UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,)))
Plaintiffs,	
v.	Case No. 1:03-cv-02006 (EGS/JMF)
RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,)))
Defendants.)))

DX 12

EXHIBIT 12 TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

Washington, DC

	Page 1
1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
3	X
4	AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE :
5	PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO :
6	ANIMALS, et al., :
7	Plaintiffs, :
8	V. : Case No. 03-2006 (EGS)
9	RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & :
10	BAILEY CIRCUS, et al., :
11	Defendants. :
12	X
13	Washington, D.C.
14	Tuesday, July 19, 2005
15	Videotaped deposition of LISA WEISBERG, a
16	witness herein, called for examination by counsel for
17	Defendants in the above-entitled matter, pursuant to
18	notice, the witness being duly sworn by MARY GRACE
19	CASTLEBERRY, a Notary Public in and for the District
20	of Columbia, taken at the offices of Covington &
21	Burling, 1201 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Washington,
22	D.C., at 9:40 a.m., Tuesday, July 19, 2005, and the
23	proceedings being taken down by Stenotype by MARY
24	GRACE CASTLEBERRY, RPR, and transcribed under her
25	direction. ORIGIN
	ONIOIN

Washington, DC

		Page 2
1	APPEARANCES:	٠
2		
3	On behalf of the Plaintiffs:	
4	KIMBERLY OCKENE, ESQ.	
5	Meyer Glitzenstein & Crystal	
6	1601 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.	
7	Washington, D.C. 20009	
8	(202) 588-5206	
9		
10	On behalf of the Defendants:	
11	MAURA A. DALTON, ESQ.	
12	Covington & Burling	
13	1201 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.	
14	Washington, D.C. 20004	
15	(202) 662-5263	
16		
17	ALSO PRESENT:	
18	ELLEN HEBERT, Videorapher	
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Washington, DC

	Page 21
1	A. This document?
2	Q. This document was not the ASPCA did not
3	produce this document, did it?
4	A. That's correct.
5	Q. Do you know why it did not?
6	A. Again, I did not believe that that was
7	part of the request for documents that were
8	requested.
9	Q. You provided other financial information,
10	correct?
11	A. Yes.
12	Q. Can you summarize for me the ASPCA's
13	allegations in this lawsuit?
14	A. Yes. We believe that Ringling Bros. has
15	violated the Endangered Species Act by the taking of
16	Asian elephants which are endangered. And the taking
17	was done by the use of the bullhook and the physical
18	abuse of elephants as well as the chaining of the
19	elephants for most of the day and night as well as
20	the forcible removal of the baby elephants from their
21	mothers.
22	Q. So you listed, I believe, four things that
23	
24	
25	physical abuses of elephants as well as the chaining

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 22 of elephants and what you refer to as the forcible 1 removal of baby elephants, is that correct? That's correct. 3 Α. Do you contend that Ringling Bros. is Q. 4 violating the Animal Welfare Act? 5 Α. Yes. 6 And how is Ringling Bros. violating the 7 Animal Welfare Act? 8 The Animal Welfare Act prohibits the 9 physical abuse of animals. It also requires that 10 animals be able to make normal postural adjustments 11 which the elephants cannot make when they are 12 chained; that they must be treated humanely and 13 provided and cared for humanely. 14 So are those claims part of your current 15 0. 16 case? Α. Yes. 17 So your claims that Ringling Bros. is Q. 18 violating the Animal Welfare Act is part of the 19 20 current case? Correct. 21 Α. Have you contacted the USDA regarding your 22 Q. concerns about Ringling's violations of the AWA?

And do you contend that USDA is not

Α.

Q.

Yes.

23

24

25

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 23 enforcing the AWA? 1 That's correct. Α. How is the USDA not enforcing the AWA? 0. 3 USDA has been notified through its Α. 4 inspectors, through various investigations and 5 inspections conducted regarding violations by 6 Ringling Bros. And the Secretary of USDA time and 7 time again has engaged in a policy of nonenforcement. 8 And you said that you have contacted the 9 United States Department of Agriculture about this, 10 correct? 11 Correct. Α. 12 How many times have you contacted the 13 Q. agency? 14 I do not recall. Α. 15 Are documents relating to your contacts 16 0. with USDA included in your document productions to 17 Ringling? 18 Yes. Α. 19 Can you think of any other documents that 20 you have not included? 21 No. Α. 22 Are there specific incidences that the 23 Q. ASPCA is complaining of in this case? 24 Yes. 25 Α.

Washington, DC

	Page 45
1	A. I believe it's Kathy Meyer and Eric
2	Glitzenstein.
3	Q. What is the ASPCA's role in the Wildlife
4	Advocacy Project?
5	A. We provided a grant to them to enable Tom
6	Rider to do his public outreach and education about
7	the treatment by Ringling Bros. of its Asian
8	elephants.
9	Q. And that was what the I'm sorry, the
10	\$6,000 referred to in the check request was this
11	original grant, correct?
12	A. Correct.
13	Q. And the check request for \$526.16 is
14	additional funding over the original allotment in the
15	budget for this project?
16	A. Correct.
17	Q. And \$400 of this was for a zoom camera?
18	A. Correct.
19	Q. Was the zoom camera to be used by
20	Mr. Rider?
21	A. Yes.
22	Q. And for what purpose was the zoom camera
23	to be used by him?
24	A. To gather additional information about the
25	treatment and chaining of the elephants by Ringling

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 Bros.
- Q. What other activities were covered in the
- 3 \$6,000 grant?
- 4 A. They were to reimburse Tom Rider for his
- 5 general living expenses to travel the country and
- 6 meet with the media.
- 7 Q. Did you have any direct -- did you provide
- 8 Mr. Rider with any direct payments or were all of
- 9 your -- that's my question. Did you provide him with
- 10 any direct payments?
- 11 A. Yes, in 2003, I believe.
- 12 Q. Did you provide that check request to us?
- 13 A. I believe I did.
- MS. DALTON: I don't recall that, so Kim,
- 15 if we could perhaps discuss that. We didn't receive
- 16 any check request for Mr. Rider specifically.
- THE WITNESS: Well, they weren't to
- 18 Mr. Rider, the check requests. We would either
- 19 advance money to him to purchase a Greyhound bus
- 20 ticket or to reimburse him for his daily living
- 21 expenses or I would prepay his hotel rooms. So there
- 22 was never any checks written to Mr. Rider.
- 23 BY MS. DALTON:
- 24 Q. So there aren't any documents that would
- 25 reflect any of those purchases or any of those

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 monetary advances?
- 2 A. The hotel rooms were oftentimes put on my
- 3 American Express corporate card, and then some of the
- 4 other smaller items were reimbursed to him through
- 5 petty cash.
- Q. And those were all in 2003?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. Can you think of any other direct payments
- 9 or in-kind reimbursements to Mr. Rider for any of the
- 10 years besides 2003?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Returning to Exhibit 7. So if you could
- 13 tell me -- if you could go into more detail as to
- what the \$6,000 grant was originally for.
- 15 A. Again, it was to reimburse Mr. Rider for
- 16 his Greyhound bus tickets, to travel the country,
- 17 basic day-to-day living expenses, food, lodging.
- 18 Q. And this was all provided through the
- 19 Wildlife Advocacy Project?
- 20 A. Correct.
- Q. Did Mr. Rider know that the ASPCA was
- 22 providing this funding through the Wildlife Advocacy
- 23 Project?
- 24 A. I believe so.
- Q. Did Mr. Rider, to your knowledge, receive

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 105 contact other members of the ASPCA and other 1 2 departments in the ASPCA to see if they had any money 3 that could be used for Mr. Rider? Α. No. 5 0. Why not? 6 Α. Because those other departments would not 7 have -- it wasn't within their purview to do that 8 kind of work. 9 MS. DALTON: I would like to mark Exhibit 10 11, which is a copy of the ASPCA's bylaws. 11 (ASPCA Exhibit No. 11 was 12 marked for identification.) 13 BY MS. DALTON: 14 Q. And in reviewing it, you can see that this 15 document lists the ASPCA's revised bylaws as of June 16 19th, 2002, correct? 17 Α. Correct. 18 Q. And article 1 states the ASPCA's origins 19 and purpose, correct? 20 Α. Correct. 21 Under number 2, the bylaws state that, Q. 22 quote, "throughout New York state, humane law 23 enforcement agents investigate and apprehend 24 individuals suspected of animal mistreatment,"

correct?

25

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

				Page	106
1		Α.	Correct.		
2		Q.	Is there a New York state law that give	s	
3	these	e agent	s the power to investigate and apprehen	d	
4	indi	viduals	3?		
5		Α.	Yes. There was a special act of the Ne	W	
6	York	state	legislature.		
7		Q.	Can you tell me a little bit about that		
8	act,	start	ing with when it was first passed?		
9		Α.	1866.		
10		Q.	And what is the substance of the Act?		
11		Α.	Basically it created the ASPCA and gave	us	
12	law e	enforce	ement powers.		
13		Q.	And the law enforcement powers are		
14	thro	ughout	the state of New York?		
15		Α.	Correct.		
16		Q.	Now, if you turn to page A-00861, artic	le	
17	8 is	descr	ibed as special agents, correct?		
18		Α.	Correct.		
19		Q.	Now, are these special agents the same		
20	indi	viduals	s as what was referred to as, quote,		

- 22 A. I believe so.
- Q. Are special agents hired by the ASPCA?

"humane law enforcement agents" under article 1?

24 A. Yes.

21

Q. And what are their qualifications?

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 107 1 Α. I can't speak to that. Are you talking 2 about before we hire them, as a basis to hire them, 3 or once we employ them? 0. When you're determining whether or not to 4 5 employ somebody, generally what are you looking for? 6 Α. I can't speak to that. That's up to our 7 vice president of humane law enforcement. 8 Under today's deposition, this is a Ο. 9 30(b)(6) deposition, so you're speaking on behalf of 10 the company so this is information regarding the 11 company. 12 Α. Well, certainly no criminal record. 13 know that they have hired former New York police 14 officers, people who have law enforcement 15 backgrounds. 16 0. And once they are hired, to whom do they 17 report? To the vice president of humane law 18 Α. 19 enforcement. 20 And then who is that currently? 0. 21 Α. Dale Riedel. 22 Q. And then who does Mr. Riedel report to? 23 Α. Steve Musso. Who is? 24 Ο. 25 He is the senior vice president and chief Α.

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 of operations.
- 2 Q. And do you report to -- I'm sorry, I
- 3 didn't catch the name, Steve --
- 4 A. Musso, M-u-s-s-o.
- 5 Q. Do you also report to Steve Musso?
- 6 A. No, I do not.
- 7 Q. So Mr. Musso, then, reports to whom?
- 8 A. To the president.
- 9 Q. So they report down through a different
- 10 chain of the organizational structure than you do,
- 11 correct?
- 12 A. Correct.
- Q. Once they are appointed by the ASPCA, they
- 14 then have the law enforcement powers granted to them
- 15 under New York state law?
- 16 A. They need to complete a course to become a
- 17 peace officer in New York state.
- 18 Q. And what does that course entail?
- 19 A. It's a 40-hour course in law enforcement.
- 20 Q. And when you say law enforcement, what in
- 21 particular?
- 22 A. I believe it's a class that they complete
- 23 at John Jay College in New York City. They also do
- 24 firearms training under New York state law.
- 25 Q. Does the ASPCA provide any additional

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 training to these individuals?
- 2 A. Yes. There is ongoing continuing legal
- 3 education. And I believe the firearms training,
- 4 there is some type of annual training requirement for
- 5 them to bear firearms.
- Q. And this is all overseen by Mr. Riedel?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Under article 8, it says that -- section
- 9 4, it says that these agents are specifically
- 10 assigned to the task of humane law enforcement. So
- 11 does that mean they are charged with enforcing New
- 12 York state's animal welfare laws?
- 13 A. Correct. That's generally the provisions
- 14 in article 26 of the New York State Agriculture and
- 15 Markets law.
- 16 Q. And they are assigned to the task of
- 17 humane law enforcement and then it says, "To make
- 18 lawful arrests, issue summonses, appearance, tickets
- 19 or similar instruments, seek and obtain warrants,
- 20 execute warrants for the violation of any law
- 21 relating to or effecting the prevention of cruelty to
- 22 animals."
- 23 I skipped over a little bit in the
- 24 beginning, but what I'm interested in is this phrase,
- 25 "For the violation of any law relating to or

Washington, DC

	Page 110
1	effecting the prevention of cruelty to animals." So
2	that just refers to New York State law, is that
3	correct?
4	A. Correct.
5	Q. Does the ASPCA provide training on what
6	New York animal cruelty laws are?
7	A. Yes.
8	Q. And they are required to have that
9	training on an ongoing basis?
10	A. Correct.
11	Q. So under the New York State law and under
12	the bylaws of the ASPCA, special agents have a duty
13	to inspect Ringling Bros., correct?
14	A. They are authorized to inspect.
15	Q. When they arrive at a Ringling Bros.
16	performance or at a Ringling Bros I should say at
17	an area where Ringling Bros. is currently housing its
18	animals, is Ringling Bros. required to treat them as
19	they would any other law enforcement officer?
20	A. For the most part.
21	Q. And Ringling Bros. has to grant these
22	agents access to its animals, correct?
23	A. We're authorized to inspect, but we're not
24	mandated.
25	Q. But once you decide to inspect, then the

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 entity or person being inspected is required to allow
- 2 the inspection?
- 3 A. Not necessarily. Because Ringling Bros.
- 4 houses its animals and performs at Madison Square
- 5 Garden, which is a private entity, we need to get
- 6 either the permission of Ringling Bros. to inspect or
- 7 we would need to get a search warrant which would
- 8 allow us to inspect. And in order to do that, we
- 9 need probable cause.
- 10 Q. Was the humane law enforcement group
- 11 founded back in the 1800s when this New York state
- 12 law was first passed?
- 13 A. Yes.
- Q. And generally speaking, what are the
- 15 number of inspectors?
- 16 A. The current number of peace officers?
- 17 Q. Yes.
- 18 A. I believe it is 21 agents.
- 19 Q. And are they all in the New York City area
- or are they spread out throughout the state?
- 21 A. All in the New York City area.
- 22 Q. How do they determine whether or not to
- 23 perform an inspection?
- A. Based on complaints that we receive from
- 25 the public and also from various government agencies.

Washington, DC

	Page 112
1	Q. Are there routine inspections in addition
2	to these inspections that are a result of complaints?
3	A. Yes. We will inspect pet shops, other
4	circuses that come to town.
5	Q. Is there a decision made by somebody in
6	the humane law enforcement group as to which entities
7	to inspect?
8	A. Yes.
9	Q. And who is that person?
1.0	A. Dale Riedel.
11	Q. Does he receive any input from any other
12	vice presidents?
13	A. Only if we've been contacted about a
14	possible case of cruelty.
15	Q. Do you know of any examples when other
16	individuals at ASPCA have asked that there be an
17	inspection?
18	A. I have.
19	Q. In what cases?
20	A. Pet shops, hoarders, individuals, problems
21	with carriage horses in the city.
22	Q. Can the ASPCA fire a humane law
23	enforcement inspector if they don't carry out their
24	functions properly?
25	A. Yes.

Washington, DC

		Page 113
1		MS. DALTON: I would like to mark Exhibit
2	12.	
3		(ASPCA Exhibit No. 12 was
4		marked for identification.)
5		BY MS. DALTON:
6	Q.	And this is a document that was included
7	in your pr	coduction to Ringling Bros. with the Bates
8	Number A-0	00801, correct?
9	Α.	I'm sorry?
10		MS. OCKENE: She's just reading.
11		THE WITNESS: Oh, yes.
12		BY MS. DALTON:
13	Q.	And this is a letter to you from Giselle
14	Gomez, co	rrect?
15	Α.	Correct.
16	Q.	And Ms. Gomez is with the humane law
17	enforceme	nt group?
18	Α.	Yes.
19	Q.	And why did Ms. Gomez send you these
20	reports?	
21	Α.	I requested them as part of the discovery
22	request.	
23	Q.	When you say discovery request, that's
24	the	
25	Α.	By the defendants.

Washington, DC

	Page 114
1	Q by the defendants. And what inspection
2	reports did you request?
3	A. I requested any files pertaining to circus
4	inspections.
5	Q. So there were no other inspections of
6	circuses as of May 20th, 2004 besides these, I think
7	it's nine?
8	A. Correct.
9	MS. DALTON: Mark as Exhibit 13.
10	(ASPCA Exhibit No. 13 was
11	marked for identification.)
12	BY MS. DALTON:
13	Q. So document number A-00804 is what appears
14	to be a routine circus inspection, correct?
15	A. Correct.
16	Q. And the date is March 20th, 1998?
17	A. Correct.
18	Q. And it is assigned case number \$98-0278,
19	correct?
20	A. Correct.
21	Q. What is a routine circus inspection?
22	A. Basically, the agents would look to see if
23	the animals were properly fed and watered, general
24	health, making sure that they're not visibly ill or
25	injured as well as sanitary conditions.

. Washington, DC

	Page 115
1	Q. Are these routine circus inspections
2	required by law?
3	A. No.
4	Q. Are they required to be conducted at
5	certain times?
6	A. No.
7	Q. And whose decision is it to carry out
8	these inspections?
9	A. I would imagine it's Mr. Riedel.
10	Q. How are these inspections carried out?
11	A. My understanding is that they are arranged
12	in conjunction with Ringling Bros. or whichever
13	circus we're inspecting by appointment.
14	Q. And once they determine to go in and
15	inspect the circus, are they required to review all
16	animals once they're there?
17	A. I believe so.
18	Q. And are they required to speak with
19	certain Ringling representatives?
20	A. I believe that they are accompanied by a
21	Ringling Bros. employee.
22	Q. Now, if you could turn the page to
23	document A-00805.
24	A. Right.
25	Q. It appears as though this refers to the
1	

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 116 1 same case. Α. Yes. 3 And it notes this was a Friday night Q. 4 circus inspection? 5 Α. Correct. 6 Q. And it says, name of business, and it says 7 Nass Col. Is that the Nassau Coliseum? I believe so. Α. And that's on Long Island, correct? 9 Ο. 10 Α. Correct. 11 Q. And document 00806 looks like the Special Agent Brett's notes and it reads, "This is a 12 duplicate case. Already investigated and closed by 13 Special Agent Gary Rogers NVO." What does NVO stand 14 15 for? 16 Α. I do not know. Maybe no violations. 17 not sure. 18 Q. And SA stands for special agent? 19 I believe so. Α. 20 And it doesn't look as though there were Q. 21 any violations of the standards that they were being 22 investigated under during this visit, correct? 23 Α. It's unclear since this was closed based 24 on special agent Gary Rogers' inspection, and he's a 25 special agent with the Suffolk County SPCA.

Washington, DC

	Page 117
1	Q. And is that why Gary Rogers' notes
2	regarding this inspection were not provided to us?
3	A. I don't know.
4	Q. Would you consider the notes of an
5	inspection performed by the Suffolk County SPCA
6	responsive to our document requests?
7	A. Not necessarily.
8	Q. And you don't know what NVO stands for?
9	A. No, I don't.
10	MS. DALTON: I would like to turn to
11	Exhibit 14.
12	(ASPCA Exhibit No. 14 was
13	marked for identification.)
14	BY MS. DALTON:
15	Q. Actually, prior to turning to Exhibit 14,
16	if we could return to Exhibit 3, please, to page 29
17	where it says, "humane law enforcement
18	investigations." It's the second entry to the
19	bottom.
20	A. Yes.
21	Q. And it says $8/4/98$ and $8/31/98$.
22	A. Right.
23	Q. So do you know if those inspections
24	regarded Ringling Bros.?
25	A. I don't know.

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 118 1 0. Do you know if we received documents 2 regarding those investigations? 3 Α. Yes. 4 0. So turning back to --Α. I'm sorry, I believe those records were not -- they have no records for 1998, so you did not. 6 7 But you just showed me a record from 1998 Q. which was Exhibit 13, which was actually earlier in 8 the year than 1998 -- in 1998. 9 10 I'm sorry, you're right. That's correct. Α. MS. DALTON: So I would like to ask for 11 12 additional 1998 records, if they exist, for these two 13 investigations that were in August, if they related 14 to Ringling Bros. 15 MS. OCKENE: For the record, she performed a reasonable search and we've provided documents. We 16 can search again. It appears that they weren't in 17 the files for some reason, but we can search again. 18 19 BY MS. DALTON: 20 I mean, as you were able to account for 0. 21 the funding for these, I would assume there was some 22 sort of record that refreshed your recollection when 23 you were preparing the response for interrogatory 21. I mean, if you were able to piece together that those 24 25 were the two dates of the law enforcement

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 investigations.
- 2 A. Right. I believe that we turned over all
- 3 the records, but I can certainly ask our humane law
- 4 enforcement department to double-check.
- 5 Q. Okay. That will be great.
- 6 MS. DALTON: And I'll follow up with you,
- 7 Kim, on that.
- BY MS. DALTON:
- 9 Q. I'm sorry, I missed my spot. I had moved
- on to Exhibit 14, which is another routine
- 11 inspection.
- 12 A. Uh-huh.
- 13 Q. And the case number is S99-0002.
- 14 A. Correct.
- Q. And again, it was assigned to, it appears,
- 16 Special Agent Brett?
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 Q. And document number A-00820 refers to that
- 19 same case number, correct?
- 20 A. Correct.
- 21 Q. And when it says complainant and it says
- 22 HLE, what does that stand for?
- A. Humane law enforcement.
- Q. So does that mean that somebody within the
- 25 ASPCA had complained about something or is that a

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 120 routine inspection? 1 I believe it's a routine inspection. Α. 2 And again, this was at the Nassau 3 Q. Coliseum, correct? 4 Correct. Α. 5 And document 00821 describes the findings 0. 6 from the inspection, doesn't it? 7 Α. Yes. 8 And the report states that the elephants 0. 9 were kept on, quote, "padded chain," correct? 10 Α. Yes. 11 And it also states that the inspector was, 0. 12 quote, "escorted by the circus vet"? 13 Α. Correct. 14 And it said that the inspector was 15 "escorted by circus vet Peter Cimini on an inspection 16 of premises to confirm compliance on all humane 17 issues," doesn't it? 18 19 Α. Correct. And it says, case closed, correct? 20 Q. Correct. Α. 21 And reports NVO at this time, correct? 22 Q. Correct. 23 Α. Does that mean that there were no 24 Ο. violations of, quote, "all humane issues," end quote? 25

.Washington, DC

 	Page 121
1	A. I believe so.
2	Q. So there were not any reports of any
3	violations during this visit, are there?
4	A. The inspectors, our inspectors, when they
5	perform an inspection, are again only looking for
6	proper food and water and sanitary conditions and
7	whether there are any visible signs of injury or
8	illness. There may be other violations that our
9	inspectors are not trained to detect.
10	Q. So the inspectors found that there was
11	proper food, proper water, proper sanitary conditions
12	and there were no visible signs of injury or illness,
13	correct?
14	A. Correct.
15	MS. DALTON: I would like to mark Exhibit
16	15.
17	(ASPCA Exhibit No. 15 was
18	marked for identification.)
19	BY MS. DALTON:
20	Q. Document number A-00822 is yet another,
21	quote, "routine inspection of Ringling Bros.,"
22	correct?
23	A. Correct.
24	Q. And this investigation was assigned to
25	Special Agent Romano?
1	

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 A. Correct.
- Q. And it was an inspection that occurred
- 3 at -- it appears from the address, 34th Street and
- 4 8th Avenue, that it was at Madison Square Garden on
- 5 March 23rd of 1999, correct?
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 Q. And the following page confirms that this
- 8 is a routine inspection of Ringling Bros. Barnum
- 9 Bailey Circus at Madison Square Garden, correct?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. And the following page, 00824, this is the
- 12 report that the inspector wrote after conducting his
- 13 inspection, correct?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 Q. And the report reflects the fact that the
- 16 ASPCA official inspected the areas where the animals
- 17 were kept, including all the animal pens, correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 Q. The inspector found that there was, quote,
- 20 "adequate bedding, food and water," correct?
- 21 A. Correct.
- Q. And that "all pens were secured, clean and
- 23 mucked," correct?
- 24 A. Correct.
- 25 Q. And with regards to the elephants, he

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 stated that the elephants were secured and that there
- 2 was food observed, correct?
- 3 A. Correct.
- 4 Q. So there are no reports of any violations
- 5 of humane laws during this visit, correct?
- 6 A. Based on this criteria, correct.
- 7 Q. So during this visit, they found that
- 8 there was adequate bedding, food and water and there
- 9 was no visible signs of harm to any of the elephants,
- 10 correct?
- MS. OCKENE: Objection to the form, your
- 12 characterization of the testimony.
- MS. DALTON: Well, I don't think so,
- 14 because based on what Ms. Weisberg said earlier, she
- 15 said that the standards that the humane enforcement
- 16 officials look at during these reviews, they look at
- 17 whether or not there is adequate food, bedding, water
- 18 and visible signs of harm.
- 19 So I then just asked that because there
- 20 were no violations found, that she can infer that
- 21 there was no violations of any of those.
- MS. OCKENE: I just think the document
- 23 speaks for itself, and you're mischaracterizing
- 24 what's contained in the document. I don't see
- 25 anywhere where it says no violations of humane laws.

Washington, DC

		Page 124
1		BY MS. DALTON:
2		Q. I'm going to ask that again. So based on
3	3	this document where it says that all pens were
4	1	checked and adequate bedding, food and water were
į	5	observed, and based on what you said earlier in that
	6	the officials looked to see if there were any visible
	7	signs of harm or visible signs of injury to the
	8	elephants, that there was no violation of any of
	9	those standards?
1	.0	A. Correct.
]	1	Q. In addition, did Special Agent Romano note
:	12	that the general condition of the area where the
	13	animals were found was good?
	14	A. Yes.
	15	MS. DALTON: We're running out of tape
	16	right now. I have a few more of these to go through.
	17	It's 12:30. Do you want to take a break?
	18	MS. OCKENE: I would prefer to finish this
	19	topic.
	20	MS. DALTON: Okay.
	21	MS. OCKENE: Is that all right with you,
	22	Lisa?
	23	THE WITNESS: Sure.
	24	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This concludes tape 2
	25	in the deposition of Lisa Weisberg. We're going off
	1	

Washington, DC

	w asimpton, 2
	Page 125
1 t	he record. The time is 12:32:50.
2	(Recess.)
3	(ASPCA Exhibit No. 16 was
	marked for identification.)
4 5	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This begins tape 3 in
6	the deposition of Lisa Weisberg. We're back on the
	record. The time is 12:35:56.
8	BY MS. DALTON:
9	Q. I would like to continue with what has
10	been marked as Exhibit 16 and the first page of this
11	exhibit has been Bates stamped A-00825 which is
12	another routine inspection of Ringling Bros.,
13	correct?
13	A Correct.
15	O. And this one was assigned to, it says S/I ,
16	which I'm going to assume is special investigator?
17	A. I believe so.
18	Q. MacDonald, and it is at Madison Square
19	Garden on March 29, 1999, correct?
20	A. Correct.
21	Q. And the next page refers to the same case
22	number, N99-1051, correct?
23	A. Correct.
24	Q. And on the following page, A-00827, that
25	refers to the same case, correct?

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 Q. And it says that the investigator was
- 3 escorted throughout the entire holding area and
- 4 observed all animals to be, quote, "very secure,
- 5 bright, alert, clean pens, ample water provided,"
- 6 correct?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. At the bottom of the report, it says that
- 9 there were, quote, "no violations observed," correct?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. So is it possible that the NVO that we saw
- 12 written on prior reports stands for no violations
- 13 observed?
- 14 A. It's possible.
- Q. Would you say that that's what NVO stands
- 16 for?
- 17 A. I believe so.
- 18 Q. So based on that, looking back at Exhibit
- 19 13, the third page of that exhibit, it means that
- 20 Special Agent Brett found no violations during his
- 21 visit at the Nassau Coliseum on March 20th, 1998,
- 22 correct?
- 23 A. It's unclear to me given that this case
- 24 was investigated by Special Agent Gary Rogers.
- 25 Q. That's not what I'm asking you. I'm

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 asking you, on the date of March 20th, 1998, Special
- 2 Agent Brett found no violations, correct?
- 3 A. I believe so.
- Q. And with Exhibit 14, at the bottom of page
- 5 A-00821, which is regarding the March 23rd, 1999
- 6 visit to the Nassau Coliseum, in the last sentence
- 7 of -- Mr. Brett says, "case closed/NVO at this time."
- 8 So that shows that on March 23rd, 1999, Special Agent
- 9 Brett found no violations when he visited Ringling
- 10 Bros. at Nassau Coliseum, correct?
- 11 A. To the best of my knowledge, yes.
- 12 Q. If you could return back to Exhibit 16 and
- turn to page 00828, which refers to the same March
- 14 29th, 1999 inspection of Madison Square Garden.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And can you please tell me whether there
- 17 was any finding of, quote, "any mistreatment of or
- 18 cruelty to animals"?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. So there was no finding of mistreatment or
- 21 cruelty to animals, correct?
- 22 A. Based on this inspection, that's correct.
- 23 Q. This document says that there was no
- 24 mistreatment of or cruelty to animals, correct?
- 25 A. Correct.

Washington, DC

					Ħ
				Page 128	
	1	Q.	And during this March 29th, 1999		
	2	inspection	, it found that there were no animals		
	3	injured, c	orrect?		20 S. C. Section
	4	Α.	Correct.		WANTED TO
	5	Q.	And there were no incidences that were		
	6	reported o	during this visit, correct?		WALK STATE
	7	Α.	Correct.		20 Sept. 100
	8	Q.	And under the next category, it says		Section 1
	9	animals,	and I'm going to ask you to tell me, how		To the second
] :	10	were the	facilities rated?		
	11	Α.	Good.		
	12	Q.	And is good the highest rating?		
	13	Α.	Yes.	. nót	
	14	Q.	And what was the rating for whether or	Hot	
	15	the facil	ities were clean and sanitary?		
	16	Α.	Good.		
	17	Q.	And what was the rating for food and		
	18	water?			
	19	А.	Good.		
	20	Q.	Were the animals properly segregated?		
	21	Α.	Yes.	-1+h	
	22	Q.	And what was the condition and the he	атип	
	23	of the a			
	24	Α.	Good.	۹?	
	25	Q.	Were there any sick or injured animal		
				**************************************	MARK NACES OF

Washington, DC

	Page 129
1	A. No.
2	Q. Were any animals suspended from labor?
3	A. No.
4	Q. And were the animals securely confined?
5	A. Yes.
6	Q. So based on this report, the facilities
7	were found in good condition, they were clean and
8	sanitary, there was good food and water, the health
9	and condition of the animals were good, there were no
10	sick or injured animals and the animals were securely
13	confined, correct?
12	A. Correct.
1	(ASPCA Exhibit No. 17 was
1	marked for identification.)
1	BY MS. DALTON:
1	Q. Before turning to Exhibit 17, I want to
1	confirm that the findings from the visit of Madison
1	Square Garden where Ringling Bros. was located on
]	
2	
	and the conditions of the animals were good and there
	were no sick and injured animals, I would like to
	confirm with you that good was the highest rating
	available, correct?

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 O. Document A-00830 is what's labeled as an
- 3 activity card for another inspection of Ringling
- 4 Bros. at Madison Square Garden, correct?
- 5 A. Correct.
- 6 O. And this inspection was conducted on April
- 7 2nd, 2001, correct? If you look back at the activity
- 8 card, it's this section down at the bottom.
- 9 A. Yeah, I'm just determining whether the
- inspection actually occurred on the 2nd or the 3rd.
- 11 Q. On the next page, in the middle of the
- 12 second block, it says, inspection sequence and date.
- 13 A. Yes. Yes, it does appear to be April 2nd.
- Q. So the next page, document 00831, is a
- 15 report following the same inspection of Ringling
- 16 Bros. dated April 2nd, 2001, correct?
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 O. Under the narrative section, the ASPCA
- 19 official found that, quote, "everything was found to
- 20 be in order" and that there were, quote, "no injured
- 21 or sick animals," correct?
- MS. OCKENE: Objection to the
- 23 characterization of the document. It says no injured
- 24 or sick animals observed.
- MS. DALTON: I would ask you to stop

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 131 making objections that aren't form or privilege and 1 stop instructing the witness. 2 MS. OCKENE: I didn't instruct her. I was 3 objecting to the form. 4 MS. DALTON: You're instructing through 5 your objections. 6 MS. OCKENE: I object to the form. You 7 can answer the question. 8 THE WITNESS: Yes. 9 BY MS. DALTON: 10 Let me ask that again. So under the Q. 11 narrative section, the ASPCA official found that 12 everything was in order? 13 Α. Yes. 14 And found that there were no injured or 15 Ο. sick animals, correct? 16 Correct. Α. 17 The ASPCA inspector also noted that there Ο. 18 was a vet on staff and present, correct? 19 Correct. Α. 20 Document number A-00835 refers to the same 21 Q. April 2nd, 2001 visit of Madison Square Garden, 22 23 correct? Correct. Α. 24 Was there any finding of any mistreatment 25 Q.

Washington, DC

34 11 010002		Washington, DC	
		Page	: 132
1 0	f or cruel	ty to animals?	
2	Α.	No.	
3	Q.	Were any animals injured?	
4	Α.	No.	
5	Q.	Were there any incidences reported?	
6	Α.	No.	
7	Q.	How were the facilities rated?	
8	Α.	Good.	
9	Q.	And is good the highest rating available?	
10	Α.	Yes.	
11	Q.	And how is the cleanliness and	
12	sanitarin	ess of the facility rated?	
13	Α.	Good.	
14	Q.	And how was the food and water rated?	
15	Α.	Good.	
16	Q.	And for both the cleanliness and	
17	sanitarir	ness and food and water, good is the highest	
18	rating, o	correct?	
19	Α.	Correct.	
20	Q.	Was it found that the animals were	
21	properly	segregated?	
22	Α.	Yes.	
23	Q.	What was the condition and health of the	
24	animals?		
25	Α.	Good.	

Washington, DC

	<u> </u>
	Page 133
1	Q. And is good the highest rating?
2	A. Yes.
3	Q. Were there any sick or injured animals?
4	A. It says yes.
5	Q. And were they required to work?
6	A. No. They were suspended from labor.
7	Q. And were the animals securely confined?
8	A. Yes.
9	Q. So as found by the inspector following the
10	Madison Square Garden inspection of April 2nd, 2001,
11	there was no mistreatment or cruelty to any animals,
12	there were no animals injured, the facilities were
13	found to be good, the facilities were found to be
14	clean and sanitary and the food and water was good,
15	correct?
16	A. There were found to be sick or injured
17	animals.
18	Q. I didn't ask you that. I asked you if
19	there were any mistreatment or cruelty to animals,
20	any animals injured or any reported incidences,
21	whether or not the facilities were good, whether or
22	not the facilities were clean and sanitary and
23	whether or not there was food and water that was
24	good.
25	A. Correct.

Washington, DC

	Page 134
1	Q. Now, you mentioned that there were sick
2	and injured animals, correct?
3	A. Correct.
4	Q. Were they required to work?
5	A. No.
6	Q. And I would like to confirm that the
7	facilities and the cleanliness and sanitary of the
8	facilities and the quality of the food and water was
9	all ranked the highest, good.
10	A. Correct.
11	(ASPCA Exhibit No. 18 was
12	marked for identification.)
13	BY MS. DALTON:
14	Q. And document A-00836 is another activity
15	card that reflects an inspection at Madison Square
16	Garden on March 21st, 2002, correct?
17	A. Correct.
18	Q. And this is another routine inspection of
19	Ringling Bros. while the show was at Madison Square
20	Garden in New York City, correct?
21	A. Correct.
22	Q. And in the text at the bottom of the
23	activity card, the ASPCA inspector noted that the
24	special agent was escorted by Alex Vargas throughout
25	the entire circus area, correct?

Washington, DC

	Page 135
1	A. Correct.
2	Q. And the report states that, quote, "all
3	animals are secure, all bright and alert, no injuries
4	found on any elephants and ample food and water
5	provided," correct?
6	A. Correct.
7	Q. Document number A-00838 refers to the same
8	inspection of March 21st, 2002, correct?
9	A. Correct.
10	Q. Dr. Lindsy, a veterinarian, was on site
11	during this inspection, correct?
12	A. Correct.
13	Q. And the report says that he was available
14	for any reason if needed, correct?
15	A. Yes.
16	Q. And the report again states that, quote,
17	"all animals are secure, all bright and alert, no
18	injuries found on any elephants and ample food and
19	water provided," correct?
20	A. I'm sorry, where are you reading that?
21	Q. It starts
22	A. Yes, I see that.
23	Q. So the report states that all animals are
24	secure, all bright and alert, no injuries found on
25	any elephants and ample food and water provided,

Washington, DC

, <u> </u>		Page 136
1	correct?	
2	Α.	Correct.
3	Q.	And the report states at the bottom that
4	the inspect	cor is, quote, "closing out this case as
5	unfounded,'	end quote, correct?
6	Α.	Yes.
7	Q.	What was unfounded?
8	Α.	It's not clear.
9	Q.	Do you know of any allegations against the
10	circus that	led to this inspection?
11	Α.	No.
12	Q.	Document A-00840 refers to the same March
13	21st, 2002	inspection, correct?
14	Α.	Correct.
15	Q.	Can you please tell me if there was any
16	finding of	mistreatment of or cruelty to animals?
17	Α.	No.
18	Q.	Were any animals injured?
19	Α.	No.
20	Q.	Were there any incidences?
21	Α.	No.
22	Q.	How were the facilities rated?
23	Α.	Good.
24	Q.	And again, good is the highest, correct?
25	Α.	Yes.

Washington, DC

		35
		Page 137
1	Q.	And were the facilities clean and
2	sanitary?	
3	Α.	Yes.
4	Q.	And again, good was marked, which is the
5	highest ra	ating, correct?
6	Α.	Correct.
7	Q.	And the food and water was rated good,
8	correct?	
9	Α.	Yes.
10	Q.	And that's the highest rating, correct?
11	Α.	Right.
12	Q.	And the animals were found to be properly
13	segregate	d?
14	Α.	Correct.
15	Q.	And the condition and the health of the
16	animals w	ere good, correct?
17	Α.	Correct.
18	Q.	And good is the highest rating?
19	Α.	Correct.
20	Q.	And were the animals securely confined?
21	Α.	Yes.
22	Q.	And were there two animals not working?
23	Α.	Correct.
24	Q.	So based on this inspection report, there
25	was no fi	nding of any mistreatment of or cruelty to

Washington, DC

Page 138
1 animals, correct?
2 A. Correct.
3 Q. And there were no injured animals?
4 A. Correct.
5 Q. And the facilities and the food and water
6 were found to be good, which was the highest rating
7 available, correct?
8 A. Correct.
9 MS. DALTON: I would like to go off the
10 record.
11 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Going off the record.
12 The time is 12:52:30.
(Whereupon, at 12:52 p.m., the deposition
14 in the above-entitled matter was recessed, to
15 reconvene at 1:33 p.m., this same day.)
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 139 AFTERNOON SESSION 1 (1:33 p.m.)2 3 Whereupon, LISA WEISBERG, 4 the witness testifying at the time of recess, having 5 been previously duly sworn, was further examined and 6 testified further as follows: 7 EXAMINATION BY COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANTS (RESUMED) 8 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We're back on the 9 The time is 13:33:27. 10 record. BY MS. DALTON: 11 I would like to just ask you a few more 12 0. questions regarding the inspection process that the 13 ASPCA inspectors are responsible for in New York 14 City. At the beginning of our discussion regarding 15 the inspectors, you mentioned that the inspectors 16 have the power to issue a search warrant if there is 17 probable cause, correct? 18 We don't issue the search warrant. The 19 Α. court does. 20 They can obtain a search warrant from a 21 court if it's found to have probable cause? 22 23 Α. Yes. To your knowledge, has there ever been a 24 warrant issued for an inspection of Ringling Bros. 25

Washington, DC

	Page 140
1	Circus?
2	A. I'm not aware of that.
3	Q. Do you know if Ringling Bros. has ever
4	rejected a request from the ASPCA to inspect the
5	circus?
6	A. I believe there was one year where there
7	was an incident where they initially denied us access
8	to inspect.
9	Q. Do you know what the reason given when
10	they initially denied access was?
11	A. I believe they questioned our authority.
12	Q. And then once that authority was
13	confirmed, they then granted you access?
14	A. I don't recall.
15	Q. Do you know what year that was?
16	A. No, I don't remember.
17	Q. On an unrelated topic, I just wanted to
18	ask you two more questions regarding ASPCA's decision
19	not to provide Mr. Rider with any additional funds
20	after 2003.
21	A. Okay.
22	Q. You said that the reason why there was no
23	funding for Mr. Rider past 2003 was because of
24	budgetary concerns?
25	A. Other issues that we wanted to pursue that

Washington, DC

July 19, 2005

Page 230

- 1 Q. Turning to Exhibit 9, where the first
- 2 sentence of your first -- of your e-mail to Larry
- 3 Hawk, it says, "Tom Rider who is a co-plaintiff on
- 4 the suit and a former Ringling elephant trainer has
- 5 just left the employ of Pat Derby's group." Do you
- 6 see that?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. I think you referred to it earlier and
- 9 Ms. Dalton asked you a question as to how you knew
- 10 that Tom Rider was an elephant trainer?
- 11 A. Right.
- 12 Q. Do you recall whether he actually told you
- 13 he was an elephant trainer?
- 14 A. No. I realize that I made a mistake
- 15 there, that it was my misunderstanding. He wasn't a
- 16 trainer, but he was a caretaker for the elephants.
- 17 Q. And now I want to turn your attention to
- 18 the discussion you had earlier about the humane law
- 19 enforcement inspections.
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. Of Ringling Bros. elephants.
- 22 A. Right.
- Q. And we looked at a number of exhibits that
- 24 are forms that your humane law enforcement agents
- 25 fill out after doing inspections?

14:40 PUUN 147 1CU

14142483831



May 20, 2004

Lisa Weisberg, Esq. ASPCA - Government Affairs

Re: Ringling Brothers Inspection(s)

Dear Lisa:

As per your request, attached herewith are all the files pertaining to Circus Inspections. The file numbers are as follows:

N99-1051 N99-0913 S99-0002 \$98-0871 S98-0768 598-0278

A01-000318 A02-001028 A03-002090

Kindly be advised that records for 1997 have been destroyed and we have no records for 1998.

If you have any questions, or need any further information, please feel free to contact Mr. Riedel at ext 4459.

Cordially

Humane Law Enforgement

DR/gyg

424 East 92nd Street, New York, NY 10128-6804 Tel: (212)876-7: 00 www.aspca.org

43 13

ASPCA

CASE # 598-0278

CRUELTY COMPLAINT

DATE RECEIVED 03/20/98

RECEIVED BY Jessica

COMPLAINANT INFORMATION

APT# X ST H: W:

COMPLAINT

routine circus inspection

VIOLATION

10-29H CIRCUS INSPECTION

DATE ASSIGNED 03/20/98

ASSIGNED TO S/A Brett

SUBJECT INFORMATION

Barnum & Bailey Circ Hempstead Turnpike APT# Suifolk X ST

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

	17172402031			•	
אבו אחמא ואין וכמ		•	. •		7000
	•		•		SKC 1/
					ASPUA
		U	:	E	
					F 156 8
SPCA		ENEORCEME	NT :		A STATE OF THE STA
121 012	HCMANE L	AW ENFORCEME	_ :		
	COMPLA	INT COVER SHEET	τ	:	
Pagada	(,0,0,0	D BY:	CASE	ø:	<u> </u>
- 5500	REC	DB1	• •	· .	<u></u>
ATE REC D				:	
OMFLAINANT:(M	r./M3./				
ADD	RESS:		6T·		<u> </u>
PT. #BOR	OLIGH:	CROSS STREE		:	·
PT. # BOR	000:	(WOR	LK) [
FLEPHONE #:(HO	ME) ()		:		
					•
			•		_ _
MOLATION CODE				11/1	P
MOLATION CODE			6112645),\\\	7
MOLATION CODE		NIGHT	61/20 W.S	11/5	7
NOLATION CODE			<u>e1120 us</u>	11/5	-
TOLATION CODE			<u>61120 us</u>),/(
TOLATION CODE			<u>e1/20 us</u>	jn/s	
TOLATION CODE			<u>e1/20 us</u>		
TOLATION CODE			<u>e1/20 u.s</u>		
TOLATION CODE	FR.I	NIGHT	<u>e1/20 u.s</u>		
IOLATION CODE	FRI	NIGHT	<u>e1/20 us</u>		
IOLATION CODE	CIRCL NASI	CUS COLIS	<u> </u>		
SUBJECT'S NAME	FRI FRI O IVE	Cus Cohis			
SUBJECT'S NAMI	FRI FRI O IVE	Cus Cohis			
SUBJECT'S NAMI	FRI FRI O IVE	Cus Cohis			
SUBJECT'S NAMI	INT: FRI CIRC HOMP BOROUGH:	CUS COLIS CROSS ST			
SUBJECT'S NAMI	FRI FRI FRI FRI GIRL BOROUGH:	CUS COLIS CROSS ST			
SUBJECT'S NAMI	FRI FRI FRI FRI GIRL BOROUGH:	CUS COLIS CROSS ST			
SUBJECT'S NAMI	INT: FRI CIRC HOMP BOROUGH:	CUS COLIS CROSS ST			
SUBJECT'S NAMI	FRI FRI FRI FRI GIRL BOROUGH:	CUS COLIS CROSS ST			
SUBJECT'S NAMI	FRI FRI FRI FRI GIRL BOROUGH:	CUS COLIS CROSS ST			

	HUI CH		, mar. 07
DD/ 24/ ZUD4 14.42 14123403U31		:	and the second second second second
and the state of t	and the second s		
	•		
			1
		•	İ
	. Case No.	!	
	,		
THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR	THE PREVENTION OF C	RUILTY OF ANIM	[사고
THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FUR	COMPLAINT INVESTIGA	TED	
REPORT OF	THE WHITE	<u> </u>	:
WHO - WHAT - V	VHERE - WILL	olgie Fr. du	
	TE SIK	5/90 J. F. CO	y
	case already	1- L	
	La deposit	inviso Tigota	7
This is a duplicate	case green	1	
101.3 13 4),	
1 . 1 6, 5/4 FOON K	ogers. NVC		
osco by min	5/4 //n Y	1079	
	1 471.	107	
		18/0)
		•	

		· ·	
The state of the s			
		÷.	
No. 8	_		
		·	
	_		
			!
7. 			į
		:	
हर 			
		:	
		•	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			i
		•	
		:	
			i
		-	;
		:	
• 1 }-		•	i
		;	:

A 00806

12123483631

THOSE 1

14

ASPCA

CASE # S99-0002

CRUELTY COMPLAINT

DATE RECEIVED 03/23/99

RECEIVED BY Jessica

COMPLAINANT INFORMATION

นาะ

APT#

X ST H: W:

COMPLAINT

routine inspection

VIOLATION

10-29H CIRCUS INSPECTION

DATE ASSIGNED: 03/23/99

ASSIGNED TO S/A Brett

SUBJECT INFORMATION

Barnum & Baillys
Nassau Collistem
1255 Hempsteal Turnpike
APT# Suffolk
X ST

Union Dale

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

NO1 241 Z004 14:46 12123483031

right 1 3/23 13 ret





HUMANE LAW ENFORCEMENT COMPLAINT COVER SHEET

DATE REC'D: 322 99 REC'D BY:		C. SE #: 599-1	000
COMPLAINANT (MR. MS.)			
HOME/WORK ADDRESS:			
APT. # BOROUGH:		CI OSS STREET:	
TELEPHONE # (HOME)	(WOPK):		
VIOLATION CODE: NO- 29 H			
ALLEGED COMPLAINT: Partime Inspect	um		
		: 	
SUBJECT'S NAME: Barnum & Bailly's	Cucus		
NAME OF BUSINESS: Name: Barnum & Baily's ADDRESS: 1255 Hempstead Twy APT #: BOROUGH:	m)	-	-
ADDRESS: 1255 Hempstead TWM	oike	CF OSS STREET:	
APT #: BOROUGH:		Cross street.	
TELEPHONE NUMBER:	Unim	1082	
ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FOR AGENT:			
			:
			•

שט/24/2004 14:46 17173483831 Case No THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY OF ANIMALS REPORT OF COMPLAINT INVESTIGATED WHO - WHAT - WHERE - WHEN - WHY - & - HOW DATE 3-23-99 Tues ime: 1650× 1700 ms animail Koman O

humane

A 00821

12123483031 45:41 POOR 14:49

CASE # N99-0933

CRUELTY COMPLAINT

03/23/99 DATE RECEIVED

RECEIVED BY

DATE ASSIGNED 03/23/99

ASSIGNED TO

S/A Romano

COMPLAINANT INFORMATION

APT# X ST

H:

COMPLAINT

routine inspection

SUBJECT INFORMATION

Barnum&Bailey Fircus 34th Street

APT# Manhattan

X ST 8th Avenus

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

madison square garden

VIOLATION

10-29H CIRCUS INSPECTION

PREVIOUS CASE(S) N98-1552 N98-2376 N98-4472 N99-078;

D5/24/2004 14:46 12123483031
WED, JHM NIGHT
The American Society for the Prevention of Creaty to American



HUMANE LAW ENFORCEMENT COMPLAINT COVER SHEET

DATE REC'D'3 20 199	REC'D BY	CA	E#1099_	0933
COMPLAINANT (MR. MS.)	ν·	:		
HOME/WORK ADDRESS:		:		
APT. #	BOROUGH:	CRC	SS STREET:	
TELEPHONE # (HOME)	(WC	ORK):		
VIOLATION CODE: 10-29H				
ALLEGED COMPLAINT: ROUT	une anspector)		i
	•			
SUBJECT'S NAME:	rum & Bailly's	& Cucus		!
NAME OF BUSINESS: Mac	son Square	Varden		!
ADDRESS:	8	Avenue	SS STREET:	
APT #:	вогоцан: Manha	than cro	SS STREET:	
TELEPHONE NUMBER:				
ADDITIONAL INFORMATION F	OR AGENT:			
			:	:
				:
<u> </u>				

שטט 147 /כט	14:40 171734					• • •
				. :	•	
			F Commence		:	
			Case No	V99-09	33	
	THE AMERIC	CAN SOCIETY FO	OR THE PRE	VENTION	OF CRUELTY (OF ANIMALS
		<u>REPORT O</u> WHO WHAT	F COMPLAI	MEN WH	A TOM	
		WHO - WHAT	WILLS W			
ime /	1925 x 2005	5		DATE	3/24/99	
				:		
H.	sived AT	4A DISON SO	vare GAI	OEN. CH		WIOW OT
Cir	CUS ANIMAL	& Area al	here and	mals al	e leer	INSPECTED,
a11	Pens CHECK	(ep, adeau	ote be	DOING,	1000 a	no water
oose.	rueo. All	pens secur	eo, crea	ney will	MUCHEL	
Eler	Hanis secu	TED FOOD	BSALVED	Gonon	1 con DIT	ion of
Area	9000 Co	TAL COUNT O	7 anin	nas as	+01/0WS.	
16	Tigers	35400		GOACS		1 Zebras
			, ,	11:	6,000	
14 Z	le PHants	6 Alba				
" (amels	2 MAC	ė //	100000		:
7 (6	u me is		, 4	OSTAIC		
4 (1	u me is	~~				Pompao # 1975
4 6	a me is		9			Pomano # 1975
4 C	a me is		· · · · ·			Pomano # 1975
7 (a me is		, 4			Pomano # 1975
7 (a me is		, 4			Pomano#1975
7 (a me is		, 4			Pomano # 1975
7 (a me is		, 4			Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul 1	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4			Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul 1	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul 1	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul /	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul /	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul /	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul /	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul /	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul /	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul /	Pomano # 1975
	a me is		, 4		! Paul /	Pomano # 1975

17173402031 05/24/2004 14:4b

CASE # N99-1051

CRUELTY COMPLAINT

03/29/99 DATE RECEIVED

RECEIVED BY

DATE ASSIGNED 03/29/99

ASSIGNED TO

S/I MacDonald

COMPLAINANT INFORMATION

APT# X ST H: : W :

COMPLAINT

routine inspection

SUBJECT INFO MATION

Ringling Brothers Madison Square Garde 33 Street APT# Manhattan

X ST 7 Avenue

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

VIOLATION

CIRCUS INSPECTION

PREVIOUS CASE(S) N97-1245 N98-1155 N99-0675





HUMANE LAW ENFORCE MENT COMPLAINT COVER SHEET

DATE REC'D: 3/20/00 REC'D BX:	TASE 199-1051
COMPLAINANT (MR. MS.)	
HOME/WORK ADDRESS:	
APT. # BOROUGH:	ROSS STREET:
TELEPHONE = (HOME) (WOPK):	
VIOLATION CODE: 10 - 29 H	
ALLEGED COMPLAINT: POLITINE Inspection	
	:
SUBJECT'S NAME.	
NAME OF BUSINESS PUNGling Brow.	
APT #: BOROLGH.	23 Stut
APT # LBOROUGH MAMMUTAN	ROSS STREET:
TELEPHONE NUMBER:	
ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FOR AGENT:	

12123403031 05/24/2004 14:4b Case No THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY OF ANIMALS REPORT OF COMPLAINT INVESTIGATED WHO - WHAT - WHERE - WHEN - WHY - & - HOW DATE 11- 29- 99 to 2038 hrs rrived at madison Square garden in NYC inspected all animals at the tingling 13+05, mer with a ma. Rick Boger who is the for the red unit. was escopited throughout the entire holding area and observed all animals to be very Secure, bright +Alert Clean Penstample water Provided. a Court was also raken of all the animals Present. 7 AlPaca's 3 ostriches_ 2 yaks. GOGTS. 2 MINIOS ample Socurity Provided, Case closed <u> No</u>

7/24/2004 14:46	17173483831	ASPLA		•	PAGE	Z
			• • •			
-			;,			
and the state of t			÷:			
•	THE	AMERICAN S. P. C. A				
		CUS INSPECTION REPOR				
1	<u> </u>	LUS ANSI COLLON RELEGI	3	-29-	99	
	2-1.					
Name of Show	KING/IN S	& Brother	52			
Location	Madison	Square 9	ard:N			
What time die	d you strive?	2000 hRs. 4	weret	035 ha	<u>S =.</u>	
PERPORHANCES						
		•		•		
		p.m. to				
		p.m. to <u>' 2035</u>				
1. Any mists	matment of or crue	elty to enimals? Ye	·	No X		
		No <u>X</u>				
	lent#7 Ye#					
ANIMALS				. :		
		rair Poor				
4, Yacilitie	181 Cook			Boot	•	
5. Pacilitie	e clean and samite	ary? Good X	7818	/***		
		Fair 1		_		
7. Are enime	le properly segre	sated? Yes X	_ Ho	;		
S. Total hou	re animale exhibit	ted or worked each	day? 3	hours.		
9 Condition	and health of an	imals? Good X	Pair	Poq	·	-
10 1-0 10-00	steb ee tolu	red animals? Yes	No .	Χ		
ID. Wie fuele	any veck ve auju	Lord Was	- N			
11. Are they	suspended from lat	bort Yes!	~ _<			
12. Are enime	le securely confir	ned? Yes X	No	ber)		
(Use reverse	olde to describe	irregularities - Ac	erer in una		•	
		OVER	:			

The Ame	rican Society for the	Preventio	n of Crue	Ity to Anim	Dis
26.60	Report of Com to 2035 has	plaint Inv	estigateu 	3-2	9-99
	the annexed complaint, as	nd report a			
		<u> </u>			
Arrida	dat madi	SON S	doces	d rgc	<u>N</u> .
~	and unspec	च्ते व	11 FPE	CHIM	سك
Contra	acted to the	- 72.12	عطاسم	105,0	<u>ر ود ن ح</u>
I De	s escorted b	م ملا	W.F.		
				<u> </u>	
				3541 AB.	
					garana y
					• 1 S., 1
	•	•		1 1 1 1 1	, and the second
					.43.4
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
•			garagas (n. 1924). Maria da Maria da Ma	3 3 3 4 3 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5	
				, as is to the state of	

רכש 151 אסאר 141 אס 151 אסאר					
Activity Card			;		长
Activity					
	-				
01-000318-1 INSPECTION/CIRCUS					
Total Animals: 0 Animal Typ	e: OTI	HER	<u>!</u>		
ionty Level: DAIDA		:			
cuvity Address: MADISON SQUARE GARDE MANHATTAN NY.	• •	; :	:		
ctivity Comment:	:				
educy Comments	11				
	<u>:</u>	:			
Caller Information:	; ;;	: .*		•	
	Γ	Result C	odes:]	
		:			
		•	•		
	:	:			
DOS POPOSI MAC DONALD Clerk: JUDITHC					
Omcer: 199021 Water 2000 ANA	!				
Call Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM New Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM	• •				
		•	13. 1		
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM	: .		<u> </u>		
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM				,, <u>-</u> -	
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM				,,	
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM				-	
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:	**				
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:					
Dispatch Date: 04/02/01 12:00 AM Working Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Complete Date: 04/03/01 12:00 AM Memo:				getes	







Investigation Report

		_		
Subject Data	Case # HOLOW 3/8	<u>C</u>	mplaint	
Name Ringling brot	hers		1+1	<u>E</u>
	vare garden			
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			į
Phone #	·	Co	mplainant Notif	ied? Yes No
				
Location Description	Inspection Sequence		40	
MSG- ARENA		ime:	1410	Disp. Code: A) VC
	_	ime:		Disp. Code:
	3. Date: T	ime:		Disp. Code:
Animal Data	, 			
Dog Cat Other \(\)	Color		Sex:Male V	/Female
Breed: See animal Lis	Markings:		ndition:	
Age:	Does Animal Require Medic			/No
Seizure #	Adoption #	Lo	ation	
Shelter Description:			<u> </u>	
Veterinarian Info:				i i
				:
Narrative:	0 1 (1)	1	3 - 0	ho is the
Arrived at boration.	ME MET WITH MAI	<u> </u>	INCO LY	No: 15 FILE
	circus Same esco			U . / C . NII
	nend think mas than	•	1	
List for all appeals	Picscut) NO INS			ection report
observed yets on			-	Lions whenve
Ct this time I am c	bring out this Cas	د٥	LAND OLA Z	A TOPE STORE FACE
			- 	<u> </u>
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		- 	
			<u> </u>	:
	<u></u>			
		<u> </u>		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
				Last Update 02/23/00

12123403031

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCLED UNIT ANIMAL CENSUS 2001

revised 1/19/01

(Finbas maxim	nz)	<u>;</u> :	<i>y</i>	
	-,	4	*	
	SEX	ORIGIN	<u> ID</u>	<u>WI</u>
·				
				7900
	-			8860
	-		•	9840
	_		:	7,840
	-			7120
	-		•	\$760
-	-	•		7800
		•		8880
	-			7900
	•			
	F	1		
	_		•	:
	_			
	-	·;		•
	F			i
	-			
•		,		:
	SEX	SPECIES	<u>COLOR</u>	:
		-	prown	033*305*845
		•	prown	033*562*065
	_		prown	033"630"872
•			provin	033*630*568
	•			i
	м	Bactrian	brown	!
- •		Dromedary	brown	:
	_		prown	;
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	brown	•
1997	M	DOM: MI		
				•
			. White	
•	•			• :
				:
	N/M	l	DI OMII	
(Bos mutus)				:
	(Elphas maxim 10 total DOB 1968 1957 1961 1957 1976 1984 1957 1978 1961 1984 1957 1978 1961 1984 1965 1965 1965 1965 1965 1965 1965 1965	DOB	10 total DOB	DOB

12123403031

(DDM 14:40 171					
			•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	:
			•		
•				:	!
Owned by Blake	2 total	_		B/W	
Betsy	1997	F		B/W	
Elly	1997	• F			; !
	(Equus caballu	s) .			:
Owned By RBBB	14 total	er:3/	BREED/COLOR	COTTA	i
NAME	DOB	SEX	Arabian/G/W	144	:
Flask	1985	S	Arabian/Grey	151	
Komandte	1988	S	Arabian/White	145	
Thunder	1986	S	Lipizzan/White	150	i :
Conversanoli Ahola	1988	S	Libraria wine		
ake "Siglevy"				1	
ConversanoII MedussaII			Lipizzan/Grey	1-1	i
aka "Duke"	1992	S S	Lipizzan/Grey	158	1
Conversanoli Reballi	1990		Lipizzan/White	748	· -
FavoryIV BersyII	1987	S	Lipizzan/White	578	
Garbo	1983	S	Lippizzan/Grey	119	
Maestoso AlabamaII	1992	. S	Lipizzan/Grey	3-Jan	•
Maestoso Edesanyal	1992	S	Lipizzan Grey		
aka "Sonny"			Lipizzan/Grey		!
Samson	1995	S S	Min ature	BAW	•
Champ	1997	S	Frieslan/Black		:
Artos.	1996	J	, ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,		
Owned by I. Garden	4 total 1997	S	Arabian/Gray		:
Emir	1998	S	Arabian/Gray	* 1	•
Rajah	1997	S	Arabian/Gray		
Sheik	1998	S	Arabian/Gray	• • · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Sultan	(Equus burch	_	•		
ZEBRAS		СШ)			CHIP#
Owned by RBBB	# total 4/2#/9#	NVM	Grants		3*121*341
Zero Trixie	8/6/99	F	Grants	1:	3*016*280
	8/3/99	N/M	Grants	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	3*567*829
Lima Geashi	9/9/99	NVM	Grants		3*633*065
Chad	8/27/99	N/M	Grants	03	3*623*825
Guines	\$/11/97	N/M	Grants		
	8/4/99	N/M	Grants	03	3*627 272
Mali	1998	NVM	Grants	:	i
Kenya	(Panthera bg				:
TIGERS	12 total	,			:
Owned by RBBB	DOB	<u>SEX</u>	BREED/COLOR	ORIGIN	
NAME Dalla	8/1/96	<u>527.</u> F	Bengal	B. Bonar, IN.	!
Della	8/1/96	M	Bengal	B Bonar, IN.	•
Flavio	0/ I/ 7V	***	Bengal	B Bonar, IN.	i

		17173483831		ASPLA		meace 21
29 /כש	1/2004 14:46					,
		•		•	;	: :
•			•	•	\$ 1	
			. •		•	
A						
	King	1990	М	Bengal	mgaryika Wildlife,KS	
	Madrass	1990	S/F	Bengal	leary Doorly Zoo, NE	•
lol	Mousy II	1983	F	Bengal	Law hlin, MI City Zoo	Sent back t
6	Narak	1993	M	Bengal	194 Fawthorn,IL	Clorida
	Princess	1990	F	Bengal	mga yika Wildlift,KS	
	Rambo	1986	M	Bongal	indar gered Species Fl	
	Rita	1986	F	Bengal	index gered Species F1	
	Saber	1990	NM	Bengal	icary Doorly Zoo, NE	
	Nala	Jun-95	F	Bengal	4 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
2	LEOPARD	(Panthers per	dus)			
	Owned byRBBB	1 total			; ;	
	Reno	Feb-95	M		1995 Atici ison Bros. FL.	•
	and American				.:	1

05/24/2004 14:4b

12123463031

HOMEH

PHUL 40



THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIM ALS

424 East 92nd Street New York, NY 10128 (212) 876-7700 Ext. 4450 (212) 534-8888 Fax

CIRCUS INSPECTION REPORT

				DATE	
NAME OF SHOW HINGING B	rothers.			<u> 4</u>	-a-01
LOCATION:		1-N			
WHAT TIME DID YOU ARRIVE?	Pe da	LEAVE?			
MORNING		:			
AFTERNOON:					
EVENING.			·		
ANY MISTREATMENT OF OR CRU	JELTY TO	yes 🛘		NO 🗹	<u>, </u>
ANY ANIMALS INJURED?		YES 🗆	1	NO W	
ANY INCIDENTS?		YES 🗆		NO 🛂	
FACILITIES? GOOD	V	fair 🗆		POOR	
FACILITIES CLEAN AND SANITARY? GOOD		FAIR 🗆		POOR	
FOOD AND WATER?		FAIR 🗆	: !-	POOR	
ARE ANIMALS PROPERLY SEGR		YES D		№П	
TOTAL HOURS ANIMALS EXHIB	ITED OR WORKE	DEACH DAY?			HOURS
CONDITION AND HEALTH OF A	VIMALS?	OOD S	FAIR 🗆	1	POOR 🗆
ARE THERE ANY SICK OR INJUR		YES 🗹		NO	
ARE THEY SUSPENDED FROM L	ABOR?	YES 🗆		NO [Y	
ARE ANIMALS SECURELY CONF	INED?	YES 🗹	-	NO [
				· · · · · · ·	

12123463631 14:46 85/24/2004 Achvity Card CITATION NO: INSPECTION / CDR/RX/SHO \$2-001028-1 Case # Animal Type: OTHER Total Animals: Priority Level: DAILY MADISON SQUARE GARDE MANHATTAN NY entivity Address. CIRCUS INSPECTION OF ALL ANIMALS Carrity Comment: er Information: RINGLING BROTHERS 24106 MADISON SQUARE GARDE BLUE EDITION NY NO PHONE Oler Information: Result Codes: JUDITHC Clerk. P990002 MAC DONALD c. Agent / Investigator: Date 03/21/02 12:00 AM Dall Date: 03/21/02 12:00 AM Date: 03/21/02 12:00 AM lipatch Date: 03/21/02 10:40 AM Working Date: 03/21/02 11:30 AM Complete Date:

20/02 SA arrived at Madsion Square Garden where SA met with one Alex Vargas super in charge who escorted SA provided and alert no injuries found on any lephanis and ample and water provided. There are 2 animals not being used in the show 1 camel w/a slight temp and a tiger with her citib. All others are used in the show all kept secure with clean cages and clean water no injuries. See arrached form closed(jc).

actoardo.rpt SS 3/00

05/24/2004 14:4	6 12123483031	ASPUA	. •	, mor
	PALEVE	THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE INTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS		20.7
2. de cabett	e C	OMPLAINT FORM		. ·
ATE REC'D:	1	ECTO BY:	P0200	1028
OMPLAINANT (MI		ALE		
OME/WORK ADD		OROUGH:	CROSS STREE	r,
PT.#: ELEPHONE # (HO		W ·	RK):	
OLATION CODE				
LLEGED COMPL	AINT (PCUS T	usfection	of all ani	mals
SUBJECT'S NAME NAME OF BUSINE	Jone CE.	ing Snos	1 .	· ·
EDDRESS:			gitico	
PT.#:	Mad won	BOROUGH: W.	CROSS STRE	ET
TELEPHONE #:	,			
ADDITIONAL INF	ORMATION FOR AGE	VT: Check el	ethouts.	
				Last Update 02/23/00

05/24/2004 14:46 12123483031

ASPCA

PHOE 31



	Case # A020	1028 Comila	int Cineus	THP.
ubject Data			•	
111111111111111111111111111111111111111		pirios)		
Address Madison	w Square 9ard	<u> </u>		
YEU FU			int Notified? Yes	No
Phone # 941- 350-66	16		Time:	
		Date:	1 ime:	:
Description	Inspection Sequence	e		
Location Description	1. Date: 3-21-6	er: 1.1	Disp	Code: us#
Mudical Squar Cox	2. Date:	Time:		. Code:
	3. Date:	Time:	Disj	Code:
	J. Date.			
Animal Data Dog Cat Othe	Color	S	x:Male/F	emale
D0g	Markings:	Cond	ion: 900	4
Breed:	Does Animal Requ			1 -
Age:	Adoption #	Locat		•
Seizure #	Adoption #			
Shelter Description:				
Veterinarian Info. DR. L.	Mrd paber	on site		
	1		·	·
Narrative:	N Square garde	u where I	met with	OM ALEK
			dpont en	Line Circus
		./8 }_M		
10.00	ands mps excor	and is three	E. NO INT	wice for
Jarges Supr in ch	HE Secure call !	oright + alex	END INZ	There GIE
Jarges Super in ch area, all animal a on any electronis	one apple for	oright + Gler	Provided	There GIE
10.00	one and the	oright + alex 1 + water 5 how 1 Ca	Resided,	There are
Larges Supr in ch area, all animal a en any electronis a animals no ber and a tiger with	ing used in the	oright + alex	Provided, Mel wya a are use	There GIE Slight tems din the St
Larges Supr in ch area, all animal a en any electronis a animals no ber and a tiger with	ing used in the	oright + alex	Provided, Mel wya a are use	There GIE Slight tems din the St
Larges Supr in ch area, all animal a en any electronis a animals no ber and a tiger with	ing used in the	oright + alex	Provided, Mel wya a are use	There GIE Slight tems din the St
Larges Supr in ch area, all animal a en any electronis a animals no ber and a tiger with	ing used in the	oright + alex	Provided, Mel wya a are use	There GIE Slight tems din the St
Jarges Super in the area, all animals and a tiger will and a tiger will and alligators the all all all all all all all all all al	ing used in the th her new Cul 30 mins a day which are being	me clas of the control of the contro	Provided, Mel wy a sorved & sorved & structured & Livelics	There are Slight tem din the st what Snak What Snak
Larges Supr in ch area, all animals an any electronis a animals no ber and a tiger with	inals with the	oright + Gler Show 1 Cr Show 1 Cr Show 1 Cr Used in the Used in the C Show 1	Provided, Mel uya De use Schow a Liveics. Liveics.	There are Slight tem din the St wood Snow Where So Bec att, DVM is tenson b

GYG 3/1/01 11:53 AM 1
424 East 92nd Street, New York, NY 10128-6804 Tel: (212)876-7710 www.aspca.org

Case No. AD2-00/02 Ringling Bros. (18CU) (18) Le edition) Dele Phants Dele Phants Tiges	-8
Ringling Bros. (1800) Total de carinnols OclePhanits S. Tigers 3. Zebra's. 4. AlPaca's. 4. Hallander Cours. E-Mini donxeys Mini Paries	
Deleghants Deleghants Tigees Tigees - Claca's - Claca's - highlander laws - mini dankeys - mini dankeys	
Ciele Phants Ciele Phants Tigees Cieles Ci	
Bta O OF GRUNDS Dele Phants Tises - Zebra's - Alfaca's - highlander laws - highlander laws - Mini dankeys - Mini dankeys	
Relephants Tigers Zebra's Coats - highlander laws Mini dankeys Mini dankeys	
gelethants Tiges Zebra's Coats Coats Mini donxeys Mini Tonies	
Gelethants Tiges Zebra's Coats Chiphapder Couss Mini donxeys Mini donxeys	
Z=bra's. - alpaca's. - Coats - highlander lows. - Mini dankeys - Mini Paries	
2. Tigers 2. Zebra's. 2. ClPaca's. 2. Coats 2. Lightander Cours. 2. Mini donkeys. 3. Mini donkeys.	
- Clacks - Coats - Lighlander Cours Mini dankers - Mini Janues	
1- alfaca's. 1- acts 1- highlander lauss. 1- Mini dankeys 1- Mini fances	
e-Goats - highlander Cours. e-Mini donkeys e-Mini Panies	
- highlander Cours. - Mini donkeys - Mini Ponies	
- Mini donkeys	
2- MINI TONIES	
e- Mini Tonies	
9-7-douks	
and it Courts	
1- horses (Rusiaus)	
9- arabians	
8-alligators	
6. Rulhous.	
t - Maritat Lizard	
TOTAL OF (76) animals in Show	
TOTAL OF CE	

0	5/24/2004	14:46
	alono	90
		ر ا
5	rac	K.
	ASPC	A
	E	Ž
	1000	8

12123483031 ASPCA

102001028

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO AN IMALS

424 East 92nd Street New York, NY 10128 (212) 876-7700 Ext 44 (212) 534-8888 Fax

CIRCUS INSPECTION REPORT

CINC	Blue and	" Eq. Tra	DATE
NAME OF SHOW:	ros Pircos		3-21-01
LOCATION:	garden.	LEAVE?	
WHAT TIME DID YOU AF	O. C.		
MORNING:	The second secon	1 Fe Tick	er w/ cobs
AFTERNOON:		1 Cam	1 NOT IN Show
EVENING:		-	NO D
ANY MISTREATMENT CANIMALS?		YES -	NO D
ANY ANIMALS INJURE): 	YES [NO M
ANY INCIDENTS?	ASS		
FACILITIES?	GOOD Z	FAIR .	POOR -
FACILITIES CLEAN AND SANITARY?	GOOD W	FAIR 🗆	POOR D
FOOD AND WATER!	GOOD M	FAIR [NO NO
ARE ANIMALS PROPE	LS EXHIBITED OR WOL	YES M	7701705
TOTAL HOURS ANIMA CONDITION AND HEA	TH OF ANIMALS?	GOOD M	FAIR POOR
CONDITION AND HEA	OR INJURED ANIMAL		№ □
ARE THEY SUSPENDE	D FROM LABOR?	YES W	NO []
ARE ANIMALS SECUR	ELY CONFINED?	YES 🗹	NO [