UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

:

Plaintiffs,

.

v. : Case No. 03-2006 (EGS/JMF)

:

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

.

Defendants.

ciciidants.

MOTION TO COMPEL DOCUMENTS SUBPOENAED FROM THE WILDLIFE ADVOCACY PROJECT AND MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF

EXHIBIT 9

O AO88 (Rev. 1/94) Subpoena in a Civil Case

CT COURT

ä	issued by the	
	UNITED STATES DISTRIC	
	DISTRICT OF	

	DISTRICT OF	District of Colun	nbia .
ASPCA et al.		SUBPOENA IN A	CIVIL CASE
v.			•
Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Circus, et al.	Case Number: 103-2006 (EGS)		
TO: Wildlife Advocacy Project 1601 Connecticut Avenue N.W., Suite 700 Washington, DC 20009			
YOU ARE COMMANDED to appear in the U testify in the above case.	Jnited States Distric	t court at the place, d	
PLACE OF TESTIMONY			COURTROOM
			DATE AND TIME
YOU ARE COMMANDED to appear at the pl in the above case.	ace, date, and time	specified below to tes	stify at the taking of a deposition
PLACE OF DEPOSITION			DATE AND TIME
YOU ARE COMMANDED to produce and per place, date, and time specified below (list docu See attached Exhibit A	rmit inspection and iments or objects):	copying of the follow	ving documents or objects at the
	·		DATE AND TIME
PLACE Covington & Burling, 1201 Pennsylvania Ave. NW	, Washington, DC	20004	August 12, 2005
YOU ARE COMMANDED to permit inspection	on of the following	premises at the date	and time specified below.
PREMISES			DATE AND TIME
Any organization not a party to this suit that is subj directors, or managing agents, or other persons who co the matters on which the person will testify. Federal R	insent to testify on it	s benam, and may see	designate one or more officers, orth, for each person designated,
ASSUING OFFICERIS SIGNATURE AND TITLE (INDICATE IF A	TTORNEY FOR PLAIN	TIFF OR DEFENDANT)	DATE
by Attorney For 1	July 26, 2005		
ISSUING OFFICERIS NAME, ADDRESS AND PHONE NUMBER Joshua Wolson, Covington & Burling, 1201 Penns		Washington, DC 200	04, (202) 662-6000

(See Rule 45, Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Parts C & D on next page)

f action is pending in district other than district of issuance, state district under case number.

AO 88 (Rev. 1/94) Subpoena in a Civil Case PROOF OF SERVICE PLACE DATE SERVED MANNER OF SERVICE SERVED ON (PRINT NAME) TITLE SERVED BY (PRINT NAME) **DECLARATION OF SERVER** I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing information contained in the Proof of Service is true and correct. Executed on

Date

Signature of Server

Address of Server

RULE 45, Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Part C & D: (c) PROTECTION OF PERSONS SUBJECT TO SUBPOENAS.

- (1) A party or an attorney responsible for the issuance and service of a subpoena shall take reasonable steps to avoid imposing undue burden or expense on a person subject to that subpoena. The court on behalf of which the subpoena was issued shall enforce this duty and impose upon the party or attorney in breach of this duty an appropriate sanction which may include, but is not limited to, lost earnings and reasonable attorney's
- (A) A person commanded to produce and permit Inspection and copying of designated books, papers, documents or tangible things, or inspection of premises need not appear in person at the place of production or inspection unless commanded to appear for deposition. hearing or trial.
- (B) Subject to paragraph (d) (2) of this rule, a person (B) Subject to paragraph (d) (2) of this rule, a person commanded to produce and permit inspection and copying may, within 14 days after service of subpoena or before the time specified for compliance if such time is less than 14 days after service, serve upon the party or attorney designated in the subpoena written objection to inspection or copying of any or all of the designated materials or of the premises, if objection is made, the party serving the subpoena shall not be entitled to inspect and copy materials or inspect the premises except pursuant to an order of the court by which the subpoena was issued, if objection has been made, the party Serving the subpoena may, upon notice to the person commanded to produce, move at any time for an order to compel the production. Such an order to compel production shall protect any person who Is not a party or an officer of a party from significant expense resulting from the inspection and copying commanded. and copying commanded.
- (3) (A) On timely motion, the court by which a subpoena was issued shall quash or modify the subpoena if it
 - (i) fails to allow reasonable time for compliance:
- (ii) requires a person who is not a party or an officer of a party to travel to a place more than 100 miles from the place where that

person resides, Is employed or regularly transacts business in person resides, is employed or regularly transacts business in person, except that, subject to the provisions of clause (c)(3) (B) (iii) of this rule, such a person may In order to attend trial be commanded to travel from any such place within the state in which the trial Is held, or

(iii) requires disclosure of privileged or other protected matter and no exception or waiver applies. or

(vi) subjects a person to undue burden.

(B) If a subpoena

(i) requires disclosure of a trade secret or other confidential

(i) requires disclosure of a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial Information, or (ii) requires disclosure of an un-retained expert's opinion or information not describing specific events or occurrences in dispute and resulting from the expert's study made not at the request of any party, or (iii) requires a person who is not a party or an officer of a party to incur substantial expense to travel more than 100 miles to attend trial, the court may, to protect a person subject to or affected by the subpoena, quash or modify the subpoena, or, if the party in whose behalf the subpoena is issued shows a substantial need for the testimony or material that Cannot be otherwise met without undue hardship and assures that the person to whom the subpoena is addressed will be reasonably compensated, the court may order appearance or production only upon specified conditions.

(d) DUTIES IN RESPONDING TO SUBPOENA.

- A person responding to a subpoena to produce documents shall produce them as they are kept in the usual course of business or shall organize and label them to correspond with the categories in the demand.
- (2) when information subject to a subpoena is withheld on a claim that it is privileged or subject to protection as trial preparation materials, the claim shall be made expressly and shall be supported by a description of the nature of the documents, communications, or things not produced that is sufficient to enable the demanding party to contest the claim.

EXHIBIT A TO SUBPOENA

I. DEFINITIONS

- 1. "Defendant" means Feld and Ringling Bros., as those terms are defined herein.
- 2. "Document" is defined to be synonymous and equal in scope to usage of this term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a). A copy or duplicate of a document which has any non-conforming notes, marginal annotations, or other markings, and any preliminary version, draft, or revision of the foregoing is a separate document within the meaning of this term. Documents include, by way of example only, any memorandum, letter, envelope, correspondence, electronic mail, report, note, Post-It, message, telephone message, telephone log, diary, journal, calendar, minutes, working paper, financial report, accounting report, work papers, teletype message, facsimile, directory, computer disk or tape, or video or audio recording such as a tape, CD, or DVD. Documents also include the file, folder tabs, and labels appended to or containing any documents.
- 2. "Feld" means Feld Entertainment, Inc., any of its current or former employees, consultants, agents, attorneys, directors, other representatives, and all other persons acting under their control or on their behalf.
- 3. "Litigation" means this case, captioned American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals et al. v. Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Circus, et al., No. 03-2006 (EGS) (D.D.C).
- 4. "Plaintiffs" refers to the plaintiffs in this action: the American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals, the Fund for Animals, the Animal Welfare Institute, and Tom Rider.

- 5. The phrase "refer, reflect, or relate to" is used as a means of requesting information or documents that constitute, comprise, consist of, contain, evidence, set forth, propose, show, disclose, describe, discuss, mention, explain, summarize, reflect, deal with, identify, analyze, demonstrate, or in any way address, involve, regard, pertain to, touch upon, affect, or concern, in whole or in part, the subject matter of the relevant request for production.
- 6. "Ringling Bros." means Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Circus, any of its current or former employees, consultants, agents, attorneys, directors, other representatives, and all other persons acting under their control or on their behalf.
 - 7. "You" and "Your" refer to the Wildlife Advocacy Project.

II. INSTRUCTIONS

- 1. All documents shall be produced in the order they are kept in the ordinary course of business, and shall be produced in their original folders, binders, covers or containers, or facsimile thereof.
- 2. These requests relate to all documents which are in your possession, custody or control.
- 3. You shall produce the original of each document described below or if the original is not in your custody, then a copy thereof.
- 4. If production of documents is withheld on the ground of privilege, please provide sufficiently particular information regarding the alleged privileged communication in a privilege log on the date on which the documents are produced.
- 5. Whenever a document is not produced in full or is produced in redacted form, so indicate on the document and state with particularity the reason(s) it is not being produced in full and describe with particularity those portions of the document not being produced.

- 6. If a document responsive to these requests was at any time in your possession, custody or control but is no longer available for production, as to each document state the following information:
 - a. whether the document is missing or lost;
 - b. whether the document has been destroyed;
 - c. whether the document has been transferred or delivered to another person and, if so, at whose request;
 - d. whether the document has been otherwise disposed of, and
 - e. the circumstances surrounding the disposition of the document and the date of its disposition.

III. RELEVANT TIME PERIOD

Unless otherwise indicated, these requests relate to the period between January 1, 1996, and the present (the "relevant time period"). Your responses should reflect information for that entire period. Where your responses relate to only a portion of that period, indicate the dates to which your responses relate.

IV. REQUESTS FOR THE PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS REQUEST NO. 1:

All documents that refer, reflect, or relate to Defendant or any of Defendant's current or former employees, consultants, agents, attorneys, directors, or other representatives.

REQUEST NO. 2:

All documents that refer, reflect, or relate to Tom Rider, including without limitation all correspondence with or about Mr. Rider, all documents that reflect anything of value, whether monetary or in kind, requested by or on behalf of, given to, directed to, or made at the direction of Mr. Rider, all documents that relate to the purpose of any payments made to or requested by

Mr. Rider, all documents that relate to any payments received, requested, or solicited by You or on Your behalf for purposes of paying Mr. Rider, funding any activities to be undertaken by Mr. Rider, or funding any activities relating to Defendant or any other circus.

REQUEST NO. 3:

All documents that refer, reflect, or relate to anything of value, whether monetary or in kind, requested by, on behalf of, or received from any of the Plaintiffs.

REQUEST NO. 4:

All documents that refer, reflect, or relate to the Litigation.

REQUEST NO. 5:

All documents that refer, reflect, or relate to any communications of any kind, whether in person, by telephone, letter, facsimile, e-mail, or other form, with any other animal advocate or animal advocacy organization, as that term is used in Plaintiffs' Initial Disclosures (a copy of which is attached at Exhibit B).

EXHIBIT B

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al., Plaintiffs,))) Civ. No. 00-01641 (EGS)
v.)
RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,)
Defendants.)
	<u> </u>

PLAINTIFFS' INITIAL DISCLOSURES PURSUANT TO RULE 26(a)(1) OF THE FEDERAL RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE

Plaintiffs hereby submit their Initial Disclosures pursuant to Rule 26(a)(1) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and the parties' Stipulated Pre-trial Schedule. Plaintiffs reserve the right to amend or supplement these disclosures as discovery proceeds.

I. Rule 26(a)(1)(A) Disclosures

To date, plaintiffs have identified the following individuals likely to have discoverable information that plaintiffs may use to support their claims in this case. Although plaintiffs have not yet determined which of these individuals they will use to support their claims, plaintiffs "may" use any of them. If as discovery proceeds plaintiffs determine that they will definitely not be relying on a particular witness, or they identify additional individuals who may serve as witnesses, they will supplement these disclosures accordingly.

Although plaintiffs have made all reasonable efforts to determine addresses and phone numbers of the individuals on this list, some addresses and phone numbers remain unknown to plaintiffs at this time. If and when plaintiffs determine the remaining addresses and phone numbers, they will supplement these disclosures accordingly.

Name

Address/Description of Testimony

Private Sector (non Feld Entertainment employees):

Deniz Bolbol

P.O. Box 5656

Redwood City, CA 94063

650-654-9955

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling Brothers and Barnum & Bailey ("Ringling" or "Ringling Brothers")

elephants; videographer

Carol Buckley

c/o the Elephant Sanctuary 183 Buck Hollow Road,

Hohenwald, Tennessee 38462

931-796-6500

Knowledge of use of ankus, chaining, and other

mistreatment of circus elephants

Joseph Patrick Cuviello

P.O. Box 2834

Redwood City, CA 94064

650-369-5533

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants;

videographer

Tracey DeMartini

245-M Mt. Hermon Rd. #276

Scotts Valley, CA 95066

510-601-1807

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants;

videographer

Pat Derby

c/o Performing Animal Welfare Society

P.O. Box 849 Galt, CA 95632 209-745-1809

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants;

knowledge of use of ankus, chaining, and mistreatment of

circus elephants; videographer

Information bearing on credibility of Feld Entertainment

Linda Fasso

34 Congressional Court Las Vegas, NV 89113

702-876-4763

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants

Joyce Friedman

c/o People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals

501 Front St.

Norfolk, VA 23510 757-622-7382

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants; knowledge of use of ankus and mistreatment of circus

elephants

Jane Garrison

357 Anchor Circle

Mt. Pleasant, South Carolina 29464

Knowledge of use of ankus and mistreatment of circus

elephants

Dr. L.G. Gayle

Texas Veterinary Medical Diagnostic Laboratory

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, Ringling Brothers' violations of the Animal

Welfare Act

Barbara Grove

current address unknown

650-430-0989

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants;

videographer

Carol Haft

c/o Performing Animal Welfare Society

P.O. Box 849 Galt, CA 95632 209-745-1809

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants

Colleen Kinzley

General Curator, Oakland Zoo

P.O. Box 5238 Oakland, CA 94605

510-632-9525

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of elephants, Ringling violations of the Animal Welfare Act

Alfredo Kuba

500 W. Middlefield Rd, #178 Mountain View, CA 94043

650-965-8705

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants;

videographer

Florence Lambert

c/o The Elephant Alliance 6255 Cardeno Drive, La Jolla, California 92037

858-454-4959

Knowledge of use of ankus, chaining, and mistreatment of

circus elephants

Linda Landrus

current address unknown

Knowledge of use of ankus, chaining, and mistreatment of

circus elephants

William Lawler

and family

34 Big Lake Circle Huntsville, TX

Eye-witnesses to use of ankus on Ringling elephants, other

practices that harm elephants

Michael Copeland

Moore

current address unknown (Texas)

Veterinarian with knowledge of circumstances of death of

Ringling elephant named Benjamin

Miyun Park

Compassion over Killing

P.O. Box 9773

Washington, D.C. 20016

301-891-2458

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants

Dr. Joel Parrott

Executive Director, Oakland Zoo

P.O. Box 5238

Oakland, CA 94605

510-632-9525

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, Ringling Brothers' violations of the Animal

Welfare Act

Jim Parsons

WTAE-TV

400 Ardmore Blvd. Pittsburgh, PA 15221

Eye-witness to use of ankus on Ringling elephants

Jan Pottker

10104 Lloyd Road Potomac, MD 20854

Information bearing on credibility of Feld Entertainment

Ed Stewart

c/o Performing Animal Welfare Society

P.O. Box 849 Galt. CA 95632 209-745-1809

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants; videographer; information bearing on credibility of Feld

Entertainment

Betsy Swart

10 State Street

Newburyport, MA 01950

978-352-2589

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants

Feld Entertainment Employees (Former):

Nicole Adrian

San Marcos, California

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Gary Boyle

current address unknown (last known address: Iowa)

Eye-witness to use of ankus on Ringling elephants, other

practices that harm elephants

Dave Brown

current address unknown

GS Document 86-4 Filed 09/07

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices that harm elephants

Joshua Dunievy

current address unknown

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Timothy Eaton

current address unknown

Handler who used ankus on elephants, eye-witness to other use of ankus on elephants and other practices that harm

elephants

Dennis Ferguson

current address unknown

Eye-witness to chaining of elephants, other practices that

harm elephants

Neill Fillhart

current address unknown

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Clair George

5026 Allan Road

Bethesda, MD 20816

Information bearing on credibility of Feld Entertainment

David Gorman

current address unknown

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Adam Hill

current address unknown

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other

ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Dr. Richard Houck

current address unknown

Knowledgeable about wounds, injuries, diseases of animals; care and treatment provided; conditions under which Ringling elephants maintained; breeding difficulties

Ted Huddleston

current address unknown

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

current address unknown Joel Kaplan

Information bearing on credibility of Feld Entertainment,

condition of Ringling elephants

current address unknown Steve Kendall

Information bearing on credibility of Feld Entertainment

current address unknown (last known address - Tennessee) Rob Lyle

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants

Dave MacFarland current address unknown

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other

ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

current address unknown . Charles Meek

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

current address unknown John Noonan

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

current address unknown Gary Oxidine

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

c/o 600 East Holland Street Tom Rider

Washington, IL 61571

309-444-3782

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants;

videographer

600 East Holland Street Tracie Rider

Washington, IL 61571

309-444-3782

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Abel Rivera

current address unknown

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Charles Smith

current address unknown

Information bearing on credibility of Feld Entertainment

Ryan Dixie Smith

Corpus Christi, TX

817-271-6865

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Tod Sites

current address unknown

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Kelly Tansy

1829 West Gardner

Spokane, WA 99201

509-327-5988

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants

Gary West

San Antonio Zoo

3903 N. St. Mary's Street

San Antonio, TX 78212-3199

Knowledgeable about wounds, injuries, diseases of

animals; care and treatment provided; conditions under

which Ringling elephants maintained

Dave Whaley

current address unknown

Handler/trainer who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness

to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Ted White

current address unknown

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

John Wiedenhofer, Jr.

current address unknown

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Dave Wiley

current address unknown

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Feld Entertainment Employees (Current):

Brian Christiani

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler/trainer who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Robin Curry

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Kenneth Feld

Feld Entertainment

9609 Halter Court Potomac, MD 20854

703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants; familiar with United States Department of Agriculture ("USDA") investigations

Michael Fitzpatrick

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182

Eye-witness to use of ankus one elephants, other practices that harm elephants

Mark Oliver Gebel

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Trainer/handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Scott Green

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; witness to mistreatment of elephants

Katia Harned

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices that harm elephants

Patrick Harned

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Trainer/handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants; involved in death of elephant named Benjamin

Steve Hart

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Sara Houcke

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Trainer who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Sasha Houcke

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Trainer who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

John Jamieson

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants; other practices that harm elephants

Gary Jacobson

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler/trainer who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Jeff James

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

David Kiser

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants; other practices that harm elephants

William Lindsay

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Knowledgeable about wounds, injuries, diseases of animals, care and treatment provided, conditions under

which Ringling elephants maintained

Scott Martin

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other

ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Angela Martin

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Troy Metzler

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Trainer who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other

ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Randy Peterson

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Trainer/handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Jeff Pettigrew

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

P

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Daniel Raffo

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Robert Ridley

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Tony Rodriguez

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

David Solove

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Jeffrey Steele

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Steve Thomas

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

Alex Vargas

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler who uses ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other

ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Andy Weller

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Handler who used ankus on elephants; eye-witness to other

ankus use and other practices that harm elephants

Vernon Walton

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

James Williams

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to practices that harm and harass elephants

Todd Zimmerman

c/o Feld Entertainment

8607 Westwood Center Drive

Vienna, VA 22182 703-448-4000

Eye-witness to use of ankus on elephants, other practices

that harm elephants

State/Local Government Employees:

Gary Bain

Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services

Division of Consumer Services

2005 Apalachee Parkway, Rhodes Building

Tallahassee, FL 32399-6500

850-922-2966

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment and condition of

Ringling elephants

Dr. Leroy Coffman

Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services

Division of Consumer Services

2005 Apalachee Parkway, Rhodes Building

Tallahassee, FL 32399-6500

850-922-2966

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment and condition of

Ringling elephants

Don Donce

Santa Clara Humane Society

2530 Lafayette Street Santa Clara, CA 95050

408-727-3383

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Christine Franco

Santa Clara Humane Society

2530 Lafayette Street Santa Clara, CA 95050

408-727-3383

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants;

knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants; photographer

Kimberly Flores

Humane Society Silicon Valley

2530 Lafayette Street Santa Clara, CA 95050

408-727-3383

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Bureau of Animal Disease Control

Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services

Division of Consumer Services

2005 Apalachee Parkway, Rhodes Building

Tallahassee, FL 32399-6500

850-922-2966

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment and condition of

Ringling elephants

Marcia Mayeda

Santa Clara Humane Society

2530 Lafayette Street Santa Clara, CA 95050

408-727-3383

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants; videographer

Dr. Janet Payeur

National Veterinary Services Laboratories, Florida

c/o APHIS

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment and condition of

Ringling elephants

Teri Reeve

Santa Clara Humane Society

2530 Lafayette Street Santa Clara, CA 95050

408-727-3383

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Darrell Revier

Santa Clara Humane Society

2530 Lafayette Street Santa Clara, CA 95050

408-727-3383

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Dr. Warner

Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services

Division of Consumer Services

2005 Apalachee Parkway, Rhodes Building

Tallahassee, FL 32399-6500

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment and condition of

Ringling elephants

Barbara Wallace

Santa Clara Humane Society

2530 Lafayette Street Santa Clara, CA 95050

408-727-3383

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Lanette Williams

San Jose Police Department 201 West Mission Street San Jose, CA 95110

Eye-witness to mistreatment of Ringling elephants; knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Kelly Zantow

Santa Clara Humane Society

2530 Lafayette Street Santa Clara, CA 95050

408-727-3383

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Federal Government Employees:

Miava Binkley

USDA, Florida

c/o Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer

Services

Division of Consumer Services

2005 Apalachee Parkway, Rhodes Building

Tallahassee, FL 32399-6500

850-922-2966

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, condition of elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act; photographed Doc and Angelica

Robert Brandes

USDA, Florida

c/o Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer

Services

Division of Consumer Services

2005 Apalachee Parkway, Rhodes Building

Tallahassee, FL 32399-6500

850-922-2966

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment and condition of Ringling elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal

Welfare Act

Dr. Tom Callahan

USDA

1400 Independence Avenue, SW

Washington, D.C. 20250

202-720-2791

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, Ringling's lack of medical records concerning

elephants

Kristina Cox

USDA Eastern Region

920 Main Campus Drive Raleigh, NC 27606

919-716-5618

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act

Ron DeHaven

USDA

1400 Independence Avenue, SW

Washington, D.C. 20250

202-720-2791

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act

Jacqueline Freeman

USDA

1400 Independence Avenue, SW

Washington, D.C. 20250

202-720-2791

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act

Elizabeth Goldentyer

United States Department of Agriculture

Eastern Region

920 Main Campus Drive Raleigh, NC 27606 919-716-5618

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act

David Green

USDA

P.O. Box 6258

Fort Worth, TX 76115-6258

817-885-6922

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act

Meredith Jones

USDA, Investigative and Enforcement Services

c/o APHIS

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act

Frank Keyser

USDA, Investigative and Enforcement Services

c/o APHIS

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

John Kinsella

USDA **APHIS**

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Barbara Kohn

USDA **APHIS**

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act Samual Santiago

USDA

c/o APHIS

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act

Michael Smith

USDA

c/o APHIS

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Diane Ward

USDA

c/o APHIS

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling

elephants

Dr. Dave Warner

USDA

c/o APHIS

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment and condition of

Ringling elephants

Charles Willey

USDA, IES

P.O. Box 171

Avoca, WI 53506

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment and condition of

Ringling elephants

Neil W. Williamson

USDA

c/o APHIS

4700 River Road, Unit 85 Riverdale, MD 20737

Knowledge of evidence of mistreatment of Ringling elephants, Ringling's violations of the Animal Welfare Act

II. Rule 26(a)(1)(B) Disclosures

To date, plaintiffs have in their possession, custody, or control documents and other tangible items in the following categories that plaintiffs may use to support their claims in this case. The inclusion of records in these disclosures shall not be construed to waive either the attorney-client or the work product privileges generally or with respect to any particular records.

All of the documents and other items on this list are located at the offices of plaintiffs' counsel: Meyer & Glitzenstein, 1601 Connecticut Avenue, NW, Suite 700, Washington, D.C., 20009.

- Records related to Feld Entertainment, Ringling Brothers, and Ringling Brothers' 1. elephants, that were provided to plaintiffs by the United States Department of Agriculture in response to Freedom of Information Act requests submitted by plaintiffs. This includes but is not limited to memoranda, inspection reports, correspondence, witness or expert statements, photographs, and other materials in the possession of the USDA.
- Pleadings, exhibits, and correspondence related to ASPCA v. USDA, Civ. No. 01-2. 02628 (D.D.C.) (RJL) (Freedom of Information Act case).
- September 2003 report prepared by plaintiffs entitled "Government Sanctioned 3. Abuse: How the United States Department of Agriculture Allows Ringling Brothers Circus to Systematically Mistreat Elephants," and all documents associated with that report and contained therein.
- Documents prepared by or for Ringling Brothers, including: Ringling Brothers' 4. applications to U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service for export and re-import of elephants and other animals to foreign countries; Ringling Brothers' comments on USDA/APHIS draft policy on training and handling of dangerous animals; Ringling Brothers' news releases, web site material, and other materials for public dissemination; Ringling Brothers' "elephant inventory;" survey prepared for Feld Entertainment concerning public views on a ban of circus animal acts.
- Documents related to Ringling Brothers' performances in Mexico City, and 5. export and re-import of elephants associated therewith.
- Miscellaneous other documents related to Ringling Brothers' use and treatment of 6. elephants.

- Correspondence between animal advocates (including plaintiffs) and the USDA 7. concerning Ringling Brothers' compliance with the Animal Welfare Act, and evidence or records associated with that correspondence.
- Correspondence between animal advocates (including plaintiffs) and Feld 8. Entertainment or the Department of Interior (Fish and Wildlife Service) concerning Feld/Ringling Brothers' violations of the Endangered Species Act, and evidence or records associated with that correspondence.
- Documents related to other circuses' use of elephants, including Clyde Beatty 9. Cole Brothers and King Royal Circus.
- Documents related to the presence of tuberculosis in circus elephants. 10.
- Documents related to legislative bans on use of animals in circuses in U.S. 11. jurisdictions and foreign jurisdictions.
- Documents related to captive elephant rampages, tramplings, and dangerous 12. captive elephant behavior.
- Documents related to H.R. 2929, a Bill entitled the "Captive Elephant Accident 13. Prevention Act," including testimony, media, fact sheets, and correspondence.
- Materials from USDA elephant inspection training courses, including but not 14. limited to: articles and documents related to elephant pathology and physiology, care and treatment of elephants, elephant training practices, elephant social and physical needs.
- Other documents related to the training of elephants in captivity, including but not 15. limited to: American Zoological Association guidelines; correspondence.
- General materials related to elephant behavior and physiology (both in captivity 16. and in the wild), including but not limited to scientific articles and reports.
- Additional materials concerning the behavior and physiology of elephants 17. submitted or obtained by plaintiffs' counsel in connection with In Defense of Animals v. Fish and Wildlife Service, Civ. No. 02-2068 (D.D.C.), and Born Free USA v. Norton, 278 F. Supp.2d 5 (D.D.C. Aug. 8, 2003), vacated.
- Fact sheets/reports concerning the use and treatment of elephants in circuses 18. (including Ringling Brothers Circus), and records underlying or associated with those fact sheets/reports.
- Letters in opposition to use of elephants in circuses. 19.

- - S Document 86-4 Filed 09/07
- Documents related to international elephant issues (e.g., Tuli baby elephants, 20. Loki)
- Pleadings, exhibits, and hearing transcripts in this case. 21.
- Pleadings and other documents related to Performing Animal Welfare Society v. 22. Feld Entertainment, Civ. No. 00-1259 (E.D. Cal.) (GEB).
- Media-related documents, including but not limited to: press releases produced 23. by plaintiffs; letters to the editor; articles concerning Ringling Brothers, its employees, or its treatment of elephants; articles concerning plaintiffs; articles concerning elephants in circuses or captivity in general; articles concerning elephants in the wild.
- Photographs from sources other than USDA of Ringling Brothers' elephants, 24. facilities, and bull hook.
- Video tapes, including: footage of Ringling Brothers' elephants, trainers, and 25. handlers; news stories concerning Ringling Brothers and its treatment of elephants; footage and news stories concerning other circuses' treatment of elephants.

Katherine A Meyer (D.C. Bar No. 24301) Kimberly D. Ockene (D.C. Bar No. 461191) Jonathan R. Lovvorn (D.C. Bar No. 461163) Eric R. Glitzenstein (D.C. Bar No. 358287)

MEYER & GLITZENSTEIN 1601 Connecticut Ave., NW, Suite 700 Washington, D.C. 20009 (202) 588-5206 fax: (202) 588-5049

Dated: January 30, 2004