

**EXHIBIT F**

**MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT BY  
DEFENDANTS KATHERINE MEYER, ERIC GLITZENSTEIN, AND  
MEYER GLITZENSTEIN & CRYSTAL**

Civ. No. 07-1532 (EGS/JMF)

REDACTED.

REDACTED.

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Galvin, Joan  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 28, 2000 3:41 PM  
**To:** Phillips, Molly; Pflughaupt, Barbara; Strauss, Julie; OrtMabry, Catherine; Kerley, Katherine; Huey, Rodney; Kiser, David  
**Subject:** RE: Tom Rider to protest RB in Las Vegas

the tape is not ours. definitely taken by someone not authorized. but odd that there is nothing egregious -- and in fact, it just looks like a darker less professional version of the footage we had shot!

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Phillips, Molly  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 28, 2000 3:10 PM  
**To:** Pflughaupt, Barbara; Galvin, Joan; Strauss, Julie; OrtMabry, Catherine; Kerley, Katherine; Huey, Rodney; Kiser, David  
**Subject:** RE: Tom Rider to protest RB in Las Vegas

The tape was taken while the train was in motion, so it would be more likely that we have someone inside rather than someone we allowed access to. I understand what the AR people are trying to say by distributing it but what I was trying to make clear is that there isn't anything on the tape that we should be concerned with internally.

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Pflughaupt, Barbara  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 28, 2000 3:05 PM  
**To:** Phillips, Molly; Galvin, Joan; Strauss, Julie; OrtMabry, Catherine; Kerley, Katherine; Huey, Rodney; Kiser, David  
**Subject:** RE: Tom Rider to protest RB in Las Vegas

Just occurred to me and please forgive the constant email stream today... but perhaps this was footage supplied to a media outlet who turned it over to them? My guess is what they find disturbing is \*just\* the fact that they are in train cars in chains and the cleanliness etc. is irrelevant to their use of the tape as a visual of chaining in a confined space.

I will stop now <g>.

XXB

*Barbara Pflughaupt*  
212-861-2100

visit Feld Entertainment on the web at:

[www.Ringling.com](http://www.Ringling.com)

[www.elephantcenter.com](http://www.elephantcenter.com)

[www.barnumskaleidoscope.com](http://www.barnumskaleidoscope.com)

[www.disneyonice.com](http://www.disneyonice.com)

[www.feldentertainment.com](http://www.feldentertainment.com)

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Pflughaupt, Barbara  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 28, 2000 03:02 PM  
**To:** Phillips, Molly; Galvin, Joan; Strauss, Julie; OrtMabry, Catherine; Kerley, Katherine; Huey, Rodney; Brown, David; Kiser, David  
**Subject:** RE: Tom Rider to protest RB in Las Vegas

ok.. but... since I assume it is not \*our\* tape (produced by us)... then I am curious how they obtained footage inside our rail cars. Just a thought...

XX B

*Barbara Pflughaupt*  
212-861-2100

visit Feld Entertainment on the web at:

[www.Ringling.com](http://www.Ringling.com)

www.elephantcenter.com  
www.barnumskaleidoscope.com  
www.disneyonice.com  
www.feldentertainment.com

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Phillips, Molly  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 28, 2000 03:01 PM  
**To:** Pflughaupt, Barbara; Galvin, Joan; Strauss, Julie; OrtMabry, Catherine; Kerley, Katherine; Huey, Rodney; Koors, Patrick; Brown, Steve; Hebert, Shannon; Brown, David; Kiser, David  
**Subject:** RE: Tom Rider to protest RB in Las Vegas

We obtained a copy of that tape today and it is definitely RB (it shows the train cars) but there isn't anything on it even slightly disturbing. It is 9 minutes of elephants standing in clean train cars, chained and swaying. They have clean bedding and everything looks good. I'm not sure what they think is compelling about the tape. It says that it was filmed in early '00. I don't know the elephants well enough to tell you which Unit.

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Pflughaupt, Barbara  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 28, 2000 2:17 PM  
**To:** Phillips, Molly; Galvin, Joan; Strauss, Julie; OrtMabry, Catherine; Kerley, Katherine; Huey, Rodney; Koors, Patrick; Brown, Steve; Hebert, Shannon; Brown, David; Kiser, David  
**Subject:** RE: Tom Rider to protest RB in Las Vegas

Please note this at the end of the release from Joyce at IDA (in case you missed it):

>> IDA has a 9.5 min video tape, **anonymously given to us, of recent undercover Ringling footage of elephants chained in train cars.** For a copy to use at protests and to get to your local press while RB is in your town, email me asap with your mailing address.  
Joyce  
IDA<<

Anonymously given? Then how do they know it is us?

**Barbara Pflughaupt**  
**212-861-2100**

visit Feld Entertainment on the web at:  
www.Ringling.com  
www.elephantcenter.com  
www.barnumskaleidoscope.com  
www.disneyonice.com  
www.feldentertainment.com

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Phillips, Molly  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 28, 2000 02:09 PM  
**To:** Galvin, Joan; Strauss, Julie; OrtMabry, Catherine; Kerley, Katherine; Huey, Rodney; Pflughaupt, Barbara; Koors, Patrick; Brown, Steve; Hebert, Shannon; Brown, David; Kiser, David  
**Subject:** Tom Rider to protest RB in Las Vegas

From the AR listserv

---

Las Vegas Sun  
June 26, 2000

Animal rights activists preparing for elephants' visit to Las Vegas  
By Kristen Peterson  
<kristen@lasvegassun.com>  
LAS VEGAS SUN

Recent public opposition from animal rights activists including game show host Bob Barker should not dampen ticket sales to the Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Circus next week in Las Vegas, circus representatives predict.  
The activists are throwing their weight behind a House resolution that would prohibit the use of elephants in traveling shows or circuses as well as the use of the animals for rides. They would be allowed to

perform in permanent structures.

Barker testified before the House Judiciary Committee's subcommittee on crime earlier this month in favor of the resolution, saying that elephants are a threat to public safety. Nearly 30 people have been killed by circus or zoo elephants since 1983, he said.

Appearing with Barker were Pat Derby, president of Performing Animal Welfare Society, and Tom Rider, a former Ringling Bros. employee. Rider will be in Las Vegas Tuesday and Wednesday hoping to drum up more media attention on the issue before the circus' performances July 5-9 at the Thomas & Mack Center.

If anything, the media attention only creates more publicity for the circus, said Catherine Ort-Mabry, spokeswoman for Feld Entertainment Inc., the parent company of Ringling Bros.

The bill, introduced in September by Rep. Sam Farr, D-Calif., is backed by supporters who say elephants are wild animals that pose a threat to spectators.

Derby cites more than 60 incidents in the past 70 years in which elephants have escaped or killed spectators or riders.

Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey, which opposes the bill, counters that the legislation "relies on emotion rather than fact."

"Once you get beyond the emotional rhetoric and get to the facts, people see this as a political agenda," Ort-Mabry said.

In its history, Ringling Bros. has not had one incident in which an elephant has threatened or harmed a member of the public, Ort-Mabry said.

But Derby, who has four elephants at PAWS' Northern California sanctuary, says placing the large animals in "stupid costumes" and having them do tricks is a "ticking time bomb."

A police officer from Palm Bay, Fla., who shot an out-of-control elephant in Florida and a woman from New York who said she was charged by an elephant at a Hannaford Bros. Circus in Poughkeepsie, N.Y., also spoke at the congressional hearing on June 13.

Farr said his interest in the issue is twofold: public safety and protection of the animals against abuse. In order to make animals perform, fear and torture are used, Farr said.

Although the resolution does not address animal cruelty, protecting elephants from abuse would be a byproduct of the bill, Derby said.

Enforcement is "too difficult when shows travel," Derby said. "It's easier when elephants are in one spot and unannounced inspections are made."

PAWS filed a separate complaint against Ringling Bros. with the U.S. Department of Agriculture based on the allegations of Rider, who worked for 2 1/2 years as a barn man for Ringling Bros.

Rider alleges that elephants with Ringling Bros. were repeatedly abused by trainers and handlers.

"I'm not a disgruntled employee," Rider said. "The public has to know what goes on behind the scenes at the circus. You have to beat an elephant into submission. They don't naturally go out there and climb on each other's backs."

Rider's allegations, which first came out in a British tabloid, came as a shock to representatives of Ringling Bros., who say that as an employee Rider never voiced his concerns.

"He is describing a pattern of systematic abuse," Ort-Mabry said. "If there were a pattern, it would be found."

Ort-Mabry said the circus is governed by the Animal Welfare Act and was inspected 36 times during Rider's employment.

"We have a legal obligation to treat the animals (well)," she added. "In every market we play, there is a network of local animal control officers and regulations. By not abiding by that, they could shut us down."

A circus doesn't need animals to be effective, Derby said. "Cirque du Soleil" and "O" are two of the biggest shows in Las Vegas. They have no animals."

When asked whether he believes the bill will pass, Farr said: "It's a tough call. The entertainment industry is heavily lobbying against this bill."

"What we hope to gain is consumer support," Farr added. "If enough people stop going, maybe they'll discontinue using elephants."

~~~~~  
IDA has a 9.5 min video tape, anonymously given to us, of recent undercover Ringling footage of elephants chained in train cars. For a copy to use at protests and to get to your local press while RB is in your town, email me asap with your mailing address.

Joyce

IDA

---

This email was sent using Inficad(r)  
Communications' Free wEb-Mail service!  
<http://www.inficad.com/mail>