AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO

ANIMALS, et al.,

v.

:

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM &

BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

:

Defendants.

Defendants.

#### **NOTICE OF COMPLIANCE**

Pursuant to the Court's September 26, 2006 order ("Order"), Feld Entertainment, Inc. ("FEI") states as follows:

FEI hereby submits 29 declarations in response to the Order. Dr. Houck explains historically how medical records were kept at FEI. See Houck Decl. (10/4/06) (attached hereto). Also attached is the July 6, 2006 declaration of Dr. Ellen Wiedner. See Wiedner Decl. ¶ 7 (7/6/06) (previously submitted as Exhibit E to FEI's Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Expedited Motion to Enforce (7/7/06)). Dr. Wiedner explains that certificates of inspection, also known as "interstates," are a transportation document rather than a medical record. They usually expire after 30 days. Id. Thus, FEI did not consider the interstates responsive to plaintiffs' document requests and has not attempted previously to retain them for litigation. See Strauss Decl. ¶ 2 (attached hereto). Pursuant to the Court's Order, FEI is producing whatever interstates

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Mr. Troy Metzler, the Superintendent of Elephants on the Blue Unit, and Mr. Antonio Olmeda, Senior Handler on the Red Unit, are currently on vacation. Mr. Metzler already has testified under oath at deposition for plaintiffs that he does not perform recordkeeping (and thus has none). FEI believes the same is correct for Mr. Olmeda. FEI will provide the Court with their declarations when each person returns from vacation.

it has, and has instructed its employees to now retain them on a going-forward basis regardless of their expiration dates. <u>Id.</u> ¶ 5. At no time since this lawsuit was filed, however, has FEI ever been refused entry into or travel through any state during the course of its annual touring schedules for the Blue, Red, and most recently, Gold Units. <u>Id.</u> ¶¶ 3 & 4.

FEI is producing today documents identified as FEI 40991-42865, which consist of the following:

- 1. FEI has located and retrieved offsite records relating to numbers 11, 15 and 16 of the Order, and one additional e-mail responsive to number 9 of the Order. These documents consist of additional radiographs for thirteen elephants (including thoracic x-rays for Benjamin and Shirley elephants), and lab results, some of which are duplicative in part. The radiographs are available for inspection, and the lab results are hereby produced as FEI 42479-42627.
- 2. FEI has necropsy photos, that again, are not considered by its veterinarians to be medical records. See FEI 40086-40954, 42866-71. Out of an abundance of caution, FEI will make these photos available for inspection pursuant to the Order but will ask the Court to restrict their use and dissemination due to their graphic nature.
- 3. The remainder of the documents produced constitute a supplemental production for elephant medical records for the period May 1, 2006 through September 26, 2006, and interstates (pursuant to number 8 of the Order). See FEI 40991-42478, 42628-42865. This also includes the medical records for three Asian elephants, Jan, Marie and Shelley. Those three elephants, which are not owned by FEI, are now traveling on the Gold Unit, and are presented as part of an act that FEI recently engaged in August 2006.

As for the remainder of the categories in the Order, no elephant named Shirly Ann ever existed, see Order no. 6, and the documents related to numbers 1-5, 7, 9-10, 12-14 of the Order

have been produced already. This was explained in detail in FEI's earlier briefing. <u>See</u> Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Expedited Motion to Enforce at 17-35 (7/6/06). Dated this 11<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2006.

Respectfully submitted,

John M. Simpson (D.C. Bar #256412) Joseph T. Small, Jr. (D.C. Bar #926519) Lisa Zeiler Joiner (D.C. Bar #465210) Michelle C. Pardo (D.C. Bar #456004) George A. Gasper (D.C. Bar #488988)

FULBRIGHT & JAWORSKI L.L.P. 801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20004 Telephone: (202) 662-0200

Facsimile: (202) 662-4643

Counsel for Defendant Feld Entertainment, Inc.

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

٧.

•

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM &

BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, William A. Lindsay, D.V.M., declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 2. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 3. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 1st day of October, 2006.

William A. Lindsay, D.

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

- I. Richard Houck, D.V.M., declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- I graduated from veterinary school in 1957. I was employed by Feld
   Entertainment, Inc. (and its corporate predecessor) from approximately 1984 1997 as the
   company's veterinarian. There were no medical records on any animal at the time I was hired.
  - 3. When I was hired, I did not make or maintain animal medical records.
- 4. At some point, I began to keep a few handwritten medical records. They were discarded when I started to use a computer.
- 5. Later I began to enter medical records into a laptop computer. I would print the records and send them to the general managers of the circus units.
- 6. When I retired, any medical records that I had at the time were provided to the veterinary staff that followed.

#### 

Eventually the computer failed to function, and it was discarded.

7.

| I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. |   |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
| Executed on this 4th day of October, 2006.                                 |   |
| Richard Houck, D.V.M.                                                      | Ŋ |

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE | ; |
|--------------------------|---|
| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO |   |
| ANIMALS, <u>et al.</u> , |   |
|                          |   |

Plaintiffs,

v. : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

**DECLARATION** 

- I, Ellen Wiedner, V.M.D., Dipl. A.C.V.I.M., declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 2. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 3. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Ellen Wiedner, V.M.D., Dipl. A.C.V.I.M.

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v. : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Ramiro Isaza, D.V.M., M.S., Dipl. A.C.Z.M., declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 2. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 3. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 4 day of Oct., 2006.

Ramiro Isaza, D.V.M., M.S., Dipl. A.C.Z.M.

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE    | •                                  |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------------|
| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO    | :                                  |
| ANIMALS, <u>et al.</u> ,    | :                                  |
|                             | :                                  |
| Plaintiffs,                 | :                                  |
| v.                          | : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF) |
| RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & | •                                  |
| BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,      | :                                  |
|                             | :                                  |
| Defendants.                 | :                                  |
|                             | •                                  |

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Allison L. Case, D.V.M., declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 2. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
- 3. I have no such records, and I did not take any with me when I left Feld Entertainment, Inc. in 2004.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this \_\_\_\_\_\_\_, 2006.

Allison L. Case., D.V.M.

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

: Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

ν.

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

I, Gary Jacobson, declare under oath as follows:

- 1. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 2. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 3. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 4th day of Octobon, 2006.

Say Jacobson

Gary Jacobson

| AMERICAN SOCI    | ETY FOR THE |
|------------------|-------------|
| PREVENTION OF    | CRUELTY TO  |
| ANIMALS, et al., |             |

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM &

BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

v.

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

I, Kathy Jacobson, declare under oath as follows:

- I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September
   26, 2006 ("Order").
- 2. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 3. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 4 day of October, 2006.

Kathy Jacobson

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE |  |
|--------------------------|--|
| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO |  |
| ANIMALS, et al.,         |  |

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

DECLARATION

I, James Williams, declare under oath as follows:

- 1. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 2. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 3. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 5th day of October, 2006.

James Williams

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al., | :<br>:                                               |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|
| Plaintiffs,                                                        | :                                                    |
| v.                                                                 | : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)                   |
| RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,                 |                                                      |
| Defendants.                                                        | :<br>:<br>_:                                         |
| <u>DE</u>                                                          | CLARATION                                            |
| I, Robert Ridley, declare under oath                               | as follows:                                          |
| 1. I have reviewed the Court's                                     | order in the above-captioned case dated September    |
| 26, 2006 ("Order").                                                |                                                      |
| 2. I have searched for all recor                                   | ds covered by the Order in my possession, custody or |
| control.                                                           |                                                      |
| 3. Any such record that I locat                                    | ed was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.  |
|                                                                    | hat the foregoing is true and correct.               |
| Executed on this $\frac{7^{5+}}{4}$ day of $\frac{0}{2}$           | <del>. +</del> , 2006.                               |
|                                                                    |                                                      |

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

.

Plaintiffs,

:

v. : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

:

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

I, Dennis Schmitt, D.V.M., Ph.D., D.A.C.T, declare under oath as follows:

- 1. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 2. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 3. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this day of Clouds, 2006

Dennis Schmitt, D.V.M., Ph.D., D.A.C.T

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE                           | :                                 |
|----------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO                           |                                   |
| ANIMALS, <u>et al.</u> ,                           | 1                                 |
| Plaintiffs,                                        | ;<br>;                            |
| ν.                                                 | : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF |
| RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al., |                                   |
| Defendants.                                        | :<br>:                            |

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Heather Riggs, declare under oath as follows:
- I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September
   26, 2006 ("Order").
- 2. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
- 3. I have no such records, and I did not take any with me when I left Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 6 day of October, 2006

Heather Riggs

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE : PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO : ANIMALS, et al., :

v.

:

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

:

Defendants.

**DECLARATION** 

I, Anita Santiago, declare under oath as follows:

- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as a veterinary technician for the Blue Unit.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Anita Santiago

| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,          | :<br>:                             |
|----------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| Plaintiffs,                                        | :<br>:                             |
| .V.                                                | : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF) |
| RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al., | ·<br>:<br>:                        |
|                                                    | . <b>:</b>                         |

#### **DECLARATION**

I, Emily Kennedy, declare under oath as follows:

Defendants.

- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc., and was the veterinary technician on the Gold Unit this summer.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 5th day of October, 2006.

Emily Kennedy

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v. : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

**DECLARATION** 

I, Carrie Coleman, declare under oath as follows:

- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as a veterinary technician for the Red Unit.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_\_, 2006.

Carrie Coleman

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Deborah Fahrenbruck, declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as the Regulatory Affairs and Outreach Coordinator.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc. 4.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 6th day of Getober, 2006.

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v. : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

**DECLARATION** 

I, Angelina Quevedo, declare under oath as follows:

- I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as the General Manager of the Gold
   Unit.
- I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September
   26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 7th day of October, 2006.

Angelina Quevedo

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE |  |
|--------------------------|--|
| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO |  |
| ANIMALS, et al.,         |  |

Plaintiffs,

v. : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Alex Vargas, declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as the Superintendent of Animals on the Blue Unit.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. I am not responsible for recordkeeping, and I have no such records.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 6 day of October, 2006.

Alex Vargas

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE | : |
|--------------------------|---|
| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO | : |
| ANIMALS, et al.,         | : |

Plaintiffs,

v. : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Sacha Houcke, declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as a handler and presenter on the Red Unit.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2006.

Sacha Houcke

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO |   |
| ANIMALS, <u>et al.</u> , | · |

Plaintiffs,

v. Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, David Polke, declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as the Superintendent of Animals on the Blue Unit.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
- 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_ O c \_\_\_\_\_\_, 2006.

Parid Polke

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE |  |
|--------------------------|--|
| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO |  |
| ANIMALS, et al.,         |  |

v.

•

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

:

Defendants.

•

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Michael Hayward, declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as a handler and presenter on the Blue Unit.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 6th day of October, 2006.

Michael Hayward

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

v.

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Hicham Basllam, declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as a handler and presenter on the Blue Unit.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. I am not responsible for recordkeeping, and I have no such records.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this \_\_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_, 2006.

Hicham Basllam

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

: Case No. 1:03-CV-02006

v. (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

**DECLARATION** 

l, Harry Locker, declare under oath as follows:

- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as the General Manager of the Williston facility.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
- 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, inc.

Harry Locker

| AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE |
|--------------------------|
| PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO |
| ANIMALS, et al.,         |

Plaintiffs.

: Case No. 1:03-CV-02006

(EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

**DECLARATION** 

I, Catherine Monger, declare under oath as follows:

- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as a handler and veterinary technician at the Williston facility.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
- 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this \_\_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_, 2006.

Catherine Monger

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO

ANIMALS, et al.,

v.

•

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM &

BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

:

Defendants.

**DECLARATION** 

- I, Thomas Albert, declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as the Vice President of Government Relations.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 6th day of October, 2006.

Thomas Albert

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v. : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

I, Janice Aria, declare under oath as follows:

- I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as the Manager, Animal Stewardship
   Training, at the Ringling Bros. Center for Elephant Conservation.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 5 th day of 6 to ber, 2006.

Janice Aria

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

v.

:

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

:

Defendants.

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Trudy Williams, declare under oath as follows:
- I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as a handler at the Ringling Bros.
   Center for Elephant Conservation.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 5th day of October, 2006.

Trudy Williams

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

Plaintiffs, :

v. : Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

Defendants.

**DECLARATION** 

I, Mickie Frizzell, declare under oath as follows:

- 1. I am employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. as the Circus Registrar.
- 2. I have reviewed the Court's order in the above-captioned case dated September 26, 2006 ("Order").
- 3. I have searched for all records covered by the Order in my possession, custody or control.
  - 4. Any such record that I located was sent to counsel for Feld Entertainment, Inc.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this 5th day of 6th (128), 2006.

Mickie Frizzell

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

v.

:

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

:

Defendants.

----

#### **DECLARATION**

- I, Julie Alexa Strauss, declare under oath as follows:
- 1. I have been employed by Feld Entertainment, Inc. ("FEI") since 1988. I am Vice President and Corporate Counsel for FEI.
- 2. Certificates of veterinary inspection are also known as "interstates." The interstates are not considered to be medical records. See, e.g., Wiedner Decl. ¶ 7 (7/6/06). These forms vary from state to state, and they are for the purpose of transporting animals. They normally expire after thirty days. Id. Because they are not considered to be medical records, the interstates were not responsive to plaintiffs' document requests in this case, and FEI did not retain them for purposes of this litigation.
- 3. During the time of my employment at FEI, the Blue and Red Units have been continuously traveling in accordance with their annual touring schedules. In the positions I have held with FEI, I would have been advised if an elephant had been refused entry into or travel through any state. I am not aware of any instance in which an elephant from either unit has been refused entry into or travel through a state.

- 4. The Gold Unit began touring in 2004 and has been continuously traveling in accordance with its annual touring schedule. I am not aware of any instance in which an elephant on the Gold Unit has been refused entry into or travel through a state since the Gold Unit began touring in 2004.
- 5. Pursuant to the Court's September 26, 2006 Order, FEI is producing all interstates in its possession, custody and control. FEI's employees have now been instructed to retain all interstates, regardless of when they expire, until discovery closes or upon further notice from the Court.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on this // day of October, 2006.

Julie Alv- Staur

Case 1:03-cv-02006-EGS Document 98 Filed 10/11/06 Page 34 of 37

### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS, et al.,

:

Plaintiffs,

v,

Case No. 1:03-CV-02006 (EGS/JMF)

RINGLING BROS. AND BARNUM & BAILEY CIRCUS, et al.,

•

Defendants.

#### DECLARATION OF ELLEN WIEDNER, V.M.D., D.A.C.V.I.M.

Ellen Wiedner, V.M.D., D.A.C.V.I.M. declares under oath the following:

- I am a veterinarian for Feld Entertainment, Inc. ("FEI"). I have held this position since April, 2004. Previously, I worked at Colt's Head Equine Clinic in Freehold, New Jersey. At FEI, I provide veterinary care for all of the animals, including Asian elephants. I make this declaration based on personal knowledge acquired in the course of my seven (7) years of professional experience, including my time at FEI.
- 2. I consulted with counsel in the preparation of the May 12, 2006 letter to plaintiffs regarding veterinary issues discussed in that letter.
- 3. FEI maintains a herd of Asian elephants that are either traveling with the circus units or located at the Center for Elephant Conservation or Two Tails Ranch (Williston) facilities in Florida.
- 4. Entries to an FEI elephant's "Medical History" or "Animal Veterinary Report" that simply record the visit are evidence that the animal was not experiencing any problems that required attention. The level of detail for a given animal is a function of that animal's particular

medical situation. Visits to healthy elephants, with no conditions or treatment to document, typically do not get recorded other than to state "examine on site" or "vet on site."

- 5. As an example, Asha elephant is a healthy four-year old elephant. Her medical history document reflects this by containing notes of visits, rather than containing notes regarding medical conditions or treatments.
- 6. An elephant's medical record is dependant upon his or her health. No elephant's medical records will be identical to another's.
- 7. Certificates of veterinary inspection are not considered to be medical records. FEI does not maintain such an inspection certificate in an elephant's medical file, and it is not created to facilitate treatment of an elephant. Such a document is akin to an inspection document or permit document, which varies from state-to-state, and is required to transport an animal through the state. Typically, such inspection certificates expire thirty (30) days after they are issued.
- 8. A laboratory report is a meaningful document for a veterinarian and, as such, does not require separate written analysis.
- 9. When a consulting or on-call veterinarian treats an FEI elephant, the practice is for that veterinarian, if appropriate, to add to the elephant's veterinary record while on site or by subsequent communication.
- 10. *Nocardia* bacteria is found worldwide in soil. Elephant trunk washes frequently contain normal organisms found in soil. They do not indicate infection.

- 11. Sarah elephant did not have surgery for a fistula and therefore there is no document for that procedure.
- 12. The medical history of Asia elephant contains various entries regarding lameness. The intermittent entries that do not discuss Asia's lameness indicate that she was not exhibiting symptoms sufficient to note, or otherwise warrant treatment for, at those times.
- 13. None of FEI's baby elephants has ever died of the condition known as elephant endotheliotropic herpesvirus (EEHV) or "herpes." FEI owns one of the few elephants who successfully recovered from EEHV.

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

Ellen Wiedner, V.M.D., D.A.C.V.LML

Executed on July 6, 2006.