:19 shows [2] - 14:18, 61:7 Siam [1] - 36:3 **SIAM** [1] - 36:3 sic [1] - 62:14 side [2] - 33:8, 40:25 sides [1] - 78:9 sight [1] - 35:22 signed [1] - 50:4 similar [1] - 13:17 Similar [1] - 13:23

simple [1] - 27:14 Simpson [2] - 3:16, 73:24 SIMPSON [11] - 1:19, 3:15, 70:7, 70:11, 70:24, 72:7, 72:14, 72:22, 73:2, 75:4, 77:11 single [1] - 73:3 SINNOTT [1] - 3:13 Sinnott [1] - 3:13 sit [2] - 61:10, 63:19 sitting [1] - 51:21 situation [1] - 19:20 Six [1] - 32:14 Sixteen [1] - 31:21 skilled [1] - 57:24 **skin** [3] - 58:10, 58:21, 59:1 social [1] - 67:1 society [1] - 32:20 **SOCIETY** [1] - 1:3 Society [17] - 3:3, 11:8, 13:11, 34:25, 37:18, 37:19, 37:23, 44:8, 45:16, 51:4, 51:9, 51:22, 53:4, 53:18, 56:17, 61:13, 61:21 Society's [2] - 52:8, 62:2 sold [1] - 65:10 soliciting [1] - 69:2 someone [8] - 24:3, 24:21, 48:2, 48:3, 64:20, 72:11, 77:9, 77:22 sometime [1] - 52:5 sometimes [1] - 54:22 Sometimes [2] - 30:6, 54:22 somewhat [1] - 72:11 somewhere [3] -14:20, 31:19, 71:13 son [1] - 17:7 sorry [11] - 4:20, 7:11, 17:1, 27:3, 45:10, 46:6, 48:22, 51:7, 55:15, 58:23, 77:24 Sorry [1] - 7:15 sounds [1] - 48:19 source [4] - 25:16, 43:18, 44:22, 45:5 Southern [1] - 66:9 speaking [2] - 42:14, 52:19 special [1] - 15:19 species [2] - 72:24, 73:5 **specific** [3] - 9:18,

12:14, 55:22 specifically [1] - 5:15 **specifics** [1] - 41:3 spot [1] - 20:14 spring [2] - 63:4, 63:7 stab [4] - 17:4, 18:7, 20:8, 20:22 stabbed [3] - 17:14, 18:11, 18:18 stabbing [1] - 60:25 stand [4] - 57:14, 68:18, 78:10, 78:25 start [4] - 69:20, 75:16, 75:18, 78:25 started [4] - 32:19, 32:20, 33:17, 64:25 startling [1] - 59:25 starts [1] - 39:9 state [1] - 54:7 statement [3] - 27:10, 33:21, 52:8 **statements** [1] - 22:6 States [5] - 31:10, 45:15, 46:18, 53:18, 73:4 STATES [2] - 1:1, 1:12 states [1] - 49:21 station [1] - 73:22 statute [3] - 5:8, 5:9, 9:18 statutes [1] - 5:14 statutory [3] - 69:4, 69:10, 69:14 stay [1] - 78:1 steps [1] - 18:23 Steve [1] - 39:9 Stevens [2] - 76:2, 76:22 stiff [2] - 11:15, 12:9 stiffly [1] - 11:25 still [3] - 4:9, 4:10, 72:18 stop [7] - 19:22, 39:25, 59:9, 59:20, 60:8, 60:21, 65:25 stopped [1] - 41:22 story [1] - 57:14 straightforward [1] -69:7 STRAUSS [1] - 3:22 Strauss [1] - 3:22 straw [1] - 15:7 stray [1] - 32:21 Street [1] - 18:2 street [2] - 59:20, 59:22 stretching [1] - 50:13 strike [2] - 16:16,

53:12

strikes [1] - 25:1 stuff[1] - 16:2 subject [2] - 10:8, 52:22 subsequent [2] -24:24, 25:22 substance [1] - 69:15 sufficient [1] - 70:7 Suite [1] - 1:17 **SULLIVAN** [4] - 1:11, 2:2, 81:2, 81:5 summary [1] - 71:18 summer [1] - 42:2 surprised [1] - 25:24 Sustained [3] - 6:25, 44:11, 52:11 sustained [1] - 52:11 swaying [2] - 8:12, 8:13 **SWORN** [1] - 4:13 swung [1] - 12:1

#### T

table [1] - 73:12 tactics [2] - 66:1 Tactics [2] - 55:4, 55:24 talent [1] - 75:17 tank [1] - 40:19 Tanya [1] - 3:10 TANYA [1] - 1:15 tape [6] - 6:2, 6:4, 6:19, 6:24, 37:23, 38:3 teat [1] - 27:4 tech [1] - 3:13 telephone [1] - 33:8 ten [17] - 20:9, 46:6, 65:12, 67:19, 67:22, 67:25, 68:15, 68:17, 68:19, 69:8, 69:9, 69:23, 70:5, 72:5, 75:16 Ten [3] - 70:12, 72:9, 75:10 ten-minute [3] - 67:19, 67:25, 68:19 (Tennessee [3] - 30:15, 32:2, 74:8 tent [11] - 8:12, 13:17, 13:20, 15:13, 16:15, 17:2, 17:3, 17:25, 18:3, 36:25, 43:6 terminated [1] - 53:24 terms [1] - 78:9 test [1] - 49:1 testified [20] - 8:15,

34:10, 34:20, 37:4,

43:7, 45:24, 46:2, 57:8, 60:25, 62:9, 62:19 testify [9] - 6:8, 22:3, 24:21, 29:21, 38:25, 39:5, 42:8, 51:16, 58:20 testifying [2] - 6:4, 45:21 Testimony [1] - 25:15 testimony [8] - 25:18, 30:4, 32:17, 40:18, 48:8, 58:25, 61:3, 68:12 tethers [1] - 64:6 Texas [1] - 62:14 **THE** [197] - 1:1, 1:3, 1:11, 3:9, 3:24, 4:8, 4:9, 4:13, 5:8, 5:10, 5:12, 5:15, 5:17, 5:19, 5:24, 6:10, 6:17, 6:22, 6:25, 7:2, 7:4, 7:6, 7:8, 7:9, 7:11, 7:12, 7:14, 8:20, 10:12, 10:24, 16:19, 16:23, 21:13, 21:16, 22:1, 22:4, 22:5, 22:10, 22:15, 22:19, 23:2, 23:6, 23:8, 23:13, 23:15, 23:18, 23:22, 24:1, 24:9, 24:16, 25:5, 25:20, 26:3, 26:17, 26:20, 26:22, 26:23, 26:25, 27:3, 27:4, 27:6, 27:14, 27:25, 28:2, 28:5, 28:9, 28:11, 28:16, 28:24, 29:1, 29:2, 29:3, 29:4, 30:3, 30:6, 30:9, 30:24, 31:1, 31:3, 31:5, 31:11, 31:12, 31:14, 31:15, 31:16, 31:17, 31:20, 31:21, 31:23, 31:25, 32:1, 32:2, 32:4, 32:7, 32:25, 33:12, 34:5, 38:17, 40:4, 44:11, 44:19, 45:1, 45:2, 46:14, 46:17, 46:20, 47:6, 47:12, 47:22, 48:1, 48:9, 48:16, 48:23, 49:2, 49:10, 50:4, 50:6, 50:8, 50:10, 50:12, 51:1, 51:7, 51:11, 51:14, 51:18, 52:1,

38:9, 39:11, 40:11,

40:14, 41:12, 41:15,

41:24, 42:4, 43:2,

52:3, 52:11, 53:23, 53:25, 55:10, 55:15, 55:18, 56:1, 56:5, 56:7, 56:8, 56:9, 56:11, 56:13, 56:14, 56:21, 57:1, 57:3, 58:22, 61:24, 63:13, 64:15, 67:6, 67:9, 67:11, 67:12, 67:13, 67:14, 67:17, 67:18, 68:3, 68:5, 68:10, 68:14, 68:25, 70:9, 70:13, 70:15, 70:18, 72:5, 72:9, 72:18, 72:25, 73:11, 73:17, 73:21, 74:9, 74:12, 74:16, 74:19, 74:21, 75:1, 75:3, 75:6, 75:9, 75:15, 75:24, 76:1, 76:7, 76:19, 76:21, 77:3, 77:5, 77:7, 77:20, 78:1, 78:4, 78:12, 78:16, 78:19, 78:23 themselves [1] - 77:17 theory [2] - 16:20, 16:22 They've [1] - 73:6 they've [2] - 31:17, 73:7 thousand [3] - 63:8, 65:12 threatening [3] -59:18, 60:22, 60:23 three [6] - 18:23, 28:19, 35:12, 57:5, 64:20, 65:1 throughout [1] - 12:9 throwing [1] - 66:2 thrust [1] - 18:15 ticket [2] - 24:18, 24:21 tickets [1] - 18:4 TO [1] - 1:3 Toby [2] - 36:5, 64:25 today [7] - 25:10, 27:15, 33:22, 34:2, 34:18, 45:21, 67:10 toe [2] - 7:3, 7:18 Tom [1] - 10:22 Tomorrow [2] - 67:11, 67:12 ton [1] - 75:17 tone [2] - 18:24, 18:25 took [3] - 10:16, 18:23, 62:5 top [1] - 47:10 total [1] - 6:13 touch [2] - 58:21, 58:25

town [2] - 39:2, 62:24 trailer[1] - 71:13 train [11] - 13:1, 13:6, 40:11, 40:22, 40:25, 41:4, 41:7, 41:9, 43:8, 43:9, 73:22 trained [5] - 52:18, 57:23, 64:6, 64:9, 64:10 trainer [1] - 24:22 trainers [1] - 17:8 training [5] - 52:17, 52:22, 53:1, 53:5, TRANSCRIPT [1] -1:11 transcript [6] - 2:7, 73:20, 74:11, 75:1, 75:2, 81:3 transcription [1] - 2:7 transfer [2] - 74:2, 74:6 transported [1] -73:22 treatment [1] - 5:14 tree [1] - 15:6 tremendous [1] -76:21 tremendously [1] -76:24 trial [16] - 10:9, 10:10, 10:12, 24:24, 25:22, 29:15, 29:21, 46:23, 49:2, 49:4, 57:7, 62:19, 62:22, 62:23, 62:24, 67:15 TRIAL [1] - 1:11 tricks [1] - 12:12 tried [1] - 43:2 trip [1] - 67:12 true [7] - 7:24, 8:5, 25:7, 39:14, 39:15, 51:4, 51:8 trustworthiness [1] -25:17 truth [3] - 22:2, 22:6, 26:4 Try [1] - 76:6 try [6] - 19:21, 19:23, 27:15, 68:16, 76:17, 78:11 tubs [1] - 15:4 tunnel [1] - 32:16 turn [2] - 17:25, 33:14 turned [1] - 18:23 tushes [2] - 43:12, 43:15 Twenty [1] - 52:16 Twenty-plus [1] -52:16

Two [1] - 68:10 two [13] - 27:11, 28:10, 28:16, 31:17, 31:22, 36:2, 36:6, 61:7, 68:2, 68:3, 68:5, 68:9, 71:12 type [1] - 20:16 typical [1] - 38:15 Typically [1] - 43:19

#### U

U.S [2] - 2:3, 71:3 ultimately [1] - 74:7 under [10] - 4:9, 4:10, 8:12, 22:9, 22:18, 24:7, 25:6, 40:15, 40:25, 57:10 Under[1] - 46:1 uniform [1] - 5:2 unit [1] - 11:5 Unit [6] - 10:8, 10:22, 11:6, 34:13, 35:12, 36:16 Unit's [1] - 34:13 United [5] - 31:10, 45:15, 46:18, 53:18, 73:4 **UNITED** [2] - 1:1, 1:12 unlawful [1] - 4:22 unless [2] - 59:18, 60:21 unloading [2] - 11:10, 40:12 up [12] - 14:16, 15:13, 36:9, 38:15, 38:20, 39:3, 46:5, 59:22, 60:3, 68:11, 77:25, 78:20 upload [1] - 76:13 urine [4] - 40:15, 40:18, 40:22, 40:24 USDA [15] - 9:16, 9:21, 32:8, 45:24, 47:21, 48:15, 50:11, 50:20, 71:9, 71:15, 71:21, 71:24, 73:25, 74:6, 74:16 **USDA's** [2] - 71:11, 74:3

# V

vague [1] - 40:5 Valley [10] - 11:9, 35:1, 37:19, 44:9, 45:16, 51:4, 51:9, 51:22, 53:4, 61:14 various [2] - 53:21, 54:1 verdict [1] - 10:9 verses [1] - 3:3 veterinarian [2] -52:24, 53:2 veterinary [1] - 53:1 via [1] - 49:25 vice [1] - 63:24 Vicky [1] - 35:21 Video [3] - 6:14, 8:4, 36:12 video [3] - 7:9, 75:25, 76:18 videos [1] - 76:3 videotape [5] - 6:7. 6:9, 37:4, 37:21, 42:19 videotaped [1] - 37:7 view [3] - 58:15, 58:18, 71:23 views [3] - 69:3, 69:6, 70:2 violated [2] - 9:18, 9:19 **violation** [7] - 9:7, 19:13, 21:8, 50:21, 50:23, 50:24, 72:1 Violation [1] - 9:19 violations [1] - 73:8 vis [2] - 69:16 vis-a-vis [1] - 69:16 voice [4] - 6:19, 6:20, 6:24, 18:24 volunteer [1] - 32:18 vouches [1] - 48:18

#### W

wait [2] - 22:14, 59:21 Wait [4] - 23:13, 48:9, 58:22 waiting [3] - 60:11, 75:16, 75:18 waived [1] - 28:2 walk [1] - 12:1 walked [1] - 64:24 walking [2] - 58:4, 59:10 walrus [1] - 26:24 Washington [6] - 1:6, 1:17, 1:22, 2:4, 54:23, 55:7 waste [1] - 27:15 Wednesday [2] -69:23 week [13] - 4:25, 8:16, 9:2, 15:15, 15:18, 16:5, 16:12, 17:12,

17:17, 19:6, 19:8, 43:25, 78:10 weekend [4] - 69:2, 69:24, 75:12, 78:25 weeks [2] - 38:16, 38:20 weight [4] - 22:5. 24:25, 25:23, 71:11 Welfare [4] - 9:19, 9:20, 46:1, 72:2 welfare [1] - 53:14 whole [2] - 12:9, 65:10 wild [1] - 67:4 Wildlife [2] - 32:5, 72:24 wildlife [1] - 32:23 WILLIAMS [2] - 4:13, 80:4

80:4

Williams [15] - 4:16,
6:6, 7:19, 8:25, 17:7,
21:20, 26:8, 34:8,
36:15, 38:9, 41:25,
50:20, 51:21, 64:4,
64:19

Willing [1] - 59:23

WINDERS [2] - 1:15,

3:12 Winders [1] - 3:12 witness [9] - 3:25, 4:6, 6:1, 6:3, 7:16, 23:1, 51:11, 68:7, 68:8 WITNESS [36] - 4:8, 4:13, 5:10, 5:15, 5:19, 7:2, 7:6, 7:9,

7:12, 22:4, 26:22, 26:25, 27:4, 29:1, 29:3, 30:9, 31:1, 31:5, 31:17, 31:21, 31:25, 32:2, 32:7, 45:2, 51:14, 52:3, 53:25, 56:7, 56:9, 56:13, 57:3, 67:17 witnessed [1] - 71:25

WITNESSES [1] - 80:3 witnesses [6] - 67:16, 68:1, 68:5, 77:14, 77:15, 77:19

women [1] - 32:20 wonderful [1] - 75:12 wondering [2] - 56:21, 78:8

word [1] - 18:22 wound [7] - 4:23, 4:24, 20:16, 20:20, 20:23, 26:13, 29:9

wounds [1] - 26:16 wrists [1] - 32:16 written [2] - 74:9, 74:23

# Y

year [7] - 10:15, 11:7, 11:14, 12:2, 13:2, 51:24, 73:13 years [11] - 28:25, 34:15, 51:23, 52:16, 53:19, 53:20, 53:21, 57:5, 58:7, 65:19, 65:23 yell [1] - 18:13 yelling [1] - 18:5 yesterday [7] - 4:16, 5:22, 6:6, 8:15, 9:14, 70:2, 70:18 yourselves [1] - 3:5

# Z

zoo [1] - 71:16