

EXHIBIT L

**MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT BY
DEFENDANTS KATHERINE MEYER, ERIC GLITZENSTEIN, AND
MEYER GLITZENSTEIN & CRYSTAL**

Civ. No. 07-1532 (EGS/JMF)



abc7chicago.com

abc SAVE A LIFE

Quick Links go

Friday, April 30, 2004

NEWS HEADLINES

Tamed or Tortured
ABC7 I-Team investigates elephant training
 By Chuck Goudie

November 22, 2002 — The circus is in town tonight and so is the controversy about how circus elephants are trained to perform. The ABC7 I-Team reports that what happens away from the big top is not always the greatest show on earth, and what you are about to see may be disturbing. It has been almost eight years since the I-Team first exposed how pain and punishment are used to train performing elephants in an investigation called "Tamed or Tortured."

Since then, there have been congressional hearings, demands for tighter animal inspections, even calls for the banning of elephants in circuses. As the Ringling Brothers' Circus debuts weekend shows in Chicago, the controversy has not gone away.

This is a snapshot of obedience— elephants lumbering down Damen Avenue this week and into the United Center, where the Ringling Brothers' Circus is on for 21 shows.

For many fans, the elephants make it the greatest show on earth. But to Tom Rider, a former barn hand at Ringling Brothers', elephants represent the cruelest show on earth.

"They are beaten into submission. The only way to keep an elephant under your control is to beat it," said Rider, former Ringling employee.

Rider tended elephants at Ringling for two and a half years, but says in 1999 he quit after witnessing this kind of treatment by trainers...what he claims is torture administered with an ankus or metal bull hook.

"We had a standing rule that if you could put a bull hook on your finger and hold it, it wasn't sharp enough, you have to sharpen it. It would literally penetrate the skin of an elephant," said Rider.

"Tom Rider worked for Ringling Brothers for two years and never once did he make a complaint about what he says he witnessed if what he saw was so bad. Today he works for an extremist hate organization and he gets paid to do it. He shoveled manure for us then and he shovels manure today," said John Kirtland, Ringling animal stewardship director.

John Kirtland manages animal care and training at Ringling's elephant farm in central Florida.

Kirtland admits elephant trainers carry bullhooks but claims they are used primarily to "guide" the pachyderms.

He says videotape like this shot by animal rights groups is out of context and he vigorously disputes charges of elephant torture, saying Ringling consistently passes government animal inspections.

Kirtland says radicals just don't want animals in captivity.

"They don't want people to enjoy relationships with animals. They want to take the dog out of your house and the horse out of your barn," said John Kirtland, Ringling animal stewardship director.

Ringling has even prepared a videotape featuring veteran trainer Troy Metzler explaining the intended use of a bull hook or "guide" as he calls it.

"Anytime they do something that is right, you always reward them with a pat or a carrot or apple...if a verbal command doesn't work you can use the guide to guide them where you want them to go," said Troy Metzler, Ringling animal trainer.

HOME NEWS
 LOCAL/STATE
 NATIONAL/WORLD
 I-TEAM REPORTS
 CONSUMER NEWS
 MONEYSCOPE
 ENTERTAINMENT
 STRANGE NEWS
WEATHER
 DOPPLER RADAR
 LIVE CAMS
TRAFFIC
HEALTHBEAT
SPORTS
FOOD & RECIPES
PROGRAMS
COMMUNITY
TRAVEL
AUTOMOTIVE
ABC7 JOBNET
ABOUT ABC7
 CONTACT US
 ABC7 BIOS

PAGE OPTIONS
 Email this Page to a Friend
 Printer-friendly version of
 Search for Related Items

TOP STORIES
 ● Girl assaulted inside sc
 ● Man who attacked coar
 Side
 ● Boys arrested for vand
 ● Crash kills father, injur
 ● Officer pulls man from f

I-TEAM LINKS
 ● Contact the I-Team
 ● Awards
 ● I-Team Bios
 ● I-Team Stories



But this same man Ringling puts forth touting animal care, also appears on another tape shot two years ago by animals rights advocates.

Metzler is seen backstage cracking a baby elephant across the trunk and then performing a faux-karate chop for some bystanders. Metzler tells the I-team he was reprimanded-- not for clubbing the elephant, but for doing so on camera.

"The animal was going to pull down a fence onto himself and other elephants and hurt himself. The procedure was correct but the way it was carried out was unprofessional...The mistake was in the way he acted, showing off. He pretty much knew he was on tape and was showing off for the people who are adversarial," said Kirkland.


Then, a few minutes later Metzler is seen on tape issuing a pair of uppercuts with the bull hook to an elephant's jaw.

"I want you to hear the sound on this, that's from about 75 yards away and you can hear how hard he's hit that baby and why, because that baby wouldn't raise its trunk. Wouldn't get her head up," said Rider.

Metzler-- now performing in Chicago-- admits that on seldom occasions elephants need to be hit. But he contends that 95 percent of the time elephants respond to verbal commands.

"They like to say that they don't do it, that it doesn't happen, that we're the greatest show on earth...we take such good care of our animals. But you can see on the video that doesn't happen. They are all about show," said Rider.

Last Updated: Nov 22, 2002

 [BACK TO TOP](#)

 [HOME](#)

[ABCNEWS.com](#) | [ABC.com](#) | [Movies.com](#) | [ESPN.com](#) | [FamilyFun.com](#)
Advertise on this Site | [Contact Us](#)
Copyright ©2004 ABC Inc., WLS Television, Inc.
[Terms of Use](#), [UPDATED Privacy Policy](#), and [Internet Safety Information](#) for this site.



PL 08372