UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

.

Plaintiffs,

:

v. : Case No. 03-2006 (EGS/JMF)

.

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

:

Defendants.

eichdants.

MOTION TO COMPEL DOCUMENTS SUBPOENAED FROM THE WILDLIFE ADVOCACY PROJECT AND MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF

EXHIBIT 44

PRIVILEGE LOG (Updated 6-29-06) WILDLIFE ADVOCACY PROJECT

Doc Type/Number	Date	Author/Originator	Recipient(s)	Description	Basis for Withholding
Custom Transaction Detail Report; Page #s 139-140	Current as of 9/30/05	Wildlife Advocacy Project	n/a	Reflects all relevant receipts of funding by WAP regarding Ringling Bros., elephants, and/or Tom Rider	Partial redaction: identities of non-plaintiff individual contributors withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter to contributor; Page # 141	1/5/04	Eric Glitzenstein	WAP contributor	Thank you letter for contribution	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter from contributor; Page # 142	12/30/03	Non-plaintiff contributor	WAP	Letter of support for work of Tom Rider	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter from contributor; Page # 143	1/31/04	Non-plaintiff contributor	WAP	Letter of support for work of Tom Rider and WAP	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds

Letter to contributor; Page # 148	Letter from contributor; Page # 147	Letter to contributor; Page # 146	Letter to contributor; Page # 144
1/2/04	1/31/04	2/17/04	3/15/04
Eric Glitzenstein	Non-plaintiff contributor	Eric Glitzenstein	Eric Glitzenstein
Non- plaintiff contributor	WAP	Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor
Thank you letter for contribution	Letter of support for Tom Rider and WAP	Thank you letter for contribution	Thank you letter for contribution
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter from contributor; Page # 149	3/2/04	Non-plaintiff contributor	WAP	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor
					withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter to contributor; Page #	5/6/04	Eric Glitzenstein	Non- plaintiff	Thank you for contribution	Partial redaction: identity and address of
150			contributor		non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter from contributor; Page #	4/30/04	Non-plaintiff contributor	WAP	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Partial redaction: identity and address of
151					non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First
Letter to contributor; Page #	6/7/04	Eric Glitzenstein	Non- plaintiff	Thank you for contribution	Partial redaction:
152			contributor		non-plaintiff individual contributor
					withheld on First Amendment grounds
					G S STATES

Letter from contributor; Page # 156	Letter from contributor; Page # 155	Letter to contributor; Page # 154	Letter from non- plaintiff contributor; Page # 153
9/1/04	6/29/04	7/9/04	undated
Non-plaintiff contributor	Non-plaintiff contributor	Eric Glitzenstein	Non-plaintiff contributor
WAP	WAP	Non- plaintiff contributor	WAP
Letter of support for Tom Rider	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Thank you for contribution	Letter of support for Tom Rider
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter to contributor; Page # 160	Letter from contributor; Page # 159	Letter from contributor; Page # 158	Letter from contributor; Page # 157
11/8/04	9/30/04	8/1/04	3/1/04
Eric Glitzenstein	Non-plaintiff contributor	Non-plaintiff contributor	Non-plaintiff contributor
Non- plaintiff contributor	WAP	WAP	WAP
Thank you for contribution	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Letter of support for Tom Rider
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Letter of support for Tom Rider	WAP	Non-plaintiff contributor	10/30/04	Letter from contributor; Page # 165-66
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Letter of support for Tom Rider	WAP	Non-plaintiff contributor	undated	Letter from contributor; Page # 164
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Thank you for contribution	Non- plaintiff contributor	Eric Glitzenstein	1/19/05	Letter to contributor; Page # 163
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Letter of support for Tom Rider	WAP	Non-plaintiff contributor	11/26/04	Letter from contributor; Page # 161-62

Letter to contributor; Page #	2/7/05	Eric Glitzenstein	Non- plaintiff	Thank you for contribution	Partial redaction: identity and address of
16/			contributor		non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter from contributor; Page # 168	1/27/05	Non-plaintiff contributor	WAP	Happy new year greeting and letter of support for Tom Rider	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff
					individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter to contributor; Page # 169	3/9/05	Eric Glitzenstein	Non- plaintiff contributor	Thank you for contribution	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff
					individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter from contributor; Page #	2/28/05	Non-plaintiff contributor	WAP	Thank you for contribution	Partial redaction: identity and address of
					individual contributor
					Amendment grounds.

Letter from contributor; Page # 174	Letter to contributor; Page # 173	Letter from 3 contributor; Page # 172	Letter to contributor; Page # 171
4/29/05	5/6/05	3/29/05	4/7/05
Non-plaintiff contributor	Eric Glitzenstein and Katherine Meyer	Non-plaintiff contributor	Eric Glitzenstein
WAP	Non- plaintiff contributor	WAP	Non- plaintiff contributor
Letter of support for Tom Rider	Thank you for contribution	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Thank you for contribution
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter from 7/20/05 Non-plaintiff contributor; Page # 178-179 Contributor	Letter to contributor; Page # 177	Letter from 5/28/05 Non-plaintiff contributor; Page # 176	Letter to 6/15/05 Eric Glitzenstein contributor; Page # 175
WAP	n Non- plaintiff contributor	WAP	n Non- plaintiff contributor
Letter of support for Tom Rider	Thank you for contribution	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Thank you for contribution
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter from 8/ contributor; Page # 183	Letter to 8/ contributor; Page # 182	Letter from 8/ contributor; Page # 181	Letter to 9/ contributor; Page # 180
8/1/05	8/16/05	8/28/05	9/12/05
Non-plaintiff contributor	Eric Glitzenstein	Non-plaintiff contributor	Eric Glitzenstein
WAP	Non- plaintiff contributor	WAP	Non- plaintiff contributor
Letter of support for Tom Rider and expressing hope that "compassion will prevail"	Thank you for contribution	Letter of support for Tom Rider and work of WAP	Thank you for contribution
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter to 11/3/03 contributor; Page #s 194-196	Letter to 4/19/04 contributor; Page # 193	Letter to contributor; Page # 192	Letter to 6/3/05 contributor; Page # 184
03 Katherine Meyer	04 Eric Glitzenstein	1/03 Katherine Meyer	Eric Glitzenstein
Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor
Thank you for contribution and description of Tom Rider media activities	Thank you for contribution	Thank you for contribution	Thank you for contribution
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter to 8/3/04 Ericontributor; Page # 201	Letter to 6/7/04 Eri contributor; Page # 200	Letter to 10/7/04 Ka contributor; Page # 199	Letter to 4/19/05 Ka contributor; Page #s 197-198
Eric Glitzenstein	Eric Glitzenstein	Katherine Meyer	Katherine Meyer
Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor
Thank you for contribution	Thank you for contribution	Thank you for contribution and description of Tom Rider activities	Thank you for contribution and description of Tom Rider activities
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter from supporter; Page # 202	11/24/03	Non-plaintiff supporter	Katherine Meyer	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff supporter withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter from supporter; Page # 203	11/23/04	Non-plaintiff supporter and contributor	Katherine Meyer	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter from supporter; Page # 204	11/24/04	Non-plaintiff supporter	Katherine Meyer	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Partial redaction: identities and address of non-plaintiff individual supporters withheld on First Amendment grounds.
Letter from supporter; Page # 205	11/24/05	Non-plaintiff supporter	Katherine Meyer	Letter of support for Tom Rider	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual supporter withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter to 11/26/03 Eric Glitzenstein contributor; Page # 210	Letter from 11/20/03 Non-plaintiff supporter; Page # 208-209	Letter to 12/9/03 Eric Glitzenstein contributor; Page # 207	Letter to 11/26/05 Eric Glitzenstein contributor; Page # 206
Non- plaintiff supporter	Katherine Meyer	Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor
Thank you for contribution	Note identifying individuals who said they would contribute to Tom Rider's media work	Thank you for contribution	Thank you for contribution
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First	Partial redaction: identities of individual supporters withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter to contributor; Page # 214	Letter to contributors; Page # 213	Letter from contributors; Page # 212	Letter to contributor; Page # 211
12/9/03	11/26/03	11/20/03	11/26/03
Eric Glitzenstein	Eric Glitzenstein	Non-plaintiff contributor	Eric Glitzenstein
Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor	Katherine Meyer	Non- plaintiff supporter
Thank you for contribution	Thank you for contribution	Letter supporting efforts of Tom Rider	Thank you for contribution
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Letter to contributor, Page # 218	Letter to contributor; Page # 217	Letter to contributor; Page # 216	Letter to contributor; Page # 215
12/16/03	12/9/03	12/9/03	12/9/03
Eric Glitzenstein	Eric Glitzenstein	Eric Glitzenstein	Eric Glitzenstein
Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor	Non- plaintiff contributor
Thank you for contribution			
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Memo to file regarding Tom Rider media; Page #s 222-225	Memo with handwritten notes; Page # 220-221	Letter to contributor; Page # 219
2001	3/13/01	12/16/03
unknown	Tom Rider	Eric Glitzenstein
unknown	Katherine Meyer	Non- plaintiff contributor
Description of articles, other media regarding elephants, Ringling Bros.	Bus schedule and handwritten notes	Thank you for contribution
Partial redaction: (1) identities of grassroots activists with whom WAP associates and works withheld on First Amendment grounds; (2) identities of WAP media contacts withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: (1) identities of grassroots activists with whom WAP associates and works withheld on First Amendment grounds; (2) identities of WAP media contacts withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Handwritten notes;	5/16/05	Katherine Meyer	n/a	advocacy effort	Partial redaction:
8					activist with whom
					WAP associates and
					works withheld on
					First Amendment
					grounds.
Handwritten notes,	undated	Katherine Meyer	n/a	media effort	Partial redaction:
Page # 229					identity of WAP
					media contact
					withheld on First
					Amendment grounds.
Handwritten notes;	6/2/05	Katherine Meyer	n/a	advocacy and media effort	Partial redaction:
Page # 230					identity of WAP
					media contact
					withheld on First
					Amendment grounds.
Electronic mail;	11/5/03	Non-plaintiff	Katherine	E-mail supporting efforts of Tom	Partial redaction:
Page # 231		supporter	Meyer	Rider	grassroots activists
					with whom WAP
					associates and works
					withheld on First
					Amendment grounds.

E-mails; Page #	4/7/05,	Eric Glitzenstein	n/a	Confirmation that WAP may use	Partial redaction:
234	4/8/05	and WAP Funder		funds to support elephant education efforts, and thank you	(1) identifying information
					concerning former
					WAP associate
					withheld on First
					Amendment grounds;
					(2) suggested resource
					for Tom Rider's
		-			media efforts withheld
					on First Amendment
					grounds.
E-mail and	11/12/03	Katherine Meyer	Bessie	Press interview with Tom Rider	Partial redaction: (1)
handwritten notes;			Smith	and notes on other topics	identity of WAP
Page # 237					media contact
					withheld on First
					Amendment grounds;
					(2) identity of
					grassroots activist
					with whom WAP
					associates and works
					withheld on First
					Amendment grounds.

Cancelled checks; Page # 408	Handwritten Note; Page # 271	Memo to File; Page #s 267-269	Grant Proposal; Page #s 238-259
10/2/03 & 10/30/03	5/05	undated	12/11/03
Wildlife Advocacy Project	Tom Rider	n/a	Katherine Meyer
Tom Rider	Katherine Meyer	n/a	Cathy Liss, Animal Welfare Institute
Funding for public education and media efforts	Tom Rider's notes on strategy for contacting media, with additional note by Katherine Meyer	Memo to file describing Tom Rider's and WAP's strategy for garnering media and public interest in Ringling Bros. treatment of elephants	Request for funding for Public Education Effort
Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual supporters withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity of WAP media contacts and internal media strategy withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity of WAP media contacts and internal media strategy withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identities and addresses of grassroots supporters of WAP withheld on First Amendment grounds.

Check Stub; Page # 464	Cancelled checks; Page # 418	Cancelled Checks; Page # 416	Cancelled checks; Page # 414
4/11/05	7/23/03 & 8/13/03	8/22/03, 9/4/03 & 9/22/03	10/14/03, 11/13/03 & 11/19/03
Wildlife Advocacy Project	Wildlife Advocacy Project	Wildlife Advocacy Project	Wildlife Advocacy Project
n/a	Tom Rider	Tom Rider	Tom Rider
Funding to purchase vehicle for public education and media efforts	Funding for public education and media efforts	Funding for public education and media efforts	Funding for public education and media efforts
Partial redaction: identity of non- plaintiff contributor withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual supporters withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual supporters withheld on First Amendment grounds.	Partial redaction: identity and address of non-plaintiff individual supporters withheld on First Amendment grounds.

,	·) := ;>				
Checks from contributors; Page	12/7/03, 12/5/03 &	Non-plaintiff contributors	Wildlife Advocacy	Contributions to WAP related to Tom Rider/elephant project	Partial redaction: identity and address of
# 503	12/10/03		Project	. !	non-plaintiff
					individual
					contributors withheld
					on First Amendment
					grounds.
Checks from	2003 -	Non-plaintiff	Wildlife	Contributions to WAP related to	Partial redaction:
contributors; Page	2005	contributors	Advocacy	Tom Rider/elephant project	identity and address of
#s 512-537			Project		non-plaintiff
					individual
					contributors withheld
					on First Amendment
					grounds.