Case 1:03-cv-02006-EGS Document 599-44 Filed 06/11/12 Page 1 of 4

# EXHIBIT P

## Westlaw. 4/23/02 PHILADAILY 33

**News**Room

Page 1

4/23/02 Phila. Daily News 33 2002 WLNR 1999488

Philadelphia Daily News (PA) Copyright Philadelphia Newspapers Inc. 2002

#### April 23, 2002

#### Section: FEATURES

#### 8 minutes of fun **ELEPHANTS** PAY A PRICE FOR YOUR ENTERTAINMENT

#### STU BYKOFSKY

'I DON'T want to see them hooked like they're hooked. I don't want to see them chained like they're chained. I don't want to see them jammed into railroad cars," says the Elephant Man. "For what? Eight minutes of the public's enter-tainment?"

The Elephant Man, **Tom Rider**, pushes a hank of brown hair off his forehead, rolls another cigarette and talks passionately about what he calls "my girls," the performing **elephants** he came to love as a "barn man" employed by the Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Circus from 1997 to 1999.

He hates the life his "girls" have. He travels the country, just as the circus does (his expenses paid by the ASPCA), to speak for his "girls," who can't speak for themselves.

I used to like the circus. I was taken as a kid and, later, took my own kids. Maybe you do, too.

My favorites were the animal acts, because I like animals so much.

It took a while for it to sink in that my desire to see animal acts resulted in misery, lifelong confinement and perhaps pain for the animals.

So I swore off circuses. Rodeos, too.

Not because they are unspeakably brutal on their face - although some circuses are theaters of cruelty - but because they are inhumane by their nature. The hooks Rider, 51, refers to are bull hooks, short poles topped with curved steel hooks and sharp points that are used - the circus admits - to "guide" the animals. The circus says they don't hurt the animal.

In gentle hands, that's correct, agrees Philadelphia Zoo elephant keeper Michael Seeley, who adds that "a person can take a tool and abuse it."

That's what was revealed in a blood-curdling hidden-camera videotape made by animal rights activists earlier this year at another circus. In it, an elephant "trainer" orders his staff to "sink that hook into 'em. When you hear that

### Case 1:03-cv-02006-EGS Document 599-44 Filed 06/11/12 Page 3 of 4

4/23/02 PHILADAILY 33

screaming, then you know you got their attention."

That "would not be tolerated," says Ringling public relations director Jennifer Maninger, who says animal activists often try to tar all circuses with the same brush.

But you don't have to beat a beast to harm it. You can deprive it of its natural environment and behavior.

When Rider talks about chains, he means the 22 hours a day elephants might be chained.

Not anymore, says Maninger. For the past three years, most Ringling **elephants** have been kept in open pens, except for overnight, when they are chained for safety. She admits this policy is in part a response to complaints by animal activists.

This means Ringling is listening. That's a good thing.

When he was a Ringling "barn man," Rider later told the USDA in a sworn statement, **elephants** were beaten, or at least physically abused, "six out of seven days a week."

"That is simply not true," counters Maninger, who adds that Rider never complained to management at the time.

"I reported all the time to Randy Peterson, the superintendent of animals," replies Rider. "His response was, 'It's discipline.' That's the unit manager. Who should I go to, (circus owner) Kenneth Feld?"

Maninger repeats Rider did not complain to management.

I can't solve that, but I can tell you why I think circuses are inhumane by nature.

**Elephants** are highly social and intelligent. It's inhumane to tear them from their family units, ship them around by rail on a two-year "work" schedule with only a three-week break. It's inhumane to store them in parking lots, garages, basements, whatever's available. Nothing could be farther from their natural environment.

Are they happy?

Would you be?

Do you care?

E-mail Stu Bykofsky at stubyko@phillynews.com.

#### РНОТО

JENNIFER MIDBERRY/Daily News\ Ringling chains up elephants overnight for safety reasons.

BYKO!

#### ---- INDEX REFERENCES ----

INDUSTRY: (Animal Research & Animal Rights (1AN65); Healthcare Policy (1HE46); Bioethics (1BI56); Healthcare (1HE06); Environmental (1EN24); Nature & Wildlife (1NA75))

4/23/02 PHILADAILY 33

REGION: (USA (1US73); Americas (1AM92); North America (1NO39))

Language: EN

OTHER INDEXING: (ASPCA; BYKO; DAILY NEWS; PHOTO; RINGLING; RINGLING BROTHERS; USDA) (Barnum Bailey Circus; Jennifer Maninger; Maninger; Michael Seeley; Randy Peterson; Rider; Rodeos; Stu Bykofsky; Tom Rider)

EDITION: 4STAR

Word Count: 737 4/23/02 PHILADAILY 33 END OF DOCUMENT